

FIFTEENTH-CENTURY COLONIZATION OF THE AMERICAS
AND THE PROCESS OF *RECONQUISTA*:
A MILLENARIAN PERSPECTIVE

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

FATMA HAZAL TİRYAKİ

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF HISTORY

SEPTEMBER 2019

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Yaşar Kondakçı
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Arts.

Prof. Dr. Ömer Turan
Head of Department

This is to certify that I have read this thesis and that in my opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Arts.

Assist. Prof. Dr. Bahar Gürsel
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Güçlü Tülüveli (METU, HIST)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Bahar Gürsel (METU, HIST)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Paul Latimer (Bilkent Uni., HIST)

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last name: Fatma Hazal Tiryaki

Signature :

ABSTRACT

FIFTEENTH-CENTURY COLONIZATION OF THE AMERICAS AND THE PROCESS OF *RECONQUISTA*: A MILLENARIAN PERSPECTIVE

Tiryaki, Fatma Hazal

Master's Thesis, Department of History

Supervisor: Assist. Prof. Dr. Bahar Gürsel

September 2019, 143 pages

The year 1492 witnessed three related and important events - the fall of Granada, the expulsion of the Jews and the enterprise of the Indies - which originated in the Iberian Peninsula yet altered the course of the European and world history. In this study, the developments in mainland Spain and its overseas territories which were under the rule of Isabel and Ferdinand will be analysed by referring to the historical, cultural and theological dimensions. This study, by using the textual interpretation and historical analysis methods, asserts that the geographical expeditions led by Christopher Columbus and the *Reconquista* process that was finalized by Isabel and Ferdinand of Spain were momentous examples of the theopolitics in which eschatological expectations and millenarian prophecies played a significant role in Spain's policy-making.

Keywords: Reconquista, millenarianism, the enterprise of the Indies, eschatology

ÖZ

ON BEŞİNCİ YÜZYIL KOLONİLEŞME SÜRECİ VE İSPANYOL FETİHLERİNE BİNYILCILIK PENCERESİNDEN BAKIŞ

Tiryaki, Fatma Hazal

Master Tezi, Tarih Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Bahar Gürsel

Eylül 2019, 143 sayfa

1492 yılı, İber Yarımadası'nda ortaya çıkan ve tüm Avrupa ve dünya tarihinin akışını değiştiren birbiriyle bağlantılı üç önemli olaya tanık oldu. Bunlar, Gırnata'nın Hristiyanlar tarafından ele geçirilmesi, Yahudilerin İspanya'dan kovulması ve Amerika'nın keşfiydi. Bu çalışmada, Isabel ve Ferdinand yönetiminde, İspanya'da ve denizaşırı yerlerde yaşanan gelişmeler, tarihi, kültürel ve teolojik boyutlarıyla birlikte analiz edilecektir. Bu çalışma, metin yorumlama ve tarihsel analiz yöntemlerini kullanarak, İspanya'da Isabel ve Ferdinand tarafından tamamlanan İspanyol fetihleri ile Christopher Columbus'un öncülük ettiği coğrafi keşiflerin; eskatolojik beklentilerin ve binyılcılık kehanetlerin önemli rol oynaması nedeniyle din-politika ilişkisinin en önemli örneklerinden birini gösterdiğini ortaya koymaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: İspanyol fetihleri, binyılcılık, coğrafi keşifler, kıyametbilim

To My Beloved Parents

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to express her deepest gratitude to her supervisor Assist. Prof. Dr. Bahar Gürsel for her guidance, advice, criticism, encouragements and insight throughout the research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PLAGIARISM	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ÖZ	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	viii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	x
LIST OF FIGURES	xi
CHAPTER	
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. ESCHATOLOGY AND MILLENNIALISM	11
2.1 Eschatology.....	11
2.1.1 The Concepts of Linear and Cyclical Time with Their Impacts on the Eschatological Belief	12
2.1.2 Christian Eschatology	17
2.2 Millennialism.....	20
2.2.1 Christian Millennialism.....	22
2.2.2 The Roots and the Transformation of the Christian Eschatology and Millennialism	26
2.2.2.1 The Second and Third Centuries	26
2.2.2.2 The Fourth and Fifth Centuries	28
2.2.2.3 The Contributions of the Latin Fathers	30
2.2.2.4 The Seventh Century Onwards	39
2.2.3 The Kingdom Concept and the Doctrine of Millennium	45
3. PROCESS OF “RECONQUISTA” AND JEWISH AND MUSLIM IDENTITY ON THE IBERIAN PENINSULA	49

3.1 The Heroic Fathers of Kingship and Crusade: Charlemagne and El Cid	53
3.2 The Enemy of the Faith	59
3.3 The Existing Tensions in the Society and the Catholic Monarchs	63
4. CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS, GEOGRAPHICAL EXPEDITIONS AND COLONIALISM	75
4.1 Christopher Columbus's Life	77
4.2 Christopher Columbus's Voyages	83
4.2.1 The First Voyage	84
4.2.2 The Second Voyage	93
4.2.3 The Third Voyage	96
4.2.4 The Fourth Voyage	99
4.3 The Imprints of Christian Millennialism on the Geographical Expeditions	101
5. CONCLUSION	115
REFERENCES	126
APPENDIX	
A. TURKISH SUMMARY / TÜRKÇE ÖZET	132
B. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU	143

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

b.	Born in
BCE	Before Common Era
c.	Circa
CE	Common Era
d.	Died in
p.	Printed in
tr.	Translation
w.	Written in

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE

Figure1: Signature of Christopher Columbus	102
--	-----

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

There is no clearly defined border between mythology and history. Both explore and aim to reveal the social events, the stages of change and the development of human societies. In this regard, one of the important factors affecting the changes and developments in the beliefs of societies is the myths that framed the developments that were experienced in the primitive eras. Some way, myths can go down to the foundations of religious beliefs and constitute one of the important pillars of societies' religious history. In this regard, the philosopher Mircea Eliade defines mythology as,

Every myth shows how a reality came into existence, whether it be the total reality, the cosmos, or only a fragment-an island, a species of plant, a human institution. To tell how things came into existence is to explain them and at the same time indirectly to answer another question: Why did they come into existence? The why is always implied in the how-for the simple reason that to tell how a thing was born is to reveal an irruption of the sacred into the world, and the sacred is the ultimate cause of all real existence.¹

On the same subject, Carl Gustav Jung cites directly from Sigmund Freud as follows, "...it seems extremely probable that myths, for example, are distorted vestiges of the wish-phantasies of whole nations the age-old dream of young humanity."² In this sense, since human beings share similar concerns, and fear and dream similar things, and yearn for the same things and try to make sense of the

¹ Eliade Mircea, *Time Sacred & Profane: The Nature of Religion* (New York: A Harvest Book Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1963), 97.

² Carl Gustav Jung, *The Collected Works: Symbols of Transformation*, vol.5 ed. Sir Herbert Read, Michael Fordham, Gerhard Adler, (New York: Routledge, 2014), 24.

world and creation, it is possible to encounter similar myths in different societies of the world. These can be classified as myths of worship, myths of creation, myths of cult, myths of persona, myths of after life, myths of origin, myths of apocalypse, myths of cultural hero, myths of believing that God will send a savior, myths about eternity, myths about faith, myths of birth and renewal, myths of remembering, myths about the founders or reformers of religion, myths about Gods/Goddesses and extraordinary creatures, myths about sovereigns and finally myths of evolution.³

In this context, the theme of a savior who would build a new order on earth has been a common concept among many religions throughout history. The teachings of Zoroastrianism can be shown as an example of this kind. The age of the world is more than 12.000 years in this religion where darkness (Ahriman) and light (Ahura Mazda) are in constant war and try to dominate the humankind.⁴ Zarathustra, the prophet, emerges to invite people to the path of light, 3.000 years after the creation of the mankind. It is believed that, at the end of every thousand years, a savior who was hidden in the depths of a great sea from the descendants of the Zarathustra is born with extraordinary abilities to correct the wrongdoings.⁵ When the last of the saviors is born, the last and final war between the good and the evil will be started, giants and heroes will reborn, all the dead will be resurrected, a certain comet will fall from the heavens to the earth and the earth will remain in flames.⁶ This fireflood will not harm good people, and those who pass this challenge will be rewarded with heaven. At the end of this apocalyptic battle, the forces of Ahriman will be defeated and banned for eternity.⁷ Then the earth will be cleansed and fixed for the new order.⁸

There is also a similar theme in cargo cults. Cargo cults define the belief system of relatively underdeveloped societies who had encounters with the advanced

³ Nimet Yıldırım, *İran Mitolojisi* (İstanbul: Pinhan Yayıncılık, 2015), 75-77.

⁴ Ibid., 159.

⁵ Ibid., 160.

⁶ Ibid., 161.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Ibid.

Western culture. These cults are millenarian in nature and based on prophecy.⁹ They emerged first in Melanesia and New Guinea. After the Second World War, different versions of such beliefs emerged, but basically these cults assert that people of European origin will perish and their wealth and richness will pass on to indigenous people of those lands.¹⁰

These cults predict that an age of endless happiness and wealth is near. In the near future, native people will reorient their faith and manage themselves. They will work no more, because “the dead” will come with the cargo ships just like the white men’s coming and bring endless wealth.¹¹ After the coming of Christ with a cargo ship, a new era will be initiated which is very similar to the life in paradise and members of the cult will be immortal.¹² Both Zoroastrianism and cargo cults, together with other millenarian expectations, are explainable with the myth, which is based on the sequence of “the demolition of the world, following by a new creation and the coming up of the golden age.”¹³

As this study will aim to show in detail, Catholic Christianity is also a belief system that is millenarian and messianic in nature. The focus of this study will be mainly on the fifteenth-century European experiences specific to Iberian Peninsula within the context of the millenarian scenario. If we look at the developments in the European continent during this period, according to Harvard historian Samuel Eliot Morison, the prevailing emotions were despair, pessimism and anxiety since Western European civilization was shrinking.¹⁴ In this rather pessimistic atmosphere, European people turned their faces to the pagan past in order to escape the present.¹⁵ As it is well known, this process made a major contribution to the age of the

⁹ Mircea Eliade, *Mitlerin Özellikleri* (İstanbul: Alfa, 2018), 12.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Ibid., 13.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus*, vol.1 (New York: Time Incorporated, 1942), 1.

¹⁵ Ibid.

Renaissance. The French word, *Renaissance* literally means “rebirth” but in more of a spiritual manner. This choice of the word can give a glimpse about the spiritual entrapment which Western European states and Christianity had been experiencing.

Islam, on the other hand, was expanding its sphere of influence. Every effort to recapture the Church of Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem¹⁶ had failed. The Ottoman Turks were in control of the former Byzantine territories, and they were expanding. Furthermore, the traditional trade routes that were the silk and spice roads were being controlled by the Ottoman Turks. Preventive crusader campaigns were organized, yet these were regarded as a device of raising money since papal diplomacy was conceived of as just as cynical as those of any other state.¹⁷ In this context, Samuel Eliot Morison gives the example of Pope Innocent VIII’s taking hostage of the Ottoman prince Cem in order to prevent the French king to invade Italy and balance his power.¹⁸ That is to say, there were internal messes and power struggles throughout Europe and because of such a chaotic atmosphere, hopes for a unified and strong Europe were just a dream.

Furthermore, Christianity was going through rough times. Although the repercussions of Great Schism¹⁹ in 1054 were controlled by Vatican, this control was at the expense of the reforms.²⁰ According to Morison, it was the enthronement of Rodrigo Borgia, a corrupt politician, as Alexander VI that the last drop for the undercut of the Papal holiness.²¹

Additionally, in the secular world, things were not brighter. The Holy Roman Emperor Frederick III (1440-1493) was expelled by the Hungarian king from his

¹⁶ The church of Holy Sepulchre has a symbolic importance for Christians, since it is believed to contain the site where Jesus was crucified. It is also believed to be the place of Jesus's empty tomb.

¹⁷ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea*, 1.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Great Schism was the break of communion, teachings and method between the Catholic Church and Eastern Orthodox churches. The ongoing tension from the Council of Nicaea of 325 between the visions of Rome and Constantinople finalized in 1054 with a division.

²⁰ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea*, 1.

²¹ Ibid.

Austrian lands.²² Moreover, his son Maximilian was not promising much for the unification of Europe, either.²³ In England, thanks to the marriage of Henry Tudor and Elizabeth of York, the Wars of Roses were finally terminated but there were doubts about the success and continuity of the Tudor dynasty.²⁴ The Iberian Peninsula was promising; still, it was too much on the margins to change the general atmosphere in Europe.²⁵

The principle of the unity between the emperors and the popes was now a distant dream. To make it clear, since the ninth century onwards, there had been a rather mutualistic relationship between the emperor and the pope in Europe. By coronation, the popes had been providing the legitimacy that a king would want, whereas the kings had brought protection in return. As it is known, Charlemagne was the first ruler crowned in St. Peter's Basilica by the hands of Pope Leo III in 800. Despite the fact that the title "Holy Roman Emperor" was not used until it was used by Otto I in 962, every Holy Roman Emperor considered their empire as a descendent of the Carolingian Empire of Charlemagne. Frederick III, on the other hand, was the last Holy Roman Emperor crowned by the Pope marking the end of almost 650 years of tradition. Considering the historical background, the schism in the European political sphere better reveals itself.

Within this framework, a chronicle, which matched the biblical prophecies with recorded world and human history, was published in 1493. The name of it was the *Nuremberg Chronicle*. This chronicle mentioned the year 1493 as in a sixth age of the world. Six blank pages were reserved to be filled by the events from the date of publication of the chronicle to the Day of Judgment.²⁶ Then comes the prophecy of seventh, hence the last age. According to this prophecy, in the last age of the

²² Ibid., 2.

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ Ibid.

world the evil would reach its triumph.²⁷ There would be no law and order, no peace and no tranquility.²⁸ This age would be characterized by bloodshed caused by endless wars as well as flood, natural disasters, pestilence and famine.²⁹ In this last age, according to the prophecy, crops would not grow, fruits would not ripe and even the fish in the sea would cease to exist.³⁰ All of these sufferings would be ended when the seventh angel, mentioned in John's *Revelation*, pours out the seventh vial.³¹ Then the Day of Judgment will terminate this wicked world. This particular prophecy was in accordance with the exhaustion from endless wars, political instabilities and social tensions that European states and societies were experiencing since the fall of the Roman Empire. It can be deduced, there was no hope for a stable Europe, to an extent that the apocalypse was almost a desired end to break the unfortunate circle of disturbance. This pessimistic atmosphere composed also a suitable substructure for a hope and a need for a savior with divine powers. In such an atmosphere, the year 1492 witnessed three related and important events originated in Iberian Peninsula yet altered the course of the whole European history. In order to develop a comprehensive view on subject, one should go back in time to eighth-century Muslim conquests.

Almost 12.000 Muslims of Africa under the command of Tariq ibn Ziyad had crossed over the eight and half mile Straits of Gibraltar³² in 711 and reached Iberia.³³ For a few hundred years, the Christians, Muslims and Jews co-existed and lived rather peacefully in the Iberian Peninsula.³⁴ *Convivencia* is the general term coined to

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Ibid., 3.

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Ibid.

³² "Jabal al Tariq" named after commander Tariq ibn Ziyad which means mount of Tarik.

³³ Lawrence A. Clayton, *Bartolomé de Las Casas and the Conquest of the Americas* (Malaysia: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), 11.

³⁴ Ibid.

portray this mutual existence. The city of Córdoba in Southern Spain was cherished as the capital of the Caliphate and grew into a center of a great civilization. The Caliphate of Córdoba was the richest and most prosperous state in Europe until around 1000.³⁵ Around that time, the small Christian kingdoms located on the coasts of Bay of Biscay and the Atlantic Ocean, began a series of raids and invasions that ignited the process of the *Reconquista* of the Iberian Peninsula for Christendom.³⁶ Even in the period of the Christian raids, the existing coherence and tolerance among the Christian, Jew and Muslim pillars of the society were preserved.³⁷ In the early-modern period, on the other hand, that tolerance gradually transformed into a militant and intolerant Christianity.³⁸

Although the mediaval kingdoms of Spain such as Castile, Aragon, León and Valencia maintained their own traditions and ways of administration, it can be asserted that, to some extent, they were united by the marriage of Ferdinand of Aragon and Isabel of Castile in 1469.³⁹ After hundreds of years of warfare, the only surviving Muslim state was the Kingdom of Granada and it fell to the Christendom in January 1492.⁴⁰ This event, which terminated the Muslim political existence in Iberia, was the first of the important three events in 1492. The Church, or more specifically Catholicism, played an important role in the process of the Spanish conquests as well as the unification. In this sense, the victory of Ferdinand and Isabel was the victory of the militant Church.⁴¹

At the same time, the long period of war between the Christians and Muslims over the centuries produced a disregard for life and sufferings of the “other.” Related to this, Ferdinand and Isabel of Spain expelled Jews from Spain, and confiscated

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Ibid., 6.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ Ibid., 10.

⁴⁰ Ibid., 12.

⁴¹ Ibid.

their assets in 1492. This was the second important event of the year. In addition, the pressure on the Muslims was also growing. A couple of years later, the Muslims were forced to convert to Catholicism or share the destiny of the Jews in Spain.

That was also around the time when Christopher Columbus emerged as an important historical figure. In the era of exploration, Columbus was a significant person who served initially Portugal, and later Spain. It is important to note that the fifteenth-century geographical expeditions brought about the transformation of medieval Europe into an early modern Europe, which was characterized by exploration, discovery and mercantilism.⁴² Within this scope, in 1492, Columbus weighed anchor from the port of Palos in Spain with the aim of *buscar el Levante por el Poniente* (reaching the East by sailing westward). This was the third important event of the year and it opened the gates of the New World. It can be argued that the geographical expeditions opened up a new ground for the nation state and the rising bourgeoisie. On the other hand, as in the case of Christian reconquests in the Iberian Peninsula, the geographical expeditions of Columbus were also fueled by Catholicism.

Within this context, all of these three important events happened partially on behalf of a religious belief or myth that had its roots in the ancient times. The subject of this stereotypical belief or myth alters from culture to culture; nevertheless, it is observable in different and geographically diverse cultures. Christianity or Roman Catholicism is one belief system of such character. Within this scope, in the second chapter, the concepts of eschatology and millennialism will be addressed by focusing especially on Christianity. In the third chapter, the unification of Spain under Ferdinand of Aragon and Isabel of Castile, the expulsion of the Jews and the reconquest process that was finalized with the takeover of Granada in 1492 will be examined in a framework of existing ethnic tensions in the society. The Muslim and Jewish identities on the Iberian Peninsula in the fifteenth-century will be mentioned briefly within this context. The fourth chapter will concentrate on fifteenth-century geographical expeditions led by Christopher Columbus. The life and voyages of

⁴² It is an economic system based on the idea that the accumulation of precious metals like gold and silver has paramount importance for a nation's wealth and power since the resources of these metals are scarce.

Columbus will be evaluated in terms of his mysterious quest. In the fifth chapter, the underlying millenarian motivation and the role of theopolitics behind the geographical expeditions as well as the Spanish reconquest will be scrutinized. In this sense, the similar aspects of the both incidents will be emphasized. Furthermore, the events originated in the Iberian Peninsula in the fifteenth century will be analyzed in terms of intersecting millenarian prophecies. The imprints of Christian eschatology and millennialism and, the instrumentalization of them in the contemporary politics will also be highlighted.

The interpretation of fifteenth-century Spain and especially geographical expeditions, in this sense, could not be carried out without taking into consideration the letters, journals and other written works of Christopher Columbus. In this context, Christopher Columbus's interaction with Isabel and Ferdinand of Spain is the most reliable source to comprehend their state of mind. Therefore, the overwhelming part of the primary sources will be reserved for Columbus's works.

For the life and voyages of Columbus, in addition to his journals, his son Ferdinand's biographical work and Bartholomé de Las Casas's narrative, Samuel Eliot Morison's *Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus* (1942) and John Noble Wilford's *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy* (1991) will be taken into account. These works are significant for the comparison of the two different views on Columbus. In the *Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus*, Columbus was reflected and praised as a rational man with high morals, godliness, tolerance and scientific spirit whereas the other one focuses more on the human aspect of Columbus rather than his heroization. This study supports the latter view on Columbus asserting that he was a mysterious person who believed that he was driven by God in his voyages for a messianic mission.

Since the subjects of millennialism and eschatology are very complicated and the studies about them commenced a long time ago, Bernard McGinn's *The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism* (2000), Jerry L. Walls's *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology* (2008) and Catherine Wessinger's *The Oxford Handbook of Millennialism* (2011) will be introduced in this study in order to develop a

comprehensive view on the roots and development of Christian eschatology and millennialism. Afterwards, it will be more feasible to establish a connection between them and fifteenth-century Spain. Furthermore, for the primary sources, Augustine's two work, *Confessions* and *The City of God* will be emphasized because he had a central importance for the context of Columbus's eschatological clock.

Before mentioning Columbus, and after explaining the concepts of eschatology and millennialism, for the integrity of the subject, the political developments in the fifteenth-century Spain are going to be mentioned by giving reference to the existing tensions in the society. In fact, the reason why Isabel and Ferdinand supported Columbus in his voyages was highly related to the political atmosphere of Spain during the post-1492 era. In this context, Olivia Remie Constable's *Medieval Iberia Readings from Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources* (1997) is significant for this study since it contains first hand experience and information from the period. Apart from this source, a couple of works will also be introduced to enable to better understand the political events of the era such as the Oxford historian Henry Kamen's *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict* (2005), and Raymond Carr's *Spain A History* (2005). Together with these works, a selection of primary and secondary sources will also be utilized when it is necessary to include a historical fact or an idea of a historically significant person.

CHAPTER 2

ESCHATOLOGY AND MILLENNIALISM

And I saw an angel coming down out of heaven, having the key to the Abyss and holding in his hand a great chain. He seized the dragon, that ancient serpent, who is the devil, or Satan, and bound him for a thousand years.

Revelation 20

Millennialism, millenarianism or chiliasm is an eschatological belief of many Christian denominations. The term “millennialism” derives from the Latin word *millennium* meaning “thousand years.” More precisely, it is a belief, which endorses that there will be a thousand years of golden age of Christianity starting with the second coming of Christ until the day of the final judgment.

This chapter will include eschatology in general and Christian millennialism in special as a part of Christian eschatology.

2.1 Eschatology

Millennialism is closely related to the concept of eschatology. The word “eschatology” is derived from the Greek word *eschatos*, which means “last.” Eschatology, thus, is an area of study, which concentrates on the end of things. In a broader sense, it is concerned with the extinction of the entire creation. In this sense, it is possible to mention two different types of eschatology: individual and cosmic. Individual eschatology is concerned with one’s personal life after death. Cosmic eschatology, on the other hand, is concerned with what will happen to human beings in general at the end of the time. Concepts such as death, the day of judgment,

purgatory, heaven, hell and apocalypse may be enumerated as subject areas of eschatology.

Eschatological belief is accredited by various world religions. The above-mentioned definition of eschatology may be valid for monotheistic religions (Judaism, Christianity and Islam) which embrace the idea that one god has created all things and all creation will eventually come to an end. To put it differently, monotheistic religions' experiences of time is linear; as it is indicated in the respective holy books, they start with the creation and will end with the Day of Judgment. Other religions such as Buddhism or Hinduism, on the other side, possess a cyclical view of time, which suggests that there is a process of perpetual follow up between the death and the life. Since the religions based on that perspective do not experience time as a concept which has an end, their eschatological belief is categorically different from the one of monotheistic religions.

2.1.1 The Concepts of Linear and Cyclical Time with Their Impacts on the Eschatological Belief

Although all humans experience time, the perception of time differs from culture to culture or from one geography to another. In this sense, there are two major ways of perceiving time: cyclical and linear. The first of the two, cyclical time, can be characterized with the regularity and patterns. Cyclical time perception originates from the everyday routines and awareness of human beings such as the hours of the day, seasons in the year and the cycle of the sun and the moon. It suggests that there are patterns between past and present, similar to the patterns that human beings are experiencing in everyday life. A person who perceives time as cyclical could not think of time as a coordinate system starting with zero and going all the way to infinity.⁴³ The reincarnation theory, depending on a spiritual pilgrimage among two or more hosts, is the perfect example of the cyclical view. In this context, time, which is cyclical and repetitive, gives the opportunity to

⁴³ Joseph Needham, *Time and Eastern Man* (Glasgow: Robert MacLehose & Co. Ltd. The University Press, 1965), 4.

compensate one's past actions. That is to say, the reincarnation is considered a new chance to correct past mistakes and live worthily.

Nonetheless, there is an important disadvantage of the cyclical time. Since it depends on the continuity of cycles, there is no end and perhaps no beginning. Human beings, therefore, can be imprisoned inside the cycle. In this respect, the ultimate goal of a Buddhist or Hindu, for instance, is to break out of this cycle. For the cyclical view, the world eras are destroyed one after the other and the most suitable religion is either polytheism (worshipping particular spaces) or pantheism (worshipping the entire space).⁴⁴ In this kind of history, no one or no event have eternal importance. Furthermore, the concept of "historically unique" is not present in this understanding.⁴⁵ Many ancient and tribal cultures including the Sumerian, Ancient Greek and Chinese presuppose a cyclical view of time where history restlessly repeats itself. Among living religions, Buddhism, Jainism and Hinduism can be the perfect examples of this kind. As Buddhism and Jainism, Hinduism is also originated from Vedic Brahmanism.⁴⁶ Later in time, the rivalry between *Shramana* (the school of thought which Buddhism and Jainism belong) and *Brahmana* (Vedic Brahmanism) traditions gave rise to the foundation of Hinduism.

Our knowledge of Hindu religion and eschatology, in this context, originates from the sources of both Vedic Brahmanism and *Shramanic* religions. The sources of Hindu religion might be classified under two categories: *Smriti* and *Sruti*.⁴⁷ In these oral and traditional texts, there is a generally accepted set of beliefs and practices. To

⁴⁴ Ibid., 48.

⁴⁵ Ibid., 47.

⁴⁶ Romilia Thapar, *The Penguin History of Early India from the Origins to AD 1300* (Suffolk: Penguin Books, 2002), 171.

⁴⁷ The former is the traditional texts composed by certain authors, and they have been open to change and revision over time. The main subjects of these texts are legends and myths. The renowned examples for this kind are *Mahabharata*, *Ramayana*, *Puranas* and *Dharma Shashtra of Manu*. *Sruti*, on the other hand, are considered authorless sacred texts, which generate the central religious authority in Hinduism. They are mainly Vedas and Upanishads, which are believed to be fixed and originally preserved, and they are not open to change. Although *Smriti* and *Sruti* are both important for Hindu philosophy, *Smriti* texts are more like secondary sources compared to *Sruti* texts.

understand Hindu eschatology, it is essential to go back to the creation in the Vedas⁴⁸ before referring to other concepts. The roots of existence and creation can be found in the *Rgveda* book 10 hymn 129. According to this hymn, there is a supreme power referred as “that one” who had existed when there was no existence. Furthermore, *Rgveda* mentions of other gods besides “That One.” According to the text, “That One” created the world first, and created other gods later.

In addition, from the perspective of the Vedas, there is an undivided wholeness in the universe. This wholeness is the key to the creation and renewal of existence.⁴⁹ Thus, the ultimate goal of a Hindu is to grasp the mystery of creation. To achieve that purpose, a man needs to find the way to be one with the cosmic person through performing *yajna* (sacrifice).⁵⁰ In this respect, the core principle of *yajna* suggests that the ritual death is not annihilation. In this regard, even an ordinary death is considered a sacrifice since the decaying body transforms into different elements in the world.⁵¹ Through *yajna* it is believed that the order and the function of this world is maintained.

Moreover, there are six concepts central to Hindu eschatology. The first one is *samsara*, which is the cycle of the life and the death. As everything material is subject to destruction, humans are also born, live and die. Then re-birth follows. Yet, *samsara* is not a desired situation since the life is suffering. The second concept is *Karma*. It literally means “action”, but it goes deep beyond this. It is the interconnectivity between the action and the event. It suggests that every action, no matter if it is mental or physical or if it is good or bad, will have repercussions.⁵² The

⁴⁸ The word “Vedas” shares the etymological root with the word “wisdom”. Vedas are, a large complex of religious literature originated in Ancient India. They are composed in Vedic Sanskrit. There are four parts of Vedas which differentiates from each other in terms of their contexts: Samhitas (mantras), Aranyakas (texts on rituals, ceremonies, and sacrifices), Brahmanas (commentaries on rituals, ceremonies, sacrifices), Upanishads (spiritual knowledge).

⁴⁹ John M. Koller, *The Indian Way* (New York: Macmillan Publishing Co. Inc., 1982), 53.

⁵⁰ Ibid., 39, 53.

⁵¹ David M. Knipe, “Hindu Eschatology” in *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology* ed. Jerry L. Walls, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 175.

⁵² John M. Koller, *The Indian Way*, 59.

significant correlation between *karma* and *samsara* is that, in order to break out of *samsara*, one needs to live a life accumulating no further karmic forces.⁵³

For the liberation from *samsara*, on the other side, one needs to live a good life. In order to live a good life, one needs to follow the four steps in life. These are *dharma* (morality), *artha* (goods of life, materials such as money and clothes), *kama* (enjoyment) and *moksa* (liberation). Especially, *dharma* and *moksa* constitute the core of Hindu eschatology.

In the end, those who have good *karma*, go to the sun first and to the path of the Gods later, and they do not return.⁵⁴ Those who could not break the cycle of *samsara*, on the other hand, first go to the moon, and then to the path of their ancestors. Decided by their *karma*, they come back to the world as natural powers either such as the wind or rain, or as human beings. Good *karma*, in this respect, is rewarded with high social class. The lowest re-birth is defined as coming to the world in non-human forms such as insects or ghosts.⁵⁵

In the cosmic level, similar to human experience, the god *Brahma* experiences cycles. The *Puranas*⁵⁶ assert that *Brahma* (cosmos) experiences 1.000 cycles in one day, and each cycle is equal to 4.320.000 human years. At the end of 36.000 *Brahma* days, the god ceases to have a rebirth.⁵⁷ Together with *Brahma*, *Vishnu* and *Shiva* constitute a trinity, which is called *trimurti* in Hindu tradition. In fact, all three are the representatives of the same. *Brahma* is considered to be the creator, *Vishnu* the preserver and *Shiva* the destroyer. There is a unity and bond of neediness between these three. When *Brahma* ceases and rest after 36.000 days, it is

⁵³ Ibid., 60.

⁵⁴ David M. Knipe, "Hindu Eschatology," 178.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ Puranas are parts of Vedas. They are composed of epic stories about creation and destruction of the universe, kings, heroes and gods.

⁵⁷ David M. Knipe, "Hindu Eschatology," 178.

the duty of the other two gods to trigger his emergence again.⁵⁸ That is to say, even when *Brahma* ceases to exist, he emerges again for a new life cycle.

In conclusion, there are endless life cycles in Hinduism both in personal and universal levels. In this sense, there is no such concepts as the apocalypse and the destruction of universe in Hinduism or other polytheist religions whereas these are inevitably related to the Christian millennialism.

Linear or diachronic time, on the other hand, perceives time as a straight line with a beginning and an end rather than a repetitive cycle. People are born, get old and die, and that is the ultimate end of created life in the temporal sphere. It does not possess the concept of rebirth in it, as in the case of cyclical time. In this sense, the linear time perspective highlights the continuity, tradition and linkages.⁵⁹ Communities with diachronic historical understanding tend to give more importance to their passed relatives and ancestors than the communities with cyclical time perspective. Human beings, who sense time linearly, are inclined to place themselves in the world with reference to their ancestors. In this respect, family trees and bloodlines have great significance in terms of political and social power legitimization. For instance, legitimization for the throne in Turkish history had always come from two bloodlines: Oghuz and Genghis. In this sense, whereas the Ottoman sultans based their family line to Oghuz Khan, Timurlenk tried to establish kinship to Genghis Khan although he was of Turkic origin. The interest for basing bloodline on an important person was also evident in monotheistic religions. All three monotheistic religions; Judaism, Christianity and Islam -also known as Abrahamic religions- attribute their prophets' bloodline to Abraham first, and back in time from Abraham to Adam and Eve.

Similar with the idea that the past has a strong impact on the present day, the same timeline also reaches through and affects the future.⁶⁰ The effect of the future is more obvious in monotheistic religions. All three of them suggest that one God created all beings, and the world will come to an end. The end means the destruction

⁵⁸ Ibid., 180.

⁵⁹ Penelope J. Corfield, *Time and the Shape of History* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007), 80.

⁶⁰ Ibid., 83.

of the universe and material things, and it will be followed by an inquiry of humans about their deeds in the life. On the judgment day, the ones who live their lives in accordance with the religious doctrine will be rewarded with heaven. There, they will be surrounded by countless blessings and they will stay happily for all eternity. The ones who disclaim the holy discipline, on the other hand, will be deemed to suffer in the hell. In contrast to cyclical time, linear time neither carries the notion of repetitiveness nor provides humans with another chance to correct their past mistakes. Furthermore, even if total destruction or apocalypse will occur at a very distant future, when a person dies it is considered to be a small apocalypse because the death ends the vitality. In this context, since there is no reincarnation or travelling of mental or spiritual consciousness in the monotheistic religions, death marks the termination of the capability to make right or wrong.

The most appropriate religion in terms of the linear view of time is monotheism, in which one God creates and controls the time and everything happening in it.⁶¹ The apocalyptic Christianity is one of these religions possessing the idea that the good will win over the evil eventually. In this context, the Christian eschatology will be explained in detail in the subsequent part.

2.1.2 Christian Eschatology

Millenarianism and Christian eschatology are highly interconnected subjects. In fact, millenarianism can be understood as a belief of a unique period in an eschatological time clock. Jesus Christ is the center of both the Christian eschatology and millenarianism with his half-human and half-god character. In this regard, the *Gospels* provide information about the life and teachings of Christ. When reading the *Gospels*, one can deduce the fact that the Christian doctrine is built on the linear time perspective. The *Gospel* of Matthew,⁶² in this context, starts with the bloodline of

⁶¹ Joseph Needham, *Time and Eastern Man*, 48.

⁶² Together with the Gospels of Mark, Luke and John, the Gospel of Matthew was accepted as one of the four official gospels of Christianity in Council of Nicaea in 325 under the presidency of the Roman Emperor Constantine. These gospels were written by Mark, Luke, John and Matthew in order

Jesus, moves to his birth, his divine character and supernatural doings, his virtues and altruistic character and closes up with the crucifixion and the resurrection.

First, there is a strong emphasis on the bloodline of Jesus. It is stated in the *Gospel* that Jesus shares the direct bloodline from Abraham, David, Solomon and others, which gives him the right to rule. In other words, the *Gospel* opens up with the divine legitimization. Secondly, it is stressed that his birth was supernatural. His mother Mary was the fiancée of a man called Joseph. Yet before they got married, she got pregnant with Jesus. According to the text, she was still a virgin when she got pregnant by the Holy Spirit. In this sense, Jesus's birth is reflected as a supernatural and divine event.

Later on, God acknowledges Jesus as his son and his divine character started to be exposed in the text. Some of his godly skills, in this sense, are listed as healing the disabled with a touch, walking on the surface of water, dividing the lake into two and even resurrecting the dead. Furthermore, there is the indication of the twelve apostles of Jesus, to whom he taught how to defeat the evil spirits and cure the diseases. It was one of these apostles, according to the *Gospel*, that betrayed Jesus and caused his crucifixion. There are also verses referring to the devoted personality of Jesus such as Matthew 16:21, which starts with Jesus's decision to go to Jerusalem. He already knew that this departure would bring him suffering from the hands of the elders and chief priests and scribes, and finally he would be killed, and be raised again the third day. The message here is that although he knew the consequences, he followed God's orders and did not hesitate for the sake of people. In this regard, Catholic Christians believe that Jesus's death was in accordance with God's will as well as his resurrection from the death. When he was risen from the death, God made him Christ. The word "Christ" originally implies the term "messiah" as it is expressed in Matthew 20. Thus, Catholic Christian faith is a messianic faith where there is hope and expectation that a savior will set up his kingdom on earth and reign with justice.

to transfer information about the life and teachings of Christ to the following generations. In other words, these *gospels* are not revelations from the God.

Within this scope, Psalm 110 says; “The Lord (God) says to my lord (Jesus): ‘Sit at my right hand until I make your enemies a footstool for your feet.’” In this sense, God has taken Jesus as his right hand temporarily until the day Jesus and his enemies will confront. With reference to this verse, Christians believe that Jesus Christ, who is both human and divine, will come to life again to claim and restore God’s kingdom on earth, and prepare the doomsday as it was promised by God.

For the Christian eschatology, the main sources are the *Old Testament* and the *New Testament* (mostly *Revelation*) scriptures. There is a long list of literature about resurrection, the Kingdom of God, the destruction of the world (apocalypse) and the phase of eternal life in the *Testaments*.

In the Christian eschatology, there is the concept of resurrection. After the death, the spiritual element or the soul leaves the body until the day of resurrection. On that day, the body and soul will merge again. After the Day of Judgment, human beings would go to hell or heaven for an eternal punishment or an eternal life of joy. Resurrection in Christianity is a two-staged phenomenon. The first stage, as it was mentioned above, is related to the resurrection of Christ in 29 or 30 AD. In Romans 8:11, it is stated that “But if the Spirit of him that raised up Jesus from the dead dwell in you, he that raised up Christ from the dead shall also quicken your mortal bodies by his Spirit that dwelled in you.” From this passage, it can be inferred that once resurrected Christ will become a guide for the resurrection of the body of the ordinary people. This resurrection is not related only to the souls, it will also be a bodily resurrection that will happen after the Kingdom of God is founded on earth and when God’s will win over the enemies of the faith.

Furhermore, there are verses mentioning the Day of Judgment. Daniel 12:2 is one of them and it states, “And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake, some to everlasting life, and some to shame and everlasting contempt.” This verse focuses on the judgment day when human beings will be classified to either everlasting joy or everlasting suffering depending on their actions when they were alive. After the Day of Judgment, the concepts of heaven and hell become more of an issue. The heaven is a widely mentioned concept in the *New Testament*. Different verses describe the heaven, define it as the true and eternal home of people, and give

advices about how to reach this blessing. John 14:2, Philippians 3:20-21 and John 14:6 may be good examples. In addition, hell also occupies an important place in the *New Testament*. In *Revelation* 21:8, cowards, unbelievers, viles, murderers, sexually immoral, magicians, idolaters and liars are presented as the candidates for hell. In various passages, the suffering and the tortures in hell are also mentioned. As it was stated in Jude 1:7, the basic instrument of hell is fire and it is not a desired place because there is suffering for the evil for all eternity.

In conclusion, Christianity possesses a view that God has created all beings including the time itself. If the history is considered to be a coordinate system, the creation would be the point zero, and there would be a continuous progress until the apocalypse which marks the end of the world days. After the apocalypse, a new dimension would be unlocked, and it will continue for all eternity.

2.2 Millennialism

Millennialism (or millenarianism), essentially, is the hope that in the near future there will be a major change both progressive and destructive, which will lead to the collective salvation of human beings. In this respect, the holy books, prophets, messiahs and other people related to the issue are all regarded as messengers that are obliged to guide common people about what they have to do in order to be the part of the millennial kingdom.⁶³

In almost every culture, millennial ideas are closely related to gaining political power. In ancient polytheistic societies, it was believed that collective salvation would be reached by supporting the ruling dynasty.⁶⁴ Ancient Egyptian and Mesopotamian texts followed a pattern, which asserted that after an economic or an agricultural stagnation periods, a strong ruler would emerge to bring peace and prosperity to the torn society and restore the sacred old customs.⁶⁵ In fact, this

⁶³ Catherine Wessinger, "Millennialism in Cross Cultural Perspective," in *The Oxford Handbook of Millennialism*, ed. Catherine Wessinger, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 3.

⁶⁴ Ibid., 10.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

anticipation of the coming of a strong ruler is not merely attached to Mesopotamia or its surroundings. Almost every society experiencing tough times, expected a savior who would free them from the misery. Kalki in Hinduism, Saoshyant in Zoroastrianism, Maitreya in Buddhism, Prashai Siva in Sabians, and Miroku in Shintoism can be examples of this kind.

From the monotheistic perspective, the holy message of an imminent destruction and apocalypse was utilized as an effective tool to convince the disciples to change their lives.⁶⁶ Apocalyptic Judaism and early Christianity, for instance, envisaged a final battle between the forces of light and darkness.⁶⁷ It is not clear whether human beings take part in this cosmic war yet, they need to adjust their lives accordingly.⁶⁸

Some themes are common and observable in all three monotheistic religions such as the Doom's Day, resurrection after the death and judgment day.⁶⁹ There are also some concepts that are probably included later. For instance, the biggest signs of the Doom's day are enlisted in *Quran* as a beast arising from the earth⁷⁰ and Ya'juj Ma'juj⁷¹. However, in the hadiths, which are the alleged sayings of Prophet Mohammad, there are other big signs such as Antichrist (*Dajjal*), the fight between Jesus and Antichrist, the victory of Jesus, sunrise from the west, the big fire which starts in Yemen, and the appearance of *Mahdi*.⁷² In this respect, it can be stated that the monotheistic religions influenced each other and further similarities between Islam, Judaism and Christianity may be found, although most of them are not based on the *Holy Quran*.

⁶⁶ Ibid.

⁶⁷ Ibid.

⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ Ibid.

⁷⁰ For more information see, An-Naml:82.

⁷¹ For more information see, Al-Anbya:96.

⁷² A male person from Prophet Mohammed's bloodline who will restore the true religion and outlaw heresy.

Overall, monotheistic millennial ideas share three common concepts: the sacred time, the sacred geography and the sacred commonwealth.⁷³ The sacred time refers to the important dates, specific years, sacred years and timeline. The sacred geography indicates sacred places, and the most important one is Jerusalem, which is holy for all three monotheistic religions. Lastly, the sacred commonwealth refers to the people living under the millennial kingdom.⁷⁴

2.2.1 Christian Millennialism

Christian millennialism depends upon the idea that Christ will return (the Second Advent) once more, and a thousand years of joy, happiness, righteousness and so forth will begin under his physical existence. The millennium can be understood as a sub-period of Christian eschatology.

And I saw an angel coming down out of heaven, having the key to the Abyss and holding in his hand a great chain. He seized the dragon, that ancient serpent, who is the devil, or Satan, and bound him for a thousand years. [...] They came to life and reigned with Christ a thousand years. (The rest of the dead did not come to life until the thousand years were ended.) This is the first resurrection. Blessed and holy are those who share in the first resurrection. The second death has no power over them, but they will be priests of God and of Christ and will reign with him for a thousand years.⁷⁵

Millennium is the period that will take place after the great war in heaven in which the armies of the beast (Antichrist) are going to be defeated by the armies of Christ. After Christ and his angel fellows defeat Satan and his followers *Gog and Magog*⁷⁶, Satan would be bound for a thousand years. This process is explained allegorically in the *Revelation* chapter of the *New Testament*. In this chapter, John

⁷³ Catherine Wessinger, "Millennialism in Cross Cultural Perspective," 11.

⁷⁴ Rebecca Moore, "European Millennialism," in *The Oxford Handbook of Millennialism*, ed. Catherine Wessinger (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 284-285.

⁷⁵ For more information see, *Revelation*:20.

⁷⁶ In *Old Testament*, *Gog and Magog* is prophesized as invader of Israel and evil forces that try to deflect devotees from God's path. *Gog and Magog* has an important place in apocalyptic literature. Equivalent of *Gog and Magog* in *Holy Qur-an* is *Yājūj and Mājūj*.

meets with Christ in the spiritual world. Christ shows him the future scenario about the end of the world and gives him some directions. For example, Christ urges John to write down the visions and distribute them to the seven churches⁷⁷ (communities) of Asia Minor.⁷⁸

Furthermore, from the passages in the *Revelation* it can also be inferred that this thousand-year rule of Christ would be in between two major wars. In this context, Satan would be freed after one thousand years of captivity and there would be a final conflict (*Armageddon*) in which Satan would be killed by Christ and Kingdom of the Lord is restored forever. In this respect, millennium is the period between Satan's first captivity and the release from captivity. Explicitly, the *Revelation* chapter of the *New Testament* is one of the main sources of Christian millennialism. On the other hand, early Christian millenarians also quoted *Old Testament* prophecies and formulated Jewish predictions that Jerusalem would become the capital of the world. In this sense, it can be asserted that some assumptions and prophecies from the Jewish tradition also involved in the formulation of Christian millennialism.

There are different views in Christian eschatology about the starting point of the thousand years. The most prevalent three opinions on the subject are premillennialism, amillennialism and postmillennialism. Firstly, premillennialism holds that after the Second Coming of Christ, a literal thousand years of reign will start and peace and justice will prevail on the earth until the judgment day. Before the coming of Christ, the world would be in turmoil, there would be wars and rumors of wars, hunger, natural disasters and the rise of Antichrist.⁷⁹ In this context, Christ will come with his disciples; he will defeat his enemies and establish his rule on earth.

The Christian Church, after the apostolic era (starting from 33 BCE) up until the third century, approved premillennial view on the Second Advent. In the third

⁷⁷ These churches are Ephesus, Smyrna, Pergamon, Thyatira, Sardis, Philadelphia, and Laodicea.

⁷⁸ For more information see, *Revelation* 1:11.

⁷⁹ Timothy P. Weber, "Millennialism" in *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology* ed. Jerry L. Walls (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 367.

century, however, the premillennial view was abandoned for a variety of reasons such as the premillennial view's emphasis on earthly rewards, the hostility between Judaism and Christianity, the death of the millennial expectation under the rule of Constantine since the emergence of state and Church had put an end to the Christian misery, the influence of Augustine, and the rise of the Roman Church which endorsed itself as the kingdom of God on earth.⁸⁰

Secondly, amillennialism suggests that the thousand years has already initiated by the resurrection of Christ. On the other hand, this reign is not a literally a reign, but it is manifested in the body of the Church. In this regard, all the prophecies concerning the eternal kingdom of Christ on earth are and will be fulfilled by the Church. The advocates of this view support the idea that the *Old Testament's* prophecy about the future golden age suggests a new order or heaven for the deserving people after the last judgment.⁸¹ This option attracts the attention of especially the classical theologians, and has been widely accepted among Christians since the fifth and sixth centuries.⁸²

Augustine of Hippo (354-430), who was a fourth and early fifth-century Christian philosopher, contributed greatly to the foundations and the rise of amillennial view. Before Augustine, amillennial view was regarded as one of the heresies created by the spiritual school of Alexandria. After Augustine, amillennial view became the prevailing doctrine of the Roman Church.⁸³

In his renowned work *De Civitate Dei* [The City of God], completed in 426, Augustine asserted that the Church is the kingdom of God on earth. According to Augustine, the thousand years mentioned in the *Revelation* 20 are not literal thousand years. Yet it ought to be interpreted as a figure of speech for the last era of the history or as an image of perfection, which already exists in the life of the saints and the

⁸⁰ J. Dwight Pentecost, *Things to Come* (Michigan: Dunham Publishing Company, 1958), 377 – 380.

⁸¹ Timothy P. Weber, "Millennialism," 367.

⁸² *Ibid.*, 368.

⁸³ J. Dwight Pentecost, *Things to Come*, 381.

institution of the Church.⁸⁴ Augustine's ideas about millennialism will be covered in detail under the next subtitle.

Finally, postmillennialism argues that the millennium will be initiated as a consequence of the growth of the Christian Kingdom.⁸⁵ In this theological interpretation, human involvement matters in order to initiate the millennium. For the return of Christ, the world must be Christianized through preaching the *Gospel*, and every human being must surrender to its teachings. The believers in this view rely on the literal millennium, and they generally follow the *Old Testament* teaching about the nature of that kingdom. This view is referred to as "post-millennial" because the followers of this view believe that Christ will return after the millennium.⁸⁶ In this respect, the golden age would arrive as a result of the Christian social and political activity in the world.⁸⁷

The third standpoint has been an excuse for the Catholic kings and queens in their conquests. Isabel of Castile and Ferdinand of Aragon are the most prominent examples among them. After their coronation and the unification of Spain, they became the most vigorous representatives of Catholic Christian faith and warship. Christopher Columbus, who had initiated his journey to India, started his letter in which he announced his discovery in 1493 as follows "I know you will be rejoiced at the glorious success that our Lord has given me in my voyage."⁸⁸ and in the same letter he continued by stating that "[he] ... gave a thousand good and pretty things that I had to win [natives'] love, and to induce them to become Christians, and to love and serve their Highnesses and the whole Castilian nation, and help to get for us

⁸⁴ Robert E. Lerner, "Millennialism," 329.

⁸⁵ Jerry L. Walls, "Introduction" in *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology*, ed. Jerry L. Walls (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 13.

⁸⁶ J. Dwight Pentecost, *Things to Come*, 371-372.

⁸⁷ Alexander Chow, "Eschatology and World Christianity," *Studies in World Christianity* 22, no.3: (2016), 206.

⁸⁸ "The Letter from Columbus to Luis De Santángel," *American Journeys Collection*, accessed January 12, 2019, <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-063/>

things they have in abundance, which are necessary to us.”⁸⁹ The details of the deeds of Christopher Columbus and Spanish Monarchs, in terms of Catholic millennialism, will be broadly mentioned in the subsequent parts.

2.2.2 The Roots and the Transformation of the Christian Eschatology and Millennialism

2.2.2.1 The Second and Third Centuries

Millenarian hopes started to play an important role in the future expectations of prominent Christian thinkers in the second and third centuries in Anatolia, Rome, North Africa, and Egypt.⁹⁰ In this context, Eusebius of Caesarea (263-339) quoted third-century bishop Dionysius of Alexandria as attributing to Cerinthus the hope that the faithful would enjoy, under Christ's rule, a thousand year "wedding feast" of material pleasures in Jerusalem after their resurrection.⁹¹

Secondly, Justin Martyr (d. 165) was an early Christian apologist who developed, for the first time, a consistent picture about Christian eschatology and millennial hope.⁹² He asserted that Christ would live two times, his first coming was full of suffering and pain but the second one would be in glory and full of divine power. He also predicted that the second coming would take place in Jerusalem and would be the sign of the long-awaited Day of Judgment.⁹³ In this period, according to Justin, righteous people would live in ease and joy in the restored Jerusalem for a thousand years until the Day of Judgment. Then, the eternal life would start and the

⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁹⁰ Brian E. Daley, "Apocalypticism in Early Christian Theology," in *The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism*, ed. Bernard McGinn, (New York: The Continuum Publishing Group, 2000.), 7.

⁹¹ Ibid.

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ Ibid., 7-8.

righteous people would be equal of the angels.⁹⁴ For Justin, bodily resurrection of Christ was an indispensable aspect of the coming millennium.

Considering the second century, Irenaeus of Lyons (died after 198) was the third person who is significant. Irenaeus shared the same ideas with Justin about the bodily resurrection of Christ and the transformation of present cosmos during the millennium.⁹⁵ Following a traditional Jewish thought, Irenaeus assumed that human history would be limited with a "week" of six thousand years.⁹⁶ His conception of the scenario of history's end closely followed the *Old Testament*. With reference to Daniel, the end-time would be initiated by Antichrist, an unjust and wicked ruler, who would be seeking to be worshiped as a god. Irenaeus suggested that the number 666⁹⁷ was a code for Antichrist's name.⁹⁸

Another significant Christian thinker who contributed to the millennial hope was Hippolytus (d. 235). In his renowned work, *On Christ and Antichrist* (w. 200), he analyzed both the *Old Testament* and the *New Testament* (especially *Revelation*) in order to develop a vision for the end of history.⁹⁹ Hippolytus was also the person who vividly pictured Antichrist. According to him, Antichrist would claim that he is the Messiah who carries all the symbols of the son of God.¹⁰⁰ He would also build the temple in Jerusalem, which was destroyed for the second time¹⁰¹ by the Roman commander and the forthcoming emperor Titus in 70 CE and dismantled totally by Roman Emperor Hadrian in 135 CE. Furthermore, Antichrist would control the Eastern Mediterranean including Egypt, Libya, Tyre and Berytus and put an end to

⁹⁴ Ibid., 8.

⁹⁵ Ibid.

⁹⁶ Ibid.

⁹⁷ For more information see, *Revelation* 13:18.

⁹⁸ Brian E. Daley, "Apocalypticism in Early Christian Theology," 8.

⁹⁹ Ibid., 12.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid.

¹⁰¹ First incident happened under the reign of Babylonian king Nebuchadnezzar II in 587 BCE.

the Roman rule.¹⁰² His followers, according to Hippolytus, would be mainly the Jews and after acquiring enough power, Antichrist would start the persecution of the Christian Church.¹⁰³ Only the just and righteous people and true Christians would be able to endure this suffering with patience until Christ comes and defeats the beast.

Fifthly, Cyprian of Carthage (d. 258) thought that violent conflicts within the Empire and the Church were the signs of the world's final crises.¹⁰⁴ These troubles, according to him, were not caused by a natural depletion of human and cosmic powers but by the judgment of God. Within this context, Cyprian asserted that the rule of Antichrist was near.¹⁰⁵

In this century, one of the most influential figures, beyond dispute, was Origen of Alexandria (185 – 253/254). Origen affirmed clearly, in his book *Against Celsus* (c. 250), that his first goal as a Christian evangelist¹⁰⁶ was to convince the pagans that there would be a judgment day in which people will be judged based on their deeds.¹⁰⁷ He also believed that the future sufferings under the rule of Antichrist needs to be understood as a means to salvation. He, in this sense, resembled the suffering under the rule of Antichrist to the suffering of the Jews under the rule of Titus and Hadrian.¹⁰⁸

2.2.2.2 The Fourth and Fifth Centuries

Moving into fourth and fifth centuries, we encounter new Christian thinkers who focused on the subject. The first of them was a Gallic theologian Hilary of Poitiers (315-367) who followed Origen about the rule and the defeat of Antichrist,

¹⁰² Brian E. Daley, "Apocalypticism in Early Christian Theology," 12.

¹⁰³ Ibid.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., 14.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ Etymologically means "bringer of good news," derives from *eu-* "good" and *angellein* "announce".

¹⁰⁷ Brian E. Daley, "Apocalypticism in Early Christian Theology," 15.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., 16.

second coming of Christ, resurrection from the death and the final judgment.¹⁰⁹ Similarly, Ambrose of Milan (334-397), contemporary of Hilary, was also a follower of Origenist tradition.

Apollinarius of Laodicea (310-390), on the other hand, was an important figure with his revivalist ideas about Christian millennialism. He held “Jewish” expectations of a millennium. He believed, the Jewish cult and religious practices would be revived during the second coming of Christ as well as the Temple of Jerusalem.¹¹⁰ It is important to show that since the predictions based on the *Old Testament* and *New Testament* are intertwined, the line between Jewish and Christian apocalypticism from time to time is rather vague.

More striking were the ideas of Sulpicius Severus (d. 420) who was a disciple of Martin of Tours (d. 397) and also a biographer and historian. In his *Dialogues*, he cited Martin about Christ’s second coming.¹¹¹ According to Martin, Emperor Nero’s (37-68) and Antichrist’s acquisition of power was a must. Furthermore, he asserted that Nero was not dead but hiding in a secret place. Within this framework, Nero would be the ruler of the West, Antichrist would be the ruler of East. The Temple in Jerusalem would be reconstructed by Antichrist, he would impose circumcision, and claim to be the Messiah, the son of God.¹¹² Eventually, Antichrist would defeat Nero and rule the world, until he is defeated by Christ.¹¹³ According to Severus, Martin believed that Antichrist was already an alive young boy whose spirit was seized by the evil powers. He would assume power as soon as he became a proper age.¹¹⁴

The fifth-century political turmoil within the Roman Empire represented itself also in religious works. A fictitious dialogue between a Christian and a non-believer composed by North African bishop Evodius of Uzala was an example of this kind.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid., 20.

¹¹⁰ Ibid., 22.

¹¹¹ Ibid., 23.

¹¹² Ibid.

¹¹³ Ibid.

¹¹⁴ Ibid.

The name of his work is *Consultations of Zacchaeus and Apollonius*. In this context, Christian Zacchaeus believed that the violence of the time is a manifestation of the fact that the end was near. Christ would come sooner, but only God knew the exact time of his return.¹¹⁵ Zacchaeus's predictions of future events followed a similar pattern. Firstly, Elijah the prophet, son of David, would come, and he would be followed by Antichrist. Pagans would conceive them as divine and they would restore the Jewish law. Later Christ will come, defeat Antichrist, the dead would be resurrected, Day of Judgment would begin, new heaven and new earth would be established and the just ones would live in glory and joy.¹¹⁶

2.2.2.3 The Contributions of the Latin Fathers

When speaking of the Christian theology and the biblical scholarship, the ideas of Latin Fathers matter the most. In this sense, Jerome (331-420) initially followed Origen's methods while interpreting the scriptures. Similar to Origen, Jerome believed that the events and persons in the *New Testament* end scenario would take place in the physical, but not in the spiritual world. Nevertheless, he asserted that it is possible to derive allegorical and spiritual interpretations from the scriptures in terms of asceticism and the life within the Church.¹¹⁷ In this regard, Jerome believed the second coming of Christ has two meanings: One was the eschatological meaning in terms of world's coming to an end, whereas the other one implied a person's encounter with Christ in death or even the spiritual rapprochement of a person to death in ascetical practice.¹¹⁸ In this context, Jerome argues that the thousand year kingdom is a symbol of the virgin life, which is praised in the *Gospel* of Matthew.¹¹⁹

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

¹¹⁶ Ibid., 24.

¹¹⁷ Ibid., 27.

¹¹⁸ Ibid., 27-28.

¹¹⁹ Ibid., 28.

Therefore, in his *Commentary on Matthew* (w. 398), Jerome suggested that the events in Matthew 24 could refer to different realities. They might refer to the historical events about the destruction of Jerusalem in 70, they might refer to the approaching apocalypse, or alternatively they might be understood in terms of the present life of the Church.¹²⁰ The rule of Antichrist, for example, can be regarded as the triumph of heresy and heretical teachings from which true believers must avoid.

Being a witness to Rome's fall to the Visigoths in 410 had a great effect on Jerome. In the preface to his *Commentary on Ezekiel* (w. 411), for instance, he commented:

For days and nights, I could think of nothing else but the safety of all the people; when my dear ones were captured, I felt myself a captive, too, sharing in the captivity of the saints... After the brightest light of all the world had been extinguished, indeed the head of the Roman Empire had been cut off, and-to speak more truly-after the whole world died in one city, then "I became silent and lay on the ground, and spoke no good words."¹²¹

From this point of view, Jerome started to believe that the chaos and heresies that troubled the Church were clear signs of the end of the days.

Before commenting on the ideas of Augustine, there is one more person to mention since he had an intellectual influence on Augustine. This person was the Donatist exegete Tyconius (d. 380). Tyconius is important for his categorization of humanity into two cities or societies as laid down in the *Revelation*: one of God and one of evil.¹²² His influence on Augustine is evident in this respect. Furthermore, just like Jerome and Origen, Tyconius also believed that the thousand-year reign of Christ is accessible spiritually for the true believers.¹²³ For instance, in his judgment, sinning openly referred the release of Satan from the chains in human heart.¹²⁴

¹²⁰ Ibid.

¹²¹ Ibid.

¹²² Ibid., 29.

¹²³ Ibid.

¹²⁴ Ibid.

The use of eschatological themes by Augustine of Hippo was, on the other hand, more varied and more complex. Furthermore, he is more significant for our study since his ideas deeply influenced Christopher Columbus, the Spanish Monarchs and the Western Church in general. Augustine, like Jerome, believed that the biblical prophecies refer to the future events, yet the spiritual interpretation of the scriptures has a crucial importance.¹²⁵ Furthermore, Augustine's views on the apocalypse was fully intertwined with his general perception of history. In this sense, he tackled with the questions such as what history is and how we consider its meaning. In addition, he explained his perception of eternity, time, and eschatology. The center of history, for Augustine, was the incarnation of Christ, therefore salvation, and this concept is pivotal in all historical events. In order to understand Augustine's ideas on the matter, the main source is his book *The City of God Against the Pagans*, which was composed of twenty books and written between the years 413–426. Yet other writings, such as *Confessions* and *On Christian Doctrine* also include important details.

Being an eschatological thinker, salvation was the key concept of his attention. According to Augustine, the world was created out of nothing and this creation was a plan for salvation. Augustine believed that God sacrificed his son, the mediator between God and the humanity, for the salvation of all humanity.¹²⁶ In this sense, only the people who follow the right path of Christ and his Church would be redeemed. To put it differently, salvation means entering the Kingdom of Heaven that only the performers of Christ's teachings will enter.¹²⁷

According to Augustine, time is a creation of God so God's eternity is before all time, exists in all time and extends beyond all time.¹²⁸ Furthermore, time is only measurable when it is flowing. To put it differently, it can be measured within the

¹²⁵ Ibid., 30.

¹²⁶ Augustinus, *İtiraflar* (İstanbul: Kabalcı, 2010), 357.

¹²⁷ Augustine, *The City of God Against the Pagans*, ed. R. W. Dyson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 988.

¹²⁸ Augustinus, *İtiraflar*, 370.

present time through the strength of the human mind.¹²⁹ The human mind measures past times with memory and future times with expectations.¹³⁰ Without God's triggering the creation, from Augustine's point of view, there would be no time, no world, no human beings and no history.¹³¹ For Augustine, history is linear and predestined. It was initiated by the creation of God and would end with the second coming of Christ. He categorized history as sacred and non-sacred or secular history. The sacred history, for Augustine, consists of the events documented in the Christian Scriptures, which were written under divine inspiration. Anything written apart from *historia sacra* is secular or profane history. In this sense, the history of Church, for instance, is not sacred history because it is not composed with divine inspiration.¹³²

Augustine can be argued as the first theologian who combined Christianity and history as a whole. In this regard, his work *The City of God* was a response to the allegations that the decline of the Roman Empire was a consequence of the abolition of the pagan worship. Augustine's writing of this book only three years after the sack of Rome clearly indicates that this book was a plea against those accusations. According to the archaeologist Ian Morris's universal social development index, the fall of the Roman Empire was the biggest back step in human history.¹³³ During the Renaissance, the period after the fall of the Roman Empire was portrayed as Dark Ages. For this was a big event and it had major repercussions in European history, from Christianity to climate change many things were blamed for the destruction of the Empire.¹³⁴ Although the Roman Empire was not yet fully finalized when *The City of God* was composed, certain factors were started to be pinpointed as the reasons of the decline. In contrast to the pagan allegations, which asserted that Christianity was responsible for the decline, Augustine promoted that

¹²⁹ Ibid., 388-393.

¹³⁰ Ibid.

¹³¹ Ibid., 372.

¹³² Ibid.

¹³³ Gürkan Ergin, "Romanın Çöküşü ve İklim Değişiklikleri," *Aktüel Arkeoloji* no. 68 (2019), 74.

¹³⁴ Ibid.

Rome's decline was a consequence of a moral decay within the Empire, and Christianity saved it from turning into complete wreckage.

In *The City of God*, Augustine also dwells on the concept of salvation. He gave examples of massacres and bloodshed from the history of Troy¹³⁵ and Rome¹³⁶ during which the pagan gods did not protect their subjects because there were not true gods, and people worshipped false gods. From this point of view, Augustine regarded pagans as wrongly directed people who needed to be instructed to the right way because pagans' gods never laid down any holy doctrine of virtuous living¹³⁷ and took no care to prevent the Republic from being ruined by bad morals.¹³⁸ Furthermore, Augustine asserted that the Kingdom of the Jews, which was established by one true God, was also preserved by him as long as people remained in the true religion.¹³⁹

Augustine outlined his vision of the two societies, the City of God and the City of Man in this book. The former is the land of belief whereas the latter is the land of denial where the wicked people live. The characteristics of the City of God and the City of Man are explained between the Books XV–XVIII. Augustine's eschatological understanding, on the other hand, is surfaced in the last four books. In Book XIX, Augustine explained the end of the both cities. In this respect, people who belong to the City of God would experience eternal peace and greatest good whereas those who do not belong to it would be in everlasting misery.¹⁴⁰ He said "just as misery is the opposite of happiness, and death of life, so it seems that the opposite of peace is war."¹⁴¹ What he meant by saying this is that while good people (people who belong to City of God) will live a peaceful eternal life, the wicked ones

¹³⁵ Augustine, *The City of God Against the Pagans*, 8.

¹³⁶ Ibid., 10-11.

¹³⁷ Ibid., 56-57.

¹³⁸ Ibid., 80-81.

¹³⁹ Ibid., 185.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., 964.

¹⁴¹ Ibid.

(people who belong to City of Man) will be in continuous war in the afterlife: Their human nature would be kept so that they would feel the torture and pain.¹⁴²

In Book XX, Augustine dealt with the concept of the last judgment. He elaborated the subject further by saying that although God is always judging from the beginning of the human race, the last judgment or divine judgment belief of the Church represents the day in which Christ would come from the skies (heaven) and judge the living as well as the dead.¹⁴³ For the proof of the last judgment, Augustine used first the verses of *New Testament* then the verses of *Old Testament* because he asserted that the *Old Testament* was the herald of the *New*.¹⁴⁴ He cited Matthew 11:22, “But I say unto you, It shall be more tolerable for Tyre and Sidon at the day of judgment than for you.”, Matthew 11:24, “Verily, I say unto you, It shall be more tolerable for the land of Sodom in the day of judgment than for thee.” and Matthew 12:41, “The men of Nineveh shall rise in judgment with this generation, and shall condemn it: because they repented at the preaching of Jonah...” to indicate that the judgment day was a biblical reality and with it the dead would also be resurrected.¹⁴⁵

Indicating sources other than the *Bible*, moreover, Augustine emphasized that the coming of a “savior” may refer to the present status of Christ’s Church, more profoundly, the members of the Church.¹⁴⁶ In this context, Christ has been coming part by part and little by little through the establishment of the Church because the institution of the Church is his body.¹⁴⁷

Moving from this point of view, Augustine cited *Revelation* 20 and asserted that most of the people were enchanted by the impact of the passage and believed that there would be a bodily resurrection of Christ in the future and there would be a

¹⁴² Ibid.

¹⁴³ Ibid., 965.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid., 970.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid., 971.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., 973.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid.

thousand years, a kind of Sabbath during that time.¹⁴⁸ Augustine regarded this opinion as tolerable only if the joy that the saints would experience in these thousand years would be a spiritual one.¹⁴⁹ He believed that only the carnal people could hold such ideas whereas the spiritual ones use the word millenarians for those who believe in such things.¹⁵⁰ In this sense, Augustine came up with the idea that the *Revelation* of John was an allegorical text and there must be an effort to decode its true meaning.

Firstly, he cited Matthew 12:29, “No man can enter into a strong man’s house, and take his property, except he first bind the strong man.” to assert that strong man here represents the devil because he has a control over humans through various sins.¹⁵¹ Secondly, he cited *Revelation* 20 “And he laid hold on the dragon, that old serpent, which is the Devil, and Satan, and bound him a thousand years...” and states, this part of the passage promotes the idea that Satan is bound and lack of power so that he cannot seduce people who belong to Christ, to put it differently, to the Church.¹⁵² He corroborated his idea with other verses from the passage, for instance, “And he cast him into the bottomless pit”. This sentence signifies, for Augustine, the bottomless malignity in the hearts of the enemies of the Church.¹⁵³ Furthermore, “...shut him up, and set a seal upon him, that he should deceive the nations no more, till the thousand years should be fulfilled.” signifies for Augustine that God forbids Satan to perform transgressions against God’s commandments.¹⁵⁴

In this sense, Augustine believed that the thousand years in the *Revelation* could be understood as a figure of speech. Depending on his compartmentalization of history into seven ages, he believed the thousand years in the *Revelation* might be understood in two ways, either these things would happen in the sixth thousand of

¹⁴⁸ Ibid., 979.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid.

¹⁵¹ Ibid.

¹⁵² Ibid., 981.

¹⁵³ Ibid.

¹⁵⁴ Ibid.

years or in the sixth millennium. In his mind, John used this term to denote the last part of Augustine's millennium that remains before the end of the world.¹⁵⁵ Another alternative was that John might have used this term to signify the period from the creation of the world and for underlying the fullness of time; he chose a perfect number because the number in question is the cube of ten.¹⁵⁶ Therefore, Augustine believed that the thousand years have already been experienced from the establishment of the Church.

In addition, Augustine believed that the Church was predestined and chosen by God before the foundation of the world.¹⁵⁷ Hence, again citing the *Revelation*, he believed that when Satan would be loosed, he would attack the Church through deceiving the nations and they would declare war upon the Church.¹⁵⁸ Yet, he would not be able to deceive the rightful ones, the people who belong to the Church, even if he is loosed.¹⁵⁹ For Augustine, God would release Satan for the people of the City of God so that they could understand how mighty an enemy they could defeat.¹⁶⁰ Satan, on the other hand, was bound during the time he wrote the book and he would be bound until the end of the world or, to put it differently, Christ's second coming.¹⁶¹

Augustine interpreted John's vision about the "reign of saints with Christ for a thousand years" as being different from the eternal kingdom. For him, saints reigned with Christ even then, since the present kingdom of Christ was the Church.¹⁶² Therefore, Augustine promoted the idea that the Kingdom of Heaven was then a reality and it was realized within the institution of the Church. Nonetheless, he also left a room for improvement, saying that when the wicked men are eliminated

¹⁵⁵ Ibid., 980.

¹⁵⁶ Ibid.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., 983.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid., 984.

¹⁶¹ Ibid., 983.

¹⁶² Ibid., 987.

from the ranks of the Church, the Church would reach its utmost glory and earn its rightful title as a kingdom.¹⁶³ The eternal kingdom, on the other hand, is a period after the last judgment when the righteous and wicked ones will be revealed. In this sense, only the righteous ones would be accepted to the eternal kingdom.

While interpreting John's *Revelation*, Augustine inevitably concerned with *Gog and Magog*, too. In this regard, he tried to understand the nature of these creatures. He set forth the idea that *Gog and Magog* could have been the nations in all corners of the world because the final battle would include the whole ecclesia.¹⁶⁴ In this context, Augustine denied the allegations about *Gog and Magog* being the barbaric (Germanic) tribes attacking the Roman Empire during that day.¹⁶⁵ He continued by saying that "they are the nations in which the devil is shut up as in a bottomless pit, and the devil himself is, as it were, the one who rushes out and comes forth from them: they are 'the roof', and he is the one who comes forth 'from the roof'."¹⁶⁶ Therefore, when Satan is liberated, he would stir up his followers and *Gog and Magog* to allure believers and to start a war upon the Church.¹⁶⁷ In this period, the Church and the City of God would face severe persecutions in the hands of the universal City of the Devil wherever they exist on the face of the earth.¹⁶⁸

Later on, Augustine cited Peter, Paul, David, and talks about the prophecy of Malachi (or Malachias) to provide a vision about Antichrist, the resurrection of the dead, the end of the world and the last judgment.¹⁶⁹ If we follow the book, until the last judgment, these events would happen but it is not possible to know the exact order of the events: Elijah the prophet would come alongside with Christ to teach the Jews the spiritual meaning of the Law; the Jews would be converted to Christianity;

¹⁶³ Ibid., 988.

¹⁶⁴ Ibid., 993.

¹⁶⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., 994.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid., 993.

¹⁶⁹ Ibid., 1007- 1043.

Antichrist would torture the believers until he would be persecuted by Christ; all the dead would be resurrected; after the judgment the godly ones and ungodly ones would be separated and the world shall be burned and renewed.¹⁷⁰ Next in Book XXI, Augustine explained his views about what would happen to the ungodly ones; namely, the eternal punishment they would face. Lastly, in Book XXI, Augustine talked about the opposite, eternal joy that the godly ones would enjoy.

Augustine's gathering of these apocalyptic texts into a single narrative and his charismatic personality ensured his rightful place as the Church Father and *The City of God Against the Pagans* constitutes the classical source for the apocalyptic tradition in the Latin West as well as the Christian perspective of world history.

To sum up, Augustine's ideas about the end of times being already started with the resurrection of Christ, and his view that the thousand years signifying the last era of the world that we are still in leaves no reservation for the future millenarian kingdom on earth. On the other hand, the Kingdom expresses itself through Christ's Church. In this sense, conversion of the people into Catholic faith has utmost significance for the realization of the Kingdom.

2.2.2.4 The Seventh Century Onwards

After Augustine, the formulation and transformation of millennialism fastened on the ideas of the Syriac author Methodius in the mid-seventh century. In this respect, Methodius predicted that, through the end of times, the Arabs would start to persecute Christians until they would be defeated by a Roman Christian King.¹⁷¹ This hero would seek vengeance of the former persecutions of the Arabs, he would enslave them and by doing this, he would start the era of peace and tranquility. He would bring joy and victory to the Christian world from his base that is Jerusalem.¹⁷²

¹⁷⁰ Ibid.

¹⁷¹ Robert E. Lerner, "Millennialism," 330.

¹⁷² Ibid.

Additionally, Methodius composed a narrative of the last things. In his mind, the doomsday would be initiated after the appearance of *Gog and Magog* and the reign of Antichrist.¹⁷³ In this context, the heroic Roman Christian King would perform a crucial role for the downfall of Antichrist.¹⁷⁴ Overall, Methodius's apocalyptic prophecy foresaw the advent of *Gog and Magog* first, followed by the reign of Antichrist, the epic hero defeating the evil forces and finally the last judgment.

In the literature related to millennialism, the prophecy ascribed to the Tiburtine Sibyl¹⁷⁵ earns a more important role than the one of Methodius. Although the Tiburtine Sibyl was from the fourth century, her prophecy that survived was written in the early eleventh century, and has been influenced by Methodius's apocalypticism.¹⁷⁶ What makes Sibyl of Tivoli (Sibylla Tiburtina) so famous is the alleged confrontation of her with the Roman Emperor Augustus (63 BCE - 14 CE). This mythical meeting of the Sybil of Tivoli with Augustus took place in modern Tivoli (Tibur). Reportedly, because Augustus wanted to know if he would be worshipped as a god, he sought to consult the Sibyl of Tivoli. The millennial passage attributed to Tiburtine Sibyl, on the other hand, mentioned a Christian Roman King by the name Constans who would overcome the enemies of Christianity, end pagan worshipping, convert the Jews to Christianity and hence initiate the period of peace.¹⁷⁷ His physical characteristics were also prophesized as tall and handsome.¹⁷⁸ He would reign for 112 years (in some variants 122 years) in which he would unite the Greeks and Romans, he would destroy pagan temples or he would place crosses

¹⁷³ Ibid.

¹⁷⁴ Ibid.

¹⁷⁵ A "sibyl" or "Sibylla" is an oracle or prophetess in ancient Greek myths.

¹⁷⁶ Christopher Bonura, "When Did The Legend Of The Last Emperor Originate? A New Look At The Textual Relationship Between The Apocalypse Of Pseudo-Methodius And The Tiburtine Sibyl", *Viator*, 47 no. 3 (2016): 47-100, 64.

¹⁷⁷ Robert E. Lerner, "Millennialism," 331.

¹⁷⁸ Ibid.

on them.¹⁷⁹ After all of his hard work bringing peace and joy to the Christians, when the age of Antichrist arrives, he would leave his crown and royal gown and travel to Jerusalem to fight.¹⁸⁰ According to the prophecy of the Tiburtine Sibyl, the time of Antichrist would witness great tragedy and suffering on believers' part. Yet in the end, Antichrist would be beaten by the benevolent forces of God.¹⁸¹

It can be seen that Pseudo-Methodius and Tiburtine Sibyl shared the same vision. Both predicted a heroic Roman ruler who would initiate a glorious millennial reign after a time of torture. Furthermore, both are convinced that this millennial reign would mark great victories over the pagans, the conversion of the Jews and the rewards for the worthy. Both terminated this millennial reign with the rise of Antichrist. These similarities indicate that both figures who are crucial for the conceptualization of Christian millennialism were influenced by the Jewish messianism.¹⁸²

The Pseudo-Methodius's and Tiburtine Sibyl's ideas contributed much to the Western pseudonymous prophecies. The main goal of such prophecies was, as before, to predict a victory of a conquering hero. This time he would not be a Roman Emperor but he would be a current European ruler with more or less transparent identity.¹⁸³ The role of this European hero would be both the same with formerly mentioned Roman Emperor and somehow different from him. This European ruler was expected to defeat regional enemies, unite the Christendom and travel to the East to start a golden age before the coming of Antichrist.¹⁸⁴ It is clear that the former emphasis on the defeat of the pagans and the conversion of the Jews transformed as the unification of Christendom and the former emphasis on the triumph of Roman

¹⁷⁹ Ibid.

¹⁸⁰ Ibid.

¹⁸¹ Ibid.

¹⁸² Ibid.

¹⁸³ Ibid., 333.

¹⁸⁴ Ibid.

Emperor was transformed into the triumph of a European ruler in accordance with the spirit of that time.

Moreover, this conquering hero was expected to be a currently ruling monarch or a dynastic heir. One way or another, the conquering hero prophecies were a means of political or dynastic propaganda which aimed to gather support for a ruler or a family by using eschatology for the world conquest.¹⁸⁵

The conquering hero prophecies continued to have a great popularity in the West until the Enlightenment.¹⁸⁶ The earliest known example of conquering hero prophecies was written by Italian bishop Benzo of Alba in 1089 for the glorification of German emperor Henry IV.¹⁸⁷ This was even before the First Crusade in 1095, which indicated that at least 6 years before the First Crusade, the crusading ideas were expressed. In this context, Benzo cites a lost sibylline text, which is related to or inspired by Tiburtine Sibyl, to assert that Henry IV, the ruler of Germany and Lombardy, will conquer southern Italy, be crowned in Constantinople, and then travel to the Holy Land, rescue the Holy Sepulchre and be crowned for a third time in Jerusalem.¹⁸⁸ "Babylon in awe will come to Zion to lick the dust from his feet." was the prophecy, which is not clear if it points out Henry IV. Nevertheless, Benzo utilized it for contemporary propaganda purposes.¹⁸⁹

In the following centuries, similar prophecies were applied to many different European rulers. During the campaign for the Second Crusade in 1146, for instance, King Louis VII of France was represented as the long-awaited Constans who will rule the entire Orient and witness the "gates of the city of Babylon" open before him.¹⁹⁰ Holy Roman Emperor Charles V (1500-1558) was argued to be "Charles, son of Charles, from the most illustrious nation of the Lily" in the prophetic texts by

¹⁸⁵ Ibid.

¹⁸⁶ Ibid.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸⁸ Ibid.

¹⁸⁹ Ibid.

¹⁹⁰ Ibid., 334.

Pseudo-Methodius and Tiburtine Sibyl.¹⁹¹ The text argued that Charles would gain dominion over all of Europe conquer the Orient, and force its inhabitants to idolize the cross and finally he would be crowned in Jerusalem.¹⁹²

Closely related to the conquering hero prophecies, cleansing hero prophecies, on the other hand, were interested in the coming hero who would punish the clergy and reform the Church.¹⁹³ According to the cleansing hero prophecies, the source of the regression was Pope Gregory IX (ruled between 1227-1241). He was ignorant of the life and teachings of Christ and his apostles so that he was seeking worldly awards by supporting heretics in Lombardy and hindering the emperor from helping to the Holy Land.¹⁹⁴ The emperor in question was Frederick II (1194–1250) who imitated the Roman emperors and built a rather charismatic personality. He had been regarded as a Christ-like figure who would bring the Church back to the right path and restore the former glory.¹⁹⁵ He was so charismatic that people had a difficult time accepting his death. He was believed to seek refuge in a foreign and distant land or, according to a widely accepted legend, he was believed to sleep beneath the Mount Etna until one day he wakes up and asks for his throne.¹⁹⁶ It is clear that Frederick II's death did not put an end to the myths around his personality.

Inevitably, cleansing emperor prophecies gave way to the birth of cleansing pope prophecies. Both the cleansing emperor and cleansing pope prophecies emerged in the thirteenth century. Cleansing pope prophecies can be considered as a response to cleansing emperor prophecies, which suggested that the clergy and the Church were corrupted. Hence, cleansing pope prophecies suggested that the worldly Church needed to return to its primitive ideals.¹⁹⁷ This would be realized under the rule of an

¹⁹¹ Ibid.

¹⁹² Ibid.

¹⁹³ Ibid., 335.

¹⁹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁹⁶ Mircea Eliade, *Mitlerin Özellikleri*, 232.

¹⁹⁷ Robert E. Lerner, "Millennialism," 337.

angelic pope, during whose reign "the world would be renewed and all peoples would enter into the faith".¹⁹⁸

Cleansing hero and pope prophecies raised the idea that the western Christian society, with divine help, is capable of reforming itself and it must. This idealization caused the emergence of good out of evil genre. According to this understanding, suffering from the hands of evil rulers is bearable for the upcoming millennial blessings.¹⁹⁹ The Cedar of Lebanon prophecy is an example of this kind. This prophecy was invented around 1239, at the time of the Mongol invasion of Europe.²⁰⁰ According to the prophecy, after many battles and "mutations of faith, of laws, and of kingdoms" the cleansing would allow a new order in which world will be united under one god and monarchy.²⁰¹

Similarly, the first prophet of social justice in Medieval Europe, Hildegard of Bingen (1098-1179), thought that the future millennial joys would occur as a result of chastisements by evil governors of Church and secular rulers.²⁰² She was confirmed by the Archbishop that her visions were from God, yet she did not hesitate to demonize the clergy.²⁰³

A common characteristic of all the prophecies mentioned earlier is that their source was not the theological tradition.²⁰⁴ In this regard, Robert E. Lerner conclude that "because the *New Testament* left little room for millenarian optimism, and because the most authoritative Latin fathers linked millennialism with reprehensible carnality, it was difficult for anyone to teach the coming of a better future within the framework of authoritative doctrine."²⁰⁵

¹⁹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹⁹ Ibid., 339.

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

²⁰¹ Ibid.

²⁰² Ibid., 341.

²⁰³ Ibid.

²⁰⁴ Ibid., 343.

²⁰⁵ Ibid.

All of these prophecies that are mentioned up until this point agreed that there would be a battle between angelic forces and demonic forces and after Antichrist's death there would be peace and tranquility but they indicated little about any particular purpose for this.²⁰⁶ At this stage, Honorius Augustodunensis (c. 1080-1156) suggested that after Antichrist, the conversion of all the pagans would be realized. Otto of Freising (c. 1114-1158), moreover, asserted that the time after the downfall of Antichrist would witness the conversion of the Jews.²⁰⁷

Joachim of Fiore (c. 1135-1202) was the person who expanded the period after Antichrist. His methodology depended solely on the *Old* and *New Testaments*.²⁰⁸ He believed that the chronological patterns in the *Old Testament* and *New Testament* were a match but with one reservation: *New Testament* were missing some of the events because it was incomplete.²⁰⁹ Hence, moving from this idea, he compared the *Old* and *New Testaments*, attempted to adjust the events in *Old Testament* to the *New Testament*. Since it is mentioned in the *Old Testament* that Jewish people faced seven persecutions, Joachim of Fiore finalized that Christians would also face seven persecutions.²¹⁰ Furthermore, Joachim was very important for Columbus due to his prophecy about “a savior from Spain who would recapture Jerusalem.” The details of the relationship between Columbus and Joachim will be mentioned later in this study.

2.2.3 The Kingdom Concept and the Doctrine of Millennium

The kingdom concept is more or less evident in the teachings of the aforementioned Christian thinkers and it can be found in the former passages. To summarize, it can be said that there are some contradictory views on the nature of the

²⁰⁶ Ibid., 344.

²⁰⁷ Ibid., 345.

²⁰⁸ Ibid., 346.

²⁰⁹ Ibid.

²¹⁰ Ibid.

kingdom. For the first group of people, the kingdom of God is equal to heavenly kingdom that has nothing to do with worldly affairs. For others, the kingdom of God is a spiritual kingdom. Since the souls of humans are governed by God, the kingdom is already a fact, yet it is not related to the world. For another group of people, the kingdom is earthly (not spiritual), and its political and social structure will be achieved by the efforts of humans. In this context, some people follow the idea that the kingdom is related to the restoration of the Israeli law and the Temple. Lastly, other groups believe that the kingdom is the Catholic Church, which is both spiritual and political.²¹¹

These different ideas have originated from the different interpretations of the scriptures. Through scriptures, it is possible to deduce that the kingdom is both eternal and temporal, it is both universal and local, and it is directly ruled by God, or indirectly ruled through non-divine sovereigns. Needless to say, the kingdom will be ruled by a theocracy under the rule of King Jesus with the authority given to him by God: “But the Lord is the true God, he is the living God, and an everlasting king: at his wrath the earth shall tremble, and the nations shall not be able to abide his indignation.”²¹²

But in the last days it shall come to pass, that the mountain of the house of the Lord shall be established in the top of the mountains, and it shall be exalted above the hills; and people shall flow unto it. And many nations shall come, and say, Come, and let us go up to the mountain of the Lord, and to the house of the God of Jacob; and he will teach us of his ways, and we will walk in his paths: for the law shall go forth of Zion, and the word of the Lord from Jerusalem. And he shall judge among many people, and rebuke strong nations a far off; and they shall beat their swords into plowshares, and their spears into pruninghooks: nation shall not lift up a sword against nation, neither shall they learn war any more. But they shall sit every man under his vine and under his fig tree; and none shall make them afraid: for the mouth of the Lord of hosts hath spoken it. For all people will walk every one in the name of his god, and we will walk in the name of the Lord our God for ever and ever. In that day, saith the Lord, will I assemble her that halteth, and I will gather her that is driven out, and her that I have afflicted; And I will make her that halted a remnant, and her that was cast far off a strong nation: and the Lord shall reign over them in mount Zion from

²¹¹ J. Dwight Pentecost, *Things to Come*, 427.

²¹² For more information see, Jeremiah 10:10.

henceforth, even for ever. And thou, O tower of the flock, the strong hold of the daughter of Zion, unto thee shall it come, even the first dominion; the kingdom shall come to the daughter of Jerusalem.²¹³

These two passages clearly indicate the universal and divine authority of Christ. As it is understood from these passages, Jerusalem possesses an important role in the millennial kingdom. Since Christ is a part of David's bloodline, he is also the ruler of Jerusalem; hence, the center of his kingdom would be Jerusalem. There are other supporting verses such as Jeremiah 3:17: "At that time they shall call Jerusalem the throne of the Lord; and all the nations shall be gathered unto it, to the name of the Lord, to Jerusalem: neither shall they walk any more after the imagination of their evil heart." Moreover, in the millennial kingdom, Jerusalem would not only be the center, but it would be the most glorious city that is protected by the divine powers. It would also be the center of worship.²¹⁴

As for the doctrine of the millennium, the most important point is the detainment of Satan.²¹⁵ In other words, human beings in the millennial age would have the opportunity to act independently from Satan's influence. This, in return, will cause divine righteousness on earth as it is displayed in Daniel 9:24, "Seventy weeks are determined upon thy people and upon thy holy city, to finish the transgression, and to make an end of sins, and to make reconciliation for iniquity, and to bring in everlasting righteousness, and to seal up the vision and prophecy, and to anoint the most Holy." This also means, there would be no heresy, no idolatry and no pagan worship in the millennial age. To put it differently, all the people of the earth would submit to the authority of the Church.

In light of all the information given up until now, it can be asserted that there is a link between millennialism and evangelization, which constitutes the subject for this study. Especially postmillennial and premillennial views of the Second Advent encourage human involvement for the fulfillment of millennial prophecies. According to these views, through preaching the *Gospel*, and the evangelization of

²¹³ For more information see, Micah 4:1-8.

²¹⁴ J. Dwight Pentecost, *Things to Come*, 509.

²¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 477.

the world and realizing the prophecies, the Second Advent would be fastened. Since religion is a practical source for political aims and power accumulation, several imprints of millenarianism have occurred throughout the global history. In this context, in the following chapters, how the *Reconquista* process in Spain and the evangelization of Americas in fifteenth century onwards are related to Catholic millennialism will be examined.

CHAPTER 3

PROCESS OF “RECONQUISTA” AND JEWISH AND MUSLIM IDENTITY ON THE IBERIAN PENINSULA

God foretold with clarity through the prophets, predicted with unveiled power and accomplished in certain reality that their Gods were false gods and should be entirely abandoned and their temples and idols and holy objects should be overthrown.

Augustine

Two years after the first arrival of the Muslims on the Iberian Peninsula, the Treaty of Tudmir was signed in 713 between Abd Al-Aziz, the son of Musa ibn Nusair²¹⁶ (640-716) and Theodemir (called as “Tudmir” in Arabic), the local ruler of Murcia in Spain.²¹⁷ This treaty can be accepted as the first step to build a culture of coexistence in Spain. In this regard, with the Treaty of Tudmir, the personal safety of the citizens and their free pursuit of religion were accepted as inviolable rights.²¹⁸ According to this peace treaty, in addition, the Muslims quickly capitulated strategic locations such as the Visigoth Toledo whereas other areas were conquered gradually.²¹⁹ Nevertheless, after three hundred years of Muslim rule, Isidore’s

²¹⁶ Governor of Spain.

²¹⁷ Olivia Remie Constable, “A Muslim Christian Treaty The Treaty of Tudmir” in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 37.

²¹⁸ Ibid.

²¹⁹ Ibid.

Seville, Visigot Toledo and the rest of Al-Andalus were overwhelmingly populated by the Muslims.

About the same time with the First Crusade for Jerusalem (1096-1099), the Muslim supremacy in Spain started to shrink as a result of the collapse of the Umayyad Caliphate of Córdoba (929-1031). Apart from the fertile Córdoba being the center of Islamic civilization, the Muslims did not establish permanent settlements in the northern terrain. That is why, some small Christian kingdoms such as Navarre, Aragon, León, Castile and Catalonia managed to survive. After the fall of the Caliphate of Córdoba, on the other hand, these small Christian kingdoms changed their defense-based policy and initiated the reconquest process or the *Reconquista*. The *Reconquista* depended primarily on the idea that the Muslims were intruders. Since they were unjustly occupying territory which by right belonged to the Christians, they needed to be ejected. To put it differently, the core of the conflict was to drive the Muslims out of the land. In this sense, Toledo was capitulated in 1085, Saragossa in 1118, Mallorca in 1229, Córdoba in 1236, Valencia in 1238 and Seville in 1248. A few centuries later, the Iberian Peninsula was once again politically Christian.

Still, it was possible to mention that there was an uneasy *convivencia* or coexistence between the three faiths (Judaism, Christianity and Islam) in medieval Spain. It was uneasy because the relationship between the people of different religions was strictly regulated and controlled. Nevertheless, the medieval hero El Cid's story proves that *convivencia* was a fact in medieval Spain. In this sense, one can deduce that the process of reconquest in medieval era was never entirely a religious quest since it was also determined by self-interest. Therefore, it included both territorial and religious confrontation. This balance would change during the reign of Isabel and Ferdinand in favor of Christianity. In this regard, the reign of the Catholic Monarchs marks the end of *convivencia*.

Isabel of Castile and Ferdinand of Aragon were married in 1469. Isabel was crowned as the queen of Castile in 1474 and Ferdinand was crowned as the king of Aragon in 1479. When Isabel succeeded in the fight for the throne against her sister Juana, the unification of the medieval kingdoms of Spain such as Castile, Aragon,

León and Valencia was secured. After establishing authority, they turned their attention to Muslim Moors.

They acquired power in Spain when millenarian hopes for the second coming of Christ were common in Europe. This was reflected in the works of some Spanish writers. A fifteenth-century historian Alonso Palma, commonly known as El Bachiller Palma, in 1478 claimed that “the king our lord came to set at liberty the people of Castile... out of slavery from which Christ, and through him the king, freed us.”²²⁰ As it will be mentioned in the subsequent part, Christopher Columbus was also one of these people who perceived Catholic Monarchs as messianic figures.

In accordance with the millenarian prophecies and expectations, about the same time Columbus was dealing with the evangelization of the Americas, Ferdinand of Aragon and Isabel of Castile were busy to reassure the Christian rule over the Iberian Peninsula. During their reign, their official enemies were announced as bad Christians, evil people, heretics, thieves, deceivers, and all of the people who walk outside the doctrine of the Holy Church.²²¹ They were also supported and honored by the Church in their struggle against heresy. In this sense, Isabel established special interest in the financing of the war against the Muslims. To realize this, she used different ornaments such as putting more taxes on the Jews or selling her jewellery. Ferdinand of Aragon, on the other hand, was the brain on the battlefield. In fact, Ferdinand of Aragon was praised by Niccòlo Machievelli (1469-1527) as the model prince of the Renaissance:

Nothing makes a prince so greatly esteemed as do great campaigns and giving rare examples of himself. We have in our own times Ferdinand of Aragon, the present king of Spain. This man can be called almost a new prince, since from being a weak king he has become by fame and by glory, the first king of the Christians; and if you will consider his actions, you will find them all very great and some you will find extraordinary. He attacked Granada in the beginning of his reign, and that campaign was the foundation of his state. First of all, he did it privately and without fear of being impeded... He was able to supply armies with money from the Church and the people, and through that long war to make a foundation for his

²²⁰ Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict* (Harlow: Pearson, 2005), 63.

²²¹ Andrés Bernáldez, *Historia De Los Reyes Católicos D. Jernando Y Doña Isabel*, Tomo 1. (Sevilla: D. José María Geofrin, 1870), 26.

military that afterward brought him honor. Beyond this, so as to be able to undertake great campaigns, ever making use of religion, he resorted to an act of pious cruelty by chasing the *Marranos*²²² from his kingdom and despoiling them: nor could this example be more wretched or more rare. He attacked Africa under this same cloak;²²³ he made his campaigns in Italy;²²⁴ lately he has attacked France.²²⁵ And so he has always done and ordered great things, which have always kept the spirits of his subjects suspended and wondering and occupied with their outcome.²²⁶

The above-cited passage from *The Prince* (p. 1532) reflects Machiavelli's vision of Ferdinand as the man who accomplished great things with the pretext of religion, yet who in reality had no mercy. In this sense, it can be asserted that the pluralistic outlook of *convivencia* in Spain was explicitly rejected either in favor of or on the pretext of Christianity. Therefore, fifteenth-century Spain was designed to be a county only for the Christians. To achieve this goal, forced migration, conversion and inquisition were utilized as the three most important tools. In this regard, fifteenth-century Spain reflects one of the unique examples of the theopolitics. That is to say, in order to understand the developments in this era, one needs to evaluate the political behavior from historical, cultural and theological perspectives.

In this context, the subject of this chapter will be the process of the evangelization of Spain during the reign of Isabel and Ferdinand of Spain with reference to the existing tensions and different cultural identities in the Spanish society. In addition, the utilization of the millenarian expectations by the Catholic Monarchs will be emphasized.

²²² tr. pigs. In Spain, it is an insult used for Muslim and Jewish converts by referring to their diet against eating pork. In Italy, *Marrano* is used to remark Jews and Muslims who were forced to flee Spain rather than convert to Christianity.

²²³ By using religion as a pretext, he took Oran in 1509 and Tripoli in 1511.

²²⁴ The Kingdom of Naples was seized in 1503.

²²⁵ In May-December 1512.

²²⁶ Niccolò Machiavelli, *The Prince*, ed. William J. Connell (Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2005), 108-109.

3.1 The Heroic Fathers of Kingship and Crusade: Charlemagne and El Cid

Before Isabel and Ferdinand's confrontation with the Muslims, two important historical figures, who represented the charismatic leadership for Spain, had already had an encounter with the Muslims of Spain. The first one was Charlemagne (742-814), medieval Europe's greatest ruler and a role model of Christian kingship. The other one was Rodrigo Díaz de Vivar or more commonly El Cid²²⁷ (d. 1099). Since they were the role models for the Spanish crown, their confrontation with the Muslims matters for the comparison with the reaction of Isabel and Ferdinand to the Muslims and Jews. Furthermore, by examining the confrontation of Charlemagne, El Cid and the Muslims, it would be possible to comprehend the dimensions of the hundreds-years old tensions in the society as well as the origins of the policies in the fifteenth century. Charlemagne's and El Cid's heroic legacy demonstrates itself in literature as *Chanson de Roland* [Song of Roland] (w. 1100) and *Poemo de Mio Cid* [Poem of the Cid] (w. 1201-1207). It is important to underline the fact that these two pieces of literature were published in the years when the balance of power in the Iberian Peninsula shifted in favor of the Christians. At the beginning of the eleventh century, the Christians were taking back the territories that once had belonged to them. In this sense, Toledo was seized in 1085, Sicily was recovered in 1091 and Valencia was recaptured in 1094. The victories on these lands flourished the hopes about the extermination of the superiority of the Muslims which was also a

²²⁷ tr. Lord, from Arabic word *al-sayyid*.

millennial prophecy. Besides, the heroic examples of Charlemagne and El Cid served as a propaganda fuel for the reconquest.

In this context, the *Song of Roland* and the *Poem of the Cid* reflects the two different visions of the post-*Reconquista* Spain. To put it differently, the story of Charlemagne and the story of El Cid represents two different reactions which were given to the same situation. The *Song of Roland*, in this regard, envisioned a homogenous Spain where non-Christians were provided with only two options: to convert or to die²²⁸ whereas, the *Poem of the Cid* embodied a different view. Firstly, the *Song of Roland* opens with the deeds of Charlemagne in Spain for seven years. For him and his followers, Muslims of Spain did not love God, but they served Muhammad and worshipped Tervagant²²⁹ and Apollo.²³⁰ In the song, there are more than one statement such as “May Mahomet our ruler, and Tervagant and Apollin our Lord, save the King and protect the Queen.”²³¹ that are given from the mouths of the Muslims. Since the Muslims did not worship the true God, the war against them was justified. The overwhelming emotion in the text is Charlemagne’s caring and altruistic character in the name of Christianity. In this sense, he was reflected as an outsider who travelled to Spain only to fight the evil Muslims.

At the beginning of the *Song of Roland*, except Saragossa, Emperor Charlemagne manages to conquer all the uplands.²³² The story accelerates with King Marsilie of Sarragosa’s peace offering. He proposes that if the Emperor chooses to leave Spain with gifts he would offer, later he would follow him to France, to convert to Christianity and rule Spain in the name of him.²³³ At this point, the councils of Charlemagne, including his nephew Roland, suspect that this offer would be a bait and urge Charlemagne to attack Sarragosa in order to complete what he has started.

²²⁸ Jessie Crosland, trans. *The Song of Roland* (Cambridge: Publications Old French Series, 1999), 4.

²²⁹ or Tarmagant, a deity erroneously ascribed to Islam by medieval European Christians.

²³⁰ Jessie Crosland, *The Song of Roland*, 54.

²³¹ Ibid.

²³² Ibid., 2.

²³³ Ibid., 5.

Then Charlemagne, through Count Ganelon who is the stepfather of Roland, offers his peace terms to Marsilie. Accordingly, he should accept Christianity and he would be entitled to rule half of the Spain as a fief. The other half, on the other hand, is reserved for Roland.²³⁴ For Marsilie's account, the terms of the treaty are not favorable so he looks for an alternative. At this point, Ganelon betrays Charlemagne and advises Marsilie that if he kills Roland, Charlemagne would lose his right hand and thus the French army would cease to exist.²³⁵

Then Roland and his few soldiers, who are separated from the Emperor and the rest of the army, are ambushed. Throughout the text, the demonization of the other side is evident as in the case of the following passage: "The Saracen Abisme is riding in front – there is no greater felon than he in his company. He is a man of evil character and many crimes; he does not believe in God the son of Holy Mary. He is as black as molten pitch, and he loves treason and murder better than all the gold of Galicia."²³⁶ Furthermore, it can be asserted that the *Song of Roland* echoed Islamic *jihad*²³⁷ and martyrdom. For instance, during the battle, the archbishop motivates the forces of Roland by saying "Sir Barons, have no unworthy thoughts. For God's sake I pray you that you do not flee, that no gallant man ever sings an evil song about us. It would be far better for us to die in battle. We are destined to end our lives quite soon and after today we shall no longer be alive. But one thing I can guarantee to you: Holy Paradise awaits you and you will be seated there amongst the Innocents."²³⁸

Besides, when the Emperor understands the deception, it would be too late. Roland, who is reflected as a man of courage and virtue with saintly character dies before Charlemagne intervenes. After the death of Roland, the physical war between the Muslims and Christians turns into a cosmic one. Despite being devastated and

²³⁴ Ibid., 10.

²³⁵ Ibid., 13.

²³⁶ Ibid., 31.

²³⁷ Just war in Islam.

²³⁸ Jessie Crosland, *The Song of Roland*, 31.

sad, through the guidance of an angel and miracles of God, Charles finds the strength in him to pursue his vengeance against the wicked.²³⁹ With this regard, all the heathens are killed on the battlefield except King Marsilie who escapes to Sarragosa. At the end, as predicted, Charlemagne enters Sarragosa, conquers it and kills the King. Since it is a former Muslim city, it needs to be purified so his soldiers search the mosques and synagogues for the idols and other sources of sorcery or fraud.²⁴⁰ Furthermore, the waters are blessed by the clergy and more than a hundred thousand non-Christians are baptized.²⁴¹ There was no option besides the conversion or death since Charlemagne orders the non-believers to be hung, burnt or killed by the sword except Queen Bramimonde of Sragossa who is kept captive and moved to France in order to be the wife of the Emperor.²⁴² According to the song, with the power of love, she sincerely converts to Christianity and takes the name Juliana. When it seems that the death of Roland is revenged, the land is conquered and the people are converted, one can assume that the song is finished. Yet, precisely at this point, Angel Gabriel once again approaches Charlemagne to deliver a message from God: “Charles, summon the armies of thy empire! By force shalt thou enter the land of Bire and bring succour to King Vivien in his city of Imphe which the heathen has besieged. The Christians are crying out and calling for thee.”²⁴³

In this sense, even though he tooks vengeance of his nephew and kills the King of Spain, further vengeance is required. Although the land is not explicitly mentioned as Jerusalem, there is a strong possibility that it is Jerusalem. The striking idea here is that only the total destruction of Islam could bring peace to Charlemagne and his God. That is to say, the *Song of Roland* promotes a homogeneous Christian society where Christians and non-Christians can not co-exist in harmony. One needs to be destroyed in the hands of the other.

²³⁹ Ibid., 49.

²⁴⁰ Ibid., 72.

²⁴¹ Ibid.

²⁴² Ibid.

²⁴³ Ibid., 78.

The *Poem of the Cid*, similarly, carries the spirit of conquest, however it envisions a more pluralist and harmonious society. The *Poem of the Cid* opens with the information that El Cid is banished from his native Castile by King Alfonso VI.²⁴⁴ Briefly speaking of the historical background, El Cid was the lieutenant of Leon-Castile's prince Sancho. When the father of Sancho, King Fernando I died, his kingdom was parceled among the three sons.²⁴⁵ Before long, this division transformed into a power struggle and Sancho II of Castile lost his life. At this stage, El Cid found himself in a difficult situation. Rather than accepting to marry one of Alfonso VI of Leon's nieces and declaring loyalty, he decided to pursue his own destiny.²⁴⁶ This was the decision that made him banished.

On the contrary to the reflection of Charlemagne in the *Song of Roland* as pure good, El Cid's status is complicated since he was an exile. In the poem, after El Cid entrusts his wife Ximena and their daughters to a monastery, he decides to leave Castile. Interestingly, almost four hundred years later, Christopher Columbus left his son in a monastery to pursue his own destiny. After banishment and loosing all his wealth, El Cid finds a new living by raiding the Muslim towns and making them his tributaries.²⁴⁷ According to the poem, he moves forward by wining every battle, therefore, his followers call him as *Compeador*.²⁴⁸ By capturing the frontier Muslim cities, El Cid begins to recover his charisma and lost status. Although El Cid is reflected as a good Christian, he does not initiate a massive conversion in the conquered lands, by contrast to the *Song of Roland's* Charlemagne. Furthermore, there are no words of invectiveness against the Moors in the *Poem of the Cid* whereas the *Song of Roland* is full of them. In fact, in the *Poem of the Cid*, the Muslims are considered as an honorable enemy. In this sense, it can be asserted that

²⁴⁴ John Ormsby, ed. *The Poem Of The Cid* (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1879), 63-64.

²⁴⁵ Chris Lowney, *A Vanished World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 133.

²⁴⁶ Ibid.

²⁴⁷ John Ormsby, *The Poem Of The Cid*, 71.

²⁴⁸ tr. War hero.

El Cid was driven by self-interest in his endeavours rather than just a crusading spirit.

Meanwhile, the growing charisma of the *Compeador* starts to attract the interest of nobility such as the *infantes*²⁴⁹ of Carrion. Through the King, they propose to marry to the daughters of El Cid in order to benefit from the *Compeador*'s wealth, power and legacy.²⁵⁰ At the King's bidding, El Cid agrees to the marriage although he has no taste for the match since his daughters are of a tender age.²⁵¹ Unfortunately, the sons-in-law are proved the opposite of El Cid. They are coward, selfish, deceiving and mean. They flee the battle with a lion, and are humiliated by El Cid and his companions.²⁵² Then, they take their wives to Carrion, spend a night with them, beat them and leave them to die in a wild forest as a vengeance for the dishonor of the lion affair.²⁵³ El Cid, instead of taking revenge by himself, takes the case the King. The King, in this sense, finalizes the divorce and commands that the dowry should be paid back to El Cid. Meanwhile, the *infantes* of Navarre and Aragon arrive and express their will to marry El Cid's daughters.²⁵⁴ With these marriages, El Cid's daughters are proved to be superior to the *infantes* of Carrion, since Navarre and Aragon were higher in rank when compered to Carrion. Furthermore, El Cid's native Castile, Aragon and Navarre become connected through these marriages and they are entitled to have a claim in El Cid's legacy. In this context, it can be assumed that the monarchs of his blood had been upon the thrones of Spain.²⁵⁵

El Cid's intimidation of both the Christians and Muslims can be accepted as an indication of the mixture of the self-interest and the desire for conquest in his

²⁴⁹ The son of a king or high noble.

²⁵⁰ John Ormsby, *The Poem Of The Cid*, 92-93.

²⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 94.

²⁵² *Ibid.*, 104.

²⁵³ *Ibid.*

²⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 117.

²⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 124.

personality. Furthermore, contrary to the *Song of Roland*, there is no “Christian good versus Muslim evil” theme in El Cid’s story. In this regard, his heroic character is not only derived from the crusading spirit but also from the fair treatment of his adversaries. Unlike *Roland*’s universal struggle between god and evil, El Cid’s motives were only limited to his personal sphere. Even so, El Cid is celebrated as a medieval Christian hero since he took control of Muslim Valencia in 1094 and he is accepted as a model in terms of courage and knighthood.

The comparison of *Song of Roland* and *Poem of the Cid* is important for two reasons. First of all, it proves that there had been a cultural and political “Muslim problem” in the Iberian Peninsula long before the reign of Isabel and Ferdinand. It also proves that it can be possible for similar people to approach differently to the same problem. That is to say, despite the fact that both Charlemagne and El Cid were Christians and their enemies were the Muslims, their attitude towards the Muslims was categorically different. In fact, these two alternatives were distinctively implemented during the reign of Isabel and Ferdinand. In the early years of their reign, for instance, El Cid’s version of multiculturalism was prioritized, however, especially with the fall of Granada in 1492, the royal policy towards non-Christians shifted from El Cid’s version to Charlemagne’s version in the song. The only reason for this change was the fact that the balance of power in the Iberian Peninsula shifted irrevocably in favor of Christianity and there was no self or national interest in maintaining the delicate *convivencia* anymore.

3.2 The Enemy of the Faith

In the previous part, it is mentioned that there was a sense of uneasiness in Spain which originated from the quarrel between the adverse cultures. The cause of the tension between the religions was, in this regard, expressed throughout the Medieval Spain. The document *Istoria de Mohamet* (c. 850) [History of Muhammad], which was composed in ninth-century Spain, gives clues about the Christian way of thinking about the Muslims. The text starts as, “Heresiarch Muhammad... attend assemblies of Christians, and as shrewd son of darkness, he

began to commit some of the sermons of Christians to memory and become the wisest among the irrational Arabs in all things.”²⁵⁶ In addition, it continues as “the spirit of error appeared to him in the form of a vulture and exhibiting a golden mouth, said it was the Angel Gabriel and ordered Mohammad to present himself among his people as prophet.”²⁵⁷ As it can be seen clearly, the writer of this text demonizes Prophet Mohammad of Islam as a false prophet directed by the evil. In his mind, Prophet Mohammad is no true prophet, therefore, he acquired divine knowledge not from God, but the Christian sermons he had overheard. In the same text, the Prophet is accused of ordering his believers to take up arms and cut down his adversaries with the sword.²⁵⁸ In this context, the writer tries to implement the idea that the Muslims were savages and struggle against them was an honorable self-defense.

Another example is from twelfth-century Spain. A Mozarabic²⁵⁹ blamed the Muslims for being unbelievers since they denied the crucifixion of Jesus Christ.²⁶⁰ For him, the Muslims were as guilty as the Jews, who actually crucified Jesus. However, contrary to the ninth-century writer, the writer of this text followed a more moderate policy against the Muslims by saying “There is much justice and general goodness at the root of your religion. So if you were to believe in the Messiah and affirm that He is God, the creator of the heavens and the earth your belief would be perfected.”²⁶¹ Therefore, in his mind, Islam was an incomplete religion despite it bore some virtues. He also added that, contrary to the historical facts, Christianity had spread throughout the earth without coercion and Islam should also had to follow

²⁵⁶ Kenneth B. Wolf, trans. “History of Mohammad (ca. 850)” in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 48.

²⁵⁷ Ibid.

²⁵⁸ Ibid.

²⁵⁹ Arabian-speaking Christian.

²⁶⁰ Thomas E. Burman, trans. “Mozarabic Refutation of Islam (ca. 1140)” in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 145.

²⁶¹ Ibid., 145.

its lead.²⁶² The Mallorcan poet-philosopher Ramon Llull (c. 1232-1316) is another person we know, at least by name, who expressed his ideas about the Muslims. In this sense, similar to the aforementioned writers, he aimed to convince the readers that Muslims needed to be converted. For this, he even prescribed some methods as preaching in the Muslim's own tongue.²⁶³

Similarly, Muslims in Spain were as confident as the Christians about their religion. For instance, Ibn Hazm of Córdoba (994-1064), one of the greatest minds of the Islamic civilization of Andalusia, worked closely on the Christian and Jewish doctrine to refute them. According to him, Jews and Christians had conspired to change their manuscripts. In this regard, he accused the Christians with removing the prophecies concerning the arrival of Prophet Mohammad and adding heretical teachings. He analysed the *Gospels* and tried to find the inconsistencies. According to Ibn Hazm, for instance, Matthew 10:34-35 and Luke 12:49-53 contradicts with the ninth chapter of Luke and tenth chapter of John.²⁶⁴ At this point, he concludes that since God forbid the Messiah to lie, there is only one explanation for these inconsistencies: "the four iniquitous men altered the *Gospels*."²⁶⁵ He also questioned the position of Jesus as God and asked: what kind of a God eats and drinks?²⁶⁶ In this sense, he blamed the Christians for attributing falsehood to Messiah and accused them with polytheism. The regulations in the medieval society were also in comply with this mutual hatred. A regulation in twelfth-century Seville, for instance, stated that the Muslim woman,

Shall be prevented from entering their abominable churches, for the priests are evil-doers, fornicators, and sodomites. Frankish women

²⁶² Ibid., 147.

²⁶³ E. A. Peers, trans. "Ramon Llull (ca. 1232-1316) Blanquerna (ca. 1285)" in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 147.

²⁶⁴ Thomas E. Burman, trans. "*Ibn Hazm (d. 1064), Al Fasl fi al-Milal*" in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 82.

²⁶⁵ Ibid.

²⁶⁶ Ibid., 83.

must be forbidden to enter the church except on days of religious services or festivals, for it is their habit to eat and drink and fornicate with the priests, among whom there is not one who has not two or more women with whom he sleeps. This has become a custom among them, for they have permitted what is forbidden and forbidden what is permitted.²⁶⁷

Within this context, the language which was used can be a good example to track the smear campaign between the religions. The Muslims and Christians in the Iberian Peninsula, when mentioning the other, used different words, some ethnic and some spiritual. For instance, the Muslims referred to the Christians as *Rum* as an attribution to the Roman lineage. In Spain, exclusively, the words *al-Ishban* (from Hispani) or *al-Frani* (the Franks) were used.²⁶⁸ All three of these words were focusing on the ethnic origin of the people and they were not promoting any negative meaning by themselves.

On the other side, there were words that originated from religious doctrines. Nazaranes, for instance, was the reference that described the Christians due to their devotion to Jesus Nazareth. This term had also a neutral meaning. However, the words infidel (*kafir*), polytheist (*mushrik*) or idolater had all negative meanings originating from *Holy Quran*. By using these words, the Muslims asserted that Christians did not worship one true God. Since the Christian doctrine was established on the concept of the Holy Trinity, in the Muslims' opinion, the Christians were believing in three Gods. Therefore, Christianity could not be accepted as a monotheistic religion. Although the Christians and Jews were accepted and protected as the People of the Book by the Islamic law, there emerged a problem about the religious texts. If the Christians had altered their holy book, as the Muslims asserted, how could they be respected as the People of the Book?

The Christians, on the other hand, used *Saraceni*, *Agareni* and *Ismaelitae* to refer to Muslims.²⁶⁹ These words were all derived from the Book of Genesis. By

²⁶⁷ Andrew Wheatcroft, *Infidels A History of Conflict Between Christendom and Islam* (New York: The Random House, 2005), 69.

²⁶⁸ Joseph F. O'Callaghan, *Reconquest and Crusade in Medieval Spain* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), 15.

²⁶⁹ Ibid.

using these words, the Christians focused on the second wife of Abraham, Hagar and their son Ishmael. Since Hagar was the slave of Sarah, the first wife of Abraham, the Christians used these titles as an indication of inferiority.²⁷⁰ Similar to the Muslims, the Christians were also using the titles such as infidel, heretic and pagan to describe the opponent. Besides, the Jews' status in the eyes of the Christians were worse than the Muslims' status since they were blamed for the crucifixion of Jesus Christ.

In Medieval Spain, therefore, the Muslims, Jews and Christians were socially and ideologically separated communities. Although some violent incidents occurred and *convivencia* was shaken, it was still the rule to maintain the delicate balance between the societies of different religions. Isabel and Ferdinand of Spain utilized the tensions that had accumulated in the society since the medieval era to eradicate the culture of coexistence that also had existed for ages.

3.3 The Existing Tensions in the Society and the Catholic Monarchs

Although it is not possible to say that there was no tension, before the fall of Granada, *convivencia* was still the rule in Spain. In the early fourteenth century, both the Muslims and Jews living under Christian rule were entitled to certain protections under the law although their lives and relations with the Christians were closely regulated. In this sense, *convivencia* could continue only if physical and cultural boundaries were respected. For example, the Jews had to live their lives among the Christians within harmony and order. Yet they were forced to bear distinguishing marks on their heads if they did not, they would be punished with a fine of 10 maravelis of gold.²⁷¹ In addition they were free to practice their own religion unless they were not speaking ill of the Christian faith.²⁷² In return, the Christians were banned from behaving disrespectfully at the synagogues. Since it is the resting day for Jews, on Saturdays no judge could summon them on court or they could not be forced

²⁷⁰ Ibid.

²⁷¹ S.P. Scott, trans. "Siete Partidas" in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 272.

²⁷² Ibid., 269.

to do anything for Christians.²⁷³ Furthermore, both Christians and Jews were banned to convert one another. But if a Christian was converted to Judaism, s/he would be treated as a heretic. That is to say, they were put to death and their property was confiscated.²⁷⁴ Moreover, sexual intercourse across the class boundaries was accepted as the most dangerous and contaminating behaviour. Accordingly, a Jew and a Christian could not live together. The punishment for such crime was death.²⁷⁵

There were also similar laws concerning the relationship of a Muslim citizen with the Christian state. In this sense, similar to the Jews, the Muslims were also entitled to live among the Christians, perform their own religion unless they insult the Christian doctrine.²⁷⁶ On the other hand, Muslim practice was more restricted since no mosques or animal sacrifices were allowed in Christian towns.²⁷⁷ Likewise, no conversion could be forced on the Muslims by the Christians or on the Christians by the Muslims. The penalty for this was the same as the Jewish practice.²⁷⁸ Similar to the Christian-Jewish law, sexual intercourse between a Christian woman, whether she was a virgin, spouse or a widow and a Muslim man was forbidden and punished by death penalty.²⁷⁹

The battle for Granada, in this sense, changed a lot of things. The campaign for Granada was no continuation of the medieval reconquest. Christian warfare was more destructive and aggressive now and it was directed at only one aim: the total annihilation of the other. This also marks the ultimate shift from El Cid's vision to Charlemagne's vision. It is important to note that Isabel of Castile and Ferdinand of Aragon were very careful with their appearance as model rulers in the process of the reconquest. In this sense, they acted in accordance with the Christian doctrine, the

²⁷³ Ibid., 270.

²⁷⁴ Ibid., 271.

²⁷⁵ Ibid., 272.

²⁷⁶ Ibid., 273.

²⁷⁷ Ibid.

²⁷⁸ Ibid., 274.

²⁷⁹ Ibid., 275.

millenarian prophecies, and in return, they obtained the material and spiritual support of the Church. In this context, the altered strategy towards the Christians was firstly surfaced in 1487 with the war for Màlaga. The enslavement of the total population of Màlaga, that was 15.000 people in total, could be a hint of this shift.²⁸⁰ In this sense, the war for the Andalusian succession, turned into a European crusade in which the cultural identity of the opposite party was important. Yet it can be accepted as a deviation from the general crusader experience, since it was conducted within a smaller land and it required a lesser mobility. Additionally, the absence of the Holy Land (Jerusalem) in the war for the Iberian Peninsula was compensated with Christian saints' or religious figures' tombs on the Muslim territory.²⁸¹ Their tombs needed to be freed just as Jerusalem. This European crusade was also blessed by the Papacy. The pope contributed to the war in terms of both material and human resources.²⁸² He also provided Ferdinand with a giant silver cross that was carried before the troops.²⁸³ In this regard, the religious motivation was evident in the propaganda. In 1481, Ferdinand announced that his aim was "to expel from all Spain the enemies of the Catholic faith and dedicate Spain to the service of God."²⁸⁴ In a statement he made in 1485, he claimed a position similar to Charlemagne's in the *Song of Roland* by saying "we have not been moved to this war by any desire to enlarge our realms, nor by greed for greater revenues."²⁸⁵ In this regard, he was asserting that his motives were only pious although his future campaigns in Italy and North Africa would prove otherwise.

The burden of the war was too heavy for the crown to carry alone so it was apportioned between the crown, the papacy and the religious minorities of Castile. Within this context, in 1482, Pope Sixtus IV issued a bull of crusade which granted

²⁸⁰ Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict*, 35.

²⁸¹ Andrew Wheatcroft, *Infidels A History of Conflict Between Christendom and Islam*, 86.

²⁸² Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict*, 35.

²⁸³ Ibid.

²⁸⁴ Ibid.

²⁸⁵ Ibid.

spiritual favors to the participants of the war.²⁸⁶ Later Pope Innocent VIII in 1485 declared that he granted one-tenth of the revenues of the Church to the war in Spain.²⁸⁷ Furthermore, the Jews and Mudéjars²⁸⁸ in Castile were forced to finance the war through additional taxes.²⁸⁹ The sale of the slaves from Málaga was another profitable business to compensate the financial cost of the war.²⁹⁰

When in January 2, 1492 the last standing Moorish state of Granada fell into Christendom, Ferdinand announced it to the rest of Europe with the following lines: “after so much travail, expense, death and bloodshed this kingdom of Granada, which was 780 years was occupied by infidels, has been won to the glory of God, the exaltation of our Holy Catholic Faith, and the honour of the Apostolic See.”²⁹¹ As a result of this victory of Christianity, Pope Alexander VI honored the sovereigns with the title of *Los Reyes Católicos* [the Catholic Monarchs] in 1494.²⁹²

Spanish writer Hernando del Pulgar (1436-1492) portrayed the dramatic scene of the Christian victory over Granada in his *Crónicas de Los Reyes de Castilla* [Chronicles of the Sovereigns of Castille] (w. 1492). According to this cronicle, in the month of December in 1491, the city of Granada which was under siege, was running out of its provisions for further resistance. Thus, the negotiations for the terms of the surrender started in this atmosphere and lasted thirty days. On December 30, 1491 Moorish King Boabdil surrendered Alhambra to Ferdinand and Isabel.²⁹³ According to the treaty between Boabdil and Ferdinand, the Moors were allowed to keep their

²⁸⁶ Ibid., 36.

²⁸⁷ Ibid.

²⁸⁸ tr. Muslims who were the remnants of the former Islamic state.

²⁸⁹ Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict*, 37.

²⁹⁰ Ibid.

²⁹¹ Ibid.

²⁹² Ibid.

²⁹³ Teófilo Ruiz, trans. “Hernando del Pulgar (1436-1492) *Crónicas de Los Reyes de Castilla* (1492)” in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 343.

religion and property, as well as other privileges.²⁹⁴ In return, the Moors agreed to surrender all the fortresses and all their weapons.²⁹⁵ On the other side, there was a resistance inside Granada who sought to fight rather than to surrender. At this point, Boabdil gathered his councillors and the people who were rioting. He explained that if they continue to fight, the consequences would be severe since they were out of enough provisions to resist this siege.²⁹⁶ In the end, Boabdil persuaded his people and wrote a letter to Ferdinand and Isabel about their acceptance of the peace terms. Reading the letter, Isabel and Ferdinand led their army to Granada. While the Queen and her two infant children were waiting upon a hill overlooking to Granada, Ferdinand and his men approached to the river bank of Genil in front of the city.²⁹⁷ Later, King Boabdil approached, kissed the arm of Ferdinand and gave the keys of the city. Then, two commanders from Ferdinand's army entered the city and, on top of the tower of Comares, they implemented a cross and royal banners.²⁹⁸ When the Queen saw the cross she started to cry out of happiness and her clergymen sang *te deum laudamus*.²⁹⁹ In this sense, the fall of Granada was promoted as a victory against the enemies of Christ.

When we examine the capitulations of Granada, we encounter a respectful document. For instance, the Moors were granted a right to be judged in their laws according to the code of *shari'a*³⁰⁰ under the jurisdiction of qādīs (judge).³⁰¹

²⁹⁴ Ibid.

²⁹⁵ Ibid.

²⁹⁶ Ibid.

²⁹⁷ Ibid., 344.

²⁹⁸ Ibid.

²⁹⁹ It is a religious chant meaning "we praise thee, God".

³⁰⁰ Islamic law.

³⁰¹ L. P. Harvey, trans. "Capitulations of Granada (1491)" in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 345.

Furthermore, they were allowed to leave to live, if they wish, in the Barbary³⁰² or in other places.³⁰³ In this situation, they were free to sell their properties in Granada and take their families beside them. Different from the implementation about the Jews, they would not be forced to bear distinctive marks on them.³⁰⁴ Moreover, the Christians were banned to enter mosques without the permission of the Muslims.³⁰⁵ The Muslims were assured that the Jews were not permitted to have power or command over the Muslims or to be collector of taxes.³⁰⁶ In addition, the Muslims could not be forced to convert or serve in military and their property and inheritance rights would be under protection of the crown.³⁰⁷ On the other hand, after the initial three years of tax holiday, the Muslims would be entitled to pay just taxes.³⁰⁸

However, the incidents did not meet the terms of the treaty. Ferdinand and Isabel, almost immediately, changed their ideas about the freedom of religion in Granada. Hence, the Queen appointed Archbishop Hernando de Talavera (1428-1507) to explain the truth and righteousness of Christianity to the Muslims. In Talavera's mind, conversion should not have been forced if it were to be sincere.³⁰⁹ Therefore, he believed in the power of preaching and dialogue. Archbishop Francisco Jiménez de Cisneros of Toledo (1436-1517), on the other hand, was not pleased with Talavera's peaceful means to convert the Mudéjars in Granada. He was impatient since, in his mind, the conversion progress was slow.³¹⁰ Therefore, with the consent of Queen Isabel, a new turn of forced conversion and inquisition was initiated in

³⁰² North Africa.

³⁰³ L. P. Harvey, "Capitulations of Granada (1491)," 346.

³⁰⁴ Ibid.

³⁰⁵ Ibid.

³⁰⁶ Ibid.

³⁰⁷ Ibid., 348-349.

³⁰⁸ Ibid., 348.

³⁰⁹ Andrew Wheatcroft, *Infidels A History of Conflict Between Christendom and Islam*, 115.

³¹⁰ Erika Rummel, *Jiménez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Arizona: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 33.

Granada. Although Cisneros initially tried to persuade the Muslim community leaders in converting to Christianity through splendid gifts, when he did not succeed, he used coercion.³¹¹ This violation of the Capitulations of Granada, on the other hand, led to the break of a revolt, which was suppressed violently. At the end, the Mudéjars were given two options, either to convert or to go on exile. In this regard, this event marks the end of *convivencia* as Cisneros reported to Pope Alexander VI in December 1499 that 3.000 Muslims were converted.³¹² In addition, it is asserted that thousands of books, including *Holy Quran* which was “the chief book of the Muslim superstition” in Cisneros’s mind, were burned in the public bonfires.³¹³ In this sense, Cisneros planned to eradicate even the cultural imprints of Islam from the Iberian Peninsula. In January 1500 Cisneros reported that “there is now no one in the city who is not a Christian, and all the mosques are churches.”³¹⁴

The Jews were considered as another obstacle before the evangelization of Spain. Although it cannot be mentioned that they were totally free from oppression before the reign of Catholic Monarchs, the Jews experienced a relative tolerance. They were living in ghettos (*aljamas*) in the major towns and they were dealing with certain professions such as commerce.³¹⁵ In fact, some of them lived the prestigious life of the upper classes. For instance, the chief financier of the crown Luis de Santángel who was also the person who helped to finance Columbus’s American expedition, was of Jewish origin. Apart from him, there were other financiers for Isabel and Ferdinand such as Alfonso de la Caballería, Gabriel Sánchez, Abraham Seneor and Isaac Abarbanel.³¹⁶

Nevertheless, violent incidents against the Jews are observable throughout Spanish history such as the great pogrom of 1391. It began in Seville on 6 June, it

³¹¹ Ibid.

³¹² Ibid., 34.

³¹³ Ibid.

³¹⁴ Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict*, 38.

³¹⁵ Andrés Bernáldez, *Historia De Los Reyes Católicos D. Jernando Y Doña Isabel*, 341.

³¹⁶ Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict*, 40.

quickly spread to other Andalusian towns, and thereafter to Toledo, Gelona, Mallorca, Barcelona, Valencia, Logrono, Leridai, Jaca, and Perpignan. The killings and the fear of further persecutions caused to mass conversions. In Seville, for instance, synagogues were transformed into churches and the Jewish ghetto was destroyed.³¹⁷ Later from 1449 onwards a series of anti-semitic pogroms would be seen in Spain as the pogrom of 1473 in Cordoba which led to massacre.³¹⁸

Finally, on March 31, 1492, only two months after the victory over Granada, a royal charter was prepared which commanded the expulsion of all the Jews from Spain. This charter is significant from a couple of points for instance it provides the reason of expulsion in itself:

You know well, or ought to know, that whereas we have been informed that in these our kingdoms there were some wicked Christians who Judaized and apostatized from our holy Catholic Faith, the great cause of which was interaction between the Jews and these Christians, in the cortes which we held in the city of Toledo in the past year of 1480, we ordered the separation of the said Jews in all the cities, towns and villages of our kingdoms.³¹⁹

According to the charter, the Jews were accused of Judaizing the Christians. To put it differently, the “Jews’ aim was to steal faithful Christians from the holy Catholic faith and separate them from it and to drove them to themselves and subvert them to their own wicked belief and conviction.”³²⁰ Furthermore, there is an emphasis on the date of 1480 as the beginning of the Jewish wrongdoings. It is stated that, as a counter measure, the Jews and Christians were separated and the Jews were forced to live in the ghettos. Nonetheless the social interaction continued, and there emerged a need to take further action. At least, this was the justification of the crown. In the end, the Catholic Monarchs resolved to order the said Jews and

³¹⁷ Raymond Carr, ed. *Spain A History* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), 106.

³¹⁸ Ibid.

³¹⁹ Edward Peters, trans. “Charter of Expulsion of Jews (1492)” in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 353.

³²⁰ Ibid., 353-354.

Jewesses of the kingdom to depart and never to return.³²¹ They were allowed to sell their properties but it was forbidden to take gold, silver and coin out of the country.³²² By this charter, in the end, the Jews were faced with two options: to leave the country without money or to accept baptism. It is clear that, in Catholic Monarchs' mind, the Jews were criminals who had been violating the social contract. Therefore, the crown had to take action to punish them for their own sins. Nevertheless, as the passage below indicates, Jews did not agree with the accusations and they thought that Queen Isabel was the source of all evil:

And it is well known that in 1475, in Spain, began the reign of the wicked Queen Isabel, she who was brought upon us all evils and that in 1483 began the period of forty five years and the principle sufferings and affliction, for in that year the she-bear expelled Israel from Andalusia, and from thence to this very day the afflictions have not ceased. Until 1492 when came the general expulsion of all the Exiles of Jerusalem who were then in Spain.³²³

It is important to note that the charges against the Jews were made with the data collected by the Inquisition.³²⁴ Inquisition was used as an instrument to create a homogenous society as well as to weaken local authorities and family alliances. The Spanish Inquisition was established in 1478 by Ferdinand and Isabel with the approval of Pope Sixtus IV. Since the inquisitors could not judge non-Christians, they focused on *marranos*³²⁵ and *moriscos*³²⁶. The main aim of the Inquisition was to find evidence that they were secretly performing their former Jewish or Muslim rituals, and they only posed to be Christian in order to escape from the pressure and the threat of exile. In this sense, the Jews and Muslims who converted to Christianity, could not find peace as well.

³²¹ Ibid., 355.

³²² Ibid.

³²³ Raymond Carr, *Spain A History*, 113.

³²⁴ Edward Peters, "*Charter of Expulsion of Jews (1492)*," 355.

³²⁵ Spanish for "pig", a humiliating word describing the Jewish people who converted to Catholicism.

³²⁶ Spanish for Moorish, describing the Muslim converts to Catholicism.

Inéz López's two accounts of the inquisitorial trials were good examples of this kind. She was put on trial two times one in 1495-1496 and the other in 1511-1512.³²⁷ It was the way of the Inquisition not to tell the accused about the reasons for their imprisonment.³²⁸ Instead, they were given three warnings over a period of weeks to confess for the sins. By doing that, the inquisitors aimed at revealing unreported accounts of heresy. In the inquisitorial trials, formerly Jewish, recently Christian people were asked to confess about nearly everything in their personal lives.

In Inéz López's case, for instances, she confessed that she maintained some of the Jewish customs such as not doing servile work and putting clean clothes on Saturdays and lighting candles on Friday evenings.³²⁹ She also confessed that she had little desire to eat pork and she was observing Jewish fasts.³³⁰ In this sense, it can be inferred that many conversos did not feel obliged to give up all of their Jewish background although they accepted the Catholic faith. After the first trial, on September 17, 1496, she was sentenced to be reconciled in an *auto de fe*³³¹ and to wear *sanbenito*³³² in public. By the reconciliation ceremony, the repentant heretics were received back into the bosom of the Church while the unrepentant ones were executed by burning at stake.³³³ The reconciliation process was hoped to result in good outcomes but sometimes the results were not expected. Inéz López was put on

³²⁷ Ronald Surtz, trans., "Inquisitorial Trials of Inéz López (1495-1496, 1511-1512)" in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 333.

³²⁸ Ibid.

³²⁹ Ibid.

³³⁰ Ibid.

³³¹ tr. act of faith. It was an edifying public spectacle that expressed hatred of heresy and faith in the mercy of the Church.

³³² It was a distinctive penitential garment that was used during the Spanish Inquisition. The style and colour was depending on the offences. Penitent heretics and impenitent heretics wore different colours and style.

³³³ Ronald Surtz, trans. "Descriptions of Two Auto de Fe (1486)" in *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*, ed. Olivia Remie Constable (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 330-331.

trial again in 1511 on the pretext of “false reconciliation”. According to the inquisitors, “Inéz López... in many places disclaimed the confession that she had spontaneously made, declaring and affirming that she had never perpetrated or committed the crimes of heresy that she had confessed to and for which she was reconciled.”³³⁴ Therefore, in 1511 she was sentenced to life imprisonment and all of her property was confiscated by the Inquisition.

Within this context, two motives of the Inquisition can be summarized as *limpieza de sangre* (purity of blood) and money. According to the official propaganda, the blood of the non-Christians and cheaters were not pure. Together with the forced migration and forced conversion, the Spanish Inquisition was proved to be the most prominent instrument for the Catholic Monarchs’s pursuit of their religious and political cleansing agenda. The spirit of the time also enabled this policy since Isabel and Ferdinand’s ultimate victory over the Muslims in the Iberian Peninsula helped to fill the spiritual void and sense of despair experiencing in Europe after the fall of Constantinople. Their victories over the enemies and the Church’s support behind them caused their charisma grow bigger. In this sense, they had a claim on the leadership of the Christian world.

On the other side, the Joachimite prophecy about a savior who would emerge from Spain and free Jerusalem³³⁵ was no secret. The beginning of each new reign, in this sense, aroused eschatological expectations. Together with Pierre D’Ailly’s argument about the end of Islam and the coming of the Antichrist,³³⁶ expectations of a Spanish messianic king aroused with the fall of Granada to Christendom. In this regard, the victory over the Muslims was utilized as a means of political propaganda and as Columbus believed, Ferdinand of Aragon seemed to be the person in the prophecy who would defeat Antichrist, capture Granada, end Islam, reconquer Jerusalem and declare his world empire. The marquis³³⁷ of Cadiz, Don Rodrigo

³³⁴ Ronald Surltz, “Inquisitorial Trials of Inéz López (1495-1496, 1511-1512),” 335.

³³⁵ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 77.

³³⁶ Ibid.

³³⁷ An aristocratic title.

Ponce de Leòn (1443-1492) was one of the people, beside Columbus, who expressed that Ferdinand was the messianic king:

The illustrious, powerful and great prince, King Ferdinand, king and lord of the kingdoms of Castile, Aragon, Sicily, was born under the highest and most copious planet that any king or emperor was... There will be nothing in this world able to resist his might, because God has reserved total victory and all glory to the rod, that is to say the Bat, because Ferdinand is the *Encubierto*³³⁸... And he will subdue all kingdoms from sea to sea, and he will destroy all the Moors of Spain, and all renegades to the Faith will be completely and cruelly destroyed because they are mockers and despisers of the Holy Catholic Faith. And not only will his Highness conquer the Kingdom of Granada, but he will subdue all Africa, and the Kingdoms of Fez, Tunis, Morocco and Benamarin... And he will conquer the Holy House of Jerusalem... and he will become emperor of Rome... and he will keep Roman see empty for three years; and then, by God's will, he will install an Angelic Pope... and not only will he be Emperor but he will be Monarch of all the world.³³⁹

In this regard, presumably Ferdinand and Isabel of Spain utilized the millenarian expectations to consolidate their rule over Spain. The official propaganda against the infidels, the war on the Muslims, the escalating hatred against the Jews which eventually resulted in the expulsion, the investigating techniques of the Spanish Inquisition and forced conversions were the clues and means of this quest. The conversion of the Jews, for instance, was a millenarian prophecy. However, even if the Jews accepted Christianity, they faced with the sinister methods of the Inquisition. Additionally, the victory over the Muslims and conversion of them were in accordance with the eschatological expectations, yet similar to the Jews, the converted Muslims were not trusted and treated as equal citizens. In this regard, their former political allegiances seem to raise doubt about their future loyalty in the minds of the Sovereigns.

³³⁸ tr. the hidden one. Together with "the Bat" or "Marcièlago", it was used to refer to the messianic Spanish king.

³³⁹ Raymond Carr, *Spain A History*, 93.

CHAPTER 4

CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS, GEOGRAPHICAL EXPEDITIONS AND COLONIALISM

*Venient annis
Secula seris; quibus Oceanus
Vincula rerum laxet, et ingens
Pateat telus tishisque novos
Detegat orbis nec sit terries
Vltima tille.³⁴⁰*

Seneca, *Medea*

Christopher Columbus (1451-1506) was another important figure in terms of fifteenth-century theopolitics in Spain. Evidently, Christopher Columbus's voyage to mainland America was not the first one in history. The Norwegian and Icelandic seafarers arrived in the tenth century to the shores of the Greenland. Probably in 1001, Viking ships reached the eastern shores of North America. In fact, the Norse under the command of Leif Ericson had established a short-lived settlement in the northern islands.³⁴¹ Nevertheless, pre-Columbus voyages to the Americas are not accepted as a discovery.

In traditional historiography, Columbus has a positive image whereas most recent studies about Columbus are more complex in nature. Apart from Columbus's son and contemporaries, a historian and biographer Washington Irving's *Life and*

³⁴⁰ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea*, 50.

tr. an age will come after many years when the Ocean will loose the chains of things, and a huge land lies revealed; when Tiphys will disclose new worlds and Thule no more be the ultimate.

³⁴¹ Howard Zinn, Manning Marable, Mike Davis and Veli Yılmaz, *Fatihler Yargılanıyor* (İstanbul: Tüm Zamanlar Yayıncılık, 1992), 17.

Voyages of Columbus (1828) and Harvard historian Samuel Eliot Morison's *Admiral of the Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus* (1942) can be given as significant examples of the former understanding. In these works, Columbus was reflected and praised as the representative of high morals, godliness, tolerance and scientific spirit.

More recently, on the other side, European scholars have analyzed Columbus from a different viewpoint. Jacques Heers's *Christophe Colomb* (1981), Alain Milhou's *Colon y su Mentalidad Mesianic en el Ambiente Franciscanista Español* (1983), Oxford historian Felipe Fernandez-Armesto's *Columbus* (1991) and Pulitzer winner writer John Noble Wilford's *The Mysterious History of Columbus* (1991) can be classified under this category. These works concentrate more on the human aspect of Columbus rather than his heroization. The postmodern studies on Columbus, furthermore, place him within a larger history of global conquest and state building.³⁴² Yale historian J. H. Elliott's *The Old World and the New: 1492-1650* (1970), University of Texas historian Alfred W. Crosby's *Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492* (1972), William H. McNeill's *Plagues and Peoples* (1976) and activist Kirkpatrick Sale's *Conquest of Paradise* (1990) can be examples of such kind. These studies evaluate the geographical expeditions from ecosystem-, diseases-, and cultural transformation-related dimensions.

Therefore, the traditional European narrative perceives him as a hero, whereas later historians and Native American activists support that glorifying Columbus as a discoverer of New World is an ethnocentric perspective ignoring indigenous people of the Americas and the Vikings' earlier voyages. Not to mention, he opened the box of Pandora containing genocide, slavery and the exploitation of both human and material resources of the Americas. What is more striking and relevant to this study is the reason behind his expeditions. Contrary to the traditional understanding, more recent studies on Columbus, such as the ones of Alain Milhou and John Noble Wilford, tend to reflect him as a man of religion rather than a man of reason. In this

³⁴² Carla Rahn Phillips, "Background Books: Columbus and the Labyrinth of History", *The Wilson Quarterly* 15, no. 4 (1991): 87-90, 87, accessed April 28, 2019, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40258163>.

context, the content of this chapter will be the life of Christopher Columbus and his voyages within the framework of his religious beliefs.

4.1 Christopher Columbus's Life

Christopher Columbus was born in Genoa in 1451³⁴³ on the verge of the *Renaissance*. His family name was written as “Colombo” in Italy but he preferred “Colón” in Spain since he wanted to comply with the language of the place he resided.³⁴⁴ On the other hand, because *columba* means “dove” in Latin, Columbus preferred the English version “Columbus”, and assumed the mission of a dove when sailing to the West while carrying the grace of the Holy Ghost.³⁴⁵ For similar reasons, he used *Christoferens* for his signature, meaning “Christ-bearer”.

Our knowledge about Columbus's journeys, life and ideas mainly came from the writings of his illegitimate son Ferdinand (1488-1539) and Bartolomé de Las Casas (1484-1566). In this regard, Ferdinand wrote a comprehensive biography of Columbus in his *La Historie Della Vita e Dei Fatti di Cristoforo Columbo*. Bartolomé de Las Casas, in addition, is significant since he was a direct witness of the colonization of Americas. In 1502, he traveled to Hispaniola with a mission where he was concerned with the evangelization of the Indies. He was a priest by 1510 and, a Dominican friar by 1522. He was the person who wrote a history about the Spanish colonization in the New World, and his famous works include *Historia de Las Indias* (1527-1561) [History of the Indies] and *Brevísima Relación de La Destrucción de Las Indias* (1539-1552) [A Brief Account of the Devastation of the Indies].³⁴⁶

³⁴³ Daniel C. Scavone, “Christopher Columbus” in *Salem Press Biographical Encyclopedia*, 2018 accessed April 28, 2019, <https://bit.ly/2WkoNtd>.

³⁴⁴ Benjamin Keen, ed., *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand* (New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1959), 4.

³⁴⁵ Ibid.

³⁴⁶ During his stay in the Americas, he was observing the treatment of the Indians/natives and their pathetic living conditions. At age forty, he gave his *encomienda* (Spanish labor system. Firstly, established in Spain after the *reconquista* and spread to Americas and Philippines with colonization.

To begin with, the timing of Columbus's birth contributed great to his personality. He was born only two years before the conquest of the eastern capital of Christianity by the Ottomans. That is to say, he grew up hearing stories about the "evil" Turks, and how they blockaded the traditional trade routes to the East, and troubled the Christian West. Throughout his youth, popes and priests were demanding a new crusade to reconquer Constantinople as well as Jerusalem.³⁴⁷

Additionally, he had good navigational and maritime skills as well as knowledge of geography, cosmology, history, astronomy and any other related subject that all came from his readings. Some of them includes Pliny the Elder's *Naturalis Historia* (c. 77 AD), Plutarch's *Lives* (c. the beginning of the second century), Marco Polo's *Il Milione* (c. 1298), Pius II's *Historia Rerum Ubique Gestarum* (1477) and Pierre d'Ailly's *Imago Mundi* (1410).³⁴⁸ D'Ailly's *Imago Mundi* and *Historia* of Pius II inspired his vision of cosmos.³⁴⁹ There are strong indications that Columbus sincerely studied these works. On Columbus's copy of *Historia Rerum Ubique Gestarum*, for instance, there were four postilles. One included quotations from the *Bible*, and others included a discussion of the Hebrew prophets in Augustine's *City of God*; of Flavius Josephus, a Jewish historian, about Solomon's explorers who were seeking gold and a chronology of the world from its

It rewarded *conquistadors* with the labor of particular groups of subject people.) holdings up and passed them to Diego, the legitimate son of Columbus. Perhaps with the effect of being a priest, he dedicated his remaining life to the voice and sufferings of the natives and to restore their living conditions.

³⁴⁷ John Noble Wilford, "Columbus and the Labyrinth of History," *The Wilson Quarterly* 15, no. 4 (1991), 73.

³⁴⁸ Pauline Moffitt Watts, "Prophecy and Discovery: On the Spiritual Origins of Christopher Columbus's 'Enterprise of Indies'", *The American Historical Review* 90, no. 1 (1985): 73-102, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1860749>, 75.

³⁴⁹ *Ibid.* 77.

creation.³⁵⁰ From his readings, he acquired the idea that the earth was a globe and this shape of the earth could make circumnavigation possible.³⁵¹

Then it brings us to the idea that made Columbus significant for the world history, “La Empresa de Las Indias” [The Enterprise of the Indies] which simply meant to reach east by sailing westward. Nevertheless, this idea does not originally belong to Columbus. Paolo Toscanelli dal Pozzo (d. 1482), a Florentine mathematician had already brought this idea up to Prince Herry the Navigator in 1474. Columbus got Toscanelli’s opinion on the subject, in fact they exchanged letters from 1474 until the death of Toscanelli in 1482.³⁵² Unlike Toscanelli, Columbus was proved a man of action. His passion to procure the gold and the richness of the East made him spent years pleading his case to the crowns of Europe. During this time, he dealt with the most eminent scholars and academics of his time to persuade them about the feasibility of his ideas although he was a man with lower education. He was so stubborn about his ideas because the gold meant more than just a commodity or a means of richness to Columbus. Rather it was a means to salvation. To put it differently, it was the material source to be expended for a divine cause.

In this sense, he first submitted his ideas to Portuguese king John II in 1484, but he was rejected since the advisors of the Portuguese King found the idea difficult and useless in terms of the practice and consequence.³⁵³ Furthermore, Portugal was already dwelling to find a route to India through Africa. In 1488, when Bartolomeu Dias rounded the Cape of Good Hope, the expectations of Columbus from the Portuguese crown were finalized. As a result, Columbus tried England, France and Spain as the next target patrons. He spent years at the Spanish court trying to find patronage for his voyages. With the consent of Queen Isabel, Columbus was employed in the palace and his proposal was left for evaluation by a commission in

³⁵⁰ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy* (New York: Vintage Books, 1992), 227-228.

³⁵¹ Pauline Moffitt Watts, “Prophecy and Discovery: On the Spiritual Origins of Christopher Columbus’s ‘Enterprise of Indies,’” 80.

³⁵² Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 19-23.

³⁵³ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri* (İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, 2016), 247.

1486.³⁵⁴ For years, Isabel and Ferdinand had constantly delayed their decision about the enterprise although they did not exclusively reject Columbus.³⁵⁵

Columbus's lack of success in Spain until 1492, in this regard, might be originated from a couple of reasons. The most important one among them was the war which Ferdinand and Isabel of Spain were waging against the Moors. Since their marriage strengthened the Christian League there was an opportunity to erase the last standing Muslim presence from the Iberian Peninsula. Therefore, all of their attention was on the war of Granada. Furthermore, Columbus's ideas were not proved correct or profitable yet.³⁵⁶

Columbus thought that after the war with the Moors and its burden were finally over, the Spanish Monarchs would give him their consent on the journey.³⁵⁷ Actually, nothing changed after the fall of Granada in 1492. It was the chief financial advisor Luis de Santángel who changed the mind of the Spanish Monarchs.³⁵⁸ He gathered money from the ample coffers of the state police, and from the Italian bankers and made the crown believe that they had little to lose and much to gain if Columbus's ideas hold.³⁵⁹ Concordantly, if Columbus succeeded, this would be great service to God and his Church, not to speak of the glory it would provide to the kingdom.

Finally, in the Church of St. George in Palos de la Frontera, a royal proclamation was read commanding the people of Palos to provide the crown with two caravels fully equipped for Christopher Columbus to sail to the ocean.³⁶⁰ The names of these two caravels were *Niña* and *Pinta*. In addition to these, there was a third and a chartered caravel, which was *Santa Maria*. Columbus left Palos on

³⁵⁴ Ibid., 246.

³⁵⁵ Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 40.

³⁵⁶ Ibid., 39-40.

³⁵⁷ John Noble Wilford, "Columbus and the Labyrinth of History," 75.

³⁵⁸ Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 43.

³⁵⁹ John Noble Wilford, "Columbus and the Labyrinth of History," 70-75.

³⁶⁰ Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 44.

August 3, 1492 with three ships and ninety crewmembers. The Catholic Monarchs granted Columbus 10 percent of the gold or any other material bought, bartered, found or produced within the limits of his admiralty.³⁶¹ Moreover, they graced Columbus and his family with the title the Admiral of the Ocean Sea and Viceroy of Discovered Lands.³⁶² Against the accusations he did not risk anything of his own, Columbus paid an eighth part of the total expenses of the expedition.³⁶³

His aim was to arrive at the fabled shores of the Indies and Cathay (China), the place Marco Polo had celebrated in his tales; the place where gold and spices abounded. Within this context, for Columbus, gold meant more than richness. In his own words; “Gold is the most precious of all commodities; gold constitutes treasure, and he who possesses it has all he needs in this world, as also the means of rescuing souls from purgatory, and restoring them to the enjoyment of paradise.”³⁶⁴

Even if he could not, yet in his dying bed, he insisted that he arrived at the Indies.³⁶⁵ In fact, he never expressed explicitly or recognized that he arrived somewhere other than Asia. What makes Columbus significant for this study is the relationship between the enterprise of the Indies and the doctrine of millenarianism. For this reason, before going into the details of the voyages and religious motives behind them, Columbus’s character requires attention. According to his son Ferdinand he was also strict about religious issues to the point that one could think him as a member of a religious order.³⁶⁶ Yet, he never blindly obeyed the Church; he argued with the priests and the bishops in defending his perception of Christianity.³⁶⁷ In this regard, he had close friends around religious circles. Antonio Marchena, a

³⁶¹ Ibid., 42-44.

³⁶² Ibid.

³⁶³ “Articles of Agreement Between the Lords The Catholic Sovereigns and Christóbal Colon” *American Journeys Collection*, accessed July 24, 2019, <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-061/>, 79.

³⁶⁴ R. H. Major, ed. *Select Letters of Christopher Columbus With Other Original Documents Related to The Four Voyages to The New World* (London: Council of the Hakluyt Society, 1870), 256.

³⁶⁵ John Noble Wilford, “Columbus and the Labyrinth of History,” 70.

³⁶⁶ Ibid., 72.

³⁶⁷ Paolo Emilio Taviani, *Cristoforo Colombo'nun Maceraları* (İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi, 2003), 283.

Franciscan priest, for instance, was one of Columbus's best friends.³⁶⁸ Moreover, Columbus opened and discussed his idea *buscar el Levante por el Poniente* to the monks in La Rabida Monastery in Palos in 1485.³⁶⁹ In this context, the fact that he shared his plans for the voyage with the clergy was an indication of his ideas being mysticized by him.

Moreover, he was a good student of the Christian doctrine, in this regard, he knew very well the *New Testament* as well as the long sections of the *Old Testament*. When an unfortunate event happened, he had the habit of repeating the first verses of St. John's *Revelation*.³⁷⁰ Columbus's stubborn pursuit of reaching the Indies was to acquire gold and fortune in order to organize a crusade for the recapture of the Holy Sepulchre. Within this framework, Columbus fantasized of bringing the divided world together under one religion just as it was once under the Roman Eagle.³⁷¹ In this sense, Columbus was prone to ascribe mystical meanings to his voyages. He thought of himself as the person who would fulfill the prophecy of Joachim of Fiore. More specifically, he thought he was the person to initiate the age of the Holy Spirit which is mentioned under the title of millennialism.

He died on May 20, 1506 in the city of Valladolid, Spain, and was buried in Seville.³⁷² It is clear that Columbus died before he could make his dreams come true, and he reached the triumph of his popularity not initially after his voyages, but in the course of a significant time. Nonetheless, his first arrival at the Americas has been celebrated as a holiday (Columbus Day) both in Spain and in most of the countries he travelled to.³⁷³ Within this context, the 400th anniversary of his first landing was celebrated as the World's Columbian Exposition in 1893 in Chicago.³⁷⁴ Even so, his

³⁶⁸ Ibid.

³⁶⁹ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 246.

³⁷⁰ Ibid.

³⁷¹ Ibid., 284.

³⁷² Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 284-285.

³⁷³ Daniel C. Scavone, "Christopher Columbus".

³⁷⁴ Ibid.

legacy is rather complicated. In the subsequent part, independently from his legacy, his voyages will be examined and the religious motivations behind them will be tried to shed light on.

4.2 Christopher Columbus's Voyages

As mentioned above, Christopher Columbus weighed anchor from Palos, Spain on August 3, 1492 with three ships and a mystic quest. The date of Columbus's departure is interesting since July 31, 1492 marks the date of the final shipload of the Jewish families, who were banished from Spain because they refused to convert to Christianity. Three days before Columbus's first departure, they sailed away from Palos and mostly Cadiz.³⁷⁵ In the summer of 1492 alone, some 8.000 Jewish families were forced to leave Spain.³⁷⁶ It is also interesting that, while the Jewish families sailed away from Palos two days before the day of mourning for the destruction of Jerusalem; three days later, Columbus was sailing away from the same port with the desire to gather enough gold for the recovery and reconstruction of Jerusalem under the Christian rule.

Three months earlier than the departure, on May 23, 1492, a letter of the Spanish Monarchs dated April 30 was read in the courtyard of the Church of St. George. Opening with royal titles and greetings, the letter continued with the command of equipping two ships in ten days for Columbus to sail on them towards the Ocean in order "to perform certain things for the crown."³⁷⁷ Furthermore, it announced that a four-month advanced payment would be given to those who wished to participate in the voyage.³⁷⁸

Preparations of the ships, on the other hand, took more than ten days. *Niña* and *Pinta* were provided and furnished by the tax-payers whereas *Santa María* was

³⁷⁵ Leonard I. Sweet, "Christopher Columbus and the Millennial Vision of the New World," *The Catholic Historical Review* 72, no.3 (1986): 369-382, 372.

³⁷⁶ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A life of Christopher Columbus*, 101.

³⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, 102.

³⁷⁸ *Ibid.*

chartered by Columbus himself from its owner.³⁷⁹ In this process, all the people in Andalusia, especially merchants, dealers, carpenters, ship chandlers and bakers were commanded to provide Columbus with everything he needed at a fair price. They were ordered not to impose customs duties or excises on the needed materials.³⁸⁰ More interestingly, all civil and criminal prosecutions against the future travel companions of Columbus were lifted by the consent of the crown.³⁸¹

Three months after from the announcement of the Royal Proclamation, everything was set for the voyage. On August 3, Columbus participated in the communion at St. George's Church of Palos in the morning, and sailed away in his flagship with other the two ships and ninty crewmembers before dawn. Columbus sailed with *Santa Maria*,³⁸² and his first command was "in the name of Jesus, get under way."³⁸³

4.2.1 The First Voyage

Columbus's own journal is the main source of most of the information about the voyage and the discovery. This journal is not an ordinary journal of a ship captain since it contains detailed information on the people, vegetation and live stock as well as objects sighted at sea and discovered lands. The original manuscript of the journal was lost after it was presented to the king and queen by Columbus in Barcelona.³⁸⁴ It might have got lost in the royal archieves but fortunately, a handful of copies were taken before. Las Casas was one of the people who made an abstract including long quotations from the original manuscript.³⁸⁵ Columbus's son Ferdinand also used the

³⁷⁹ Ibid., 102-103

³⁸⁰ Ibid., 104.

³⁸¹ Ibid.

³⁸² Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 44.

³⁸³ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea*, 151.

³⁸⁴ Ibid., 149.

³⁸⁵ Ibid.

journal, but it is not clear if he copied from the original himself or he also used the Las Casas version.³⁸⁶ The Las Casas version is kept in National Library of Madrid and the the passage below is taken from it.³⁸⁷ Columbus started his journal by writing a preamble as follows:

In the name of our Lord Jesus Christ
Because O most Christian and very high, very excellent and puissant Princes, King and Queen of the Spains and of the islands of the sea, our Lords, in this present year 1492, after Your Highnesses had given an end to the war with the Moors who reigned in Europe, and had finished it in the very great city of Granada, where in this present year, on the second day of the month January, by the force of arms, I saw the royal banners of Your Highnesses placed on the towers of Alhambra, which is the fortress of that city, and I saw the Moorish King come forth from the gates of the city and kiss the royal hands of Your Highnesses, and of the Prince my Lord, and presently in that same month, acting on the information that I had given to Your Highnesses touching the lands of India, and respecting a prince who is called Great Can [Khan] which means in our language King of Kings, how he and his ancestors had sent to Rome many times to ask for learned men of our holy faith to teach and how the Holy Father had never complied, insomuch that many people believing in idolatries were lost by receiving doctrine of perdition; Your Highnesses, as Catholic Christians and Princes who love the Holy Christian faith and the propagation of it, and who are enemies to the sect of Mahoma [Mohammed] and to all idolatries and heresies, resolved to send me, Christòbal Colon, to the said parts of India, to see the said princes and the cities and lands, and their disposition with a view that they might be converted to our holy faith; and ordered that I should go by land to the eastward, as had been customary, but that I should go by way the west, whither up to this day, we do not know for certain that any one has gone.

Thus, after having turned out all the Jews from all your kingdoms and lordships, in the same month of January, your Highnesses gave orders to me that with a sufficient fleet I should go to the said parts of India, and for this they made great concessions to me, and ennobled me, so that henceward I should be called Don, and should be Chief Admiral of the Ocean Sea, perpetual Viceroy and Governor of all the islands and continents that I should discover and gain, and that I might hereafter discover and gain in the Ocean Sea, and that my eldest son

³⁸⁶ Ibid.

³⁸⁷ Ibid.

[Diego] should succeed , and so on from generation to generation for ever.³⁸⁸

From the above-cited passage, one can deduce various details about Columbus's state of mind. Firstly, Columbus approached his voyage as a natural consequence or a related event of the Spanish conquests against the Moors in the mainland. He also considered the expulsion of the Jews in the scope of the Spanish conquests. Secondly, Columbus was prone to interpret history from an ecclesiastical angle. As it is mentioned earlier in this study, Augustine divided history into two, as the sacred and profane. In this categorization, the most important events in human history fell into the sacred one since the aim of the creation was salvation. Influenced by Augustine, Columbus was eager to analyze events from a similar perspective hence, he thought that Great Khan and his ancestors had attacked Rome to learn about and convert to Christianity. Unfortunately, when God did not help them, they fell into idolatry and heresy. Thirdly, Columbus perceived Christianity as the one and only true religion, thus any other religion could only be a heresy or idolatry, and its believers could only be heretics and infidels. Islam, in his mind, was a deteriorated sect of Christianity. And lastly, he believed his journey was to perform a religious duty. He was keen on the evangelization of the Indies.

Columbus's planned sea route was to sail southward to the Canary Islands rather than sailing directly to the west.³⁸⁹ The Portuguese sailors had already tried to sail directly westward from Portugal, which resulted with failure due to the westerlies. Therefore, this choice of route also demonstrates Columbus's navigational and geographical skills. On October 12, the land was spotted from *Pinta* since it was the fastest and leading caravel.³⁹⁰ At this stage, the crew gathered and signed *Salve Regina*,³⁹¹ they always gathered at such times.³⁹² When he spotted the

³⁸⁸ "Journal of the First Voyage of Columbus," *American Journeys Collection*, accessed July 24, 2019, <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-062/>, 89-90.

³⁸⁹ Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea*, 149.

³⁹⁰ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 19.

³⁹¹ tr. Hail Queen. A chant.

³⁹² Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 20.

land, Columbus thought it was one of the outlying islands of Cipangu (Japan). In this sense, he was dissatisfied since he thought he failed to reach Cipangu.³⁹³ Instead, the actual place of the first landfall was called Guanahani by the natives and it was far from China or Japan since it was in the Bahamas.³⁹⁴

Later, Columbus, Pinzón and his brother Vicente Yáñez went ashore with a royal banner and two green cross flags. There was F (for Ferdinand) and I (for Isabel) letters on them, a crown on the both letters and a cross between two letters.³⁹⁵ In this way, Columbus seized the island on behalf of the king and the queen, and named it as San Salvador. From the first landing onwards, Columbus traveled from island to island in order to arrive at Cipangu at once. He spent little time on those rather small islands.

Nevertheless, he did not hesitate neither to christianise the discovered islands nor to observe the people and the habitat. In this respect, he planted a cross on each of the discovered islands and renamed them. Furthermore, he observed the inhabitants and the lands and compared them with each other or the ones in Spain. In his journal, Columbus spoke of the natives as completely unclothed, young and beautiful looking, well-built, curious and decent people.³⁹⁶ In terms of their character, Columbus described them as people who did not know the meaning of evil, and who were compliant and timid.³⁹⁷ They also did not have weapons apart from sharpened stakes. They did not recognize swords, to such an extent that when they were shown, they were handling it from the wrong side which resulted in injuries.³⁹⁸

³⁹³ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer" in Encyclopedia Britannica, accessed April 28, 2019 <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Christopher-Columbus/The-fourth-voyage-and-final-years>

³⁹⁴ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 20.

³⁹⁵ Ibid.

³⁹⁶ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 21-22.

³⁹⁷ Ibid., 57.

³⁹⁸ Ibid., 22.

In terms of religious affiliations, Columbus interpreted that since the natives did not belong to an organized religion, they could be baptised very easily.³⁹⁹ For Columbus, natives believed there was only one god in the skies, and Columbus and his crew were sent from the skies by that God.⁴⁰⁰ In his journal, Columbus wrote that as soon as devoted Christians learned the natives' language, natives would convert to Christianity in masses.⁴⁰¹ In addition, he urged the Catholic Monarchs in the conversion of the native population as well as the destruction of the ones who did not have the desire to submit to the Trinity.⁴⁰² Columbus longed for the help of Christ in the decision-making process of the crown. By the christianisation of the discovered lands, he believed the Spanish Monarchs, when they passed away, would make their country free from evil and heresy, and in return they would be accepted with compassion by God.⁴⁰³

To realize the aim of evangelisation, Columbus warned his crew not to hurt any native or not to take any of their belongings without their consent and ordered them to give something back for anything they took from the natives.⁴⁰⁴ Unfortunately, the more the natives gave, the more the crew got greedy. They desired to take as much as possible from the natives but gave nothing in return.⁴⁰⁵ Conversely, Columbus believed in the power of dialogue. He thought that nowhere in Castile could be compared to the richness or natural beauty of the newly discovered lands.⁴⁰⁶ Natives were already content and generous people. They were quick learners, and they instantly repeated what they had been told. For example,

³⁹⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰⁰ Ibid., 57.

⁴⁰¹ Ibid., 55.

⁴⁰² Ibid.

⁴⁰³ Ibid.

⁴⁰⁴ Ibid., 107.

⁴⁰⁵ Ibid., 111.

⁴⁰⁶ Ibid., 97.

they were singing *Salve Regina* and *Ave Maria*⁴⁰⁷ with Spanish men and they were crossed themselves when they were shown.⁴⁰⁸ When a ship approached their shores, they were running to the beach with gifts. In this context, the natives exchanged parrots, cotton balls and jewelry for worthless trinkets.⁴⁰⁹ Even so, these made the natives very happy since they were fascinated by the men coming from the sea. Columbus understood that friendship and dialogue could work due to the fact that the natives were already eager to share everything they had.

Initially, Columbus and his adherents were travelling safely from shore to shore, from island to island and they did not confront any resistance.⁴¹⁰ Columbus commented that the natives were ignorant of the art of war to an extent that three Spanish men would easily overcome a thousand natives in a conflict.⁴¹¹ Accordingly, the natives were prone to take orders, work in the fields and do other useful things: they could be thought to dress like Christians and build cities.⁴¹² Besides, Columbus needed them to locate the places of the gold. For these reasons, Columbus might have thought that the natives' feeling comfortable with Christians had paramount importance. On the other hand, some of his crew did not think as same as Columbus and wanted to pursue other gains. In this sense, the escape of *Pinta* under the command of Pinzón was a great difficulty for Columbus. He was obliged to end the first excursion early while there was still pretty much to discover but it could be dangerous.⁴¹³ Besides, there was no ship to carry the obtained material and people back to Spain. On December 25, *Santa María* ran aground off Haiti and was lost.⁴¹⁴

⁴⁰⁷ tr. Hail Mary. A chant.

⁴⁰⁸ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 49.

⁴⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, 21.

⁴¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 98.

⁴¹¹ *Ibid.*

⁴¹² *Ibid.*, 98-99.

⁴¹³ *Ibid.*, 125.

⁴¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 116.

Pinta, on the other hand, was out of sight since October 21.⁴¹⁵ Hence, there was only one caravel left and it was not enough. Preparations for the return started on December 31.⁴¹⁶

Before departure, Columbus stopped at some of the islands on his way. La Navidad was one of them. Columbus spent time with the natives there and asked them the usual questions about their life and the places where they could find gold. He introduced Diego de Arana, Pedro Gutiérrez and Rodrigo de Escobedo to the natives and left them to rule with the grace of the Lord and Christ.⁴¹⁷ On January 6, Columbus sighted *Pinta*. Pinzón asked for forgiveness, Admiral accepted yet said all the excuses Pinzón put forward were inappropriate and he left because he succumbed to his greed.⁴¹⁸ Columbus revealed, Pinzón learned from one of the Indies in his carevel that there was enormous amount of gold in an island called Bohio.⁴¹⁹ Anyhow, Columbus was very cautious since he strived hard for this voyage. After that moment, his only desire was to return back to Spain and get rid of these “inglourious” people.⁴²⁰ He had confidence in the Spanish Monarchs: when they asked for the details of this voyage, he thought, they would learn about these tricksters and punish them.⁴²¹

On January 16, 1493, Columbus sailed with two remaining caravels for Spain. The journey back was difficult due to the westerlies. On February 14, *Pinta* was out of sight again but this time the reason was the storm.⁴²² The crew and also Columbus were terrified by the storm, they were begging and making vows to God in

⁴¹⁵ Ibid., 66.

⁴¹⁶ Ibid., 130.

⁴¹⁷ Ibid., 126.

⁴¹⁸ Ibid., 131.

⁴¹⁹ Ibid.

⁴²⁰ Ibid., 133.

⁴²¹ Ibid., 135.

⁴²² Ibid., 152.

order to survive this storm.⁴²³ They arrived at Azores on February 18 and sailed from there on February 24.⁴²⁴ On March 5, Columbus reached Lisbon where Bartolomeu Dias was waiting with an armed ship at the dock.⁴²⁵ Dias asked Columbus to join him to give information about the voyages to the Portuguese King. Columbus refused it saying he was under the protection of the Spanish Monarchs and only by armed struggle he could be taken from his ship.⁴²⁶ Eventually, he was asked to show the letter of the Spanish Monarchs as evidence.⁴²⁷ Columbus found this offer reasonable and provided the Portuguese officials with the letter. The Portuguese king ordered this man to provide Columbus and his crew with everything they needed.⁴²⁸ Besides, the news spreaded quickly. People were coming to the dock to see the caravela and Indian people beside Columbus.⁴²⁹ Portuguese royals and highranking officials even offered Columbus their support if he wished to travel to Spain by road.⁴³⁰

On March 15, 1493 Columbus reached the port which he sailed from for the first journey on August 3, 1492. He concluded his first journal in Palos commenting;

I know respecting this voyage, that he has miraculously shown his will, as may be seen from this journal, setting forth the numerous miracles that have been displayed in the voyage, and in me who was so long at the court of your Highnesses, working in opposition to and against the opinions of so many chief persons of your household, who were all against me, looking upon this enterprise as folly. But I hope, in our Lord, that it will be a great benefit to Christianity, for so it has ever appeared.”⁴³¹

⁴²³ Ibid., 153-154.

⁴²⁴ Ibid., 162.

⁴²⁵ Ibid., 165.

⁴²⁶ Ibid.

⁴²⁷ Ibid., 166.

⁴²⁸ Ibid.

⁴²⁹ Ibid.

⁴³⁰ Ibid., 168.

⁴³¹ “Journal of the First Voyage of Columbus,” *American Journeys Collection*, 257-258.

In Palos, Columbus learnt that the sovereigns were in Barcelona. He had already sent a letter to them from Lisbon. After he set foot in Spain, he immediately sent another copy by way of Seville.⁴³² Later he performed his vows, which he made during the terrible storm, at Santa Clara de Moguer and Santa María de la Cinta at Huelva and after spending almost two weeks with Fray Juan Pérez at La Rábida, he moved with ten Indian captives to Seville.⁴³³ On April 7, he received a reply from the monarchs:

Dón Christóbal Colón,
Their Admiral of the Ocean Sea, Viceroy and Governor of the Islands
that he hath discovered in the Indies,
We have seen your letters and we have taken much pleasure in
learning whereof you write, and that God gave so good a result to your
labors, and well guided you in what you commenced, whereof He will
be well served and we also, and our realms receive so much
advantage. It will please God that, beyond that wherein you serve
Him, you should receive from as many favors (...) In as much as we
will that which you have commenced with the aid of God be
continued and furthered, and we desire that you come here forthwith,
therefore for our service make the best haste you can in your coming,
so that you may be timely provided with everything you need...⁴³⁴

By this letter, Columbus achieved a couple of things. First, he had his long-wished titles ratified by the crown. In addition, he had been given consent for a new expedition. This was the triumph of Columbus's fame. Now that Pinzón had already died shortly after he set foot on Spain, Columbus was the undisputable leader of the expeditions. Within this moment of joy, he assumed a new role for himself and started to write his plans for an efficient colonization of Hispaniola.⁴³⁵ He formulated some two thousand volunteers should be taken to Hispaniola, upon arrival they should be distributed to three or four towns to be founded at appropriate places each with an alcalde, a clerk, a church and priests "for the administration of the

⁴³² Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea*, 341.

⁴³³ Ibid.

⁴³⁴ Ibid., 342.

⁴³⁵ Ibid., 343.

sacraments, and for divine worship and the conversion of the Indians.”⁴³⁶ He also regulated the collecting of gold. Accordingly, no one except *bona fide* settlers with a licence could collect gold. Moreover, gold hunting should be limited with a season so that other duties did not get sidetracked.⁴³⁷ Additionally, the gold hunters had to hand over the gold to the clerk, half to be taken by the colony treasurer for the crown and one percent to be reserved for the support of religion.⁴³⁸ Also all the gold that was gathered had to be melted and stamped in order to prevent misconduct.⁴³⁹

Despite Columbus returned back with both material and human cargo from the first voyage, he had not managed to meet the Great Khan and see the grand cities mentioned in the tales of Marco Polo. For this, one of the main objectives of the voyage seems unfulfilled. Yet, Columbus did not doubt that maybe he had been near to Japan or China. His other aims, on the contrary, can be accepted as partially fulfilled. He came across a population that was eager to believe that Columbus was sent by the skies so that the evangelization could not be so difficult. He also managed to gather gold, pearl, spices and exotic creatures which in turn granted him with the second voyage.

4.2.2 The Second Voyage

The material sources such as gold and parrots and human captives that Columbus displayed for his sovereigns at Barcelona granted him the second voyage. This time, the goal was to establish a permanent settlement in Hispaniola. To realize this aim, Columbus left the port of Cádiz in the autumn of 1493 with 17 ships and 1200 people including clergy.⁴⁴⁰

⁴³⁶ Ibid.

⁴³⁷ Ibid.

⁴³⁸ Ibid.

⁴³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁰ Rocky M. Mirza, *The Rise and Fall of The American Empire: A Re-Interpretation of History, Economics and Philosophy: 1492-2006*, (Canada: Trafford Publishing, 2007), 32.

The second voyage was different from the first one since the pressure over Columbus started to increase. He could not find the mainland Cathay, so he was still stuck to one of the objectives of the first voyage which created a sort of tension. Furthermore, the natives began to resist the colonialists. For example, the men Columbus had left in the first voyage in Navidad were murdered by the natives and the stockade he had built was destroyed.⁴⁴¹ Although Columbus rebuilt the fort, built a church and a city which was named as La Isabela, the colony was on the verge of starvation because of the insufficient rainfall and little vegetation.⁴⁴² Meanwhile, sickness and dissention were widely encountered.⁴⁴³ Additionally, expeditions into the mountains to find gold mines turned into a dead end.⁴⁴⁴ These unsatisfying events brought harsh implementations alongside. As Las Casas put, Columbus “spread terror among the Indians in order to show them how strong and powerful the Christians were.”⁴⁴⁵

The journal of the second voyage is missing but we have the letter that Columbus sent to the sovereigns through Antonio de Torres on January 2, 1494.⁴⁴⁶ In this letter, Columbus talked about his plans for colonization, everyday life, city building and evangelization and asked for the approval of Isabel and Ferdinand for his plans.⁴⁴⁷ In this sense, Columbus wrote that he had sent some of the resisting natives alongside with Torres to be sold as slaves in Spain. He also urged Isabel and Ferdinand to enable to teach the Spanish language to those slaves since they could be used as translators to convert natives into Christianity.⁴⁴⁸ Columbus also assumed that heaven was granted to those slaves. In his mind, when they reached Castille,

⁴⁴¹ Valerie I. J. Flint, “Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer.”

⁴⁴² John Noble Wilford, “Columbus and the Labyrinth of History,” 76.

⁴⁴³ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁶ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 173.

⁴⁴⁷ Ibid., 173-191.

⁴⁴⁸ Ibid., 180.

they could learn Spanish and immediately baptized.⁴⁴⁹ Therefore, Columbus perceived himself as the savior of these rather primitive people. In return, the Catholic Monarchs stated their appreciation for the evangelization of the Indies.⁴⁵⁰

As mentioned earlier, colonization was not going as planned. Unfortunately, there were sickness, famine and resistance. In this sense, Columbus asked for the required material for the survival of the colonies such as sugar, salt, honey, meat etc.⁴⁵¹ In order to break the resistance, Columbus asked for more artillery.⁴⁵² Columbus, who was frustrated by the lack of sufficient gold, also asked the Catholic Monarchs to send experienced miners who was not only capable of separating the gold from the sand, but could also locate the reserve.⁴⁵³

In March 1494, Columbus explored the Cibao Valley. Then, in April, he sailed to explore the Cuban coastline and search for gold in Jamaica.⁴⁵⁴ At the end, he concluded that Hispaniola promised the richest gold reserves.⁴⁵⁵ The second voyage and the settlement continued almost two and a half years. Starting with the first year, his charisma and prestige started to be challenged. His hopes for wealth were diminishing and he was turning into a desperate man day by day. Opposition was rising among the crew. Most probably, in order to create a sense of victory and gather support for colonization, on June 12, 1494, Columbus forced his men to sign a declaration which indicated that they had reached the mainland Cathay at Cuba.⁴⁵⁶

⁴⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁰ Ibid., 181.

⁴⁵¹ Ibid., 179.

⁴⁵² Ibid., 189.

⁴⁵³ Ibid., 190.

⁴⁵⁴ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer."

⁴⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁶ John Noble Wilford, "Columbus and the Labyrinth of History," 76.

4.2.3 The Third Voyage

For the third voyage, Columbus left Sanlúcar de Barrameda on May 30, 1498 with six ships, three of them carrying explorers and other three carrying the provisions for the settlement on Hispaniola.⁴⁵⁷ The main aim of this journey was to find a strait from Cathay (Cuba) to India as well as to recover Solomon's gold mines.⁴⁵⁸ However, things did not go as planned.

While leaving for Spain after the second voyage, Columbus left his brothers Bartholomew and Diego Columbus in charge yet both the Taino natives and the European immigrants were unsatisfied with this choice. In return, a rebellion broke out by Francisco Roldán, the mayor of La Isabela.⁴⁵⁹ The Torres Memorandum or the letter from the second voyage that Columbus had sent with Torres to the Catholic Monarchs may give a clue about the rebellion. As it was mentioned before, in this letter Columbus reported that the colonization was not going as planned. It also spoke of sickness, famine and resistance and mentioned the need for the materials such as food and artillery for the survival of the colony. It is possible that these problems intensified and Columbus's family was held responsible for the deterioration.⁴⁶⁰

Meanwhile, a conspiracy was developing against Columbus in Spain in order to cut the support of the Spanish Monarchs. Using the Torres Memorandum and the fact that Columbus's men were mostly released criminals as a pretext, an investigation by a Spanish royal commission under the presidency of Chief Justice Francisco de Bobadilla was decided to be conducted.⁴⁶¹ He arrived at Hispaniola on August 23, 1500. Upon his arrival, Bobadilla searched Columbus's private home and

⁴⁵⁷ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer."

⁴⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁶¹ Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 221.

confiscated all his papers and property.⁴⁶² Then Bobadilla arrested him and his brothers and sent them in chains to Spain on the ship *La Gorda* which arrived at Cádiz on November 1500.⁴⁶³

At the same time as the inquisitions in Hispaniola, court circles in Spain became busy with undermining Columbus's reputation. They suggested that the New World and Columbus could not yet produce the wealth they expected.⁴⁶⁴ In this regard, the legal adviser of the crown openly advocated declaring Columbus's rights and privileges null and void on the basis of him being a foreigner.⁴⁶⁵

During his journey as a prisoner, Columbus composed a letter addressed to his sovereigns. This letter is well protected and it includes detailed information about his own view of himself, his beliefs and emotions, his voyages, and also sufferings. The mystical character of Columbus is also observable in this letter. In the letter, Columbus maintained his claim that he struggled and served to spread the name of Christ for seven years, and he endured much pain in the process.⁴⁶⁶ In this sense, he reminded his sovereigns about Prophet Isaiah, and repeated that the name of Christ would be spreaded from Spain.⁴⁶⁷ Furthermore, he accused the people who gossiped about the lack of gold-filled ships of jealousy since they judged him without providing a proper amount of time.⁴⁶⁸ He gave examples of Solomon, Caesar and Alexander the Great about how they had appointed officials and sent them far away from home to explore foreign lands or to investigate curious phenomena.⁴⁶⁹ By

⁴⁶² Ibid.

⁴⁶³ Ibid., 222-223.

⁴⁶⁴ Frederick W. Meisnest, "The Lost 'Book of Privileges' of Columbus Located and Identified," *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 12, No. 4 (1949): 401-407, 402, accessed April 28, 2019 <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3816338>.

⁴⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶⁶ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 195.

⁴⁶⁷ Ibid., 196.

⁴⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁶⁹ Ibid., 197.

indicating this, he was also resembling his sovereigns to great leaders from history and hence, honoring them.

Later, he spoke of his accomplishments and discoveries, his search for gold, pearls and navigational skills.⁴⁷⁰ In this context, one particular discovery came to the forefront: Earthly Paradise. Columbus asserted that he reached the outer region of the biblical land of the Earthly Paradise, from which four rivers -the Ganges, the Euphrates, the Tigris and the Nile- were originated.⁴⁷¹ He also advocated the land was showing all signs in his readings of the Earthly Paradise such as mild weather, flow of fresh water into the gulf and highlands.⁴⁷² He believed if Earthly Paradise was near so as the gold. In that way, he attempted to legitimize his discoveries by providing evidence from the biblical sources.

Later in the letter, Columbus continued indicating his services about how he christianized the discovered lands, how he introduced his sovereigns to the natives and how he represented the holy faith.⁴⁷³ He also stated that his sovereigns were the first in the Spanish history to acquire lands as far away from the mainland.⁴⁷⁴ Even if he did not directly mention, it is clear that he took credit for this.

This letter granted Columbus his release, and provided him an audience at Granada in late December 1500.⁴⁷⁵ His skills as a navigator and a discoverer were appreciated but the same did not apply for his governmental abilities. Furthermore, there rose a strong doubt about the validity of Columbus's claims about sailing to Indies.⁴⁷⁶ In this regard, the Catholic Monarchs decided to put their faith in a new

⁴⁷⁰ Ibid., 198-211.

⁴⁷¹ Ibid., 212.

⁴⁷² Ibid., 213.

⁴⁷³ Ibid., 216.

⁴⁷⁴ Ibid., 217.

⁴⁷⁵ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer."

⁴⁷⁶ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*, 216.

generation of explorers and colonials.⁴⁷⁷ In addition, Nicolás de Ovando was appointed as a governor to succeed Bobadilla on September 3, 1501.⁴⁷⁸ In October 1501, Columbus travelled to Sevilla to prepare for his last journey.⁴⁷⁹ Before departing for the fourth voyage, recognizing the danger, he decided to entrust the copies of his rights and privileges that had been granted to him for the discoveries to several friends and he also did not neglect to notarise them.⁴⁸⁰

4.2.4 The Fourth Voyage

For the fourth voyage, Columbus sailed from Cádiz on May 9, 1502.⁴⁸¹ It was then clear that he had lost much of the support from his sovereigns. Although they appreciated his navigational skills, they also appointed a new governor. Isabel and Ferdinand provided Columbus with four ships whereas they provided the governor Ovando with thirty ships.⁴⁸² Since there was no support for Columbus in Hispaniola, they forbade Columbus to return there, instead they ordered him to continue with his explorations to find gold and a strait to India.⁴⁸³ Columbus tried to land on Santo Domingo, Hispaniola on June 29, but he was rejected by the new governor.⁴⁸⁴

Then he sailed to and stopped at Jamaica, Cuba, Honduras, Nicaragua and Costa Rica.⁴⁸⁵ His main objective was to find Solomon's gold and a strait to Asian

⁴⁷⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁷⁸ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer."

⁴⁷⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁸⁰ Frederick W. Meisnest, "The Lost 'Book of Privileges' of Columbus Located and Identified," 402.

⁴⁸¹ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer."

⁴⁸² Ibid.

⁴⁸³ Ibid.

⁴⁸⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁸⁵ Ibid.

mainland.⁴⁸⁶ In Veragua, the present day Panama, he came across a promising amount of gold and, in order to exploit it, in February 1503 he attempted to establish a trading post at Santa María de Belén (derives from Bethlehem, birth place of Christ).⁴⁸⁷ However, he failed because of Indian resistance and the poor condition of his ships. This was indeed the unluckiest exploration due to a marine accident that made Columbus miss discovering the Pacific, and failed to make contact with the Maya of the Yucatán.⁴⁸⁸ In the end he and his crew were unwillingly rescued by Ovando. He reached Hispaniola on August 13, 1503. On November 7 he sailed to Sanlúcar where he found out that his Queen and patron was on her death bed.⁴⁸⁹

Columbus's letter dated July 7, 1503 which was addressed to his sovereigns, sheds light on his psychological state at the time. Since he was in no condition to write due to the disfunctioning of his eyes and malaria, he was assisted by his son Ferdinand. In this letter, Columbus dictated, as usual, a lot of things related to his journey, reputation, health and his plans. It seems that the last events that caused the loss of prestige for Columbus deeply affected him. In his letter, his efforts to gain appreciation for him and his family is evident. Especially, he feared that his son Diego would be disenfranchised from his titles.⁴⁹⁰ Columbus always maintained that he had reached Cathay, and in this regard, he wrote that this time he also discovered Mago (Marco Polo's Mangi).⁴⁹¹ Since he believed he had reached Cathay, he was sure that there would be plenty of gold, pearls and spices, yet there was not enough

⁴⁸⁶ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*, 238.

⁴⁸⁷ Valerie I. J. Flint, "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer."

⁴⁸⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁹⁰ Kristof Kolomb, *Seyir Defterleri*, 223.

⁴⁹¹ Ibid., 232.

time to extract enough amounts.⁴⁹² In this sense, the resentment of Columbus is clear. He reminded once more that he was enchained and humiliated unjustly.⁴⁹³

Furthermore, in the letter, Columbus maintained his ideas about saving Jerusalem by the hands of a savior coming from Spain.⁴⁹⁴ This time he openly indicated that that person could be him if he could have safely arrived in Spain from the third voyage.⁴⁹⁵ Also, his illness and the misfortunes he had experienced on the sea seems to affect his psychology. He was afraid of dying in the Indies that were far away from the Holy Church. He believed if he died there, his soul could not benefit from the Church's grace.⁴⁹⁶ He also wanted his sovereigns let him visit Rome and other pilgrimage sites if he could ever manage to sail to Spain.⁴⁹⁷ Fortunate for him, he made it back to Spain in November 1504.⁴⁹⁸ His Queen was on her death bed, and his request for a visit was denied. When Isabel died on November 26, 1504, Columbus lost the biggest support for his enterprise. This was his last voyage. Until his death on May 20, 1506 in Valladolid, Spain he fought to hold his titles and privileges, which had been granted to him in Santa Fè, for his family.

4.3 The Imprints of Christian Millenialism on the Geographical Expeditions

When Christopher Columbus sailed away on Friday, August 3 of 1492, one would think that this journey might have brought him glory, richness and probably a noble title only if his ideas held. This may be true but insufficient since Columbus explained that his journey had a bigger goal, in other words, a religious quest. Briefly, Columbus believed that he was guided by biblical prophecy in all his deeds.

⁴⁹² Ibid., 236.

⁴⁹³ Ibid., 240.

⁴⁹⁴ Ibid., 238.

⁴⁹⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁹⁶ Ibid., 241.

⁴⁹⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁹⁸ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*, 238.

That was the view, which made him so persistent in his will for the voyages as well as intolerable and cruel in the name of God. He was a student of the *Bible* and writings of Church authorities, and he perceived himself as God's messenger. In this sense, the letters and journals of Columbus can shed a light on his state of mind. We can also benefit from the writings of his contemporaries, such as his son Ferdinand and Bartolomé de Las Casas.

First, in order to comprehend Columbus's self-image, one needs to look at his adoption of the signature. It is a Latinization of his given name, and it means "Christ-bearer."⁴⁹⁹ This choice gives an idea about the spiritual and religious dimensions of Columbus's personality. In this context, many scholars were interested to understand and analyze Columbus's signature.



Figure1: Signature of Christopher Columbus

In 1498, Columbus instructed his heirs to sign with his signature "which is an X with an S over it and an M with a Roman A over it and over them an S and then a Greek Y with an S over it."⁵⁰⁰ Columbus scholars had put forth different explanations for Columbus's signature but the most common was the following one

⁴⁹⁹ Pauline Moffitt Watts, "Prophecy and Discovery: On the Spiritual Origins of Christopher Columbus's 'Enterprise of Indies,'" 74.

⁵⁰⁰ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*, 225.

which means “Servant I am of the Highest Savior; Christ, Mary, and Joseph; Christ-bearer.”

Servus
Sum Altissimi Salvatoris
Xristus Maria Yosephus
Xristo-Ferens

There are also more complicated analyses. A medievalist at Princeton University, John Fleming was one of the scholars who tried to decode the meaning of the signature. He concluded that Columbus combined both religious (hermetic) and nautical symbolism in his signature. The unifying idea behind the signature is, in Fleming’s judgment, the medieval association of Virgin Mary with Stella Maris; in other words, Polaris or North Star.⁵⁰¹ The first cross bar, for Fleming, stands for Stella MariS.⁵⁰² In the Vertical line, on the other hand, S A M letters stand for “Stella Ave Maris.”⁵⁰³

Fleming also believed that Columbus’s signature includes the image of both a Christian cross and a ship’s mast. He asserted that,

In Columbus’s heavenly city, the Virgin Mary stands ever firm between her two Christ-bearing guards, Christophorus on the one hand, San Yago the Moorslayer on the other. And in the larger meaning of these two saints, both celebrated by the Roman church on a single day, which was of course Columbus’s name day, we may see adumbrated much of the glory, and much of the tragedy, of the European encounter with the New World.⁵⁰⁴

If this encryption is not enough for understanding Columbus’s state of mind, one should pay attention to what Bartolomé de Las Casas mentioned about the signature. Las Casas suggested that Columbus used this signature to indicate he was

⁵⁰¹ Ibid., 226.

⁵⁰² Ibid.

⁵⁰³ Ibid.

⁵⁰⁴ Ibid.

the first person to open the gates of the Ocean Sea in order to bear Christ over the waves to those distant lands.⁵⁰⁵ Alexander von Humboldt developed a different perspective and interpreted Columbus's choice of signature as a manifestation of the medieval residue in his mind, which started to raise to the surface as his rational powers declined.⁵⁰⁶ Ronald Sanders, who advocated the idea that Columbus was a Jew, translated letters X M Y as *Christus Messias Israel*, the middle A as *Adonai*, the top S as *Shaddai*, and perceived the two lateral S's as the wings of the *Shekina*.⁵⁰⁷

William Eleroy Curtis, on the other hand, with the consideration of Columbus's mission about Jerusalem interpreted his signature as "*Salvo Sanctum Sepulchrum, Xriste, Maria, Jesus, Xristo-Ferens*" meaning, "I save the Holy Sepulchre, Christ, Mary, Jesus, Christ-bearer."⁵⁰⁸ Since it will always probably be a mystery, this issue is open to scholarly discussion. Nevertheless, it is beyond doubt that Columbus's signature was reflecting his religious affiliations.

Columbus's self-image is indeed another subject that is needed to be examined. In a letter he wrote to the Catholic Monarchs, he mentioned his interest and experiences on the sea. Later he continued suggesting that: "Our Lord has favored my occupation and has given me an intelligent mind. He has endowed me with a great talent for seamanship; sufficient ability in astrology, geometry, and arithmetic; and the mental and physical dexterity required to draw spherical maps of cities, rivers, and mountains, islands, and ports, with everything in its proper place."⁵⁰⁹ Hence, he believed that he was destined to be a sailor and explorer, and at the same time he was equipped with the required qualities for the job.

⁵⁰⁵ Kevin A. Miller, "Columbus's Signature: What Does It Mean?" *Christianity Today*, accessed April 28, 2019 <https://www.christianitytoday.com/history/issues/issue-35/columbuss-signature.html>

⁵⁰⁶ Pauline Moffitt Watts, "Prophecy and Discovery: On the Spiritual Origins of Christopher Columbus's 'Enterprise of Indies,'" 80.

⁵⁰⁷ Leonard I. Sweet, "Christopher Columbus and the Millennial Vision of the New World," 377-378.

⁵⁰⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁰⁹ Geoffrey Symcox, ed. *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus* (California: University of California Press, 1997), 67.

Additionally, he was highly keen on believing in the prophecies regarding the conversion of all of the people to Christianity, the recapture of Jerusalem and the advent of Antichrist.⁵¹⁰ D'Ailly, the pseudo-Methodius, Augustine and other prominent figures was the major sources for the establishment of Columbus's judgment about the end of the things.⁵¹¹ Through these sources, Columbus supported the idea of cosmos with a beginning and ending. This cosmos was unfolding in time and space according to God's plan.

Thirdly, Columbus believed that he was a part of God's divine plan. Through realizing apocalyptic prophecies, he thought he would fasten the end of the world. As he set forth in a letter to the nurse of Prince Don John of Castile in 1500, "Of the new heaven and earth which our Lord made, when Saint John was writing the Apocalypse, after what was spoken by the mouth of Isaiah, he made me the messenger, and showed me where it lay."⁵¹² The Apocalypse of John refers to the allegorical chapter of the *New Testament* that is the *Revelation*. It was mentioned earlier that millennial expectations took most of their routes from this text. Another passage from his letters reflects a similar theme:

I gave to the subject six or seven years of great anxiety, explaining, to the best of my ability, how great service might be done to our Lord, by this undertaking, in promulgating His sacred name and our holy faith among so many nations ;—an enterprise so exalted in itself, and so calculated to enhance the glory and immortalise the renown of great sovereigns.⁵¹³

As it is clear from the passage, Columbus believed that he was an agent of christianization. Therefore, through the evangelization of the Indies he asserted to serve God. In this long run, he believed, the Holy Spirit directed him to his voyages,

⁵¹⁰ Ibid., 77.

⁵¹¹ Ibid., 71.

⁵¹² "Letter of Columbus to the Nurse of Prince John", *American Journeys Collection*, 371, accessed July 24, 2019 <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-067/>

⁵¹³ R. H. Major, *Select Letters of Christopher Columbus With Other Original Documents Related to The Four Voyages to The New World*, 109.

in other words, he was God's messenger. The following lines are from his own words and they clearly show the key point: "Who can doubt that this fire was not merely mine, but also the Holy Spirit who encouraged me with a radiance of marvelous illumination from this sacred Scriptures, ...urging me to press forward?"⁵¹⁴ There is also another similar text transmitting Columbus's claims with his own words: "With a hand that could be felt, the Lord opened my mind to the fact that it would be possible... and he opened my will to desire to accomplish that project."⁵¹⁵ From these lines, it would be safe to draw a conclusion that Columbus provided evangelical and apocalyptic motives to gain support for his Indian enterprise.

Bartolomé de Las Casas, supportively, argued that the discovery of the Indies was the marvelous work of God. For this purpose, Columbus was chosen by the divine providence since he beared the necessary virtues and qualities.⁵¹⁶ Las Casas also indicated that Columbus, with a determined spirit of exposing himself to all the dangers, did everything for the honor and glory of God, and the exaltation of his holy Catholic faith.⁵¹⁷

Although Columbus's claims about hearing the voice of God would spark the questions about his mental health, his pious character and religious objective of these voyages are beyond doubt. There are more confirmative passages in Columbus's journals, letters and his *Book of Prophecies*. By just investigating these sources, one can clearly see the Biblical references, constant praying and appeal to the God. In this context, his *Libro de Las Profecías (Book of Prophecies)* is a religious justification for his voyages. The dating of the manuscript is uncertain. Most likely,

⁵¹⁴ Kevin A. Miller, "Why Did Columbus Sail."

⁵¹⁵ Ibid.

⁵¹⁶ Bartolomé de Las Casas, *Historia de Las Indias*, vol. 1 (Madrid: Miguel Ginesta, 1875) 42, accessed August 12, 2019
<https://archive.org/details/HistoriaDeLasIndiasvol.1De5BartolomeDeLasCasas>

⁵¹⁷ Ibid., 218.

Columbus and his collaborator Friar Gaspar Gorricio gathered the necessary material in a couple of years following the third voyage after 1500.⁵¹⁸

The Book of Prophecies, in this sense, is the collection of the prophecies and Biblical passages that concern the recovery of Jerusalem, which addressed the Catholic Monarchs. Columbus defined the aim of his book as collecting the related material about Jerusalem and arranging them.⁵¹⁹ It also included writings of ancient and medieval European writers and the Church Fathers such as Augustine, Methodius and Pierre D'Ailly. In this regard, it reflects the eschatological perception of Columbus as well as the centrality of Jerusalem in this scenario. Columbus himself described his book as follows: "This is the beginning of the book or collection of *auctoritates*, sayings, opinions, and prophecies concerning the need to recover the holy city and Mount Zion, and the discovery and conversion of the islands of the Indies and of all the peoples and nations, for Ferdinand and Isabel, our Spanish rulers."⁵²⁰

In this regard, he was prone to perceive himself as the person who aided the evangelization of the world for his monarchs. In that way, the salvation of the people and their gathering at Zion could be realized. Columbus never got the chance to complete the *Book of Prophecies* and submit it to his sovereigns but some excerpts managed to survive through his son Ferdinand. One unfinished copy resides in the Biblioteca Colombina at Seville.⁵²¹ In this book, Columbus included, for example, Psalm 2, saying "He has made me king of Zion, his holy mountain, and I preach his holy commandment. The Lord said to me: 'You are my son; today I have begotten you. Ask of me, and I will give you the peoples as your inheritance and the ends of the earth as your possession.'"⁵²² or Psalm 50, stating that "Be generous. O Lord in

⁵¹⁸ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*, 217.

⁵¹⁹ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 55.

⁵²⁰ *Ibid.*, 59.

⁵²¹ John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*, 218.

⁵²² Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 79.

your goodwill to Zion, so that the walls of Jerusalem may be built up.”⁵²³ He also cited Psalm 101 saying that “Arise and have mercy on Zion, because it is time to take pity on her, because the time has come. The people will fear your name, Lord and all kings of the earth your glory, because the Lord has built up Zion and he will appear in his glory. So that they proclaim the name of the Lord in Zion and his praise in Jerusalem, and so on, to the end.”⁵²⁴ These citations by Columbus clearly indicates that he was deeply concerned with the restoration of the glory of Mount Zion. There are even more passages in the *Old Testament* regarding Jerusalem will raise after the advent of Antichrist and *Gog and Magog*. These are constituted in chapters 8, 11 and 12 of the Book of Daniel and chapters 38 and 39 of Ezekiel. These are also cited in Columbus’s *Book of Prophecies*.⁵²⁵

In addition to this theme, there was another one similarly originated from the Psalms. Psalm 8 states, for instance, “Lord, our Lord, how wonderful is your name throughout the entire world.”⁵²⁶ Furthermore, Psalm 21 indicating “All the ends of the earth will remember and turn to the Lord, and the families of the nations will worship before him. Because the kingdom is the Lord’s, he will be the sovereign of all peoples.”⁵²⁷ or Psalm 64 saying, “Praise is due to you in Zion, and in Jerusalem a solemn vow to you will be recited. Hear my prayer; all mortal flesh will come to you. Blessed is the one whom you have chosen and received; he will live in the halls of your temple.”⁵²⁸ can be good examples of this kind. There are more similar passages in the Psalm, but to make a long story short, Columbus was concerned also with the conversion of the infidels to the Christian faith. Another passage from the *Old Testament*—which was also cited by Columbus in his book, John 10 says that “I am

⁵²³ Ibid., 89.

⁵²⁴ Ibid., 105.

⁵²⁵ Ibid., 228-231.

⁵²⁶ Ibid., 79.

⁵²⁷ Ibid., 81.

⁵²⁸ Ibid., 91.

the good shepherd: I know my sheep, and they know me. I have other sheep who are not from this fold and I must bring them, and they will hear my voice and there will be one fold, and one shepherd.”⁵²⁹ The Indies also fell into this group. In Columbus’s mind, the natives were waiting for him and evangelization.⁵³⁰

In the *Book of Prophecies*, Columbus also cited Augustine’s *The City of God* in order to strengthen his ideas about worldwide evangelization:

“Truly our fathers worshipped false idols; there is no benefit to be gained from them.” For, to be sure, the Jews, who were willing to kill him, were not about to acknowledge him, as the same prophet [Jeremiah] points out: The heart is heavy in all things, for he is man and who will recognize him? ... For the same Jeremiah says “Behold the days are coming says the Lord, when I will grant a new testament to the house of Jacob,” and the rest of what is read there. Meanwhile, I will give these predictions about Christ made by the prophet Zephaniah, who prophesied with Jeremiah: “Wait for me” says the Lord, “on the future day of my resurrection: for my decision is to assemble the people and gather together the kingdoms. And again: “The Lord will be terrifying against them,” he says, “and he will destroy all the gods of the earth: each man will worship him from his own place, all the islands of the peoples... On that day, you will not be ashamed of your impious conduct toward me; for I will remove the burden of your lawlessness, and you will no longer be exalted on my holy mountain... And those who remained of Israel will fear the name of the Lord... Even if the children of Israel are as numerous as the sands of the sea, only a remaining few will be saved.” Of course, these people will believe in Christ.”⁵³¹

The emphasis on the islands may take special attention of Columbus, as a sign of this Columbus erected a wooden cross on every island he explored.⁵³² Moreover, the names given to the islands by Columbus indicated this evangelical spirit. Columbus named, for instance, some of the islands as San Salvador with the consideration of Salvation, Trinidad after the Trinity and Santa Maria after Virgin Mary. In this sense, his son Ferdinand also believed that Columbus picked up these

⁵²⁹ Ibid., 297.

⁵³⁰ Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 167.

⁵³¹ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 301-303.

⁵³² Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 59.

names because he wanted to show his gratitude to God.⁵³³ Furthermore, one year after the voyage, in 1493, Columbus asked the Catholic Monarchs to reserve one percent of the gold to establish churches on the islands.⁵³⁴

Apart from these, Columbus's actions were also encouraged by a prophecy belonging to Joachim of Fiore. According to Columbus, "Joachim, abbot of Calabria, predicted that someone from Spain would recover the wealth of Zion."⁵³⁵ According to this prophecy, Jerusalem under Muslim control would change hand before the end of the world and Columbus sought to have part in this mission. In this respect, one of Columbus's letters that addressed the Spanish Monarchs can shed more light on this issue:

Most of the prophecies of the Holy Scripture have already been fulfilled. The Scriptures say this and the Holy Church loudly and unceasingly is saying it, and no other witness is necessary. I will, however, speak of one prophecy in particular because it bears on my argument and gives me support and happiness whenever I think about it... I have already said that for the voyage to the Indies neither intelligence nor mathematics nor world maps were of any use to me; it was the fulfillment of Isaiah's prophecy. This is what I want to record here in order to remind Your Highnesses and so that you can take pleasure from the things that I am going to tell you about Jerusalem on the basis of the same authority. If you have faith in this enterprise, you will certainly have the victory.⁵³⁶

In Columbus's judgment, both the enterprise of the Indies and the reconquest of Jerusalem were events within the knowledge of God, and he was an assistant in the realization of this divine plan. Likewise, his son Ferdinand explained the mystical meanings of his father's name and surname in order to support the claim that he was the one who fulfilled the prophecy. For the surname, Ferdinand suggested that:

⁵³³ Ibid., 180.

⁵³⁴ Kevin A. Miller, "Why Did Columbus Sail?"

⁵³⁵ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 317.

⁵³⁶ Ibid., 75.

If we consider the common surname of his forebears, we may say that he was truly Columbus or Dove, because he carried the grace of the Holy Ghost to that New World which he discovered, showing those people who knew Him not Who was God's beloved son, as the Holy Ghost did in the figure of a dove when St. John baptized Christ; and because over the waters of the ocean, like the dove of Noah's ark, he bore the olive branch and oil of baptism, to signify that those people who had been shut up in the ark of darkness and confusion were to enjoy peace and union with the Church.⁵³⁷

Additionally, Ferdinand praised his father's given name since it was the name of St. Christopher:

We may say that just as St. Christopher is reported to have gotten that name because he carried Christ over deep waters with great danger to himself, and just as he conveyed over people whom no other could have carried, so the Admiral Christophorus Colonus, asking Christ's aid and protection in that perilous pass, crossed over with his company that the Indian nations might become dwellers in the triumphant Church of Heaven.⁵³⁸

For Columbus, Isabel and Ferdinand were God's chosen monarchs who were going to reconquer Jerusalem.⁵³⁹ Especially after the fall of Granada to the Christians, Columbus believed that the Catholic Monarchs would play a key role in restoring Mount Zion. In this sense, the liberation of Jerusalem was Columbus's ultimate aim, and he only sailed to realize this.

To better understand Columbus's judgment, it is important to comprehend his perception of time. In *Book of Prophecies*, Columbus, following Augustine's compartmentalization of history into seven ages, believed that he was living the sixth age.⁵⁴⁰ His calculation led him to believe only 155 years were ahead until the seventh age.⁵⁴¹ In this sense, there was a little time but much more thing to do until the end of

⁵³⁷ Benjamin Keen, *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*, 4.

⁵³⁸ Ibid.

⁵³⁹ R. H. Major, *Select Letters of Christopher Columbus With Other Original Documents Related to The Four Voyages to The New World*, 204

⁵⁴⁰ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 71.

⁵⁴¹ Ibid.

the days. In other words, the eschatological clock was ticking. In this 155 years of time, according to Columbus, all the prophecies written by the prophets would have to be fulfilled.⁵⁴² The people of the world needed to be Christianized, Jerusalem had to be taken away from the Muslims, Antichrist had to come, the second advent had to be realized, and the War of Armageddon had to be conducted.

In this regard, the conquest of Jerusalem was Columbus's obsession. He wrote in his journal that he sailed to acquire the mine of gold and the spices, which would be useful for funding the recapture of the Holy Sepulchre. Las Casas also confirms this in his book *Historia de Las Indias*. According to Las Casas, when some gold or precious things were brought to Columbus, he immediately entered the chapel and said on his knees: "Let us thank our Lord for discovering so many goods."⁵⁴³ He was only eager to convert the Indians since he wanted the faith of Jesus Christ expand.⁵⁴⁴ His main aim was to win the Holy Sepulchre and the gold was just an instrument to realize this.⁵⁴⁵ Believing he was guided by God to the discovery of gold, he begged Queen Isabel to spend all the wealth of his discovery for the recapture of Jerusalem.⁵⁴⁶ In this respect, Columbus had faith, if he could acquire the riches of the East, he could gather enough gold to start a Crusade campaign. For this reason, it will be an inadequate analysis to say that Columbus was driven by personal greed. On the contrary, he wanted the gold not for himself but for a much greater case: Columbus wanted to initiate a crusade campaign on Jerusalem.

Furthermore, in a letter written on March 4, 1493 to the Catholic Monarchs, Columbus asserted "that in seven years from today I will be able to pay Your

⁵⁴² Ibid., 72.

⁵⁴³ Bartolomé de Las Casas, *Historia de Las Indias*, 44.

⁵⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁴⁶ Ibid.

Highnesses for five thousand cavalry and fifty thousand foot soldiers for the war and conquest of Jerusalem, for which purpose this enterprise was undertaken.”⁵⁴⁷

Almost ten years later, in 1502, in a letter directed to Pope Alexander VI Columbus defended his voyage by expressing that his purpose was to invest in aiding the erection of the Holy Temple in Jerusalem.⁵⁴⁸ In another letter written to the Spanish Monarchs in 1503, Columbus revealed his aims once again by saying,

Jerusalem and Mount Sion are to be rebuilt by the hands of Christians as God declared by the mouth of His prophet in the fourteenth Psalm. The Abbé Joaquina said that he who should do this was to come from Spain; Saint Jerome showed the holy woman the way to accomplish it; and the emperor of Cathay has some time since sent for wise men to instruct him in the faith of Christ. Who will offer himself for this work? Should any one do so, I pledge myself, in the name of God, to convey him safely thither, provided the Lord permits me to return to Spain.⁵⁴⁹

Even shortly before his death, on 19th May 1506, he was thinking about his ultimate desire. On that day he ratified his heritage, he laid down a fund be set up for the Crusade to liberate Jerusalem as a condition.⁵⁵⁰ It is now clear that his sovereigns the “Most Christian Monarchs” Isabel and Ferdinand, although interested in the evangelization both in the mainland and Americas, did not share the enthusiasm of Columbus to initiate a crusade. As the leaders of a newly emerging nation-state, their priority was to acquire the full control of their lands. Even if it was just under the Christian law and in accordance with the millenarian expectations to attack the Turks and recapture Jerusalem was not feasible any time soon. Hence, although they gave

⁵⁴⁷ “Christopher Columbus Letter to the Sovereigns 4 March 1493,” The University of British Columbia, 5, accessed August 12, 2019, http://www.history.ubc.ca/sites/default/files/courses/documents/%5Brealname%5D/columbus_1493.pdf

⁵⁴⁸ Carol Delaney, “Columbus’s Ultimate Goal: Jerusalem”, *Society for Comparative Study of Society and History* (2006): 260-292, 266, accessed April 28, 2019. <https://www.amherst.edu/system/files/columbus.pdf>.

⁵⁴⁹ R. H. Major, *Select Letters of Christopher Columbus With Other Original Documents Related to The Four Voyages to The New World*, 204-205.

⁵⁵⁰ Carol Delaney, “Columbus’s Ultimate Goal: Jerusalem,” 266.

their blessing and actively worked for the evangelization and utilized the prophecies of a messianic savior for their propaganda, they never marched on Jerusalem.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

Apart from the fact that they were organized and patronised by the same crowns, the geographical expeditions to the Americas and the *Reconquista* process in Spain share more common characteristics. The gold and the conversion, for instance, were the two immediate connotations of both the Indian expedition and the Spanish reconquests. Furthermore, both of them echoed a crusader campaign that was encouraged by the will to expand Christianity and to initiate a golden age. In this sense, the conquest and evangelisation of the Americas and the expulsion of the Jews from Spain as well as the conversion of Granada should not be considered in isolation from each other.

Within this context, for instance, the death of Don Rodrigo Ponce de León, who died fighting the Moors in August 27, 1492 was celebrated as a crusader's death. He was important since he was considered to be El Cid of his time.⁵⁵¹ His funeral hosted so many people and his death was celebrated as a feast.⁵⁵² Although it was late and dark, two hundred people accompanied him with lighted candles and honored his death as it was the feast of *Corpus Christi*⁵⁵³ in Seville.⁵⁵⁴ The enterprise of the Indies, similarly, was justified as a crusader campaign. Throughout his book, *A Short Account of the Destruction of the Indies* that he addressed to the Spanish throne, Bartolomé de Las Casas complained about the violence, cruelty and mercilessness of *conquistadors* and expresses the horrific details of their torture and

⁵⁵¹ Andrés Bernáldez, *Historia De Los Reyes Católicos D. Jernando Y Doña Isabel*, 313.

⁵⁵² *Ibid.*, xix.

⁵⁵³ It is a Christian ritual celebrating the presense of the body and blood, soul and divinity of Jesus Christ in the sacramental bread and wine.

⁵⁵⁴ Andrés Bernáldez, *Historia De Los Reyes Católicos D. Jernando Y Doña Isabel*, xix.

massacres by giving the names and the locations. For him, the main reason behind the expedition was evangelization, and especially after the death of Christopher Columbus, the *conquistadors* were undermining this holy mission because of their appetite for the gold.⁵⁵⁵

Similarly, both in the cases of the Indian enterprise and the Spanish conquests, the opposite party was considered to be uncivilized and morally inferior whereas the Christians were deemed as morally superior, just and godly. Columbus believed that, through evangelization, the Indian people could be taught to behave and live like the Christians. In his mind, Christianity would honor these people and free them from the deceptions of the evil and endow them with eternal salvation. While he was busy with the evangelization of the Americas, the Catholic Monarchs were dealing with the cleansing of what they called “heresy” in Spain. For them, non-Catholics were either heretics or infidels, and they had to be eliminated. The people who converted to Christianity, on the other hand, could not be trusted in the eyes of the Spanish Monarchs since their conversion was not sincere. They believed that the converted people secretly continued to perform the rituals of their former religions and they tried to deter the true Christians from the holy Catholic faith. Furthermore, they could not be trusted politically. In case of a Muslim attack coming from Africa, for instance, their allegiances would be open to discussion. In this regard, firstly with forced conversion and inquisitorial trials, then with the forced migration and serial death threat, they ended the hardly-preserved *convivencia* in the peninsula. In this sense, fifteenth-century Spain was not a tolerant society anymore.

For the justification of the war against the infidels, in his *Book of Prophecies*, Columbus cites Augustine’s *City of God* saying that, “God foretold with clarity through the prophets, predicted with unveiled power and accomplished in certain reality that their Gods were false gods and should be entirely abandoned and their temples and idols and holy objects should be overthrown.”⁵⁵⁶ Furthermore, Augustine believed that “the Lord will prevail against them, and he will destroy all

⁵⁵⁵ Bartolomé de las Casas, *A short account of the destruction of the Indies* (London: Penguin, 1992), 34-36, accessed July 8, 2019. <http://www.columbia.edu/~daviss/work/files/presentations/casshort/>

⁵⁵⁶ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 163.

the gods of the peoples of the earth and they will worship him, everyone from his own place, all the islands of the nations.”⁵⁵⁷ The emphasis on the islands in this sentence might have taken special attention by Columbus in his enterprise. Augustine also stated that “all the ends of the earth will remember and turn to the Lord: And all the lands of the people will worship before him. Because the kingdom is Lord’s and he will be the universal sovereign.”⁵⁵⁸ In this sense, in Columbus’s mind, Christ and his faith needed to be worshipped by all the people on the islands and the lands, and all the false gods and their temples had to be destroyed.⁵⁵⁹ In this regard, it can be stated that both the enterprise of the Indies and the Spanish conquests were conducted partially with the influence of Augustine or at least justified on the basis of the assumptions of Augustine.

At this point, it is important to understand Augustine’s perception of history. Briefly, according to him, the history and the time are the creations of God and the history of the world is predestined. To put it differently, it will come to an end and it will be destroyed when the time comes. It only survives by the generous goodness of God.⁵⁶⁰ Nevertheless, Augustine believed that the ultimate human perfection can not be attained while living on earth.⁵⁶¹ In this regard, Augustine urges to rejoin with God and predicted that the world would end in the seventh millennium after its creation.

From the creation of the world or from Adam until the coming of Our Lord Jesus Christ there are 5343 years and 318 days... According to these numbers 1500 years and one not yet completed, gives a total of 6845 years counted toward the completion of this era. By this count only 155 years remain of the 7000 years in which according to the authorities cited above, the world must come to an end.⁵⁶²

⁵⁵⁷ Ibid., 137.

⁵⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁵⁹ Ibid., 139.

⁵⁶⁰ Augustinus, *İtiraflar*, 443.

⁵⁶¹ Ibid., 456.

⁵⁶² Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 71.

According to Columbus's calculations based on the prominent Christian theologians such as Agusutine and Cardinal Pierre d'Ailly, there were only 155 years until the seventh millennium and the prophecies concerning the end of the world had to be fulfilled within these 155 years.⁵⁶³ The prophecies concerning the end of the world generally follows a similar pattern. It can be narrated as the advent of *Gog and Magog*, the rule of Antichrist, the second advent of Christ, the epic battle between the forces of God and the evil, resurrection of the death and finally the last judgment.

According to Methodius, some events would precede the coming of Antichrist. The first one is discord. It was manifested in the second epistle to the Thessalonians: "Unless the discord comes first."⁵⁶⁴ The second event would take place in the seventh millennium when the end is near. Accordingly, the sons of Hagar will rise up against the Roman ruler who subjugated many kingdoms to his rule.⁵⁶⁵ Thirdly, Jerusalem would be lost to Islam because of its inhabitant's sins.⁵⁶⁶ Following this event, many people would deny the true faith. Later, Muslims would control the important land such as Persia, Romania, Cilicia, Cappadocia, Sicily, Isauria and Syria.⁵⁶⁷ Then, the king of the Romans would appear stronger and will bring rage upon those who deny Christ.⁵⁶⁸ There would be great peace and tranquility upon the earth under his rule. Later, the gates of the north will open and whom Alexander held back⁵⁶⁹ would be freed with full strength. These creatures are famous because they will disturb the peace with their numerous cruelties.⁵⁷⁰ Lastly, the king of the Romans would travel to Jerusalem and then Antichrist would appear.⁵⁷¹

⁵⁶³ Ibid., 72.

⁵⁶⁴ Ibid., 173.

⁵⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁶⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁶⁸ Ibid., 175.

⁵⁶⁹ Although it is not stated explicitly, it may refer to *Gog and Magog*.

⁵⁷⁰ Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 175.

When the prophecies concerning the end of the world are examined, it can be inferred that Jerusalem is expected to be under the Christian rule. In this sense, the recovery of Jerusalem is an indispensable part of the eschatological events for Columbus as well as other contemporary Christians.

I will... enter in my room and sing love songs to you, sighing indescribable sighs in my pilgrimage and remembering Jerusalem, my heart reaching up to her, Jerusalem, my homeland, Jerusalem, my mother and you, her ruler, enlightener, father, protector, husband, remembering the virtuous and intense delight, the genuine joy and all the ineffable benefits of one greatest and true good.⁵⁷²

It is important to note that Jerusalem had and still have great importance in Islam, Christianity and Judaism. It is important for Muslims since it is believed that Prophet Muhammed's ascendance to heaven occurred at the Dome of the Rock in Jerusalem. For Christians, it is the place of the crucifixion of Jesus and the Holy Sepulchre. For Jews, it is the heart of the holy land that was promised to them in the Scripture. In addition, Columbus was convinced that the biblical prophecies promote the idea that before the end of the world, all the Jews would gather into their holy land, and be converted to Christianity. On the subject, Columbus cited Baruch chapter 4 stating,

I sent you out wailing in sorrow, but the Lord will bring you back to me full of joy and eternal delight. Just as the neighbors of Zion witnessed your captivity through the work of God, soon they will see your salvation by God, which will come upon you with great honor and eternal splendor... Jerusalem turn your eyes to the east and see the joy from God which is coming to you. Behold your children are coming, whom you dismissed and dispersed; they are coming together from east to west because of the word of the Holy One, rejoicing in the honor of God.⁵⁷³

⁵⁷¹ Ibid.

⁵⁷² From Augustine's *Confessions*, cited in the *Book of Prophecies*. Geoffrey Symcox, *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*, 139.

⁵⁷³ Ibid., 221.

In addition, he cited Baruch chapter 5, saying, “They left you on foot, led by enemies, but the lord will lead them back to you borne in honor as children of the kingdom.”⁵⁷⁴ There are other verses in the Scripture which are cited by Columbus such as Isaiah 27 saying “And on that day a great trumpet will sound: and they will come, those who had been lost, from the land of the Assyrians and those who had been exiled in the land of Egypt; and they will worship the Lord on the holy mountain in Jerusalem.”⁵⁷⁵ and Isaiah 35, stating “The deserted and distant regions will rejoice. They will see the glory of the Lord and the beauty of our God. And those who have been liberated will go, and the ones redeemed by the Lord will return. And they will come to Zion with praise, and everlasting joy will be upon their heads.”⁵⁷⁶ and Isaiah 60 saying, “Arise, shine, Jerusalem, for your light is coming and the glory of the Lord has risen upon you. For behold, the darkness will cover the earth and the obscurity the people; but the Lord will rise over you, and his glory will be seen upon you.”⁵⁷⁷ In this regard, the evangelization of the Jews, their gathering at Jerusalem and the recapture of Jerusalem have an eschatological value. Additionally, according to the prophecy of Joachim of Fiore, the recovery of Jerusalem would be realized from the hands of a person from Spain: “Joachim, abbot of Calabria, predicted that someone from Spain would recover the wealth of Zion.”⁵⁷⁸ In this sense, both Columbus and the Catholic Monarchs were perceived as the suitable candidates for the prophecy.

The search for the gold, within this scope, was a spiritual quest for Columbus. As it was mentioned earlier for him, the gold was only an instrument for salvation. It was not perceived as a mere commodity. As it is expressed in this study, what makes Columbus significant for the world history was his idea about reaching the East by sailing westward. In this regard, Columbus’s initial plan was to drop anchor

⁵⁷⁴ Ibid., 223.

⁵⁷⁵ Ibid., 181.

⁵⁷⁶ Ibid., 181.

⁵⁷⁷ Ibid., 201.

⁵⁷⁸ Ibid., 317.

on the shores of China, the land which is famous with its innumerable riches that Marco Polo mentioned in his tales. In this context Columbus searched for the gold of the East to finance a crusader campaign on Jerusalem and to restore its former glory before the world ends.

Moreover, conversion of not only the Jews but also all of the people is crucial in the millenarian scenario. In this sense, Psalm 71, stating, “And all the rulers of the earth will worship him: all the people will serve him.”⁵⁷⁹ and Matthew 24, saying, “And this *gospel* of the kingdom will be preached throughout the world in witness to all the people then the end will come.”⁵⁸⁰ can be counted among the biblical justifications that Columbus cites. In addition, Mark 16 indicates that “And he said to them, ‘Go out to the entire world and preach the gospel to every creature. Whoever believes and is baptized will be saved. Whoever does not believe will be condemned.’”⁵⁸¹ Before the end of time, therefore, the *gospel* must be preached and all the people will receive the faith of Christ.

In addition to the biblical prophecies, there were personalized prophecies that can be assumed to point Columbus and the Spanish Monarchs. One of them, for instance, Cardinal Pierre d’Ailly’s prophecy about the end of Islam and the coming of the Antichrist. Accordingly, the Muslim dominion would last for 693 years.⁵⁸² Considering Islam was introduced in 610, the year 1303 would be the end of its dominion according to Cardinal Pierre d’Ailly’s calculations. Since Islam certainly started to decline in the Iberian Peninsula in 1303, the age of discovery witnessed the expectation that Islam and the enemies of the Christian faith would soon be destroyed. After the Muslim rule, in Pierre d’Ailly’s mind, no other religion would come except the rule of Antichrist based on magic.⁵⁸³ The war against the Moors and the victory in Granada served conveniently as an indication of the fulfillment of the

⁵⁷⁹ Ibid., 151.

⁵⁸⁰ Ibid., 153.

⁵⁸¹ Ibid., 155.

⁵⁸² Ibid., 165.

⁵⁸³ Ibid., 167.

prophecy. Furthermore, there were instances that Christians called the Moors as the beast or Antichrist, which was again in accordance with the prophecy. As it was mentioned in the second chapter, Otto of Freising asserted, as a millenarian prophecy, that the time after the downfall of Antichrist would witness the conversion of the Jews. In this sense, if the captain of the Moors was Antichrist, as it was asserted by some, his defeat in 1492 and the conversion of the Jews afterwards would perfectly fit the millenarian scenario.

Similarly, as it was mentioned earlier in this study, Methodius predicted that through the end of times, the Arabs would start to persecute Christians until a Roman Christian King would defeat them. This is also in accordance with the allaged Muslim cruelties that were expressed by the Iberian Christians. This Christian hero, according to prophecy, would initiate a glorious millennial reign after a time of torture. He will bring peace and tranquility to the Christian world from his base, Jerusalem. This millennial reign, according to Methodius, will mark great victories over the pagans, the conversion of the Jews and the rewards for the worthy. In this sense, Ferdinand of Aragon who defeated the enemy could be considered by his contemporaries as the Roman Christian King in the prophecy. It seems that all the prophecies mentioned above were utilized as a means of political propaganda for the support and the deeds for the Catholic Monarchs.

Conveniently, there was another prophecy about a European ruler who would defeat regional enemies, unite Christendom and travel to the East to start a golden age before the coming of Antichrist. All of these three events were reciprocated in fifteenth-century Spain. The defeat of the regional enemies defines the defeat of Muslim Granada; unification of Christendom defines the conversion policy as well as the expulsion of the Jews from Spain whereas traveling to the East defines the aim of Columbus's journeys. In this regard, it could be understood that the prophecy points Ferdinand of Aragon as the messianic European ruler.

To sum up, there was a relationship between the Indian enterprise, the Spanish conquests against Muslims, the expulsion of the Jews and the recapture of Jerusalem in terms of fulfilling the millenarian prophecies and accelerating the eschatological clock. The *Book of Prophecies*, the journals and the letters of

Columbus addressed to the Spanish Monarchs are full of such convictions. For instance, Columbus himself revealed his aim as collecting all the material related to Jerusalem and arranging them appropriately in his *Book of Prophecies*⁵⁸⁴ whereas there was no geographical proximity or direct relationship between the voyages, Spain and Jerusalem. Within this context, the fall of Granada in 1492, the conversion and the expulsion of Jews, the evangelization of Granada and Americas were conducted either to fulfill the prophecies concerning the worldwide conversion and the advent of Jerusalem, or to utilize them for the political ends. In this respect, Columbus and the Catholic Monarchs seemed to support the postmillennial idea that the golden age would arrive as a result of Christian social and political activity in the world. Nevertheless, it can be asserted that amillennial view was also taken into account since Augustine, who was the pillar of this view, was cited repeatedly by Columbus.

At this stage, it is necessary to evaluate the subject from different directions. Although the millennial passages and prophecies were the justifications and non-Christians were the enemy, just as the approaches of Charlemagne and El Cid, Columbus's and Ferdinand's approaches were categorically different. It is almost certain from his writings that Columbus was obsessed with the recovery of Jerusalem and fulfilling other eschatological prophecies whereas there is a room for doubt for Ferdinand as to whether Machievelli's praise for using religion in order to gain political power was right.

As it is mentioned before, with the fall of Constantinople, the crusading spirit in Europe revived. This made it possible for the *Reconquista* to be carried under the Church's banner. In this sense, the Church provided justification for the deeds of the Catholic Monarchs, in return the Catholic Monarchs help to expend the sphere of the Church's influence. It can be stated that there was a mutual political benefit.

When Queen Isabel died in 1504, the political side of the story came to the forefront. At her death bed, she supported that the reformation of the kingdom and its church had to be continued in accordance with the Spanish Inquisition which was

⁵⁸⁴ Ibid., 55.

founded in Seville in 1478.⁵⁸⁵ Furthermore, she believed that Ferdinand's benefits from Castile had to continue as well. By this she particularly stressed the revenues gathered overseas, since they belonged by papal authority to the Castilian crown.⁵⁸⁶ When Isabel died, Ferdinand had to renounce his title as the king of Castile although he maintained his hereditary rule as the king of Aragon. Therefore, the Castilian crown passed to their mentally unstable daughter Juana (1479-1555). Since she was in no condition to rule, her husband Philip (1478-1506), the son of the Holy Roman Emperor Maximilian I (1459-1519) ruled Castile on her behalf. This left Ferdinand in a politically vulnerable position since Philip did not want his father-in-law to play a part in the Castilian policy as well as to gain from the revenues overseas.

It is important to note that, similar to the *Reconquista* process, the support of the Church was crucial in the enterprise of the Indies. In this sense, the permission to rule over the Indies, which the Catholic Monarchs had received from Pope Alexander VI, was entrusted to them with the condition of evangelization and setting up the Church there.⁵⁸⁷ Therefore, the Spanish political existence in the Americas was justified with the duty to convert. For Ferdinand, in this sense, the conquest of Americas was related to the accumulation of resources for more important enterprises elsewhere such as Italy and North Africa.⁵⁸⁸ That is why, when Ferdinand was precluded by his son-in-law, he resorted to more aggressive policies. In order to strengthen his political position, for instance, he left for Naples. There had been a power struggle for the control of Naples between Spain and France. In fact, it was already conquered by Ferdinand's uncle, Alfonso V (1396-1458) in 1443 making him the king of Naples and Sicily.⁵⁸⁹ When he died, Sicily passed to Ferdinand's father, from him to Ferdinand. However, there were French claims on Naples so its

⁵⁸⁵ John Edwards, *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs 1474-1520* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2000), 283.

⁵⁸⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁸⁷ Ibid., 286.

⁵⁸⁸ Ibid., 287.

⁵⁸⁹ Erika Rummel, *Jiménez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age*, 72.

status was complicated. Eventually, Naples was partitioned by Spain and France in 1501.⁵⁹⁰ Ferdinand took advantage of a dispute with France and drove the French troops out of Naples in 1504 which made him the sole ruler. Furthermore, two years after the death of Isabel in 1506, Ferdinand married Germaine of Foix (1488-1536), the niece of Louis. His ambitions in the complex policies of Italy, moreover, caused the annexation of Navarre, which was under the protection of France, in 1512.⁵⁹¹

Together with his participation in the League of Cambrai (1508) against the Kingdom of Venice and Holy League (1511) against France, all of these instances indicate the fact that although Ferdinand claimed not to move by any desire to enlarge their realms or by greed for greater revenues, when the time was right, he did not hesitate to attack Christian France and Italy that did not have any significance for the millenarian scenario or worldwide evangelization. Furthermore, he did not fight with the “Turks”⁵⁹², who were controlling both Constantinople and Jerusalem even if the exile Jews of Spain were formally accepted by Sultan Bayazid II (1447-1512). In this sense, it can be concluded that although the evangelization of the Indies and Spain were in accordance with the millenarian prophecies, they were also used as a means for the political ambitions of Ferdinand of Aragon.

⁵⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁵⁹¹ John Edwards, *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs 1474-1520*, 289.

⁵⁹² The name “Turk” had been traditionally used by Europeans for describing all Muslims. Jerusalem passed to Ottoman Turks in 1517. During the reign of Catholic Monarchs, it belonged to another Muslim state named Mamluk Sultanate (1250-1517).

REFERENCES

Primary Sources

American Journeys Collection. "Articles of Aggrement Between The Lords The Catholic Sovereigns and Christóbal Colon." Accessed July 24, 2019. <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-061/>

American Journeys Collection. "Journal of the First Voyage of Columbus." Accessed July 24, 2019. <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-062/>

American Journeys Collection. "Letter of Columbus to the Nurse of Prince John." Accessed July 24, 2019. <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-067/>

American Journeys Collection. "The Letter from Columbus to Luis De Santángel." Accessed January 12, 2019, <http://www.americanjourneys.org/aj-063/>

Anonymous. *The Song of Roland*. Translated by Jessie Crosland. Cambridge: Publications Old French Series, 1999.

Augustine. *The City of God Against the Pagans*. Edited by R. W. Dyson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

Augustinus. *İtiraflar*. İstanbul: Kabalcı, 2010.

Bernaldez, Andrés. *Historia De Los Reyes Católicos D. Jernando Y Doña Isabel*. Tomo 1. Sevilla: D. José María Geofrín, 1870.

Casas, Bartolomé de las. *A short account of the destruction of the Indies*. London: Penguin, 1992. Accessed July 8, 2019. <http://www.columbia.edu/~daviss/work/files/presentations/casshort/>

Casas, Bartolomé de las. *Historia de Las Indias*. vol. 1. Madrid: Miguel Ginesta, 1875. Accessed August 12, 2019.
<https://archive.org/details/HistoriaDeLasIndiasvol.1De5BartolomeDeLasCasas>

Constable, Olivia Remie, ed. *Medieval Iberia Readings From Christian, Muslim and Jewish Sources*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997.

Keen, Benjamin, ed. *The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by His Son Ferdinand*. New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1959.

Kolomb, Kristof. *Seyir Defterleri*. İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, 2016.

Machiavelli, Niccolò. *The Prince*. Edited by William J. Connell. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2005.

Major, R. H., ed. *Select Letters of Christopher Columbus With Other Original Documents Related to The Four Voyages to The New World*. London: Council of the Hakluyt Society, 1870.

Ormsby, John, ed. *The Poem Of The Cid*. London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1879.

Symcox, Geoffrey, ed. *The Book of Prophecies Edited By Christopher Columbus*. California: University of California Press, 1997.

The University of British Columbia. "Christopher Columbus Letter to the Sovereigns 4 March 1493." Accessed August 12, 2019.
http://www.history.ubc.ca/sites/default/files/courses/documents/%5Brealname%5D/columbus_1493.pdf

Secondary Sources

Bonura, Christopher. "When Did The Legend Of The Last Emperor Originate? A New Look At The Textual Relationship Between The Apocalypse Of Pseudo-Methodius And The Tiburtine Sibyl". *Viator*, 47 no. 3 (2016): 47-100.

Carr, Raymond, ed. *Spain A History*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
Wheatcroft, Andrew. *Infidels A History of Conflict Between Christendom and Islam*. New York: The Random House, 2005.

Chow, Alexander. "Eschatology and World Christianity." *Studies in World Christianity* 22, no.3 (2016): 205-215.

Clayton, Lawrence A. *Bartolomé de Las Casas and the Conquest of the Americas*. Malaysia: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.

Corfield, Penelope J. *Time and the Shape of History*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007.

Delaney, Carol. "Columbus's Ultimate Goal: Jerusalem." *Society for Comparative Study of Society and History* (2006). Accessed April 28, 2019.
<https://www.amherst.edu/system/files/columbus.pdf>.

Edwards, John. *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs 1474-1520*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2000.

Eliade, Mircea. *Mitlerin Özellikleri*. İstanbul: Alfa, 2018.

Eliade, Mircea. *Time Sacred & Profane: The Nature of Religion*. New York: A Harvest Book Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1963.

Elliott, J. H. *The Old World And The New 1492-1650*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Ergin, Gürkan. "Romanın Çöküşü ve İklim Değişiklikleri," *Aktüel Arkeoloji* no. 68 (2019).

Flint, Valerie I. J. "Christopher Columbus: Italian Explorer" *Encyclopedia Britannica*. Accessed April 28, 2019.
<https://www.britannica.com/biography/Christopher-Columbus/The-fourth-voyage-and-final-years>

Jung, Carl Gustav. *The Collected Works: Symbols of Transformation*. Vol.5. Edited by Sir Herbert Read, Michael Fordham, Gerhard Adler, New York: Routledge, 2014.

Kamen, Henry. *Spain 1469-1714 A Society of Conflict*. Harlow: Pearson, 2005.

Koller, John M. *The Indian Way*. New York: Macmillan Publishing Co. Inc., 1982.

Lowney, Chris. *A Vanished World*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.

McGinn, Bernard, ed. *The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism*. New York: The Continuum Publishing Group, 2000.

Meisnest, Frederick W. "The Lost 'Book of Privileges' of Columbus Located and Identified." *Huntington Library Quarterly* 12, no. 4 (1949): 401-407. Accessed April 28, 2019. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3816338>.

Miller, Kevin A. "Columbus's Signature: What Does It Mean?" *Christianity Today*. Accessed April 28, 2019. <https://www.christianitytoday.com/history/issues/issue-35/columbuss-signature.html>

Mirza, Rocky M. *The Rise and Fall of The American Empire: A Re-Interpretation of History, Economics and Philosophy: 1492-2006*. Canada: Trafford Publishing, 2007.

Morison, Samuel Eliot. *Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus*, vol.1. New York: Time Incorporated, 1942.

Needham, Joseph. *Time and Eastern Man*. Glasgow: Robert MacLehose & Co. Ltd The University Press, 1965.

O'Callaghan, Joseph F. *Reconquest and Crusade in Medieval Spain*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004.

Pentecost, J. Dwight. *Things to Come*. Michigan: Dunham Publishing Company, 1958.

Phillips, Carla Rahn. "Background Books: Columbus and the Labyrinth of History", *The Wilson Quarterly* 15, no. 4 (1991): 87-90. Accessed April 28, 2019. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40258163>.

Rummel, Erika. *Jiménez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* Arizona: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999.

Scavone, Daniel C. "Christopher Columbus" *Salem Press Biographical Encyclopedia*. Accessed April 28, 2019. <https://bit.ly/2WKoNtd>.

Sweet, Leonard I. "Christopher Columbus and the Millennial Vision of the New World." *The Catholic Historical Review* 72, no.3 (1986): 369-382.

Taviani, Paolo Emilio. *Cristoforo Colombo'nun Maceraları*. İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi, 2003.

Thapar, Romilia. *The Penguin History of Early India from the Origins to AD 1300*. Suffolk: Penguin Books, 2002.

Walls, Jerry L., ed. *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.

Watts, Pauline Moffitt. "Prophecy and Discovery: On the Spiritual Origins of Christopher Columbus's 'Enterprise of Indies.'" *The American Historical Review* 90, no. 1 (1985): 73-102. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1860749>.

Wessinger, Catherine, ed. *The Oxford Handbook of Millennialism*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Wilford, John Noble. "Columbus and the Labyrinth of History." *The Wilson Quarterly* 15, no. 4 (1991): 66-86.

Wilford, John Noble. *The Mysterious History of Columbus An Explanation of the Man, the Myth, the Legacy*. New York: Vintage Books, 1992.

Yıldırım, Nimet. *İran Mitolojisi*. İstanbul: Pinhan Yayıncılık, 2015.

Zinn, Howard, Manning Marable, Mike Davis and Veli Yılmaz. *Fatihler Yargılanıyor*. İstanbul: Tüm Zamanlar Yayıncılık, 1992.

APPENDICES

A. TURKISH SUMMARY / TRKE ZET

İkisi de gemiřte yařanan sosyal olayları ve insan toplumlarının gelişimini ortaya koyduęu için mitoloji ve tarih arasında her zaman kesin olarak ayırım yapmak mümkün deęildir. Bu bağlamda, ilk çağlarda yařanan olayların aktarıldıęı mitler, dini inançları besleyebilir ve toplumların dini tarihinin önemli bir kısmını oluřturur. Bu kapsamda, gelecekte dünyada yeni bir düzen inşa edecek bir kurtarıcının geleceęi teması, tarih boyunca birçok din tarafından benimsenen ve işlenen bir kavram olmuřtur.

Bu alıřmada ayrıntılı olarak gsterilmeye alıřıldıęı gibi, Katolik Hristiyanlık kurtarıcı mesih inancının benimsendięi dinlerden biridir ve bu ynyle yukarıda belirtilen temayı yansıtmaktadır. Bu alıřma esas itibarıyla, on beřinci yzyılda İber Yarımadası'nda ortaya ıkan sosyo-politik olayların binyılcılık ve mesih inancı erevesinde deęerlendirilmesi ile din ve politika iliřkisinin ortaya konulmasını amalamıřtır. Bu kapsamda, 1492 yılında İber Yarımadası'nda ortaya ıkan ve tm Avrupa tarihinin akıřını deęiřtiren  önemli olaya odaklanılmaktadır.

Tarik bin Ziyad komutasındaki yaklaşık 12.000 Mslman 711 yılında sekiz buuk kilometrelik Cebelitarık Boęazı'nı geerek İberya'ya ulařtı. Birka yz yıl boyunca, İber Yarımadası'nda Hristiyanlar, Mslmanlar ve Yahudiler bir arada yařadılar. *Convivencia*, bu kapsamdaki farklı etnik grupların birbirleriyle olan dzenlenmiř iliřkilerini betimlemek için kullanılan genel terimdir. Bu erevede, Gney İspanya'daki Kordoba řehri, halifelięin bařkenti olarak geliřti ve byk bir medeniyetin merkezi hline gelmiřtir. Kordoba Halifelięi, 1000 yılına kadar Avrupa'nın en zengin devleti olarak varlıęını srdrmřtr. Bu tarihten sonra, Biskay Krfezi ve Atlantik Okyanusu kıyılarında yer alan kk Hristiyan krallıkları, *Reconquista* olarak adlandırılabilen karřı saldırılarını bařlattılar. Yine de erken

modern döneme kadar, İber Yarımadası'nda toplumun Hristiyan, Yahudi ve Müslüman katmanları arasındaki düzen ve hoşgörünün korunmasına önem verilmiştir. Öte yandan, erken modern dönemde, bu hoşgörü yerini militan ve hoşgörüsüz bir Hristiyanlığa bırakmıştır.

İspanya'nın orta çağ krallıkları olan Kastilya, Aragon, Leon ve Valensiya'nın 1469 yılında Aragonlu Ferdinand ile Kastilyalı Isabel'in evliliği ve daha sonra kendi krallıklarında tahta çıkmaları ile birlikte farklı idari yapılarını korusalar da bir dereceye kadar birleştiklerini söylemek mümkündür. Öte yandan, yüzlerce yıllık savaştan sonra, ayakta kalan tek Müslüman devlet olan Gırnata Krallığı, 1492 yılının Ocak ayında Isabel ve Ferdinand'ın liderlik ettiği Hristiyan Ligi tarafından ele geçirilmişti. Ferdinand ve Isabel'in zaferi aynı zamanda Katolik Kilisesi'nin de zaferiydi. Böylece, İber Yarımadası'nda siyasi anlamda Müslüman varlığını sona erdiren bu olay, 1492 yılında yaşanan üç önemli olaydan ilkidir.

Bununla birlikte, Hristiyanlar ve Müslümanlar arasında yüzyıllar boyu süren uzun savaş dönemi, “öteki”nin hayatı ve ıstırapları için bir umursamazlık iklimi yaratmıştır. Bunun en önemli göstergelerinden biri Yahudilerin İspanya'dan kovulmasıdır. Bu kapsamda, Hristiyanlığı kabul etmeyen Yahudiler 1492 yılında Isabel ve Ferdinand tarafından İspanya'dan kovulmuş ve tüm mal varlıklarına el konulmuştur. Bu, aynı yılın ikinci önemli olayıydı. Ayrıca, Müslümanlar üzerindeki baskı da artmaktaydı. Birkaç yıl sonra Müslümanlar, Hristiyanlığı benimsemek veya İspanyol Yahudilerinin kaderini paylaşmak zorunda kalmışlardır.

Bu aynı zamanda Kristof Kolomb'un önemli bir tarihi figür olarak ortaya çıktığı dönemdir. Kolomb öncelikle Portekiz ve daha sonra İspanya için görev yapan önemli bir kişiydi. Bu bağlamda, on beşinci yüzyıl coğrafi keşiflerinin, Orta Çağ Avrupa'sını keşif ve merkantilizm ile tanımlanabilecek erken modern Avrupa'ya dönüştürdüğünü belirtmek önemlidir. Bu kapsamda, 1492 yılında Kolomb, İspanya'da Palos Limanından demir alarak doğuya ulaşmak için batıya doğru yelken açtı. Yeni Dünya'nın kapılarını açan ve Katolik Hristiyanlık tarafından desteklenen bu olay yılın üçüncü önemli olayıdır.

Bu çalışmada, bu üç önemli olayın eski bir dini inanç ya da mit adına gerçekleştirildiği irdelenmektedir. Bu inancın veya mitin konusu kültürden kültüre

değişmekle birlikte coğrafi olarak farklı kültürlerde gözlemlenmesi mümkündür. Katolik Hristiyanlık da bu karaktere sahip bir inanç sistemidir. Bu kapsamda, bu çalışmanın ikinci bölümde, özellikle Hristiyanlığa odaklanılarak eskatoloji ve binyılcılık kavramları ele alınmıştır. Üçüncü bölümde, İspanya'nın Aragonlu Ferdinand ve Kastilyalı Isabel'in tahta çıkışı ile birlikte birleşmesi, Yahudilerin sınır dışı edilmesi ile Gırnata'nın 1492 yılında Hristiyanlar tarafından ele geçirilmesi ile sonuçlanan İspanyol fetihleri süreci, toplumda var olan etnik gerilimler çerçevesinde incelenmiştir. On beşinci yüzyılda İber Yarımadası'ndaki Müslüman ve Yahudi kimlikleri bu bağlamda kısaca açıklanmıştır. Dördüncü bölüm, Kristof Kolomb'un önderlik ettiği coğrafi keşiflere odaklanmıştır. Kolomb'un hayatı ve seyahatleri, esrarengiz kişiliği çerçevesinde değerlendirilmiştir. Beşinci bölümde ise, coğrafi keşiflerin yanı sıra İspanyol fetihlerinin altında yatan motivasyon ve teo-politiğin rolü incelenmiştir. Bu anlamda, her iki olayın da benzer yönleri üzerinde durulmuştur. Ayrıca, on beşinci yüzyılda İber Yarımadası'nda ortaya çıkan olaylar, binyılcılık kehanetleri çerçevesinde değerlendirilmiştir. Hristiyan eskatolojisi ve binyılcılığın çağdaş politikada araçsallaştırılmasının etkileri de vurgulanmıştır.

Bu değerlendirmeler yapılırken özellikle coğrafi keşiflerin yorumlanması, Kristof Kolomb'un mektupları, seyahat günlükleri ve diğer yazılı eserleri göz önüne alınmadan gerçekleştirilemezdi. Bu bağlamda, Kristof Kolomb'un İspanya'nın yöneticileri olan Isabel ve Ferdinand ile olan yazılı iletişimi, üçünün de bakış açısını kavramak açısından güvenilir bir kaynaktır. Bu nedenle, bu çalışmadaki birincil kaynakların büyük çoğunluğunu Kolomb'un mektupları, günlükleri ve diğer çalışmaları oluşturmaktadır.

Kolomb'un hayatı ve seyahatleri için yukarıda belirtilen kaynaklara ek olarak, oğlu Ferdinand'ın biyografik eseri, Bartholomé de Las Casas'ın kitapları, Samuel Eliot Morison'ın ve John Noble Wilford'un Kolomb üzerine yazdıkları da dikkate alınmıştır. Bu çalışmalar, Kolomb hakkındaki iki farklı görüşün karşılaştırılması açısından önem arz etmektedir. Samuel Eliot Morison'ın çalışmasında Kolomb yüksek ahlaklı, hoşgörülü ve bilimsel ruha sahip rasyonel bir adam olarak yansıtılmakta ve övülmekte iken John Noble Wilford'un çalışmasında Kolomb'un kahramanlaştırılmasından ziyade insani yönüne odaklanılmıştır. Bu çalışmada,

yukarıda sayılan kaynakların incelenmesi neticesinde, Kolomb'un yaptığı seyahatlerde tanrı tarafından yönlendirildiğine inanan mistik bir kişi olduğu sonucuna ulaşılmış olup bu sonuç, John Noble Wilford'un çalışmalarında bulduğu sonuçlarla paralellik arz etmektedir.

Öte yandan, binyılcılık ve eskatoloji konuları uzun ve karmaşık bir geçmişe sahip olduğundan Hristiyan eskatolojisi ve binyılcılığın kökenleri ve gelişimi hakkında kapsamlı bir analiz yapılmıştır. Bu tarihsel altyapıyı oluşturduktan sonra, on beşinci yüzyıl İspanya'sı ile aralarında bağlantı kurmak daha kolay olmuştur. Ayrıca, Kolomb'un kıyamet öngörülleri açısından merkezi bir öneme sahip olduğundan Augustinus'a ayrı bir önem atfedilmiş, bu bağlamda *İtiraflar* ve *Tanrı'nın Şehri* adlı eserlerinden faydalanılmıştır.

Bununla birlikte, eskatoloji ve binyılcılık kavramlarını açıkladıktan sonra Kolomb'dan bahsetmeden önce, konunun bütünlüğü açısından, toplumdaki mevcut gerilimlere de değinilerek on beşinci yüzyıl İspanya'sındaki politik gelişmelerden söz edilmiştir. Bu bağlamda, Isabel ve Ferdinand'ın deniz aşırı seyahatlerinde Kolomb'a destek vermesinin nedeni, İspanya'nın 1492 yılındaki siyasi atmosferi ile büyük ölçüde bağlantılıydı. Bu kapsamda ikincil kaynakların yanı sıra, dönemin siyasi olaylarını daha iyi anlayabilmek için Orta Çağ'da İber Yarımadasında ikamet eden Hristiyan, Müslüman ve Yahudiler tarafından yazılan eserlerden faydalanılmıştır.

Yukarıda belirtilen hususlar ile ilgili detaylı açıklamalara yer verildikten sonra bu çalışma, aynı kişiler tarafından organize edilmelerinin ve desteklenmelerinin yanı sıra, İspanyol fetihleri ve coğrafi keşifler daha birçok ortak özelliğe sahip olduğunu ortaya koymuştur. Örneğin, altın (para) arayışının ve din değiştirmenin, hem İspanyol fetihlerinde hem de coğrafi keşiflerde önemli yeri bulunmaktadır. Ayrıca, her ikisi de Hristiyanlığın hüküm sürdüğü alanı genişletme ve altın çağını başlatmaya yönelik bir hacı seferi görevini üstlenme iddiası taşımaktadır. Bu anlamda, Yeni Dünya'nın keşfi, yerlilerin din değiştirmeye zorlanması, İspanyol fetihleri, Yahudilerin İspanya'dan ihraç edilmesi ve Gırnata'nın Müslümanlarının Hristiyanlaştırılması birbirinden ayrı konular olarak ele alınamaz.

Bu bağlamda, örneğin 27 Ağustos 1492'de Müslümanlarla savaşırken hayatını kaybeden Don Rodrigo Ponce de León'ın ölümü, bir hacı ölümü olarak kutlanmıştı.

Don Rodrigo Ponce de Le n kendi zamanının El Cid'i olarak kabul edildiğinden  nemli bir kiři ydi. Cenazesine  ok sayıda insan katıldı ve  l m  bir bayram olarak kutlandı. Ge  saatlerde ve hava karanlık olmasına rağmen, iki y z kiři ona yanan mumlarla eşlik etti ve  l m  *Corpus Christi* bayramı olarak onurlandırıldı. Coğrafi keřifler de benzer řekilde bir ha lı kampanyası gibi yansıtılarak haklı  ıkarıldı. Bartolom  de Las Casas, *Kızılderililer Nasıl Yok Edildi* adlı, Isabel ve Ferdinand'a hitaben yazdıė kitabında *conquistador* řiddeti, zulm  ve acımasızlıėı hakkında řik yetle bulunmaktadır. Las Casas i in coğrafi keřiflerin ardındaki asıl sebep, d nya halklarını Hristiyanlařtırmaktı ve  zellikle Kristof Kolomb'un  l m nden sonra Las Casas'a g re, İspanyollar bu kutsal g revi unutarak maddi deėeri nedeniyle altın peřinde kořmuřlardır.

Benzer řekilde, hem coğrafi keřiflerde hem de İspanyol fetihlerinde, karřı taraf barbar, medeniyetle tanıřmamıř ve ahlaki a ıdan ařaėılık sayılırken, Hristiyanlar ahlaki a ıdan  st n, adil ve tanrının sevdiė kullar olarak kabul edilmiřlerdir. Kolomb, Amerikan yerlilerinin Hristiyanlar gibi davranması ve yařamaları gerektiėine inanıyordu. Kolomb'a g re, Hristiyanlık bu insanları onurlandıracak, k t l kten aldatmacalardan kurtaracak ve onların kurtuluřunu saėlayacaktı. Bu kapsamda Kolomb Yeni D nya'nın Hristiyanlařtırılması ile meřgulken, Katolik h k mdarlar Isabel ve Ferdinand ise İber Yarımada'sında "zındıklık" olarak adlandırdıkları dinlerin ortadan kaldırılması ile uėrařıyorlardı. Onlar i in Katolik olmayanlar k f rlerdi ve ortadan kaldırılmaları gerekiyordu.  te yandan, Hristiyanlıėı kabul eden insanlar ise Hristiyanlıėı samimi bir řekilde benimsemedikleri d ř n ld ė nden İspanyol h k mdarların g z nde g venilmezlerdi. Hristiyanlıėı benimseyen insanların gizlice eski dinlerinin ayinlerini ger ekleřtirmeye devam ettiklerine ve ger ek Hristiyanları kutsal Katolik inancından caydırmaya  alıřtıklarına inanıyorlardı. Ayrıca, politik olarak g venilmez kabul ediliyorlardı. Mesela Afrika'dan gelen bir M sl man saldırısı durumunda, sadakatleri tartıřmaya a ık olacaktı. Bu baėlamda,  ncelikle g   zoruyla Hristiyanlıėı kabul ettirme ve Engizisyon mahkemeleri, ardından zorunlu g   veya  l m tehdidi ile Yarımada'da uzun yıllardır g   l kle korunan  ok k lt rl l ė  ve

birlikte yaşama kültürüne son verdiler. Bu anlamda, on beşinci yüzyıl İberya'sı artık hoşgörülü bir toplum olmayacaktı.

Kâfirlere karşı savaşın haklı gösterilmesi için Kolomb, *Kehanetler Kitabı*'nda, Augustinus'tan alıntı yaparak, kâfirlerin tanrılarının sahte tanrılar olduğunu ve tamamen terk edilmeleri ve tapınaklarının, putlarının ve kutsal objelerinin yok edilmesi gerektiğini gerçek Tanrı'nın peygamberler aracılığıyla açık bir şekilde ortaya koyduğunu söylemektedir. Yine Augustinus'a göre, kıyamet yaklaşınca yeryüzündeki karalarda ve denizlerdeki tüm insanların gerçek tanrıya ibadet etmesi de gerçekleşecekti. Bu anlamda, Kolomb da Hristiyanlığın adalardaki tüm insanlar tarafından kabul edilmesi ve tüm sahte tanrılar ve tapınaklarının yok edilmesi gerektiğine inanıyordu. Bu bağlamda, hem coğrafi keşiflerin hem de İspanyol fetihlerinin kısmen Augustinus'un etkisiyle yapıldığı ya da Augustinus'un varsayımları temelinde haklı çıkarıldığı sonucuna varılması mümkündür.

Bu noktada, Augustinus'un tarihe bakış açısını anlamak da önemlidir. Augustinus'a göre, tarih ve zaman, Tanrı tarafından yaratılmıştır ve dünyanın kaderi önceden belirlenmiştir. Başka bir deyişle, dünya sona erecek ve zamanı geldiğinde imha edilecektir. Dünya, sadece Tanrı'nın cömert iyiliği ile ayakta kalmaktadır. Bununla birlikte, Augustinus, insan yaşamındaki mükemmelliğin yeryüzünde yaşarken elde edilemeyeceğine inanmaktaydı. Bu bakımdan Augustinus, dünyanın kurulduktan sonra yedinci milenyumda biteceğini öngörmüş ve tanrı ile yeniden kavuşmaya özlem duymuştur. Kolomb'un Augustinus ve Kardinal Pierre d'Ailly gibi önde gelen Hristiyan ilahiyatçıları esas alan hesaplarına göre 1500 yılında dünyanın sona ermesi gereken 7000 yıldan sadece 155 yıl kalmıştır. Diğer bir deyişle, İsa'nın yönetimi altında huzur ve mutlulukla geçecek milenyum ve dünyanın sonuyla ilgili kehanetlerin bu 155 yıl içinde yerine getirilmesi gerekmektedir. Bu çerçevede, dünyanın sonuyla ilgili kehanetler genellikle benzer bir modeli izlemektedir: Bunlar, bu çalışmada Deccal'in gücü ele geçirmesi, Gog ve Magog'un gelişi, İsa Mesih'in ikinci gelişi, iyilik ve kötülük güçleri arasındaki destansı savaş (Armageddon), ölümlerin dirilişi ve diriltilecek tüm insanların yargılanması olarak özetlenmektedir.

Dünyanın sonuyla ilgili kehanetler incelendiğinde, Kudüs'ün Hristiyan egemenliği altında olmasının beklendiğini görmek sürpriz olmayacaktır. Bu anlamda, Kudüs'ün Hristiyanlar tarafından ele geçirilmesi Colomb ve çağdaşı diğer Hristiyanların eskatolojik bakış açılarının vazgeçilmez bir parçasıdır. Bu kapsamda, Kudüs'ün İslam, Hristiyanlık ve Musevilikte büyük öneme sahip olduğu ve bu önemi hâlâ muhafaza ettiği açıktır. Kudüs Müslümanlar için kutsaldır çünkü Muhammed Peygamber'in cennete yükselişinin Kudüs'teki Kubbet'üs-Sahra'dan gerçekleştiğine inanılmaktadır. Hristiyanlar için, İsa'nın çarmıha gerildiği yer olması ve Kutsal Kabir'in Kudüs'te bulunması hasebiyle önemlidir. Yahudiler için ise, Eski Ahit'te kendilerine vaat edilen kutsal toprakların kalbi olması nedeniyle büyük önem arz etmektedir. Ek olarak, Kolomb kutsal kitapların dünyanın sona ermesinden önce tüm Yahudilerin kutsal toprakları olan Kudüs'e toplanacağı ve Hristiyan olacakları öngörüsünde bulunduğu inanılmaktaydı.

Bu anlamda, hem Kolomb hem de Katolik Hükümdarlar bu kehaneti gerçekleştirmeye uygun adaylar olarak görülmüşlerdir. Bu kapsamda altın arayışı, Kolomb için sadece maddi bir arayış değil, manevi bir arayıştır. Diğer bir deyişle, Kolomb için altın kurtuluşa ermek için bir araçtır. Sadece maddi bir anlamı yoktur. Bu çalışmada, Kolomb'u dünya tarihi için önemli kılan şeyin, batıya doğru yelken açarak doğuya ulaşma konusundaki fikri olduğu açıklanmıştır. Bu bakımdan Kolomb'un ilk planı Marco Polo'nun bahsettiği sayısız zenginlikleriyle ünlü olan Çin'in masalsı kıyılarına demir atmaktır. Bu bağlamda bu çalışmada ortaya konulduğu üzere, Kolomb'un esas amacı, doğunun zenginliklerini ele geçirerek Kudüs'ü Müslümanların elinden kurtarmak için bir haçlı seferi finanse etmek ve dünya sona ermeden Kudüs'e eski ihtişamını geri kazandırmaktır.

Buna ilaveten, bu çalışmada ortaya konulduğu üzere sadece Yahudilerin değil, tüm insanların Hristiyanlığı kabul etmesi, binyılcılık senaryolarında çok önemli yere sahip olan bir kehanettir. Bu nedenle, zamanın sona ermesinden önce Hristiyan inancının vaaz edilmesi gerektiğine inanılmakta olup tüm insanların Hristiyan dinini benimsemesi gerekmektedir.

Kutsal kitaplarda yer alan Kudüs ve insanlığı Hristiyanlaştırma ile ilgili kehanetlere ek olarak, Kolomb ve İspanyol hükümdarlarını işaret eden kişisel

kehanetler de vardır. Örneğin bunlardan biri, Kardinal Pierre d'Ailly'nin, İslam'ın sonu ve Deccal'in geleceği hakkındaki kehanetidir. Buna göre, Müslüman egemenliği 693 yıl sürecektir. İslam'ın 610 yılında ortaya çıktığı dikkate alındığında 1303 yılı, Kardinal Pierre d'Ailly'nin hesaplarına göre İslam'ın egemenliğinin sonu olacaktır. Bu itibarla, İslam 1303 yılında İber Yarımadası'nda gerilemeye başladığında, İspanyol fetihlerinin sonunda İslam'ın ve Hristiyan inancının düşmanlarının yakında yok edileceği beklentisi oluşmuştur. Kardinal Pierre d'Ailly'ye göre Müslüman egemenliğinden sonra, büyü ve sihir gücüne dayanan Deccal'in hükmü dışında başka bir din gelmeyecektir. Bu kapsamda, İber Yarımadası'nda Morolara karşı yapılan savaşın ve Gırnata'da kazanılan zaferin, söz konusu kehanetin gerçekleşmesien dair emareler olarak okunması mümkündür. Buna ilaveten, yine kehanete uygun olarak Hristiyanların Moroları Deccal olarak adlandırdığı durumlar da vardır. Bu çalışmanın ikinci bölümünde de belirtildiği üzere, Freising Otto, binyılcılık kehanetlerinden biri olarak, Deccal'in çöküşünden sonraki zamanın Yahudilerin Hristiyanlığı kabul etmesine tanık olacağını iddia etmiştir. Bu anlamda, eğer Moroların başı Deccal ise, bazıları tarafından iddia edildiği gibi, 1492 yılındaki yenilgisi ve Yahudilerin Hristiyanlığı kabul etmeye zorlanması milenyum senaryosuna tam olarak uymaktadır.

Benzer şekilde, bu çalışmada Arapların, kıyamet vaktinin yaklaşmasına doğru Hristiyan bir kral tarafından yenilene kadar Hristiyanlara zulmedecekleri yönündeki kehanet de ele alınmış olup bu aynı zamanda İber Yarımadası'ndaki Hristiyanların ifade ettiği gibi Müslüman zulmü yaşadıkları iddialarıyla da örtüşmektedir. Bu Hristiyan kahraman, kehanete göre zulme son verdikten sonra görkemli bir bin yıllık saltanat başlatacak, Kudüs'e yerleşecek ve oradan Hristiyan dünyasında huzur ve barışı sağlayacaktır. Kehanetin sahibi Methodius'a göre bu bin yıllık saltanat döneminde, putperestlere karşı büyük zaferler kazanılacak, Yahudiler Hristiyanlığı benimseyecek ve Hristiyanlar hak ettikleri şekilde mükâfatlarını alacaklardır. Bu anlamda düşmanı yenen Aragonlu Ferdinand, çağdaşları tarafından kehanetteki Hristiyan kral olarak düşünülmüştür. Diğer taraftan bu çalışma, yukarıda sözü edilen tüm kehanetlerin İspanyol hükümdarları tarafından kendilerine destek sağlamak için veya siyasi propaganda aracı olarak kullanıldığı görüşünü de desteklemektedir.

Yine aynı bağlamda, Hristiyanlığın düşmanlarını yenecek, insanları Hristiyanlığa davet edecek ve Deccal'in gelmesinden önce altın bir çağ başlaması için doğuya seyahat edecek Avrupa hükümdarıyla ilgili başka bir kehanet de vardır. Bu üç olayın tümü, on beşinci yüzyılda İber Yarımadası'nda yaşanmıştır. Hristiyanlığın bölgesel düşmanların yenilgisi, Müslümanların yenilgisini tanımlamaktadır. Hristiyanlaştırma; Yahudi, Müslüman ve Amerikan yerlilerinin Hristiyanlaştırılma politikasını ve Yahudilerin İspanya'dan çıkarılmasını tanımlamaktadır. Son olarak doğuya seyahat etmek Kolomb'un yolculuklarının hedefini tanımlamaktadır. Bu bakımdan, bu kehanet Aragonlu Ferdinand'ın beklenen Avrupalı kral olarak algılanmasına neden olmuştur.

Özetlemek gerekirse, bu çalışma ile milenyum kehanetlerinin yerine getirilmesi ve eskatolojik saatin hızlandırılması açısından coğrafi keşiflerin, Müslümanlara karşı yürütülen İspanyol fetihlerinin, Yahudilerin İspanya'dan kovulmasının ve Kudüs'e atfedilen önemin arasında bir ilişki olduğu ortaya konulmuştur. Kolomb'un *Kehanetler Kitabı*, seyahat günlükleri ve mektupları bu türden bir inanışı doğrulayacak verilerle doludur. Mesela Kolomb, *Kehanetler Kitabı*'nda Kudüs'le ilgili tüm materyalleri toplama ve onları uygun şekilde düzenleme amacını güttüğünü belirtmesine rağmen coğrafi keşiflerin rotası ile İspanya ve Kudüs arasında coğrafi bir yakınlık veya doğrudan bir ilişki yoktu. Bu bağlamda, 1492 yılında Gırnata'nın düşüşü, Yahudilerin Hristiyanlığı kabul etmeye zorlanması ve daha sonra İspanya'dan ihracı, Gırnata'nın ve Yeni Dünya'nın Hristiyanlaştırılması, birtakım kehanetleri yerine getirmek ya da onları siyasi amaçlar için kullanmak için yapılmıştır. Bu bakımdan, Kolomb ve Katolik Hükümdarlar Isabel ve Ferdinand'ın, İsa'nın ikinci defa dünyaya gelmesinin Hristiyanların sosyal ve politik faaliyetine bağlı olduğuna inanılan "postmillenyal" düşünciyi destekledikleri iddia edilebilir.

Bu aşamada konunun farklı yönlerden ele alınmasına da ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır. Her ne kadar kutsal kitaplarda yer alan veya bireysel milenyum kehanetleri haklı çıksa ve Hristiyan olmayanlar düşman olarak görülse de, Kolomb'un ve Ferdinand'ın konuya yaklaşımları kategorik olarak farklıdır. Bu çerçevede, Kolomb'un Kudüs'ün Hristiyanlaştırılmasına ve diğer eskatolojik

kehanetlerin yerine getirilmesine saplantılı olduđu neredeyse kesindir. Diđer taraftan, Ferdinand'ın Machievelli'nin iddia ettiđi gibi siyasal iktidarı kazanmak için dini kullanıp kullanmadıđı konusunda şüpheye yer vardır.

Bu çalışmada belirtildiđi gibi, İstanbul'un Türkler tarafından ele geçirilmesiyle birlikte Avrupa'daki haçlı ruhu canlanmıştı. Bu, İspanyol fetihlerinin Kilise'nin sancađı ve koruması altında yürütölmesini de mümkün kılmıştı. Katolik Hükümdarlar, Kilise'nin nüfuz alanının genişlemesine yardım ederken; Katolik Kilisesi ise, Katolik Hükümdarların yürüttüğü askeri ve politik eylemlere dini meşruiyet kazandırıyordu. Bu bağlamda, İspanyol hükümdarları ile Kilise arasında karşılıklı bir siyasi fayda sağlama durumu olduđunu iddia edilebilir.

Kraliçe Isabel, 1504 yılında öldüğünde, hikâyenin politik tarafının ön plana çıktığını görmek mümkündür. Isabel ölüm yatağında, 1478'de Sevilla'da kurulan İspanyol Engizisyonuna uygun olarak, krallığın ve Kilise'nin reform sürecinin devam etmesi gerektiğini söylemiştir. Ayrıca Aragon ve Kastilya farklı yönetimler olduğundan Ferdinand'ın Kastilya'dan kazanımlarının da devam etmesi gerektiğine inanıyordu. Bu kapsamda, özellikle Yeni Dünya'dan elde edilen gelirleri vurgulamıştır çünkü bu gelirler Papalık tarafından Kastilya tahtına ait kabul edilmiştir. Isabel öldüğünde, Ferdinand Aragon kralı olarak yönetme hakkını sürdürse bile, Kastilya kralı unvanından vazgeçmek zorunda kalmıştır. Bu nedenle, Kastilya tacı zihinsel olarak dengesiz kızları Juana'ya geçmiştir. Sağlık sorunları nedeniyle kraliçelik konumuna uygun olmadığından, Kastilya'yı onun yerine kocası, Kutsal Roma İmparatoru Maximillian'ın oğlu Philip yönetmekteydi. Bu Ferdinand'ı siyasi açıdan savunmasız bir konumda bırakmıştı çünkü Philip, kayınpederinin Kastilya politikasında rol oynamasını ve denizaşırı gelirlerden kazanç sağlamasını istemiyordu.

İspanyol fetihleri sürecine benzer şekilde, Kilise'nin desteğinin coğrafi keşifler için de çok önemli olduğunu belirtmek gerekir. Bu kapsamda, Katolik Hükümdarların Papa II. Alexander'dan aldığı yerlileri yönetme izni onlara, yerlileri Hristiyanlaştırmaları ve Yeni Dünya'da kilise inşa etmeleri koşulu ile verilmişti. Bu nedenle, Amerika'daki İspanyol siyasi varlığı, Hristiyanlaştırma göreviyle meşrulaştırılmıştır. Diđer taraftan, Ferdinand'a göre Yeni Dünya'dan gelecek altın ve

zenginlikler, İtalya ve Kuzey Afrika gibi daha önemli yerlerde yürüteceği güç mücadelesi ve politik hamleler için gerekliydi. Bu nedenle, Ferdinand Kastilya'da damadı tarafından engellendiğinde daha saldırgan politikalara başvurmuştur. Mesela politik pozisyonunu güçlendirmek için Napoli'ye gitmiş ve Fransa ile Napoli'nin kontrolü için savaşmıştır. Aslında, Ferdinand'ın amcası V. Alfonso 1443 yılında bir dizi fetih faaliyetine girişmiş ve bu onu Napoli ve Sicilya kralı yapmıştır. Öldüğü zaman Sicilya'nın yönetimindeki söz hakkı, Ferdinand'ın babasına, ondan da Ferdinand'a geçmiştir. Ancak, Napoli'de Fransızlar da hak iddiasında bulundukları için Napoli'nin durumu belirsizdi. 1501 yılında Napoli, İspanya ve Fransa tarafından paylaştırılmıştır ancak Ferdinand, Fransa ile bir anlaşmazlıktan yararlanarak 1504'te Fransız birliklerini Napoli'den tamamen çıkarmayı başarmıştır. Bu onu Napoli'nin tek yöneticisi yapmıştır. Ayrıca, 1506'da Isabel'in ölümünden iki yıl sonra Ferdinand, Fransız Kralı Louis'in yeğeni ile evlenerek siyasi bir evlilikle Avrupa'daki konumunu güçlendirmiştir.

1512 yılında Fransa'nın koruması altında olan Navarre'yi ilhak etmesi, Venedik Krallığı'na karşı Cambrai Birliği'ne (1508) ve Fransa'ya karşı Kutsal Lig'e (1511) katılımı Ferdinand'ın politik çıkarları için doğru zamanı bulduğunda, binyılcılık kehanetleri ile insanlığın Hristiyanlaştırılması kapsamında hiçbir önemi olmayan Hristiyan Fransa ve İtalya'ya saldırmakta tereddüt etmediğini ortaya koymaktadır. Bu da, kendi politik ve askeri etki alanını büyütme arzusuyla veya açgözlülükle hareket etmediği iddiasının tersini işaret etmektedir. Dahası, İspanya'dan kovulan Yahudiler resmen II. Bayazid tarafından Osmanlı ülkesine kabul edilmiş olsalar bile İstanbul'u ve Kudüs'ü kontrol eden Müslümanlarla askeri olarak karşı karşıya gelmemiştir. Bu anlamda bu çalışmada, Yeni Dünyanın ve İspanya'nın Hristiyanlaştırılması hareketinin binyılcılık kehanetlerine uygun olması bir yana, aynı zamanda Aragonlu Ferdinand'ın siyasi emelleri için bir araç olarak kullanıldığı sonucuna varılmıştır.

B. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU

ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences

☐

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Social Sciences

☒

Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics

☐

Enformatik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Informatics

☐

Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Marine Sciences

☐

YAZARIN / AUTHOR

Soyadı / Surname : Tiryaki
Adı / Name : Fatma Hazal
Bölümü / Department : Tarih / History

TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (İngilizce / English) :

FIFTEENTH-CENTURY COLONIZATION OF THE AMERICAS AND THE PROCESS OF
RECONQUISTA: A MILLENARIAN PERSPECTIVE

TEZİN TÜRÜ / DEGREE: Yüksek Lisans / Master

☒

Doktora / PhD

☐

1. Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır. / Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide.
2. Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır. / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of two years. *
3. Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır. / Secure the entire work for period of six months. *

☒☐☐

* Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir.
A copy of the decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.

Yazarın imzası / Signature

Tarih / Date