THE CHALLENGES AND ASPIRATIONS OF PROFESSIONAL MIDDLE-CLASS PARENTING IN TURKEY

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

SEVİL TOĞAY

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS

FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIOLOGY

SEPTEMBER 2019

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

———————————————

Assoc.Prof. Dr. Sadettin Kirazcı
Director (Acting)

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree
of Master of Science.

———————————————

Prof. Dr. Ayşe Saktanber
Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate,
in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

———————————————

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fatma Umut Beşpınar
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Prof. Dr. Kezban Çelik   (TEDU,SOC)   ——————————————

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fatma Umut Beşpınar (METU,SOC) ——————————————

Prof. Dr. Ayşe Saktanber   (METU,SOC)   ——————————————

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last Name: Sevil Toğay
Signature:

ABSTRACT

THE CHALLENGES AND ASPIRATIONS OF PROFESSIONAL MIDDLE-
CLASS PARENTING IN TURKEY

Toğay, Sevil

M.S. Department of Sociology

Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fatma Umut Beşpınar

September 2019, 118 Pages

Drawing on 15 interviews with middle-class parents who occupy professional positions at work-life, this study examines the intersectionality of gender and class in professional middle-class parenting experiences and practices- a family strategy for class reproduction. Gendered segregated networks in parenting are existent and this is why woman and man have similar and different parenting experiences as they differently do parenting in the midst of expectations of the intensive parenting ideology, class position, work-home balance. In this study, parenting is considered from a relational viewpoint, and it is shown that how parents actively construct their parenting experiences and practices. It is observed that both mothers and fathers want to distance themselves from the past and their parents' parenting style. However, for mothers, it is seen that being a good mother means not complying with the traditional parenting roles but being a professional working mother who can cultivate individuality in children and support children's autonomy. For fathers, spending more time with children and being fond of open-sharing are revealed as what defines them. On the other hand, being stuck in between the work-home life balance, the gender divide in parenting continues as mothers are still primary parents, but fathers are outsider-within. Professional middle-class parenting practices are also shown as an important component of this parenting: getting professional advice on parenting; reading the books and choosing foreign private schools and good activities. These

practices that reproduce and consolidate professional middle-class parenting also uncover how mothers' parenting is more embedded in multi-dimensional public and private anxieties as fathers do only concern for their individual selves in their parenting practices.

Keywords: Parenting, professionalization, middle-class, gender, class reproduction

ÖZ

TÜRKİYE'DE PROFESYONEL ORTA SINIF EBEVEYNLİĞİN ZORLUKLARI
VE ÖZLEMLERİ

Toğay, Sevil

Yüksek Lisans, Sosyoloji Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi: Doç. Dr. Fatma Umut Beşpınar

Eylül 2019, 118 sayfa

Bu çalışma İstanbul ve Ankara şehirlerinde yaşayan 8 kadın ve 7 erkekten oluşan profesyonel iş yaşantısı ve orta sınıf pozisyonuna sahip 15 farklı ebeveyn ile yapılan görüşmelere dayanarak bu anne babaların ebeveynlik deneyimleri ile pratiklerini araştırmaktadır. Toplumsal cinsiyet kimliği ve sınıfsal pozisyonun kesişiminde bu ailelerin sınıfsal yeniden üretimi amaçlayan profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynlikleri tezin temel konusudur. Yoğun anne babalık ideolojisinin, iş-ev yaşam dengesinin, sosyal sınıf pozisyonunun ve kendilerine ilişkinin beklentilerinin tam ortasında anne ve babalar ebeveynliği farklı ve benzer şekilde deneyimlemektedirler. Bu çalışmada ebeveynlik ilişkisel bir perspektiften ele alınarak, ebeveynlerin kendi ebeveynliklerini aktif biçimde inşa ettiği gösterilirken anne ve babaların bu inşa sürecine katılımının farklı olduğuna dikkat çekilir. Kendi anne babalarının ebeveynliklerinden farklı bir yolu seçen görüşmeciler de annelerin bilhassa iyi anneliği çalışan ve çocuğunu yeteri kadar otonomisi olan birey yetiştiren anne olarak tanımladığı görülmüş babaların ise bu süreci katılımcı baba olarak çocuğu ile daha fazla zaman geçiren ve çocuğuna daha yakın baba olarak deneyimlediği görülmektedir. Ev-iş yaşam dengesi yeni geleneksel aile modelinin kurulmasında rol oynarken anne ve babaların bir profesyonel gibi icra ettikleri ebeveynliklerinde uzmandan yardım almak, çocuk yetiştirme kitabı okumak, profesyonel bakıcı tutmak ve özel yabancı okul/iyi aktivite pratiklerini öne çıkarmaktadır. Her biri profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynliği tanımlayan bu pratikler

annelerin ebeveynliklerinin hem özel hem de dış dünyaya ilişkin kaygıları içerdiğini ancak babaların endişelerinin kişisel olduğunu ortaya koymaktadır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Ebeveynlik, orta sınıf, profesyonelleşme, toplumsal cinsiyet, yeniden üretim

Beautiful sky, true sky, look at me that changes!

Güzel gökyüzü, sahici gökyüzü, bak nasıl da değiştim ben!

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

soothe me when I get caught in the feeling of being not enough. My father did not give up on me during the writing-up process despite all the tensions. They always believed my true potential. As my mother says, ' I have not seen a person just like you who is that scared of being oneself.' I was afraid. I was scared of being myself. Odd. How different I am today compared to who I am and who I want to be during the whole life. Without you, I have been nothing. I am grateful for everything.

If not for my family, this thesis would not have been written. My one and only brother, Ege, you have always been with me during my thesis journey. Through all my ups and downs, you have been my only true friend. I would ever want you to be a better version of me. And you are a better version of me. I am looking at you, what you transform into, with a grateful heart. You are the greatest brother anybody could have. I am so lucky to have been blessed by your friendship — all the love in the world to you my dearest.

My dearest cousin, Özgü, you played an exceptional role as a friend in my life. I owe you a special debt for our conservations for the last 20 years. I am so proud to see how we improve ourselves every day. I am also grateful for you to host me in Istanbul during my fieldwork process.

My biggest thanks go to Aylin and Merve, whom I met when we are only 16. Thank you for giving me the dose of inspiration, I needed to finish this thesis, but beyond that to learn how to live this life. I am so happy that we grew up together — my go-to pals.

Canım Ayşem, Yetkin, Kubi, Cem. The most exceptional chaos team ever. Thank you for all these days and nights we spent together. I learned a lot from you. You are the wittiest people of all time. I am glad to see your true colors. That is why I love you.

I want to thank you, three different people, for their friendship. Canım Yiğit, thank you for your insightful comments and all the fabulous times we spent in Ankara and Istanbul. Sevgili Ahmet, thank you for being with me during my Kayseri period. Without you, Kayseri would be more unbearable. Sevgili Oğuzcan, thanks for your

company, especially during the last couple of weeks of my writing process. It was always a pleasure to share my ideas with you and receive your feedback.

Life is hard, and I did go through a lot. At the end of the day, all I know is the power of believing in myself. This thesis symbolizes the end of an era. Today I would like to welcome all the ends with the new beginnings. Thank you, everyone, who make me who I am. I will always be your Sevo- as brave and soft with a big loving heart.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Research Problem

What parents do and how they raise a child has been fiercely debated in the literature as parenting is now a term that depicts more than the relations among mothers, fathers and children. Instead, there have been never-ending allegations about the links between parents' individual choices and its effects on children's lives and development. As parenting turns out to be distinct skills set to invest in children to guarantee their emotional, cognitive and physical development, parenting becomes seldom so relaxed. On the other hand, the effect of gender on parenting is another discussion point simply because woman and men differently engage in parenting. Whereas parents try to leverage opportunities for children's lives through reproductive parenting practices, this 'providing opportunity' action is deeply intertwined with gender and class. The gendered pattern in parenting has extended to different point: investing in child is not about parents' desires to invest but rather the volume and composition of their wide-range resources. Therefore, class turns out to be key to understand parenting. The intensive parenting ideology that needs abundance of time and money to raise a child cross-cuts different class positions but it is said that the ideology is crystallized in middle-class position considering the fact that middle-class is the widest group that have the necessary material and emotional resources. As the middle-class fears are multi-dimensional, the fear of falling is mixing into the dream of climbing to the higher rungs in the class ladder.

By looking at the parenting experiences of woman and man who are occupying same occupational and class position, this study examines different layers of professional middle-class parenting experiences and practices in Turkey. At a point of seeming departure from a traditional family arrangements and parenting role, what is at stake here a family model in which woman and man share the similar position at work. As it is said above, intensive parenting ideology operates on middle-class position in

particular and amalgam of professional work status and class position uncover a peculiar situation: there is no other class position in which woman's position can be this uncertain. Simply because, parenting experiences of professional middle-class women are in a complex relationship with their position at work. In another class fractions, including different fractions of middle-class, women either prefer to work in any kind of job to sustain the livelihood of their family or they simply choose not to work. However, professional middle-class women can behave proactively in accordance with their class position and intensive parenting ideology because they have similiar material and emotional resources as much as their husbands. Therefore, examining the parenting experiences and practices of professional middle-class mothers and fathers become significant.

This is why I address to what extent woman and man's parenting differs from each other, how they handle the intensive parenting ideology, how they confront the normative gender expectations of parenting roles and how the experiences resemble and varies in accordance with the reproductive role of parenting. In this manner, this thesis invites the middle-class, gender and professional work dimensions in parenting discussions to position itself in the big conversation about parenting that is going on in different disciplines in social sciences and sociology in particular. Also, the ways in which different aspects of parenting is set forth in the studies that are done in Turkish context are also taken into consideration in this study, to have deep comprehension of what leads to these discussions in Turkey. Within this framework, four abovementioned aspects of parenting should be addressed.

Firstly, to show why middle-class parents tremendously respond to, comply or challenge with intensive parenting ideology, three main themes of middle-class aspect of parenting appeared: (1) middle class parenting practices that mobilizes significant resources to a child to reproduce the social advantage by distinguishing itself from the working class (Gillies: 2008, Lareau:2011), (2) practices that are shaped by uncertainty and risk discourses so that middle-class parents use different techniques to care and control their children (Nelson:2010, Warner:2006) and apply different security projects to buffer kids from the repercussions of market (Cooper:2014), (3) middle

class parenting and its obsession with getting advice from child-experts, therapists and doctors (Lee:2014). All these themes share one common point: middle-class parents seek for entitlement and distinction, and they either better their parenting or invest in a child more and more as to differentiate themselves and their children. Just because as Furedi (2008) argues, parenting in itself does not have a meaning but rather 'parenting' postulates a relationality. Parents forms' parenting' in and through relations with their children and constructs themselves and their parenting practices and most importantly, their parenting identity. This relationality can explain why middle-class parents are very concerned about children's future because the children are a testimony to their competence, class position, and good parenting.

Secondly, the class cannot be the only descriptive lens to understand middle-class parenting. Although this concept may seem gender-neutral, as Lee et al. (2014) say gender is another lens to explore intensive parenting ideology in addition to the class. It has been already known that woman and man's parenting is different as their changing position in the society causes them to return back to traditional roles of parenting. However, the class position and work status make the gap between varying gendered parenting roles more visible. Furthermore, as the gender aspect of parenting practices are more emphasized, to understand the disparities between how women and men are experiencing parenting becomes crucial. The most important factor that creates this disparity is the issue of reconciliation between work and home.

Thirdly, the compatibility between parents' work and home life are pointed out in various ways through the literature. As Hochschild and Machung (2012) say, women are not liberated from their domestic and parenting duties despite their participation in the labor force. On the contrary, women continue to be the primary parent. As they say, the only way to ease the burden on women's shoulders can be possible with men's involvement in parenting. From this point onwards, there have been conducted several studies on how intensive parenting ideology becomes and should be a topic for fathers as well (Ennis:2014, Faircloth et al.:2013, Furedi:2008, Hochschild et al. :2012).

Middle-class mothers are generally addressed through their economic duties to contribute to family finances, so they become the group whose struggle between the work and home life is the biggest (Hochschild&Machung:2012). For upper-middle-class mothers, to not to withdraw from work life, they use their financial gains to compensate for their domestic work. Also, other studies are arguing that upper-middle-class women approach mothering as a professional issue, mainly based on individual choices (Cooper,2014). Interestingly, it is also said that other upper-middle-class professional women quit their jobs and participate in the opt-out revolution to raise their kids in the best way. What is common in the mothers' experiences who belong to different fractions of the middle class is that they have some hardships to make the needs of intensive parenting ideology. Whichever they cannot fulfill the requirements of this ideology, they share the common feeling of being not enough.

Middle-class fathers, on the other hand, are generally addressed as their bread-winner roles to continue staying afloat and make the family financially secure. The new aspect added to the story is new fatherhood ideals, which examines the meanings and boundaries of the more involved fatherhood. Fathers both try to make more time for their kids and continue to be the primary responsible person for the family finances (Ranson:2001, Henwood &Procter:2003). However, for professional fathers, it is said that their new fatherhood ideals articulate into the language of the market, which praises rationality, effectivity, and control. It is said that the enactment of their masculinity turns to be how these fathers experience parenting as parenting becomes a professional matter for these fathers (Cooper, 2010). In this regard, Connell (2011) says that the deep play of hegemonic masculinity shows itself through how new fatherhood is constructed and reconstructed based on the needs and requirements of the market. This is why neither mothers' nor father's parenting cannot be understood without their relation to the market.

Lastly, as a fourth point, understanding how parenting is discussed for Turkish context and in Turkish literature is significant. In Turkey, the rate of female labor force participation is already low. Therefore, it is not a surprise that the number of women employed in the professional sector is low as well. As Kabasakal (1998) says, unlike

the western counterparts, the considerable proportion of professional women occupying managerial positions is married and have children. According to OECD reports, Turkey is the country where working hours is the longest with Mexico[1], and early childcare services are insufficient[2]. As professional women are challenged by these facts, they also fulfill the requirements of intensive parenting ideology. As Kağıtçıbaşı (2007) says, emotional dependencies and relatedness are the characteristic features of parent-child relations in terms of intergenerational dependencies. This is why these women are not totally separated and individualized in terms of their parenting.

Several economists and sociologists asked why female labor force participation in Turkey is so low. Through the use of a feminist lens to the employability of women Özbay says (as cited in İlkkaracan,2019) that the main thing is not their low level of education and but rather the gender culture and gendered division of labor. Also, there have been some points made on the possible factors behind women's low level of labor force participation, which can be used to understand the current conditions of professional middle-class women. As Kandiyoti[3] (1997) says, upper-middle-class women historically occupied professional jobs. Besides, according to Çağatay and Berik (as cited in Özbay, 1998), the transition to export-led growth economy with neoliberal economic restructuring pushes women to hold on more insecure, feminized, and unregistered jobs. In other words, holding a professional position in the labor market is already hard in Turkey, and it is said that the low professional labor demand in the market even influences the employability of upper-middle-class professional women (İlkkaracan, 2019). In this regard, women seem to be stuck in between to hold on these positions and balancing the work-home life.

Undoubtedly, the determinants of more involved fatherhood are also in question, especially in recent times. Even though the new fatherhood becomes the dominant

---

[1] Women and Men in OECD Countries http://www.oecd.org/sdd/37964450.pdf

[2] Education Today 2010: The OECD Perspective

[3] Kandiyoti adds one more point: In Turkey, educating the women serves a solidification of class privileges rather than providing women to be upwardly mobile.

discourse in the literature, it is seen that even high SES men are speaking of the women's primary parenting role. According to AÇEV's last report[4], it is underlined that men still perceive parenting in this regard: designating women as the main care-taker; having hard times because of work-home imbalance, understanding more involved fatherhood as a part of daily stuff such as watching tv with children, not be informed about paternal leave or being informed but not being able to access this right because of structural and individual factors.

Both men and women are challenged by the market economy in terms of their involved parenting. At the same time, it is seen that parenting is addressed as a role which affects a child's cognitive, physical, and emotional development. How Turkish literature perceives parenting is crucial to understand as this literature produce knowledge on the ways to better mothers and fathers' parenting with several education programs. Simply because, as this literature address parenting in different ways, parenting becomes a topic in terms of how parenting attitudes, beliefs, and practices have an effect on cognitive, physical and emotional development of children; how SES is a variable which has positive association to parenting practices and behaviors (Kağıtçıbaşı and Ataca: 2005, Sunar and Fişek: 2005, Yağmurlu et al.:2009); how women's education level and their labor force participation rates show a positive association to women's status and child's behavior. Even especially social psychology literature interrogates why a particular parenting style and practice emerge in a specific context-based the causal-functional analysis of parenting through the lens of the ecological model (Baydar et al. 2012); the answers do not involve how parenting is also about parents' work-home life and their class position. It is understood that in Turkish literature on parenting, the most underlined theme of the effect of parents' behaviors on children validates Furedi's point. Parenting becomes about the behavior of parents, which manifests who they are and how much their children are excellent and well-rounded individuals.

---

[4] http://www.en.acev.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/1_involved-fatherhood-and-its-determinants-in-turkey.pdf

From these four evaluations onwards, the research questions of this study are expressed in this way: how does gender shape the professional middle- class construction of parenthood and their parenting practices? How do their work-life and class position intersect with their gender identities and experiences in their parenting? Since there are two questions, my arguments are twofold. First, professional middle-class mothers and fathers shape their parenting practices almost like a professional, and they reproduce class status of both their own and their child through parenting practices. Second, professional middle-class mothers and fathers shape and alter their own construction of intensive parenting practices to reconcile the demands of these practices with their status at work.

1.2 Significance of the Study

The significance of the study lies in its sincere efforts to consider both professional middle-class mothers' and fathers' parenting at the same time.
In Turkish literature, firstly, this study suggests looking at 'professional middle-class component of parenting,' which is a topic that insufficiently addressed. Two main studies investigated professional work, middle class, and parenting at the same time. In her thesis, Kaya (2008) tries to understand the mothering experiences of professional women in Turkey in terms of childbearing and raising processes. She comes up with the conclusion that mothering experience is class and gender-based as these professional mothers do treat their children like they treat a task in work life. In her thesis, as she only points out mothering experiences, her focus is to understand the interrelation between intensive mothering ideology and professional work. This thesis simply does not invite fathers to the stage.

On the other hand, Beşpınar (2016) written on new fatherhood ideals among middle-class man who does work in the professional sector. As she considers the whatness of new fatherhood, she scrutinizes how hegemonic masculinity ideal surrounds and makes fatherhood as these fathers actively contribute to shaping their parenting identity. These fathers interpret their past, the current and economic status in Turkey and also global currents in the market that popularizes therapies and activities. Also,

they try to distance themselves from their past and to provide the best possible start to their child in life. However, this study focuses on male parenting to be specific.

In this study, addressing mothers' and fathers' parenting practices and experiences at the same time gives me the chance to understand how they share same concerns in terms of their class position and professional work identity. However, the meanings they attach to these experiences are seriously different from each other, as their level of responsiveness to intensive parenting practices is deeply affected by their confrontations to professional work identities. Also, interpreting their experiences based on the same frame also shows that from work-home reconciliation to consumptive practices on behalf of their children, they go through similar challenges. Only means, intensive parenting ideology works. Yet, how this ideology works on different levels in terms of intensive mothering and new fatherhood ideals creates the discrepancies in their practices.

1.3 Theoretical Framework of the Study

The emergence of professional middle-class parenting can not be explained through one, strict theoretical lens. This is why I draw on two concepts in different theoretical lenses to understand the gender dimensions of professional middle-class parenting. Professional middle-class is a concept which was first coined by Ehrenreich (1989) in her famous book titled 'Fear of Falling.' What she means by this concept is people whose economic and social status is based on education, rather than on the ownership of capital and property. In other words, professional middle-class consists of people who found a chance to be upwardly-mobile in the society they live in. As they are defined as professionals, their jobs require at least bachelors' degree and even more in accordance with the skills that they need to thrive in the work sector. Ehrenreich makes a classification of these professionals ranging from engineers to academics, corporate executives to teaching professionals and any job that necessitates a high level of knowledge and reliability. Here, as these jobs predicate the weakening of self-regulating power and reduction in autonomy and dominance, they also require individual decisions and non-ending self-development. The way I use this concept is similar to how Nelson (2010) borrows it from Ehrenreich. As she says, education is

what defines professional- middle-class parents as it means more than material components but also gives an idea about the interrelation amongst occupational position, the values, and meanings attached to these positions and cultural-social capital that makes the difference in one's trajectory.

Here, understanding how class operates, I apply Bourdieu's formulation of social class. For him, in its basics, social class is explained with similarity and distinction. Making sense of a class position, feeling belonging to an environment, making similar talks with similar people in a more homogeneous environment describe similarity. On the other hand, marking territory to identify belongingness as different than any other people tells the distinction. Social class is not a static and durable category but constructed in relations. As Bourdieu (1987) says, there is nothing out of social space. Therefore, social class designates one's place in this space where agents actively relate with others. By mainly use of concepts habitus and capitals, I show that how investing by consuming is about how one's structured dispositions (the upbringing, education level, and the familial status) generates one's aspirations whereas the volume and composition of capitals are essential in the constitution of a habitus. In other words, how parents try to preserve class privileges on behalf of their children and how the class works as a unifying and differentiating principle can be understood in this way.

1.4 Research Methods

In order to find out how professional middle-class mothers and fathers construct and experience parenting; I have conducted 15 semi-structured in-depth interviews with eight professional woman and seven professional men that are occupying high-level positions in companies and state institutions. There are executives, academics, engineers, and one teacher and one lawyer. Two mothers had a career break at that time, and there is also a mother who paused her work life a long time ago but occasionally worked in the family company. All fifteen parents are at least university educated. Three parents also have Ph.D. degrees, and one was a Ph.D. candidate at that time. Four parents have graduated, and seven parents have only bachelor's degrees.

Two of these parents are a couple, married to another.[5] These parents have one or two children whose ages ranging from 1 to 17. This range seems broad, but there are only two children who are at the age of 14 and 17. All others are between 1-8. Also, even if some parents who have a child at the age of 1, they have another child at the age 4-5. Therefore, the talks generally revolved around the child who is older than her/his sibling. The three parents who are older and have teenage children are chosen deliberately as pinpoints in my study to see any difference in their parenting. However, I saw that there is not a big difference, at all, simply because, to the best of my knowledge, class operates may be at different levels but still operating on how they construct their parenting. These parents told me the same stories of educational aspirations for their children's future, activities, and even therapists and controlling mechanisms.

The interviews have taken place in Ankara and Istanbul within almost six months, starting from July to December 2018. I entered into the field with my three key persons: two academics and one close friend who know different families and parents. The reason why I have chosen these cities is that these cities are more involved in organizations and networks in the global economy. At the same time, as Rutz and Balkan (2009) say for Istanbul, it is a city embedded in national aspirations and also subject to regulation by the state. The commercial and financial centers are based in Istanbul, and it is home to the outward-looking new middle class. As for Ankara, it can also be said that it has a professional middle-class people who mainly work in consulting firms and technoparks. There also some studies on the emergence of the new middle class who are mostly educated, living in gated communities, having consumptive tastes and communicating with their children differently, which individuality takes precedence over family (Ayata, 2002).

1.5 Organization of The Study

In Chapter 2, I address the details of my fieldwork process. I introduce why and how I did choose my research method, what I did go through before-during the field. Also,

---

[5] Please see p. 17.

by showing how I evaluate the strengths and limitations of my research, I end this chapter.

In Chapter 3, there are four sections complementing each other. First, I provide a brief description on the concept of parenting, which is very central to understand how the concept is closely related to middle-class and solidification of intensive mothering ideology. Then, I extend parenting to middle-class parenting, focusing on gendered aspects as well. In the third section, I highlight how professional work, class and gender intesect with each other. By making use of Bourdieu's frame and elaborating his frame on this specific study, I close this chapter.

In Chapter 4, first, I present a framework to look at how my respondents identify their parents' parenting. Then, I show how they start to construct their own parenting and how mothers do relate themselves with their own mothers and how father do relate themselves with their fathers and how they make inferences of the past and apply these into their parenting. Lastly, I do question how mothers and fathers differently and similarly continue to construct their parenting in the midst of work-home balance.

In Chapter 5, I show how these professional middle-class parents do experience different aspects of parenting practices in a similar but varying way. From this point onwards, I look at how they reproduce their cultural and social class position via these parenting practices.

In conclusion chapter, I provide the whole thesis frame by putting emphasis on the most essential points. I also endeavor to comment on possible future studies related to my topic.

CHAPTER 2

RESEARCH METHODS

2.1 Research Method

In this study, I chose semi-structured in-depth interview method to understand how parents respond to neoliberal transformation, how they transform the way they do 'parenting' and how they actively contribute to the construction of parenting. To make them contemplate on the topic of professional middle-class parenting practices and ask about the why and how of these practices in a self-reflexive manner, was only possible with conducting interviews. From July to December 2018, I recruited 15 parents. As I mention in the latter part of this chapter, I had a set of questions which were prepared before the pilot study and updated during it with experiences gained from respondent's feedback and my own. These questions were edited once more after a few interviews. Some questions did not work as I expected, and some of them were overlapping with each other as I've seen. For instance, I replaced the detailed questions about children's education with questions about the parents' perception of children's success. Simply because, during the interviews, I noticed that success is a term encapsulating parenting practice of investing by consuming not only in terms of schools, extra-curricular activities but also in terms of other activities that guarantee children's emotional and cognitive development.

To be sure, I could have chosen quantitative methods such as questionnaires and scales. In their Intensive parenting attitudes questionnaire (IPAQ), Mackinstosh et al. (2014) focusing on characteristics of intensive parenting in Hays' book tried to see whether college students' beliefs on intensive parenting practice differ in fathers, mothers, and parents in general. To not to overlook gender differences in the experience of parenting and to look at these students' belief about intensive parenting ideology whether there is any change or whether the same pattern is followed or not, they applied a Likert scale questionnaire. In another scholars' study on parental

burnout, they also offered a survey for parents to measure their burnout level to handle with it and to test the detrimental effects of parenting practices on the pursuit of reaching the ideal and perfect parenting. Likewise, Kağıtçıbaşı (2007) in her study offered different scale to consider the related and autonomous self in the family to understand how parenting practices are mediated between macroeconomic-social conditions and culture and influential formation of children's self. Without a doubt, all these crucial studies represented a fraction of reality about a different aspect of parenting. Yet, these don't say much about how parenting is related to the past and the present effects. The psychological lens in these studies caused scholars to focus on a particular aspect of parenting even they somehow looked at the continuities and changes in parenting practices. However, Cooper's (2014) study on how inequality of security led families to employ different security projects and emotion management strategies showed that conducting in-depth interviews with parents enabled her to discover the concept of doing security and the role of emotions in doing it.

Similarly, Beşpınar's (2016) study on middle-class fatherhood, her choice of conducting in-depth interviews provided her rich details about the construction of fatherhood, new fathering experiences, and ideals. Not just figuring out the specifics of parenting, they both revealed how parenting practices are related to the link between macro and micro conditions in the society such as class, gender, and race. As like them, preferring to conduct interviews enabled me to look behind the facade of parenting practices by listening to their whole parenting story, the past, today, and aspirations for the future. To see what themes will emerge from the interviews besides my previously prepared questions and to let my respondents also guide the interview, I ended up conducting interviews.

2.2 Research Field and Sample

After I read many pieces written on parenting and assured myself about working with professional middle-class parents to understand intensive parenting practices, I entered into the field with updated questions in July 2018. At that time, I was only thinking of Ankara as my only field area. Yet, I started with Istanbul because my close friend, who is also my first contact person lives there and he has so many acquaintances who are

employed in professional jobs and have Ph.D. degrees. My other contact people were consisting of academics and NGO professionals in Istanbul and Ankara. Thus, every parent I talked to was naturally selected from an entourage of professional middle-class. Another automatic outcome of this was that these parents are based in Istanbul and Ankara. Yet, this should not mean that my choice of fields was random. I knew that to find these parents; I better go to the biggest cities in Turkey. These cities went through a sharp neoliberal transformation and urbanization in last 20 years, and so they were exactly the best options for me who study on the construction of parenting practices and the motives, reasons, and relations behind them.

The interviewees except academics were consisting of banking professionals, one project management professional, one former judge, one retired teaching professional, a biomedical supervisor and married couple who are trading auto parts. The commonality of these fifteen parents was their education level. All of them were graduated from the top universities in Turkey, and half of them also had post-graduate degrees from Turkey or abroad. Even the parents who run their own trade business were a business engineer and a pharmacist, but they were continuing to do family business. These parents' ages range from 30 to 53. They are all married except one father who described the mother of their daughter as his partner. Only three families have two children, whereas the leftovers have only one child. The ages of their children range from 3 months old to 17 years old. This range seems very broad, yet only three children go to high school. The others are consisting of babies, toddlers, and little kids who are around five years old. Age of the children simply matters. This is why I set the upper age limit to 17 to see how professional middle-class parenting practices operates especially in school choice. Details of the 15 respondents are provided in the following table:

	Person[6]	Gender[7]	Age	Marital Status	The number and age of child/children	Educational status	Occupational status
1	Hatice	F	53	Married	1/26,14	University	Teacher
2	Deniz	F	39	Married	2/ 7,4	University	Career break/ Senior Banking Executive
3	Ayşe[8]	F	47	Married	1/17	University	Pharmacist/ Paused her career a long time ago/ Occasionally works in family company
4	Aylin	F	36	Married	1/2	Ph.D.	Academic
5	Büke	F	34	Married	1/2	Ph.D.	Academic
6	Merve	F	30	Married	1/2	Ph.D. candidate	Career break/ Lecturer
7	Melis	F	35	Married	2/4,1	Master's	Correspondent Account Executive in a private bank
8	Filiz	F	45	Married	1/8	University	Attorney at Law
9	Ozan	M	36	Married	1/4	Master's	Executive in the defense industry
10	Ahmet	M	35	Married	1/3	University	Executive Sales Manager in biomedical company
11	Ali	M	52	Married	1/17	University	Business Engineer/ Owner of A Company
12	Kubilay	M	35	Married	1/2	University	Senior Project Professional in a software company
13	Cem	M	38	Single (Unmarried)- living together with his partner for almost 9 years	1/1	Ph.D.	Part-time lecturer in two different universities/ Editor for NGO/Researcher
14	Melih	M	39	Married	1/5	Master's	Partner in a consulting company
15	Sezgin	M	41	Married	1/4	Master's	Mechanical Engineer in a software and systems company

---

[6] All the respondents' names in the study are pseudonyms.
[7] F stands for female and M stands for male.
[8] Ayşe is married to Ali, so they are the members of same family.

Yet, my choice of parents with little kids was to understand how the ideas of parental determinism and today's parenting on-demand spread into the lives of parents and how parents construct their parenting practices and themselves as a parent by adjusting themselves to the neoliberal transformation and its effects.

From July to December 2018, we usually met each other in coffee shops or the workplace. Only one family proffered to meet me at their house in Aydınlıkevler in order for me to interview with them. Thinking their comfort and mostly the time limit, I always went to the places of their choosing. We generally had an interview during the times while they wait for their kids to pick them up from a class or before/after/during their work hours. Time was precious, and they were all in a rush when they come to meet me. I thought time pressure might be a problem.

For this reason, I always informed my respondents about the expected interview time and so I arranged the interviews which took time about 50 to 90 minutes in accordance with their most suitable time. With their permission, I recorded interviews, and I took some notes during the interviews to turn back and see which detailed I highlighted at that particular moment. Besides, I shared the necessary information of the ethical permission, and I informed my respondents about that their names will not be revealed, the confidentiality of their data will be secured, and they can leave the study any time they wanted.

2.3 Field Experiences

2.3.1 Me before conducting the interviews: The first instance from the field

Broadly speaking, if a social sciences master's student in Turkey studies on a topic that entails talking to people by doing ethnography, narrative analysis or conducting interviews, she does this field study right after she completed her master's classes. First, she enters into a field for a pilot study to measure the possible weaknesses and strengths of her topic then jumps into a field with a more crystal-clear mind. In my case, the situation has gone awry. In 2016, when I started to take master's classes, I exactly knew what I want to study. I was supposed to problematize professionalization as the doxa of parenting. By arguing these parenting practices are getting

professionalized in the way that parenting is a now a medium of investing in a child by consuming various services to absorb the ramifications of neoliberalism, I was trying to show parenting is an active practice which adjusts itself concerning today's needs. However, although today I still mainly study on the same topic, in those days, I was focusing on parenting practices to extend the boundaries of Bourdieusian concept of doxa by providing a substantial methodological contribution to the respective literature. I believed that when everyone fails to understand a specific problem from a western-made theoretical viewpoint, I was going to beat the odds and explain Bourdieu with middle-class parenting. To do this, I prepared a set of questions to conduct semi-structured interviews with randomly chosen parents living in different places in Ankara in the beginning of 2017. Interestingly, when I conducted a pilot study by asking seven different parents belonging to different fractions of middle-class, the main themes that the questions are asked accordingly seemed plausible.

Yet, there happened quite a problem: the questions worked, but the answers varied according to whom I asked questions. Investing in schools and extra-curricular activities were a shared concern for all of them, but the way these become a problem and the solutions developed for them are different. The pursuit of explaining Bourdieu in Turkish middle-class parenting context pushed me through investigating all different fractions of the middle class. However, 'intensive' practices have been more of a matter for parents who have more than a graduate degree and are employed as professionals. Because lower-middle-class do not have sufficient resources to be intervened in the choice of schools and financially expensive extra-activities, they left this area to the teachers and the school itself. Also, the fact that they're generally live in the outskirts of the city caused them to be worried about the physical dangers in the environment, such as drug addiction and teenage delinquency. Therefore, this pilot study showed me that all fractions of the middle class could not be an issue only the specific fraction should be included.

Also, trying to use the concept of doxa to construct the backbone of my study might have seemed a problem. On the one hand, I was thinking that today's parenting practices are becoming the common sense as parents believe their styles and practices

are the predictors of a child's behavior problems. However, this did not mean that they're the passive receivers because there was a tension between their parenting practices, their own parents' practices, and parenting manuals/books. As my respondents behave in accordance with the terms and conditions of the parenting field, which give rise to their common action of investing by consuming, they also do this to reproduce their class identity and position. These parents were really thinking of what to do and how to raise their children in constant bombardments with advice on how to parent. In this way, I could have seen that how the current parenting culture and current status of education field in Turkey creates certain types of taste and a doxic understanding of certain ways of child-raising in terms of child's education; extra-curricular activites and getting advice from experts on the proper way to parent. I was thinking that this process relies on my respondents' consumption of cultural capital as the position of their cultural capital is determined by the position of parents' investing by consuming activities the field. This way of thinking really provided me a methodological understanding to see the active construction of parenting. However, during my pilot study, I understood that calling professionalization as the doxa of parenting, I should have a broader knowledge of parenting practices such as asking the doctor, reading the books and choosing the private schools. Simply because, I was trying to introduce a general frame of different parenting practices at once and naming professionalization as doxa of parenting needed deeper analysis of these practices. This is why I gave up on to use this concept in a visible way. But I really valued this concept because it shaped my consideration of parenting and contributed my insight about this topic. From that point onwards, to focus on today's parenting practices of professional middle-class, I decided that my primary field-work experience should be based on a ongoing to and fro between the theory and practice through which I will give a more plausible way to read the parenting with theoretical framework.

2.3.2 During the Interviews

My interviews have gone, as well as possible. There were two main reasons behind this: As a future academic who graduated from one of the top universities in Turkey, I was giving the impression of somebody smart and really into what she is working

on. At the same time, the perfect academic credentials of my contact person probably reinforced positive feelings about me and my academic capability. Most importantly, building a good rapport and trust relation with my respondents have also been possible thanks to my contact person's good credits in my respondents' eyes. Interviewing with parents who have academic backgrounds and are familiar with social sciences was a soothing experience both for my respondents and me. Because they were precisely aware of what we're going to talk about, understanding, and replying to the questions within my context have become easy for them. However, as in these two interviews and in other two which I conducted with academics, my main discomfort was about they constantly switched between their professional identity (as familiar with the topic) and parent identity (who are suffered from the intensity of parenting practices). Their self-reflexivity level into the topic, sometimes, jeopardized my researcher position. Simply because thinking about the sociological reasons behind their parenting practices, they usually engaged in this topic very intensely especially when they felt like stuck in between their ideas about parenting practices and their enactments which reminded them the problems about their daily life. At those times, I felt I was losing control of the interview a bit since my respondents were redundantly involved in questions and topic. This situation provided me substantial details, though. Maybe in another case, they could not have preferred to respond to the questions in great detail. Their professional identity, my academic identity, and my apparent courage to tell about my parents intertwined with one another. Even though I've been challenged by carrying out interviews with parents who have an academic background or post-graduate degree, I also gained vibrant details about the construction of parenting practices.

However, being an academic who is trying to verse in the topic of parenting is not same as being an expert or a professional who can give advice on parenting styles and practices. Even at some point, my respondents opened up the delicate issues about their parenting, there have been a clash between my academic identity and their professional attitude on parenting. Simply because, I am coming from a sociology background; I am not a parenting expert and so I was not looking for the predictors of their parenting behaviours and experiences to examine the right and wrongs or seek a

model, a treatment to enable parents to better their parenting practices and behaviors. In the end, when my respondents felt like my knowledge about parenting is more comprehensive compared to theirs, there happened two things: (1) Although I am not an medical or phsychological expert of parenting, they wanted my approval about their parenting styles, strategies, and practices as they approached me as a top of the hiearchy considering my researcher position. They saw me as the one who knows whether a specific parenting practice is right or wrong. (2) On the other hand, they wanted to intervene in the questions and the topic by sharing extensive details and techniques about their parenting practices by subtly implying my lack of knowledge in parenting.

On the other hand, my gender identity did not cause any significant problem. Instead, I always felt that for both mothers and fathers, it was a comfort to talk to me. As I mentioned before, when I noticed the anxiety in attitudes of my novice respondents, I told about myself and my family. Besides my academic identity, I wanted them to know that I do these interviews as a young woman who witnessed her parents' dilemmas about parenting. Additionally, my age didn't become a problem. I was twenty-five years old in 2018 while conducting the interviews. Even though I was much younger than my respondents, my academic identity always came forward and made the age gap less important.

2.4 Limitations and Strengths of the Study

This study has its specific limitations like in every other study. Firstly, interviewing with 15 professional middle-class parents may not represent the parenting universe fully. It is somehow true, but this study does not claim to give a whole representation of professional middle-class parenting. Still, it introduces clear insights about these parenting practices.

Secondly, when I started to work on this thesis, I have thought that meeting both with the father and mother of the same family can be beneficial to see the differences and similarities in what they emphasize, what they silence in their practices. This could

have enabled me to see how holding a professional position in the work-life can change and affect how parents in the same family experience parenting similarly and differently. There are only two families that I met and interviewed with two parents. The first reason behind this is very similar what I experienced in my pilot study in 2017: Because when parents think about how their spouse responds to a particular question, they hesitate to see if their answer to that question is consistent with their spouse's response. In my pilot field study, two different parents told me, 'Of course, I don't know what my wife would say but (…)'. That is, when parents consider what their partner thinks about the subject, they may tend to remain silent about the subject, not to say more. Or they may tend to distort both their memories and experiences to talk about something parallel to what their spouse says. The second reason is about the pace of their work life. Setting up the interviews were hard because they all have been busy almost all the time. Even the mothers who paused a break in their careers, they tried to keep up with the daily schedule to pick up the kid from school or medical doctor appointment. However, even it seems a limitation to me, during the interview, they always mention a point about the parenting experiences of their spouses. Simply because, when my respondents think that they do a specific thing differently compared to their spouses, they reflected what they see and do in their narratives.

Thirdly, I wanted to have much more time with my respondents. To see what they do in a day and how they spend time and how they manage time in a house could have been perfect for me. However, I didn't visit them in their houses except for one family. An ethnographic study could have certainly given the details that do not come out during an interview. But at the end, I chose to interview as my primary research method and to consider my time limitation for this master's thesis; I should say the ethnographic study could have taken a lot of time.

As the last word, I want to say I am fully aware of that parenting practices in all class are changing but the way this change happens to differ from one class background to another. My main task here in this study to show how this relatively small group of professional middle-class parents construct their parenting practices and experiences parenting in the midst of their professional work life and intensive parenting ideology.

In the end, the main strength of this study discloses itself: the studies that consider both mother's and father's parenting experience from a similar/ different class backgrounds are rare. I address its contribution, starting from introduction to conclusion chapters.

CHAPTER 3

PROFESSIONALIZED PARENTING THROUGH CLASS AND GENDER DYNAMICS

In this chapter, first, I start with the section of understanding parenting. This section gives a brief background to the concept of parenting and to look at how this concept can be considered with mothering and fathering at the same time. Without a doubt, a serious historical analysis exceeds the limits of this thesis. However, discussion on this concept and its intersections with mothering and fathering can present an idea of how the evolution of concept is deeply related to middle-class ideal family ideology and especially mothering. This section is not grounded on the in-depth and historically sequenced analysis of the concept of parenting, but rather it introduces a pathway to evaluate what comes in the following chapters. Second, I individually consider middle-class parenting practices to understand what they ensure both on the individual and societal levels. The scholarly works mentioned in this section, surely, introduces some observation about the differences in male and female parenting. However, I also opened a sub-section to see what is specific to middle-class mothering and fathering. Third, I mainly focus on the interrelations between professional identity and work-home balance and how it is deeply related to what mothers and fathers attach to parenting. Also, it gives a chance to look at some macroeconomic figures and policies that affect the gendered division of labor in a family. These first three chapters share some overlapping points, but I mainly categorize them based on what I want to emphasize in the particular section. Fourth, an invitation to Bourdieu gives me a chance that how social class operates as a mechanism in which parents are both the objects and subjects of their practices by contributing the construction of their parenting based on how they read the field.

3.1 Understanding Parenting

In the first place, parenting could be understood via how theories about children change and how they are related to the wider society and culture in which they are found (Lee et al., 2014). For Onur (2012), childhood emerged as a consequence of local, historical, and socio-cultural conditions and the interaction between children and these conditions. That means childhood, and the history of childhood is not universal but contextual. Indeed, the history of childhood embodies continuities as well as ruptures. Through the literature, it has been hotly debated on whether childhood is a social and historical construction or not. For Aries (1965), up until the 16th century in the western world, the idea of childhood has not been in existence, in a sense, children were not separate beings who have peculiar existence and needs different than adults. Via his methodology centering on the changing emotions in the medieval age, he argues about the nonexistence of the idea of childhood by demonstrating that apathy and insensitivity to a child were the noticeable emotions of that age. However, Pollock's (1983) methodology asserting that childhood could rather be read with parent-child relationships unlike the contemplations on the childhood, shows the continuity in emotions through the ages and repudiates that parents have been indifferent to the death of a child. In fact, it is problematic to search for the same modern traits of childhood in medieval times and to define childhood as a whole social construction whenever we could not find families' current relationships with children. As Hendrick (2015) states, childhood is a social construction in the way that the meanings of immaturity differ time and across cultures. These discussions about the changing meanings of childhood open up a new discussion on the meanings of modern childhood.

For Zelizer (1994), modern childhood is about how the sentimental value of a child superseded the child's economic value. In the background story, there are four main interrelated changes that go hand in hand with changing meanings of childhood. In a transition period from agricultural to an industrial society, the need for the skilled labor force, changing schooling system, reduced birth rates and women's education are

considered as relevant reasons for the modernization of childhood. According to Stearns (2016), what is counted as modern childhood is mainly built on what the West did and how the rest of the world reacted. However, even that Western influence on modernization takes over the writings on childhood, every country has its own peculiarities that cannot be simply explained with the steps in modernization theory. There is a point certain about today's childhood. Children are no longer associated with their economic value, but rather they represent as non-market exchange relationships, in fact, consumption goods.

Here, another dimension to understanding the value of a child is signed with how child-rearing has become an important issue starting from the late 19th century. Child-rearing has started to be considered as science because children are now psychologically valuable assets as they are the future citizens whose physical and cognitive development should be protected. During the subsequent era, rooted in psychoanalytical theories of attachment and especially Piaget's development theory, Spockian parenting contributed to how children themselves became central to all aspects of life. This child-rearing style was grounded on two main things: (1) the idea of making children creative, kind, generous and spontaneous is not a distant reality but rather if children are treated correctly by taking advice from doctors, experts and books, they can develop perfectly. (2) Maternal indulgence and affection are central to how children can grow as healthy individuals. Therefore, what is uncovered, the main idea behind that natural and intuitive aspect of mothering is added to mothers who ask the doctor and ensure their children's development.

Hays (1998) interpreted these developments and changes in the value of a child and the meaning of childrearing as what fuels intensive mothering ideology. She says that mothering is equal to child-rearing since the 19th century onwards. The construction of this ideology lies behind very complicated interrelations, but, the essential components are the changing role and function of the family. As wage labor replaced the family economy and women's domestic labor was differentiated from men's wage labor during the transition to the capitalist economy, women are started to be associated with the home which is an alternative to illnesses of the outside world.

While women become the primary caretaker and decisive agent in raising the future, mothers' lives are occupied with thoughts on how to treat and discipline children in the best proper way possible. Here, understanding Hays's concept of intensive mothering ideology is crucial simply because it uncovers how abovementioned changes are central to comprehend the proper approach to raising of a child by the majority of mothers. Spending enormous time with children and investing them financially and emotionally are the main characteristics attributed to this ideology. Even that this ideology is not responded by mothers in the same way, as Arendell (2000) says, it is the normative standard by which mothering practices are evaluated. Therefore, child-rearing has tremendously been a concern for mothers. What Hays (1998) particularly states that even that this concern cross-cuts different class positions, racial and ethnic backgrounds, how mothers accommodate and resist this ideology changes based on interrelation between mainly gender and class position. The middle-class mothers, as her locus, prepare their children for their future class positions and provide them the necessary cultural capital as to differentiate themselves from the mothers within the lower class milieu. While Hays discusses the dimension of today's child-rearing ideology, she reveals mainly the class and gender aspects of child-rearing. However, what Hays suggested that intensive mothering ideology contradicts the self-interested gains of mothers in market-driven culture. Simply because, the language of market persists on that the rationalization and individualization of all aspects of life, mothering is about nurturing and loving the children unconditionally, whatever it takes. As middle-class mothers invest in their children, the main question turns out to be how they balance work and home.

Parallel to Hays' point, Furedi (2008) comes up with the notion of parenting, through which we can understand gender aspect, in particular. He distinguished this notion from child-rearing and being a parent. As Smith (2010) validates him, parenting points out the break off from the natural aspect of being a mother or a father but rather the sum of instrumental and technical matters to handle children effectively. Therefore, fathers are also invited to stage as parenting transcends mothering. The question is whether intensive mothering ideology fades away or reconstructed in a different form. The concept of parenting, as seemingly gender-neutral rhetoric, results in two things:

(1) an invitation to fathers as to be more involved in parenting, (2) concealment of the fact that mothers are not liberated from their duty to be the primary parent. The evolution of this concept simply puts the professionalization of child-rearing and its relatedness with both genders.

From the 1960/70s onwards, degendering of work was shaped by and shape the rising women labor force participation; another discussion appears: second-shift. The bind of women's wage labor and domestic responsibilities were focused its relation to how men take part in parenting. As Hochschild and Machung (2012) observe, in some American middle-class families, fathers are more hands-on so that their wives can continue to work. However, they state that the idea of having-it-all mothers who can perfectly run the household and work outside the home simultaneously reproduce the traditional mother and father images. As mothers feel stuck in between work and home life, the individual responsibility takes over and make them feel they're the only one who can do two things at the same time. Whereas mothers are exposed to the mixed logic of nurturer and maternal employment, fathers are considered as more like a figure invited to parenting. Despite new fatherhood ideals and 'hands-on 'model, McMahon (1999) shows that how new fatherhood manifests itself as an amalgam of narcissistic consumer and male nurturer. Surely, there is evidence that modern childhood magazines now address both fathers and mothers by naming them as parents (Sunderland, 2006). Yet, the contradiction between who parenting roles and work-life seems to reshape the older binary oppositions once more.

Today, parenting signifies that child-rearing is not a generational responsibility anymore. Rather, it is about raising a child by her/his own and mostly who raises the child despite the work-life responsibilities is the mother. The change in the rhetoric, from child-rearing to parenting, signifies that it is all about parents. Either choosing poorly for a child or letting her/him stray from a path is a parental responsibility. The more parenting becomes an excruciating task, the more it is open to discussion with its many aspects from class, gender, work-life balance, cultural variances, risk, consumption, infant-care, and many more. Why it becomes a hot topic simply lies in: it is about doing something for children. To understand what it ensures, one needs to

look at its specific aspects. How parenting is shaped and how its effects erupt in work-family-gender relations, I start with a particular aspect of parenting 'the class' and its interrelation with gender. Therefore, for the aim of my thesis, I look at middle-class parenting and its gendered dimensions.

3.2 What Middle-Class Parenting Ensures

Middle-class parenting is a very broad term, and middle-class parents are not a homogeneous group. Firstly, different fractions of the middle class can be considered. Generally, a differentiation between middle and upper (named professional or new-middle in accordance with the emphasis aimed) levels are made throughout the literature. Secondly, middle-class parents can involve single parents, foster parents, and many other parents who come from a different social or ethnic background. Thirdly, motives behind middle-class parenting are various, ranging from social reproduction to protecting the child in an uncertain world. Fourthly, middle-class parenting is deeply gendered as gender plays an important role in how parents do attach meaning to their parenting.

In this section, I consider middle-class parents mainly from an upper-middle-class perspective, but, especially for Turkey, I do not aim to differentiate one from another because of that the literature is somehow lack of enough studies focusing on upper/professional middle-class parenting. I also address mainly married couples, not a specific group of single parenting, but surely, I mention how different variances affect gendered experiences of middle-class parenting. Then, I mainly deal with the motivations, including 'investing by consuming' by following Hays' argument on intensive mothering ideology and how it expands to fathering now. Without a doubt, gendered experiences are central to my evaluations.

One of the most ground-breaking works on how cultural logic operates differently according to families, Lareau's (2011) work is vital to understand the reproduction of social class position and structural inequality in society. Expanding Hays' argument, she says that middle-class parents read the field to foster their children's skills, to

schedule their activities, to reason with and hover over them, to intervene in their lives, to cultivate individuality and different skills. What she calls as 'concerted cultivation' is a way for middle-class parents to cultivate their kids' sense of entitlement so they can feel belong to a specific social class position and communicate with others in different institutional settings such as schools and hospitals. What lies behind this cultivating a talent in a concerted fashion is that to prepare children as an active future market agent who can negotiate on the terms, who can bargain to get what they want and who can leverage the advantages created by their parents in different institutions.

As Lareau's work does not use a specific gender lens[9], there are other studies to look at. Friedman (2013) looks at a very specific are of competitive after-school activities and how parents' decisions impact the social structure across generations. How middle-class parents try to cultivate competitive kid capital, what expresses the specific characteristics of middle-class parenting is, how these parents handle the insecurity and fear of falling behind by leveraging these activities to provide their children for entry to upper-middle-class life.

The main theme of social reproduction and mobility reveals itself in several other studies, mostly focusing on the interrelation between changing in the education system and parents' intervention to compensate for welfare state responsibilities. In one of the studies, Brown (1990) defines parentocracy as a political question of whom to educate is now on the shoulders of parents who can choose to invest in child's education or simply not. He states that parentocracy cross-cuts different social class positions, for middle and upper-middle-class parents, it is a way to preserve their class privileges by reproducing their values and rearing active agents of the future who can compete in rational and competitive recruitment processes. In an article by Katartzi (2017), she comes up with that how parentocracy is a way to compensate for hidden privatization in the Greek education system via investing in activities and tutors to prevent

---

[9] Lareau makes some points about the differences between mother's and father's parenting, but the book mainly focuses on the cultural logic of child-rearing. For instance, even though fathers stated that they are involved in parenting, they see their wives as the chief information resource to rely on for any detail in parenting.

downward mobility. In her study, Gillies (2008), also shows that education is a way to construct the special, unique and different child for middle-class parents whose selves are shaped in relation to willingness to differ themselves from lower-class inferiority. Validating all these points differently, Connell (2011) says that commodification of education and child's activity services also cause parents to more invest in their children's education to parenting to market. However, other studies are showing that how middle-class parents deliberately attempt to reject choosing particular private schools to provide advantages to their children (Cucchiara, 2013). Even investing in education practice can differ, the main point, here, is that education is the most important area in which middle-class use any opportunity to guarantee the place of their child in the class ladder.

For middle-class parents, what is more than investing in education is concerning about child's psychological and emotional development as well. Nelson (2010), taking the discussions on enacting parenting to preserve class position, states that realistic concerns over economic uncertainty and fear for the future led parents to plan for success, schools, activities. In addition, how especially professional middle-class parenting is now about over-indulgence in children's lives and securing the children both from physical and virtual dangers. She says that parenting is harder than ever simply because the forms of control over the child have changed, and parents try to navigate their children towards dangers by monitoring, using surveillance techniques. This parental vigilance, in her words, is about how professional middle-class parents enact their parenting based on how they understand the past. Whereas in the past, most aspects of life seemed crystal clear, parents now do not know what to ensure the safety and well-being of their children. Therefore, this is why Furedi (2008) points out that, especially middle-class children initiate into the wider social world by the help and guidance of adults. As what parents think about children and childhood changes, in parallel to Nelson, he tells that adults now define an appropriate form of family in the way that children are the responsibility of a mother and father but not of the larger community. The middle-class nuclear family ideal is also uncovered in what he says because these parents try to use their distinct skills to determine their children's future. This individualization of parenting also brings out how uneducated and unguided

parental behaviors represent a risk to the community and society. From Hays' points onwards, getting help from the experts switch its meaning from making the perfect children to the betterment of parenting.

Two main aspects of middle-class parenting which appear as the sum of investing in child's education and cognitive/ psychological well-being manifest one exact thing: there is uncertainty about the future that arises as a result of social dislocation. This situation shapes how parents think of their children and parenting and also parents themselves a response to this situation by investing in their children. Simply because, parental determinism uncovers the effect of parenting on children's future, so the psychological value of a child is emphasized once more.

In Turkey, even that middle-class parenting has been mostly considered as more educated, high-SES and urban-living parents, especially Kağıtçıbaşı's studies has become very important to understand what middle-class parenting tries to ensure in current conditions of the country. In the first original Turkish Value of a Child study, it is understood that via socio-economic development and increased education, children's utilitarian value decreased while the psychological value of children increased. Based on Kağıtçıbaşı's (2007) family change theory, Ataca and Sunar (1999) validate this point in their studies by saying that emotional dependencies still continue with socioeconomic development while material dependencies between generations decrease. These findings reiterated itself in several other studies (Duben, 1982; İmamoğlu, 1987). In 2003 VOC, it is showed that the psychological value of a child is markedly important. This change in Turkey also uncovered the way parents relate to their children. Whereas a child's autonomy has become more important and valued in urban living, more educated and high-SES parents, it is seen that it is also necessary for children to be successful and employed in specialized jobs. However, relatedness is valued as well as parents do not desire individualistic separation. In the end, while children become assets to invest, parents adjust themselves to these changes. The more the idea that parents should raise and invest in children become widespread, more parenting becomes an issue to be intervened both by the state and NGOs in Turkey.

As Göncü *et al.* (2012) say, both lower and middle-class fractions invest in their children's language education and upper-middle-class fraction also meticulously invest in child's extra-curricular activities. This shows shat as middle-class are more involved in parenting, the idea that children are valuable assets gain more importance. Considering the societal and economic changes in Turkey, based on the motto that the first three years of a child affect a child's life-span development, AÇEV started education and intervention programs to create the healthy, happy and successful children. The middle-class parenting ideal grounded on parents' responsibility and parental investment in the child were disseminated into both lower-class parents to better them and also middle-class parents to strengthen them. These programs are built on one main idea: the betterment of parents-children relations is necessary because from children's language to reading and math skills have a positive association to parents' education level and even parents' rate of reading. As these programs started with the idea that betterment for every child's future both in rural and urban contexts because of emerging social inequalities especially in the urban area, the message sent was the positive correlations between parental competencies and child's development. Without a doubt, these programs have played an important role in a child's education, but as Bayraktar (2011) says, they also constructed an ideal form of parenting. In her study focusing especially mothers, Sevi Bayraktar (2011) says, how mother-child education programs try to create a proper form of mothering based on scientific techniques and discourses of parenting. She states that the effect of these programs on the lower class is transforming the lifestyle and female parenting in accordance with the middle-class ideals. As she uncovers the important characteristics of middle-class parenting, consumptive practices, Bayraktar points out how parenting is becoming about educating the parent, motherhood, children as to transform family in general but also to create a middle-class ideal in particular. This point brings out that the gender aspect of middle-class parenting practices is constructed mostly on mothering in Turkey. When mothers asked why they participated in mother-child education program, they stated that they want to raise their children properly; they want to be qualified, they value education; and they want to find a job, if possible. As AÇEV

created many education programs, including fathers, mothers have always been on the focus.

Therefore, middle-class parenting has been on target. What they simply ensure is to invest in children's development in terms of cognitive, emotional, analytical, and psychological needs. The value of a child appears as very important, and parents react to this change by practicing 'investing by consuming.' However, as seen from general discussions on parenting in Turkey, the way mothers and fathers understand these changes in the value of a child are not the same. As abovementioned studies in international literature do not specifically open up the gender dimension of middle-class parenting, taking into consideration of general discussions on parenting in Turkey, I need to take into consideration gender aspects of middle-class parenting. By looking at how mothers and fathers interpret the need to invest in a child, I also disclose the interrelations between gender differences and the way to look at child and parenting. In the end, both gendered connotations of parenting become on the surface and why/what mothers and fathers do value more in terms of investing by consuming practices, from education to getting expert-advice for the way they parent.

On gendered aspects of parenting, there is a broad, and overlapping domain consists of that the meanings of parenting, parents' relationship with children, parenting experiences, and the social-structural context in which mothers and fathers do parent. Here, on the basis of, how mothers and fathers experience investing in education, activities, expert-guides, and other opportunities is covered. The similarities and differences are also on my focus to understand how gender plays a role in middle-class parenting. The common point is that these are the parents who have more education and income compared to their more disadvantaged counterparts and those who are in the upper levels in class-rungs. Therefore, what defines these parents, either mother or a father is not their wealth but their education and the aspiration to invest in their children and themselves in various ways.

As Arendell (2000) shows particularistic approach to motherhood can open up a way to understand how mothering takes place within specific historical contexts framed by

intertwining structures of class, gender, and race. How middle-class mothers are known for is their particular interest in investing in children's education and activities. In Brown's (2014) article, it is shown how intensive practices of middle and upper-class mothers plays an important role in bridging between the market economy and their kids both by buffering them from the consumer culture in the market and by preparing children for the market, with coordination of schools, activities, and lessons. Why these mothers are tremendously investing time, money, and energy in their children can be explained with the motto of intensive mothering and more psycho-social roots of female parenting. However, for Brown, lack of public policies to support parents and relying on intensive mothering practices intensifies how and why these mothers' parenting practices exacerbate. In another article by Milkie and Warner (2014), it is stated that status-safeguarding including academic, talent-based and emotional investments in children, is a strategy employed by mothers to insert children successfully into the competitive labor market system. What they come up with, unlike what Hays (1998) said, middle-class mothers, do status safeguarding as to form of work to reproduce and improve the class status of their children. Rather being on the market, what these mothers do is not contradictory to unselfish nurturance, but it is a form of self-interested gain, which mothers invest in their children professionally like working outside. Therefore, these mothers do not just involve in school improvement efforts but also observing their children to find out their talent, like in Chua's (2011) well-known concept of Tiger Moms, and also make efforts to reduce their children's anxiety and boost their happiness. From elementary years to adulthood status-safeguarding is what moms do both providing certain advantages for their children so they can be with similar others and pushing the bar even higher so their children can be different and distinct from the similar others. This theme reiterated itself in Aydın and Artar's (2009) study on the teacher-mother role of low SES and high SES mothers and found that high-SES mothers want their children to learn at least one foreign language, to participate in enriching social activities and to be prepared for the future life. This is why they state that these mothers often make school visits, organize the home environment to the needs of their children, help children's homework, and regulate the time intervals for homework and computer games. As Hochschild (2004) says, hyper-symbolization of women that signifies how the feelings of security and

support transferred from the family to wife-mother are now only about mothers. Therefore, as Pugh (2018) states that especially mothers from different class backgrounds[10] are concerned about children's status in insecure and uncertain economic conditions. Similarly, Dermott (2018) shows how mothers continue to do more in household management and parenting in order to balance work-home. In the end, how mothers' connection to larger market forces and needs are central to understand why to invest in their children as to make them flexible, versatile and well-rounded and prepare them to adjust themselves anywhere in the world.

The neoliberal lens has also been used in how middle and upper-middle-class mothers enact parenting. In several studies, different aspects of upper-mid class mothering are taken into consideration. The reason behind their choices is mostly choice and necessity discourse of neoliberal ideology, which conjoins the idea of intensive mothering. There are mothers (1) who refused to vaccine as they think these vaccines can be infective and dangerous for their children health (Reich, 2014); (2) who constantly think how to dress their babies to guarantee their well-being and physical development (Douglas and Michaels, 2005); (3) who concern about how to breast-feed their babies (Wolf, 2010); (4) who desire and consume different modern services, affected by the media images, and participate into consumer economy (Bayraktar, 2014). As Connell (2011) says, mothers are started to be defined as a consumer for themselves and on behalf of their children, both to be a good-proper mother and to navigate their children in the midst of uncertain neoliberal economy. Therefore, middle and upper-middle-class side of parenting in terms of mothering encapsulates abovementioned practices of middle-class parenting. To absorb the repercussions of the market, to prepare their kid as active agents for the market, to be a good mother, and to be involved in the outside world, what mothers do is simply investing in children through consumptive practices.

---

[10] Pugh states that three parents group are consisting of lower-middle-class; middle-class who occupy putatively stable job positions; fairly affluent parents.

For fathers, the topic is way more complex because the traditional bread-winner figure is always engaging in financially investing in children. However, what and how to invest seems like to become a mother's job. What fathers live through these days is confronting the new fatherhood. LaRossa (2012) states that there are several discussions about fatherhood and whether it has changed and been completely new or not. Let alone the historical discussions about fatherhood, one thing is common in today's talks: more involved, 'hands-on' fathers. As the term 'parenting' takes over the literature, fathers' parenting has also been debated mostly in terms of how involved fathers (1) have a positive effect on their children's psychological and behavioral well-being (Cabrera et al., 2007); (2) have a positive impact on their children's cognitive and emotional development (Coley et al., 2011). According to AÇEV's report[11] on Involved Fatherhood and Its Determinant, the most predominant type of fatherhood in Turkey is traditional whereas the category of diligent and exceptional fathers constitutes approximately 13% of the sample. Therefore, without SES or class variances[12], it is seen that participation in physical care is classified as rare, spending time mainly means watching TV together, and spending outdoor time is mostly consisting of going for a walking or visiting a relative. That means, in Turkey, it is hard to talk about hand-on fathers as women are still seen as primary caretakers. Similarly, Milkie and Warner (2014) say status-guarding means mostly aiding women to invest in their education as fathers do not tend to plan future steps. Additionally, Palladino (2014) adds that middle-class fathers can enjoy the advantage of child-care arrangements more simply because their jobs are less precarious. It is not a surprise that it is not easy to find articles on middle-class and fatherhood simply because the middle-class family ideal is grounded on the mother's labor, both domestic and in terms of child-rearing. As in AÇEV's report, irrespective of SES and education level, fathers state that their wives are always with them when they need. Therefore, for men, parenting is not a thing that can be thought of without the mother's participation.

---

[11]http://www.en.acev.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/1_involved-fatherhood-and-its-determinants-in-turkey.pdf

[12] There is general information about the profile of respondents: their education and income level. However, the specific details about the associations between SES and fathering practices are not detailed.

Surely, fathers now in Turkey attribute psychological value to their children and that they enjoy being a father. Additionally, it is said that high SES fathers can enjoy fathering more.

At this point, understanding work-home balance is crucial simply because discussions on paternal involvement revolved around paternal employment. Through the discussion on the man in the midst of work and life, the hegemonic masculinity ideal and intensive mothering are set on the table. This is why I now consider how work-home balance affect parenting and how middle- and upper-class mothers and fathers shape and interpret their parenting during ongoing negotiations between work and home.

3.3 Professional Work, Gender and Class

The question about parenting gender gap is pivotal simply because fathers and mothers do not experience parenting in the same way. For fathers, the main discussion starts with hegemonic masculinities. Simply because, this concept tells that on the local, regional, and global levels, how hegemonic masculinity is constructed in the midst of complex interrelations among these three levels (Connell et al., 2005). Therefore, the first point is why and how new fatherhood ideals cannot be realized considering how gender culture can lag behind gender order.

Across the world, there are many attempts to enhance the paternal involvement in parenting via several amendments and legal regulations. Most of the scholars try to understand the relationship between paternal leaves, working hours, and new fatherhood ideals. According to Hook (as cited in Palladino, 2014), in the countries where access to paternity leave is easier, there is a noticeable increase in paternal involvement in unpaid domestic labor, at least extra 2 hours. Contrarily, she also found that maternity leave can depress the father's contribution to domestic work and parenting. Miller (2010) says that attitudes of employers and colleagues toward paternity leave plays an important role in whether fathers can access to this right or not. In Turkey, five days paid paternity leave is accessible according to 4857 Labor

Law. However, as stated in AÇEV's report, 21% of the father cannot use because their employers do not allow them. Besides, 28% percent of fathers does not even know that there is this kind of right. Although there is a considerable share of men who go on paid paternity leave, the expectation about a man is going to participate in domestic tasks are falling behind reality. According to Williams (2010), even that fathers should comply with the terms of new- more involved- fatherhood and even that the time that fathers spend with their children is steadily increasing, work-life becomes a barrier in front of father's participation into work.

How class and gender intersect with work-life, in this case, for men, is a very interesting story to look at. As Lupton and Barclay (1997) suggest, the new science of the child also includes the development of a model of ideal fatherhood. As abovementioned, fathers' role in parenting, and their impact on a child's development have taken place, so this new hand-on model with more care and affection was introduced. There has been discussed different aspects of more involved fathers: (1) fathers in England are the most involved one compared to three generations (Brannen and Nilson, 2006); (2) fathers in Japan who take more responsibility in child-care via state support and who feels the guilt because of work-home separation (Futoshi, 2007) (3) fathers in Latin America who were dislocated by neoliberal economic restructuring and who try to find a job as to fulfill the requirements of masculinity (Viyoga, 2001). What is interesting is that the emergence of new masculinities, work-focused type, new fatherhood is one more time constructed in the midst of long work hours, the language of the market, and new ideals about being an involved father. Connell (2011) says that new fatherhood cannot be considered without market relations. In Cooper's two different studies, why and how father's parenting manifests itself in Silicon Valley. In Cut Adrift, Cooper (2014) says that an upper-class father is so concerned about his children's future as he considers them as a project. The discourses of anxiety and uncertainty surround him as he doesn't feel secure with 7-figures earning. For this father, investing in their children's education and future can only be possible with upscaling, more and more investment just in case. In another study, Cooper (2000) discloses the way fathers think and perceive parenting is not independent of how they do interpret the tasks at the workplace. The new masculinity, which is working hard;

managing time efficiently; having enormous control over work incorporate into private life. Therefore, how these fathers' parent is inseparable from what they experience at work. In a recent study, Beşpınar (2016) validates this point by showing how professional middle-class fathers in Turkey think of fatherhood as a work task to be handled effectively and efficiently. As she emphasizes new fatherhood, the newness does not just result from that these fathers do not want to like their own dads and do want to protect their children from the language of the state, but also it is associated with these fathers plan their parenting in compliance with their work attitude. Therefore, as I discussed in gender and middle-class parenting part, whereas mothers are automatically associated with tasks about child-rearing from education to dressing, how professional middle-class fathers think of investment in children is very similar to their work ethic which necessitates self-development, self-investment, and performance. Here, without a doubt, class reproduction also plays a vital role in their minds as they forge security and make financial plans for their children. This simply shows that even new fatherhood ideals about care and affection are sometimes challenged by long working hours and full performance at the workplace, the hegemonic masculinity takes the form of masculinity and new fatherhood desired by the market logic, as fathers incorporate their work-life into parenting. This new fatherhood is also experienced as falling back to patriarchal habits (Miller, 2011), the interconnection between especially regional and local market forces reconstruct the masculinity ideal via its articulation into more affective fatherhood.

In Turkey, according to the report named Gender Inequality[13], only 26% of women are employed in professional jobs, and only 5% are holding A list positions like executive and senior managers. By different scholars, it is said that neoliberal export-oriented policies fueled women's labor force participation and even some in some sectors there have been observed of the feminization of certain work sectors, which increase women's labor force participation. However, as İlkkaracan (2012) shows, female labor force participation in turkey should be considered with the rate of labor market

---

[13] https://tusiad.org/en/reports/item/3668-gender-inequality-in-turkey--challenges--priorities-and-suggestions

experience. Simply because, in the urban context, this rate is 20% more compared to female labor force participation figures. In other words, this can be explained with how women quit their jobs because of their domestic labor and active participation in child-rearing. As Kaya (2008) states in her thesis, professional women in Turkey even plan their pregnancy in order not to interrupt their work schedule. It seems that being employed in a professional job, again for women requires a professional approach to child-bearing. Additionally, their control over their bodies and private life is because of not to be excluded from work life. As women, she says, are not belong to the public world, what these professional women do is planning all the steps in their child-bearing, caring and rearing processes. The project child is uncovered in her study, as well.

Today, the new trend emerged: the opt-out revolution. From the US to Germany, many highly-educated professional women opt-out their career to make a better choice both for themselves and their children. The neoliberal discourse on individual choice leads them to be stay-at-home mothers who closely engage in child-rearing practices by planning every step of their child's life. As Warner (2006) says, while these Ivy-League educated and fat wage mothers quit their jobs, the ones from middle- and lower-class fractions continue to struggle not just in work life but also at home. Whether it is a real opt-out or pushed-out from work life, it is so important to look at what factors contribute to women's career equality in terms of individual and organizational factors.

According to Hochschild& Machung (2012), the only way to build an equal ground for women so they can work outside the home while they can do household chores and raise the child can be possible with men's involvement in parenting. As intensive mothering ideology is speaking of as intensive parenting ideology, it should be considered that mothers do not liberate from their traditional gender roles. The assumptions about how the family after women start to work longer hours and be identified with the outside world, the general concern is about how women can make time for their families and domestic duties. Mackintosh et al. (2014) show that there is no difference between working moms and stay-at-home mothers in terms of child-

centeredness and fulfillment. However, what differs is what these mothers specifically emphasize the challenging aspects of mothering. For stay-at-home middle-class mothers, they said how denigrated is being at home all the time. On the other hand, working middle-class moms insisted that how they are guilt-ridden because of their work life and how they try to handle this feeling by trying to stimulate their children's interests and skills within very limited 'quality time.'

Intensive parenting ideology cross-cuts different class fractions. Its backlash on middle-class parenting is apparent: the willingness to invest in children more as they invest in themselves at the workplace by making a good plan for this investment. However, as the larger market forces challenge mothers, they are stuck in between whether to work or not. All the choices come with a price, in case of mothers and fathers. Gender culture operates at every level of their lives, and how the market is constructed on and articulated to new ideologies of mothering and fathering, it seems that traditional image in patriarchal order remains.

On the other hand, I consider that both mothering and fathering has emancipations and restrictions. It is a mixed bag. As Takseva (2014) says, how consumptive practices of mothers both define, identify who they are, these practices are also the expressions of market logic. These mothers and fathers are not the passive receivers of the market forces, but instead they often reshape, reconstruct, and reinterpret it. They position themselves in and against the market forces, as parenting is not only about children but parents themselves. What is more, parenting is classed and gendered and how parents choose how they want to parent to their child is about choosing who they are in terms of how their class positions and gender intertwined with each other.

3.4 Invitation to Bourdieu

Social class has always been a significant category to understand how people live through daily matters and how they experience a feeling when they confront different situations in everyday life within various institutional settings. This methodologically and theoretically considerable category had also led some discussions on whether the social class has explanatory power in diverse topics of education, family, health,

identity, sexuality, and many more. It has reached out to a point where social class is said to be dead and go away. Most importantly, the use of SES as a compositional index and a specific aspect of social class has come up, and many scholars are studying on parenting, parenting behavior and styles employed SES to show how it affects parenting. Also, many scholars defined the class as a strict category that excludes and misreads the divergences or overlook them all, so they preferred to apply SES to their studies. The explanatory power of SES has faded away. Goldthorpe (as cited in Lareau and Conley, 2008) made a point by showing his disprove with SES index and saying that it is now a synthetic approach that automatically correlates income with education. He also says, unlike its origin as to scale occupational prestige, SES now is a vague category and nothing more than a manifestation of American individualism ideology. Therefore, he and Wright (as cited in Lareau and Conley, 2008) offer a specific class concept instead of putting class as an umbrella category. Wright, on the other hand, offers a more relational understanding of 'social class' not to miss how educational, motivational and cultural accumulation is needed to come to a particular position in a stratified society.

In this study, the social class is used as a descriptive lens, not an umbrella one which explains all. Bourdieu's viewpoint of social class answers the questions- which are as follows how social class operates as a mechanism in parenting in general and parenting practices in particular, how it creates distinctive differences among professional middle-class parenting and those who less advantaged and how social class works as unifying and differentiating principle.

In his article, Bourdieu (1996) looks at how the concept of family has been created, what areas the family encompasses as a category, and how it is a construction and how it constructs itself as an active agent. He explains that how having a family means conforming to the norm and living the privilege and comfort of the symbolic advantage of being normal. Family is an arena where economic, social, and cultural privileges are accumulated and transmitted to the next generations. Within a family, peculiarly parenting and parenting styles ensure this practice and what it equals: reproduction of class values and codes as well as structural inequality in the society. Today's intensive

parenting ideology cross-cuts different class segments, but the way parenting and parenting styles are enacted and interpreted vary according to one's class background. Likewise, social class background is a decisive factor in how parenting works as a coping strategy with the repercussions of market forces.

How does social class operate? A metaphor may facilitate to understand the fundamentals of Bourdieu's viewpoint. Parenting is like building a brick wall. What makes this act possible is applying intensive parenting which connotes the good and healthy and in other words, investing in child to guarantee her future with never-ending sacrifice and by consuming various services to intervene in her education, extra-curricular activities and an opportunity for her cognitive and emotional development. Not to go out of the comfort zone and falls into the category of poor parenting is only possible with investing by consuming. Also, reproducing ones' cultural value and code set in the next generation is included in this what is accepted as good parenting. However, there are some repercussions of building this brick wall: it does not just reproduce one own's social and cultural background but also the structural inequality where everybody's class place is determined. At the same time, the questions of do I perpetuate this inequality and are parenting practices inadequate led to endless fear of being not enough financially and emotionally. That is, classed parenting practices builds a brick wall. Building parenting itself brings building the neoliberal structure as well. Professional middle-class parenting works precisely in this way: this parenting style is an adjustment to neoliberal structure and today's needs. It is the only way to build parenting and parental identity. Moreover, it also regenerates the structure itself. For Bourdieu (1987), in its basics, social class is explained with similarity and distinction. Making sense of a class position, feeling belonging to an environment, making similar talks with similar people in a more homogeneous environment describe similarity. On the other hand, marking territory to identify belongingness as different than any other people tells the distinction. Social class is not a static and durable category but constructed in relations. As Bourdieu says, there is nothing out of social space. Therefore, social class designates one's place in this space where agents actively relate with others.

The components of social class are what generates the practice, that is, to understand professional middle-class parenting practices, one needs to grasp how what constitutes a practice. In this book of theory of practice, Bourdieu (1977) gives 'the elements of practice' to call the Anglo-Saxon world and its analytical worldview. The first constituent, habitus, is durable and transposable dispositions, which can also be defined as a cognitive horizon that generates practice. From upbringing to family background, all these connote habitus. It also constitutes which ways to go and by how. A child who was born to a professional middle-class family has a habitus which determines her possible future education and the choices.

For Bourdieu (1987), the other constituent is the capital. It has two main features: volume and composition. As the third feature, trajectory, the volume and composition of one's capital can change through time. What makes a change in the volume of one's capital is illusio, which drives one to invest in a game- a game metaphor for Bourdieu (1998) - a game that one is interested in to be involved. This investing practice should be understood in terms of the concept of field in which one invests to enter in a field-investing here is the fundamental premise to be a part of a field (can be artistic, academic and other).

Professionalization is standardization of rules and values- like putting them into a frame, a frame which has some indicators determines the level of compatibility of the de facto conditions with the indicators of a standardization process. This standardization goes along with two things: one is that being involved in the decision-making process as an agency. The other is that this agency is under the power tutelage of the structure which sets the rules and values and organizes them in terms of tangled relations amongst different mechanisms and institutions: state, bureaucracy, education, law, and others. Here, how my respondents execute their parenting as 'professionals' can be understood how they construct their parenting as market forces construct their parenting. For these parents, investing by consuming in compliance with professional values is not only leveraging future chances for and on behalf of their children but also, they reproduce their class position as well.

As Bourdieu (1990) says, the agents cut their coats according to their cloth. That is, one's habitus- the system of durable and transposable dispositions- is in direct relation with the field, an arena of struggle (Wacquant, 1998). Therefore, one can practice a thing in the way she wants to, but this practice is not separable from the field- in a broader manner, the social universe. It should be seen that an individual can decide on his-her own, but this decision-making process cannot be severed from the market structure itself.

His conceptualization of class is crucial to understand how professional middle-class parenting can not be easily defined with their position in the relations of production. Simply because, cultural capital is what defines these parents, as their professional credentials make them position in the labor force. This is why, as active agents, these mothers and fathers practice parenting following the rules of the game. To be distinct from the others and to be like the others. As their professions require full devotion in work life, their parenting is also professional involvement in parenting. However, as mothers and fathers confront with this class reproduction processes both in same and different ways, how professional middle-class parenting shapes itself can only be understood through how it is shaped by the market forces, which requires the method set to be a good parent.

CHAPTER 4

CONSTRUCTING PARENTING

In this chapter, I look at how my professional middle-class respondents construct their parenting. To understand this construction process, I introduce their way of thinking about their mothers' and fathers' parenting; their interpretation of past and mixing it with their own parenting style and the effect of work-home reconciliation on their decisions about the way they do parenting. Here, by mainly arguing that the willingness to distance themselves from their past construct, consolidate and reproduce professional middle-class way of parenting. Additonally, I address that the endless trade off between work and home life as this duo contributes to the reconstruction of traditional gendered parenting role on a different level. By using continuity-change perspective, I set forth how my respondents choose to become what type of parent.

4.1 The Impact of Their Own Childhood Experiences on Parenting

In my respondent's narratives, their aspirations to become a different mother and father often went hand in hand with how they remember their parents' parenting. Methodologically speaking, recalling the past may result in distortion of recollections as to create a different narrative of the past. The gap between what is really happened, and which is said to have happened might widen sometime. Even so, total recall is not possible, and the act of remembering overshadows the truth, recalling the past is the only way for the respondents to make inference about how their parents did parenting. What they remember most about their parents may be deceiving as the narratives of who was a parent like are in a way to construct the stories, we tell ourselves and other people. However, it is the only way to understand what values my respondents do attach to be a parent based on individual experiences. Therefore, first, I aim to look at what they remember and how this remembering affects the way they do parenting. From this point, I frame the continuities and ruptures at an individual level. In the end,

I come up with how professional mid-class parenting emerges at the individual level as parents do shape the way they do parenting as parenting means shaping their own subjectivities and do-don'ts of child-raising.

4.1.1 How Are Their Own Mothers and Fathers Like?

How mothers and fathers are remembered is intertwined with each other because one's role in the family tells the other's position. The reason why I discuss the memories of both my female and male respondents about their own parents at the same time is to show their connections with families in which they grow up. Here I start with the depiction of traditional Turkish mothers and fathers in the middle-class family. What differs from one to another is mainly based on the position of the mother in the family. Whether the mother works outside the home or not affect the stories as two different stories have commonalities about gender hierarchy as well.

A traditional Turkish mother is generally identified with housewife role which is a kind of occupation to run and manage home, care for her children and husband. Being a 'good-wife', as an umbrella term that covers unconditional love, support, warm and intimacy, is what makes mothers who they are. Both my female and male respondents tell the similar stories about their own mothers:

> *My mother was a housewife whose main purpose to raise her children and run the household perfectly. A housewife whose main purpose was organizing our life in the best way possible. (Sezgin, 41 years-old)*
>
> *My mother was a typical housewife. To go out to drink or eat something. I mean there was no such thing. This is why we stayed at home together, drink a cup of tea and go out to do the grocery shopping. Naturally, our communication was a way better because she was at home all the time. Maybe a couple of neighbor visits. So, we got along very well as she was this kind of woman. (Ayşe, 47 years-old)*

Another connotation of being a traditonal Turkish mother is not to work outside the home. Although the mothers of my respondents are generally educated, they either automatically choose to be stay at home or make the hard decision of quitting job or drop out of university as to raise the children.

My mother was not working at a job. She has never wanted it. Actually, she was studying medicine. Because she couldn't continue on her undergraduate study, so she decided to drop-out. She has always taken care of us. She took us to extra-curricular activities, swimming, piano, and volleyball. Yes, she was such a good mother compared to other moms at that time period. (Merve, 30 years-old)

I am the only child of my parents. That is why I had such a good connection with my parents but especially with my mother. More intimate and close relationship. My mom quit her job. Since my father was assigned to a position abroad, we shared endless moments with my mother at home in a foreign country (Ozan, 36 years-old)

My mother was a housewife, but she also had an undergraduate degree from a good university. However, she completely quit her job after her children were born. She was unbelievably sacrificial. We have always been together because she was always at home. We did almost everything together, shopping, visiting neighbors and doing some stuff at home. (Melis, 35 years-old)

Here, recognizing the explicit heuristics in these depictions are important because it gives the detailed profile of a mother. A sacrificial housewife whose main duty to is to take care of kids, spend most of their time with the kids, devote herself to children' needs and wants. As opposed to the outside world and work life, mothers generally mean home. All the joys and burdens of life at home belong to mother because it is both a gift and responsibility of being a mother. Here, why they are responsible to be a mother can be explained with the absence of father. As father work outside the home, come back tired after a long work day, or be away from home because of work duties, mothers need to be at home. Besides, mothers find parenting joyful and full of pleasures, so they are seen as more intimate and open. At this point, how fathers are remembered need to be taken into consideration. Once more, both my female and male respondents describe their fathers similarly:

He was working for two early morning shift, two shifts afternoon and two-night shifts. So, that's why he had not enough time for us. When I was a child, he was really taken care of me but after he did start working shifts, and effort to buy a house and to gain more and more money. He had not spent time with us. We didn't go to the cinema, theatre or anything together. (Sezgin, 41 years-old)

He has always come back home at around 7-8 pm. He left home early in the morning and came back at evenings, exhausted and worn-out. Actually, he loved to cook. But my mother always cooked for us. Anyway, he was giving a hand to make the salad or maybe clear the dinner table. Sometimes, he even brought our dinner to our feet. On the weekends, my mother was always insisting to go someplace, a park maybe. I remember that my father had not enjoyed those times. He was somehow forced to

come with us to the park. He was there. I mean physically but he was not in the picture. At nights we were eating together, sitting together then we had to sleep so we couldn't share almost anything. He was like a father who sits on the couch, watching a football game on tv, he was that kind of father. (Merve, 30 years-old)

According to many different scholars, what defines 'the fatherhood' is physical and emotional distance; avoidance from open share and what maintains this image is the authority, protection, discipline and representing the family (Ayçiçeği-Dinn and Kağıtçıbaşı: 2010, Sancar:2009, Sunar :2002). In similar way, here, the father figure is described with his general absence, remoteness, reluctance. As they are involved in parenting time to time, their presence is kind of guest-like. He is much talked of and real but occasionally seen, like an imaginative person. This is because a father always has to work and during the leftover hours within a day, he may give hand to preparing the dinner or participate in weekend activity. Either he does not show up in an activity or social life with the kids or he rarely engages with opposite-work activities.

On the other hand, in some of the narratives, fathers appeared as a more involved figure in parenting. This involvement does not include a real physical and emotional connection but rather it is kind of a participation as an outsider to parenting. Even the wide space between being an involved dad and being a hard-working bread-winner man does not disappear, some of my respondents stated that their dads read the popular parenting books of that time to understand the nature of children, child-raising and child psychology. In Ozan's story, he states that his dad at least put effort to understand what parenting is about compared to other dads at that time:

> *My father was a really good dad compared to other fathers in those times. He once told me that he read different books on child psychology, child-care, and parenting. He, at least tried to improve his parenting. (Ozan, 36 years-old)*

The outsider-within role of fathers can also be understood with that the meanings and values attached to fatherhood in their father's generation were more related to their connection to outside world. In other words, as they define their mothers more intimate, sacrificial, close and a bit authoritarian from time to time, they describe their

fathers as more rational, reasonable and plausible. For instance, a father seems like a figure who reason with the kids by explaining why they go back to home:

> *When we have to go back home from a visit, let's say, my father had always told me-okay, we need to leave now because we're going to go bed and have a sleep and get up early. He was explaining to me the reasons why we had to go back to our house. He was reasoning with me. He was always so plausible. While everyone told him that 'she is just a child so why are you insisting on reasoning with her' 'you should just say her what to do', he didn't listen to them. He was a different father. (Büke, 34 years-old)*

When we were talking about the position of a mother that she holds at home, all my respondents told me about their mothers the same thing: a bit more authoritarian mediatory position. This means, when my female and male respondents try to get permission, they first go and ask their mothers:

> *My mother was way more authoritarian. I usually asked for permission from my mum. She, then, was opening up the issue to my father. If I tried to get permission from my father, he usually did not say no. (Ahmet, 35 years-old)*

> *I always asked my mother for permission. My brother still asks my mum for permission Then, my mother delivers to our father. But in a way if my mother says yes then it is a yes. She always told me that you go and get it done but beware that your father does not hear that. That's weird because now I see that my father knew everything. An invisible authority. He was not that rigid, but my mother tried to maintain my father's authority. Probably it was not working but still… (Merve, 30 years-old)*

These stories uncover one common thing: all these mothers take on a mediatory role between children and the father. Generally, a father matches with the authority and power within a family. However, in the absence of a father, mothers switch to the authority figure because that mothers' construction of self is only existent and possible with being an extension of father's authority. Even if a father is not remembered as authority, the constant effort to create this image is because only with this image mothers gain power in the family. However, this does not mean that mothers are passive receivers but on the contrary, this is a bargain with patriarchy as mothers make a space for themselves. Here, this relationality shows the regulating and organizing principles in mother-father relations. Mothers are seen as more authoritarian, non-dependent and in a way a piece of home, a collection but not a separate self. Yet,

fathers are the doors opening to outside world where one becomes the agent of his practices and follow self-interested gains.

Similar depictions of traditional Turkish mother also show itself in families in which mothers go to work. In these families, despite full-time-working mums, moms are the main care taker and still seen as main authority figure. The difference from the abovementioned families is that these mothers are not depicted as housewives. Yet, the position of a distant father reiterates themselves as fathers do not want to be involved in parenting the child. This is why a working mom also tries to build authority to fulfill the void of father. The subtle message is the authority belongs to the father. Like in a traditional patriarchal family, the rank and status of a mother seems lower than father. As the image of a father is consolidated each and every time, what defines mothers and fathers is their relationality where their selves are formed together. As this father tells:

> *What I can recall from my childhood is, my mother was a figure that arranges and organizes everything. By this, I don't mean household chores but rather my mother was looking like the main authority figure. Maybe it is because of my father's character. He didn't simply involve in parenting stuff. So, my mother possibly wanted to fill my father's void. Retrospectively speaking, now I understand why I have been treated harshly from time to time. Her effort to replace my father's absence in parenting. (Cem, 38-years old)*

Here, I presented a brief overview to how my respondents remember their parents' way to parent. These details are definitely beneficial to understand how the intensions of my respondents to be a different parent compared to their own are related to the way describe their parents' parenting. It is also important to see the continuities and ruptures between their own parenting and parents' way of parenting. Simply because how their interpreted their past based on the memories have effects on their choice of what type of a parent they (want to) become.

4.2 What Type of Parent They Become

At this point, the narratives about traditional Turkish mothers and fathers open up a way to see how my respondents recast their parenting through their involvement with

their parents based on their gender identity. How professional middle-class parenting emerges on the individual level, one needs to understand the self-image, self-discovery and self-occupation and self-making processes of my respondents. Here, what they build as parenting is a parenting identity that signifies how inviting their own parents to the process of constructing parenting form and reform who they want to become. What parents think about their parents is inseparable from how they define the appropriate form of parenting. When my respondents decide what kind of a parent, they want to become is about how they want to raise and treat their children. The interpretations of past differ by gender because my female respondents generally idealize the best parenting looking at their mothers as my male respondents try to negotiate on the terms of traditional and hands-on fathering based on their stories. Although professional mid-class parenting is situated as opposed to the past, there are also some characteristics that my respondents still repeat. First, this recasting provides them to differentiate themselves because they want that their parenting should not be the same as that of their parents. Second, the willingness to distance themselves from the past and the specific emphasis on individuality, self, independence, and intimacy in terms of their parenting manifest and consolidate the proper class behavior of professional-middle class position. In this section, I start to do reveal change and continuities between the ways of parenting compared to their parents by specifically focusing on the values attached to individuality/ relatedness and intimacy and distance.

A traditional Turkish mother who is at the sacrifice of her own needs, what my female respondents see as proper and ideal parenting is not like their mothers' who choose not to work when they came to across road whether to continue to work or raise children. In her narrative, it appears that not giving up the aspiration of being a full-time mom who have a life of her own shows how determined she does not want to be like her own mother:

> *My mother told me that you will not quit your job and we can do anything for you so that you can continue working. I grew up with this. Now, I have some hard days. I mean with 2 kids; it is so hard, but I haven't even thought of quitting. Even that we can survive at the same standard without my wage, I don't even think of it. Sometimes I think that I am still dependent upon my mother's opinion and I don't want my kids to be like me. I think that I have become dependent because they did everything for*

me, on behalf of me. When I first come to Istanbul, I experienced that struggle even that I didn't go through something like this in Europe. Istanbul is way harder than Europe. At that time, I told myself that if I were a child of a working mother, I could do many things by myself and I could be alone with myself. I could have developed my skills to survive anywhere if I were a child of a working mom. (Melis, 35 years-old)

For Melis, being alone with yourself means the opposite of dependency. Also, having a working mom automatically associates with growing up as more independent individual. In her mind, working mom provides a more positive role model whose children had to take responsibility of her/his own. This is why Melis continues to talk about how she makes an effort to encourage her daughter's interest to play by herself. Simply because independent play is one of the first steps to strengthen her identity and provide herself the chance of dealing with her issues by herself. So, what she does is:

I try to not to repeat what my mom did to me. I encourage her to do everything on her own. She is now 4 years old, but I pushed her to play alone even she was at the age of 2.

In another narrative, Merve mentions a similar point that how she is persistent to not to quit her job to raise an independent kid:

My mother gave up on her career for us, to take care of us. This is the only thing I do not never ever do. I don't give up on myself. I was telling myself even before I had a child. I was asking myself what if I will change my mind after I have my daughter. No, it didn't change at all. Okay, maybe I will not that forge ahead in my career and this Ph.D. process will expand. Whatever it takes, I will do this job, for me and my child. I can better understand how important it is to be a working mom so that you can raise independent kids. (Merve, 30 years-old)

The decision about continuing to work remarks on the relationality of parenting. My respondents' desire to distance themselves from their own mothers' parenting is related to their willingness to participating in work-life have an influence on how they want to raise their kids. Cultivating individuality in kids also necessitates mothers to hold on their professional careers. In this manner, being a working mom consolidate and reinforce the most defining aspect of professional-middle class: individuality. Therefore, it ensures the professional middle-class parenting and its values.

As children can see her/himself as a separate individual for the first time at around 8 months old, these mothers are aware of the importance of raising independent children who can content to have a life of their own. In another attempt by Deniz, she simply tries to take measures to help her child feel more individual and secure. As her boy is getting the school bus by himself, that seems one of the ways to avoid him descending into clinginess in the future:

> *Now, he gets on the school bus by himself. I observed many families; they don't let their children get on by themselves. I do try to retreat from my child's life at some points. If he can make it by himself, so I should not intervene in his life. I continuously ask myself what I can do more to strengthen his individual side. I want him to develop inner discipline and resilience, and I want to see this mechanism work in his life. Or I want him to go to a summer camp in the next years by himself. I see my duty as a medium in his life to enable him to get all that he needs. I have to stop myself when the right time comes and retreat from his life. (Deniz, 39 years-old)*

Her response to intensive parenting ideology is not to comply with its demands like making everything on behalf of a child. But rather, sending her son to a summer camp by his own is a sign to fight against this ideology. What these mothers do not want to do is not to know the right time to retreat from the child's life. Otherwise, it may cause a problematic child who is not an individual but a dependent upon a mother. Moreover, making a child who need to be an autonomous individual and demand a personal space is bother manifestation of professional middle-class parenting.

This also shows itself in another narrative by Melis who try to distance herself from the past means because to be a working mom who can raise independent child. Cultivating child's individuality is not a main concern for fathers, as Melis talks about how her husband reacts to her behavior towards their daughter who get her clothes dirty. Here, the point is, in Melis's mind, letting her daughter get dirty is not about intervention but she just wants her to learn this individual skill. She wants her daughter to be suitable and favorable in middle-class setting:

> *I am way more concerned about what she is going to wear the next day or how do I do her hair. My husband is really an easy parent. I don't want my daughter to go out*

with stained clothes because there are three people in our house to take care of her. If I were anyone else, I would think that this kid has a neglectful parent. My husband always tells me to let her alone and let her do anything she wants. He sees it as an intervention, but it is not. I want her to learn not to be lazy. I want her to learn to change her clothes when it is stained or torn. I want her to behave like this in any other matter in her life. (Melis, 35 years-old)

For her, it is not just a disgrace as her child appears with dirty clothes in front of everyone but rather her individuality, somehow, matches with own kid, as kids' individuality is a testimony to competence of mother. In mother's minds, self-reliant and self-sufficient kids relate to how they want to be and how they want to raise a child. As Furedi (2008) says, parenting is a way to see how adults construct their lives in and through interaction with their children. It is developing an identity through them. Like my female respondents who do not want to turn out their own mothers, their relationship with their children is not only about their significant ones but also their own.

Here as an interesting point to consider, the assumption that -as the number of households with stay-at home mothers dwindle, the mothers less engage in features of sacrificial intensive mothering- does not come true. Working moms are not figures who are unintentionally identified with housewife roles. Yet, they are also told like stay-at-home mothers who devote themselves to children's life. This respondent narrates almost the same story of a mother who does not let herself alone and how she struggles with similar crippling behavior pattern who do not want to repeat:

My mother has never left me alone. She did not even leave me to my grandparents. She has thought that this was the right way. This really hit me; I just understand because now I can't leave my child alone. I mean no way. Even though I spent many years abroad, my whole going abroad stories were a tragedy. I don't want my kid to be like me. I want my kid to leave to persons whom I trust, maybe my husband or his child-minder. I was told that if you can not separate yourself from your child and if you do not let him develop an individual self starting from the early years of his childhood, so your child will experience every separation as a life crisis in the future. (Büke, 34 years-old)

As they don't turn into their mothers, this does not mean the connection between my respondents and their mothers fade away. In this regard, when she speaks, they Merve

tells me me how she idealizes her mother's parenting in terms of intimacy, affection, love and nurturing:

> *Of course, I will be just like my mother. I always loved doing some stuff with her. I mean I really enjoyed those times just like her. I want to be close to my child as like my mother. (Merve, 30 years-old)*

The need to be approved by one's own parent shows itself these mother's stories. Although they state that they don't generally get child-rearing tips from their mothers because in their times the practices and styles were different, they still seek their own mother's approval:

> *I still get my mother's opinion on some many things. It is so weird I know, and probably there is a psychological explanation of this. I don't feel good when I do a thing without her approval. I mean, I know that her parenting style had its wrongs and it doesn't fit in today's life but still… (Melis, 35 years-old)*

> *I call my mom. I call to inform her about how her grandchild is doing. These calls are not for getting my mother's advice about my daughter. If my daughter gets a bump on her head, I call her and tell what happened. Our family life was built on this. Talking about any matter. (Aylin 36 years-old)*

In the end, we see that there are both rupturures and continuities in the relationship between my female respondents and their mothers. As they fashion their parenting and mostly femininity by sustaining their attachment to mother (Chodorow, 1978), they also want to distance themselves from their mothers. For them, parenting is about raising independent kids because having these kids is shows who they are. Their insistence to continue work life can be explained as how they want to be powerful role models for their children. Therefore, their children can step up to their responsibilities because they take as their mothers as an example. Even I have respondents who have working mothers, they also want to be different and detach themselves from their children so the children can be healthy and functioning individuals.

As for fathers, the story is quite different when it comes to take lessons from the past and to carry the past relationship baggage to present time. Here, it is not a surprise that

fathers do idealize their own fathers because being a father means outside world, individual freedom and autonomy. They want to be like their dads in terms of giving space to their children. In other words, compared to my female respondents, individuality is not something to strive for but rather a characteristic that fathers can easily nurture individuality of their kids. Here, Ali tells a story of his own father and how he is content to happy for being his son:

> *My mother was authoritarian, whereas my father always valued freedom and individuality. Our relationship with my mother was like a traditional mom-child relationship. Simply because my father valued individuality and my mother was always thinking about what the others are going to say. But my father always told me I could do anything I want. My character is very similar to my father, and I am proud to be his son. (Ali, 52 years-old)*

What he says also shows itself in how he treats her daughter:

> *I want to repeat my father's attitude towards individuality. I want to give personal space to my child.*

It is interesting to see that how my female and male respondents value individuality and raising an individual child in a different way. For my female respondents, it is something that they earned with their education and work-life. It is something that they cannot imitate their mothers as their mothers did not choose to work outside or even, they worked, they were neither independent nor individual characters enough. For my male respondents, on the other hand, raising an individual child has not much about their growing-up story. This is why they want to be like their own fathers in terms of valuing independency and freedoms.

How these fathers want to distance themselves from their own past is mainly about the relationship between intimacy and distance, which is much of a topic that varies by gender.Both my male and female respondents state their fathers were not doting fathers, but distant fathers whose presence is passive even at the times their fathers were with them. Being more related and having intimate connection are not concern for my female respondents because they grew up with loving mothers. Nevertheless,

for my male respondents, when they speak about the relationship between closeness with their own fathers and fear of intimacy, they simply say never like my father! An emotional connection is what they look for:

> *I don't want that my daughter is scared of me. I don't believe respect out of fear. I want her to love me. I want to be close to my daughter. She should be able to tell me everything. She should be able to discuss with me on any topic. My father and I had not a close relationship, but the relationship between my daughter and me is/will be different. (Ali, 52 years-old)*

> *I am not like my father. My child is very close to me. She loves me. She comes and gives hugs and kisses. (Ahmet, 35 years-old)*

As they also crave for a physical connection, touch with their children, they do not want to their child to grow up in with a father that hurts and distances himself. According to Boratav, Fişek and Ziya (2017), irrespective of the age of a child, especially high SES fathers express the desire to become more intimate and to show affection and love. As they also added that distant-intimacy issue is much about the impact of their father on their own stories, I reveal the same way relationship. Fathers often invites their own fathers into the construction of their fathering process.

What they also identify themselves as different from their fathers is how much time they (try to) spend with their children:

> *Now I bring my daughter to gymnastics class — two times each week. My father just brought me to the park. I also brought my daughter to a park, and I also watch a film with her. I do these more than my father did for me. I do it concertedly. (Ozan, 36 years-old)*

In this story, more involved fatherhood means driving his daughter to the gymnastic class, picking up her from the class, waiting for her when she is at the class and doing all these in a concerted fashion. The difference he states between him and his father is mostly about assigning time for parenting. The meanings attached to the quality time uncover one thing. Here, spending more 'planned time' with her daughter – no matter the content of planned time- reveals how Ozan does professional middle-class parenting. In other words, even if he drives her to the gymnastic class for her physical

and emotional development (an advance investment in his daughter's social capital), it seems that this way of spending time is about fulfilling the demands of middle-class parenting.

To sum up, what mothers and fathers concern about their children is associated with how professional middle-class experience vary by gender, which mothers and fathers differently interpret their own parents' parenting style. As mothers mostly spoke about their mothers, they insistently state their willingness to be a working-mom who values individuality and independency in their lives and in their parenting as well. For them, individuality is a characteristic to be gained to become an independent human-being. Also, they think that their mothering is a testimony to their child's capabilities and individual characteristics, their willingness to distance themselves from the past involves both their concerns about themselves, their children and their effort to be a different mother. Although the change of woman's position is what makes the difference in parenting story, I also displayed that the belonginess and continuity maintain as female respondents still care about what their mothers think. Professional middle-class mothers are mostly detached from their families in financial terms, but emotional connectivity is still existent. On the other hand, as fathers value intimacy and closeness more, the boundaries of their involved fathering seem limited. For them, what lies behind 'never like my father' is much more about affection. The issue of quality time is a bit confusing because in Ozan's narrative, I show that quality time doesn't mean a full engagement in parenting in terms of its all aspects from getting her daughter to sleep at night to thinking about what she is going to wear next day. In this manner, man's involvement in parenting is still in compliance with normative gender order and it still show a slight difference compared to woman.

4.3 Reconciling Work and Family

During neoliberal transformation, paid work and maternity is seen to be reconciled. Also, new hands-on model of fatherhood appears and masculinity is seen to be in a crisis as aggressive work focused masculinities undermine the ideals of new fatherhood (Connell, 2011). When the regional and global gender culture spreads the

traditional type of motherhood and fatherhood, parents find themselves in a dilemma where they are challenged with regional form of gender culture provides materials that can work and adjust itself to the global arena (Connell et al., 2005). When all these levels confront for and against each other, parenting appears as a deadlock. To resolve this deadlock, my respondents develop individualized and characteristic coping skills. The meanings of being a good mother and a father are constantly changing as parents negotiate on the terms and conditions of work life. For mothers, deserting their jobs, toning down their career or opting out success turn out to be defining features of their professional middle-class parenting experience. For fathers, work-home life balance is made up of personal concerns especially how to plan their time effectively and schedule their work programs. Simply because the best use of time is the prerequisite to fulfill the requirements of work and home life altogether as fathers' work identity continues to be stronger. Here, the coping mechanisms, the strategies and the justifications uncover how all these are closely related to hold a middle-class position.

4.3.1 Becoming Working Women

The mothers I talked to consistenly says how challenging it is to reach out to the goal of being a good mother who have a life of her own and still do anything for her child. However, as mothers find themselves in a conflict with work life, how they do a way to reconcile is mostly compatible with the neo-conservative family model: mother tone down and pause their careers. The first story I share is about that: although fathers are more involved in parenting, mothers are still more anxious compared to fathers. If this anxiety is not soothed by a father who gives hand a mother in daily life, mothers start to consider work-life balance. Here how she says:

> *Let's say I have to work overtime. I call my husband and tell him that 'I am going to get home late today, so can you please get home on time?'. He tells me the children have the child-minder with them. He tells me that there is child-minder in our house so why are you so bothered with this. Just relax because I can't be bothered' — this kind of dialogue. The children are alone at the house. Of course, we have a child-minder but still. I mean, how can I be relaxed. (Deniz, 39 years-old)*

My respondents' husband does not seem bothered as much as Deniz. As the concerns multiplied and the burden can not be born any more, what she says to me that how she decided to pause a break:

> I couldn't find a mid-way between home and work. And there is my husband who doesn't bother with anything at all. When I decided to quit my job, he told me that 'you are exaggerating this too much, there are so many working-moms out, and they bear the burdens.' He didn't accept my choice. Because we have similar mind-settings, I mean, both parents should go to work outside. The fact that I am at home right now really bothered him. He took it personally, and he made it a matter of social status.

Interestingly, as his husband sees her as an extension, a manifestation of their social status, she also considered return work life. Being married to a woman who stays-at-home and who exaggerate the mothering stuff is not what his husband expected. Then, what she says to me is that:

> Now I'm actively looking for a job. I understand that this is not the life I want to live. I spent good times with my kids. I took care of them a lot. So that's enough. I feel like I have no right to continue this career break. I feel like I have to return. Now, all the burdens are on my husband's shoulder. I don't have this kind of right. But how are my kids going to be? I mean I don't really know.

The feeling of holding the husband as a sole financial responsible in the family also bothers my respondent. However, what Deniz feels is not only about her image in his husband but also in her children. One of the things behind is the anxiety knocking my respondent's door as being a stay-home-mother does not serve as a role model to a child. To be able to give the message that 'look, I do go to work every day like you have to go school, I do spend time alone and with my colleagues like you do with your friends and in the end of the day we'll be together to talk about the day', this respondent believes in going back to work is a must when the time comes- a must both for a mother and her child:

> Both for myself and my children. I want to be a role-model for them. How can a stay-at-home mother be a role model? Everyone has something to do in this life. Me as well. I have a concern about myself. Not just about my children. The feeling of 'I have to do something as soon as possible.'

As Deniz tries to handle her anxiety which is taken into a new level with her child, what Melis tells me uncovers how she handle the guilt-ridden feeling as she did not choose to give a break to her career:

> *Every time I feel the guilt when I think about 'did I spend enough time with my kids,' I always want to believe that they are going to be resilient, strong, and independent. They are going to be stronger than me. I want to think in this way. Otherwise, it is so hard to swallow this guilt. (Melis, 35 years-old).*

As she tries to reinforce the individuality of their children with her deeds and choices of being a full-time mom, self-interested gains start to contradict with unselfish nurturance. She already does not prefer to turn out to be like her mother. Yet, surely, spending time with children is indispensable as to socialize child in the way they want. However, professional work life is not an easy road. Long hours of work, regular travels, academic meetings are always on the table. This is why she tries to justify her preference about what kind of a mother she wants to be. It is not only about being a full-time mother can foster her children's individuality, but it is also about not being like other mothers who reside in the same gated community. The general tendency of opt-out amongst upper class mothers who are gradutes of top-notch schools in Turkey is not a choice for Melis. She believes in self-fulling prophecy:

> *I know within two or three years; these children are going to have a life of their own. We're going to be separated. So why do I quit my job, then? I don't want to be at home all alone. I don't want to go to yoga classes or open e-trade company. I told myself I don't want to do these, but I want to continue to work.*

It is very similar to what Duncan (2005) says for the mothers from England, called as gentrifying partners, are the ones who consider full-time employment as a part of good mothering. Additionally, as Melis didn't not pause her career because she matches good mothering and paid-work, she confronts the reality to tone down her career. When a mother sacrifice time, emotion and money, there is again another price of this sacrifice: career trajectory. First, if a mother prefers to continue working, the first repercussion is voluntary retreat from chasing a better position in job life as everybody

endorse the value of being a mother and let go of work life stress. For Melis, being a mom of two kids is a kind of consolation whereas the agony of being replaced by other for a wanted position is so hard to take. Therefore, the option of opt-out career success is on the table:

> *Before I had my second child, I have thought that I want to promote to A+ position at work. Now I give myself time. I look at other people; they continue to work until their 60's. I mean for what? It is very tiring working in the banking sector. I have enough time to promote to A+ position until my retirement. Within three years or 5 years. Does it matter? I'm going to reach that position one day. But I regularly think that what if somebody replaces me at work. Then I know that I will go through an emotional breakdown. But at the same time, I tell myself I raised two children. This is a thing, right? I have so many dreams about my job my future career because I put a lot of effort into this job. I can't just let it go. Or I will just let it go. My mother tells me that 'you have two kids now, spend more time with them, do not travel this much. Just let it go'. I can't convince myself.*

This mother's resentment is maybe nothing as other mothers quit their jobs for child-raising confronts harder reality: the decline in employability quotient and the danger of stop growing retirement savings account. As statistics says[14], the reason for quitting job- or to suspend career for a time- is mostly because of insufficient child care and it may verify why my respondents decide in this way. But the thing is when they try to go back to work life, they are prone to choose a job which is more flexible and open to negotiate work hours. A professional job in the formal sector, banking in this case, makes it difficult for a mother to balance work-family life. There are some initiatives from public and private sector to promote early childhood care as to aim decrease in turnover rates, increase in efficient working hours, increase in return to a job after giving birth to a first child, decrease in cost of turnover and investment in new employee and increase in promotion of position at work[15]. However, corporate child care in Turkey is still insufficient as Turkey is the only OECD country ranks last where the participation rate of early childhood education is only 2.8%, almost 25 times less than OECD average[16]. If the services are not sufficient as not to liberate mothers from

---

[14] https://tusiad.org/tr/yayinlar/raporlar/item/10255-is-ve-ozel-yasam-dengesi-yolunda-cocuk-bakim-ve-egitim-kurumlarinin-yayginlastirilmasi
[15] Please see footnote 11 above
[16] http://www.keig.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/ErkenCocuklukBakimveEgitimHizmetleriPaneli-Web-1.pdf

the burdens of being a mother, then the way is simply move down in a career where this mother can also make time for their kids, to pick them up or to drop them out.

In the end, whether a mother tones down, pauses a break or opts-out success, a feeling of being-not-enough is inevitable. For my female respondents, this feeling has many aspects. Relationship with the husband, concern about themselves and their career, concern about their children and sometimes spendings on education, they are all interrelated. How a mother can construct her parenting at the middle of work-home balance, it is very complex what she considers about the way she parents. They are stressed out because they often try to catch up a thing: work life, child-care, individual stuff and their connection with husband. In this regard, what Melis states show how female parenting is at the cross-fire. As she even thinks of the reason behind why her daughter has a weak connection to Melis is that she has to work all the time and her husband can adjust his schedule in accordance with child's schedule:

> *Nobody can understand the guilt of being a working mom. I can't be enough. I am not able to be enough. I don't feel being enough. I have to travel for my job. Now I'm on a maternal leave again, but last year I traveled so much. My husband has more time compared to me because he is working as a partner in one of the big 4's. He can work at more flexible hours. I have to work 9/6 or maybe until 7 pm. But my husband can adjust his schedule to the children. He can spend more time with the children. My oldest daughter is so close to his father, but she and I have such a weak connection.*

For these mothers, the extinction of solitude, trying to live in a mess, constantly thinking of one own self, children, husbands, work life, are for real. This is what they go through in terms of work-home interface. They hardly live and they live hardly. The thin line between these two is what uncovers the stories of my female respondents.

4.3.2 Working Dads Have Guilt, Too?

How fathers construct their parenting in terms of work-home balance is a bit complicated story, though. Because fathers consider parenting a professional job, that can be completed effectively with best time management plan. If they are behind work schedule or their social life, the problems emerge. However, for fathers, concern areas are way more limited and peculiar to themselves. The first type of father, here, is that

real work-forced masculinity. This type of father is also involved in parenting, but the priority is to plan everything and gain more money as tuition fees and other expenses are hard to meet. Therefore, they can do a simple trade-off between their ideal of being a good father who spend plenty of time with kids and keeping up the good work. One of respondents, Melih tells me how he frames parenting like a job:

> *Being a father is like that you promote to a position and have more responsibility then. It is just like this. Just like your responsibilities change when you promote a position because up until that point, you do everything for yourself. You do it for your future. After you get promoted, you have people looking at into your eyes. Now you have people dependent upon you. Being a father is just like this. So I mean like at work, I'm going to do whatever I should do. I'm going to do the tiring and tedious part of life. And my wife can simply do the better and more joyful part. She may sit at home; she can be happy and take care of the kids. I mean, just think, it is bliss, right? (Melih, 39 years-old)*

For him, his university educated wife can give up her career, sit at home and care for child because it is his job to take financial responsibility in the family. Although my male respondents state that what they understand from good fathering is being more involved in parenting and child's life, they still live up to the ideal of traditional Turkish fathering. According to statistics, in Turkey, 60% or more men reported that they work 45 hours a week or even more, which is the highest rank among OECD countries[17]. If this numbers are read with that only 44% of fathers[18] can take paternal leave, and this leave is only 5 days for fathers who have new inborns, what Cem says gain importance. As a father of one daughter who is at the age of 1, let alone she speaks of a paternal leave when his baby was born, he often talks about how tiring is going back and forth between home and work:

> *I have almost no time for myself. I think I'm on a different part from this point onwards. I should sleep less to read an article or look at a study. It is so tiring. I can barely sleep at nights. My concentration hit at the rock bottom. My mind is distracted. I always stutter when I'm talking. These are the symptoms I see it in myself. I want to believe these are temporary. Weird. If you speak to my wife, you hear a very different story of parenting. She is going through a tough time. I can't even imagine that — I'm aware. (Cem, 38 years-old)*

---

[17] Please see footnote 1 above (p.7)
[18] Please see footnote 7 above (p.38)

Interestingly, Cem's concern is about himself. How his attention is divided, how he spends some idle hours and how he can barely sleep at nights. However, in this narrative, what comes forward is not whether he can spare enough time to her daughter or not but rather how his life is in an unwanted disruption. As he speaks of his wife, he briefly touches a point that her wife could probably tell totally different things about parenting. Because his wife, a well-known artist, pause a career break to take care of the kid and possibly what she fights for is much harder compared to Cem.

Similar to Cem's story, Kubilay reveals another related topic to time management. When he talks about sleep education process for her daughter, he first tells me that education has worked after 2 weeks after they have started. Yet, on a breakfast with their friends, their child did reject to sleep. Although they have become overwhelmed with weeknights, undesirable outcome of her daughter's interrupted sleep is annoyance. As his wife threatens him to the point that she will give up parenting, what is more appearant is annoyance rather than what his wife said and what her daughter lived through:

> *My wife put our daughter sleep every night, but I check her during the nights. Her mother comes in the morning then feed her. I just realized that I'm the father of this child during this process. But we went to a baby sleep training class for two weeks. Now she developed a sleep pattern. However, in recent times, we went to a Sunday breakfast with our friends. She didn't sleep in the afternoon. It was a disaster. I was so nervous after these two weeks. She was so stubborn, and she didn't sleep. We came back that night. My wife said to me that 'one day you come to this home and you will not find me. You will find this child by herself'. (Kubilay, 35 years-old)*

Up until this narrative, it seems that my respondents consider work-life balance as a professional matter to be taken care seriously, in parallel to Connell (2005) points out for transnational business masculinities. There is also a father that who suffers from feeling of being not enough only because that he has to split his life between work life and family. Here, what disturbs him is only how he could not spend enough time with her daughter. In his narrative, there is only himself and his daughter. It is not like the narratives of my female respondents who live through many concerns simultaneously. What he says to me:

I feel guilty when I see that other dads can have more time with their kids. We have a downstairs neighbor; this man also has a 3-year-old child. He really spends time with his kid, but I am not able to do this. I feel bad when I see them together. I feel upset. Other mothers and father, as well, go to a park with their children. I bring my daughter to a park, yes but my mobile is always ringing. I'm responding to these calls. Work calls. I can't have enough time for her. But I have to pick up these calls, I mean my only job is to provide her everything-financially. (Ahmet, 35 years-old)

This type of fathers also considers fathering as a kind of job. However, whenever they recall their childhood memories of an unattended, super busy father, they may find themselves in a conundrum. In the end, their compliance with requirements of intensive parenting ideology is determined in accordance with their responsiveness to work-home balance. As this ideology is built on time, emotional and financialy investment and also being child-centred, they mainly comply with its financial aspect. As these professional fathers really care their work life, parenting may be a disrutipting task in their lives. The way the do concern is only about themselves and how they lose their focus at the work place. They always do the due-diligence. Parenting is like a real job for them.

To sum up, it is interesting to see how my respondents differently respond to and feel about their work-home balance. The role of feelings in their strategies to reconcile work and home life can be thought with Hochschild's (1979) concept of emotion work and emotion management as well. Mothers incessantly told me that how they feel stuck in between home and work life, as the requirements of professional work (travels, long working hours, and time management) are hard to meet when they try to spare equal time to their children. The feeling-of-being not enough and guilt-ridden feelings are the sum of their uneasiness about how their children are, their concern about their careers, the anxiety about financial independence, the worries about their images both their own and their children's minds. Here, as Hochschild (1979) says, feelings do not pop-up out of nowhere, but rather, social factors affect what people feel and what they think and do about what they feel. It means people work on and manage their emotions. My female respondents' compliance and challenges with intensive parenting ideology show that at any time they try to balance the requirements of professional work and home life, they do emotional work. For instance, Melis worked on her feelings when

she tried to recalibrate her feeling of being-not enough to maintain her career, independency and her mother/women image in her mind. To try not to feel guilty, what Deniz did is very similar to Melis's story but in a different way. The way she thinks about her feelings is very central to her parenting. As she quits her job for her children and wants to return to a more flexible job, how she manages her feelings is a bit complicated.

On the one hand, she tried to overcome the unexpected or inappropriate feelings at a specific time, especially when she could not spare enough time for her children. Then, she quit her job, and she repressed the feeling-of-being not enough resulted from her financial fragility, her image in her husbands' minds and her belief in a self-fulfilling prophecy. The way she tells this trade-off is a constant back and forth between the justification for her toning down a career and her choice to pause a career break to care of her kids.

Being a professional mother is, in a way, means that being a professional parent, as it is uncovered in the next chapter. Here, what Melis did is to transfer the codes of emotion management at their workplace (being a professional also includes control over feelings) to her parenting. The language of the market is built upon its rigid structure and highly professionalized standard, which necessitates a lifestyle in which Melis' self-interested gains have to be way more important than her feelings about the children. The competition in the market is hard and endless. Therefore, she seems to work on her feeling of being not enough in a professional way.

The fathers, on the other hand, do this emotion work via readjusting themselves and their appearing popping-up feelings of being not enough as a result of an imbalance between work and home life. How they do is that they transform their feelings about being a more involved father to the feelings of building financial security for the family. The work-forced masculinity contradicts with the ideals of new fatherhood. It seems that their understanding of being a more involved father transforms itself in line with the needs of work-life. As they try to spend more time with their children, to be

closer and more intimate, but do not want to sacrifice their whole time for parenting tasks, they seem that they really professionally do parenting.

These feelings and endless effort to 'do it professionally' uncover themselves in their parenting practices as well. When reconfiguring how to parent in each time, what they do to secure their class position for and on behalf of their children and to facilitate it with demand-choices by seeking entitlement and feeling-of-being enough, their practices are needed to be considered. The fears and willings to be coerced into investing in children by different consumptive practices display what and how parents share common and different concerns for themselves as well as for their children.

CHAPTER 5

PROFESSIONALIZED PARENTING

In this chapter, to reveal how professional middle-class parents prefer to raise their children in a wholesome atmosphere, which they turn over their parenting to a professional job out of both choice and necessity. Therefore, the four practices: asking the doctor, reading the books and hiring the child-minders, better schools and activities show how these parents continue to construct their parenting by learning to how to parent in the middle of class-confrontations, class-fears, and intensive parenting ideology.

5.1 Ask the doctor!

Expertise, in relation to parenting, gives answers to questions that parents even asked yet. Even experts discover all kinds of problems, even they fantasize about problems that parents never imagined, it is needed as rationalization like in every part of life replace the taken for granted ways of doing things, intuitions and inner know-hows. As parents get advice from experts, books and doctors, one question appears. Why do they need advice to raise a child? There comes a competition of authority. Who do you trust as you raise a child, who has the authority to make certain pronouncements as well as whose judgment matters, my respondents exactly tells me: do what the doctors say. But does this mean they totally turn their back to their own parents' know-hows or put their instincts aside (if there are)? As Kessen (1979) calls child-psychology a cultural invention that moves with the tidal sweeps of larger culture, parenting appears to be a set of skill that cannot be done with instincts. However, parenting reforms itself in line with professional attitude one more time. On the one hand, according to the Research on Family Structure in Turkey[19], only 7.6 % of parents living in urban

---

[19]https://www.tuseb.gov.tr/enstitu/tacese/yuklemeler/ekitap/aile/turkiyenin_aile_yapisi_arastirmasi_2011.pdf

context gets advice from a professional or an expert about a matter on child's problems. In a country where the numbers of parents getting professional counselling or support are very low, all of my respondents speak out their theraphy sessions. Simply because, professional middle-class parenting has its own codes and terms that parents try to comply by bettering themselves.

The professional style, in father's case, occurs in the way that Beşpınar (2016) says for middle-class Turkish fathers who do incorporate the language of the market in their private life. Here, a hegemonic masculinity in display speaks out that fathers are ready to receive help if they have to develop themselves. Ozan narrates his story on why they get a help from therapists:

> *We went to see the therapist one time up until now — a well-known child therapist in Ankara. To know if we do everything right. We go and see this therapist to do self-check. We want to be sure that we're doing a good job as a parent. We just went once because we had no problem so far. But of course, if we confront a problem, we will go again. We are not 'I don't need help' kind of people. You can always see this kind of people. They ignore their problems, and they neglect these problems to the last point. You can confront a problem that you can not solve, and you need to get some help. You should never feel ashamed about going to therapy. (Ozan, 36 years-old)*

Ozan does not want to make a mistake in treating her daughter. He and her wife are not like other families that fighting to get one of the parents or each of them to the theraphy is futile. Simply because, Ozan needs a self-diagnostic to convince himself that everything is under control. Besides, this therapeutic activity for her daughter is not only about the child but mostly about himself. Here, Ozan is like doing performative parenting, in which he wants to be seen and validated by an expert. It is more like he is seeking for a reward in front on everyone and his fatherhood is in display. He is a dad at betterment, a dad who seeks help if he needs to learn the other way to parent his daughter. In this regard, not to avoid going and see a therapist associates with good parenting in Ozan's mind. Besides, he has no concern about sharing this detail with his friends or even me. All these details about Ozan's story once more uncovers how a professional middle father behave in accordance with his

class position as going to a therapist is an activity to symbolize what this parenting is about.

All my male respondents say that they go and see a therapist at least one time in their lives. However, in Melis's narrative, I saw that there can be also fathers who avoid this activity because therapist means that you need help for a problematic issue. As she hides what happens from her husband, seeking a help is way to train herself. This is because raising a child properly means that you can not help your children with yourself, if you have got problems of your own. You have to begin sort things out so you can be a guide to your child through the life. Here is how Melis opens up this:

> *I see a pedagog for my mental health. I see her by myself, and my husband doesn't know this. I didn't tell my husband because I know what he is going to say. He will tell me that 'there is no need, do not treat our children like they have a problem. I want to improve my relationship with my children, and I want to see if there is anything that I can do it better. I do it for my child, but I also do it for myself.*

For other mothers, getting help from therapists is beyond learning motherhood because my female respondents are fully aware that they are the primary parents. Here, intensive parenting ideology surrounds mother once again as mothers are seen more responsive to this ideology that designates women who serve as the primary caregivers. If anything, bad happens to a child, mothers are the first to go and to blame. Therefore, this ideology conjoins and disseminates into professional logic. The idea that everything must be taken care of thoroughly, which they confront during their professional life, shows itself in their parenting as well. This is how Büke speaks about her plans to go and see a therapist in this manner:

> *I haven't seen a pedagog yet, but I go to a medical clinic where psychologists and pedagog also work. So, I should have an appointment and ask the doctor about some issues in my mind. Anything about my child's development. About my relationship with my child. To see what I should do and do not. I assume that I will get consultancy from a doctor. (Büke, 34 years-old)*

These parents want to succeed in their life's most important project 'the children' as they constantly forge ahead with their work life and careers. To anticipate any sign about kids may go off the rail, to start to control child from the first day onwards and

to guarantee child's development, therapy is a must to prepare a child for the future. It is the only way for their children what they describe as 'bright' can be successful at school and in extra-activities. To maximize the outcome, these parents do not avoid go and seek help. Simply because, the evidence of their parenting competence is how successful is their investment in child. However, what differentiates fathers from mothers in terms of seeking help is not the difference in their future goal. The difference lies in how they attach meaning to parenting: for fathers it is a way to learn from stracth, a betterment in their parenting. For mothers, they do already know how to parent and for them it is like add another tool to their tool box. The professional middle-class parenting is about trying to achieve the best. If it is only possible by starting from therapists, so they go and get this help.

5.2 Read the books!

Scientific statements became an ethical imperative as they describe the ways of raising the child as best. To guarantee a child's development, all my respondents state that they read at least one book during the pregnancy, during different development processes of a child. The reasons are several. For fathers, reading is the way to distant themselves from their own fathers who don't know much about parenting. As they want to become more involved in parenting tasks, reading is a learning process for them to understand how to do fathering. It is also a way to see what child needs and how parenting style of typical traditional father can have negative effects on child development:

> *By the help of parenting books, I learned that my child could not understand why I am exhausted, and why I do not have enough time with her. I learned that your child misses you when you're at work, and she/he wants to have moments with you. I learned so many. I tried to apply all these. Even if I am drained, I now know that I have to respond to my daughter's needs. It is my duty to give her what she needs. I learned that she couldn't understand me, but I have to understand her. (Ali, 52 years-old)*

Reading enables this father to learn the right way to do parenting as it also works as a regulating mechanism that corrects father's behaviors. What needs to be taken into account here is that self-helping style books present a certain form of fathering. However, as Wright (2008) says, the impact of globalization upon personal experience

can work the other way. That means, for fathers, realizing that kids need fathers as well, this realization can transform the fatherhood, by introducing a new to be a father. In this regard, in Ali's narrative, it is obvious that responsiveness to her daughter demands is a must because parenting is making the ends to meet not only financially but also emotionally. However, emancipatory feature of this transformation shows that parents are not the passivers in this very game of child-raising, but they are active participants.

For the mothers, reading process is again very much about confronting with the global. As the intensive mothering ideology puts a focus on trusting on scientific expertise, what comes here that idea of raising a child as an individual is also a manifestation of global effects. In her narrative, it seems that French parenting, which is much grounded on the ideal of encouraging independency, this is what she craves for. To be a mother like:

> *I always wanted to be a cool mom. Whatever the cool is. I read a book titled 'Bringing Up Bebe' when I was pregnant. It is about how an American mother discovers French parenting. I always wanted to be a mid-way between. French parents do value individuality. They raise independent kids. I always aspired to be like them. I don't know whether I succeed or not.*[20] *(Melis, 35 years-old)*

However, reading sometime maybe really challenging as it results in the feeling of not enough. Because there are so many to read and they all introduce the optimal model of parenting, they don't work properly all-time. Besides, it kills the inner voices of mothers. Even this is a century where the skills-based discourse surpasses the emphasis on instinctive mothering, listening to your heart and finding a way between can ease the feelings of mothers. Therefore, it is not a one-way confrontation as the tecniques are always open to discussion:

> *I always read books. Reading makes a difference, but mothering is I mean being a mother is also about knowing oneself. I didn't apply all of these techniques written in the books. Harmony. That's all I know. Day by day, you're getting to know your child, you synchronize with your child. It erases all contradictions. So, everything goes natural as it should be.*

---

[20] Here, there can be a point to consider. The cultural compatability between the proper ways to parent in West and in country is open to discussion. The contradiction appears as Melis says how she confronts with the French way of parenting. Without a doubt, there is always discrepancy between theory and practice but here the problem is the theory is based on Western self-sufficient individual construction.

Here, emphasis on natural parenting intensify the mothering ideology. Because mothering is not totally about professional behaviors and the harmony can be reached out by following the inner voice.

The problem is that maternal love is too often to be assumed to be a sufficient guide for mother and this is why parents need to proclaim their professionalism in this new science of child raising (Lee et al., 2014). Accordingly, the middle-class mothers see expert-guides as a way to open up their private life into the public as they enthusiastically embraced the idea of becoming educated in the science of childrearing. My female respondents who have professional work-life reiterates this pattern. It is because getting help is another way to say I am a competent parent. For fathers, as it seems a transformative power, for mothers it intensifies the ideal of good mothering. Although they are changing their parenting style by taken all these into consideration, they do not automatically jump into the conclusion like yes, I do treat my children in this way. As this confrontation is relational, contradictions seem to be remaining.

5.3 Hire the child-minder!

Professional middle-class parenting practice of hiring the professional child-minders is a very interesting story as this practice signifies another departure from my respondents view abput parenting. Rather asking help from their own parents for child-rearing, a professional child-minder is the general choice amongst my respondents who believe that it is one of the ways to transform their children a world-citizen.

Child-minder is an odd term. There are couple of words in care terminology such as nanny, baby-sitter, au-pair and nursery. A child-minder is the one who is professionalized in child-caring. In England, for instance, they have to be registered in OFSTED[21] and they even get inspected from time to time. In Turkey, it is not that professionalized as in England because even nanny insurance is very new, started in

---

[21] The Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skil

2015. Now, according to the last amendments in legislation, all the care workers are taken into the scope of social security but there are some differences between those who work more than 10 days and those who work less. Even in this way, child-minder is not in ideal terms in Turkey, what makes professional the choices of my respondents are they want to hire a child-minder who can speak a foreign language, who is educated besides getting alone well with children. Although they also use them in household chores, the main thing here is that introducing the child into a broader world.

These child-minders are generally found by the help of somebody who knows a one. Sometimes, they apply to a recruiting agency to find the correct one. For professional middle-class parents finding a decent Filipino child-minder resembles their execution of professional work. Therefore, what they seek for is not an emotional connection or trust to these agencies or friends. Rather, they look for a professional attitude in this process of hiring. When Cem talks about child-minders, professional help is the term that too often appears in our talk:

> *We'll get professional help starting from this September. Now we're looking for a child-minder. I see that it is a job as well. I haven't known anything where to find a child-minder. We're asking other people. I have an artist friend who works with Filipinos. You know there are so many Filipino nannies coming to Turkey. We talked about this with my wife. Filipinos have some advantages. They can speak English, and they are professionally trained. There is a network of Filipino nannies in all around the world. These are educated people. (Cem, 38 years-old)*

They can speak English. Additionally, they are educated. They simply know what to do. As I reveal more broadly in the upcoming section, the subtle message here is making the child as a world citizen. When my respondents constantly talk about individuality, autonomy and forms of control, a language exchange between a child and a child-minder opens up an opportunity to foreign lands. How professional-middle class take child care seriously shows itself how investing in child's habitus almost from the day one to raise the child as a fully-fledged individual.

For mothers, hiring a child-minder means two things: a professional care, a golden ticket to the future life (like as fathers think) but also someone who can ease the burden

of parenting on their shoulders. As Moors et al. (2009) says, hiring a child-minder is a status symbol for middle- and upper-class woman and it also works as a mechanism of emancipation as women find a chance to continue outside the home. It also consolidates the class place as class is not a static thing, but it is made in terms of class position as it makes the one who belongs to a class. Therefore, investing in children also means investing in a mother's own habitus to both generate and unify her practice of choosing a child-minder and consolidating her class place. A mother of two, Melis tells me that:

> *My story to find a childminder is so funny. We have a supermarket in the residence we live in. There are so many expats living in our residence. There is a Chinese bank here, so there are so many Chinese people living around. Korean people as well. One day a Chinese lady told me that 'oh look, how cute your baby is.' Then she asked me about whether I am a stay-at-home mother or not. Then she directly said to me that her childminder would quit because her parents are coming from Pekin. She told me that 'If you want so, you can take my child-minder.' This is how I found a Filipino child-minder. She both do household chores and take care of my kids. (Melis, 35 years-old)*

Melis also repeats what Cem tells me about the process of finding the child-minder. As this process is approached very professionally, it is important to see how Filipino nannies who can do household chores, buy groceries, speak English with the kid is a validation for the appropriation of other women's labour contributes to the making of professional-middle class[22]. However, this exodus of international labor force may have own disadvantages. Both for my female and male respondents, the nannies at stake seems a kind of emotional and psychological extension of parents who can not become parents subsistitute. However, as these kids spend their most of the times with nannies, they have to be controlled. It is not possible to watch the record from start to end but the existence of baby-monitors manifests both parental vigilance and some kind of advance corrective measures on the nannies' behavior. They do now want that

---

[22]As Parla (2014) is not specifically pointing out Filipino nannies, she says that the use of migrant domestic workers in elderly or child care is a implicit deal between the government and upper middle-class families, which shows that upper middle-class does not give up this consumptive practice. Here, Moors et al. (2009) add a point that the filipino nannies have also modern appearances, which indicates the status of the employer's household.

nannies attempt to undo the things as opposed to what they say. It is cruical because for these parents, raising a child is a matter. This is what this parenting is about:

> *There was a smart indoor security camera. It was in our living room. We didn't actually check it. We didn't have the chance to watch all eight and a half hours. But we were wondering how the childminder feeds her. What kind of an activity they do together? How is their relationship? It was a medium of control. (Ozan, 36-years old)*

Parental vigilance simply posits fear, anxiety, need for security. But for what? It is more than an activity for the sake of protection. Rather, as Bourdieu (1984) says, taste classified the classifer. In other words, they prefer a Filipino child-minder over a traditional nanny so that their children can learn English easily and they can be treated professionally. However, this confrontation with 'the other' can not be explained without how professional middle-class do not completely trust in child-minder way of raising a child. Simply because, any unwanted behavior or technique of a child minder might jeopardize preserving the class status that they confer upon themselves.

To sum up, professional middle-class parenting is full of contradictions. When the past whispers into their ears, they directly state that I do now want to be/ will not be turn into my parent. However, some patterns maintain because class position, gender identity and work-home interface intersect, complete and contradict one another. Distancing oneself from the past also conjoins the intensive mothering ideology and new work- focused masculinities. As they approach parenting as a kind of profession, what they do is simply develop themselves as to be a good parent. But to be a good parent is not easy because work-private life balance is not easy to build. As mothers constantly go back and forth between being a working mother, a good mother and a mother who is in need of help to perfectionize their mothering, they confront with the hardships in continuing their work life. Even self-interested gains contradict with unselfish nurturance, they do try to find a way. For fathers, the dilemma is between the being traditional type of father and the work-life pressures. Here, what professional middle-class parenting is about investing in children's future as to reproduce the class position and make children a world citizen from the first of their life and onwards. This desire shows itself how parents consume different services from doctors to child-

minders. Therefore, parenting is not only about child-raising. It is a way to shape parenting and children's identity, as parents actively contribute to the construction of their parenting.

5.4 Reproductive Parenting through better schools and extra-curricular activities

Reproduction begins on the ground. Compared to its counterparts within a different social milieu, professional middle-class parenting involves parents who are way more concerned for their children's future, so they don't fall off from the class ladder. These parents exert their best effort to bring out the best in child simply because of their willingness not just to win a place but to guarantee it. As for professional middle-class, what it means (to do) parenting is being one's own active agent of class reproduction in navigating children's way through education and extra-curricular activities. Under a neoliberal welfare reform in schooling and workplace-family interface which remakes professional middle-class, parenting is shaped by these changes, but it also includes a deliberate articulation of parents' own interests in the main parenting practice of investing in education and activities by consuming various services both to survive and to live a lavish style with a bit of luck. In an ongoing trade-off and contestation between means and ends to earn a place in social structure, education represents the only way through to be an upwardly mobile in Turkey since 1950's but the thing is a persistent and even wild investment in education signs a confrontation with a familiar unfamiliar. As parents seek and find pattern connecting to past, it seems familiar, but the intensity needed to invest in education is unfamiliar as the hidden privatization of education in Turkey opens up new ways of struggles. The parents who I talked to started to utterly speak of a vague uneasiness, which makes them think of 'necessary measures to be taken when it comes education'. For instance, a mother with two children addresses a moment of discussion with her husband about how today's educational needs are different than of yesterday:

> *I think I am way more concerned compared to my husband. My husband always tells me that 'we were children as well and we grew up. So do not exaggerate this much. They'll grow up in any way'. But I say no. The world we live in today is not the same as the world I grew up. The intergenerational difference in education is real now.*

There is no way that I let these children by themselves, and they can't handle in the education system. (Deniz, 39 years-old)

What she says of that letting-go-of-children is not even possible. Not being worried about a child's educational attainment and future success is nothing more than resigning parents themselves to the fact that they are accepting the terms and conditions of current education system in Turkey. Although her husband thinks that parenting is not something to be exaggerated in terms of education, for Deniz it is a real concern.

Therefore, there has to be a kind of intervention as children seem that they can't handle with today's context. To be prepared to pay the price of private education will not be surprise but be a planned step into a life as beware of taking a detour to aspired field of education. A father of a daughter says:

Yes, of course, I know that. I'm not that naïve to think that we can send this child to public school. Sometimes my wife and I talk about this issue. She thinks that we still live in a world we grew up. She tells me that 'We went to public school then Anatolian high school, and it was okay.' I tell her everything has changed so much during the last decade. You don't know this world. So be prepared, be ready for expensive tuition fees. She says, 'okay we'll think about it.' (Cem, 38 years-old)

What is at stake here that one of the parents generally intends to think that being enrolled to a public school as well is enough like themselves who found their own way by keeping up the good study and looking for a high-quality school. However, a spouse either a mother or a father is conscious of things-to-do and decision-to-make for which school they choose. The complaint about the education system reveals that the restructuring of schooling in Turkey, which makes even more complicated to where to direct children:

I don't know which education system is better now. Which one will suit my child? There is real uncertainty. I knew the system when my oldest son went to school. I knew the teachers. I knew what I get from where. I knew how to achieve our aim. So, it did pretty well for my oldest. But I don't know now. The only place I know is Koç school, so this why we choose this school. (Hatice, 53 years-old)

Between 1950's to 80's investing in education to be succeed in selective high-school and university exam has been a standard procedure for middle-class families not just

to display their own taste of education- where a child at least knows a foreign language, discovers what happens abroad, socialize with others like her-himself- but also to position themselves in the social structure. Yet, these schools- from Anatolian high schools to top-notch universities such as Boğaziçi, ODTÜ, Ankara are free of tuition and their curriculum is written and sampled by help of well-known foreign private schools mainly based on Istanbul. Both the official positions and newly created vacancies thanks to new trade ventures from finance to service, the need for skilled labor force had to necessary. Turkey's relationship with U.S. and the intention of latter to disseminate English language and its own way of 'educating citizens' enable students to be a part of quality education. These schools surely fueled social differentiation within middle class (Rutz and Balkan, 2009) but what these parents insistently tells is today's education has not something to do with 'work hard', 'earn a place in good public school' and 'lead a better life than your parents'. Rather, it has to do something with being super involved in school choices. The neoliberal welfare reform of schooling in Turkey starting from 1983 signs a new era: emphasis on providing free education is replaced with privatization of education which is a fast track to step into a good life. As Connell (2011) says for changing education system in Australia, professional middle-class parents face a new educational scenery where only way to continue to reproduce class place is to get a private education and tutoring.

Some of my respondents have children under the age of 3, which means their children are taken care by professional child-minders or mothers themselves. Although not all these children started school yet, each and every respondent told me about their definition of success and how they want to send their children to private elite schools and extra-curriculars. As Vincent and Martin (2002) say, parental anxieties about children's academic success starts in the pre-school years. They also add that middle- and upper-class families start to invest in education from the early years of a child's life. However, either their child goes to school or not, all these parents do security projects to afford expensive schools and activities:

> *I really know what I earn right now will not be enough for my daughter's school fees. It can cover only one year when I consider our savings. I know that we need a real*

plan for the future. I have to make more money because this is the only way I can afford those schools. They are really expensive. I mean three-four thousand Turkish liras for a year. And it will continue every year. (Cem, 38 years-old)

Having a savings account doesn't mean anything. The only way is finding out the right way to borrow money. I already spent too much money even from this day. I spend our next months' payments from today. I am bearing the cost. (Kubilay, 35 years-old)

Even that all parents irrespective of their gender are concerned with children's education, the concerns about financial cost is generally stated by my male respondents. They have wives who have master's degrees and have worked in professional jobs for a long time until their first child was born. Still, these fathers designate themselves as the ones who are way more concerned compared to their wives.

Why this price is paid has its complexities. The first is professional middle-class parents aspire to make a choice for a private education which the school system cultivates individuality in children. What individuality connotes here is to be adorned with mostly self-care skills, which enables a kid to be self-sufficient during the life. Besides, being a part of foreign-language medium school, which has components of being a Western individual self is a way to prepare future life where these parents expect their children to actively participate and compete in life:

The last kindergarten where my son went belongs to a German person. It was a different experience. I felt that. I don't know how can I say, but they are different. They have different mind-setting. There was a universal feeling. They encourage children to do anything by themselves. They support their autonomy and individuality. Everything was based on developing self-care skills. In Turkish schools, children play chess. I mean is that a thing? In that German school, there was something that boosts my child's individuality. You are just another brick in the wall in Turkish schools. In foreign schools, you are still a part of the whole, but you are an individual. They have exchange programs. I want my son to participate. I want him to know that there is a world out there. (Deniz, 39 years-old)

This narrative simply states that: a professionalization as a new disciplinary mechanism (Fournier, 1999) expose these parents to the logic and language of the market: a fully-fledged individual who can work on her-himself, whose performance will be measured up on the basis of individual criteria and credentials. Besides professionalism that matches with individual conduct and development on the basis of

flexibility, taking responsibility, solving problems is a language that they're familiar with. Their confrontation with the language of market joins the fact that only the ones who invests in her-his skills and be a part of non-ending self-development process as the global market can survive as the emphasis on uncertainty of the future makes an invitation for realistic concern of poor quality education and its reflection on the future life. This is why investing in private education which offers skills to navigate in any turmoil in uncertain economy is at the nexus of parental concerns.

Preparing children to lead a healthy, happy and successful life gives a chance to look at the ways in which the discourse on the effects of parental indulgence in fulfilling child's potential is translated into consumption services that parents allocate and invest money. In Turkey, spending money to invest in future aims not only develop soft skills as mentioned but also analytical skills even this means that children have to give up the rights of childhood and adopt themselves to the heavy curriculum:

> *I want her to go to the hardest and toughest schools. There is Bilfen school. It is really hard to get into. In the end, if my daughter gets into Robert or Üsküdar American Academy, so I want her to initiate into life as soon as possible. Everybody says that they can't enjoy their childhood. She will enjoy life after she gets into these schools. Can you compare Robert to other schools? So, if she will be in these schools, I don't want her to do kids crafts. I have this mind-setting. I went to the TED Ankara College. Hard school. Have I experienced any disadvantage out of this? No.*

Therefore, similar to what Nelson (2010) tells that professional middle-class parents in US who are confused about whether their little children find a path for the future despite heavy curriculums and schedules or their adulthood should be delayed, Melis opens up her conundrum:

> *I want my kids to be happy. There is nothing more important than this. But on the other hand, I want them to be better than me. I am better than my school mates now in a better position with a good salary. Let's say I am working for this bank. I want her to work in the Bank of America. I did go to Bilkent and majored in economics. I want her to study industrial engineering. I want her to go through real formal education. The pedagog confirms this. There are so many schools with free-range mind setting. Enka, Açı, and Hisar schools are three of those. Everybody makes fun of these schools because middle school's children still do kids craft. (Melis, 35 years-old)*

Even the idea of childhood somehow seems tainted by strict realities of adult world formed under the realities of global markets full of uncertainties, to get a training under the roof of these schools is the only way to transfer and protect class privileges of professional middle-class. Speaking Bourdieuese, their parenting practices aims to activate social and cultural capital in children as child's set of disposition, habitus, is open to change with active intervention from parents to boost the volume and diversify the composition of capital. This act of concertedly choosing the best school and environment is a way to produce advantages on behalf of children, if not, children will not be able to remain at the same class place of parents. For instance, a well-known private French school based in Ankara, Tevfik Fikret, is a popular choice amongst these parents who underline the importance of the mind-setting in this school that imposes its own values:

> *We chose Tevfik Fikret because of this. After she graduated from school, she can go anywhere in the world. French school and they also teach English. My daughter can easily go to Canada or France. Now, French culture is molding her personality. (Ozan, 36 years-old)*

Getting a good education that enables a child master in foreign language and culture is the way opening to consider studying abroad in the future. The reason why these parents advocate for going abroad is the inevitability of leaving Turkey as for Turkey where child's skills set, mind-set and values are seen as incompatible with environment of the country. Therefore, this parenting practice of investing by consuming works as an advance compensation mechanism for what public school couldn't offer of good-quality education which should make a kid a world-citizen:

> *She'll learn the language starting from her early years. She will have no accent problem. I think that when she will be a fully-fledged individual, she couldn't make it in Turkey. So, let's say she will go to France. She has to speak French. If she can learn a language starting from now, she can quickly learn the second language. I want her to develop herself. It is not like that I want her to be a doctor or an engineer. I want her to speak at least 2-3 languages. I want her to be ready for the future. (Kubilay, 35 years-old)*

What these schools ensure about child's educational attainment is not only to be acquainted with the skill of speaking more than one language in a perfect way but also

to be distinct and different from the other kids who go training in public schools. Unfortunately, the real cost of private education as parents is willing to confer an advantage to be with their similar others have to be paid 'in advance'. In Turkey, for these professional middle-class parents who do not come from 'foreign elite enough' backgrounds, the only way for their children to get the elite education is investing even started from kindergarten, which is the only chance for these kids to be selected based on the fulfillment of the requirement of being able to speak the foreign language in school:

> *I have a friend, and she has two kids. They first went to Petite Genie then Pierre Loti. These are French schools. Petite Genie is a preschool. They take kids when the kids are two-years-old. Pierre Loti is a French high school. This school has a different legal status. It is considered as a French territory. They have a different curriculum. It is just 4000 euros. It is affordable. But the thing is it is hard to get in. They have a quota for French citizens. They also have a small quota for Turkish citizens. If you are not coming from a French background, because I didn't go to Dame de Sion or other schools, it is hard to get in. The only way is that she has to learn French from preschool. (Büke, 34 years-old)*

> *For getting into some schools, you have to send your children to their preschools. These schools have a requirement. Kids have to go to these schools from their two years old. They want the kids to be like them. They tell that there is no other way to get into our schools. (Kubilay, 35 years-old)*

It is not only the fear of starting to invest beforehand to get one of the open seats – otherwise it is a chancy business thinking of draw of lots for admission- but also doing the right thing for the kid is a bit tricky. When the discourse of 'having a choice' is intensified with the discourse of 'choosing what is best for a child because there is plethora of options', professional middle-class prefers to actively respond to the current education system by regulated consumptive practices that also guarantees being with other kids who shares the similar background. Here, similarity which identifies the boundary for professional middle-class is beyond getting the same values, same language education and same looks. Being similar with others to distinguish itself even resonates how local and global fears of being with dangerous others who do not share the desired capability and mentality:

> *I don't want my daughter to go to a school where Syrian children can also go. Skilled migrants from Syria went to USA or Germany. Now we host these people,*

I mean they are like people coming from Çorum and Yozgat. You know all the jokes about these cities. I want my daughter to go to a school where kids from Izmir can get in.

It is not a surprise for these parents speaking of socializing their children with children born to families coming from some cities like Çorum and Yozgat, which connotes nothing but only the opposite of what is intended. When the global fear of Syrian immigrants, the people a professional middle-class parent do not want to confront let alone at schools even in public area, entwined with the local dangers, parental fears are intensified. A public school where the kids of these parents are in a kind of jeopardy to face with bad diversity is surely not a choice for them where the structural problems are read as individual failures. If a parent chooses a public school where the kids of irresponsible parents possibly with a lower-class background, it will turn out to be the failure of parents' individual choice. Undoubtedly, poor school achievement or any misbehavior is received as insufficient parenting where a child is nothing but free-range:

Did you go to Ankamall[23] and Cepa[24]? You know the difference, right? You can see that different people go to these malls. There are so many bad families now. They don't take care of their kids. Free-Range Kids, everywhere. Their kids are bad as well. They don't understand anything. I don't want my daughter to go to a school with these people's kids. (Ahmet, 35 years-old)

One's taste manifests itself as the intolerance of the tastes of other in the manner that others from lower-class backgrounds accept the terms and conditions of public schools whose curriculum is under states' control. This is why this practice even more exacerbates when professional middle-class feels that their values and purity threatened by the official language of state:

I don't want my kid to be exposed to 15 July commemoration. I don't know what is in the public-school books. These books, their contents were so problematic in previous times. I know it is getting more problematic now. I don't want my kid to learn the Prophet Muhammad's life. I don't want my kid to be indoctrinated. Sure, there are also risks of sending your child to a private school. A different indoctrination. But still… (Büke, 34 years-old)

---

[23] One of the largest shopping malls in Turkey, located in Yenimahalle where heterogenous group of people can easily access via metro.
[24] Another shopping mall where the famous brands have their stores, which simply connote a modern, more secular and more homogeneous group of people.

Even this preference of considering elite foreign schools has some consequences such as raising a child in Turkey but on a foreign ground, these parents still seems like they want to postpone the launch of their children into the real life full of people with diverse backgrounds. To be sure, embracing diversity is not bad thing in itself. Yet, parental intervention is necessary to protect the children, prepare them for the future and create the chance of going abroad in times of need:

> *Recently a friend of mine told me that 'we raise these kids as empathetic, humanist and good people. Then, the kids get beaten by some bully kid at school'. I don't want to force all the obstacles out of my daughter' path, but in the first place, she will live what I chose for her. I want her to be away from all the troubles. I don't want her to know the real world for now. (Kubilay, 35 years-old)*

However, the question of what if I as a parent find myself in a financially challenged position considering the affordability of schools and the current economic situation in Turkey where the currency is melting down each and every day but the yearly tuition fee even of a kindergarten starts from 30-40 thousand Turkish lira, considering good public schools at least for a first couple of years in education seems a reasonable idea. What is more than that this idea is getting to know the others, thinking of these children will depart from public schools in the end. The chance of being familiar with diverse class backgrounds -especially with 'mahalle çocukları' who symbolizes the naivety, purity and the goodness of the old days, professional middle-class parents apply to public schools as a kind of preemptive strategy to handle possible financial shortcomings:

> *I send my daughter to Türkan Saylan kindergarten in Beşiktaş. They have mediocre kindergarten teachers. I am not satisfied, but we have to find a financial balance. It is a small place. I mean everybody's child goes to this school. It just gives me comfort on the one side. These children are also the color of this world. It is good to see that. I am not belittling them, of course, it is good for my daughter to see these people from different socio-economic backgrounds. (Deniz, 39 years-old)*

Based on the value and cost of education, there is another variable added to the whole calculation: extra-curricular activities. According to Vincent and Martin (2002), parents from middle and upper-class backgrounds intensively make investments in various gymnastic, music and drame classes. 'The good start', which is a message of

the institions delivering these services propose benefits for future academic success at school as well. How much to invest in these activities relates to the deeper meanings attached to them. Back in Bourdieusian language, the making of professional-middle class parenting is not about whether having and preserving the place of those who are 'distinct'or the opposite but the interrelations between how professional middle-class parents think of them at the same time. The impact, that is, the effectivity of parental decision about extra-curriculars on the habitus of a child, as vicious material indulgence in education and these activities equals the assiduous pedagogical effort to invest in capitals, is what renders the making of class components possible. The denotation of being a part of an activity is simply an endeavor to step into artistic or possibly sports field. Any generalist parents, today in Turkey, would like to appreciate positive effect of these activities on from children's attitude, to their achievement in school. However, what professional middle-class parenting practice of investing in them is again fueled by their strong belief in that the true capacity of a child can be fulfilled with the right guidance based on the observation of what a kid can do:

> *My daughter didn't know what a gymnastic means when she started to go to a gymnastics class. We observed her and saw that she is as flexible as a gymnast. Then we took her to the class, and she loved it. She was almost 3 when she started. Her teacher said that 'she is little now. Usually, we don't accept kids at two-three years old but let's see whether she can follow the instructions or not.' We chose this activity for her thinking that it could be convenient, but she also wanted it. She says what she loves and not. Then we give it a try. (Ozan, 36 years-old)*

A gymnastic class may be a good example to understand how pro-mid-class parents switch from a generalist practice to more specialist one as they do not want to see their kids destined to be a novice within a designated activity field but more versed in that field. However, they sometimes crave for more to discover the full potential of kids. The perks of being a well-rounded and multi-skilled kid is surely what most of the kids wants considering the harsh competition and the struggle to be perfect in all abovementioned schools and activities. The thing is when parental competence posits itself in the level of effort to invest in the volume and composition of a kid's capital, activities can both be considered as mixed logic of choice and necessity:

Now he goes to basketball class — also, a piano class. We bought a piano. Then I told him that 'you should continue to try playing at least one more year. Then you can change your mind, but you better continue to try'. Then I told myself lets focus on a specific activity because it seemed like he couldn't do two things at the same time. I know I have to invest in his future whatever it takes. My husband told me that 'we can't invest everything in these children.' But I think that I have to do more. If I don't invest in his future, I mean, how can he succeed. (Deniz, 39 years-old)

As parents consider downsizing when in times of choosing public schools over private ones seems the only way to continue to invest in extra-activities, it is also possible for them to make another shift to enact a different security project of upsizing. As she says, if there is money to spare, investing in more than one activity is always possible. Professional middle-class parents are on the edge. How much money to invest and for which period of time are tough questions to respond. These parents zero in on a complex practice of investing by consuming. On one hand, both private education and extra-activities are not nothing but a quite clear obligation to survive. The present and clear dangers which constitutes the urge for survival are related to the collapse of public education but more importantly even the better quality public schooling in previous times cannot equal the quality of elite private education which is based on cultivating individuality and various soft skills in a kid without making any compromise about strict formal education. Of course, pro mid-class is not affected from the open and hidden privatization of schooling as its mid and lower counterparts. However, the economic recession in Turkey is real. Its backlashes crosscut many parents who have different social class background. More fail-safe than others, prices list of schools increased almost 3 times more than the wages of this class segment[25]. Therefore, to keep a balance between the school and activities, at least an activity or private pre/elementary school education has to be sacrificed for the sake of not to give up on every opportunity. What deepens these dangers are the class fear, which this education is clearly associated with a sense of entitlement. To be distinct, to not to be like others, to not to be hurt by the value and norm set of the state and of course to not

---

[25] The school fees at private four-year institutions (all levels) increase at an average rate of the inflation rate plus 5%. As the Ministry of Education in Turkey set a price limit to private schools, for this year (2019), the costs of private education are expected to increase at around 27-33%. However, Turkish Lira continues to meltdown, and the average salary of my respondents range from eighty-five to hundred-fifty thousand Turkish Liras, and their pay rises are at most 5-7% of their annual wages.

to fall from the taken-for-granted position in the class rung, investing by consuming is necessary. In the end, the ongoing negotiation over how much is going to be spent is resumed with different tension as a result of wants over needs. To be involved in an entourage of students coming from elite backgrounds, the choice of private school is a way to mold a kid into a fully-fledged future professional mid-class. The hidden and visible curriculum at school and the homogeneity of environment shows how structured dispositions of a kid generate similar organizing principles such as the content of daily talks about an extra-activity while unifying them. Besides, this similarity via a meticulous investment in kid's habitus results in a differentiation amongst the types of activities. In order to increase the cultural and social capital of kid so as to be not same as that of the others, the challenge is not just material sacrifice but also accept the risk of that kid may not succeed everything at once. The thing is what professional middle-class parenting is based on trying to do the best for a child. Therefore, if a kid is not successful enough it is probably because not investing enough in formal education:

> *We can also spend our money on lavish clothes or for his night-outs, right? But we can't. We can spend this money only for his education. My son couldn't understand in the first place. He told me, 'why can the other kids do what they want, and I'm not.' This Koç School makes him uncomfortable. We can't spend money on these things, and I also can't spend money on tutors. His grades are 80-85 out of 100. This is because he doesn't get any extra support from a private tutor. He goes windsurfing. Too expensive. I mean, some people can do both. But I can't afford that these two at the same time. This is why I accept his grades. It is because of me.*

To sum up, both my male and female respondents are conscious of the class differences. According to Crompton (2006), the middle- and upper-class parents might do anything for their children just because acquiring the appropriate educational credentials is the only way to be a well-rounded, fully-fledged individual that can compete in the labor market. As the professional language once more incorporates into how these parents do parent to their children, 'the necessary measures' have to be taken starting from the early years of the children. My respondents' investment in their children future has even started from when they go and see a therapist and hire a professional Filipino child-minder who can speak English and treat a child professionally. What intensifies the investment, in this case, education and extra-

activities, is that cultural capital is about the centrality of the family to the understanding of cultural reproduction (Reay, 2004). Therefore, it is not merely about differentiating themselves from the others but guaranteeing and preserving the class privileges for them and on behalf of their children.

The interesting point is that both professional mothers and fathers are concerned for their children's success and education, Reay (2004) says that the togetherness of cultural and economic capital brings mothers feeling of empowerment as to intervene in their children's educational path and to change their educational trajectory. In my case, considering all the efforts of my female respondents to continue to work, to make an exemplary image in their child's eyes and to think about returning to work-life can be understood in this way. Reay (2004) also says that mothers are primary agents of social class reproduction as they make cultural capital work for children, compared to men. Interestingly, I can say that both my male and female respondents equally participate in this investment through consumptive practices process. I did not see a serious difference between their anxieties about the current education system in Turkey and also their professional class fears. In this way, their parenting practices really resemble one another and share common points because professional work creates a specific mechanism and language that these parents employ. However, the difference can be said that fathers do talk much about the economic burdens of these investments while mothers do not seem concerned as like fathers. They both talked about the expensiveness of these schools and their anxiety about how to make their child enroll in these schools from the preschool period, but mothers did not mention their anxiety about dealing with this financial affordability challenge.

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

This thesis scrutinizes how professional middle-class parents construct their parenting and shape their parenting experiences based on their gender identities; tensions between their work status choices and parental responsibilities; class position and their level of compliance with the intensive parenting expectations. This is why I specifically ask that how can we understand how gender shape these parents' parenting practices and how their class position and occupations intersect with their gender identity and so their parenting? In this thesis, I try to juxtapose professional middle-class mothers' parenting experiences with their consorts' parenting in order to unpack how they have both similar and different parenting experience in terms of their gender identity and class position. I endeavored to create a common frame to look at their parenting practices and parental concerns. It was my way to find out to what extent they engage with intensive parenting practices. I searched for how they get caught in the feeling of being not enough in different ways and what they do see as good parenting. As these parents execute parenting 'professionally,' I came up with how mothers' and father's experiences in this process vary.

With a qualitative study based on semi-structured in-depth interviews, I met 15 parents consisting of 13 different families (two of my respondents are married to another as I mentioned in Chapter 2) based in Istanbul and Ankara. Although the number seems limited, it is a modest attempt to look at their parenting experiences simultaneously.

Studies on middle-class parenting, its specific gender aspects, and professional work-class-gender interface are used in order to form the background of this study. As these studies approach different dimensions of middle-class parenting and its intersects with gender and professional work, what can be considered as a deficiency is that they all try to deal with mother's and father's parenting experiences separately. There has been extensive literature on mother's and father's experiences in the midst of work-home-

parenting triad. However, there are only three major studies focusing on mothers and fathers occupying a similar position in the workplace. While Cooper tries to find out upper-middle and middle-class parents' the similar and different parental concerns in Silicon Valley, Pugh comes with a similar frame for middle-class parents and their practices, and Dermott shows the gendered demands of parenting which the primary responsibility placed on women's shoulders. As these scholars present an extended frame of gender, middle-class parenting, raising children in an insecure age, I tried to do the similar for Turkey. However, I do take 'insecurity' into serious consideration as family still operates as a buffer against the broken safety-nets and also it is addressed that the family can be extended under different economic conditions. Although my respondents' parents do not play a caretaker role, they state that they reside in their own parents' houses or they get financial aid for the extensive investment in the child's education and activities. Also, especially both in Lareau's and Friedman's works, both middle-class mother's and father's approach to child-rearing are addressed, but they do not have a specific focus on about gendered dimensions of parenting experiences. On the other hand, in Turkey, there is an extensive literature on parenting. However, the focuses are generally on one or two aspects of the parenting story- such as social class/SES and parenting styles. Kaya's and Beşpınar's study, in this vain, have been an inspiration to me even they specifically focused on professional middle-class mothers or fathers. In their study, they present an extended framework for mothers' or father's parenting on the individual, local, and global levels. Therefore, the main contribution of this thesis centers on the ways in which mothers and fathers (who do come from the same class position and occupational background) make sense of parenting within the complex relations of work-home tensions, intensive parenting ideology, and gender identities.

The use of Nelson's professional middle-class concept has key importance in this study in one peculiar respect: Professional middle-class means people who don't have real physical asset but rather their position is based on human capital. Working in the Professional sector means that working for Project-based tasks; complying with the international and impersonal work standards; measuring performance on their individual criteria. In other words, they have a real connection to the global world, and

their labor mobility opportunities are also wide. They live for getting 'one more certificate' to invest in their self-development that affects their performance at the job. They are keeping themselves wide-open and ready for any changes in both the Turkish economy and their job sector. Flexibility and versatility are the main adjectives in their work lives. As they can be replaced by the other, the only way out is looking for various ways to be a world-citizen.

On the other hand, the analysis of Bourdieu provides a chance to frame professional middle-class parenting in three ways. First, to uncover why these professional mothers and fathers do parenting professionally with all the investments in ranging from child-minders to foreign private schools, his notion of class opens up a way. For Bourdieu, the class is not about one's positioning in the production relations, but rather it is about one's perceived being, which is remote or near to others. As Professional middle-class parents try to place themselves, they also differentiate themselves from the place of others. His concept of habitus, in this way, explain how the condition of these parents also condition them to invest in their child's capitals to win, conquer, and contest their class position. Therefore, their parenting practices is a way to reproduce their class position for and on behalf of their children. Second, professional logic also reconstructs itself while my respondents' mental structure matches with the social structure, as they execute parenting like a professional. As being a Professional means having a social and cultural capital to hold this position, what my respondents do is transmitting these capitals (which they acquired at work) to their children. Third, parenting is about relationality; that is, what my respondents do for the sake of parenting also makes who they are and whom they become. Thus, as Melis says 'I do want my daughters to play tennis because you can play tennis in any place in this world' their willingness to make their children World-citizens is both a manifestation of their desire to reproduce their positions and conditioning that keeps in them in investing process.

The first aim of this thesis is to reveal what kind of values mothers and fathers attribute to parenting in different and similar ways. These parents often decide on what type of parent they want to become on the basis of their relationship with their own mothers.

Here, what is shown is that mothers give more value to individuality, independency, self-sufficiency in their parenting. Simply because traditional mother image in their minds does not match with a mother who seeks self-interested gains in the market. This symbolizes a rupture from their own mothers' parenting. For their mothers who prefer to be a stay-at-home mother, middle-class women being a stay-at-home mother was more advantageous because first what they earn in labor market cannot compensate for their domestic labor and second for a woman being upwardly mobile is not possible with working outside the home (Özbay 1982, 1990). However, investing in child and doing all the household chores enable other members of the family to be upwardly mobile. This may explain why their educated mothers quit jobs or do not prefer to work outside the home. While Deniz tells me about her mother, she told that 'the biggest success of my educated mother is my enrolment into Işık High school in Istanbul because I was like her extension in the outside world.' This simply states why their own mothers do not become a woman who is working outside for her own account. Therefore, what my female respondents think that they're lack of enough space when they grow up, and there was no exemplary image in their eyes. This is why they insistently put emphasis on encouraging their child's individuality, ideals about their careers, and having a life of their own. In this way, even that their self-interested gains contradict with being a good mother, these gains serve to be a good mother. Being a good mother means being a working mother, on the other hand, being as their own mothers show itself in the issues of intimacy and being close to one's child.

In the father's story, the intimacy and emotional connection are the most common themes that come forward. As they did not remember a close father figure, they really care to be a more calm, loving, and affectionate father. As they take their experience with their fathers as a negative experience, their willingness to distance themselves from the past is about being less authoritarian. Interestingly, as they also differentiate themselves in terms of how much time they spend with their children, they take their father's individuality as an example to raise their child as independent and free. For my male respondents, individuality is not something that they are not familiar, but at the same time, they define their fathers way more authoritarian. In both mother's and

father's stories, there are contradictions as they constantly go back and for between whom they want to aspire and who can be.

The second aim of this study to show how mothers and fathers differently negotiate with the terms of being a good parent while they try to reconcile work and home life. For mothers, the central to their parenting is the feeling of being not enough. As they associate being a good mother with one who is in her account, they feel stuck in between spending more time with the children and continuing the work. While they constantly do emotion work, this feeling does not cease. Pausing a career means spending more time with children with a sacrifice of self-fulfilling prophecy. As being a working mom fueled this feeling, being a stay-at-home mother also may not sooth simply. Like in Deniz's story, even she tried hard to return work sector, she made another sacrifice to accept the more humble job. On the other hand, continuing to work comes with its own price of guilt an even Melis did not pause a break, she was thinking about how she could reach to A+ position. How mothers react to the intensive parenting ideology, while they try to reconcile work and home life, changes itself. For fathers, work-home reconciliation is just an issue to be fixed professionally. Although they all want to comply with new fatherhood ideology, being a hands-on father, they see that parenting is a matter of time management and a job that should be done effectively. Having a child seemed an external effect that makes their daily/working life harder in terms of time. The guilt behind spending less time with the children can not be comparable to mothers' feelings. There are no male respondents who told me that 'If I had a more chance to access paternity leave, it could be different.' This shows that their perception of good parenting once more transforms itself to work-focused masculinity. In this vein, while mothers remain to be the primary parent, fathers are still outsiders within.

The third aim of this study is to disclose how both mothers and fathers execute their parenting in a professional way. Like a professional, if these parents tackle something they have no idea how to do it, or they have an insufficient idea about it, they do it like they prepare a project plan of which the tight deadline for the project delivery is always on the table. In this case, these parents are really into investing their children by

96

consumptive practices starting from day one. However, there are some differences in their experiences. When they write a project that they can be proud of in the future, fathers learn to father, especially from the books while mothers learn different mothering styles. For man, the ruptures between their parenting and their father's parenting are wider. Therefore, when they try to find out how to be a father, help is needed. However, both mothers and fathers frame parenting as a kind of job in which their performance has to be measured, they need self-diagnostic, and they have to check themselves. This is why asking a doctor is a must. On the other hand, both perceive that hiring a child-minder is one of the first steps to make their child a world-citizen. As it gives a subtle message about their class status, for mothers, it has a specific meaning because a child-minder can compensate for mother's domestic labor and enables them to continue to work. Also, they share very similar concerns in terms of their child's education and extra-activities. The main themes appearing is that a paying in advance for getting these elite private schools, protecting the child from to be like others, investing in their skills to raise them as well-rounded fully-fledged individuals that can survive anywhere in the world, and of course making them a world citizen. As they both worry about the tuition fees and the education system in Turkey, fathers come one step forward to tell their financial concerns. However, they both reproduce their class position via parenting practices as their only possible way to guarantee their class position is investing in education and activities for a child's future.

The professional language is based on gender-neutrality as parenting is a concept grounded in the same logic. Yet, the conditions are not equal. In other words, intensive parenting ideology articulates into the male and female parenting. How the language of the market, and femininity and masculinity are incorporated into each other is central to understand the gender differences in parenting. Therefore, the mothers and fathers' response to their parenting identities is constructed in gendered ways. The feeling of being-not-enough is very central to women's parenting. They continuously perpetuate the intensive parenting ideology as this ideology traps them into with this feeling and trying ro washing away it causes to get caught more in feeling not enough. Fathers, on the other hand, get caught in hegemonic masculinity ideals by articulating themselves in the market economy, by totally devoting themselves to work-life in

order not to feel threatened with what If I'll be fired or cannot promote to an upper position. These feelings are also intensified when these parents try do distance themselves from their parents, but they behave similarly. How mothers and fathers differently/similarly feel about their feelings and their parenting expand the boundaries of intensive parenting ideology. It reconstructs the gendered division of labor in terms of parenting in different ways. There should be considered to do more studies on how feelings are essential to understand gendered ways of parenting and how it conditions the parents as parents also condition themselves to feel in a certain fashion. It can also be beneficial to understand the reasons behind investing by consuming practice of these parents.

In conclusion, parenting means 'doing something.' If parents do something in a deliberate manner, it is because it achieves a purpose. The purpose varies in terms of their gender. The feeling to be enough, to be good enough parent and provide the best start in life for their children; parenting is to decide who these parents are and what kind of a woman/man they want to become. As this cultural ideology of mothering and fathering expectations maintain, these parents continue to reconstruct their parenting in gendered ways.

REFERENCES

Arendell, T. (2000). Conceiving and investigating motherhood: The decade's scholarship. *Journal of marriage and family*, *62*(4), 1192-1207.

Ariès, P. (1965). Centuries of childhood: A social history of family life.

Ataca, B., & Sunar, D. (1999). Continuity and change in Turkish urban family life. *Psychology and Developing Societies*, *11*(1), 77-90.

Ayata, S. (2002). The new middle class and the joys of suburbia. *Fragments of culture: The everyday of modern Turkey*, 25-42.

Aycicegi-Dinn, A., & Kagitcibasi, C. (2010). The value of children for parents in the minds of emerging adults. *Cross-Cultural Research*, *44*(2), 174-205.

Aydın, İ., Artar, M. (2009). Alt ve üst sosyo-ekonomik düzeyden annelerin evdeki öğretmen rolleri ve çocuk yetiştirmeye ilişkin görüşleri. Türkiye'de Çocuk Yetiştirme, Yaklaşımlar, Yöntemler, Sorunlar, Çözümler. VI. Ulusal Çocuk Kültürü Kongresi Bildirileri Kitabı, A.Ü. Çocuk Kültürü Araştırma ve Uygulama Merkezi Yayınları: Ankara. Yayın No: 17. (sf: 141-165).

Baydar, N., Akçınar, B., & İmer, N. (2012). Çevre, sosyoekonomik bağlam ve ana babalık. *Ana babalık: Kuram ve araştırma*, 81-127.

Bayraktar, S. (2011). *Makbul anneler, müstakbel vatandaşlar: neoliberal beden politikalarında annelik*. Ayizi Kitap.

Bayraktar, S. (2014). "Education of mothers" in Turkey: discourses on maternal propriety and neoliberal body politics on motherhood. *Mothering in the Age of Neoliberalism*, 223-236.

Beşpınar, F. U. (2016). Between Ideals and Enactments: The Experience of "New Fatherhood" among Middle-Class Men in Turkey. In *Gender and Sexuality in Muslim Cultures* (pp. 111-130). Routledge.

Boratav, H. B., Fişek, G. O., & Eslen-Ziya, H. (2017). *Erkekliğin Türkiye halleri*. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a Theory of Practice* (Vol. 16). Cambridge university press.

Bourdieu, P. (1984). Distinction. Translated by Richard Nice. *Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univer*.

Bourdieu, P. (1987). What makes a social class? On the theoretical and practical existence of groups. *Berkeley journal of sociology*, *32*, 1-17.

Bourdieu, P. (1990). Structures, habitus, practices. *The logic of practice*, 52-65.

Bourdieu, P. (1996). On the family as a realized category. *Theory, culture & society*, *13*(3), 19-26.

Bourdieu, P. (1998). *Practical reason: On the theory of action*. Stanford University Press.

Brannen, J., & Nilsen, A. (2006). From fatherhood to fathering: Transmission and change among British fathers in four-generation families. *Sociology*, *40*(2), 335-352.

Brown, P. (1990). The 'third wave': Education and the ideology of parentocracy. *British journal of sociology of education*, *11*(1), 65-86.

Brown. S. (2014). Intensive Mothering as an Adaptive Response to Our Cultural Environment. In *Intensive mothering: The cultural contradictions of modern motherhood*. Demeter Press. (pp.27-46)

Cabrera, N. J., Shannon, J. D., & Tamis-LeMonda, C. (2007). Fathers' influence on their children's cognitive and emotional development: From toddlers to pre-K. *Applied Development Science*, *11*(4), 208-213.

Chodorow, N. (1978). The Reproduction of. *Mothering: Psychoanalysis and the Sociology of Gender*.

Chua, A. (2011). *Battle hymn of the tiger mother*. Bloomsbury Publishing.

Coley, R. L., Carrano, J., & Lewin-Bizan, S. (2011). Unpacking links between fathers' antisocial behaviors and children's behavior problems: Direct, indirect, and interactive effects. *Journal of abnormal child psychology*, *39*(6), 791-804.

Connell, R. W., & Messerschmidt, J. W. (2005). Hegemonic masculinity: Rethinking the concept. *Gender & society*, *19*(6), 829-859.

Connell, R. (2011). The neoliberal parent. Mothers and fathers in the new market society. In *Confronting equality: Gender, knowledge and global change*. Polity.

Cooper, M. (2000). Being the "go-to guy": Fatherhood, masculinity, and the organization of work in Silicon Valley. Qualitative Sociology, 23(4), 379-405.

Cooper, M. (2014). *Cut adrift: Families in insecure times*. University of California press.

Crompton, R. (2006). *Employment and the family: The reconfiguration of work and family life in contemporary societies*. Cambridge University Press.

Cucchiara, M. (2013). "Are we doing damage?" Choosing an urban public school in an era of parental anxiety. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, *44*(1), 75-93.

Dermott, E. (2018). Potential versus Reality: The Importance of Resources in Challenging Gendered Family Practices. *Sociologica*, *12*(3), 37-45.

Douglas, S., & Michaels, M. (2005). *The mommy myth: The idealization of motherhood and how it has undermined all women*. Simon and Schuster.

Duben, A. (1982). The significance of family and kinship in urban Turkey. *Sex roles, family and community in Turkey*, 73-99.

Duncan, S. (2005). Mothering, class and rationality. *The Sociological Review*, *53*(1), 50-76.

Ehrenreich, B. (1989). *Fear of falling*. Pantheon.

Ennis, L. R. (Ed.). (2014). *Intensive mothering: The cultural contradictions of modern motherhood*. Demeter Press.

Faircloth, C., Hoffman, D. M., & Layne, L. L. (Eds.). (2013). *Parenting in global perspective: Negotiating ideologies of kinship, self and politics*. Routledge.

Fournier, V. (1999). The appeal to 'professionalism' as a disciplinary mechanism. *The sociological review*, *47*(2), 280-307.

Friedman, H. L. (2013). *Playing to win: Raising children in a competitive culture*. Univ of California Press.

Furedi, F. (2008). *Paranoid parenting: Why ignoring the experts may be best for your child*. Continuum.

Futoshi, T. (2007, July). The trends of discourse on fatherhood and father's conflict in Japan'. In *15th biennial conference of Japanese Studies Association of Australia, Canberra*.

Gillies, V. (2008). Childrearing, class and the new politics of parenting. *Sociology Compass*, *2*(3), 1079-1095.

Göncü, A., Özer, S., & AHIOĞLU, N. (2012). Childhood in Turkey: Social class and gender differences in schooling, labor, and play. In *World Yearbook of Education 2009* (pp. 87-105). Routledge.

Hays, S. (1998). *The cultural contradictions of motherhood*. Yale University Press.

Hendrick, H. (2015). Constructions and reconstructions of British childhood: An interpretative survey, 1800 to the present. In *Constructing and reconstructing childhood* (pp. 29-53). Routledge.

Henwood, K., & Procter, J. (2003). The 'good father': Reading men's accounts of paternal involvement during the transition to first-time fatherhood. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, *42*(3), 337-355.

Hochschild, A. R. (1979). Emotion work, feeling rules, and social structure. *American journal of sociology*, *85*(3), 551-575.

Hochschild, A. R. (2004). The commodity frontier. *Self, Social Structure and Beliefs: Essays in Sociology. University of California Press, Berkeley, California*, 38-56.

Hochschild, A., & Machung, A. (2012). *The second shift: Working families and the revolution at home*. Penguin.

Imamoğlu, E. O. (1987). An interdependence model of human development.

İlkkaracan, İ. (2012). Why so few women in the labor market in Turkey?. *Feminist Economics*, *18*(1), 1-37.

İlkkaracan, İ. (2019). Kadın İstihdamı Politika Söyleminde 1970'lerden günümüze dönüşümler: 'Eğitim Şart' tan İş-Yaşam Dengesi ve Kapsayıcı Büyüme Hedefli Makroekonomik Politikalara. In Kadın Emeği Seçme Yazılar (Ed.). İletişim Yayınları

Kabasakal, H. (1998). Türkiye'de Üst Düzey Kadın Yöneticilerin Profili. In A.B. Hacımirzaoğlu (Ed.) *75 Yılda Kadınlar ve Erkekler* (pp. 303-312). Tarih Vakfı Yayınları

Kagitcibasi, C., & Ataca, B. (2005). Value of children and family change: A three-decade portrait from Turkey. *Applied Psychology*, *54*(3), 317-337.

Kagitcibasi, C. (2007). *Family, self, and human development across cultures: Theory and applications*. Routledge.

Kandiyoti, D. (1997). Cinsiyet rolleri ve toplumsal değişim: Türkiyeli kadınlara ilişkin karşılaştırmalı bir değerlendirme. *Cariyeler, bacılar, yurttaşlar*, 21-48.

Katartzi, E. (2017). Youth, family and education: exploring the Greek case of parentocracy. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, *26*(3), 310-325.

Kaya, Ö. (2008). Mothering experiences of professional women in Turkey: child bearing, child caring and child rearing. *Unpublished Master's Thesis, Middle East Technical University, Ankara.*

Kessen, W. (1979). The American child and other cultural inventions. *American Psychologist*, *34*(10), 815.

Mackintosh, V.H., Liss, M. and Schiffrin, H.H. (2014) In *Intensive mothering: The cultural contradictions of modern motherhood*. Demeter Press. (pp.142-159)

McMahon, A. (1999). *Taking care of men: Sexual politics in the public mind.* Cambridge University Press.

Milkie, M. A., & Warner, C. H. (2014). Status Safeguarding: Mothers' Work to Secure Children's Place in the Social Hierarchy. *Intensive mothering: The cultural contradictions of modern motherhood*, 66-85.

Miller, T. (2010). " It's a triangle that's difficult to square": men's intentions and practices around caring, work and first-time fatherhood. *Fathering*, *8*(3), 362.

Moors, A., Jureidini, R., Özbay, F., & Sabban, R. (2009). Migrant domestic workers: a new public presence in the Middle East?. *Social Science Research Council (forthcoming)*.

Onur, B. (2012). Çocukluğun ve çocuk yetiştirmenin tarihi. *Ana babalık: Kuram ve araştırma*, 19-59.

Özbay, F. (1990). Kadınların Ev İçi ve Ev Dışı Uğraşlarındaki Değişme. *Ş. Tekeli (ed.)*, 115-140.

Özbay, F. (1982). Evkadınları. *Ekonomik Yaklasim*, *3*(7), 209-225.

Özbay, F. (1998). Türkiye'de Kadın Emeği ve İstihdamına İlişkin Çalışmaların Gelişimi. *Özbay 1998a içinde*, 147-181.

Lareau, A., & Conley, D. (Eds.). (2008). *Social class: How does it work?*. Russell Sage Foundation.

Lareau, A. (2011). *Unequal childhoods: Class, race, and family life*. Univ of California Press.

LaRossa, R. (2012). *The historical study of fatherhood: Theoretical and methodological considerations*.

Lee, E., Bristow, J., Faircloth, C., & Macvarish, J. (2014). *Parenting culture studies*. Springer.

Lupton, D., & Barclay, L. (1997). *Constructing fatherhood: Discourses and experiences*. Sage Publications, Inc.

Nelson, M. K. (2010). *Parenting out of control: Anxious parents in uncertain times*. NYU Press.

Palladino, H. (2014) The Cultural Contradictions of Fatherhood: Is There An Ideology of Intensive Fathering? In *Intensive mothering: The cultural contradictions of modern motherhood*. Demeter Press. (pp. 280-298)

Parla, A. (2014). Göçmen kadınlar ailenin ve aile politikalarının neresindeler?

Pollock, L. A. (1983). *Forgotten children: Parent-child relations from 1500 to 1900*. Cambridge University Press.

Pugh, A. J. (2018). Parenting in an Insecure Age: Class, Gender and the Flexible Child. *Sociologica*, *12*(3), 11-24.

Ranson, G. (2001). Men at Work: Change—or No Change? —in the Era of the "New Father". Men and Masculinities, 4(1), 3-26.

Reay, D. (2004). Gendering Bourdieu's concepts of capitals? Emotional capital, women and social class. *The sociological review*, 57-74.

Reich, J. A. (2014). Neoliberal mothering and vaccine refusal: imagined gated communities and the privilege of choice. *Gender & Society*, *28*(5), 679-704.

Rutz, H. J., & Erol, M. Balkan. 2009. *Reproducing Class: Education, Neoliberalism, and the Rise of the New Middle Class in Istanbul*.

Smeyers, P. (2010). Child rearing in the "Risk" Society: on the Discourse of Rights and the "Best Interests of a Child". *Educational Theory*, *60*(3), 271-284.

Smith, R. (2010). Total parenting. *Educational Theory*, *60*(3), 357-369.

Stearns, P. N. (2016). *Childhood in world history*. Routledge.

Sancar, S. (2009). Erkeklik: imkansiz iktidar. *Ailede, Piyasada ve Sokakta Erkekler (Istanbul: Metis Yayincilik, 2. Baski, 2011)*.

Sunar, D. (2002). Change and continuity in the Turkish middle class family. *Autonomy and dependence in family: Turkey and Sweden in critical perspective*, 217-238.

Sunar, D., & Fisek, G. (2005). Contemporary Turkish families. *Families in global perspective*, 169-183.

Sunderland, J. (2006). 'Parenting' or 'mothering'? The case of modern childcare magazines. *Discourse & Society*, *17*(4), 503-528.

Takseva, T. (2014). How contemporary consumerism shapes intensive mothering practices. *Intensive mothering: The cultural contradictions of modern motherhood*, 211-232.

Vincent, C., & Martin, J. (2002). Class, culture and agency: Researching parental voice. *Discourse: studies in the cultural politics of education*, *23*(1), 108-127.

Vigoya, M. V. (2001). Contemporary Latin American perspectives on masculinity. *Men and masculinities*, *3*(3), 237-260.

Wacquant, L. (1998). Pierre Bourdieu. In *Key sociological thinkers* (pp. 215-229). Macmillan Education UK.

Warner, J. (2006). *Perfect madness: Motherhood in the age of anxiety*. Penguin.

Williams, J. (2010). *Reshaping the work-family debate*. Harvard University Press.

Wolf, J. B. (2010). *Is breast best?: Taking on the breastfeeding experts and the new high stakes of motherhood*. NYU Press.

Wright, K. (2008). Theorizing therapeutic culture: Past influences, future directions. *Journal of Sociology*, *44*(4), 321-336.

Zelizer, V. A. (1994). *Pricing the priceless child: The changing social value of children*. Princeton University Press.

APPENDICES

A. HUMAN SUBJECTS ETHICS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

UYGULAMALI ETİK ARAŞTIRMA MERKEZİ
APPLIED ETHICS RESEARCH CENTER

ORTA DOĞU TEKNİK ÜNİVERSİTESİ
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

DUMLUPINAR BULVARI 06800
ÇANKAYA ANKARA/TURKEY
T: +90 312 210 22 91
F: +90 312 210 79 59
ueam@metu.edu.tr
www.ueam.metu.edu.tr

Sayı: 28620816 / 06800

Konu: Değerlendirme Sonucu

08 AĞUSTOS 2018

Gönderen: ODTÜ İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu (İAEK)

İlgi: İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu Başvurusu

Sayın Doç.Dr. Fatma Umut BEŞPINAR

Danışmanlığını yaptığınız; yüksek lisans öğrencisi Sevil TOĞAY'ın "**Ebeveynlik ve prekarite: Türkiye'de ki Profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynlerin beklenti ve mücadele alanları**" başlıklı araştırması İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu tarafından uygun görülerek gerekli onay **2018-SOS-160** protokol numarası ile **08.08.2018 - 30.12.2018** tarihleri arasında geçerli olmak üzere verilmiştir.

Bilgilerinize saygılarımla sunarım.

Prof. Dr. Ş. Halil TURAN
Başkan V

Prof. Dr. Ayhan SOL
Üye

Prof. Dr. Ayhan Gürbüz DEMİR
Üye

Doç. Dr. Yaşar KONDAKÇI
Üye

Doç. Dr. Zana ÇITAK
Üye

Doç. Dr. Emre SELÇUK
Üye

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Pınar KAYGAN
Üye

Günümüzde ebeveynlerin çocuk yetiştirme konusunda endişeli oldukları görülmektedir. Öyle ki ebeveynlik nadiren rahattır ve hatta tam zamanlı bir işe dönüşmüştür. Bu endişenin nedenlerine ilişkin sorunun ilk cevabı yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisidir. Hays'e göre ebeveynlik pratiklerinin değerlendirildiği normatif bir standart haline gelen çocuk yetiştirmenin ciddi ölçüde finansal, duygusal ve zamansal bir yatırım gerektirmesi bu ideolojinin tanımıdır. Ebeveynler sürekli çocuklarının muhtemel bir başarısızlığına ilişkin yahut kendi ebeveynliklerinin yeterliğine dair kaygılara kapılmaktadırlar. Ebeveynlik günden güne daha da fazla birey kararı ile özdeşleşmektedir. Çocuk yetiştirmenin ağır yükleri ebeveynlerin omzuna yüklenirken, ebeveynler çocuklarının fiziksel, duygusal ve bilişsel gelişimlerinin ana sorumluluğunu üstlenen aktörler haline gelmiştir. Ancak sürekli bir çocuğun optimal gelişimini sağlamada hissedilen yetersizlik ebeveynleri çocuk yetiştirme konusunda profesyonel yardım almaya itmektedir. Bu noktada temel soru bütün ebeveynlerin bu minvalde davranıp davranmadığıdır. Yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisi farklı sınıf pozisyonlarını ortak kesmektedir ancak bu ideolojinin orta sınıfta kristalize olduğu söylenmektedir.

Ebeveynlik büyük ölçüde çocuğa yatırım yapabilmek ve çocuğun gelecek hayatında farklı pozisyonlarını garantileyebilmek için edinilmesi gereken bir beceri seti şeklini almaktadır. Öyle ki çocuk ebeveynin ana sorumluluğu haline gelirken, çocuğa yapılacak yatırımın ne ölçüde anne ve baba tarafından paylaşıldığı da mesele edilmektedir. Farklı sınıflardan anne ve babaların ebeveynlik deneyimlerinin farklılığına dikkat çekilirken, tüm bu ebeveyn belirleyiciliğinin asıl anlamı olan yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisinin kristalleştiği ve gerçek tezahürünü ortaya koyduğu orta sınıf içerisinde aynı şekilde anne ve babanın yeniden üretim odaklı ebeveynlik rollerinde aynı şekilde kendi içinde farklılaşmalar gözlemlenmektedir. Sınıf,

ebeveynliği anlamak için önemli bir lense dönüşürken, ebeveynlik deneyim ve pratiklerinin içeriğini anlarken toplumsal cinsiyet aynı şekilde mühim olmaktadır. Orta sınıf ebeveynlik kendini düşme korkusu ve yükselme hayali arasında sıkışmış bulurken, orta sınıf ebeveynliğin anne ve babalar tarafından ne açıdan farklı ne açıdan benzer deneyimlendiği de anlamak ebeveynliğe çoklu bir bakış sunmaktadır.

Bu temel noktalardan hareketle bu tez Türkiye'de aynı sınıf ve mesleki pozisyona sahip profesyonel 8 kadın ve 7 erkeğin ana babalık deneyimini araştırmaktadır. Tezin temel araştırma sorusu toplumsal cinsiyet kimliğinin profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynlerin ebeveynliklerini nasıl inşa ettiği ve ebeveynliklerini iş-ev yaşam dengesi, profesyonel ebeveynlik pratikleri ve sınıf pozisyonları üçgeninde nasıl şekillendirdiğini anlamak üzerinedir.

Bu soruları cevaplandırılmak için çalışma içerisinde ebeveynliğe dair literatürde dört temel nokta ele alınmaktadır: Ebeveynlik kavramının kendisi, orta sınıf ebeveynlik, ebeveynliğin cinsiyetli oluşu ve profesyonel iş yaşantısının ebeveynlik ile ilişkisi.

Ebeveynliğin anlamına vakıf olmak ebeveyn olmanın gündelik hallerine ilişkin pratiklerin neden ve nasıl böylesine bir mesele haline geldiğini ve dikkat çekmek için önemli olmaktadır. Çocuğun değerinin değişimi ve bu değişimin çocuk yetiştirmenin profesyonelleşmesi ile ilişkisi; ebeveynlerin rolünün değişmesi ve ebeveyn belirleyiciliği ile ilişkisi ve tüm bu iki önemli noktanın orta sınıf pozisyonu ile nasıl düşülmesi gerektiği kavramın dönüşümünde nelerin rol oynadığını görmeyi sağlamaktadır. Çocuğun ekonomik değeri yerini psikolojik değere bıraktıkça çocuk yetiştirme bilim olarak addedilmeye başlanmıştır. Diğer taraftan Amerika'dan yükselen Spock ebeveynlik stili çocukların bizatihi hayatın merkezine konulması fikrini yaygınlaştırmıştır. Doktor, terapist ve çocuk yetiştirme uzmanlarından alınacak yardım ile çocuğun her açıdan sağlıklı ve donanımlı olacağı düşüncesi öne sürülmüştür. Anne-çocuk bağlanması tüm hikâyenin merkezine koyulur ve anneler başlıca ebeveyn olarak görülmüştür. Orta sınıfı konu edilme sebebi ise orta sınıfın çocuğa maddi ve duygusal kaynakları sağlayabilecek ve bu sorumlulukları alabilecek

en geniş grup olmasıdır. Öyleyse ebeveynliğin anne ve baba olmanın iç güdülerle yapılabilmesi fikrinden uzaklaşılmıştır. Ebeveynlik doğal olandan kopuştur. Çocuklarla etkili baş etme yöntemi olan bir araçsal ve teknik mesele haline dönüşmüştür.

İkinci nokta ise orta sınıf ebeveynliğin karakteristikleridir. Bu ebeveynliği tanımlayan temel unsur tüketim aracılığıyla çocuğa yatırım yapmaktır. Bu pratik orta sınıf ebeveynler için sınıfsal ayrıcalıkların korunmasının ve sınıf pozisyonunun tekrar üretiminin tek yolu olarak görülmektedir. Bu sebeple bu sınıfa mensup ebeveynler çocuklarının eğitimi ve güvenliği ile yakından ilgilenmektedirler. Türkiye'de orta sınıf ebeveynliğe yapılacak bir tartışmada ise orta sınıf çekirdek aile idealinin ve bu idealinin ana unsuru olan tüketimin ebeveynlik çerçevesinde nasıl kurgulandığını görmek önemlidir.

Böylece üçüncü nokta olarak kadın ve erkeklerin ebeveynliği deneyimleme biçimindeki farklılıklar göze çarpmaktadır. Orta sınıf ebeveynlikte annelerin çocukların okul sonrası aktivitelere katılması, en iyi okullara gitmesi ve çocuğun güvenliğinin sağlanması görevlerini yerine getirme zorunluluğunun olduğu anlaşılmaktadır. Neoliberal bir lens ise annelerin çocuklara dair yapılacaklar listesini iyice ayrıntılandırdığı ve birey sorumluluğunun çocukla hayatına dair her şeyin iyice bir meseleye dönüştüğü günümüzde öne çıktığını göstermektedir. Öte yandan babalar ise yeni babalık ideallerinin kural setine riayet etmeye çalışırken daha katılımcı baba olmak aileyi finansal olarak ayakta tutma görevini geri plana atmamıştır.

Profesyonel iş yaşantısını aynı hikâye içerisinde değerlendirmek ise babalar açısından babalık izninin ciddi bir tartışma konusu olduğunu göstermiştir. Pek çok farklı kaynakta babalık izni alabilmenin babanın hayat boyu ebeveynlik performansında değişiklik yaratacağı öne sürülmektedir. Profesyonel iş yaşantısı olan babalar için babalık profesyonel bir işe dönüşmüştür. Öyle ki yeni babalık iş odaklı erkeklikle özdeşleşmektedir. Diğer yandan profesyonel iş hayatındaki kadın sayısı erkeklere kıyasla Türkiye'de de oldukça düşüktür. Eğer kadınlar piyasanın pek

çok yapısal engellerine rağmen bu iş yaşantısına sahip olursa anneliğe de kariyerlerini sürdürebilmek için profesyonel yaklaşmaktadırlar. Aynı zamanda çok eğitimli profesyonel iş yaşantısına sahip kadınların çocuklarını daha iyi yetiştirmek için iş bıraktıkları da bilinen bir gerçektir.

Bu çalışma bahsedilen dört noktaya ek profesyonel orta sınıfın tanımını daha iyi yapabilmek için Ehrenreich, Nelson ve Bourdieu'nün farklı kavramsal çerçevelerinden yararlanmaktadır. Profesyonel orta sınıf Ehrenreich'ın deyimiyle toplumsal statüleri aslen mal varlığına dayanmayan aksine statüleri eğitimleri, eğitimin erişim sağladığı profesyonel meslekler ve bu mesleklere atfedilen anlamlarla alakalı olan kimseleri tanımlamaktadır. Sosyal ve kültürel sermaye bu anlamları anlamakta önemli bir yol olurken profesyonel iş yaşantısının gereği olan rasyonellik, efektif çalışma, kontrol, kişisel gelişim ve kişisel yatırım Nelson'a göre profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynliği de tanımlayan değerler haline gelmiştir. Diğer taraftan Bourdieu'nün sosyal sınıf kavramı da bizatihi kullanılarak profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynliğin aktif bir biçimde nasıl ebeveynlerin ürünü olduğunu ve sınıfsal yeniden üretimin ebeveynlik pratikleriyle nasıl gerçekleştiğini görmek için önemlidir. Bourdieu'ye göre farklı sosyal konumlardan bireyler farklı sosyalleşmektedirler. Aynı şekilde Bourdieu'nün ailenin ekonomik, sosyal ve kültürel ayrıcalıklarının toplanma ve aktarılma alanı olduğunu belirtmesi ebeveynliğin nasıl bir sosyal ve kültürel sermaye aktarımı aracı haline geldiğini anlamak için önemlidir. Sınıf pozisyonunu tekrar üretmek yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisinin gerekliliklerine de uymak anlamına gelirken sınıfın kavram itibariyle statik olmadığını görmek mühim hale gelmektedir. Profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynler ebeveynliklerini aktif şekilde inşa etmekte bunu da hem çocuklarının hem de kendilerinin habituslarını oluşturacak sürece kaynak aktarmakla mümkün kılmaktadırlar. Bu ebeveynlerin toplum içerisindeki pozisyonlarını konsolide ederken ebeveynlik pratikleri yeniden üretimin aracı olarak tekrar yerini almaktadır.

Bu çerçevede çalışmanın amacına ve sorularına uygun olarak niteliksel bir araştırma yöntemi tercih edilmiş ve yarı yapılandırılmış derinlemesine mülakatlar yapılmıştır.

Bu tercih ebeveynlik deneyimi ve pratiklerine çoklu bir bakış sunma isteğindedir. Şüphesiz ebeveynliği araştırmakta niceliksel metot tercih eden pek çok çalışma da mevcuttur ancak bu çalışmaların ortak özelliği belirli bir ebeveynlik davranışı ya da stilinin yordayıcı bileşenlerini bulmayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu metot ile 2017 senesinin başında orta sınıfın farklı fraksiyonlardan gelen ve Ankara'da yaşayan 7 farklı ebeveyn ile pilot çalışma düzenlenmiştir. Bu çalışma sonucunda farklı orta sınıfların ebeveynlik pratiklerine ilişkin farklı çıkarımlarda bulunduğu görülmüştür. Bilhassa okul seçimi, aktivite ve profesyonel yardım almayı daha iyi anlayabilmek için profesyonel orta sınıf pozisyonuna sahip ebeveynlerle görüşmenin daha anlamlı olacağı sonucuna varılmıştır. Böylece gerekli etik izinleri alınarak, 2018 yılı ortasında 15 görüşmeci ile sonlanacak asıl saha sürecinin ilk adımı atılmıştır.

8 kadın 7 erkekten oluşan görüşmeciler Ankara ve İstanbul'da ikamet etmektedirler. Bu şehirler iki temel sebep ile seçilmiştir. Profesyonel iş yaşantısına sahip insanları bulmanın görece kolaylığı ve bu şehirlerin profesyonel çalışma hayatına ev sahipliği yapabilecek global ölçüde şirket ve kurumları bulundurmasıdır. Görüşmecilerinin her birinin bir yahut iki çocuğu bulunmaktadır. Yaşları bir ve on yedi arasında değişen çocukların yaş aralığı fazla gözükebilir ancak yalnızca iki çocuk 14 ve 17 yaşlarındadır. Bu iki çocuğun ebeveynleri özellikle seçilmiştir. Bu ebeveynlerin yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisine çocuğu küçük olan ebeveynler gibi yanıt verip vermeyeceği görülmek istenmiştir.

Bu teorik çerçevede bir değerlendirme yapan tezin amacına paralel Ankara ve İstanbul'da 15 farklı ebeveyn ile yapılan görüşmeler iki temel bulgu sunmaktadır. Bu ebeveynlerin ebeveynliklerini inşa etme süreci cinsiyetlidir. Anneler için çalışan anne olmak iyi anne olmak ile eşleşirken kendilerini kendi annelerinin ebeveynliklerinden ayrı kılmak istemeleri onların profesyonel ebeveynlik deneyiminin de tanımlayıcısı haline gelmektedir. Kendi annelerini bilhassa çok fedakâr, yakın ve hayatını çocuklarına vakfetmiş biçimde tanımlayan görüşmeciler annelerinin aksine farklı bir anne olmayı tercih etmektedirler. Sürekli çalışan babanın eksikliğini doldurmaya çalışan çocuk ile baba arasındaki iletişimin kurulmasında

aracı rol oynayan çocuğa bakabilmek için işini veya okulunu bırakan hatta hiç çalışmayan annelerinin tersine dış dünyayla da tanımlama isteklerini dile getirmişlerdir. Bu açıdan anneler bilhassa hem kendi hem de çocuklarının birey taraflarına yatırımı vurgular ve bu yatırımın ancak çalışma hayatı ile mümkün olduğunun altını çizerken profesyonel annenin sınıfsal yeniden üretime dayalı ebeveynlik pratiğini profesyonel iş yaşantısının değerlerini alma ve hayatında öne çıkarma biçimi olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır. İş ve ev yaşam dengesi arasında iyi anne olmanın anlamını sürekli genişleten anneler bir taraftan kendilerini gerçekleştirme idealleri, kendilerini kendi annelerinden farklı kılma arzuları ve çocuğu kendi sınıfsal pozisyonlarına uygun sosyal, kültürel ve ekonomik sermayelerle yetiştirebilme isteğinin gerekliliklerini yerine getirebilme arasında kalırlar. Bu anlamda iki çeşit anne tipi belirmiştir. Bazı anne görüşmeciler kariyerlerine ara verdiğini ya da işi tamamen bıraktığını belirtmiştir. Bu anneler için eşlerinin ve çocuklarının kendileri hakkında ne düşüneceği büyük bir kaygı konusu haline gelirken ancak çalışma hayatının profesyonel orta sınıf pozisyonunu tekrar üretebileceği de düşünüldüğünde annelerin kaygıları iyice artmaktadır. Bu anneler için yeterince birey olabilmiş çocuk yetiştirmek ancak çalışma hayatında kazanılan ve öğrenilen birey olmakla sağlanacağından işi bırakmak onlar için katlanılmazdır. Diğer tip anneler ise her şeye rağmen profesyonel çalışma hayatından vazgeçmeyen ve bu hayatın sağladığı olanakların çocuklarını kendine yeten konuma getirmesini umdukları bu meşru kılma mekanizması ile hareket ederler. Bu anneler için kendilerini gerçekleştirmeye dair inançları çok önemli gözükürken çocukların büyüyüp gittiğinde bir boşluğa düşmüş ve profesyonel orta sınıf statüsünü kaybetme noktasına gelmiş anne olmak bir seçim dahi değildir. Yurtdışı seyahatleri, akademik toplantılar ve uzun çalışma saatleri annelerin yetersizlik hislerini perçinlerken iş hayatını sürdürebilse ve çocuklarını arzu ettiği şekilde yetiştirme noktasına gelebilse bile bu annelerin de ödediği bir bedel bulunmaktadır: profesyonel iş hayatındaki yoğun rekabeti bir kenara bırakıp kariyerlerinde hızlı yükseliş fikrini rafa kaldırmak. Anneler çalışma hayatını bıraksın yahut bırakmasın yetersizlik hissi ortaktır. Kariyerlerinden ödün verip vermeme hadisesi, çocuk yetiştirmeye ilişkin kaygıları ve eşleri ile ilişkileri annelerin iş-ev yaşam dengesi arasında ebeveynliklerini nasıl inşa ettiklerini özetlemektedir.

Babalar ise ebeveynliğini inşa etme süreci annelere benzer biçimde kendilerini babalarından farklı kılma çabası iken babaların annelere göre kendi babalarına olan bağlılığının çok az olduğu ortaya çıkmıştır. Sürekli yorgun ve yoğun olan babalarının aksine, bu babalar duygusal olarak mesafeyi ve açık paylaşımından uzak durmayı tercih etmemektedir. Kendi babalarını fiziksel olarak mevcut ancak ebeveynlikte hayali bir figür olarak tanımlayan baba olan görüşmeciler anne görüşmecilerin aksine bireyselliği uğruna mücadele edilecek ve kazanılacak bir özellik olarak görmemektedir. Bu açıdan babalarına benzerliği vurgulanabilir çünkü babalar tıpkı dış dünya ile özdeşleşmenin belirleyici özellik olduğu babaları gibi çocuğa yer bırakan baba olmayı istemektedirler. Çocuk ile daha yakın olmak, çocuğa daha fazla zaman ayırmak ve çocuk ile daha fazla paylaşımda bulunmak babaların özlemlerindendir. Ancak profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynlik deneyimleri ev-iş hayatı dengesi söz konusu olduğunda yeni iş odaklı erkekliğin babalığa eklemlendiğini ve babalar için kaygının annelere kıyasla çok boyutlu olmadığını ortaya koymuştur. Babaların profesyonel iş kimlikleri güçlü olmaya devam ederken babalar artık tek başına ailenin tüm finansal yükünü taşıyan unsur olmamalarına rağmen yeni katılımcı baba modelini deneyimleme biçimleri kısıtlı kalmaktadır. Uzun çalışma saatleri, iş yerindeki beklentiler, babalık iznine ulaşımın zorluğu gibi pek çok sebep iş odaklı erkeklik fikrini daha da perçinlemiş ve bu yeni erkeklik hali katılımcı babalığa eklemlenmiştir. Bu haliyle babaların temel endişesi zamanı yönetmek, finansal açıdan daha da yeterli hissetmek olarak görünmektedir. Ebeveynliklerinin inşası konusunda annelerin endişelerinin hem kendilerine hem çocuklarına hem eşlerine hem de iş hayatlarına dair olduğu görülürken ve anneliğin bilhassa mahrem alanda çocuğun tüm sorumluluğunu sırtlayan asıl ebeveyn olduğu ortaya çıkarken babalar hala içerideki yabancı gibi gözükmektedir. Bu açılardan bakıldığında hem anne hem de babaların duygularını yönettiği görülebilir. Nasıl birer anne baba olmak istediklerine dair verdikleri kararlar sürekli yönettikleri duygularından geçmektedir. Yetersizlik yahut suçluluk, hisleri farklı zeminlerde meşru kılınıp anlamlandırılmaktadır.

Tezin ikinci bulgusu ise ebeveynliklerini inşa sürecinde ebeveynliği deneyimleme biçimi farklılaşan bu ebeveynlerin pratikleridir. Doktora sormak, kitap okumak, profesyonel bakıcı tutmak ve iyi özel okul-aktivite olarak sınıflandırılmış pratiklerin ortak özelliği hem anne hem babalar için aynı şekilde bu pratikler aracılığı ile kendi ve çocuklarının sınıfsal konumlarını yeniden üretmek olarak vuku bulmaktadır. Çoğunlukla üst orta sınıfta babalığı çocuğun dış dünya ile ilişkisini regüle etmek olarak vurgulayan literatürün aksine bu çalışmada hem anne hem babaların okul ve aktivite seçimi açısından endişeleri benzeşmektedir. Babalar bir parça daha fazla inanılmaz artan özel yabancı okul fiyatlarına dikkat çekerken bu okulların çocuğu dünya vatandaşı yapabilecek, otonomisi olan bir birey kılacak, kendi sınıfsal pozisyonuna ait insanlarla sosyalleştirecek, gelecek yaşantısında piyasanın her türlü belirsizliğinde uyum sağlama, talep ve pazarlık etme becerileriyle sınıfsal pozisyonunda kalabilecek adımların hepsi anne ve babalarda ortaklaşmaktadır. Annenin mahrem babanın görece dış dünya ile ilişkili kaygıları argümanı ise kendini daha çok çocuğun gelişiminin her adımını garantilemek için yardım almakta göstermektedir. Kendi ailesine sormak yerine bir profesyonelden çocuk yetiştirme konusunda yardım isteyen babalar profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynliğin gereğini sınıfsal pozisyonunu bu pratikle şekillendirme, babalığını kamu alanında performe etme, sürekli bir kişisel gelişim ile hayatının önemli bir adımı olan çocuğun sağlığı ve başarısını güvence altına almak ile yerine getirmektedir. Anneler keza çocuk ile yanlış kurulacak bir ilişkinin çocuğun gelişimini tehlikeye atmasına dair duydukları endişeler babalar ile benzerdir ancak annelerin profesyonel yardım talepleri annelerin kendilerini çocukla özellikle duygusal açıdan kurulacak ilişkide ana ebeveyn olarak gördüğünün altını çizmektedir. Bir başka taraftan çocuğu doğru yetiştirebilmek için okunan kitaplar babalara babalığı öğrenme fırsatı sunarken ebeveynlik yine aktif olarak bir inşa sürecinden geçmekte, yeni babalık modeli deneyimlenmekte ve geleneksel erkekliğin bir anlamda yıkılarak babalar birinci elden babalıklarını dönüştürmektedirler. Ebeveynliğin doğru ve yanlışlarına odaklanan bu kaynaklar anneler için ise küresel düzeyde farklı ebeveynliklerle ile karşılaşmadır. Anneliği zaten bilen anneler çocuk yetiştirmekte çok öne çıkardıkları birey vurgusunu takip ettikleri Fransız ve Amerikan tipi farklı değerleri öne çıkaran ebeveynlikler ile kendi ebeveynliklerini sürekli şekillendirmektedir. Son olarak ise çoğunlukla Filipinli olan

profesyonel bakıcı seçimi ise profesyonel orta sınıf pozisyonunu güçlendirmektedir. Çok eğitimli olan ve İngilizce konuşan bu dadılar çocuğun dünya vatandaşlığına hazırlığında önemli bir adımken ailenin sınıfsal pozisyonunu da simgelemektedir. Dadıyı bulma sürecinin bile oldukça profesyonel oluşu profesyonel orta sınıfın mesleğine atfettiği değerleri bir kere daha özel alana taşıdığını ve çocuğu için seçtiği bakıcının bile sınıfsal pozisyonunu tekrar ürettiğini göstermektedir. Özellikle anneler için bu bakıcılar evde sağlayamadıkları ev içi emeği telafi mekanizması haline gelirken diğer taraftan bakıcının sürekli gözetlenmesi bakıcının yanlış bir davranışının çocuğun sınıfsal pozisyonuna uygun bir davranış geliştiremeyeceği endişesi de ortaya çıkmıştır. Profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynlik sınıfsal pozisyona uygun olan davranışı yerine getirmek ile yakından alakalı hale gelirken özlemini duydukları anne babalık ile zorlukları sebebiyle yapılabilen anne babalık arasındaki sıkışma hissi bu ebeveynliği kendine has kılan bir konuma getirmektedir.

Ebeveynlik ilişkiseldir. Yalnızca anne baba çocuk arasındaki ilişkilerden değil bu üç temel aktör ve onların hem özel hem kamusal alandaki farklı kimlikleri arasındaki sürekli ilişkilenmenin ürünüdür. Profesyonel orta sınıf ebeveynlik sahip olduğu sosyal ve kültürel sermayenin büyüklüğü düşünüldüğünde bu sermayeleri çocuklarına farklı pratiklerle aktarmaya çalışırken anne ve babaların kendi ebeveynliklerini inşa etme süreçleri toplumsal cinsiyet kimliklerinin toplumsal cinsiyet normları, devamlılık-kopuş ve profesyonel iş yaşantısı ekseninde sürekli yeniden yorumlanmaktadır. Ana babalığı profesyonel bir işmişçesine performe eden görüşmeciler bitmek bilmez şekilde ebeveynlik özlemleri ve aktif biçimde yarattıkları ve onların da pratiklerini yatan sınıfsal konumun gerekliliklerinin onlara sunduğu mücadele içindedirler. Her ne kadar ebeveynlik kavramının kendisi toplumsal cinsiyet açısından nötr gibi gözükse de anne ve babanın ebeveynlik yaptığı zemin eşit değildir. Yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisi hem anne hem de babalar tarafından deneyimlenmektedir. Ancak piyasa dili, kadınlık ve erkekliklerin birbirlerine nasıl eklemlendiği ebeveynlikte cinsiyet farklarını anlamakta önemlidir. Kadın ebeveynliğinin kurucu unsuru yetmezlik hissidir. Bu his annelerin sınıfsal davranış olarak doğru olanı tercih etmesi ile geleneksel olarak daha kabul gören fedakâr ve

kendini adayan annelik ile çakışmaktadır. Çakışma noktalarında annelerin uyguladıkları stratejiler hem bu hissi azaltmak hem de sınıfsal konumun yeniden üretimini gerçekleştirebilmek için sahip olan kaynakları sürdürmek ve bu kaynakları çocuğa en optimal düzeyde tahsis etmek üzerine kuruludur. Bu anlamda profesyonel orta sınıf olmanın gereği gözüken doktora sormaktan iyi okul seçmeye kadar yayılan ebeveynlik pratikleri anneler açısından sürekli sürdürülmesi gereken, kendilerini kendi annelerinden farklı kılmalarını sağlayacak ama bir taraftan da onları ev-iş yaşamının stresli dengesi arasında bırakacak pratiklerdir. Diğer taraftan yeni babalığın adı hegemonyacı erkekliğin kendini uzun saatler çalışan ve ebeveynlikte daha fazla rol sahibi olmaya çalışmaya eklemlemesiyle babalar erkekliklerini temsil eden profesyonel iş yaşantısındaki pozisyonlarında olası bir sarsılmadan endişe duyarlar. Bu açıdan atılan her adımın zaman yönetimi ile ilgili hale geldiği babaların ebeveynliği deneyimleme biçimlerinde babaların ebeveynliğe dair endişelerinin daha kişisel ve tek boyutlu olduğu görülmüştür. Annelerin ebeveynliği ancak bir şeylerden feragat ederek mümkündür ancak profesyonel orta sınıf babalık kaybetmeden kazanmak üzerinedir. Baba olmayı iş kimlikleri kadar önemli gören babaların ebeveynliğe katılım derecesi anneler ile eşit değildir. Rağmen kendi babalarına göre ebeveynlikte daha fazla söz alan bu babalar ile erkek olmanın anlamının değiştiği de aşikardır. Bizatihi eğitim ve okul sonrası aktivite seçiminde yeniden üretime dayalı ebeveynlikleri daha da benzeşen bu anne babaların ebeveynliklerini inşa etme biçimleri ve diğer ebeveynlik pratiklerini deneyimleme halleri cinsiyetlidir.

Ebeveynlik eylem halidir. Ne çocuğu yetiştirmek ne de onu büyütmek ne de anne-baba olmak ebeveynlikle aynı değildir. Eylem hali anne-baba-çocuğun birbirleri ile olan ilişkilerinin hem aile içi dinamikler hem de dış dünya ile nasıl ilişkilendikleri üzerinden kurulur. Çocuk yetiştirme sorumluluğu bireyselleştikçe ve anne babaların birey kararı çocuğun sağlığı, eğitimi ve başarısı için belirleyici hale geldikçe ebeveynlerin pratik ve deneyimleri de daha bireysel olmaktadır. Profesyonel orta sınıf pozisyonu ve iş yaşantısının gereği bu pozisyonları temsil eden birey, otonomi, rasyonellik, kişisel yatırım ve kişisel gelişim kavramlarını oldukça öne çıkarmaktadır. Ebeveynlik her anlamı ile profesyonel bir işe dönüşürken bu işin arka

planında hem sınıfsal pozisyonu korumak arzusu hem de geçmişten farklı olmak isteği vardır. Ancak anne babaların profesyonel iş yaşantısı ile ebeveynlik sorumluluklarını nasıl dengelediği onların anne babalığın profesyonelleşmesini nasıl deneyimlediklerini de ortaya çıkarmaktadır. Yoğun ebeveynlik ideolojisinin beklentileri bilhassa anneler için ev-iş yaşam dengesi arasında sıkışmayı babalar için ise zaten iş kimliğinin önemini hiçbir zaman kaybetmemesi halini almıştır.

Eğer ebeveynler özellikle ve kasıtlı biçimde bir pratiği deneyimliyorlarsa bu açıkça pratiğin kendisinin bir amacı olduğundandır. Amacın tanımlanma biçimi ebeveynin cinsiyetine göre değişmektedir. Yetersizlik hissi, daha iyi bir ebeveyn olma isteği ve çocuğa hayat içerisinde onu piyasa koşullarına hazır kılacak aynı zamanda kendi sınıfsal pozisyonundan insanlarla sosyalleşmesini sağlayacak pratiklerin hepsi ebeveynlerin nasıl bir anne-baba olmaya dair yaptığı seçimle ilgilidir. Elbette burada nasıl bir kadın-erkek olacağım sorusu yapılan ebeveynlikle yakından bağlantılıdır. Anne ve babalığın kültürel ideolojisinin ebeveynlerden beklentileri sürdükçe sürdükçe ebeveynliğin cinsiyetli ve sınıflı tarafları kendini devam ettirecektir.