THE CATHOLIC CHURCH AND NATIONALISM IN SPAIN AND IN
CATALONIA DURING FRANCO PERIOD

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

PELİN DOYGUN

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN THE DEPARTMENT OF
INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS

SEPTEMBER 2018

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

———————————————
Prof. Dr. Tülin Gençöz
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

———————————————
Prof. Dr. Özlem Tür
Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

———————————————
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zana Çitak Aytürk
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kürşad Ertuğrul (METU, ADM)   ———————————

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zana Çitak Aytürk (METU, IR)   ———————————

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Hakan Övünç Ongur (TOBB-ETU, TAR)   ———————————

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last Name: Pelin Doygun

Signature:

ABSTRACT

THE CATHOLIC CHURCH AND NATIONALISM IN SPAIN AND IN CATALONIA DURING FRANCOIST ERA

Doygun, Pelin

M.S., Department of International Relations

Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zana Çitak Aytürk

September, 2018, 164 pages

This thesis is an attempt to understand the role of the Catholic Church in Spain and in Catalonia, and their respective attitudes towards the Franco regime. While the Catholic Church in Spain almost unequivocally identified with the regime, the Catalan Catholic Church developed an oppositional stance. This thesis argues that what explains the difference in the policies of the respective Catholic Churches is the differences in the construction of nationalism in each case, both in terms of motivations and of actors involved. Accordingly, it claims that while the Spanish Catholic Church adopted state-centered policies from the beginning, the Catalan Catholic Church was characterized by a society-centered approach. The Spanish and the Catalan Church's different perceptions of threat, respectively from state and society is held as the core of different policies. It is only towards the end of the Franco regime, and again, only gradually that the Spanish Catholic Church abandoned its traditional state-centered attitude. Thus, this thesis attempts to contribute to the studies on the relationship between nationalism and religion, by first problematizing assumptions of either a mutually exclusive

relationship between the two or, the opposite, an automatic or almost symbiotic relationship; and secondly, by demonstrating a dynamic relationship, one open to change and transformation, between these two phenomena.

ÖZ

FRANCO DİKTATÖRLÜĞÜNDE İSPANYA VE KATALUNYA'DA KATOLİK KİLİSESİ VE MİLLİYETÇİLİK

Doygun, Pelin

Yüksek Lisans, Uluslararası İlişkiler Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi: Doç. Dr. Zana Çitak Aytürk

Eylül, 2018, 164 sayfa

Bu tez, Katolik Kilisesi'nin İspanya ve Katalunya'daki rolünü ve Franco rejimine karşı tutumlarını anlamaya yönelik bir girişimdir. İspanya'daki Katolik Kilisesi neredeyse tartışmasız bir şekilde rejime destek verirken, Katalan Katolik Kilisesi rejime muhalif bir duruş geliştirmiştir. Bu tez, söz konusu kiliselerin politikalarındaki farklılığın nedeni olarak, her iki bölgede milliyetçiliğin, motivasyonlar ve dahil olan aktörler temelinde farklı şekilde inşa edilmiş olmasını tartışmaktadır. Dolayısıyla, İspanyol Katolik Kilisesi başından itibaren devlet-merkezci politikalar benimsemişken, Katalan Katolik Kilisesi toplum-merkezci bir yaklaşımla karakterize edilmiştir. İspanyol ve Katalan Kilisesi'nin sırasıyla devletten ve toplumdan olmak üzere algıladıkları farklı tehditler, bu politikaların çekirdeğini oluşturmuştur. Yalnızca Franco rejiminin sonuna doğru ve yavaş bir şekilde İspanyol Katolik Kilisesi, geleneksel devlet-merkezci tutumunu terk etmiştir. Bu nedenle bu tez, öncelikle din ve milliyetçilik ilişkisinin karşılıklı olarak ya dışlayıcı ya da tam tersi olduğu ve otomatik yahut simbiyotik bir ilişki olduğu varsayımlarını problematize ederek ve ikinci olarak iki fenomen arasındaki ilişkinin değişim ve dönüşüme açık, dinamik bir ilişki olduğunu ortaya koyarak çalışmalara katkı sunmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Milliyetçilik, Katolik Kilisesi, Devlet-Merkezci Yaklaşım, Toplum-Merkezci Yaklaşım, Franco Diktatörlüğü.

I dedicate this thesis to my beloved family.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AC   Acción Católica

CEDA   Confederación Española de Derechas Autonomas

CNT   Confederación Nacional de Trabajo

EEC   European Economic Community

ERC   Esquerra Republicana de Catalunya

ETA   Euskadi Ta Askatasuna

FET   Falange Española Tradicionalista

FJC   Federació de Joves Cristianes

FST   Federación Sindical de Trabajadores

HOAC   Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica

IRA   Irish Republican Army

JOC   Juventud Obrera Católica

PP   Partido Popular

PSOE   Partido Socialista Obrera Español

SOC   Solidaridad de Obreras Catalanes

UDC   Unió Democratica de Catalunya

UGT   Unión General de Trabajadores

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Nationalism and religion have been a significant phenomenon to be considered and analyzed regarding both Spanish and Catalan history of politics. Recently, nationalism in Spain and in Catalonia has turned into a major issue that fuelled the conflict between the Spanish and the Catalan. There are two fundamental incidents that have taken place in the last two years which inspired a further work field on nationalism: First, there have been a referendum in Catalonia as a result of the disproportinate economic situations and economic crisis; voting for the independence resulted in yes and triggered the clash with the Spanish government. Second, in June 2018, the conservative Spanish government, ruled by Mariano Rajoy of Partido Popular (PP), fell as a result of the failure of vote of confidence due to corruption claims and Pedro Sanchez of Partido Socialista Obrero Español (PSOE), has become the new prime minister of Spain. Significantly, he took his oath not on the Bible and the Cross but symbolically on the constitution itself.

The simultaneous rise of nationalism and the secularist symbolism of Sanchez's action rendered the work on the connection between nationalism and religion all the more valuable. Thus, it is necessary to examine nationalism and its relation to religion in the context of Spanish and Catalonian history. The Catholic Church and nationalism had distinct interactions, which reached its pinnacle particularly under Franco's dictatorship, between 1939 and 1975. The difference in the formulation and construction of Spanish and Catalan nationalism had a dramatic and changing impact over the attitudes of Spanish and Catalan Catholic Church towards the Franco regime. Thus, this work analyzes the difference between the Spanish and the Catalan Catholic Church regarding their attitudes towards the Franco dictatorship. To what

extent nationalism plays a role in this difference will be held as the main question of this thesis.

The difference in attitudes had historical roots; since those churches started to be called as "national" churches, which dates back to the nineteenth century, their positions towards the central government began to vary. The stance of the Catholic Church in Spain and Catalonia gradually differed, especially in times of radical political changes such as the rise of the Franco regime. The declaration of "national-Catholicism" as the official ideology in 1939 caused a break in identities other than the Spanish and it had a considerable negative impact over the Catholic Church in Catalonia due to its "Catalan" self-definition.

Even though the concept of "ethnicity" is often and implicitly referred during the course of the thesis, it rather focuses on the relationship between nationalism and religion.This relationship between nationalism and religion is taken as not given, nor automatic, nor linear. Similar to language, territory and ethnicity as potential components of nationalism, religion might have a role in the construction of the nation and nationalism. In other words, religion is not a priori component but a contingent one. Respecting that contingency, the relationship between nationalism and religion should be held as dynamic rather than static and unchangeable for the Spanish and the Catalan case. Even though nationalism and religion are taken as either two contradictory poles or have an automatic, this relationship is more complex, tenable and multidimensional than these two poles suggest. Even when religion constitutes an important element of a given nationalism, the relationship between religion and nationalism is not simple or given nor static. It is a relationship which is directly dependent on and related to the conditions of the selected periods that makes this relationship unstable.

In the literature, the relationship between nationalism and religion is studied mainly by Adrian Hastings, Anthony Smith, Benedict Anderson, Rogers Brubaker and Liah Greenfeld. Except Hastings, who holds this relationship as given and religion as a

constant component of nationalism, other four scholars emphasize the dynamism and changing feature of the relationship between nationalism and religion from different angles, which are utilized in this thesis.

Benedict Anderson holds nationalism as a secular phenomenon, and religion and nationalism as mutually exclusive. According to him, both nationalism and the decline of the religious thought occured in the eighteenth century through Enlightenment. In a period of rationalist secularism, what was needed was "a secular transformation of fatality into continuity, contingency into meaning". Thus, the idea of "nation" was best suited to this end.[1] If nation-states are to be taken as historical and new, nations emerges from an immemorial past and a future.[2] He states that nationalism has to be held by lining up with religion, namely with culture systems that preceded it out of which it came into being.[3]

On the other hand, Liah Greenfeld claims that the decline of religion does not necessarily cause the emergence of nationalism; it can also emerge when the religious sentiment is at its highest. When nationalism emerges, it begins to instrumentalize religion for secular ends and needs religion and nationalism can only be held as functionally equal. According to her, the complex history of nationalism and religion does not have a linear path.[4] Religion can shape this relationship only to the extent that it has an impact over the nature of the emerging nationalism. When religion plays a significant role in the progress of nationalism, it is used as a tool with nationalism's allowance.[5] She states that nationalism can develop in a religious context but its essence is never regulated by this context. It is rather shaped by limitations of the immediate conditions experienced by the groups who contributed

---

[1] Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, (revised), Verso, London and New York, 2006, p. 11.

[2] Ibid.

[3] Ibid., p. 12.

[4] Liah Greenfeld, "The Modern Religion?", *Critical Review*, 10, 1996, p. 176.

[5] Ibid., p. 181.

to the emergence of national consciousness and those limitations are completely secular.[6] In addition, nationalism, as a part of the modern world, has taken religion's place in identity. However, regardless of the characteristic of nationalism and religion, this change in the roles will always be the outcome.[7]

Anthony Smith claims that the relationship between nationalism and religion is not given; this relationship emerges according to the situations and conditions. He holds religion as a contingent component just like ethnicity that is one of the cultural resources and traditions. The relationship between nationalism and religion is shaped depending on how the religion is described or identified.[8] He states that beliefs and practices often shape the national identities and nationalisms giving them a power and depth. There can be either conflict or alliance between nationalism and religion which indicates changing and complex nature of the relationship.[9] He mentions that nationalism is secular in nature but it utilizes religion for mass mobilization and political ends.

Brubaker's analysis on this relationship has a more analytical scheme. What mainly lay in his argument is that nationalism and religion are generally convoluted. Religious actions could not be described as "nationalist" just because they operate within a nation-state; nor do the nationalist motions become "religious" by including religious badges or conditioning the religion in order to be included in a "nation".[10] In other words, the language of the nation and religion can be interlaced. He also contributes to the argument that connection between nationalism and religion is not given nor static.

---

[6] Ibid.

[7] Ibid.

[8] Anthony Smith, "The 'Sacred' Dimension of Nationalism," *Millennium: Journal of International Studies,* 29/3, 2000, p. 796.

[9] Ibid.

[10] Rogers Brubaker, "Religion and Nationalism: Four Approaches", *Nations and Nationalism,* 18/1, 2012, pp. 2-20.

He proposes four approaches to examine the relationship between nationalism and religion three of which suits the frame of this work. The first takes nationalism and religion as comparable. According to him, both nationalism and religion could determine the description of oneself and the other. He also states that nationalism and religion can be considered as a social organization which feed the social divisions particularly in mixed communities. On the other hand, the concepts of the religion such as the praisal and sacralization of the dead in the name of religion can also be used for the ends of ethnicity and nationhood.[11]

The second examines that religion contributes to expound the cases of nationalism. Religious narratives and symbols were politicized and utilized in the construction of the nationalist claims. Moreover, besides politicization of the religious motifs for the nationalist ends, religious narratives and symbols could be used in more indirect ways. Most importantly, the religion and politics get into a closer interaction which was the outcome of the formation of the regional churches that were liable upon the political control.[12] The emergence of territorial understanding dragged nationalism as the determinant of sameness and difference as well as that territorialization and pluralization of religion made religion a comparative field.[13]

The third states that religion does not necessarily shape the borders of the nation but it can provide myths, symbols and rituals to the representation of the nation. Each discourse emphasizing the "divine" elements such as flag or territory could not be associated with the religion per se. On the other hand, nationalist references in religious discourse should also be considered separately from the religious tendencies in nationalism thanks to the appearence of the nation-states.[14] The

---

[11] Ibid., p. 4.

[12] Ibid., p. 16.

[13] Ibid.,pp. 9-11.

[14] Ibid., pp. 16-17.

nationalization is described as the "etatization of religion" through which states have sought to establish control over the church affairs, appointments and property.[15]

In this work, particular pieces of these theories will be benefitted in accordance with the characteristic of each case. Greenfeld's argument that the religion is instrumentalized by nationalism once nationalism emerges is mainly taken for both of the cases due to the fact that Spanish national-Catholicism of Franco and the Catalan nationalist movement used religion as a tool of legitimation for so-called nationalist tendencies throughout the Franco period. On the other hand, Anthony Smith's argument that the relationship between nationalism and religion is not given is best suited in the changing nature of the affiliation of the Spanish and the Catalan Catholic Church with nationalism especially after 1950s. The entire scheme of Brubaker serves the purpose of the work; his three models' claim that nationalism and religion are functionally equal and somehow interlaced, unlike Anderson's formulation of the relationship as "mutually exclusive" also covers the cases that neither the Spanish and the Catalan Church are truly nationalist nor can Spanish and Catalan nationalisms be truly defined as religious; but their language is intertwined, contrary to Smith's classification of "religious nationalisms".[16]

Both the Catalan and the Spanish churches have had capricious interactions with the respective nationalisms dominant in the territories they are located. While in Catalonia, religion and the Catholic Church did not take a significant part in the formation of the nationalist movement, it had become a major actor for the Catalan nationalist activities during the Franco period. Namely, centrality and nature of the Catholic Church within a given nationalism could change, which can be clearly seen in the Francoist era, particularly for the Catalan case. On the other hand, religion and the Spanish Church had formed a major part of Spanish nationalism both before and during the Franco's dictatorship.

---

[15] Ibid., p. 16.

[16] Smith, "The 'Sacred' Dimension of Nationalism," p. 800.

However, just as its Catalan counterpart, the role of the Spanish Church also changed but this alteration did not have the same dynamics and motivations as the Catalan Church due to the fact that each church separately regionalized and adopted the regions' idiosyncratic political and social traditions. This transformation, on the other hand, considering the two churches and nationalism, illustrates how the relationship between nationalism and religion could vary under the common circumstances.

Despite the importance of the aforementioned cases held in this work regarding the relationship of nationalism and religion, the literature on the relationship between Catholic Church and Spanish and Catalan nationalism is indeed not abundant. Each of the cases has generally been analyzed separately with no comparison; particularly the Catalan case has been taken as an eccentric movement without mentioning the nationalization of the Catholic Church in Catalonia. Besides, nationalism and religion, namely the Catholic Church in Spain and in Catalonia, have not been studied together nor have they been analyzed in terms of their interaction with each other. Henceforth, this work has been formed through interlinear readings and through their combinations while making a comparison between those resources. Even though some works reveal the interaction between the Catholic Church and nationalism in Catalonia, the reasons of reactive posture of the church against the Franco's dictatorship are not well studied.

The Catalan case cannot be fully and thoroughly analyzed and its motifs could not be brought to the surface without inquiring into the Spanish case. On the other hand, although for the Spanish Catholic Church, the church and nationalism are studied together in some resources, the existing studies do not seek to explain what the Spanish Church's relationship with Franco is and why it had been an ally with the dictatorship. However, the individual cases can be classified as a rather superficial examination since they are not sufficient to illuminate from where the difference had stemmed.

In the literature on Spanish case, Stanley Payne, Feliciano Montero, William Callahan and José Casanova have produced a variety of works on Spanish nationalism and the Spanish Catholic Church. What is significant about their works is that none of the resources has taken nationalism and the Catholic Church regarding their interaction during the Franco's dictatorship. Feliciano Montero and William Callahan contributed to the history of the Catholic Church in Spain and its role during the Franco's period[17], yet neither of the resources refers to the nationalist development but to the changing conjuncture and to the transformation of the Spanish Catholic Church throughout the century including the Francoist era. On the other hand, Payne provided a wide range of works for Spanish nationalism[18], Spanish Catholic Church and the Franco period. However, the works are holding the Catholic Church not in an interaction nor does they analyze the relationship between them.

The most revealing resources are from José Casanova despite their focus on the period of 1960s and onwards[19] since it had been the turning point for the conjuncture and the attitude of the Catholic Church. Muro only explains the Spanish nationalism without considering the Spanish Catholic Church while Javier Tusell presents a detailed history of Spain after the Civil War.[20] There is no such work combining

[17] Feliciano Montero, *La Iglesia: De La Colaboración a La Disidencia (1956-1975),* Madrid, Encuentro, 2009. William J., Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain, 1875-1998,* Washington D.C., The Catholic University of America Press, 2000.

[18] Stanley G. Payne, *Fascism in Spain, 1923-1977,* Wisconsin, The University of Wisconsin Press, 1999. *Spanish Catholicism: An Historical Overview*, Wisconsin, University of Wisconsin Press, 1984. *The Franco Regime,* Wisconsin, University of Wisconsin Press, 2011. "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century", *The Review of Politics,* 26/3, 1964.

[19] José Casanova, (edited by Said Amir Arjomand) "Church, State, Nation and Civil Society in Spain and Poland", *The Political Dimensions of Religion,* Albany, State University of New York Press, 1993. "The Opus Dei Ethic and the Modernization of Spain", *Annual Review of the Social Science Information,* 22/1, 1983. "España: de la Iglesia estatal a la separación de Iglesia y Estado", *Historia Social,* 35, 1999. "Catholic and Muslim Politics in Comparative Perspective", Paper Presented at Taiwanese Political Science Association's International Conference on *Religion and Politics: A Holy But Controversial Affiliation at National Sun Yat-Sen University, Kaohsiung,* August 15, 2005. *Public Religions in the Modern World,* Chicago and London, The University of Chicago Press, 1994, pp. 75-92.

[20] Javier Tusell, *La Dictadura de Franco,* Madrid, Alianza, 1988. *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy 1939 to the Present,* Oxford, Wiley-Blackwell, 2011. *Franco y los católicos. La Politica Interior Española entre 1945 y 1957,* Madrid, Alianza Universidad, 1990.

these two cases and comparatively analyzing the Church's reactions to the Franco's dictatorship.

In the literature on Catalan nationalism, Monserrat Guibernau, Andrew Dowling, Daniele Conversi and Albert Balcells are counted as pioneers. Except Dowling and Guibernau, the rest of the intellectuals had focused on the Catalan nationalism per se with no reference to the role of the Catholic Church. Conversi approaches to the Catalan nationalism from a different perspective by explaining it through language and culture while de-valuating the role of the Catholic Church and praising the language in a comparison with the Basque case.[21] Similarly, Balcells takes the Catalan nationalism within a historical narrative without touching the issue of the Catholic Church.[22] Although Guibernau holds the Catholic Church as an actor[23], she does not mention its role in the reformation of the Catalan nationalism in the Francoist era. The only work which has taken the Catholic Church into the analysis of Catalan nationalism belongs to Andrew Dowling[24]. Even though he reveals the connection between the Catalan nationalism and the Catalan Catholic Church during the Francoist era, he has not shed light on the quality of this relationship within the frame of reason and outcome; nor has he referred to the Spanish case.

Methodology

Moving onwards, methodologically, primary and secondary resources in English, Spanish and Catalan are used to feed this work which can be classified as articles, books, newspapers, magazines and reports published by Vatican. Due to the

---

[21] Daniele Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain: Alternative Routes to Nationalist Mobilization,* C. Hurst & Co. Ltd., London, 1997.

[22] Albert Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism: Past and Present,* Palgrave, New York, 1996.

[23] Montserrat Guibernau, "Nationalism and Intellectuals in Nations without State: the Catalan Case", *Political Studies,* 48, 2000. *Catalan Nationalism: Francoism, transition and democracy,* Routledge, London, 2004.

[24] Andrew Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia: Catholicism, Catalanism and the Origins of Convergencia i Unió 1939-1975*, (PhD Thesis), Department of Spanish, Portuguese and Latin American Studies, 1999.

insufficiency in the literature about the subject of this work, an analysis has been made through synthesising the resources as a comparatively historical review. Since the works are not on the connection between the Catholic Church and the nationalism and the Catholic Church is held as an actor in my work, I have made a historical combination through interlinear reading of the resources in order to detect the agents and actors of the aforementioned cases. Moreover, I have from the novels such as George Orwell's "Homage to Catalonia" and Ernest Hemingway's "For Whom the Bell Tolls?" as well as broadcasted resources as documentaries, particularly of the BBC.

Outline

In the light of such information, the thesis is composed of three main chapters. In order to comprehend the relationship between nationalism and the Catholic Church, in the first chapter the historical background of the interaction between these two actors in Spain is held. It is explained the structure of Spanish nationalism not through the incidents but on the basis of the variety of actors including the Catholic Church. Moreover, it is questioned how the Spanish nationalism had developed regarding those actors, how it had reacted to the changing conjuncture and conditions, how the Catholic Church as an individual institution answered to those changes, whether or not it integrated into the nationalist movements and to what extent this can be considered as an "integration".

In the second chapter, the historical background of the Catalan nationalism and regarding the actors similarly to the first part, including the Catholic Church is disclosed. Despite the reading over the actors, the main purpose is to project the existence of the different actors and motivations and to execute how these actors and motifs influenced the qualities of the nationalism which will automatically reveal the backstage of the difference of the Catalan case from its Spanish counterpart. As the first chapter, the Catholic Church will be taken as a separate actor in the development and emergence of the Catalan nationalism. It will be embraced as an institution

which has or does not have a particular interaction with the nationalism due to its own reasons. Those actors are taken as interactive and in a cause and effect relation.

In the final chapter, the relationship between the nationalism and the Catholic Church both in Spain and in Catalonia during the Francoist era is considered. The reactions and attitudes of the churches in two regions against the Franco's dictatorship are compared in order to illustrate their distinction and to analyze to what extent this difference could be associated with the nationalism. By comparing these two cases, it will be depicted how a transnational institution could have given different reactions to Francoist regime and its policies and it will be analyzed whether or not the nationalist movements and the churches' associations with such movements can be held as the major cause of distinction.

CHAPTER 2

SPANISH NATIONALISM: ROOTS AND ACTORS

2.1. Introduction

Spanish nationalism, unlike Spain itself, is a late born and undeveloped nationalism which indeed emerged as a need in the late nineteenth century. Even though there was a dominant Spanish identity which was undeliberately imposed by the Reyes Católicos (Catholic Kings, Isabel I and Fernando II), not the identity but its various interpretations had a major place in Spanish nationalism's history. Unlike the Catalan nationalism's linguistic and cultural base, the Spanish nationalism was based on the different interpretations of the history which can be classified as liberal and traditionalist. The intransigence between these two poles about the origins and the values of the nations left Spanish nationalism volatile and embryonic. Divisions within these two groups themselves also paved the way for an uneven nationalism. Other factors such as multiculturality and interior unrest put the nationalist efforts behind.

This unstability could not achieve to organize the masses around nationalism. Unwillingness of the Spanish monarchy, Army's power struggle in politics and the Church'symbiotical stance with the monarchy as well as lack of an intelectual class created a gap within the Spanish nationalism. After the declaration of the Second Republic, nationalist views strengthened more and the challenge between liberal and traditionalist views came to an end with the Civil War. In this sense, in this chapter, it will be showed how the liberal and traditional interpretations of the history shaped the Spanish nationalism and will be analyzed whether or not nationalism turned into a tool for the power struggle. The interactions of the various actors who had a significant importance for the course of the Spanish nationalism will also be showed.

2.2. Emergence of Spanish Nationalist Movement

2.2.1. Liberals and Traditionalists as Engine of Spanish Nationalism

Spain's long history had been used as the fundamental reference for Spanish nationalism and Spanish nation-building process. As a multicultural society, neither a single culture nor a single language would unite people. Since the history was chosen as the core element for the formation of Spanish nationalism, various interpretations of Spanish history determined the direction of the Spanish nationalist movement. Distinct liberal and traditionalist interpretations of the Spanish history turned out to be the backbone of Spanish nationalism.

What was the origin of these two different interpretations of history was the Napoleonic invasion (1808-1814). It became a starting point for the national myth-making process, which was attributed divergent meanings changing from liberal approach to the traditionalist.[25] The defeat of Napoleonic forces thanks to popular mobilization fueled the liberal revolution in the country and the declaration of the Constitution of Cádiz in 1812 in which the "Spanish" nation was declared as solely sovereign and Spain as a constitutional and Catholic country.[26] The emphasis on the common culture and common history as a social glue which offered both civic characteristic through "commonality" and ethnic vision through "history and culture".[27] Although anti-Napoleonic struggle showed the importance of an external threat for the mass mobilization, it cannot be identified as a national movement since it did not develop into a popular phenomenon.[28]

---

[25] Diego Muro, Alejandro Quiroga, "Building the Spanish Nation: The Centre-Periphery Dialectic", *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism,* 4/2, 2004, pp. 19-22.

[26] Carsten Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* (kindle version), Bloomsbery Academic, London, 2015, loc. 281.

[27] Diego Muro, Alejandro Quiroga, "Spanish Nationalism. Ethnic or civic?", *Ethnicities,* 5/1, 2005, p. 12.

[28] Jóse Alvarez Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity and Its Adaptation to the Age of Nations", *History and Memory,* 14/1-2, 2002, p. 22.

Liberal Spanish nationalists did not represent a unified body of ideas and they diversified as moderates and progressives. Moderate liberals, from 1830 to 1868 formulated a nationalist mythology by reinterpreting the history in their own terms; the "Napoleonic invasion" was named as "War of Independence", a reference to Spaniards' loyalty to their independence.[29] They justified their reason by attributing to history, Middle Ages in particular, when the Spanish people struggled against foreign enemies to protect their "Spanishness" that was composed of tolerance, a limited version of royalty, local rights and regional diversity.[30] As a part of nationalization process, the second of May (the day the French army was defeated), was selected as national holiday for which many monuments were also constructed.[31] In order to consolidate their rhetoric, literature was used to appoint an archaic trait to Spanishness which underlined historical continuity.[32] In addition, Catholicism was inseparably linked to Spanishness; besides Spanish glorious history, the Catholic faith was the backbone of both Spanish identity and Spanish nationalism.

Progressives, having more likely a civic impulse, on the other hand, defended a decentralized Spain unlike moderates, leaning on their own historical reference and interpretation of medieval local administrations by attributing to the Reyes Católicos.[33] They tried to attribute a tolerant, democratic character to Spanishness for which they needed the term "nation" that would separate "being Spaniard" from traditional essence. It was a way to interpret Spanish identity and make a nation from it.[34]

---

[29] Ibid., p. 20.

[30] Ibid.

[31] Muro, Quiroga, "Building the Spanish Nation", p. 21.

[32] Muro, Quiroga, "Spanish Nationalism", p. 13.

[33] Not only progressives but also moderates were aware of the fact that they had to consolidate their "revolutionary" ideas to recede from "enemy" since Napoleon was supported by some progressive minded Spaniards due to its modernization ideal. Therefore, they tried to generate a new reality by interpreting the history that the Spaniards had been above time, appealed to democracy.

[34] After the abolition of the Republic as a result of Carlist and absolutist attacks, progressives could not find a ground to disseminate their ideals until the Second Republic.

Regardless of the internal division, what can be mentioned that liberals tried to pursue a path "for people and despite people" which also led to an underestimation of the traditional, rural and Catholic dominated population of the country. Liberals were not able to mobilize the masses around revolutionary nationalist principles; As a result, pro or anti-Monarchy penchants came to be one of the major components of the Spanish nationalist movement.[35]

During the nineteenth century, Spanish nationalism could not progress due to variety of reasons.[36] The most significant fact was that even though the state's incapacity for nationalization process which principally required mass education and national symbols and rituals, linked to the economic problems, the central question was the monarchy's indifference to nationalization of masses since the monarchy saw it as a revolutionary ideal which would pose a threat to its very existence. The monarchy's unwillingness as well as clash between liberals and traditionalists encouraged the other institutions, the Army and the Catholic Church to take the lead of the formation of Spanish identity through their own doctrines.[37]

The tie between the Catholicism and Spanish nationalism was inseparable. For justification, they interpreted the history as that the power of Spain was coming from the Christianization of Indians and Counter-Reformation in the sixteenth and the seventeenth century.[38] This re-reading of history centered around Reconquest (the discovery of America in 1492, also the date for the expulsion of Jews and Muslims)

---

[35] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 297.

[36] Most significantly heavy debts and economic bottleneck also reprieved the nationalist steps such as national tax system, establishment of a national bank, an sufficient national education system, selection of the national symbols like Spanish flag in 1843 due to the lack of consensus over the symbols which were divided as those of liberals and traditionalists. Muro, Quiroga, "Building the Spanish Nation", p. 21.

[37] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 356.

[38] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 15.

which was the basic of traditionalist myth-making.[39] As well as embracing the second of May, fourteenth of May, the anniversary of the Reconquest was polished by the traditionalists as a Spanish symbol and named as "Fiesta de la Raza" (Festival of the Race).[40] They also went under a division as traditionalists and conservatives; traditionalists had more civic attitudes based on decentralized, Catholic Spain while the conservatives had ethnic tendencies, emphasizing the Catholic characteristic of identity and centralism.

What was significant for both perspectives was the prominence on Spanish heroism originated from its so-called glorious past unlike Catalan victimization for the mass mobilization. Regardless of their ideological origin, for the Spanish nationalists, Spanish heroism was stemming from the independent character of Spaniards which carried a national essence inside. The emphasis on the heroism was the one of the main tools for the liberal and traditionalist national rhetorics which would constitute a legitimate base for their actions.

1868 Revolution paved the way for progressive potency for the first time after the Republic. This development along with the worker movements escalating in that period became a trigger for the traditionalists to embrace nationalism more strongly. While during the 1830s, traditionalists' priority was on being Catholic, after 1868, it turned out to "being Spaniard".[41] During the Restoration Period (1874-1923)[42],the nation was taken in Catholic and unitarian terms giving main role to the crown and the army.

---

[39] Jesús Torrecilla, "Spanish Identity: Nation, Myth, History", *Studies in 20th&21st Century Literature,* 33/2, 2009, p. 213.

[40] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 689.

[41] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 31.

[42] It began with a military coup which ended the republican system declared in 1873 and established constitutional monarchy. In this system there were two political parties, Liberal and Conservative which had taken the power in a circular system.

1898 Spanish-American War which resulted in loss of the last colonies became another turning point for Spanish nationalism after the War of Independence. It showed that the lack of an external threat[43] and the loss of a part of Spain overseas damaged rather than triggering the nationalist sentiment. The failure of Castilian society not because of external but internal conflicts hardly awakened a nationalist sentiment even among the Castilians. Nonetheless, in a positive sense, it invoked the self-judgment that Spain needed internal reforms and regeneration.[44] Thus, it paved the way for the emergence of first intellectual group, Regeneracion '98.[45]

Twentieth century brought more chaos and complexity to the country. The outbreak of Semana Trágica in 1909, a violent, anticlerical and antimilitarist week witnessed the burning of churches and convents due to the rise of revolutionary ideals among the working class owing to economic dissatisfaction.[46] Conservative emphasis on religion and nationalism were viewed as a way to exploitation which hardened the integration of these lower classes into nationalist project and led to extreme reactions.[47]

Besides the worker movements, the strength of Catalan and Basque nationalisms after 1898 Disaster provoked the development of Spanish nationalism. As a repsonse to regional identities, "Hispanidad" and "Hispanoamericanismo" were brought to the fore front to highlight Spain's civilizing and unitary character.[48] What this newly coined terms turned out to be were the symbols of imperial past of Spain with an

---

[43] Colonies were seen as a part of the mainland so that the War can be seen as an internal affair.

[44] Sebastian Balfour, "The Lion and the Pig: Nationalism and National Identity in Fin-de-Siecle Spain", in *Nationalism and the Nation in the Iberian Peninsula,* (edited by Clare Mar-Molinero and Angel Smith), London and Oxford, Bloomsbury Academic, 2008.p. 109.

[45] Payne, "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century", p. 405.

[46] Balfour, "The Lion and the Pig", pp. 107-116.

[47] Ibid.

[48] Muro, Quiroga, "Building the Spanish Nation", p. 25.

emphasis over language, "Castellano" which referred to the language of Castile that was seen as the source of Spanish identity. In other words, thanks to regional nationalist movements Spanish nationalism began to define itself and its borders through "other" nationalisms which kept the perception of threat revived so that helped fuel the Spanish nationalist tendencies.[49]

2.2.2. Spanish Monarchy as Catalyst

Spanish monarchy was significantly a catalyst in the state and identity formulation of liberal and traditionalist Spanish nationalist project. It was an institution to which various "destinies" were appointed by the liberal and traditionalist perspectives. There were two dimensions to analyze the monarchy regarding the Spanish nationalism: the monarchy's approach to nationalism and nationalists' approach to the monarchy. These two situations had functioned in action-and-reaction circle throughout the Spanish history.

Spanish monarchy had been idle to the Spanish nationalist movement and modern nation-building process due to the nationalist efforts of liberals which excluded monarchy from the state structure. Thus, the monarchy saw nationalism as a revolutionary idea which would hamper its privileges and position if not abolish completely. It was the main institution of status-quo hence preserving its own interests was primary and it was dependent on the maintenance of the Ancién Regime.

Economic and dynastic instability brought by Carlist Wars and anti-Napoleonic War caused a heavy burden on the Spanish monarchy which made it inefficient in the decision-making processes. Its frailty and inability to take functional measures turned

---

[49] These threats became a driving force for the support for an authoritarian, Catholic, anti-Liberal and centralist Spanish nationalism which was backed by reactionaries, the Spanish Catholic Church, the monarchy and the army. Therefore, the military takeover of General Primo de Rivera was very welcomed by the large sectors of society with the hope of stability and economic recover as well as being a jetty for separatism and the strong worker movements.

it into a symbolic institution that was being provided a role by the liberals and traditionalists. On the other hand, the monarchy rejected to undergo a full scale modernization process since it posed a threat to its existence which as a result obstructed the development of Spanish nationalism.[50]

Due to the fact that the monarchy was to preserve Ancien Regime, there was no need for construction of a collective national identity since the existing local links and identities were dominantly existent.[51] Monarchy's refusal of modernization obstructed the central elements of modern nation-building process such as mass public education and allowed these local links to remain unbroken so that neither the Spaniards nor the monarchy detected the construction of national identity necessary.

From the middle through the end of the nineteenth century, the monarchy took particular initiatives for modernization of the country since the reform was obviously needed to get over the economic bottleneck. Yet, the monarchy ideologically remained loyal to status-quo which leaned on religion and traditions while the state structure was being modernized for the economic interests. This new modern state structure required a new source of legitimacy which was namely "the nation". This incoherence diluted the Spanish nationalist project and caused national symbols persist feeble.[52] A modern state structure was still legitimized by religious and dynastic principles due to the perception of nationalism as a danger became one of the reason of the weakness of Spanish nationalism in the nineteenth century.

Incapability of the monarchy as well as its hostility towards modernization caused liberals to read history through a pejorative angle regarding the crown. They, together with the Spanish Catholic Church was seen as the main obstacle before modernization and progress like in the example of Catholic Monarchs who destroyed

---

[50] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 23.

[51] Ibid., p. 24.

[52] Ibid., p. 27.

the unity in Spain through expulsion of religious minorities.[53] Referring to action-and-reaction circle, this resentment along with revolutionary ideals of progressive liberals which targeted monarchy and status-quo became a reason for the monarchy not to adopt a nationalist perspective. In other words, the animosity was mutual, liberals and monarchy, one of which was constantly provoking the other. The rise of the worker movements also fed and worsened the cynicism between the monarchy and the progressive liberals.

For traditionalists' regard, monarchy was a part of Anción Regime and a component of Spanishness together with the Catholicism. Hence the expulsion of Jews and Muslims were to consolidate the Christian unity of the country under the reign of Reyes Católicos.[54] Interestingly, not the monarchy itself but the monarchists were the advocates of the monarchic system since the crown was too weak to develop a defensive rhetoric. Even though they came to realize the need for reformation chiefly to prevent the radicalization of the workers after the 1898 Disaster, the Spanish monarchy did ignore the nationalization efforts of intellectuals and elites[55] thus they had to struggle with no support from state level which hindered the progress, officialization and systematization of Spanish nationalism.

2.2.3. Spanish Army as Political Actor

Spanish army always had a particular importance in Spanish politics. Regarding the emergence of Spanish nationalism, from the early nineteenth century until the death of General Francisco Franco, it took a more political role rather than being an institutiondetached from any political actions. Its intervention with the politics was the outcome of historical exaltation of the army pampered by the traditionalists based on imperial glories of Spain. However, the impression on its invincibility was

---

[53] Torrecilla, p. 213.

[54] Ibid.

[55] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 16.

shrinked by military failures during the nineteenth century. The more the army declined militarily, the more it got involved with politics and turned out to be politically defensive institution.

The historical narratives produced in the nineteenth century referring to glorious army were nothing but were proven illusionary. Its military defect combining with the liberal ideas politically provoked the army which took over the power through a pronunciamiento (military revolution) in 1820.[56] At this point, it should be articulated that the Spanish army could not be defined as entirely nationalist. Rather, it turned into a political component which positioned itself hostile or in accordance with the liberal or traditionalist national values in order to preserve its own interests. Moreover, since there were no external threats but only internal unrest, the army could not find a ground to be nationalized in modern sense; rather, it remained as a part and saviour of Ancién Regime.[57]

During the Restoration Period (1875-1923) the army was kept away from the politics. The defeat in 1898 damaged army's arrogance and self-esteem which transformed into agressive and oversensitive institution to any kind of criticism. The antimilitarist bias as well as escalation of class conflicts and rise of separatist threats which boosted after the disaster also bolstered a conservative reaction within the army; its exclusion from the politics was seen as the reason of the social breakdown. It, for the first time, referred to historical mission to preserve nation's interests even though its nationalist tendency was a tool to reposition itself in politics; what was nation's interest was the abolition of Restoration regime and establishment of an authoritarian state which could modernize the country, heal the economy and disciplined the society.[58]

---

[56] Angel Smith, *Origins of Catalan Nationalism, 1770-1898,* London, Palgrave, 2014, pp. 39-40.

[57] Francisco J. Romero Salvado, "The Failure of the Liberal Project of the Spanish Nation-State, 1909-1938", *Nationalism and the Nation in the Iberian Peninsula,* p. 122.

[58] Balfour, "The Lion and the Pig", p. 115.

This type of nationalism came to be widespread within the army thanks to separatist movements radicalized after the Disaster. Unity was the central principle of Army's nationalism which led to two outcomes. First, the conflict between the center and the regions was responded mostly in a ethnicist way which intensified the contradiction. Second, it cemented the Castilian base of the Spanish national identity. Especially, the strong anti-Catalan sentiments within the army evolved into political actions after a satirical publication about the army in Barcelona.[59] The conscription for Morocco together with sharp repression paved the way for Semana Trágica in 1909; dozens of churches and convents were burned down.[60] These incidents as well as regionalist reactions were met with aggression and persecution from the crown and the army. It once more highlighted the value of "unity" within the armythat was the sacred duty of army to consolidate its power over politics.

The army had two different positions and situations in the nineteenth century. On the one hand, it had a privileged situation in the country and on the other hand it was suffering from a lack of coherent identity. This duality put the army apart from the popular classes; even though it had nationalist tendencies, its nationalist policy was excluding the nation itself since it was after its own interests rather than that of the nation. This fragile system and duality led to a perception of superiority. This superiority separated the army from the nation and pushed it closer to the crown since it was the source of the army's interests. This win-win game between the crown and the army led to a more authoritarian type of nationalism which saw the constitutional system as a threat to national unity.

The army of the twentieth century can be described not as nationalist but as patriotic. The miserable level of intellectuality among the officers kept them away from any kind of ideology. This patriotism sacralized the abstraction "Spain" but so few of the army officers were capable of having a true understanding of national faith and

---

[59] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 54.

[60] Ibid., pp. 62-63.

national problems.[61] What is more, the army was self-excluded from the idea of "nation" since its interests were fulfilled by the monarchy so that there was no need for attachment to nation. In fact, this was a common wide problem among all the actors or components of the Spanish nationalism; they were seeing "nation" too unnecessary to be the focus since power and interest were their biggest and ultimate aim and resource for their existence.

The authoritarian inclination led to a new nationalist discourse underlining unity and social order which paved the way for military coup of General Miguel Primo de Rivera in 1923. Even though it seemed as army's usual intervention with politics, the discourse was completely different. The army was not a representative of any political group; it was a supra-political body and it was the savior of sacred values of the nation. It was authoritarian, centralist and ethnic-inclined pledging to rule out worker movements and separatism as well as economic modernization from above.[62] However, his unpopularity and Great Depression in 1929 induced a considerable loss of support from the king and the army to Primo de Rivera. By 1931, Primo de Rivera had to resign, and the Second Republic was declared.

2.2.4. Republicans and the Second Republic

The declaration of the Second Republic was the victory of progressive liberals in 1931. What was central to Republic was the complete abolition of the monarchy and decentralization. The republican interpretation of the Spanish nationalism was civic including all people into a common, democratic body of law.[63] Republicans embraced the concept of "Patria" in historical, linguistic and cultural terms but they also welcomed the regional and cultural differences. Differently than the previous examples, the Constitution of 1931 was not emphasizing the "Spanish" character of

---

[61] Payne, "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century", p. 412.

[62] Cultures and languages other than Castilian were excluded from the transition which led to radicalism in separatist movements.

[63] Muro, Quiroga, "Spanish Nationalism. Ethnic or civic?", p. 18.

the nation. However, it had a reverse effect; lack of a binding factor together with political and social polarization sparked the division within the country.

What the Republicans failed to realize that they had to build their own national values and symbols for the "nation". They were indifferent to national question since they assumed the nation as archaically Republican.[64] The republican victory also forged an illusion that the traditionalists and conservative ideals existed as minority.[65] This misreading of the political situation severed the Republican's inability to reconsider the needs of national reform. Thus, this gap was filled by conservative symbols[66] as well as internationalist values of radical Left such as the first of May. For instance, Fiesta de la Raza (12th of May, anniversary of the Reconquest which was mainly celebrated by the traditionalists and conservatives), continued to be held after reshaped with the Republican prospects. Republicans meant to dispose religious-political connotations referred to Hispanoamericanismo which reserved a racial aspect and instead, they attempted to give a spiritual tendency to "raza"(race which means "hispanidad").[67]

The failure in "making the nation" together with breach within the left developed the Republic into a fragile system. After the conservative takeover of CEDA (Confederación Española de Derechas Autonomas) 1934-1936 combining with popular movements, Republicans switched to top-down policy for the state structure.[68] Their apathy towards a comprehensive state nationalism led to the lack of

---

[64] Graham, "Community, Nation and State in Republican Spain", p. 136.

[65] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 3983.

[66] Even though the Second of May (anniversary of the War of Independence) never celebrated as a persistently national ceremony since the liberal and traditionalist rhetoric attributed different and uncompromised meanings to it, still, it was celebrated during the Second Republic. However, it was seen too "Castilian" in a period which witnessed a considerable rise in separatist movements, and too anti-French (France's Third Republic was the inspiration for Spanish Republicans) which could even reach to racial violence against French people. Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 1138.

[67] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 1198.

[68] Graham, "Community, Nation and State in Republican Spain"*,* p. 136.

social base for the future of the Republican regime. Rupture as well as historical deficiency in consensus among different sectors undermined the feeble efforts for nationalization process.Its inadequate attempts to nationalize the masses paved the way for the development of a fascist, nationalist group named Falange Espanola.

2.2.5. Falange Española

Falange Española could be defined as the sole nationalist movement which emerged as a reaction to Republic's nationalist inefficiency. However, the factor behind the upsurge of Falange as a nationalist actor could not be reduced to an anti-Republican stance; it was also the influence of the fascist wave both in Germany and Italy in 1930s. In addition, the impacts of Great Depression together with anticlerical tendencies and radicalization of anarcho-syndicalist movements paved the way for a radical response. In 1933, José Antonio Primo de Rivera, son of General Miguel Primo de Rivera led up an elitist initiative which was called Falange Española, in order to bring about political and economic reforms through totalitarian means.[69]

What Antonio Primo de Rivera did was the formularization of the national problems and binding them together to justify his cause in order to demolish the liberal democratic system as well as political parties and to establish a totalitarian state afterwards depending on families, municipalities and professions.[70] He revealed it by articulating the liberal democratic state as the source of all problems in the country. Economic system introduced by the liberal state entailed economic slavery; workers forced to work under harsh conditions or to be abandoned to starvation which easened the appraisal of socialism.[71]

---

[69] Payne, *Fascism in Spain 1923-1977*, p. 92.

[70] Charles F., Delzell, edited, "Fascism in Spain", *Mediterranean Fascism 1919-1945,* New York, The Macmillan Press Ltd, 1970, p. 259.

[71] Ibid., p. 261.

The movement stated Patria where all the individuals and classes are integrated in and represented unity. It was attributed a sacred connotation; the Patria was above all interests, its destiny could not be abandoned to the strongest group or the party and what would best serve to its irrevocable unity was an authoritarian system. The Spanish Patria was a reality which was free from time.[72] It was threatened by separatism, political rivalries and class struggle all of which ignored Patria for the sake of their own interests. Moreover, this structure must be framed in terms of hierarchy, authority and order and more importantly, violence was favoured as a resort to achieve these ideals which were concluded not as a way of thinking but a mode of being.[73]

In addition, Falange Española, adopted the Catholic spirit but significantly, considered a sharp separation of the Catholic Church, Catholicism and the State. The Catholic Church was a social institution; neither state nor the Catholic Church could interfere with each other's sphere of influence to preserve the national unity.[74] In this sense, the new system would be truly Catholic which would be protected by the Spanish Catholic Church within its institutional borders without interfering with the state's affairs.

The will for an authoritarian structure was legitimized with the emphasis on nation. According to Antonio Primo de Rivera no individual would be free without being a part of a free nation, this national freedom could only be sustained by an authoritarian state structure. The emphasis on national freedom was consolidated through the perception of "enemies to Spain's liberty" and its protection.[75] When the army revolted in 1936 and in Civil War afterwards, the Falange provided a full

---

[72] José Antonio Primo de Rivera, "The Spanish Answer" in *Obras Completas de Jose Antonio Primo de Rivera,* Artes Graficas Ibarra, Madrid, 1964, pp. 43-55.

[73] Ibid., pp. 43-55.

[74] Bailey W. Diffie, "The Ideology of Hispanidad", *The Hispanic American Historical Review,* 23/2, 1943, p. 477.

[75] Delzell, "Fascism in Spain", p. 270.

support declaring that they welcomed a militaristic tendency which should penetrate the entire society. With the victory of the Francoist forces, the Falange undertook a major role in policy-making process.

2.2.6. "Other" Nationalisms

The emergence of "other nationalisms" in Catalonia[76], Basque Country[77] and Galicia particularly after 1898 was indeed the major factor for the awakening of the Spanish nationalism. The reaction of regions against exclusion from the state system as well as systematic repression on their language and culture provoked the separatist tendencies and eventually turned them into "traitor" which would also mobilize Castilians to take guard for the Spain's unity. Not only the repression and exclusion but also the deficiency of Spanish nationalist movement paved the way for the bolster of those nationalisms.

Stein Rokkan's formulation of center and periphery is the most suitable for the Spanish and peripheral nationalist movements.[78] The center is defined as privileged holding the monopoly of central institutions and as a place where the territorial identity was symbolized. The periphery, on the other hand, had three elements; difference, dependence and distance along with economic, cultural and political traits.[79] What is important is that the relationship between center and periphery is not static and it is binding for both parties. Peripheries had to act within the rules which

---

[76] For Catalonia, it was the expression of the frustration of the Catalan bourgeoisie over its inability to shape Spanish policies in accordance with their own interests. They were always delayed from the central politics.

[77] For Basque Country it was a matter of cultural annihilation its fueros (local rights) were annihilated by the Spanish state through the end of the 19th century. It lacked a core value unlike Catalan nationalism. The latter was more of a regionalist, pro-Spanish at its origin, its base for the nationalist mobilization was originated from self-security and surplues since they had Catalan language as a core value.

[78] Stein Rokkan, *Centre-Periphery Structures in Europe: an ISSC Workbook in Comparative Analysis,* Campus, Frankfurt, 1987.

[79] Stein Rokkan, *State Formation, Nation-building, and Mass Politics in Europe: the Theory of Stein Rokkan,* Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1999.

were determined by the center and identify themselves in accordance with or opposition to it.[80] Although Spain was a reverse sample of "advanced center and backward periphery", the process was common that the periphery refused to incorporate into and to be assimilated by the center.

The driving force for the emergence of regional nationalisms was the Restoration regime itself which was an isolated, two-party system closed to any other alternatives that blocked the periphery's inclusion on political ground.[81] Moreover, the economic inequality brought by industrialization vacuumed a significant number of Castilian immigrants to prosperous regions like Catalonia and the Basque Country who posed a threat to the local cultures.[82] On the other hand, loss of the last colonies after 1898 led to dissolution of the distinct masses which were once brought under the ideal of Empire. This breakup backed the peripheral movements particularly in Catalonia since losing the oversea colonies caused a huge deal of loss in export rates.

The first indicator of Spanish nationalist awakening thanks to separatist threat was the military dictatorship of General Miguel Primo de Rivera in 1923. However, his nationalist project was merely ethnic which imposed severe prohibitions on cultural and linguistic activities other than Castilian. The persecutive and oppressive characteristic of the Spanish nationalism did not buttress a unifying ideal; instead it radicalized the regional nationalist movements especially in Catalonia and legitimized their cause for separatism. Monarchy's support for the army discredited both of them and led to a compromise between republicans and separatists against the crown and the dictatorship.

---

[80] Muro, Quiroga, "Building the Spanish Nation", p. 19.

[81] Muro, Quiroga, "Spanish Nationalism. Ethnic or civic?", p. 16. Eric Storm, "El Nacionalismo Espanol de los Intelectuales: Unamuno, Costa y Ganivet", in R. Sanchez Montero, (edited), *En Torno al 98,* Universidad de Huelva, Huelva, 2000, pp. 389-401.

[82] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, pp. 124-125.

During the Second Republic, the rise of anticlericalism and separatism as well as anarcho-syndicalist movements especially in Catalonia led to a deeper division in the society. The precipitating influence of "other nationalisms" for Spanish nationalism showed itself as Civil War in 1936 which lasted three years.

2.3. Civil War (La Guerra Civil)

Military uprising in 1936 which led to Civil War was directly linked to the national question that concerned all the components of the Spanish nationalism. Since the military revolt could not be quelled, the army once more undertook a political role in the determination of conception and the future of the nation. The military side which complemented with the conservative sectors of the society and the Falange, was named as Nationalists but both parties of the conflict held nationalism as a strategic tool for mobilization and to cover up the possible internal divisions and conflicts.

Two camps were representing the liberal-progressive and traditionalist-conservative type of Spanish nationalism. They tried to legitimize their conception of "nation" by alienating and blaming the other as "foreign" which would also justify their struggle over a foreign threat. This motive drove them to the illusion that each was the true representative of the Spanish nation.[83] Both Nationalists and Republicans remained loyal to the historicist approach to use the past incidents as legitimization of their current actions. Concerning the perception of "foreign enemy", both of two parties referred to War of Independence which was fought against a foreign invader in order to attribute a historically legitimate reason. Fiesta de la Raza, the anniversary of Reconquest, had been grasped by both sides by referring different connotations.[84]

---

[83] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 1244.

[84] Nationalists, under the leadership of General Franco, associated Fiesta de la Raza with imperialistic goals and excluding Republicans' interpretation based on democracy and progress since they had no Catholic thus no Hispanic tendencies. The frailty of Republicans' nationalism caused the prominence of that of Nationalists.

Unlike Republicans, Nationalists underwent a reproduction process of national symbols and myths for mobilization; the Francoist forces polished the term "hispanidad" as a mixture of unity, race, empire and Catholicism during the war.[85] It had not only historical significance but also carried a sense of resurrection by reiterating the Spanish glorious Empire. On the other hand, the Republicans were favoring liberty, equality and democracy as the inseparable parts of Spanish nationalism.[86] Importantly, the support of the Spanish Catholic Church thanks to Catholic tendency of the Nationalist forces provided with a unique advantage to Francoist side for disseminating and cementing its nationalist propaganda.

The political deficit led to a nationalist duality which witnessed a process of adapting and refashioning the national symbols to forge a consistent national ideology. By the end of war, Nationalist forces were proven as the ultimate victor that they recreated the symbols in harmony with their monarchical and National-Catholic ideology favoring Catholic Monarchs and their Inquisition proving an alliance with the Spanish Catholic Church as the new state system.

2.4. Spanish Catholic Church and Spanish Nationalism

The Spanish Catholic Church had always been an important actor concerning its position and relationship with the state. Its position in the state structure became a long-lasting debate in nation-building process and in the development of Spanish nationalism. It must be mentioned that Catholicism and the Catholic Church should be taken separate; Catholicism was a functional and an appropriate tool for the Spanish Catholic Church to pursue its own interests and gains through acting as the sole representative of Catholic faith. Since its own institutional and materialistic interests[87], the Spanish Catholic Church had a good relationship with the state, with

---

[85] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc. 1329.

[86] Ibid.,loc. 1329.

[87] Clergy's properties, Church lands, monopoly over education and public morality were prior to consolidation of Catholicism in society.

the monarchy in particular. As a result, the Church remained distant to nationalist cause because of the monarchy's distance against the "revolutionary" nationalist ideals.

It was a symbiotic relationship that based on acquisitions; the Spanish Catholic Church provided a sacred legitimacy to state by using the religion and in turn state gave privileges to the Catholic Church. As a result, the monarchy's widely distant attitude towards nationalism was imitated by the Catholic Church due to the fact that state was the sole protector and provider of the Church's privileges. Hence, the Spanish Catholic Church discerned the threat from above which was triggered by regime changes; the distant relationship with the "nation" and "nationalism" in liberal terms pushed the Catholic Church to "Catholicize" the all nationalist tendencies to maintain its privileged status instead of "Spanishizing" itself. It barely established a bottom-up relationship with the Spanish society since the threat was not coming from the lower classes but from state level.

The historical hostility towards liberalism was a gauge of Church's opposition against the liberal version of nationalism. Liberal governments' policies on the separation of the Church and state as well as liberty for Catholic activities showed how the Catholic faith were taken independent from the Catholic Church. Even though the liberals declared Catholicism as the official religion of Spain, the nullification of Inquisition and dissolution of the Church's property along with secularism and democracy signified that the Catholic Church's excessive privileges had no connection with the Catholic faith of the Spanish nation. This radical move forced the Catholic Church incorporate into traditionalist monarchic policies which was seen as the guarantor of the Church's authority as well as privileges.

Even when the traditionalists took up the power various times in the nineteenth century, neither the King nor the traditionalist-conservative governments allowed the Catholic Church to intervene with the state affairs or to establish the Inquisition

again.[88] This situation together with financial difficulties dragged the Catholic Church into a compromise with any ideology in power. Division of secular and sacred combining with dissolution of the Church properties furthered the ideological inefficiency of the Catholic Church over lower classes, especially on urban labourers which triggered anticlerical riots in 1834-1835.[89]

Obsession of the Church to intervene with the politics and obtaining a favorable position within state created a huge lapse in its position and consolidation within the society. It was kept away from social actions since it acted as a political organization pursuing its own interests which obstructed its social work at the dawn of sprawling irreligiosity and anti-clericalism. What was significant at the beginning of the twentieth century was that the anticlericalism became a policy as a result of religious attempts of the conservative governments.[90]

Politicization of the Catholic Church and its close relations with state elites along with distance from popular classes made it a target in the incidents of the Semana Trágica in 1909. The Catholic Church perceived it as the beacon of the threat to the Church, state and order. Therefore, Semana Trágica forced the Catholic Church to incorporate with the army and the monarchy; prior was seen as the savior of the Church and the society. From the Church's perspective, the liberal state failed to protect the interests of the Church, the nation and the monarchy.[91] Therefore, after Semana Trágica, the Catholic Church acted as an interest group in the defense of the monarchy and the army as well as order. In addition, in the first quarter of the twentieth century, the Catholic Church stood idle by the social incidents[92] since its

---

[88] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 7.

[89] Ibid., p. 7.

[90] José Andres-Gallego, *La politica religiosa en España, 1889-1913,* Editora Nacional, Madrid, 1984, pp. 144-157.

[91] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain,* p. 81.

[92] Labour movements, anarcho-syndicalism and separatism.

only concern was to break the hegemony of circular system of the Restoration and to establish a Catholic party.

The Catholic Church showed its alliance with the army through his support for Primo de Rivera. Even though the dictatorship defined itself as exclusively Catholic, it neither supported the Catholic Church financially nor did it substitute its loss of properties. The only concession was given in the field of education; yet, it was limited to the primary education.[93] At the end of the dictatorship, the Catholic Church completely lost its influence over popular classes since it was labelled as the supporter of a fascist regime.

The declaration of the Second Republic brought a new perspective to state and the Church relations. Republican nationalists were not taking Catholicism as the essence of the nation; it was incompatible with secularism and the Catholic Church stood as a barrier before progress. The constitutional monarchic system, therefore, was defended consistently by the Catholic Church which, together with the support for the dictatorship, discredited it and escalated the idea of separation of the Church and state. Thus, as the first step, the Republican government, took the charge of appointment of the Church staff in order to create a "republican" church.[94]

With the victory of Frente Popular[95] in 1936, secularization along with anticlericalism as a part of the nation were officialized. In return, the Catholic Church initiated a new "reconquest" with a political concern rather than a religious issue in order to widen its influence. Even though the Catholic Church blamed Protestants and socialists for de-Catholicization of the country[96], it was the Church which had been distant from below, higly inclined to politics and miserably

---

[93] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain",* p. 156.

[94] Ibid., p. 311.

[95] It was a coalition between the leftist parties formed in 1936. It was dominated by the anarcho-syndicalists and radical leftists. Payne, *Spanish Catholicism,* pp. 167-170.

[96] Especially in southern Spain, namely in Andalucia, the irreligiosity was rather high.

dysfunctional in pastoral activities. What the main shift in the Church was the adoption of "accidentalism" that the Catholic Church was equally distant to any kind of ideology and political party.[97]

Since the Catholic Church was a close ally of the Army, it is not surprising that it backed the Nationalist forces in the Civil War erupted in 1936. In the early days of the war, the key figures, General Emilio Mola, General Francisco Franco and the Falange stressed the separation of the Church and state for good of both institution and prohibited any intervention which could disturb the national integrity. Return of religious symbols to schools and censorship to the books in the regions under the control of Nationalist forces as well as compromise between the clergy and Army officers relieved the Catholic Church.[98]

Repression and violent acts of the Nationalist forces in fact contradicted with the Christian doctrines. However, the Catholic Church was after its institutional interests which made it perceive the threat from above; persecution towards lower classes or opponents was not its concern so that the Church justified the violence of the Nationalists as a response to violence against the Catholic Church and clergy in Republican Spain especially after the attacks to churches and clergy during the Civil War. Significantly, the Spanish Catholic Church also remained silent against the military's harsh anti-separatism directed to the secular clergy in the Basque Country and Catalonia in particular. Republican clergy in Catalonia and the Basque Country met with repression and execution which was the use of war for cementing the nationalist Catholic unity. Paradoxically, while the Catholic Church was blaming the Republic for the execution and slaughter of the regular clergy by radicals, it also gave no reaction to the executions of the secular priests in Basque Country and Catalonia. According to the Church, it was a struggle against separatism and separatists to create a stronger New Spain which sowed the seeds of the future division within the Catholic Church.

---

[97] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain",* p. 311.

[98] Ibid., p. 347.

CHAPTER 3

CATALAN NATIONALISM: ROOTS AND ACTORS

3.1. Introduction

Catalonia has a long history; however, Catalan nationalism in a modern sense is relatively a new phenomenon, which dates back to the nineteenth century. Before explaining Catalan nationalism, it must be considered that the national identity is a type of identity which in Catalan case, a unique identity that preceded the emergence of Catalan national identity.[99] That is to say that Catalan identity existed as a cultural identity which transformed in time. At the same time, Catalanitat (being a Catalan) is a unique Catalan identity that existed even in the medieval times. However, this existence should not be perceived as national identity; Catalanitat was more of a cultural identity than being a national one. The development of Catalan led to the emergence of a Catalan bourgeoisie. The sentiment of economic superiority combined with the assertion that cultural inferiority by Spanish state through prohibitions and repressions led to the emergence of the idea of Catalan nationalism. It became a way to reconcile the superiority of Catalan identity and inferiority concurrently. In other words, the formation of the Catalan nationalist movement coincided with the formation of Catalan bourgeoisie in the nineteenth century.

Catalan nationalism could be examined in three main phases. The first phase can be held as the emergence of linguistic and cultural aspects which occupied the period of early 1800s until 1870. The second phase corresponds to the emergence of an activist group that triggered the national awareness from 1870 to 1898. The third phase refers to the emergence of conservative and liberal strands in the nationalist movement in

---

[99] Greenfeld, *Nationalism: Five Roads to Modernity,* pp. 3-26.

the post-1898 period.[100] Therefore, in this chapter, it will be showed the relationship between the culture and politics in Catalonia and will be argued that the Catalan nationalism was created around a core element which is language and was spread syncronizing with the economic development in the region. It will also be highlighted the actors in the formation of Catalan nationalism.

3.2. The Birth of A Cultural Movement

3.2.1. The Catalan Bourgeoisie and Economic Development

Economic development could be considered as a trigger for the emergence of Catalan nationalism. By the end of the eighteenth century, Catalonia had more commercial aspirations as well as factory production in addition to agriculture and manifacture than the rest of Spain.[101] In the nineteenth century, it was a developed region within Spain which was not developed industrially. This industrial development resulted in the emergence of the Catalan bourgeoisie and working class which would have a deep impact over the further phases of Catalan nationalism. It also prepared a base for the Catalan cultural revival in the first half of the nineteenth century.

Industrial protectionism[102], a series of military coups, constitution and regime changes together with the wars such as Carlist Wars (1833-1876)[103] led to political unstability in Spain which brought a heavy burden on the Spanish economy as well as an extra tax burden on Catalonia. These incidents created a wide effect on the

---

[100] Miroslav Hroch, "From National Movement to Fully Fledged Nation", *Mapping the Nation,* New Left Review, London, 1996, pp. 3-26.

[101] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism*, p. 18.

[102] This was imposed by the Spanish state. Catalonia had to produce their bread using the Spanish products other than imported cereals, which were cheaper. Even though it favoured labour, it had a negative impact on the living standards of the working class. For further information; Smith, *Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* pp. 39-69.

[103] They were the wars between the supporter of Carlos V and Isabel II. The first one was Catholicist, traditionalist which were against liberalism and later republicanism. They were called as Carlists.

living standards of workers which shaped the first labour movements in the country. It should be pointed that during the early nineteenth century, Catalan bourgeoisie was centralist. Therefore, working class, who was hostile to bourgeoisie converged to the Catalan cultural movement which coincided with the economic development.

The fluctuations in Spain and ongoing industrialization in Catalonia led to a duality within the country. In an underdeveloped Spain, economically developed Catalonia began to feel superiority which created a reaction in different social groups in the region against their cultural and political dependence on Castilianized Spain. As Pierra Vilar stated, it became a reaction of an economically advanced region against the underdeveloped political leadership.[104] Yet, it must be borne in mind that the emergence of the Catalan nationalist movement was not the result of the economic development. Rather, this economic progress prepared the material base for the Catalan cultural movement. What is important is that this economic and cultural changes were an indicator that the Catalan nationalism would rather be a class-based movement; a class nationalism.[105]

Even though the cultural and linguistic activities began to take place in Catalonia, Catalan bourgeoisie and urban middles classes maintained their Castilianized characteristic. Unlike Catalan bourgeoisie, among the Catalan intellectual elites, Catalan cultural awakening gained a significant rise. Efforts for liberalization of Spanish state which also centralized the Castilian language and culture in 1830s on the one hand benefitted the economy of Catalonia and Catalan bourgeoisie and on the other hand it imposed a threat on Catalanness since Castilian culture would officially be dominant and liberalization would require a unitary, centralized state.[106]
The more the economic gap grew, the more it influenced the cultural initiatives of Catalan intellectuals due to correlation between economic superiority and cultural

---

[104] Pierre Vilar, *Historia de España,* Critica: Paris, 1971, p. 100.

[105] Payne, "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century", p. 409.

[106] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* p. 41.

inferiority. Unlike other center-periphery relationships, Catalonia was the advanced while the center was the symbol of backwardness.[107]This fact caused a shift in the stance of a small group of Catalan bourgeoisie; economic superiority and modernization persuaded the Catalan bourgeoisie that the Catalan language and culture which were subordinated to Castilian were in fact the way to modernize the country rather than backward Castilian language and culture.[108] As a result, economic advantage entertwined with the cultural awakening which paved the way for "La Renaixença".

3.2.2. Romanticist Catalan Intellectuals and "La Renaixença"

Cultural awakening led by Catalan intellectuals can be both defined as a reaction to state's limitations on Catalonia and reflection of increasing interest in linguistic and Romanticism. Aim of these intellectuals was to form a consistent Catalan identity through determining the core elements rather than fueling Catalan nationalism.

In the first half of the nineteenth century, there was a Catalonia which was economically developed and socially divided into classes. Due to the state repression, Catalan intellectuals, under the influence of rising romanticism were to revive the Catalan culture. In order not to be limited to a narrow intellectual group, they had to penetrate the different sectors of this divided society. Thus, Catalan intellectuals chose the Catalan language as a core element of the Catalan cultural movementwhich could be the only common aspect among the classes in a region where the majority was Catalan-speaking.[109] Long-lasting victimization caused by state's repression on the use of the Catalan language as well as Catalan culture helped to justify the aim of Catalan intellectuals and to reproduce the language and culture continuously.

---

[107] Dowling, 'For Christ and Catalonia', p. 15.

[108] Ibid., p. 15.

[109] Dowling, 'For Christ and Catalonia', p. 14.

As a result of industrialization, cultural inferiority and oppression over the Catalan language along with romanticism, La Renaixença emerged as a cultural Catalan movement which triggered and spread the idea of Catalanism by awakening the Catalan language and culture in the literature in 1830s.[110] La Renaixença transformed the Catalan language from the daily communication tongue to a modern literary language. This romanticist movement helped dig out the past of a Catalan people which could legitimize the Catalan identity by attributing a historical characteristic to it.[111] The connection with the glorious past along with the revival of Catalan language and culture created the perception of a continuous Catalan identity. Catalan intellectuals by determining the linguistic and cultural elements as the core values of Catalan identity prepared the cultural base of the Catalanism. To that extent, Catalonia became an example of nations having a cultural existence before obtaining a political position as Miroslav Hroch pointed.[112]

However, it should be mentioned that Catalan intellectuals did not define Catalans as a nation but they attributed a cultural identity. Even though those intellectuals tried to reproduce the Catalan identity through Catalan language, without institutionalization and systematic impose of core values to people, it was rather difficult. The official status of Castilian[113] rendered the institutionalization and created a high illiteracy of Catalan language. Due to its secondary position, Catalan language had not been able to establish its own linguistic rules. With no institutionalization and standardization in the language, the efforts of the Catalan intellectuals to depict Catalan as an archaic, medievalized language could not be consolidated.[114]

---

[110] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 13.

[111] Dowling, 'For Christ and Catalonia', p. 15.

[112] Umut Özkırımlı, *Theories of Nationalism: A Critical Introducution,* Palgrave Macmillan, New York, 2010, pp. 113-120.

[113] "Spanish" represents the whole Iberian peninsula as a region. Castilian was mainly the language of the Kingdom of Castile which dominated the peninsula therefore it was named as Spanish. Since Spain has various regions with their own languages, I will often use Castilian instead of Spanish in my work.

[114] Balcells, *The Catalan Nationalism,* p. 43.

In order to create unity in language, a priest, Jacint Verdaguer brought spoken and literary language together which became a middle way between the popular and high culture that even drew the attention of high number of people in the other regions to Catalan language and culture.[115] However, its urban and elite characteristic which was even labelled as bourgeois nationalism, irritated rural sectors even though they adapted to what La Renaixença proposed. Nonetheless, La Renaixença created a tie between urban, elite classes and the rural sectors under the ideal of Catalan identity based on the Catalan language. Els Jocs Florals, an ancient literary contest held in 1859 was the most apparent effort of Catalan intellectuals, poets and historians in particular, to bring the Catalan literature to all the social layers to unite them.[116]

The romanticist Catalan intellectuals were trying to form a Catalan identity through a historicist reconstruction of an idealized past, focused especially on the Middle Ages.[117] Cultural and linguistic revival became also crucial for the systematization of the Catalanism. In order to create a nation from a mass, the culture and the language should have been institutionalized and systemized through official status to Catalan in schools along with Castilian.[118] Thus, the political autonomy became necessary for the cultural autonomy. This would be put into practice with the generation of the Catalan modernist intellectuals.

3.2.3. Modernist Catalan Intellectuals

While the Romanticist Catalan intellectuals introduced the core values of Catalan identity, modernist intellectuals aimed at developing Catalan nationalism; they brought a more practical and political dimension to the Catalan nationalist

---

[115] Josep Maria Fradera, "Rural traditionalism and conservative nationalism in Catalonia 1865-1900", *Family, Class and Nation in Catalonia,* Mare Nostrum Editions, London, 1990 and *Critique of Anthropology,* 10/2-3, 1990, p. 27.

[116] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism*, p. 59.

[117] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 16.

[118] Ibid.

movement. Those intellectuals were mostly embracing federalist and republicanist ideals; they adapted the ideals of La Renaixença while rejecting its romanticism and adoption of the past.

Their federalist ideals were the outcome of the productivity of Renaixença and effects of the modernization. It blossomed in Sexenio Democrático (1868-1874) in which the modernist intellectuals found the opportunity to plant their Catalanist ideals on the political basis.[119] However, their federalist and republican ideals appealed to the popular classes, to the working class in particular which was gradually radicalizing at a time that the bourgeoisie was backing centralist state.[120]What this polarization created was a division among modernist, federalist intellectuals, a group of which was in favour of formation of a system from above by preserving the existing institutions (traditionalists) while the other wanted a state built from bottom up in which they could decide their own sovereignty and unity themselves (progressives).[121]

The efforts of the intellectuals together with the democratic atmosphere which encouraged modernist intellectuals to mention a Catalan state, were responded with Catalanophobia systematically imposed by Castilian press.[122] Catalan effort for existence in politics which had been restricted for long was perceived as an attempt to damage the state's so-called unitary structure. However, this Catalanophobia, paradoxically helped the victimization of Catalanists which would provide legitimacy for the further Catalanist demands and actions. During the Restoration Era (1874-1931), the modernist Catalan intellectuals formed the base of the ideal of Catalan self-government system.

---

[119] Mauricio Janue i Miret, "El fracaso del Sexenio en Cataluña", in Rafael Serrano Garcia (edited), *España 1868-1874. Nuevos enfoques sobre el Sexenio Democratico,* Junta de Castilla y Leon, Valladolid, 2002, pp. 259-289.

[120] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 45.

[121] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* p. 121.

[122] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 22.

The federalist ideals were institutionalized by Valenti Almirall through his work in 1886 which paved the way for the shift from regionalism to nationalism adapting federalist ideals.[123] He was a modernist opposed to historicism proposed by La Renaixença and he was seeing federalism as the only suitable political system for Catalonia.[124][125]Above all, he became a unifying factor of traditionalists and progressives under the umbrella of Catalanism by defending common Catalan economic interests.[126] Language was still the basic element; however, it was not embraced as a discriminative and exclusive feature but an indicator of defensive aspect of Catalanism, which had so long subordinated to Castilian.

3.2.4. Conservative and Republican Idealists

The political and ideological diversity among the Catalan intellectuals (traditionalists and progressives) led to a sharp distinction within the movement, it mainly paved the way for the emergence of the conservative Catalanists. From post-1898 until the end of the Civil War, these Catalanists shaped the Catalan nationalist movement. What triggered the emergence of this division was the Cuban War Crisis in 1898. Catalans, the Catalan bourgeoisie in particular, showed solidarity within Spanish state in the war for their economic interests.[127] Yet, by the end of the nineteenth century, the Catalan bourgeoisie was already sympathetic to Catalanist ideals thanks to Almirall's emphasis on common economic interests. With the loss of the last colony and economic gains, Catalan bourgeoisie for the first time gave explicit support to Catalanist movement.

---

[123] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 17.

[124] Ibid.

[125] Payne, "Catalan and Basque Nationalism", p. 21.

[126] Catalan industrial bourgeoisie was supporting the regionalist ideals even though they were pro-Spanish.

[127] Payne, "Catalan and Basque Nationalism", pp. 21-23.

Enric Prat de la Riba and other conservative Catalanists were advocating that the Catalanism was to be the vehicle of middle-class modernization, promoting social harmony and well being.[128] What conservative Catalanists did was the politicization of the Catalan cultural movement which embodied with the party, Lliga Regionalista which would be one of the major political actors of Catalonia until 1931.[129]

What is important about the conservative Catalanist intellectuals and the movement itself is that it had no official religious connotations. Catalan society was divided into the classes and the most radicalized and active one was the working-class which was under influence of Marxism as well as anti-clericalism. The support of the working-class was crucial for any kind of movement or ideology to be cemented. Thus, the Catalan nationalism preserved its secular structure even at its conservatism's highest period. This secular characteristic was also mentioned by Almirall and none of the conservative organizations presented themselves on the religious grounds, they were never called themselves Catholic.[130]

In the early twentieth century, the Catalan movement was being represented on the political ground which caused a more institutional structure within Catalan nationalism. It was at this time that Catalan people could be drawn into the ideal of "nation". For the Catalan case, even though there was a Catalan identity which was identified with the language and culture, there was a lack of elements that could make people feel belonging to a nation. Adaptation of a national anthem, national holiday and flag, La Senyera, as national symbols represented the rejection of Castilian elements[131] became a revival for the people who long felt inferior to Castilian culture.

---

[128] Montserrat, Guibernau, "Nationalism and Intellectuals in Nations without State: the Catalan Case", *Political Issues,* 48/5, 2000, p. 1004.

[129] This political formation was not after a total separation. Rather, it was pursuing regionalist strategies.

[130] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 27.

[131] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 32.

The Catalanist productivity also produced its "anti" side which was led by Republicanist Alejandro Lerroux. He was opposed to Catalanism even though he admitted Catalans as a people with their own distinct characteristics and race.[132] However, Lerrouxisme's socialist-like ideal did not find a proper response from the working class since the socialism identified with the idea of centralist state made workers sympathetic to federalism and even anarchism due to Catalan bourgeoisie's support for centralist state. Nonetheless, Lerrouxisme remained as an important actor which would be a determinant for the Catalan nationalism during Franco period.

There were two main incidents which affected the course of Catalan nationalism. The first one was the direct intervention of the Spanish Army to the Catalan issue through military repression that awakened the "victimization" and resulted in the establishment of "Solidaritat Catalana".[133] The repression coming from non or anti Catalan actors did not weaken but strengthened Catalan nationalism.[134] The second one was the "Setmana Tragica" (Tragic Week) in 1909 which was the result of anti-clerical politics of Lerrouxisme and the provocation of anarchists and during which tens of clergy were killed and tens of churches and monasteries were burned down.[135] The latter would weaken the hand of Catalan nationalists during and after the Civil War. These developments caused the Spanish government to take the Catalan issue into consideration. The establishment of the Mancomunitat which was uniting the four provinces Barcelona, Girona, Tarragona and Lleida under the leadership of Enric Prat de la Riba was a clear example of the state's effort to end extreme politics in Catalonia and to keep the Catalan nationalism under control.[136]

---

[132] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 29.

[133] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 57.

[134] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 28.

[135] Joan Connelly Ullmann, *The Tragic Week: A Study of Anticlericalism in Spain 1872-1912,* Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1972, p. 205.

[136] It was the statement of Prat de la Riba. However, it must be considered that he was not a separatist but federalist. Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 30.

What Mancomunitat did bring to the Catalan nationalism was institutionalization and systematization of the movement under the conservative Catalanism. Even though the Catalan language did not gain an official status, efforts for systematization made it more technical by determining the common rules which was coined by Pompeu Fabra.[137] Even though the state intended to control Catalan nationalism, due to its weakness, the Catalan nationalism was accelerated and penetrated into the masses thanks to Mancomunitat and created the perception of "Catalan nation" among people through education. Nonetheless, what was important that the halt of Catalan nationalism was not independent of the state; there was either positive or negative correlation between state and the Catalan movement. If state repressed the Catalanism, it benefitted from victimization, and if state allowed it to act autonomous to some extent, it could function that way.

3.2.5. Working Class and Catalan Separatists

The first quarter of the twentieth century witnessed newly appeared actors in Catalan nationalism. The working class had been the target of the Catalan nationalism until the early twentieth century. Its role changed and it became a determinant rather than being the target in the Catalanist movement along with the Catalan separatists. Even though they did not have much in common, they should be assumed as two different outcomes of one incident, the First World War. The War had a negative impact on the Catalan economy regarding workers. It created a vacuum for the anarchist organizations, UGT and CNT (Confederación Nacional de Trabajo) which were formed by the working class that led to social and political unrest in Catalonia particularly between 1917-1921.[138]

The end of the First World War also paved the way for the emergence of separatist movement. The Catalan nationalism had always been federalist (either traditionalist

[137] Laura Desfor Edles, "A Culturalist Approach to Ethnic Nationalist Movements: Symbolization and Basque and Catalan Nationalism in Spain", *Social Science History,* 23/3, 1999, p. 318.

[138] Payne, *The Spanish Revolution*, p. 60.

or progressive except Lerrouxisme) until the War after which the map of Europe would be reshaped considering the minorities. Besides, principle of self-determination declared in Wilson's Fourteen Points encouraged Catalan separatism.[139] However, the focus of Allies was on the Balkans rather than Spanish territory so the Catalan separatists could not get an international support.[140] Undoubtedly, not only the First World War but also increasing centralist repression from the state gave speed to Catalan separatism.

The activity of the working class evoked the Catalan bourgeoisie to dominate Catalan nationalism. They tried to create an alternative to ongoing labour radicalism and separatism in Catalonia. Education, standardization of Catalan language, consolidation of the institutions such as Institut d'Estudis Catalans as an alternative to the official foundation of National Library as well as small libraries for the cultural reproduction were the projects of the Catalan bourgeoisie.[141] However, the Catalan bourgeoisie did not have its own state nor did it have a position in Spanish state to intervene with the ongoing incidents to imply its policies.[142] Therefore, they could not have confronted the chaos ongoing in Catalonia. Working class and the Catalan separatists continued their radical activities which would face two different reactions from the state.

3.3. State's Encounter with the Catalan Question

Catalan nationalism had not faced any serious and systematic challenge from the Spanish state until the first quarter of the twentieth century. The Catalanist movement was pressured and restricted but it was because the state was already weak and tackling with other problems so that it did not want to be obstructed by this

---

[139] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 74.

[140] Ibid., p. 75.

[141] Albert Balcells, Enric Pujol and Jordi Sabater, *La Mancomunitat de Catalunya i l'autonomi,* Edicions Proa S.A., Barcelona, 1996, p. 443.

[142] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 36.

"discontent". Moreover, until the twentieth century, the Catalan nationalism was not a separatist and radicalized movement thus did not pose a threat to the central government. Therefore, the state did not require a serious measure until 1920s. The two periods mentioned below were two different reactions of the state to the Catalan nationalism to encounter the Catalan problem.

3.3.1. Military Regime of Primo de Rivera (1923-1930)

This period could be considered as a prototype of Franco regime regarding the state policies about Catalan nationalism. General Primo de Rivera's military uprising, indeed, did not cause a reaction in Catalonia at first; yet, after the military coup, for the first time, all the national symbols of Catalonia which mobilized the Catalan nation and became the core values of Catalan nationalism, such as the use of Catalan language, display of Senyera, were prohibited and the Catalan nationalist actions which would be perceived as a threat to state's unity would be subjected to jurisdiction in military courts.[143]

What the state's encounter did in Catalonia was contribution to deepen fragmentation in Catalan nationalism and escalated the division between the classes. The dominance of radical working class before the military coup made the Catalan bourgeoisie ally with the dictatorship and it strengthened Primo de Rivera.[144] Subsequently, Mancomunitat was dissolved and the control of four provinces (Barcelona, Tarragona, Lleida and Girona) passed to regional military authorities.[145] It turned out to be a political war between the new Spanish military government and Catalan nationalists. Moreover, this repression reproduced victimization of Catalanism which provided legitimacy for the further Catalanist actions.

---

[143] Ibid.

[144] Dowling, "For Christ and Catalonia", p. 25.

[145] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 84.

This oppression also pushed the Catalan movement underground and unintentionally created a unitary bond among the irreconcilable groups within the Catalan nationalist movement.[146] The common base was the promotion and dissemination of the Catalan culture which was under the state's repression. Moreover, people began to identify themself with the Catalan national symbols and they held on to their Catalan identity more than they did in previous periods.[147] The Catalan nationalists tried to internationalize the issue through League of Nations by taking advantage of the newly codified minority rights but those rights were mostly concerning for Balkans and Eastern Europe[148] thus they could not draw other countries' attention.

Through the end of 1920s, the military government went under a crisis due to unpopularity of General Primo de Rivera as well as economic bottleneck brought by the Great Depression in 1929. Because of the discontent and reaction among people, Primo de Rivera resigned in 1930.[149] Rivera's influence over the Catalan nationalism was more beneficiary than the Second Republic in which the Catalanist movement was at its pinnacle. The repression always had a counter-effect on the Catalan nationalism; rather than demolishing it, the military government brought long-divided Catalan intelligentsia and the popular classes together. It was because both classes were affected by the same restriction; the ban on the use of Catalan in daily life practices (changing the street names i.e.)[150] resulted in same reaction from various sectors of the Catalan society.

Both the existence and the dissolution of the military regime gave speed to leftist Catalan nationalism which were dominated by the working class and Republicans.

---

[146] David D. Laitin, "Linguistic Revival: Politics and Culture in Catalonia", *Comparative Studies in Society and History,* 31/2, 1989, p. 301.

[147] Dowling, "For Christ and Catalonia", p. 25.

[148] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 86.

[149] Kenneth McRobert, *Catalonia: Nation-Building without a State",* OUP Canada, Ontario, 2001, pp. 21-45.

[150] Payne, "Nationalism, Regionalism and Micronationalism in Spain", p. 482.

The military government brought various fractions together; autonomist ideal was a middle way that became an alternative to radical separatism.[151] The end of Primo de Rivera's rule signified a revival in organizations and political formations in the Catalanist movement.

3.3.2. The Second Republic (1931-1939)

State's encounter with the Catalan issue does not necessarily undertake a pejorative meaning so that the declaration of the Second Republic could also be considered as the state's reaction to Catalan nationalism. The Second Republic became the Golden Age of Catalan nationalism thanks to which Catalonia gained its autonomy.

The collapse of the military regime along with relatively peaceful and democratic environment brought a new phase to relationship between the central government and Catalonia. In fact, the main difference was in the attitude of the Spanish intelligentsia who was defending multilingualism and denouncing the persecutive policies of the Primo de Rivera's government.[152] This was supplied with a political initiative, San Sebastian Pact in 1930 which was formed by Spanish Republicans and socialists along with their Catalan counterparts that rejected the monarchy in the new political system after military regime.[153] This led to the formation of Republican Revolutionary Committee in 1931 which would later become the first government of the Second Republic.[154]

The rise of the republican ideas caused the collapse of conservative Catalan nationalism in Catalonia. The victory of the leftist ERC (Esquerra Republicana de Catalunya) in the election in 1931 signified the rise of the left in Catalan politics.

---

[151] Francesc Candel, *Els altres Catalans vint anys despres,* Ediciones 62, Barcelona, 1985, pp. 91-98.

[152] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, p. 39.

[153] Candel, *Els altres Catalans vint anys despres,* pp. 91-98.

[154] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, p. 38.

After the elections, the Statute of Autonomy (Estatut) was approved and it paved the way for the establishment of Generalitat, the autonomous Catalan government in 1932 and ERC's leader, Francesc Macia became the president of Generalitat.[155] It anticipated a federal state which was the only suitable system for a well-functioning autonomy in Catalonia. The main problem was that in theory, the Republican constitution would form a federal state but in practice it turned out to be an integral state which seemed unitary in nature but indeed it was a preparation for decentralization.[156]

During the Second Republic, Catalan educational system progressed more than any other European country including Spain which could trigge the dissemination of nationalist aspetcs. The only obstacle for the spread of the Catalan language was that the teachers who were sent by the central government to Catalonia were not sufficient in Catalan and they needed to be trained.[157] Therefore, Generalitat took up an initiative and opened Institut Escola to train the future teachers in Catalan.[158] Although the school system did not contribute enough to reproduction of the Catalan culture and language, radio and press became the major distributor of the language and the culture in the twentieth century.

Besides all these developments, Catalonia faced two serious problems. First, it was affected by the Great Depression which caused an increasing rate in unemployment hence disquietude among working class in Catalonia. Second, the division among Spanish Republicans and socialists re-emerged and made the Republic a fragile system. The rise of Adolf Hitler in Germany and Benito Mussolini in Italy created a domino effect and the newly established CEDA won the elections in 1933.[159] The

---

[155] McRobert, *Catalonia: Nation-Building without a State,* p. 37.

[156] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism*, p. 95.

[157] Ibid., p. 117.

[158] Ibid.

[159] Payne, "Regionalism, Nationalism and Micronationalism in Spain", p. 486.

dimension which had an impact over Catalonia was that it was a conservative rightist party which was a threat to Estatut. The Republican right was too weak to challenge CEDA which became the most powerful rightist, anti-Republican and Catholicist party.[160]

New Spanish government tried to reverse the reforms and resort to repression which caused an uprising in Catalonia that resulted in declaration of the Catalan Republic.[161] It did not succeed and brought forth the suspension of Generalitat. In 1936, the Left regained its strength and organized under the name of Frente Popular (Popular Front) which was dominated by the anarchists.[162] They gained an overwhelming victory in the elections and the new reforms were performed under the radical conditions brought by the anarchists.[163]

These incidents coincided with the revolt of the Spanish army under the leadership of General Francisco Franco. As it happened with Primo de Rivera's military coup, the army stood against separatism and socialism. Army's intervention met with the resistance of Republicans, socialists and anarchists who were called as "rojoseparatistas" (red separatists) which resulted in the most traumatic incident of Spanish history, La Guerra Civil (The Civil War), started in 1936 and ended in 1939.[164] In 1939, Francoist forces took over Barcelona; Generalitat was dissolved and Catalanist leaders were either executed or forced into exile. It opened a new phase for the Catalan nationalism under Franco's rule which lasted thirty-five years.

---

[160] Payne, "Catalan and Basque Nationalism", p. 28.

[161] Ibid., p. 41. It was led by Lluis Companys, the leader of ERC that caused his and other politicians arrest.

[162] John Langdon-Davis, *Darrere les Barricades*, Angle Editorial, Barcelona, 2009, p. 32.

[163] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, p. 41.

[164] Edward Hallett Carr, *The Comintern and the Spanish Civil War,* Pantheon Books, New York, 1984, p. 13.

3.4. Catalan Catholic Church and Catalan Nationalism

During the formation process, Catholicism was excluded from Catalan nationalism. In order to survive and consolidate its position as an influential institution, the Catholic Church needed to attach to the political structure which was only possible through rightist parties in Catalonia. Strong secular structure of Catalanism was posing a serious threat to the Church thus it had to reposition itself on Catalanist side. It did not create a new wave in Catalan nationalism; rather, it functioned within the borders already drawn by the secular nationalists, as another actor. In fact, the Catalan Church adopted the whole discourse and cultural elements of Catalan nationalism only by excluding secularism and adding Catholicism instead.

Both Catalan nationalism and the Catalan Church were in a struggle with liberalism.[165] Catalan nationalism was rejecting centralist ideals of liberalism while the Catalan Church was against the separation of the state and the Church as well as secularism.[166] During 1850s and 1860s, in order to enlarge its social base, the Catalan Church had benefitted from the anti-centralist view of Catalan nationalism which extended its sphere of influence by attracting not only upper classes and intellectuals but also popular classes.[167] It was an early sign of the shift in the attitude of Catalan Church from elite politics to popular masses.

The more Catalan nationalism gained momentum, the more it turned into a tool for the Church to spread its influence through Catholic teachings and Catholicization within Catalonia. Initially, the Catalan Church was prone to collaborate with the Spanish government and to use the conservative tendency of the bourgeois elites (both Spanish and Catalan bourgeoisie) to reinforce its position among the upper-

---

[165] It was a declaration made in the First Vatican Council in 1869. The Catholic Church was worldwidely in a war with liberalism and materialism.

[166] Anthony Gill, *Rendering Unto Ceasars: The Catholic Church in Latin America,* New York, New York University Press, 2011, p. 46.

[167] Smith, *The Origins of Catalanism,* p. 184.

classes in the urban areas.[168] However, the Catalan bourgeoisie had changed its attitude towards Catalan nationalism because of the economic restrictions implied by Spain over Catalonia. On the other hand, the Catalan Church, due to the increasing influence of the Catalan nationalism among popular classes and the transformation in the attitude of the Catalan bourgeoisie, turned its face to the lower classes by utilizing from the changing conjuncture after 1800s.

The Catalan Church supported Catholic intellectuals who were sympathetic to Catalan nationalism. Josep Torres i Bages, a Catholic priest and his work "La Tradicio Catalana"[169] became the masterpiece of Catholic Catalanist movement and the first outcome of the clerical involvement with nationalism[170] which marked the later phases of the Catalan nationalist movement. Catholic intellectuals also joined the linguistic events which was an indicator of the adoption of Catalan language and culture as an important component of the Catholic Catalan movement as well.

In order to justify its cause, the Catalan Church chose to victimize itself by selecting an "other", an "enemy" which was liberalism at that time. The Church's claim was that the secular and modern aspects of liberalism were targeting the traditional structure as well as traditions so long adopted by the society; it was undermining the sense of patria[171], which was formed by a combination of Catalanism and Catholicism. In fact, the emphasis on the Catholicism was only instrumental since the only tool the Church could effectively use was Catholicism. It was used to legitimate the Church's intervention with the social and political structures; it was not an issue of religion but an issue of institutional interests. Yet, the core of Catalan nationalism, Barcelona was highly industrialized and secularized considering the

---

[168] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 27.

[169] He was praising the greatness of Catalonia in history for it embraced Christianity. Corporatism was being raised as an alternative to modernization, urbanisation and secularization. For Torras i Bages, Catholicism and Catalonia formed a single unity and Catalonia could be free only if it would adapt its Christian past again.

[170] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 27.

[171] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism*, p. 186.

number of non-religious characteristic of workers. Therefore, Catholic Catalan nationalists allied with the bourgeoisie and canalized their efforts into the rural parts of Catalonia.

While the Church was trying to engage with the Catalan nationalism, it needed tangible symbols both for its own Catalanization and for the Catalanism's Catholicization. In fact, Catalanization of the Church was to create an indigenous Church apart from the Spanish Church, with its own particular activities and symbols. Therefore, it re-oriented the Catalan hymns, religious festivities and other Church activities into the Catalanist movement in order to draw Catalan people's support. Moreover, the Catalan Church embraced more indigenous symbols which were directly linked to Catalan "patria"- the Catalan land.[172] Thus, Monastery of Montserrat was chosen as the religious center; which was an indicator how identities are attached to landscapes in the process of the social construction of a "nation".[173] Moreover, Black Virgin (Black Madonna or Moreneta) became the spiritual base of Catholic Catalanism[174] which contribute a sacred dimension and legitimation to the Catholic Catalanist movement. It was the first declaration of the Catalan Marianism in 1880s[175] which would have a remarkable impact over Catalanist actions in the future. In accordance with the ideas of Torras i Bages expressed in his work, the local hierarchy too was seeing Catalanism as an ideology which consisted of Catholicism; Catalan nationalism and Catholicism were inseparable, without Catholicism there would be no Catalan patria or Catalan identity.[176]

---

[172] It includes the Spanish Catalonia only. French Catalonia demographically, politically and socially different than that of Spanish.

[173] Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, p. 7.

[174] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 27.

[175] Catalan Marianism was simply worship to Black Madonna. Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism*, pp. 79-80.

[176] Frances Lannon, *Privilege, Persecution, Prophecy. The Catholic Church in Spain 1875-1975*, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1987, pp. 31-88. It was propagated in the weekly Catholic Catalanist La Veu de Montserrat.

In this period, if not in general, the words used by the Catalan Church was not randomly chosen. The Church changed the mainstream expression of "Catalan identity" with "Catalan spirit" which carries a more sacred meaning. It was attributing a deific characteristic to Catalan identity which made its existence was unquestionable and undeniable; it was "given". It was coinciding with the idea of Catalonia being an organic. Along with the Catholicist tendency, it was the most distinctive characteristic of the Catalan Church-led Catholic Catalanist movement.

During 1800s, however, there can still be seen a duality in Catalan Church's actions. Despite all these efforts to create an indigenous church, the Catalan Church avoided to call Catalans as a distinct nation in order not to contradict with Spanish elites and the Spanish state. It was because of the lack of a threatening civil society which made the state only threat for the Church's interests. Thus, in 1800s, the Catalan Church, through its ideology of Catholic Catalan nationalism, acted like a medium between Catalan nationalism and the Spanish state. This state-favouring attitude of the Catalan Church was still stemming from its hostility towards the idea of state-Church separation of liberalism.[177]

The rise of labour movements enabled the Catalan Church to benefit from the discourse of superiority based on economic situation of Catalonia. Even though the Church began to approach the rural sectors of the society, it was still cautious about its relationship with the state. Therefore, the Catalan Church, unlike other Catalan nationalist actors such as Lliga Regionalista (a conservative Catalan nationalist political party which had an organic tie with the Catalan Church), used the economic superiority of Catalonia not against the state but in favor of the state.[178] On the other hand, the emergence of the labour movements pushed the Church to re-define itself over the new enemy, Marxism which led to the creation of Unión Católica[179] as a

---

[177] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* p. 195.

[178] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 19.

[179] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* p. 196.

political alternative to Marxist threat. It was not a separatist movement; rather, it was claiming that the Catalonia's superiority was the way to Spain's required modernization. However, there were two inconsistent points. First, the class who revolted was not identified by their ethnic identity, they only described as "workers" with no emphasis of being Catalan. Second, the Church's integration into Catalan nationalist movement was its adoption of all demands of Catalan nationalism that was basically the cultural and linguistic autonomy. Nonconcurrence between this nationalistic ideal and political action reminds would obscure the further activities of the organization.

Acceleration and development of Catalan nationalism, undoubtedly had a response on the state's side. However, the Spanish state was not so strong to develop a consistent policy against Catalan nationalism due to economic problems, the devastation brought by the Carlist Wars[180] and Cuban War.[181] Therefore, it took simplier measures to disturb the Catalan nationalists such as changing the Catalan street names with Castilian.[182] Thus, education was emphasized by the Catalan nationalists to counter the impose of Spanish culture. Catalonia's history was re-written and re-interpreted; Catalonia's past was more historicized to legitimate its cause and for its penetration into the society.

Despite all the efforts of the Catalan Church, anti-clericalism strengthened in Catalonia in twentieth century which was resulted in Setmana Tragica (Tragic Week in 1909). It demonstrated that the Catalan Church could not find a social and political response in Catalonia. In fact, Setmana Tragica showed that for the working class

---

[180] It can be called as throne wars which fought between the supporters of Carlos V and Isabelle II. Carlists were also fighting with liberalism and republicanism by defending traditionalist structure. There were three Carlist Wars between 1833-1876. Even though the Civil War was seen as a crusade against the secularism by Carlists, Franco did not establish the Carlist monarchism in the country.

[181] It was the independence war of Cuba between 1895-1898. It was escalated by the intervention of the US forces which turned into Spanish-American War and resulted in a devastation for Spanish monarchy.

[182] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 52.

social and religious issues were more important than the regional question.[183] The Although the Catalan Church tried to influence atheistic masses by centering Catalan nationalism, its primary element, the Catalan language in particular, it was more devoted to "the saving of souls" than engaging with very real social problems, which only increased residual resentment towards it amongst the working class.[184]

With the declaration of the Second Republic in 1931, the Catalan Church had to face two big quests: First, it lost its privilege and prestige due to its organic tie with the rightist parties which was an ally of the Primo de Rivera's dictatorship. Second, the Republic was the product of the secular modernizers who saw the Church as an agent of backwardness and as a barrier to progress.[185] The elections held in 1936 became the breaking point of the Catalan Church and state relationship. In the election, the anti-clerical party, Front Catala d'Ordre (Catalan Front Order) had a considerable success; afterwards it made the Catholic religion one of its principal banners of propaganda.[186]Even though the teachings and ideology of the Catalan Church was defended by Lliga Regionalista on the political stage, it did not make the Church central to newly established Republic.[187]

---

[183] Ullmann, *The Tragic Week,* p. 258.

[184] Josep Massot i Muntaner, *L'esglesia catalana al segle XX,* Curial, Barcelona, 1975, p. 146.

[185] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 32.

[186] Ibid.

[187] Ibid., p. 37. As all the other institutions, the influence and position of the Catalan Church was directly linked to the regime's ideological stance. Advanced secularism of the Republic which had been a serious threat to the Catalan Church for so long, had a great impact over the Catholic Catalan nationalism. However, the Catholic Catalans soon organized under the Unió Democratica de Catalunya (UDC). It was formed after Accion Catalana and Lliga Regionalista was splintered due to theirsecularism and extreme conservatism respectively. What Republic caused undeliberately was a more organizational system in the Catalan Church's ideological development. It was linked to a Catalan religious association, the Federacio de Joves Cristians (Federation of Young Christians) which was founded in 1931 and inspired by French non-rightist Catholicism. Their primary ideal was re-nationalization of their land the Christian principles. They were strongly opposing the Republic since it was excluding traditional spirituality of the Catalan nationalism and their aim was re-Christianization and to overcome the intense social divisions in Catalonia. Pilar Garcia Jordan, *Els catolics catalans i la segona republica 1931-1936,* Publicaciones de l'Abadia de Montserrat, Barcelona, 1986, p. 93.

Takeover of the Generalitat by the anarchists after an attempted military coup triggered the violent incidents directed to the Church in 1936 which resulted in the assassination of more than 2000 priests and members of the religious order.[188] The Catalan Church buildings were burned down, the Monastery of Montserrat was harshly attacked. The reasons of the attack can be varied but the most important one was the anarchist discourse triggering anti-clericalism that escalated the anti-Church actions. However, those attacks were against the Church as an institution rather than Catholicism itself. The Church not the religion was seen as a collaborator with the State elites and upper classes which were exploiting the lower classes.

During the Civil War (1936-1939) between republicans and conservative nationalists, the Church continued to be the target of the violence which made it ally with the conservative Spanish nationalists. However, the Catalan Church was not a unitary institution which sheltered the guerilla monks and separatist monks so that the nationalist forces perceived the Catalan Church as a false Catholic institution.[189] After the defeat of the republicans, it was clearly seen it was a disappointment for the Church since it was not possible to exercise its ideology and dominance without existing in the political ground since Nationalist forces were against a parliamentary system.[190] Even though, considering the threat posed to the Church, it chose to be ally with the Francoist powers other than incontrolats (ones who attacked the Church)[191] and during the Francoist period, the Catalan Church would undertake a major role for the course of Catalan nationalism.

---

[188] Josep M. Piñol, *La nacionalcatolicisme a Catalunya i la resistencia,* Edicions 62, Barcelona, 1940, p. 49, cited in Andrew Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 39.

[189] Enric Ucelay-Da Cal, "Violencia simbólica y temática militarista en el nacionalismo radical catalán", *Violencia y Politica en España*, 13, 1994, p. 241.

[190] It was the influence of Falange which was a strong anti-party movement supported nationalist side during the Civil War.

[191] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 48.

CHAPTER 4

SPANISH CATHOLIC CHURCH AND SPANISH NATIONALISM DURING FRANCOIST ERA (1939-1975)

4.1. Introduction

The defeat of the Republicans in the Civil War paved the way for opening of a new phase in the Spanish history. "Francoism" was introduced as the new system that mainly lied on Nationalist-Catholic ideology. This system was based on the Catholic Church, the Falange and the Army; however, the Spanish Catholic Church, as the most consistent institution, became the major component of the Franco regime. Therefore, in this chapter, it will be held central to national-Catholicism considering its relationship with other actors and its stance regarding the policies of the state. It did not have a static attitude towards the regime and National-Catholicism thus periodization of the Francoist era is required in order to analyze the dynamics of the relationship between Spanish Catholic Church and Spanish nationalism.

The periodization of the Franco period as 1940-1960 and 1961-1975 actually stems from different interpretations of the Civil War which changed dramatically in mentioned periods. That is, Franco based the legitimization of his power and his nationalist policy on the Civil War, which proved, in the long term, fallacy that undermined the legitimacy of his regime. Between 1940 and 1960, the Civil War was interpreted as a "crusade" fought between faithful and atheist, and it showed the conqueror and conquered, by the Spanish Catholic Church that would attribute a just cause and legitimacy to the Franco regime. In the period of 1960-1975, the Civil War began to be interpreted as a tragedy rather than a victory, which caused a long lasting division among the people which would contradict the principle of national and Catholic unity.

4.2. Emergence and Climax of Spanish National-Catholicism (1940-1960)

4.2.1. Spanish Catholic Church in the Early 1940s

The end of the Civil War in 1939 became the start of the Franco period, which lasted until the death of the General in 1975. Traditional and conservative type of Spanish nationalism under the name of national-Catholicism was sharpened during his dictatorship. What national-Catholicism mainly inflicted was that Catholicism was the core of New Spain[192] while Castilian was the main essence of the nation. This system was directly excluding Basque and Catalan elements, and by consistent pressure and prohibition since the Castilian was declared as the only official language and all other identities were persecuted and prohibited.

This ethnicist trait of Franco's nationalism entailed the principle of "national regeneration". While the Civil War was reinterpreted as a "Holy Crusade", the idea of "Anti-Spain" was associated with the Republicans, liberals, leftists and separatists. What was needed for the treatment was pure violence and persecution that was praised by the Falange in particular.[193] The national-Catholicist ideology was soon declared official in the New Spain; thus the Catholicism became officially the consubstantial component of the Spanish identity.[194]

Considering the tie between Spanish nationalism and Catholicism, it can be said that the most privileged institution was the Spanish Catholic Church after the war.

---

[192] Spain, re-established under the lead of Franco, was described as "New Spain", which actually meant "renewed" by referring to the "essence" of Spain, Los Reyes Catolicos and by refusing the Second Republic, "anti-Spain".

[193] Payne, *Fascism in Spain,* p. 79.

[194] In political domain, Falange was dominant among the other political families that was declared as the official party by Franco in 1937; however, it was obliged to collaborate with the other parties of nationalist side against the leftist forces. The Falange's plan of action was embraced as of the state yet it was not the ultimate and sole ideology of the New Spain. Theoretically, Franco's Spain was a fascist one while its structure remained highly syncretic and its full future definition undetermined. As it was mentioned before, Falange's purpose was to create a Spain loyal to Catholicism and to its imperialistic historical background. Franco proudly mentioned that Spanish totalitarianism would resemble monarchism and be inspired by the policies pursued by Reyes Catolicos. Payne, *Spanish Catholicism,* p. 176.

Religion was not necessarily to be associated with the Church; yet the Church was to use religion for political ends thus presented as the sole carrier of Catholicism. The privileges provided by Franco to the Spanish Catholic Church created a symbiotic relationship between the dictatorship and the Church hierarchy.[195] However, those privileges should not be perceived as equalization of the Church and civil authorities. It was rather to give a worldy, political role to the Spanish Catholic Church in order it to be a tool of the new regime. On the other hand, national-Catholicism, binding religion and Spanish nationalism through repudiation of liberalism and secularism and extolling General Franco as the savior of nation and faith, assisted to consolidate the new regime's authority among the citizens.[196]

In the initial years of the Franco period, the Spanish Catholic Church labelled Franco's forces as "national" which was adequate enough to legitimize and to justify the cause of the rebel side of the war since they fought for their nation and "patria".[197] The Church hierarchy supported the rebels due to the fact that they were assumed as the true representatives of Spanish nation whose purpose was to revive the culture and traditions of Spanish society in consonance with its own history.[198]The reinterpretation of the war as "crusade" and the idea of Catholic Spain that defeated its atheistic enemies as well as conception of a Christian people who internalized "spiritual reconquest"[199] to reach the Spanish nation's "universal

---

[195] Abel Plenn, *Wind of Olive Trees: Spain From Inside*, Kessinger Publishing, New York, 1946, p. 87. King Ferdinand VII was overthrown by Napoleon in 1808. He pursued counter-revolutionary policies as well as hostility against the liberal constitution of 1812. For more information; Miguel, Artola, *La Espana de Fernando VII,* Espasa, Madrid, 1999.

[196] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain,* p. 383.

[197] Nicola Rooney,"The role of the Catholic hierarchy in the rise to power of General Franco" in *Issue 4 of Quest* of 'Perspectives on Power' Conference, p. 4.

[198] Payne, *Spanish Catholicism*, p. 175.

[199] From the social perspective, the idea of religious reconquest combining with the National-Catholicism turned the country into religious and nationalist bastion. The governors perceived themselves as the protectors of the public morality while propagandating against the dances, bars and even theatre plays. Through a new criminal code, blasphemy was recognized as a crime. Bishops also took charge of "protection" of the Spanish folk from indecent ideas and actions. Particularly cinema was the target of the Spanish Catholic Church and fervently applied censorship. Thus, in fact the

destiny", pushed the Spanish Catholic Church to have a particular place as a decision-maker, renewed by the Civil War and the Second Republic.[200]

Even though the Spanish Catholic Church supported Franco's forces during the Civil War, it did not directly back the Francoist regime once it was established. Fearful of German Nazism, the Spanish Catholic Church was cautious about a different ideology which could take the state apart from the Catholic teachings[201], while the same Church consistently endorsed Franco's policies which aimed at establishing an order on the basis of authoritarian and nationalist aspects.[202] As a result of its support for the Franco's policies, the Spanish Catholic Church failed to be an institution which could bring all the Spaniards together regardless of their ideological differences but triggered the division of conqueror and conquered.

Under the ideology of national-Catholicism, state led to many regulations to empower the Catholic doctrines in the areas of education and culture.[203] Symbolization was chosen as a reminder of religion in every day practices so that the symbols and cults were revived and placed in the schools, Corpus Christi was declared a national holiday once more, and Santiago was restored as the patron of Spain.[204] The final victory on May 19, 1939 was declared as the "Day of the Victory"

Spanish Catholic Church willingly became a part of the censorship system. Callahan, *The Spanish Catholic Church,* p. 467.

[200] Pedro Cantero, *La hora católica de España,* RUTA, Madrid, 1942, p. 71.

[201] Payne, *Spanish Catholicism,* p. 175.

[202] This contradiction among the Church's discourse and its practice could be supported with the fact that during the war, it was obvious that Franco would be leading to a repressive regime and the Spanish Catholic Church approved its policies over the "anti-Crusaders" through its silence against violence. The Catholic Church remained unresponsive to the executions of the Republicanists. Thus, the symbiotic relationship between the Church and state, idealized as national-Catholicism became the primary basis for justifying Franco's power.

[203] Payne, *Spanish Catholicism*, p. 173.

[204] Ibid. The ceremonies completed with the change of the flag and addition of lyrics to the national anthem as well as attributing a currentcharacteristic to past events. Carsten, Humblebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation*, loc., 1541. Ceremonies were to reproduce the victory won in the Civil War and to declare Franco as "Caudillo". All these steps formed a rhetoric cemented with nationalism, religion

by emphasizing the power of the army and religious legitimization of Franco's authority.Popular Catholic elements such as the Blessed Virgin and the Sacred Heart were revived as the significant parts of Catholic devotion as well.[205]Even though the Spanish Catholic Church had always been concerned about popular Catholicism, which was difficult to keep under control, it turned out to bean agency, a policy for the Spanish Catholic Church to infuse Catholicism into the daily practices of the people.

Combining it with nationalizing Spaniards, it can be said that this whole process was imposed from above. Nationalization and re-Catholicization process could be interpreted as the extension of the Civil War, which preserved the division within the nation rather than bringing the unity, and led to the persecution over the half of population, which was alienated and exposed to violence in the name of purification of Spain.[206] The Spanish Catholic Church also gave approval by its silence against ongoing repression over "others" in the country.

The triumphant national-Catholicism paved the way for the Church to direct the re-Christianization process of the Spanish nation.[207] In theory, the Spanish Catholic Church perceived New Spain as a combination of the "two perfect societies", Catholic and Spanish; state was seen as the supreme authority in the temporal while the Catholic Church was the sole power in the religious domain.[208] State was subjected to the Catholic Church and they should overcome the handicaps through a

and their victory over the "enemies" through symbols and continuous discourses. The inseparable concepts of Catholicism and Spanishness in National-Catholicist ideology were emphasized in every religious activity.

[205] Humblebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* loc., 1552.

[206] Ibid., loc 1518.

[207] Enrique Lopez Galva, *Futura grandeza de España segun notables profecias,* Imp. Moret, La Coruna, 1941, p. 268.

[208] Payne, *Fascism in Spain*, pp. 129-131.

proper harmony.[209] Yet, the Catholic Church in the Francoist era was highly dependent on the state; intimate relations between military and ecclesiastical authorities paved the way for ignoring the difficulties in practice.

On the other hand, from the state's perspective, the theory of the Spanish Catholic Church was not matching with the regime's politics. For Franco, the Catholic Church was one of the main components for his authority, however, there were two facts which determined the relationship of the Church and state, both was stemming from post-war triumphalism. Firstly, Franco maintained the historical regalist policy which held the state as the ultimate power while restricting the Catholic Church to religious sphere only. Secondly, Franco needed to balance all the actors of the nationalist wing such as Falange and the army as well as the Catholic Church for its own ends.[210] Even though the Catholic Church obtained considerable privileges from the regime, it was reduced to a position in which it could only function as an interest group together with the Falange, Army and other components such as Carlists and monarchists.[211]

Even though Catholicism was seen as the basis of Francoism, it turned rather into a glue which held the different segments of the National Movement together, particulary after the Civil War. It must be borne in mind that not only Franco but also the hierarchy were responsible for the exploitation and manipulation of religion.

---

[209] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain,* p. 384.

[210] The Catholic Church and Catholic activists, mainly from the Church's organizations such as Asociacion Catolica Nacional de Propagandistas (ACNP) and the Accion Catolica (AC), were representing only one of the political "families" manipulated by Franco to sustain the dictatorship. Those organizations were two of rarely allowed bodies functioning under dictatorship. They were not directly associated with the politics; rather they were assumed as the political families due to the fact that they promoted the legitimacy of the Franco regime. Sergio Vilar, *La naturaleza del franquismo,* La Esfera de Los Libros, Madrid, 1977, p. 28.

[211] It should be mentioned that even though the state party of this symbiotic relationship represented relatively a more homogenous structure, ideals of the National-Catholicism and the principle of one and only faith could not bring a unification within Catholics as the Spanish Catholic Church had long desired. Although the Civil War supplied a monolithic front for the anti-Republicans, the National-Catholicism remained as a temporary reaction of the Catholics to the incidents of Republican years. However, heterogenity and factionalized structure did not hinder the Church's actions in the initial years of the Francoism. Callahan, *Fascism in Spain*, p. 384. Tusell, *La Dictadura de Franco,* p. 183.

However, this support and legitimation given to Franco, in return for institutional gains and benefits regarding education and control over public morality, destroyed the Catholic Church's liberty and dignity within the society by turning it heavily dependent on the state[212] and made the Church an unforgivable ally of the suppression and persecution over the Spanish nation.

In fact, the Catholic doctrine could easily turn into a tool for the Church's institutional benefits which was a blunt challenge to the state's power. Yet, it was a religious not a political actor which could be a civil authority. The restricted role given to the Spanish Church despite Franco's pietism showed that the regime was the only power to use the Catholicism as a policy; the Catholic Church was only an institution to approve the government's use of Catholicity.[213] Despite the fact that these restrictions over the Catholic Church triggered an unrest among the clergy and Catholic activists, they were hot-liners supporting Franco almost unanimously during the first two decades of the regime. It took the Church away from the lower classes and renewed its position as an ally of "above" rather than popular classes.[214]

4.2.2. Challenge of the Vatican and the Falange to the Regime

Despite the Holy See's unwillingness to associate with the Franco regime[215], the General pushed the Spanish Catholic Church to make a declaration to abolish the negative aspects of the regime abroad. What the Church did was the redefinition of the Civil War which used to be interpreted as a war between different social classes,

---

[212] Juan J. Linz, "Church and State in Spain from the Civil War to the Return of Democracy", *Religion and Politics,* 120/3, 1991, pp.164-168.

[213] Payne, *Spanish Catholicism,* p. 178.

[214] Callahan, *The Spanish Catholic Church*, p. 385.

[215] Vatican put a distance between itself and the Franco regime due to the fact that a close relationship with Franco could damage the prestige of the Holy See in terms of diplomatic connection with the European countries particularly after the Second World War started.

different ideologies, and between fascism and communism.[216] They persistently blamed the richer regions such as Catalonia and the Basque Country for their support to leftist movements while praising the less developed and poorer regions as the base of Catholicism.[217] It was not a war but the defense of the Spanish nationalists against godless communism and it was also claimed that the nationalists did not intend to form a dictatorship over the nation.[218]

Despite the unofficial agreement between the Franco regime and the Spanish Catholic Church, this relationship also had a supra-national characteristic. For international recognition and prestige as well as interior consolidation of national-Catholicism, the regime insisted on an agreement between Spain and the Vatican.[219]Knowing the restrictions over the Spanish Catholic Church as well as strength and position of the Falange (renamed later as the Falange Española Tradicionalista, FET) as the ruling party, the Holy See followed dragging-the-foot policy since it perceived the Falange members as pro-German and representatives of a totalitarian state organization. Still, despite the tense meetings, a narrow agreement was made between Spain and Vatican in 1941.[220]

Even though the Catholic Church avoided direct confrontation with the State and its ideology of National-Catholicism, the single party regime and its totalitarian ideals (FET's power) were perceived as a serious threat which resembled the Nazi Germany with its totalitarian characteristic under the unlimited power of General Franco. The prohibition of Catholic writings that questioned the negative aspects of

---

[216] It was declared through a Collective Letter in 1937. It was a document to legitimize Franco's effort in the Civil War. During the very early years of Francoism, nationalism was prior to Catholicism. Joan Domke, "Education, Fascism and the Catholic Church in Franco's Spain", *Dissertations,* 2011*,* pp. 8-10.

[217] Frances Lannon, *Privilege, Persecution and Prophecy: The Catholic Church in Spain*, *1875-1975*, p. 5.

[218] Rooney, "The role of the Catholic hierachy", p. 5.

[219] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy,* p. 46.

[220] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 387.

the Nazi Germany also fueled the Catholic Church's concern.[221]Particularly for the clergy in Basque Country and Catalonia, Franco's sympathy for Nazi Germany grew a fear that a possible triumph of Axis powers in the Second World War could have a domino effect in terms of racism and trigger the Falange's principle of state's monopoly over the Church, education and family.[222]

Although in theory, all the "families" of the regime were in favor of national-Catholicism, each of these families had its own institutional or organizational interests which were prior to nationalist tendencies. Therefore, national-Catholicism became a shelter for these "families" in order to compete to be more influential in social and political arenas using either Catholic or Nationalist principles of it.[223] Despite the fact that the ideology theoretically unified Spanish nationalism and Catholicism, each party used the most suitable aspect of it in accordance with one's own ends. The most prominent subject of competition was the education system which was dominated by the Catholics and FET members respectively. Both camps were aware of the fact that in order to spread an ideology, the education was primary domain to be dominated.[224] Although the Ministry of Education was occupied by a FET member, the Catholic Church cemented its educational gains until the mid-1940s.[225] As a nationalist organization, Falange's insufficiency turned nationalism weak as it had been throughout the history; Catholic dimension of being a Spanish turned out to be more crucial.

It can be said that by the mid-1940s, the Spanish Catholic Church consolidated its position within New Spain and the Catholic organizations were favoured as "lobbies" of the regime albeit their restricted role in Spanish politics. On the other hand, the

---

[221] Ibid., p. 390.

[222] Ibid., p. 391.

[223] Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation*, loc. 1444 and 1448.

[224] Juan J. Linz, *Totaliter ve Otoriter Rejimler,* Liberte Yayınları, Ankara, 2012, pp. 165-170.

[225] Callahan, *The Spanish Catholic Church,* pp. 397-399.

harsh censorship over the press including Catholic publications as well as state imposed vertical syndicate system-a state system of syndicalism that did not allow the Catholic Church's influence over social issues irritated the clergy.[226] It was not to collaborate with "below" but rather a policy in competition with Falange over the wider sphere of influence. These, combining with the economical bottleneck[227] which spread poverty all over the country paved the way for the discontent within the Spanish Catholic Church.[228]

4.2.3. Spanish Catholic Church in the mid-1940s

What must not be overlooked was the external events which inevitably affected the regime's policies as well as the Church as a supranational institution. With the change in the international conjuncture through the end of the Second World War, Spain shifted to a more neutral position from pro-German attitude which indeed did not contribute to its prestige in the international texture. Franco changed his authoritarian policy by forming a new structure independent from FET and by reconsidering particular rights to individuals.[229] Since the European powers were seeing Spain as an ally of the Nazi Germany, Franco tried to polish the "Catholic" characteristic of the regime to acquire the support of the Holy See and to change its image among the European democracies.[230] To some extent, this disposition brought an exclusive opportunity to the Spanish Catholic Church which had been seeking to

---

[226] As it was explained in the previous chapter, the Spanish Catholic Church did not have an influence over the lower classes due to its close relations with the State. After the Civil War, not because it began to consider the lower classes but because it wanted to prevail its sphere of influence so that it would be a determining factor in social, political and economic questions.
[227] Autarchy imposed by Franco created a closed economy which turned into widespread povery.

[228] Albinana Francisco Verdera, *Conflictos entre la Iglesia y el Estado en España. La Revista Ecclesia Entre 1941 y 1945,* Eunsa, Navarra, 1995*,* pp. 187-189.

[229] Payne, *The Franco Regime,* pp. 349-351. It did not mean that the General intended to renounce from his power. It was rather a detente for the interest of the country than a reform.

[230] Callahan, *The Spanish Catholic Church,* p. 400.

have an impact over politics. Therefore, the Spanish Catholic Church internalized this system and it tried to place Catholics into the positions in the state level.[231]

However, the long-lasting problem of the Catholic Church, disunity among the Catholics, resurfaced again in the political domain. Franco's role and importance remained unquestionable, yet, especially among the lower clergy, the idea of an accelerated development through a malleable process began to blossom. This reaction, in fact, was not new; since the beginning of the Francoist era, this military regime was seen as a temporary period. Particularly, Cardinal Enrique Pla y Deniel who was the most influential actor in the Spanish Catholic Church, at that time entailed Fuero de los Espanoles[232] to be enacted, lifting of the censorship, proclamation of amnesty and right to association for the better future of the country.[233]

Nonetheless, there was not a challenge to regime itself. Pla y Deniel was strictly a supporter of Franco, while he was advocating the end of the censorship over the press, he was also offering a tough law regulating the press to suppress any kind of hazardous attempt.[234] His efforts for changes were not to transform the regime into a democracy but he advocated the idea that the privileges and complete freedom of the Spanish Catholic Church could better be preserved and promoted in a state which

---

[231] It was a proof of progressing reciprocal relationship between the state and the Spanish Catholic Church; the Church's support for the Franco's new policies was met by expanded privileges granted by Franco for the Spanish Catholic Church. To the Vatican's discontent, it also insisted that the episcopacy and the clergy did not exceed the limits set by the Roman pontiff. Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 401. Camara Gregorio Villar, *Nacional-catolicismo y escuela: Socialización Politica del franquismo, 1936-1951,* Hesperia D.L., Jaen, 1984, p. 249. Victor Manuel Arbeloa, *Aquella España Católica,* Sigueme, Salamanca, 1975, p. 248.

[232] It was one of eight "Leyes Fundamentales" (Fundamental Laws) which established the liberties, rights and responsibilities of the Spanish people, declared in 1945. What is significant about the law is that the name "fuero" referred to laws in middle ages based on the traditions and customs of the Spanish society. The rights were endowed by an authority so that the concept directly excluded the democratic tendencies. Moreover, not the citizenship but the Spanishness was emphasized which thus carried an ethnicist aspect. Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 401.

[233] Casanova, "Church, State, Nation and Civil Society in Spain and Poland", p. 111.

[234] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 402.

was stably institutionalized within a limited pluralism. This system would free the Spanish Catholic Church from any kind of restrictions forced by the Francoist regime.[235] In other words, the Church's attempt to reform the system was not for Spanish people but for its own institutional interests; it was to sustain its close relations with the regime by promoting its own position.

At this point, it must be mentioned that the Spanish Catholic Church contributed to the formation of the dictatorship while it itself became the victim of the system afterwards. General was not to share his authority and to shape his policies in accordance with the Catholic Church's political demands. Unlike the Spanish Catholic Church's intentions, this reciprocal relationship benefitted the regime more than the Church and it showed that the Catholic family was only a tool for Franco to consolidate his power and authority.[236] Support of the Catholic Church for the regime in the climax of the international exclusion of Spain only caused the consolidation of the system which the Church desired to reform.[237]

Even though the Spanish Catholic Church enjoyed the privileges supplied by the Franco regime, the relationship between the Church and state was not static and stable. The failure of Francoist government's autharchic economic system led to unequal distribution of wealth which was seen as the main reason of religious alienation of the lower classes that caused a revolution, the Church's main paranoia.[238] It would lead to the rise of a variety of critics within the Spanish Catholic Church especially during 1950s.

---

[235] Ibid.

[236] Tusell *Franco y los catolicos,* p. 209.

[237] Payne, *The Franco Regime,* pp. 356-358.

[238] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 407.

4.3. The Emergence of Social Question in the 1950s

After the 1940s, social concerns gained more importance for the Spanish Catholic Church as a result of the fear of a revolution as it experienced in the Second Republic. However, the Church's discourse never touched the problems of the poor but it emphasized the bourgeoisie's responsibility for the lower classes.[239] The Spanish Catholic Church still avoided confrontation with the regime. For a more effective social advocacy, the Spanish Catholic Church needed its own social organizations yet any kind of unions were still prohibited.

During the Francoist era, what kept the collaboration between these two institutions vivid was the idea that the control mechanism held by the Spanish Catholic Church over society helped preserve its religious prospect and followers from the variety of dangers. In this respect, censorship imposed on religious publications, repression over the Protestant minority as well as regime's harassment of any democratic or oppositional attempt were counted as required policies for goodness of Spaniards.[240]Paradoxically, as an actor deeply concerned about morality, it remained silent against extensive human rights' abuses, police violence or corruption.

The pinnacle of the Catholicism during 1950s also witnessed a decline in religious devotion due to social changes. Even though the Spanish Catholic Church distanced itself from lower classes, the changes within the society inevitably affected its position. In 1950s, the most significant incident concerning the Catholic Church and its association with the Franco regime was the Concordat of 1953. Even though the Vatican was still unwilling to cooperate with a dictatorship which did not have a considerable reputation among the European democracies, it did not dare to question it.[241] More importantly, the course of the Cold War as well as the developing ties between the Franco regime and the USA pushed the Vatican to consider Spain's

---

[239] Lozano Martinez, "La Iglesia ante la evolucion socioeconomica", pp. 180-181.

[240] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 407-408.

[241] Ibid., p. 408.

71

altering role in the international context. Elimination of royal patronage system and promoting the liberty of the Spanish Catholic Church through a binding international treaty was the primary purpose of the Holy See.[242] However, Franco rejected to compromise his policy of patronage system; he pointed that leaving the appointment of the Church staff to the Vatican was no different than giving the pope the authority to select the local governors.[243]

The Concordat had advantageous outcomes for both parties yet it was Franco who benefitted from it most. Benefits already obtained in juridical and financial areas were guaranteed through a written document which would bring objections to both parties in case of a conflict or contradiction.[244] It had political impacts over the society which was announced as a victory for both the Spanish state and the Spanish Catholic Church. It also helped refresh national-Catholicism, by emphasizing inseparability of Spanishness and Catholicism. The Spanish Catholic Church and state, as the sole representatives of two perfect societies must have collaborated in order to undertake the role casted by God.[245]

Although the Catholic Church saw in Concordat a reassurance for its position the treaty made the Church more vulnerable to Franco. The Concordat did not have any influence over lifting the restriction over the Church for the social activities which was the expectation of the Catholic Church. It was seen as a unique victory, which cemented the support of the Catholic Church, and it was followed by an agreement with the USA[246] in the same year.[247]

---

[242] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy*, pp. 109-111.

[243] Tusell, *Franco y Los Católicos*, p. 247.

[244] Ortega Joaquin Luis, "La Iglesia Española desde 1939 hasta 1975", *Historia,* supra note 2, pp. 665-713.

[245] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain,* p. 410.

[246] William, D. Phillips Jr.,and Carla, Rahn Phillips, *A Concise History of Spain,* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2010, pp. 267-268. It was called as "The Pact of Madrid" which allowed the establishment of the USA's air bases on the Spanish territory in return of military and financial aid.

Even though Franco's Spain was an isolated and relatively a backward country, it still took its part from modernization. Catholicism's self-perception of "monolithicism" doctrinally and practically by ignoring region, class, sex, on age was at odds with the understanding of a modern and complex society. Moreover, there was the dichotomy of the local/universal Catholicism. Even though local customs and rituals were still dominant over the Catholic practices, the clergy and bishops tried to impose more modern Catholic doctrines, especially in the rural area.[248]

All these problems were nothing different than those of the 1940s. However, during 1950s, those issues turned into an avalanche which caused questioning of the ideals of national-Catholicism. The biggest challenge was the ongoing rigorous censorship; the regime's tough reaction against any criticism tensed the relations between the state and the Spanish Catholic Church.[249] However, the Spanish Catholic Church was

---

[247] Widespread poverty as well as the fear of revolution which might come from the working class who was already alienated religiously, triggered the fractions among the Spanish Catholic Church, especially between the lower clergy and the church hierarchy. Still, the Spanish Catholic Church as a whole could not dare to challenge the regime since its primary aim was to preserve its institutional benefits. Even though the prominent actors in the Church, such as Pla y Deniel warned against the danger of being dependent on the political regime as an institution, the fear of democracy as well as loyalty to Caudillo led them to move within the borders which was drawn by Franco. Jose Maria Magaz Fernandez, "Los Partidos Católicos Durante el Regimen de Franco", in *Los Partidos Confesionales Españoles,* Facultad de Teologia San Damaso, Madrid, 2010, p. 139. Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 413.

[248] It is not only the case for the southern Spain but also for the urban areas, especially in Madrid and Barcelona. Rapid industrialization and growth particularly in 1960s created a consumerist society, and among the young people, religion lost its influence extremely. Popular Catholicism was necessarily adopted by the Spanish Catholic Church since it formed a significant part in the Spanish identity; everyday routine was the key of picking up a Christian ritual in case of sickness, death or misfortune in the rural areas. Therefore, the Spanish Catholic Church's indoctrination was irrelevant comparing with the rituals and activities which would touch the daily lives in a protective sense regarding any kind of disaster they constantly experienced. The regime also welcomed popular Catholicism since it was regarded as the organic Christianity lay inside the Spaniards. It was a crucial way of belief which was able to tie daily life with Catholicism and the Spanish Catholic Church that was an indicator of the Catholic faith as an inseparable part of the Spanish identity. Henry Kamen, *Imagining Spain: Historical Myth & National Identity,* Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2008, pp. 76-81. William A. Christian, *Person and God in a Spanish Valley,* Princeton University Press, New York, 1972, p. 11.

[249] The ones criticizing the regime policies, particularly the censorship, were labelled as separatist, Freemason, a supporter of liberal and democratic system as well as non-Spaniard. Tusell, *Franco y los catolicos,* p. 355.

firmly dependent on the State regarding its interests so that it could not further its critics but continued its weak efforts for the moderate changes in the regime's mentality.

4.3.1. The Rise of Social Catholicism in 1950s

The social problems caused by modernization and Franco's economic policies led to due emergence of an important movement of social Catholicism within the Spanish Catholic Church, which imposed a threat to national-Catholicism during 1950s. In fact, the description of "social" Catholicism was rather misgiven since the Catholic Church held the social questions not because it changed its policy "above rather than below" (this "below" was Castilian) but because it needed to fill the social sphere in order to be dominant and to prevent a potential revolution which was being triggered by the regime's false policies constantly.

Social Catholicism was not really social; although the alienation of the workers through wrong economic policies of the regime was questioned by the lower clergy, all criticisms were clandestine and they remained in a restricted cycle. The first move made by the Catholic Church in terms of social problems was the formation of a workers' union under the protection of the AC in 1946.[250] During 1950s, the idea that the development and progress in social and economic conditions were vital for the Spanish Catholic Church's future, prevailed within the Church but regarding its interests and benefits, dislike against the regime's vertical syndicate system did not turn into an explicit confrontation with Franco.[251]

The first signs of the Spanish Catholic Church's "socialization" were the formation of Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica (HOAC) and the Juventud Obrera Católica (JOC) which could be defined as the organizations established on a

---

[250] Payne, *Fascism in Spain*, p. 405.

[251] Domke, "Education, Fascism and the Catholic Church in Franco's Spain", p. 64.

working-class base at the end of 1940s.[252] The logic behind the formation of those organizations was to re-Christianize the working class through religious activities. Their main difference was that they were planned by the Catholic workers themselves without the intervention of the employers against whom the workers had always been hostile.[253] However, the efforts of the Spanish Catholic Church on the basis of devotionalism, control and morality attracted mainly the already practicing Catholics.[254] The Church attempted to chase its traditional even archaic way to appeal the workers; particularly in the southern Spain which was a less developed region, the Church could not have formed an influential policy but pursued the same traditional path which did not function well in the past.[255]

Even though these organizations functioned under the protective umbrella of Acción Católica (AC), they were seen by the FET as dissidents disguised with the mask of Catholicism whose aim was to eliminate the existing national syndicate system and to reclaim political pluralism.[256] From the Church's perspective, the only point was to praise the Spanish Catholic Church among the workers was to show them that the Catholic Church stood by their side. What was unique in the efforts of the Spanish Catholic Church to catch up with the working class was its desire to collaborate with the clandestine socialist and even communist unions.[257] Particularly after the economic destruction created by 1959 Stabilization Plan[258], both JOC and HOAC turned out to be more aggressive about Francoism and its policies.

---

[252] Feliciano Montero, *La Iglesia: De La Colaboración a La Disidencia (1956-1975),* Encuentro, Madrid, 2009, pp. 64-86.

[253] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 420.

[254] Ibid., p. 426.

[255] Payne, *Spanish Catholicism*, p. 183.

[256] José Castaño Colomer, *La JOC en España 1946-1970,* Sigueme, Salamanca 1978, p. 66.

[257] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 421.

[258] After Spain became a party of IMF and the World Bank in the early 1959. With the assistance of the IMF, the Stabilization Plan was declared in 1959. It was based on two main requirements. First, monetary measures were to be taken in order to keep the inflation under control. Second, foreign

Separately from these organizations, the Spanish Catholic Church did not challenge the regime in any sense but it somehow started to alter its fully obedient policy by denying to embrace all the policies of Franco. "Accidentalism"[259] which appeared during the period of the Second Republic reemerged in 1950s which was seen in the discourses of the Church that the AC and its function were sacred and spiritiual so that they were above all the politics.[260] However, this confrontational attitude did not mean that the Spanish Catholic Church was to challenge the legitimacy and power of the Francoism; what it did was to depict that the interest of the state and the Spanish Catholic Church were about to separate regarding the social questions and concerns.[261]

4.3.2. Opus Dei as a Secular Organization

What can be said about the Spanish Catholic Church during the 1950s is that it was both against dictatorship and liberalism, which led to the formation of a reformist group within the Church. Nonetheless, the gravest threat for the Spanish Catholic Church was the totalitarian Falange which was deepening the factionalization among the Spanish people.[262] The balancing act introduced by Franco in 1956[263] escalated instability among the political families; indeed, the act empowered the ideology of

---

investment and trade were to be promoted. Initially, it triggered the unemployment that thousands of workers had to immigrate to other countries. Magaz Fernandez, "Los Partidos Católicos Durante el Regimen de Franco", p. 135.

[259] The Church was independent from and above the politics; it keeps its distance with political regimes regardless of their ideological base.

[260] This accidentalist approach was to place the Spanish Catholic Church away from the high politics due to the fact that the regime's failures began to effect the Church's position owing to its alliance with Franco.

[261] Montero, *La Iglesia: De La Colaboración a la Disidencia*, pp. 40-53.

[262] Even though the Spanish Catholic Church was opposing the Falange's discriminative policies, its discourse was also emphasizing the "Spanishness" of the people disregarding the other identities like Basque or Catalan.

[263] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy*, p. 136.

Nationalist Movement and the FET in the political arena.[264] It was at that time a new Catholic group, Opus Dei emerged, whose members were appointed to the crucial positions within the government. Those were economic technocrats whom the General saw vital for the economic reform in the country.

Initially, Opus Dei caused a considerable suspicion, even called as a Holy Mafia which was functioning clandestinely and trying to move the existing regime to a new one which was more firmly based on Catholic autoritarianism.[265] However, Opus Dei actually had a more complex organization. First of all, Opus Dei was deeply a secular organization despite its association with the Spanish Catholic Church. According to Opus Dei, re-Christianization could not be thought separately from the world; a direct tie between the world and the Christianity was a must in Opus Dei's doctrines which districted it from the traditional religious approach.[266] At the same time, it offered a more elitist maneuver for re-Christianization program of the Spanish Catholic Church. The key was to create Catholic intellectuals in order to have a significant impact over the Spanish society.[267]

During the 1950s, as Opus Dei improved itself, it defended economic liberty while emphasizing authoritarianism in political and social spheres. In order to revive the economy, bourgeoisie and technocrats were to undertake an important role.[268] Especially after getting high positions in the government in 1957, Opus Dei members defended a more liberal and capitalist economy Western democracies as crucial for

---

[264] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 422.

[265] Jesús Yfante, *La prodigiosa aventura del Opus Dei: genesis y desarollo de la Santa Mafia,* Ruedo Iberico, Paris, 1970.

[266] Casanova, "The Opus Dei Ethic and the Modernization of Spain", p. 29.It can also be described as a combination of conventional religiosity with lay apostolates.

[267] Magaz Fernandez, "Los Partidos Católicos Durante el Regimen de Franco", p. 135.

[268] Joseph Harrison, *The Spanish Economy in the Twentieth Century,* Palgrave Macmillan, London and Sydney, 1985, p. 146.

awakening of the Christian Spain.[269] It offered a modernizing, American-like model which was combining elitism, traditional Catholicism and conservatism with a modernizing concentration.[270]

4.3.3. Self-Criticism within the Spanish Catholic Church in 1950s

Even though the hierarchy maintained its loyalty to the Caudillo, at the initial years of the 1960s, it was apparent that an unanimous defense of national-Catholicism could not be preserved. Especially the individual Church members intensified their concerns about the regime in the social area. However, none of the critics could cross the border which was determined by the General; so those concerns remained weak and ineffective. The 1950s witnessed the sharpened divisions within the Spanish Catholic Church which were once silenced at the beginning of the Franco period. The Catholic Church's teaching of unity and compromise did not find a positive response.[271]

The period of rising criticism in the 1950s described as "autocrítica" by the clergy in order to stress the transformations that took place in that period.[272] Yet, "autocrítica" did not impose a threat to or confrontation with the national-Catholicism nor did it contradict the Spanish Catholic Church's policy of religious reconquest. It could be described as a multi-dimensional movement which had a variety of aspects. Firstly, the movement grabbed the pastoral attitude as the prominent ideal since they approached the social issues through a pragmatic perspective. Second, and the most important, the definition of the Catholic Church was altered in theory; it shifted from

---

[269] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 427.

[270] Casanova, "The Opus Dei Ethic and the Modernization of Spain", p. 29.

[271] Domke, "Education, Fascism and the Catholic Church in Franco's Spain", p. 69.

[272] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 490. The movement was initiated by the Cardinal Tarancon, a prominent figure of the Spanish Catholic Church as Pla y Deniel who criticized the Spanish Catholic Church for its embracing the static National-Catholicism which was then clashing with the realities of the society. He defended the repositioning of the Catholic Church in a secularizing world in which the Spanish Catholic Church had remained backward in comparison with its Western counterparts.

the concept of clerically directed institution to a community of faith which was not based on the traditional Church aspects.[273] Lastly, the movement aimed at placing the Spanish Catholicism in the secularized world through reawakening of the intellectual and cultural traits of Catholicism.[274]

From a theoretical perspective, this new stream pointed the Church as a body under which the clergy and worshippers came together in a collaborative spiritual sense.[275] The idea of collectivity and the emphasis on the laity confronted the traditional Catholic doctrine which described the Church as a perfect institution dominated, controlled and represented by the hierarchy. The new idea, renovating the Church with regard to modernizing world, crippled the traditional linkage of Catholicism with the idea of a clerically directed fortress isolated from secular society and its cultural values.[276]

As a result, the first International Catholic Conversation was organized.[277] These Conversations were crucial since they triggered Catholicism independent from national-Catholicism. The primary aim was to change the old formulation that Spain was inseparable from Catholicism and Spaniards were naturally Catholic. The Spanish Catholic Church needed to undertake the mission of Christianization of individuals rather than Christianization of abstract structures like "nation".[278]

---

[273] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 490.

[274] Ibid.

[275] Ibid., p. 493.

[276] The effort to bind old and new version of the Catholicism was the proof of what Weber defined in his work. Prevail of modernization and rationalization led to a world where the social unity could not be obtained through common religious values; modern societies could not be described with the unity. Max Weber, *Protestant Ethic, The Spirit of Capitalism,* Andesite Press, London, 2015.

[277] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 494.

[278] Ibid.

Those meetings should not be covered as political. Nonetheless, there was a strong current of critics about national-Catholicism regarding its strict characteristics. Yet, critics did not turn into action and did not turn into a policy against the Franco regime. They advocated the importance of modern thought which contributed to the religiosity in such a pluralistic society.[279] It was a separation from the idea of nation composed of Spaniards. Religion should not be subordinated to the government but the government should be subordinated to religion. Moreover, the Church's close relations with bourgeoisie hindered its openness to all classes; the Spanish Catholic Church was seen as bourgeois for working class which could be remedied through a radical alteration.[280] The Conversations became the first indication of the changing idea that the Church should form a secular group to reach Spaniards who were overlooked through the policy of religious reconquest after the Civil War.[281]

4.4. Break in the Church-State Relations (1961-1975)

The period that began with 1960 and lasted until the death of Franco was a transformative process for the relationship between the Spanish Catholic Church, Spanish nationalism and the Franco regime. It illustrated the fallacy of selecting the Civil War as the source of legitimization for the regime as the conditions changed within the country.[282]While the Spanish Catholic Church helped legitimize Francoism by reinterpreting the Civil War as a Holy Crusade fought by the Spanish nationalists against atheistic enemies, it then began to be interpreted the war as a

---

[279] Ibid.

[280] José Maria Garcia Escudero, "La eficacia del catolicismo español", in *Catolicismo español: aspectos actuales,* RUTA, Madrid, 1955*,* pp. 107-116.

[281] Losada Espinosa, "La Iglesia que vive el Concilio Vaticano II", p. 50. In this respect, Cursillos de Cristianidad formed a particular enterprise. It was based on the laity rather than clergy; its aim was to carry the Catholic doctrines in daily language. Cursillos became the evidence of the factionalized structure of the wave of change within the Spanish Catholic Church during the 1950s. The emphasis over cultural renovation within Spanish Catholicism along with the spread of the image of the Church as a community of believers posed no real transformation; rather it remained as a new representative of the old tradition of the Spanish Catholic Church. Casanova and Sanchis, "España: de la Iglesia estatal a la separacion de Iglesia y Estado", p. 143.

[282] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 494.

tragedy rather than a victory which continued to divide people and precluding the unity both in nationalist and religious sense. However, not the entire Church but a group of clergy and bishops advocated such renovation who, as a result, clashed with the Church hierarchy. The Spanish Catholic Church, thus, officially carried on its support for the Franco regime and preserved the distance with the lower classes.

Changes within the Church was not national but global. In general, the Catholic churches, with only few exceptions, shifted their policies from a state-centered strategy to a society-centered one.[283] However, for the Spanish Catholic Church, there was no explicit and direct break with the Franco regime. Rather, there was a group of reformists within the Church demanding changes for the future of the regime and the Spanish Catholic Church.

What also reappeared during this period was contradictory characteristic of the Catholic Church. Its supra-national structure that stood above any national and political formation, and its inevitably national form that made it bound by each country's political, historical and social conditions wherreted the relationship between the Spanish Catholic Church and national-Catholicism as well as the regime itself. The Second Vatican Council (1962-1965) and national conferences inspired by it triggered the nationalization of the Catholic churches regarding the political and social changes in countries. The impact of the national meetings along with the spreading secularization's impact over the Church and societies became the major facet of the society-oriented policies.[284]

4.4.1. Prior Incidents to the Second Vatican Council

The incident signified the 1960s was the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965) which created an extreme impact over the Church's strategies towards the regime policies.

---

[283] Casanova, "Church, State, Nation and Civil Society in Spain and Poland", p. 102.

[284] Ibid., pp. 102-111.

Contrary to the old policies of the Spanish Catholic Church[285], the final papers of the Council anticipated the religious liberty as well as human dignity in every aspect of the life. It was realized that the economic progress during 1960s caused an uneven distribution of wealth and thus escalated the discontent among lower classes, paved the way for the rapid urbanization and triggered secularization which gave birth to a new, complex society that could not be controlled by the old way.[286]

Alliance with the regime provided the Spanish Catholic Church with a wide privilege to create a "morality" circle to dominate as many domains within the country as possible. However, the regime's shift towards a more open society through tourism and welcoming a consumerist life style due to economic bottleneck blunted the Church's efforts.[287] The Spanish Catholic Church failed to adapt the alterations in social and political life.[288] However, the process of compliance with changes of the 1960s did not illustrate an uninterrupted momentum concerning the embracement of the new society in a planned democratic system.[289]

What is more important, through the Second Vatican Council, the separation between the ecclesiastical and popular Catholicism sharpened.[290] Even though the Church had adopted more dogmatic Christian indoctrination, popular Catholicism was more

---

[285] These policies became official after the First Vatican Council convened in the nineteenth century. In the final documents, the fight against liberalism, Marxism and freemasonry and their yields was justified and obligated. Anthony Gill, *Rendering unto Ceasar: The Catholic Church and the State in Latin America,* (e-book version)*,* The University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 1998, p. 33.

[286] Ibid., pp. 42-45.

[287] Tusell, *From Dictatorship to Democracy*, p. 189 and pp. 202-207.

[288] The biggest "change" was the re-adoption of the accidentalist perspective which could be labelled as a maneuver to save the Church's future. Suitably, this accidentalist policy corresponded to the changes brought by the Second Vatican Council such as human dignity in all aspects as well as persistence of the lower clergy about the human rights and justice. Montero, *La Iglesia: De la Colaboración a la Disidencia*, pp. 108-123.

[289] Juan José Ruiz Rico, *El papel politico de la Iglesia catolica en la Espana de Franco, 1936-1971,* Tecnos, Madrid, 1977, p. 184.

[290] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 484.

suitable to reach every layer of the society. The Catholic Church had to adapt the features of Spanish identity which had been alienated throughout the history.[291]

At the beginning of the 1960s, younger clergy as well as the members of the Catholic workers' groups began to be disturbed by the regime's connivance of the social issues. Increasing demand for the social justice widely spread among the young priests and clergy especially after the 1959 Stabilization Plan which aimed to better living standards around the country.[292] However, it had a reverse effect which led to uprisings particularly in Catalonia and in Basque Country during 1962 which stimulated young clericals' discontent.

The uprisings in 1962 encouraged further developments; underground syndicates of workers (Comisiones Obreras primarily) began to cooperate with the communist organizations (UGT), clandestine groups.[293]What was more significant than the Catholic radicals being associated with the other organizations was that they started to quit functioning under the protective umbrella of AC and joined in the establishment of secret syndicates such as Comisiones Obreras in addition to organizations Solidaridad de Obreros Catalanes (SOC) and the Federación Sindical de Trabajadores (FST) initiated by HOAC and JOC.[294]

The position taken by the Catholic workers' organizations caused a considerable deal of unrest among the higher clergy. Committee on the Social Apostolate warned the Catholic labour organizations that they were still subordinated to hierarchical instruction and were not allowed to function in opposition to the official Catholic

---

[291] However, during the Francoist era, the Spanish Catholic Church never ignored its commitment to a more inward-looking faith, largely through traditional methods based on missions, spiritual exercise, retreats and exhortation dispensed through the clergy's extensive media network. Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 485.

[292] Payne, *The Franco Regime, 1936-1975,* p. 476.

[293] Ibid., p. 247.

[294] Montero, *La Iglesia: De la Colaboración a la Disidencia*, p. 217.

doctrine of the Church, the regime authorities and its institutions.[295] Unlike other clandestine formations, HOAC and JOC maintained their Catholic aspects but at the same time, they were dissatisfied with the hierarchy's restrictions and impositions that were seen as the reason of the disunity in the Catholic opinion in the mid 1960s.[296] By that time, under the growing unrest both within the Church and the society, the Catholic Church's cautious steps to set up a balance between Franco, radical Catholic activists and their will for more institutional liberty proved irrelevant in an atmosphere of change.

Especially in Catalonia, which was considerably industrialized and urbanized in the mid-1960s, the lower clergy was directly challenging the Spanish Catholic Church and episcopacy by emphasizing the need of a more rapid adaptation to ongoing and potential changes regarding the economic boom and demographic structure. In 1965, lower clergy in Catalan towns impeached the Spanish Catholic Church's silence against the persecution and injustice and deficiency to combine its social rhetoric with the political realities from the beginning of the Francoist era.[297] It resented and drew the anger of the regime and the Church hierarchy; they both blamed the regional churches as "liberals". Paradoxically, this incident became the beacon of a new wave of emerging anticlericalism among the regime supporters.

4.4.2. The Second Vatican Council (1962-1965) and Its Impacts

All these incidents preceded the Second Vatican Council which can be counted as a reaction to the ongoing changes around the world. The Council fed the duality within the Catholic wing that the higher clergy and hierarchy. It was clearly seen that the final papers and outcomes of the Council concerning social, political and religious

---

[295] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 506.

[296] Casanova and Sanchis, "España: de la Iglesia estatal a la separación de Iglesia y Estado", p. 143.

[297] Dowling, "For Christ and Catalonia", p. 159.

issues cracked the traditional Spanish Catholic Church doctrines.[298] The most challenging aspect was that the Council re-positioned the Catholic Church according to newly emerging modern society's rules rather than constructing the society according to the Catholic Church's doctrines.[299]

The Council's outcomes were extremely progressive comparing with the Church's old, archaic perspective. The Council was implicitly defining a democratic and secular state by stating the right of individuals to take a place in the election, in political community and in governing the state regardless of their identities.[300] Radically, it was declared that the Catholic Church's future and survival could not be reduced to the will of a government or function of a system nor should the Catholic Church have expected gains or benefits from the political authorities. The Council even adviced to renounce the privileges the Church gained from the government if its legitimacy was put into question.[301]

Even though the final paper of the Vatican II in 1965 emphasized human dignity, religious liberty and natural law, it must be borne in mind that these declarations and their implications would be shaped in accordance with the individual countries' political and social structures. For the Spanish Catholic Church, the issue of the religious liberty was rather complex; although the Church declared that the decisions of the Council should have been applied, it must be remained under the control of the

---

[298] "Documents of the Second Vatican Council", www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/index.htm, (accessed: 23.03.2017).

[299] "Declaration on Religious Freedom Dignitatıs Humanae on the Right of the Person and of Communities to Social and Civil Freedom in Matters Religious Promulgated by His Holiness Pope Paul VI", *Documents of the Second Vatican Council,* (1965), www.vatican.va/archive/hist_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651207_dignitatis-humanae_en.html, (accessed: 23.03.2017).

[300] "Declaration on Religious Freedom Dignitatıs Humanae on the Right of the Person and of Communities to Social and Civil Freedom in Matters Religious Promulgated by His Holiness Pope Paul VI".

[301] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 510.

regime.[302] Moreover, religious liberty should not have contradicted or damaged the Catholic characteristic of the state. The Church staff referred to the decisions of the Council frequently but it did not challenge the regime and national-Catholicism except its emphasis over the need for institutions for Spaniards to take a place political life.[303]

Church's monopoly in religious domain and restriction of other religions were basics of national-Catholicism. In this regard, the principle of religious liberty, human dignity and freedom of conscience of the Second Vatican Council could be interpreted as a radical change for the Catholic Church in general. Separation of the identity and religion became a threat to national-Catholicism's identification of being Spaniard with being Catholic.

In order to not confront the Vatican, the regime enacted the Law on Religious Liberty in 1967.[304] Through this law, religions other than Catholicism were given a restricted freedom for their religious practices. This restricted renovation did not satisfy the lower clergy unlike the hierarchy. Conflict, stemmed from the deeply differentiated ideals and opinions over social and political issue including civil-ecclesiastical relationship, paved the way for uprisings within the Church. From a broader perspective, these uprisings were basically organized in order to illustrate the dissatisfaction with the Franco regime and the Church's silence and disability to respond to the desire of change.[305] However, the hierarchical structure of the Church could suppress the other voices within the institution.

---

[302] Ibid., p. 513.

[303] "Declaration on Religious Freedom Dignitatıs Humanae on the Right of the Person and of Communities to Social and Civil Freedom in Matters Religious Promulgated by His Holiness Pope Paul VI", *Documents of the Second Vatican Council,* (1965), www.vatican.va/archive/hist_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651207_dignitatis-humanae_en.html, (accessed: 23.03.2017).

[304] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy,* p. 206.

[305] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 516.

4.4.3. The Clash within the Spanish Catholic Church

In the second half of the 1960s, the uprisings within the Spanish Catholic Church became a widespread phenomenon in the country. The regime's response was implication of harsher policies over the disobedient priests and bishops.[306] While the regime was denouncing the Second Republic with the persecution of religion and humilitiation to the Catholic Church, it was Franco who ordered the police attacks on clergy. Hierarchy was still silent against the persecution of its own staff. [307]

In the early 1970s, influence of the Vatican II and the hierarchy's effort to integrate the Catholic Church and its benefits into the newly framed system brought by the Council diminished if not completely vanished. Majority of the bishops reclaimed their obedience to Franco and his regime while embracing the idea of Catholic Spain as well as the gains obtained from the Franco regime itself. As the end of Franco regime became clear, in the initial years of the 1970s, the Spanish Catholic Church began to reject the privileges given by the regime as well as the reciprocal relationship between two parties.[308]

In 1973, Asamblea Conjunta was held in Madrid in order to bring a resolution to the questions which the Spanish Catholic Church had endured during those hard times.[309]Although there was still no explicit animosity towards the regime among the Church members, Asamblea represented a separation from the national-Catholicism and its religious and nationalist tendencies. Adopting the idea that Spain was free from contagious notions and concepts like liberalism and secularism, was old-fashioned and not to be implemented; the Spanish Catholic Church must have

---

[306] It was not only directed to the Spanish Catholic Church but also to its Catalan counterpart.

[307] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 518.

[308] It was an expected result of the Second Vatican Council in which the Spanish representatives were adviced to reject all the privileges they had obtained from the regime. Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 518.

[309] Julián Casanova, *La Iglesia de Franco*, Ediciones Temas de Hoy, Madrid, 2001, p. 174.

internalized the new social structure if it did not wish to risk its position in the future.[310] Religious reconquest under the euphoria of national-Catholicism had also proved illusionary since it was not capable of concerning the modern complex society and its deal with the individuals' freedom.[311]

Regarding the nationalist aspects of national-Catholicism, the change in the position of the Spanish Catholic Church in 1970s deeply confronted was the regime's divisive conservative-traditional nationalist policies among the population since the Civil War. It was the first time the Spanish Catholic Church concretely took a step on the basis of the protection of human rights and elimination of discrimination within Spain by ignoring the Spanish nationalist tendencies.[312] On the other hand, the hierarchy did not mean to renounce its privileges and 1953 Concordat even though it had become a source of conflict between the Church and state. Instead of a binding Concordat, the Spanish Catholic Church demanded agreements established on the mutual recognition of the independence of Church and State.[313][314]

It could be that the Pope[315] strategically appointed a number of bishops who could be described as reformist in order to form a hierarchy sympathetic to the eventual emergence of a right-wing Christian Democratic government.[316] It was highly

---

[310] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 530.

[311] Ibid.

[312] It was the first obvious equilibrium with the decisions made in the Second Vatican Council. Until the 1970s, the Spanish Catholic Church was hesitant to internalize the outcome of the Council, however, with the fact that the Franco regime would soon come to an end, as a pragmatist institution, the Church tried to change its position.

[313] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 529.

[314] Feliciano Carmona Blazquez, *La traicion de los clerigos*, Trotta, Madrid, 1991, p. 128.

[315] Paul VI's papacy in 1963 resented the general and his followers. Even though the Vatican pursued a normal and an appropriate policy with its relationship with the Franco's government, he bothered the regime through his stance in the meetings for a concordat of refusing the state's royal patronage system over the clerical appointments. Juan Maria Laboa, "España por el Papa", *XX Siglos*, 1/1, 1990, p. 60.

[316] Chao Rego, *La Iglesia en el franquismo,* Ediciones Felmar, Madrid, 1976, p. 213.

possible that Vatican pursued a blueprint regarding appointments of the nominees embraced the reform, papal teaching and flexible though cautious approach to the political future.[317] On the other hand, those appointments could have passed from the official control due to the fact that the nominees were not evaluated as "extremists" who were in a direct conflict with the Franco regime.[318]

Franco undoubtedly got resented the turn within the Spanish Catholic Church. It escalated the tension and anger towards the Holy See, hierarchy and clerics by extreme groups, known as Guerrillas of Christ the King.[319] This was a state-level hostility towards clericalism which proved no different than that of the final years of the Second Republic. Moreover, the uprising of thousands of priests deepened the division within the Spanish Catholic Church.

Anticlericalism rising within the regime and among its hot-liners along with the clerical conservatives opposing any change, empowered the accidentalist policy of a number of bishops and hierarchy. Clerics became sharper in their criticisms of persecution and suppression whose actions could not be stopped by the regime's attempts. The escalation between the regime and the Spanish Catholic Church went on until a crisis bursted out in 1974 that resulted in a unilateral break in relations with the Vatican imposed by the government of an officially Catholic State.[320]

After this incident until Franco's death in 1975, the regime's anticlerical grudge escalated and reached its peak through objection and persecution over the Church. During this period, police force had been violently used against the reformist or

---

[317] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 536.

[318] The regime, due to its frailty and weakness, admitted the change in the hierarchy's position despite its discontent with the semi-independent maneuver of the Vatican. In 1971, the regime also loosened its tight policies imposed on non-Catalan priests and bishops in Catalonia by appointing Catalan bishops to the to the archbishoprics of Barcelona and Tarragona. Montero, *La Iglesia: De la Colaboracion a la Disidencia*, p. 256.

[319] It was a terrorist group factioned within the Carlist wing. Casanova, "Catholic and Muslim Politics in Comparative Perspective", p. 82.

[320] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain*, p. 543.

dissident clerics who met in various religious buildings and these resulted in their arrest since they were tainted as the "reds".[321] It was strictly reprimanded by the Spanish Catholic Church due to the fact that it was violation against the right to association.[322]After the increasing persecution and repression over the Church's activities, meetings and assemblies, a number of bishops demanded the elimination of Catholicism as the official religion of Spain as well as the support for secularization of politics and the depoliticization of the faith.[323]

The change the Spanish Catholic Church desired was gradual; they did not seek any fundamental alteration in social, economic or political domains. Rather, it was in favor of an order without terrorism, persecution of rights and radical, revolutionary maneuvers. They wished a change of regime, not the system.[324] On the one hand the Spanish Catholic Church was trying to adapt a changing society and prevailing capitalistic structure within the country, on the other hand, it was also critical of a capitalist structure. Therefore, the Spanish Catholic Church was no more than a moderate, semi-traditional reformist institution.[325]

After the death of Franco in 1975, the Spanish Catholic Church changed its positions and the policies due to the fact that the new system would definitely be based on democratic principles. Therefore, the Church took over a plan of action which was established on the elimination of Catholicism as the official religion of the state, preservation of the financial support to the Church and its monopoly over education.

---

[321] Ibid.

[322] Ibid., pp. 544-545.

[323] Blazquez, *La traicion de los clerigos,* p. 228.

[324] Ruiz Rico, *El papel político de la Iglesia católica,* p. 234.

[325] As a result, the Spanish Catholic Church did not give up on its will to dominate the public sphere and to become the watcher of the morality within the country. However, witnessing a rapid and profound change in the shape of a consumerist, secularized and economically advancing society pushed the Church to compromise with the outcomes of altering system and structure. On the other hand, the Spanish Catholic Church's advocacy of rights and pluralism did not mean a complete freedom of expression; unrestrained freedom of expression as it affected moral standards should not be regarded as liberalizing achievements.

It also loosened its strict logic of morality while increasing the idea of "tolerance" towards reforms in social and political domains which would widen the Church's ability to maneuver and to position itself during the transition into democracy.[326]

---

[326] Ruiz Rico, *El papel político de la Iglesia católica*, p. 229.

CHAPTER 5

CATALAN CATHOLIC CHURCH AND CATALAN NATIONALISM DURING FRANCOIST ERA (1939-1975)

5.1. Introduction

The defeat of the Republicans in the Civil War initiated a new phase for the Catalan nationalism. As the conjuncture changed, the Franco regime altered the dynamics and actors of the Catalan nationalist movement. The victory of the nationalist-conservative forces encouraged the Catholic Church to turn into an important actor which had dominated the political and social scene until the end of the dictatorship in 1975. Unlike its Spanish counterpart, the Catalan Church showed an oppositional stance from the beginning against the Franco regime; its self-definition as "Catalan" church put it apart from the Spanish Catholic Church which emphasized the indigenous and idiocratic characteristics of the Catholic Church in Catalonia.

Although the Catalan Church could be described as "antagonist" during the Franco regime, attitude of the regime changed, the quality of the Catalan Church's dissidence and resistance too altered. The turning point was the Second Vatican Council in 1962 and final papers in 1965. After 1965, the Catalan Catholic Church more explicitly radicalized in nationalist terms which made it more conflictive with the Franco regime.

5.2. 1940s-1950s: Emergence of Catholic Catalanism

5.2.1. Catalan Catholic Church in the Early 1940s

The newly emerged system after the Civil War was a military dictatorship under the lead of General Francisco Franco whose ideology was defined as "National-Catholicism" (nacionalcatolicismo).[327] This new structure consisted of the three main actors; the Catholic Church, the Army and the Falange each of which was described as a "political family".[328] Since the new ideology claimed the Spanish national unity; as soon as the Republicans were defeated in the Civil War, Catalonia was taken over by the Nationalist forces which launched the period of persecution, prohibition and repression over the political and cultural characteristics of the region.

Due to the fact that regime was aware of that the Catalan language was vital for the Catalan nationalism, its use was prohibited from every aspect of the public life.[329] In addition, many separatists and Republicans in Catalonia were executed and a strict control was put into practice in order to prevent the revival of the Catalan civil society as well as ban on the Catalan organizations. For ideological consolidation, Falange functioned effectively in the region for the re-education of the young Catalan generations in order to transform them into regime hot-liners.[330] The assumption that suppression and objection were the only tools to vanish Catalan nationalism, was indeed a great challenge for the Franco regime since it refreshed the Catalan "victimization" regarding the culture and language which would provide a legitimate cause for the further nationalist activities.

---

[327] This ideology introduced Catholicism as one of the main components of a nation. It directly connects the glorious days of Spanish nation to its strong Catholic roots. This ideology took the past as reference point for its own legitimation.

[328] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 51.

[329] Falangists were also trying to empoverish the Catalan economy but it was too important for Spain's economic situation to sacrifice for nationalistic greediness.

[330] Payne, *Fascism in Spain, 1923-1977,* p. 127.

Spanish nationalism at the beginning of the Francoist era posed a unique challenge to Catalan nationalism owing to the fact that for the first time it was systematically imposed to all other cultures and languages as a state policy. Even though it did not have strong historical roots, re-emergence of the Spanish nationalism as state policy became a threat of survival for the Catalan nationalism. The regime's discourse of "remaking the Empire" required a dominant identity, Spanishness, a faith, Catholicism and a language, Castilian[331] even though it contradicted itself since the "Empire" was a multicultural structure. In order to obscure the use of Catalan, Castilian was polished as the language of the Empire and the Christianity.[332] Inevitably, this required the exclusion of other identities, languages and beliefs which would trigger the Catalanist revival in the further phases of Francoism.

The military dictatorship also favored two actors who were excluded from the former political system and Catalanist movement; the Catalan Catholic Church and the Catalan Catholic bourgeoisie.[333] Since the Catholicism and the Catholic Church were both the essential and weakness of the Franco regime[334], those actors could also be used for Catalan nationalism as a shelter due to the fact that the Catholic Church in Catalonia was historically a Catalanized institution. The settlement of the Franco regime introduced a system in which the bourgeoisie would be intensely benefitted against potential workers' mobilization.[335]

---

[331] Payne, *Fascism in Spain,* p. 79.

[332] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 54.

[333] Ibid., pp. 54-55.

[334] It can be defined as weakness since it was given many privileges and concessions in return of legitimization provided to the regime. The need for the Catholic Church both privileged the regime and made it vulnerable.

[335] In the early years of the regime, Francoism had resembled the Nazism of Germany and fascism of Italy through which he guaranteed a natural order for bourgeoisie where the right for private property was defended and secured. Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 59.

It was reasonable that the Catalan bourgeoisie did not get involved with Catalanism since there was no vital threat to their interests until the end of 1950s.[336] Moreover, the Catalan intellectuals who carried and empowered the Catalan nationalism until the Civil War were exiled or executed which helped the Catalan Catholic Church emerge as the main actor for the revival of Catalanism. Although it backed the Franco regime in the early phases, the Church was acting on the political reality in order to survive in a repressive system.

The ideology of national-Catholicism had in fact two contradicting poles regarding the Catalan nationalism. While the rise of "Catholicism" in the political sense could be counted as an advantage for the Catholic Church after having been assaulted during the Second Republic and the Civil War, "National" side of the ideology directly excluded Catalanism from political, cultural and social scenes. However, the Catalan Catholic Church did not confront Franco during the initial years of the regime nor did it stand against the systematic violence and brutality of the regime.[337]

On the other hand, support of the Catalan Catholic Church to the Franco regime could be described as limited and temporal. After the consolidation of the new regime, the Catalan Church focused on its own recovery after the trauma of the Civil War which caused an extreme physical and psychological damage within the Catholic Church in the region. Significantly, all the bishops appointed to the region were native Spanish speaker; their aim was to re-Christianize and Spanishization of the population in Catalonia by purifying the society from Marxism and separatism.[338] On the other hand, the Church remained loyal to its "Catalanized" structure which was proved by the adoption of "sardana" that became an early sign of the Church's

---

[336] Thomas Hugh, *The Spanish Civil War*, Penguin, New York, 1961, p. 142.

[337] Plenn, *Wind of Olive Trees*, p. 87.

[338] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 64.

holding of Catalan cultural traits.[339]Thus, the Catalan Catholic Church's reconstruction process with the assistance of the Franco regime should be interpreted as crucial for the Church's further oppositional and nationalist position in the further years of Francoism.

For the consolidation of its new, prestigious position, the Catalan Catholic Church, as the process of institutionalization of the Catalan nationalism, created its own cults and symbols like martyr priests.[340] The murder of the priests was turned into an advantage for the institutional interests of the Catalan Church.[341] Perception of "a victimized Church" which suffered the most from the Civil War also contributed to the Catalan Church's discourse of the Second Republic as the sole responsible for the destruction faced in Catalonia. However, it does not label the Church as Francoist in nature; it should be read as a crucial part of the reconstruction process of the Church. Thence, Franco's Catholicist tendencies indeed were the trigger for the re-emergence of the Catalanism in contrast to his intentions.[342]

---

[339] It was the folkloric dance emerged in the northern Catalonia in 19th century. Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* p. 207.

[340] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 66.

[341] The rise in the number of priest and nun nominees should not be considered as a devotional attitude towards the Church but a vocational issue since the poverty captured the entire country together with Catalonia. On the other hand, the victimization as well as national-Catholicism as an official ideology helped the Catalan Catholic Church to promote its interest by the use of Catholicism similarly to its Spanish counterpart. In contrary to its spiritual characteristic, the Church did not avoid to use the Catholic faith for its temporal, institutional benefits particularly in the early phases of Catholicism. Alfonso Álvarez Bolado, *El experimento del nacional catolicismo*, Edicusa, Madrid, 1976, p. 72. For this end, Acción Católica was utilized to raise and the entailment of the seminarians.

[342] Formation of religious groups and organizations were allowed to a limited extent so that the Catalan Catholic Church took the initiative of some organizations like Federació de Joves Cristianes (FJC) for the re-Christianization of Catalonia, through which it could have functioned in a more institutionalized circle. Indeed, it was not a new organization. It was formed in the Second Republic and it was functioning as a liberal Catholic Catalanist structure. FJC was banned after a while since it was too "liberal" but its members continued their actions in Accion Catolica which was also a shelter for the ones escaping from radicalism and materialism of Falangism. Massot i Muntaner, *L'Esglesia Catalana al Segle XX,* p. 163. Relatively autonomous structure of the Church during the Franco period, in fact, allowed the Catalan Church to take over the revival and progress of the Catalan nationalism under the umbrella of National-Catholicism. Aureli M. Escarré, *La Federació de Joves Cristians de Catalunya. Contribució a la seva història*, Nova Terra, Barcelona, 1972, p. 264.

The prohibitions, contrary to Franco's intention, did not avert the nationalist tendencies in the region[343]; it was pushed to perform clandestinely. The most obvious example was Institut d'Estudis Catalan which continued its organizational meetings despite the fact that it was expurgatory.[344] Moreover, the Catalan Catholics, inspired by Unió Democratica, formed "Front Universitari de Catalunya" among the university students.[345] This was the first indicator of the reformation of civil society and revival of the Catalanist organizational structure under the Francoist regime.

The decade also signified the first disapprobation among the Spanish and Catalan Church since the Spanish Church was imposing the Castilian culture and a more traditional Catholicism by excluding the Catalan habits and customs. Even though the Catholic Church was privileged regardless of the region or culture it located in, when it took up a "Catalan" role, it became restricted and persecuted by the state which dictated a certain type of Catholic faith directed by the Spanish hierarchy. In other words, the Catalan Catholic Church was subordinated to its Spanish counterpart within the borders of national-Catholicism. This led to an oppositional stance and also helped develop the Catholic Catalanism in the 1950s.

When the Church's physical recovery was completed, the Catalan Church began to use printed resources to spread its own Catholic Catalan views along with the creation of symbols and cults. The Catalan Catholic Church was allowed to use Catalan only in religious publications so that the weekly "Destino" was printed in Catalan with reference to Jacint Verdaguer who was a significant poet of Catalan

---

[343] For the Catalan nationalism, micro potency areas carried a significant importance for a macro scale of influence. No intervention with the use of Catalan in household, thus, had facilitated the survival of Catalan language and Catalan nationalism since the very beginning of the regime. On the other hand, prohibition of the use of Catalan in public politicized the language and in fact contributed to the reawakening of Catalan nationalism. Since the Catalan language had been adopted by the majority of the population thanks to the efforts in the previous decades, the repression on the Catalan caused a considerable, silent reaction among the people.

[344] Laia Balcells, "Mass Schooling and Catalan Nationalism", *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics,* 19/4, 2013, p. 473.

[345] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 129.

Renaixença.[346] Attribution to Verdaguer meant a step for the Catholic Catalan identity since he was a pious Catholic and the defender of the Catalan identity.[347] Namely, the Church emphasized its "Catalan" identity apart from the Castilian imposition of national-Catholicism.

After the defeat of Axis powers in the Second World War, the regime relatively loosened its tight oppression and started to present itself as an "organic democracy" through a number of reforms.[348] These reforms accelerated the Catalanist revival and contributed to re-institutionalization of the Catalan nationalism. However, it must be pointed that the Catalan nationalism was highly depended on the state policies regardless of the regime type which made it a reactionary movement.

5.2.2. Catalan Catholic Church in the mid-1940s

After 1945, some sectors within the Catalan Catholic Church began to devote themselves to reconstruction of the Catalan identity and Catalan language. The leader was Aureli Escarré, the Abbot of Montserrat[349] whose purpose was to combine the Catalan aspects with the Church and re-Christianize the region which was radically secularized. Catalonia's worker class had a particular importance for the Church since it was radically anti-clerical; yet, the privileged and semi-autonomous structure of the "new" Catholic Church let it to dominate the Catalan nationalism and thus to penetrate the Catholic Catalanist ideas into the society.[350]

The Catalan Church utilized the cults, icons and symbols for the prevalence of the Catholic Catalanism in the second half of the 1940s. The first explicit event of

---

[346] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain,* p. 116.

[347] Smith, *The Origins of Catalan Nationalism,* p. 184.

[348] Linz, "Church and State in Spain", p. 164.

[349] He can be seen as the successor of Torras i Bages.

[350] Aureli M., Escarré, *Montserrat és Vostre. Textos de Belascoain a Viboldone*, Publicacions de l'Abadia, Montserrat, 1978, pp. 54-58.

Catalanism since the Civil War was "l'entronitzacio de la Mare de Deu de Montserrat" (the enthronement of the Mother of God of Montserrat) in 1947.[351] It was the praisal of the Catalan Catholic cult, Black Madonna[352] whose purpose was to contribute to re-Christianization of the Catalan society. This event carried a particular importance since it was the first in which the Catalan was used explicitly after the Civil War.[353] All the activities initiated by the Church or Church-related organizations were seen as the reconquest of Catalonia for Christ[354], which legitimized Catalanist initiatives of the Catalan Church.[355]

The Church's efforts to integrate Catalan cultural elements into Catholicism became a beacon for the the emergence of "indigenous" type of Catholicism. Particularly between 1945 and 1949, Catholic Catalanists within the Catalan Church were sufficiently dominant to revive the Catalanist tendencies. Both religious and regional aspects like Catalan Marianism[356] also helped the Church's efforts for combination of Catalanism and Catholicism that Catalanism indeed benefitted the most during this period. The most clear example was the civic function of the Grup Torras i Bages

---

[351] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 83.

[352] She was the main icon of Catalan Church and the backbone of Catholic Catalanism. Marina Warner, *Alone of all Her Sex: the Myth and Cult of the Virgin Mary,* Picador, London, 1985, p. 280.

[353] Hank Johnson, *Tales of Nationalism, Catalonia 1939-1979,* Rutgers University Press, New Jersey, 1991, p. 57.

[354] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 85.

[355] State's encounter with the use of Catalan language and Catalan icons was not reactionary; rather, Franco saw the Catalanist initiatives as promotion of the Catholicism within the region. After the support of the Vatican and the Franco's media to the events in Catalonia as well as the cult of Black Madonna, the Catalan Church could have found a larger sphere to practice the Catalan nationalism. Eventually, Sardana and playwrights in Catalan were popularized as the parts of the Catholic Catalanist movement. For the first time since the Civil War, a poem in Catalan was performed in a theatre thanks to the civil governer of Barcelona, Barba Hernandez. Antonio Francisco Serrano Canales, "El Robo de la memoria. Sobre el lugar del franquismo en la historiografia catolico-catalanista, *Ayer,* 5, 2005, p. 276. However, this progress in terms of Catalan nationalism was not only of the Catalan Church's efforts but also the outcome of the regime's isolation policy after the defeat of the Nazi Germany. In other words, the Church's ability to take a step in the Catalan nationalist movement was not independent of state's policies; it could function as freely as Franco allowed the Church.

[356] It was worshipping to Black Madonna.

under the Catholic Church in effort to unite Catholicism and Catalanism.[357] The significance of this type of groups was their potential to politicize the young generations and to create influential figures such as Jordi Pujol, the future president of Catalonia.[358]

5.2.3. From Catholic Catalanism to Secular Catalan Nationalism

All these developments as well as the Church's relative autonomy paved the way for the Catalan Church's monopoly over Catalan nationalism which lasted until 1960s. Since the former organizations lost their influence over the Catalanist movement, new groups, Unio Democratica de Catalunya (UDC), FJC (Federacio de Joves Cristianes) and Accio Catalana dominated the scene regarding the Catalan nationalism.[359] These groups were indoctrinated with the indigenous Catholic traditions along with the Catalan nationalist aspects.[360] Vatican's approval of Black Madonna at the end of 1950 strengthened the position of the Catalan Church and increased the number of publications in Catalan language.[361]

The 1940s prepared the base of the Catalan nationalist revival which matured during the 1950s. Adoption of the Catalan nationalist tendencies meant a prestige for any institution within the Catalan society so that the Catalan Church could consolidate its position by combining Catholicism with Catalan nationalism. This strength of the Catalan Church and Catalan nationalism also paved the way for the student

---

[357] Hilari, Raguer, 'El grup "Torras i Bages", unpublished article, Biblioteca de Montserrat, cited in Andrew Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 80.

[358] *Memoria sobre les activitats del "Grup Torras i Bages" durant el curs 1949-1950,* Biblioteca de Montserrat, Montserrat, 1950.

[359] It was established in 1931. It was inspired by the European Christian democratic trend which was disliked by the Second Republic and conversely desired by the Catalan nationalists during the Francoist era.

[360] There were three Catalan Marian groups: Congregacions Marianes, Cofraria de la Mare de Deu de Montserrat and Lliga Espiritual de la Mare de Deu Montserrat.

[361] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 101.

movements and nationalist uprisings which would have marked the late years of the Francoist regime. Even though the Catalan Church preserved the moral and spiritual hegemony as well as considerable contribution to Catalan nationalism, the effort of re-Christianization proved dysfunctional and unresponsive. As a tool, Catholicism remained weaker than Catalanism; therefore the Church's use of Catalan nationalism helped it preserve the support of Catalans.

The rise of the Catalan nationalism during the 1950s could also be identified as the outcome of the Francoist economic policies which triggered the gap between the regions. The higher tax rate as well as higher prices in transportation in Catalonia, particularly in Barcelona than in Madrid caused a large scale of boycott in 1951 which was supported by the majority of the population.[362] This uprising soon turned into a protest against the Franco's harsh policies over the Catalan language and culture which, for the Franco's part was interpreted as the revival of the threat of red-separatism.[363] With respect to national-Catholicism, Franco's effort to create one single, united Spanish nation failed due to his own, discriminative social and economic policies.

Nonetheless, thanks to the Church's protective umbrella, Catalanism could reach a wider audience and found many opportunities for progressive initiatives such as Academia de Llengua Catalana.[364] The reason why Franco could not intervene with the Church's steps for the revival of Catalanism was that due to divine characteristic of the Church, it was rather risky to keep the Church under a strict control; it could damage the prestige of Franco as a Catholic. Organizing the International Eucharist Congress in Barcelona in 1952 in which the Moreneta of Montserrat (Black

---

[362] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy,* p. 72.

[363] Sebastian Balfour, *Dictatorship, Workers, and the City: Labour in Greater Barcelona since 1939*, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1989, p. 25.

[364] Carles Santacana Torres, "Europeismo y catolicismo""Europeísmo y catolicismo en el discurso cultural y político catalán de la posguerra", *Cercles. Revista d'història cultural*, 26/14, 2011, pp. 25-37.

Madonna) was declared as the patronate and the hymn was given in Catalan[365], promoted the Catalan Church's position and aggravated the state's interference into the Church's activities.

5.3. International Developments and the Church in 1950s

The Concordat which was signed in 1953 had particular impacts over the relationship between Franco regime and the Catalan Church.[366] Even though it was a bilateral agreement, the regime benefitted from the Concordat more than the Church itself. The Concordat, in a way, officialized the use of the Church for the political and social legitimization of the Franco regime.[367] This authority given to the regime can also be comprehended as the use of the Catalan for the regime's own political ends that explains the regime's non-interventionary attitudes towards the Catalan Church. Isolation of Spain from democratized Europe as well as the economic bottleneck forced Franco to loosen his tight policies over Catalonia so that the Concordat and the use of Catalan language as the legitimizing agency became a strategy for the regime's ends.[368]

Another warrant for the regime's tolerance towards the Catalan Church was the existence of the "common enemies". The new type of Catalan nationalism formed by the Catalan Church was based upon the new symbols such as Abbot Escarré and Monastery of Montserrat which intendedly excluded the old Catalan elements like

---

[365] Ibid., p. 35.

[366] The Concordat became the guarantor of the privileged situation of the Church in Spain and gave the Church the right to be excluded from the previous censorship for its publications. For Catalonia, the lifting of previous censorship became a big opportunity for the Catalan nationalists and it resulted in increasing numbers of Catalan publications.

[367] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 136.

[368] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 99.

Lliga Regionalista or ERC.[369] Particularly after the publications on how ERC pushed the Catalan population to anti-Christianity[370], the regime assumed the Church's efforts as solely Christianizing works rather than nationalist or separatist attempts. The fortitude presented by the regime to the Catalan Church could also be presumed as a strategy of Franco in order to keep Catalanism under the state control since clandestine activities could hardly be averted due to the Church's protective role.

End of the Second World War, international conjuncture under the influence of the Cold War, which led to an economic agreement with the USA in 1953 also affected Franco's internal policies and paved the way for the end of isolationist, autarchic strategies of the regime.[371] Even though Franco was disliked by the European powers due to his sympathy towards Hitler and his Spain was excluded from formation of a European union, they maintained the economic relations with Spain which along with the agreement with the USA easened the economic problems during 1950s.[372] Abandonment of the insecure and unstable political atmosphere created a fluid environment which benefitted Catalan nationalism. Books and other printed products started to be published out of the Church's protective circle and through relative economic liberalization in 1950s multinational companies began to enter Spain which would change the course of political and cultural developments in Catalonia.[373]

---

[369] ERC was a secular, anti-clerical and masonry party for the Catalan Church. Plus it was seen as the trigger of the Civil War's destruction over the religious buildings and the killings of the priests. It was militantly anti-clerical.

[370] Canon Carles Cardo, *Les dues tradicions. Historia espiritual de las Espagnes,* Editorial Claret, Barcelona, 1994, p. 187.

[371] Phillips Jr. and Rahn Phillips, *A Concise History of Spain,* pp. 267-268.

[372] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy,* pp. 114-119.

[373] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalunya,* p. 106.

5.3.1. Acceleration and Spread of the Catalan Nationalist Movements

This atmosphere together with the Catalanist tendencies of the Catalan Church created a unique opportunity for Catalanism to penetrate into the variety of areas. Most influential was the football which had a considerably important position regarding the consolidation of the Catalan identity. Thus, Barcelona football club[374] turned out to be an effective tool for the construction of Catalan collectivity during the 1950s. Football and the club easened population's adoption of the national sentiment and supporting the Barcelona club turned into a form of expression of the Catalan patriotism.[375]Therefore, "El Barça" was described as "es més que un club".[376] The club's adoption of Monastery of Montserrat and Black Madonna as patroness were significant due to the fact that the Monastery was functioning as a refuge for Catalanist activities while the Moreneta was the symbol of Catalan characteristic of the church.

Progress and institutionalization of Catalanist efforts of the Catalan Church in fact were accelerated with the publication of a magazine, Germinabit in 1949.[377] It was the fruit of the Church's monopoly over Catalanism and its particular position for the advance and revival of Catalan nationalist movement. What made it significant was its explicit distance with the Franco regime as well as with national-Catholicism, and its preliminary role for the formation of the Serra d'Or in 1955, which was dominantly Catholic and Catalanist.[378] The most remarkable initiative of Germinabit

---

[374] Its original name was in Catalan, FC Barcelona which was changed by Franco after the Civil War.

[375] Shobe Hunter, "Place, identity and football: Catalonia, Catalanisme and Football Club Barcelona, 1899-1975", *National Identities,* 10/3, 2008, p. 336.

[376] Ibid., p. 340.

[377]Andrew Dowling, "The Reconstitution of Political Catalanism 1939-75", *International Journal of Iberian Studies*, 14/1, 2001, p. 22.

[378] It was a Catholic dominated journal in the Catalan language which had a particular importance for the course of the Catalan nationalism since as a printed resource it was a tool to penetrate the various layers of society. Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 109.

was to instruct Catalan courses within the Catalan Church which turned out to be a publishing home, a school as well as a religious institution.[379]

What remarked the 1950s was the re-emergence of the "Escoltisme" (Boy-Scout Movement).[380] The Church's effort to reach popular classes as well as the regime's concessions contributed to the systematization of the Catalanist movement within the Catalan Church. Scout movement helped spread Catalan nationalism among the young generation by providing a chance to learn Catalan language, history and culture.[381] Indeed, it was a way to propagandize the Catalan youth through indoctrination of the Catalan values and the idea of Catalan national unity with regard to Catholicism. In the Congress of Accion Catolica in 1947, Pope declared that scout movement was an alternative way for the Catholic Action which brought an undeniable prestige and legitimization to escoltisme.[382] The movement had a militaristic way of concentration and indoctrination of the Catalan values. The notions of Catalanism and Catholicism along with "patriotism" were systematically imposed on the Catalan youth in the meetings.[383]

One of the main symbols of Catalan nationalism, Sardana, the folkloric dance became a pillar of the Catalan nationalist movement in this period since the symbols carried a great importance for the revival of Catalanism. The adoption of Sardana as one of the main symbols of reviving Catalan nationalism meant a break with the old, elite based Catalanism since the dance was born in the countryside that made it close to the ordinary people and their rituals.[384] Its rural characteristic was polished by the

---

[379] Joan-Lluis Marfany, "The Catalan Question Revisited: On Lodares, a Dubious 'Linguistic Community and Imaginary Threats to It", *Bulletin of Spanish Studies,* 83/7, 2006, p. 954.

[380] Montero, *La Iglesia: De la Colaboracion a la Disidencia 1956-1975,* pp. 257-258.

[381] Joan Lluis Marfany, *La cultura del catalanisme,* Empuries, Barcelona, 1995, pp. 292-300.

[382] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 110.

[383] Marfany, *La cultura del catalanisme,* pp. 292-300.

[384] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 110.

Catalan Church due to the fact that it had long threatened by secularism and urbanization.[385]

These developments encouraged a further step, the formation of the "Crist i Catalunya" by Abbot Escarré and Jordi Pujol, the future president of Generalitat of Catalonia, that aimed to connect the Catholic faith and Catalanism inseparably.[386] This organization became a uniting body under which divided Catholic Catalans such as Republicans and Nationalists as well as Lliga Espiritual, Acción Católica and scouts came together.[387] As a result of the combination of Catalanism and Catholicism, the Catalan Catholic Church was determined as the core of the Catalanist rising. However, rejection of the old Church dogmas and teachings became the signal of the first division within the Catalan Catholic Church.

Even though the Catalan Catholic Church never separated from the popular classes, in this period, a sector within the Church directly got involved with the social questions as well as adopting Catalanism as a part of its policy even at the cost of contradicting with the regime.[388] Progressives led by Jordi Pujol intended to integrate the issue of "social justice" into the Catholic teachings which would prevail the Catholic faith among the masses.[389] Considering the strict division between the classes in the Catalan society, this sector embraced inter-classism[390] in order to avert the possible class struggles.

---

[385] Sardana along with the Escoltisme represented the re-emergence of the Catalan civil society in a slow phase.

[386] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 140.

[387] Charles L. Cotton, "Political Lineages in Catalonia 1939-2014", (published paper), p. 9.

[388] A publishing house, Nova Terra was found in 1957 which became the resource for the publications of progressive sector within the Church.

[389] William Carlton, Tatiana Mallison and Robert Oaleshott, *The Christian Response to Industrial Capitalism,* Sheed&Ward, London, 1986, p. 201.

[390] The concept rejects class struggle by promoting the collaboration and harmony between the different classes within the society.

Perception of superiority dominated the efforts of the Catalan Catholic Church regarding Catalan nationalism. Superiority together with repression over the Catalan language and culture rose the claim that the Catalans were humiliated and excluded by Franco and his policies; Catalonia was victimized and aggrieved by the regime's excessive measures upon the Catalan population. Increasing rate of the Spanish immigration into Catalonia also escalated these assumptions among Catalans as well as the idea of de-Christianization since the immigrants, particularly from Andalusia were dominantly irreligious and representatives of flamenco culture.[391]

5.3.2. Rise of Bourgeoisie in Catalan Nationalism in the 1950s

The economic bottleneck arose during 1950s affected Catalonia more due to the strong presence of the labour class which had to face all the economic problems. Progressives within the Catalan Church insistingly argued that the Catalan national reconstruction must have been established on a moderate and worker-oriented base which would be free of class confrontations and would exclude the extreme Catholic doctrines that had alienated the labour class and pushed them to irreligious groups or organizations.[392] Moreover, as a result of economic questions, Catalan bourgeoisie re-appeared as a moderate Catalanist group which was influenced from Christian democracies in Europe.[393] Economic stability as well as perception of "superiority" triggered the intervention of the Catalan bourgeoisie with re-Catalanization of Catalonia.

After lifting the autarchy, Opus Dei came to the forefront which also consisted of the Catalan businessmen.[394] Apart from their contribution to economic recovery, Opus Dei evolved into an initiative for Catalan bourgeoisie to be an effective actor in the

---

[391] Even though it seems as contradictory to widely accepted civic and tolerant Catalan nationalism, it was an extreme view which did not reach a wider audience.

[392] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 126.

[393] Ibid., p. 127.

[394] Casanova, "The Opus Dei Ethic and the Modernization of Spain", p. 29.

Catalanist movement.[395] The economic support to Catalan nationalist movement accelerated and strengthened the propagandation of Catalan nationalism during this period.[396]Catalan bourgeoisie, too could have mobilized under its own organizations such as Cercle d'Economia created in 1958.[397] Shortly after the formation of this organization, they declared that the Franco regime was imposing a threat to the development of Catalan economy; Catalan bourgeoisie had remained weak due to the weakness of Catalans and Catalonia.[398] In this way, Catalan bourgeoisie interwoved cultural and economic revival besides the Church's combination of Catalanism and Catholicism.

Besides the economic progress in the region, Catalan Church and Academia de la Llengua Catalana marked the end of 1950s both socially and ideologically. They took the initiative of variety of passive protests particularly boomed in Barcelona on behalf of the Catalic Catalan nationalism. These reactions as well as economic development refreshed the confidence of Catalans about their potential and proved the influence of the Catalan Church's over the course of Catalanist movement. What was remarkable in the progress of the new Catalanism was its apolitical stance; it had no organic tie with the political parties or groups even though the cultural autonomy required to be complemented with the political power.[399]

---

[395] Yfante, *La prodigiosa aventura del Opus Dei*, p. 181.

[396] On the other hand, the regime's moderation over Catalan linguistic and cultural activities decelerated the bourgeoisie's involvement with the revival and progress of the Catalanism.

[397] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism*, p. 150.

[398] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 131.

[399] Albert Manent, *El moli de l'ombra. Dietari politic i retrats 1946-1975*, Edicions Destino, Barcelona, 1986, p. 110.

5.4. 1960s-1975: Repoliticization of Catalan Nationalism

5.4.1. Economic Initiations and Catalan Nationalism

The 1960s became the second pinnacle of the Catalan nationalism after the revival during 1940s and 1950s. Internal and external changes as well as the Church's control over Catalanism accelerated the productivity of Catalan nationalist movement. The impulse was the Catalan economic boom in the 1960s after introduction of economic liberalization to the country. With the efforts of Opus Dei, the regime lessened the control over the small and medium size businesses and opened up a relatively appealing environment for the foreign investment.[400] As a result of economic development, Catalan bourgeoisie challenged the monopoly of the Catalan Church in Catalan nationalist movement and became the most influential actor in Catalan nationalism. It can also be read as the inefficacy of the re-Christianization efforts and the Church's endeavor for being a dominant actor in Catalan society.

Exclusion from the European Economic Community (EEC) which was found in 1957 along with the economic contraction forced the Spanish bourgeoisie to act with their Catalan counterparts which led to the foundation of Español de la Liga Europea de Cooperacion Economica.[401] Moreover, the collaboration with the Spanish bourgeoisie also triggered the feeling of superiority that contributed to the cause of Catalanism. The exclusion despite the economic liberalization depicted that without political and social liberalization and democracy, Spain's economic initiatives could not be considered by the European democracies.[402]

---

[400] Xavier Muñoz, *L'economia com a experienciadiaria a Catalunya,* Edicions 62, Barcelona, 1984, p. 30.

[401] Charles E. Ehrlich, "Federalism, regionalism, nationalism: A century of Catalan political thought and its implications for Scotland in Europe", *Space and Polity*, 1/2, 1997, p. 221.

[402] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 140.

For the Catalan case, it can be said that no national tendency would turn into a nationalist action unless it was financially backed by the Catalan bourgeoisie during 1960s. Victimization due to the Francoist policies together with the Catalan economic development fed the discourse of superiority and Catalan tendencies. The second Golden Age of Catalanism can be perceived as the outcome of Catalan bourgeoisie's effort while the Catalan Church and conservative sectors were identified as servants of the Francoism by various Catalanist groups. However, it did not mean that the Catalan Church was completely faded into background.

This period of 1960s also signified the end of anticlericalism in Catalonia after which the Church's authority would be shaken by secularism.[403] Dispensing with the historical anticlericalism was not an achievement of the Church's re-Christianization efforts; rather, it was the Church's adoption by the Catalan people thanks to its engagement with the Catalan nationalist revival and the social questions.[404] On the other hand, direct intervention with the social issues strengthened the Church against its nemesis, urban-led secularization. The abolition of anticlericalism and anti-Church sentiments were not only the outcome of the Church's nationalist tendency but also the result of the communists' moderation towards the Catalan Church.[405]

5.4.2. Immigrants as Catalyst

Due to the fact that Catalanism turned more systematized and organized, it had to encounter with three main issues: Francoist repression on Catalan language and

---

[403] Ibid., p. 147.

[404] However, the Church's position against the Catalan nationalist revival and social questions led to a division within the Catalan Church as progressives and nationalists. While the nationalists embraced the Catalan language as the main pillar and issue of the Catalan nationalist movement, the progressives prioritized the social questions while holding the Catalan language as a core. Santacana Torres, "Europeismo y catolicismo", p. 33.

[405] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, pp. 130-131.

culture, labour movements and the mass immigration.[406] Influx of immigrants into the region imposed a serious threat to prevalence and consolidation of Catalan nationalism. High level of irreligiosity among the immigrants, Andalusians in particular, forced the Catalan Church to involve with the social questions.[407] Moreover, the newly arrived immigrants, mostly Castilians were already poorly educated thus they were not prepared for the linguistic Catalanization; therefore, the progressive Catholics had to carry out their works in Castilian language.[408] The main purpose of the Catalan Church was to keep its believers; thereby the use of Catalan was not imposed on the immigrants.

Unlike exclusive, ethnic characteristic of Spanish nationalism during the Francoist era, Catalan nationalism undertook a more inclusive, civic role regarding the immigrants. Assimilation was chosen as the policy for the inclusion and integration of the immigrants to the Catalan society, who could be a threat to Catalanism.[409] The integration of the immigrants into Catalan society and Catalanist movement which was an unofficial policy which impeded the new comers to be influenced by Lerrouxisme that was blossoming in this period.[410] Even though there occured hostility against the immigrants, it remained narrow since Catalan nationalism had no racist tendencies.[411]Catalan language and culture were strongly settled in Catalonia so that the immigrants posed no serious threat to degrade the Catalan nationalist aspects.

---

[406] In some resources, it is taken as "migration" rather than "immigration". However, considering the literal definitions and the conditions at that time being, in my work, I find "immigration" more suitable to use.

[407] Candel, *Els altres Catalans vint anys despres*, p. 297.

[408] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 171.

[409] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, p. 208.

[410] It was an ideology which was totally anti-Catalanist movement of Spanish workers. Scott L. Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation? Catalan mobilization and nationhood before the Spanish democratic transition, 1970–1975", *Democratization*, 23/4, 2016, pp. 618.

[411] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, pp. 124-125.

This also fed the sentiment of superiority which actually showed that the immigration did not decelerate the progress of Catalanism. In addition, immigrants were aware of the fact that they settled in a region which had its own distinct language and culture so that they were willing to be linguistically assimilated.[412] These policies in the end paved the way for a sharper division between nationalists and progressives that the latter was blamed to be influenced leftism.[413]

5.4.3. Impacts of the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965)

On global scale, 1960s witnessed a worldwide change both socially and politically which led to the Second Vatican Council in 1962. What the Council brought was the abandonment of the warlike policies against liberalism and materialism that was introduced with the First Vatican Council (1869-1870), and the adoption of a more progressive stance. Emphasis over the human rights and social justice was the sign of the Vatican's adaptation to change and modernization. Besides world-wide alteration in Christian doctrines, the Pope's statement that the cause of unrest was the cultural and linguistic oppression over minorities prior to the Second Vatican Council caused a relief and self-confidence in Catalonia which raged the Franco regime.[414]

After the Second Vatican Council, the paradox between national and supranational characteristic of the Catholic Church was refreshed. Even though the churches were bound by the rules of the country they located in, Vatican was the supreme authority and all the Catholic churches were tied to Rome. Therefore, the Pope's declaration about the minorities as well as the final papers of the Council authorized the inculcation and religious services in the mother tongue, in Catalan language for Catalonia.[415] The higher approval of the rights of "others" expedited the Catalan

---

[412] Marfany, "The Catalan Question", pp. 950-955.

[413] It was not a false charge indeed. There were "red" priests who were prioritizing the social issues about the workers such as working conditions.

[414] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 159.

[415] "Declaration on Religious Freedom Dignitatis Humanae on the Right of the Person and of Communities to Social and Civil Freedom in Matters Religious Promulgated by His Holiness Pope

nationalism within the Church which turned out to be a serious threat for the Franco regime due to the fact that its source of legitimacy was the Catholic Church itself. Paradoxically, as a regime which adopted the Catholicism as its main pillar, it seemed not appropriate to attack on the Church which could cause the regime to resemble the anti-clerical Second Republic.[416]

After the liberalization of the church of "minority", thanks to the Second Vatican Council, Monastery of Montserrat, as the center of Catholic Catalanism, organized a congress for the spread of the use of Catalan in churches.[417] For the monastery, Catalan language was carrying a particular importance owing to the fact that using vernacular in the services was the most effective way for Catholic expansion.[418] The prominent figure in the Catalan Church, Abbot Escarré was the principal supporter, who defended the idea that Catalan language was essential to preserve the religious tendencies; continuation of national-Catholicist ideals would lead to alienation against the Church and trigger the anti-Church sentiments in Catalonia.[419]

5.4.4. New Secular Phase of the Catalan Nationalism in 1960s

During the 1960s, the lines between the Catholic and non-Catholic organizations were blurred. Majority of the organizations aimed at gatheringthe Catalanist sectors regardless of their ideological and historical background. Omnium Cultural was the most obvious example; the founders of the organizations were the supporters of the

---

Paul VI", www.vatican.va/archieve/hist_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651207_dignitatis-humanae_en.html (accessed: 27.06.2017).

[416] Tusell, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy,* pp. 146-147.

[417] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 160.

[418] Massot i Muntaner, *L'esglesia catalana entre la guerra i la post guerra,* Curial, Barcelona, 1978, p. 74.

[419] He was exiled by the regime afterwards. However, it was a wrong strategy since his exile was met with reactions from all sectors Catalanism including communists.

each side in the Civil War.[420] Furthermore, Catholic Catalanists had a major role in the organization despite the fact that Omnium was not a Catholic formation. As economic development overlapped with the cultural and linguistic progress in Catalanist sense, while Omnium was an economic organization, Serra d'Or was founded on the cultural aspects of the Catalan nationalism.[421]

This Catalanist mobility was not overlooked by the regime forces that in 1964, Serra d'Or was subjected to censorship since it was evaluated as a publication out of the Catalan Church's circle and as a formation which had separatist tendencies.[422]This explicit Catalanist mobility drew the attention of the regime's hot-liners and led to a variety of attacks[423] which depicts the rise of anticlericalism within the regime and hostility towards the Catalan Church perceiving it as the core of red-separatism as well as decline in anticlericalism in Catalonia.

Unlike the other Catalanist formations such as Escoltisme[424], Nova Cançó permeated the different layers of society. Use of Catalan music and songs helped reach to non-Catalan population as well as Catalans which strongly contributed to the strength of Catalan nationalism.[425] It also became a turning point for the separation of traditional and modern; for example Sardana was classified as a cultural value with a narrow, limited influence while Nova Cançó created a wider effect all over the country.[426] As a result, Nova Cançó evolved into the basic element of the Catalan nationalism during the 1960s.

---

[420] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 151

[421] Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation?", p. 626.

[422] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 155.

[423] In 1963, Casal de Montserrat was burned. In 1965, Falange members threatened the members of the church in Barcelona for the use of Catalan.

[424] Even though it was a significant movement for the re-emergence of Catalanism, it was appealing to middle-classes and more importantly to Catalan-speaking individuals and families.

[425] Aragüez Rubio, "La nova cançó catalana", pp. 81-97.

[426] Guibernau, "Nationalism and Intellectuals", p. 1000.

During the second half of the 1960s, thanks to the internationalization of European economies and Spain's effort to integrate to this system caused a boom in international investment within the country. Permeation of the foreign companies and investment into Spain eroded the archaic inter-state boundaries and encouraged the regional demands and protests.[427] Economic progress as well as the Catalanist tendency among Catalan businessmen forced the Catalan bourgeoisie to act upon their own "Catalan" interests. Exclusion from EEC and Franco's restrictive policies obscured Catalonia to function within the competitive international economy[428] which led to a forum, "Conversaciones sobre Economia Europea", a road map in order to be a part of EEC by Catalan businessmen.[429] Despite the economic liberalization, incapability to catching up with the Europe's economic trend paved the way for the labour movements within the entire Spain and was raged particularly in Catalonia by the immigrant workers which triggered the Catalanist tendencies among the Catalan business sector. The labour movements was accompanied by the student movements which would deeply shake Franco's authority.

These political and social incidents inevitably influenced the Catalan Church however, economic liberalization as well as cultural openings and consumerism showed that the efforts of conservatives for re-Christianization had failed.[430] Nonetheless, it should not be perceived as the exclusion of the Catalan Church as it happened during the course of the Second Republic. There was no secular or anti-Church threat; it was a shift from anti-religious tendency toward the non-religious aspects within the Catalan society.[431]

---

[427] Stein Rokkan, Derek W. Unwin, "Centers and Peripheries" in Western Europe, *The Politics of Territorial Identity: Studies in European Regionalism*, London, SAGE Publications, 1983, p. 3.

[428] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 181.

[429] Ibid., p. 177. They claimed that the Spain's economic future could not be considered independently of Europe's economy.

[430] Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation?, p. 620.

[431] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 183.

5.4.5. Escalation of Catalan Nationalist Movements in the mid-1960s

During the second half of the 1960s, Catalanist movement continued producing symbols and increasing its power. Caputxinada was the major examples of these symbol which also indicated the position of the Catalan Church in Catalonia.[432] Caputxinada was the regular meeting of Sindicat Democratic d'Estudiants (Democratic Students' Union)[433] which gathered at the shelter of the Capuchin monks.[434] This gathering had been sieged by the police for two days which turned out to be the first militant Catalanist stance within the Catalan Church. After this incident, all the religious buildings including the churches became the base of the militarized opposition in Catalonia, particularly in Barcelona. After shooting of a Basque priest along with the Caputxinada incident, prestige of the Franco regime was damaged since it contradicted itself as a truly Catholic structure.[435] On the other hand, it consolidated the Catalan Church's position and cemented the idea of "a victim Church" which drew support from various fractions.

Besides the nationalization of the youngsters, schooling was crucial for the integration of the Castilian speaking immigrants into the Catalan society. Teaching Catalan language was the root of assimilation of the immigrants in the region. What should be borne in mind that the monopoly of education was held by the state which prevented a systematic and an institutionalized Catalan teaching.[436] Even though institutionalization and systematization in educational area were vital for the spread of an ideology, teaching Catalan language became a considerable step for the spread of Catalan nationalism.

---

[432] Montero, *La Iglesia: De la Colaboracion a la Disidencia,* p. 259.

[433] Benito Sanz Diez, Olga Quinones and Francesc Perez i Moragan, "El sindicat democratic d'estudiants", *La oposicio universitaria al franquisme: Valencia 1939-1975,* Departamento de Derecho Constitucional y Ciencia Politica y de la Administracion, 2013, Barcelona, pp. 64-83.

[434] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism*, p. 176.

[435] Montero, *La Iglesia: De la Colaboracion a la Disidencia,* pp. 260-261.

[436] Balcells, "Mass Schooling and Catalan Nationalism", p. 476.

5.4.6. Question of Spanish Bishops in the Catalan Catholic Church

One of the main issues concerning the Catalan Church was that since the Primo de Rivera's dictatorship, Spanish bishops were appointed to churches in Catalonia. In the second half of the 1960s, Catholic Catalanists stood up for appointment of the Catalan bishops to the Catalan churches.[437] The reason for the appointment of Spanish bishops was the state's will to control the region and demand of the Catholic Catalanists was the result of the Second Vatican Council in which the Catholic Church was declared as exempted from the state authority.[438] However, Vatican did not want to lose one of the most Catholic countries in Europe thus it maintained the appointment of the Spanish bishops to Catalonia.[439]

From the Catholic Catalanists' perspective, this was a deliberate strategy of the Franco regime in order to degenerate and de-Christianize the Catalan society. The Catalan Church could be Catalan only if the bishops shared the same language and the culture with Catalan people.[440] Creating an indigenous church could be identified as a way of connection between Catholicism and Catalanism.[441] This rebuke within the Church escalated the progressives who insistingly claimed that the emphasis over the use of Catalan would alienate the non-Catalan speakers and drag them apart from integration.[442]

---

[437] Cotton, "Political Lineages in Catalonia 1939-2014", p. 7.

[438] "Decree Ad Gentes On the Mission Activity of the Church", www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/vat-ii_decree_19651207_ad-gentes_en.html (accessed: 02.07.2017).

[439] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 197.

[440] Cotton, "Political Lineages in Catalonia 1939-2014", p. 7.

[441] It was expressed by Grup Torras i Bages as "Catalunya sera cristia o no sera"- Catalunya will be Christian or will not be.

[442] It is representing the Anderson's view that all the communities were imagined, what makes them different is the way and style in which they are imagined. Anderson, *Imagined Communities*.

Progress of Catalan nationalism could not be evaluated separately without considering international incidents. Through the end of 1960s, leftism dominated the scene all around the world which also led to formation of Força Socialista Federal in 1968[443] in Catalonia on behalf of the socialist revolution. The rise of leftist radicalism caused a rupture within the Front Nacional de Catalunya, Front d'Allibarement Catala which was inspired by ETA (Euskadi Ta Askatasuna) andIRA (Irish Republican Army).[444] What can be seen behind the formation of those organizations is that they took nationalism as a servant of bourgeoisie interests; third-worldism was the base of those organizations so that Catalonia was declared as "exploited" by Spain.[445] As a result, it encouraged the worker movements and protests in Catalonia and particularly marginalized the immigrants in the region.

5.5. The Failure of Catholic Catalanism (1965-1975)

The most important initiative in that time taken by Jordi Pujol was the movement of "Fer Pais" (Making the Country) through reshaping and redirecting Catalan nationalism.[446] It was an economy-oriented action which tied the Catalan economy to Catalanism itself just as the Catalan Church's unification of Catalanism and Catholicism.[447] Fer Pais revealed an "action and reaction" relationship between Catalan nationalism and economy; the Catalan economy would grow only if the entire Catalonia was to prosper and if the economy progressed, it would directly

---

[443] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism*, p. 141.

[444] Alimbau Jaume Reyner, *Catalunya, qüestio d'estat: vint-i-cinc anys d'independentisme catala 1968-1993,* Edicions El Medol, Barcelona, 1995, p. 46.

[445] Ucelay-Da Cal, "Violencia simbólica y temática militarista", p. 258.

[446] Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation?", pp. 623-624.

[447] Catalan bourgeoisie turned into the main carrier of the Catalan nationalism thanks to economic advancement in 1960s. Catalanist business group, under the leadership of Jordi Pujol dominated the publishing sector which was crucial for the propaganda of any ideology or mentality. This sector was mostly aided by the Banca Catalana especially in the second half of the 1960s. The Bank undertook a crucial role for the reconstruction of the Catalan identity and reproduction of the Catalan symbols and discourses as well as the linguistic revival which was the core of Catalan nationalism. Blessing by the Abbot of Montserrat gave the publishing houses a great legitimization and prestige within the Catalan society.

contribute to the course of Catalan nationalism.[448] However, in a politicized sphere and radicalized working class, bourgeoisie's initiative remained exclusive; thus inter-classism[449] was adopted as the core of the movement in order to avert the alienation of the workers.

Moreover, the leftist rise in the world paved the way for secularization which had an impact over modernized and industrialized Catalan society. It proved that the society could not be Catholicized as the Catalan Church had attempted. Secularization[450] and the Church's failure to prevent it caused a shift in the regime that economic prosperity was held as new legitimization tool instead of the Church and Catholicism in 1960s.[451]

After the Catalan bourgeoisie's emergence as a part of Catalan nationalism, the Catalan Church lost both its monopoly and influence over Catalanist movement. The advantage of the Catalan bourgeoisie was its success to obtain the support of various groups including the leftists against the perception of the common enemy, the Franco regime.[452] Since the bourgeoisie dominated the scene, the regime was forced to take measures in order to keep Catalanism under the state control so that the native languages, such as Catalan was given a place in education which was a significant opening for Catalan's officialization.

---

[448] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, p. 130.

[449] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 247.

[450] It was a common problem in Europe; a considerable number of priests were leaving the Church at that time.

[451] Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation?", p. 626. The decade following the 1960 can be seen as repetition of nineteenth-century-Catalan nationalism. Due to the economic welfare and development, stateless nationalisms were triggered and grew such as Catalanism; it had matured and was remarked by economic advancement and its contribution to Catalan nationalist movement. However, after the assassination of the Prime Minister Luis Carrero Blanco in 1973 by the terrorist group, ETA re-sharpened the regime's repression which also paved the way for the formation of a regime fanatics' group called "Bunkers" that posed a threat to the existence of Catalan and Basque nationalisms. Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 165.

[452] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, pp. 130-131.

Through the mid-1970s, since Franco's death was soon and it was obvious that the regime would undergo a transformation, if not transition, all the Catalanist actors repositioned themselves in accordance with democratic principles. At this time, Catalan bourgeoisie and the Catalan Church were the primary actors for the Catalan nationalism; however they did not contradict each other on the basis of Catalanism. They both victimized the Catalan identity which turned them into the saviour of Catalan nation. Moreover, the Catalan bourgeoisie defined itself as Catholic but also politically realist; Catholicization of the masses was not the primary target of its strategy.

On the other hand, Franco regime continued to suppress all the Catalanist efforts of the Catalanist actors in order to dominate the scene in Catalonia. Therefore, the regime itself organized "Primer Festival Popular de Poesia Catalana" in Barcelona in 1970 which was followed by the re-emergence of Els jocs florals de Barcelona[453] that had a significant place in Catalan nationalism. The duality, pressuring Catalanists and tolerating the Catalanist values and tendencies, triggered frailty and unstability within the regime and national-Catholicism.

As a result of this progressive stream, Jordi Pujol's ideals, "possibilisme"[454] in particular as the base of the Fer Pais attracted a large scale of people who were irritated by Francoist policies in Catalonia.[455] He was both possibilist and aperturista[456] in 1970s particularly who praised a complete integration into European system while pointing the regime as an obstacle.[457] Since the Catalan bourgeoisie perceived itself as European, Europeanism was crucial to westernize the Spanish

---

[453] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 236.

[454] Ibid., pp. 240-242. Firstly, possibilism points that the culture and the human behaviour are determined not by environment but by human agency which makes it contrary to determinism. On the other hand, it also means the attempt of realistic reforms within the society. These two distinct definitions are well-framed for the Catalan case since the first one provides a more theoretical base while the latter represents the mentality of the movement.

[455] Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation?", p. 623.

[456] Aperturistas were the reformers while inmovilistas were the ones against the reforms.

[457] Greer, "Who negotiates for a nation?", p. 624.

state. Westernization, though, was not renunciated from Catalanism since Catalanism or Catalanist policies would bring the Westernization into the country. [458]

The fruit of institutionalization was the formation of Convergencia Democratica.[459] From the Catalan Church's perspective, the movement was the projection of the failure of Catholic Catalanism since the Convergencia was not formed upon the Catholic doctrines which was outdated by the Catalan bourgeoisie considering the weakness of religiosity in Catalonia.[460] Even though the movement carried a Catholic tendency, being Catholic was secondary to being Catalanist; the discourse that the Catholicism and Catalanism were inseparable would hamper the cause of Catalan nationalism in an overtly secular society.[461]

In terms of Catalan nationalism and demand for Catalan autonomy, Spanish speaking immigrants carried a significant importance. What helped the Spanish people adopt the Catalanist ideals was the assimilation policy that whoever live and work in Catalonia was Catalan.[462] Integration of the immigrants could be achieved thanks to the cooperation and harmony among various organizations; while the socialist and

---

[458] Since the economic conditions were the determiner for the course of Catalan nationalism, the oil crisis in 1973 and its worlwide impacts led to a unity among the variety of business groups in Catalonia. Rise in unemployment and economic crisis altered the Catalanist discourse which triggered the worker movements consisted ofSpanish immigrant labour that posed a more serious threat for the Spanish elites residing in the region than the Catalan nationalism itself. The common threats and problems reshaped the Catalan nationalism and led to a pact between various groups such as nationalists, conservatives and monarchists which paved the way for a more institutionalized formation in the Catalan politics. This unification together with the policy of "inter-classism" turned into a mediumbetween Catalan speaking middle and upper class and Spanish speaking, radicalized immigrants. Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, pp. 241-247.

[459] They were mostly influenced by the Portuguese revolution. It was including many sectors; Banca Catalana, CIRP, CC, activists from the Catholic Syndicalist Movement. Ehrlich, "Federalism, regionalism, nationalism", pp. 213-214.

[460] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 252.

[461] It can be given as an example to the secularization theory of David Martin who claimed that if a region could be identified with the language and culture and it is not differed from the center regarding the religion, the religion, then, is not necessarily put into the core of the regionalist movements. David Martin, *A General Theory of Secularization,* Gregg Revivals, Oxford, 1978, p. 148.

[462] Marfany, "The Catalan Question Revisited", p. 54.

communist organizations were organically linked to the working class regardless of their identity or nationality, Pujolist ideals tried to hold every and each class together through inter-classist perspective. In this way, the labour class could not radicalize or be alienated and all the classes collaborated against the common enemy, Francoism.[463] Regarding the Catalan Church, although the Catholic Catalanism was represented by the Christian democratic parties, it lost its prestige after the death of Franco. Immediately after Francoist era, the transition to democracy was launched and with the constitution legislated in 1978, Catalonia re-gained its autonomous status and the Catalan Church turned into a symbolic actor which was dismissed as a policy maker.

---

[463] Conversi, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain*, pp. 130-131.

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

As this thesis stated in the Introduction, the cases illustrates that the relationship between nationalism and religion is dynamic and not mutually exclusive. As Smith and Greenfeld explained, this relationship does not have a linear sequence; rather, it has a changing characteristic..Spanish Catholic Church's distance with national-Catholicism through the end of the Franco regime and the Catalan Catholic Church's integration into Catalan nationalism, which was excluded before, during the Francoist period can be seen as the dynamic characteristic of this relationship. Moreover, just as Greenfeld mentioned in her work, nationalism is seen a secular phenomenon, which uses religion as a tool and religion might have an impact over nationalism only to the extent of nationalism's sufferance.[464] In the Spanish case, Catholicism was used as a tool for political legitimacy of Franco until it lost its influence. In the Catalan case, the Catalan Church operated for the development of Catalan nationalism since there was no alternative; when the secular bourgeoisie dominated the scene, the Catalan Church was dismissed from nationalist movement.

What this work also shows is that, as Brubaker stated, religious actions cannot be defined as "nationalist" because they operate within a nation-state, which is clearly seen in the Spanish case. The Spanish Catholic Church developed policies within the border of national-Catholicism; yet its actions were to preserve its position and interests from the Franco regime. On the other hand, he also mentions that nationalist actions cannot turn into "religious" when it includes religious badges. In fact, Catalan nationalism progressed under the

---

[464] Greenfeld, "The Modern Religion?", p. 176.

protective umbrella of the Catalan Catholic Church by using indigenous Catholic symbols; yet it preserved its secular structure. This non-automatic, contingent relationship led the way for the different attitudes and policies in the Spanish and the Catalan Church towards the Franco regime.

The difference in the attitudes and the positions of the Spanish Catholic Church and the Catalan Catholic Church during the Francoist era has been a remarkable pattern in the relationship between political and social spheres and religious institution in Spain. Even though these two churches had similarities to some extent regarding their position against the dictatorship especially during and after 1960s, they had adopted different strategies and divergent stances and embraced disparate doctrines between 1939 and 1975.

The reason of this divergence of attitudes of two Catholic churches could be varied; however, for the Spanish and the Catalan case, what makes sense of this difference was their adoption of "nationalism" and "national identity". It should be mentioned that position of the Spanish and the Catalan churches are not only related to Spanish nationalism and Catalan nationalism repsectively. Their definition of "other" also determined their reaction throughout the Franco period. Given that the Catholic Church is also a transnational institution, it is rather natural that the Spanish Church and the Catalan Church had particular policies and strategies in common. The change in the 1960s happened simultaneously with the Second Vatican Council (1962) which itself represented as a shift from state-centered strategy to society-centered one on the part of the Catholic Church this caused principally a transformation within the Spanish Church as the Catalan Catholic Church had long had a society oriented policy since the nineteenth century. Yet, basically, before and during the Francoist period, the reactions and responses of these two churches had leaned on different bases in variety of periods due to their national characteristics.

The transnational characteristic of the Catholic Church undoubtedly has an impact over the affinity of the two churches; however, it is the distinction between being "Spanish" and being "Catalan" Church that is, the national(ist) identification, which defined the stances of those churches under Franco's rule.

These two churches diverged on the basis of traditional/modern. In this context, traditional means the adoption of old Catholic Church's dogmas on topics such as marriage, sex and individualism; it was not to hold liberalism, liberal human rights which were seen as demonic but to hold absolute monarchy and oligarchic system. For the Spanish case, traditional structure also means the domination of Castilian while Catalanness and Catalan nationalism were seen revolutionary. On the other hand, modern means orientation of the Catholic Church to changing needs of society and politics such as equality, human rights, pluralism and democracy as well as secularism. Spanish Church was traditional while the Catalan Church was modern. In fact, this division had not only effected the churches' responses but also had had an impact over every aspect of life including the dissident movements in both societies. For instance, while in the wider Castilian territory of Spain, a form of bourgeois opposition had been expressed in the shape of monarchism, in Catalonia, the bourgeoisie used Catalanism to express its criticism toward the regime.[465]

The opposite attitudes of the Spanish Catholic Church and the Catalan Catholic Church were based on the traditional and modern interpretations of the Catholic religion as well as nationalist tendencies under the reign of National-Catholicism.[466]The Spanish Church had embraced a more dogmatic, traditional way of indoctrination while the Catalan Church developed a more modern and contemporary rhetoric emphasizing the demands of Catalan people such as equal rights, economic freedom and liberty for their own language and culture

---

[465] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 266.

[466] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 267.

before and during the Franco dictatorship that bothered the regime which was strictly anti-modern and traditional, that is, it wanted to maintain monolithic Castilian and Catholic order while preserving the absolute unity of the country by pressuring the other identities and nationalisms. Undoubtedly, this distinction was also related to the structure of the society in both regions to some extent; Spanish society was dominantly composed of rural sectors while the Catalan society, due to the rapid economic change and development, turned into a more industrialized, modern compared to its Spanish counterpart.[467]

Although the mentioned conflict between the Spanish Church and the Catalan Church seems as the reason of their distinct stances against Franco's dictatorship, it should be held as an outcome of a more comprehensive and a wider factor which has shaped the behaviours of Spanish Catholic Church and Catalan Catholic Church during the Francoist era which was the attitudes of Spanish Church and Catalan Church towards Spanish nationalism and Catalan nationalism respectively that determined their positions under Franco's rule.[468]

Moreover, the distance from below and the dependence on the state since it was the instrument which had guaranteed interests and prestige thus pushing the Spanish Catholic Church to determine the threat perception as one from the state. Therefore, state's unwillingness about the the formation and development of the Spanish nationalism directly led the Spanish Church to adopt the same logic that made it more identified with the state, distancing itself from the below and the nationalist sentiments. The lack of initiative taken by the most powerful institutions, the state and the Catholic Church while nationalism was rising in Europe along with the loss of the last colonies as well as the failure of the idea of "Empire" triggered the nationalist tendencies in the industrialized regions such as Catalonia and the Basque country. Economic superiority,

---

[467] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", pp. 32-34.

[468] Linz, "Church and State in Spain", p. 163.

existence of a strong bourgeois class and intellectuals along with the linguistic and cultural distinctiveness shaped the Catalan nationalism.

More importantly, this distance to Spanish nationalism and Catalan nationalism points a significant factor, distinct perceptions of threat by the two churches that remarked the positions of the churches during the Franco period. Even though this distinction did not emerge in the Francoist era first, it reached its pinnacle and became an identifier for the churches between 1939 and 1975. This factor explains why the Spanish Catholic Church had allied with the Franco regime while the Catalan Catholic Church stood against its sanctions and persecutions. Yet, while considering this factor, it also must be borne in mind that both Spanish Church and the Catalan Church were "national" institutions which appoint them different "national" motives and interests regarding the distinct dynamics of the societal and political system in the area they are placed.

The Spanish Catholic Church had always been an ally of the state which first officialized under the reign of Reyes Catolicos. This relationship was clearly mutual, even symbiotic; thus it was not unexpected that the Church's connection with the popular classes was rather weak due to official presumption that took the Catholicity of the Spaniards as granted. Equating the Spanish identity with being Catholic and the state's support for such formulation caused the Spanish Catholic Church not to consider any kind of nationalist mission respecting the Spanish nationalism since it was regarded as unnecessary.[469]

Perception of threat from above made the Spanish Church compatible with the state and let the Church use and benefit from the state's official discourses. The reference in the state's discourses was to War of Independence and the period of Reyes Catolicos which meant a consistent attribution to "heroism".

---

[469] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 24.

Since the Spanish Catholic Church had collaborated with the state, it too could have been defined as "hero" due to the fact that both periods were formulated as the victory of Catholicism against atheism and the Protestant threat. This statist posture of the Catholic Church was combined with the Catholic tendency of Francoist government so that the Catholic Church could not dare to be at disagreement with the state. The traditional composition of the masses, the lack of alternative religious identities and explicit revolutionary ideals which could pose a threat to the Spanish Church[470] as well as the weakness of civil society in the Castilian territory promoted the idea of threat coming from above. The most significant challenge for the Spanish Church was its own tendency to consider the masses as homogenous and gather them under one single policy while collaborating with the state.[471] Thus, it turned into both the reason and the result of its distance from below.

The status-quoist and conservative attitude of the Spanish Catholic Church is best revealed in its alliance with the Francoist forces during the Civil War. The victory of nationalists re-strengthened the Church's adoption of "heroism" and helped it reposition itself as the "victor" after the war. The privileges granted by Franco as well as the Church's wide authority after National-Catholicism was proclaimed as the official ideology regenerated the Spanish Catholic Church's threat perception from the state which paved the way for the alliance between these institutions. This threat also benefitted the regime and contributed to its long existence through "Catholic legitimacy" provided by the Spanish Catholic Church. That perception of threat can very well be detected in the Church's unresponsiveness to the executions and imprisonment of church personnel by the Franco regime between 1939 and 1975.[472]

---

[470] The religious minorities, Protestants, Jews and Muslism had already been exiled through "Counter-Reformation".

[471] Callahan, *The Catholic Church in Spain,* pp. 462-500.

[472] Ibid., p. 518.

Dependence on the state due to the perception of "threat" could not be abandoned even when social Catholicism came to the forefront in the 1960s. The rising voices against the Franco regime as well as the failure of Francoist policies put the Spanish Church in a tough position and made it as illegitimate as Franco's. Even though the Second Vatican Council created a changing trend, the Spanish Church never dared to directly contradict the regime. One of the reasons of the Church's failure could also be seen in its overlook of the persecutive character of the official ideology as it chose to focus on its Catholic tendency. It can be held as an indicator of its apathy towards below and its arrogance as a part of the state organization.

On the other hand, the stance of the Catalan Catholic Church during the Franco period has divergent dynamics and bases. Since the nineteenth century, particularly with the systematization of the Catalan nationalism after the 1898 disaster, the Catalan Church had embraced Catalanism unlike Spanish Church's attitude towards the Spanish nationalism. The reason why the Catalan Church had been sympathetic with the Catalan cause was that contrary to its Spanish counterpart, it had a perception of threat from the masses, from "below". Civil society was stronger in Catalonia unlike in wider Castilian territory and due to the impact of the economic failure brought by 1898 disaster along with the linguistic and cultural persecution, Catalanist sentiments had found an opportunity to penetrate into masses.[473] Widespread support of the masses for the Catalan nationalism together with the existence of a secularized society posed a threat to the Catalan Church's position in Catalonia, leading it to adopt a society-based strategy in contrast with the Spanish Catholic Church's state-centered policies.

The adoption of Catalan nationalism and the perception of threat from below helped the Catalan Catholic Church hold the concept of "victimization" which had been utilized by the Catalanist movements and become a legitimate base

---

[473] Balcells, *Catalan Nationalism,* p. 43.

for further action. Between 1939 and 1975, due to the persecution of Catalan nationalism, the Catalan Catholic Church too positioned itself as a "victim". This perception of "victim Church" (which was also embraced by the Spanish Church with different dynamics referring to the anticlerical tendency of the Second Republic) along with the threat of exclusion from below and its characteristic as a "Catalan" Church enabled it to be a dissident either explicitly or implicitly during the Franco's dictatorship unlike Spanish Catholic Church.

In spite of the high level of pressure and sanctions over the Catalan language and culture during the Francoist era, Catalan continued to be spoken by the vast majority of people. Imposing Castilian as the language of catechism irritated the Catalans renewing the Catalan Church's perception of threat from below instead of identifying it with the state.[474] This situation significantly, pushed the Catalan Church to be both Catalan and Catholic if not more Catalan than Catholic. In a Catalanized and politicized region in which the working class and middle class were rather active, the loss of the support of those layers were more of a threat than the state.

The discrepancy between the perceptions of threat made the Spanish Catholic Church adopt the state policies under the influence of National-Catholicism which aimed at Catholicize the people while the Catholic Church in Catalonia adopted Catalanization. The victimization of the Catalan nationalism brought the Catalan Church to the forefront as the carrier of Catalanism under the persecution by the Franco regime, bringing therefore a considerable prestige to the Catalan Catholic Church. Unlike the Spanish Church, the adoption of the Catalan nationalism due to threat from below made the Church revolutionary. For the statist Spanish Church, revolution was to be avoided and thanks to Franco, there had remained no room for the revolutionary movements.

---

[474] Dowling, "For Christ and Catalonia", p. 146.

The alliance with the state helped the Spanish Church promote its position and allowed it to dominate the public schooling system, which became a tool for the Catholicization of children and youngsters in the framework of National-Catholicism.[475] Unlike in Catalonia, the Church and undoubtedly the Army became the holder of identity formation during the Franco period. For the Spanish Church, however, education of the youngsters as good Catholics was more important than educating them as good Spaniards. On the other hand, in Catalonia, the education was relatively secularized, which hindered the Catalan Church to intervene with the formation of the national identity. It paved the way for the attitude that the being Catalan was more crucial for the Catalan Church[476] that was the reflection of the difference in the threat perceptions.

The separation between the perceptions of threat as well as the respective churches' adoption of the Spanish and Catalan nationalisms also influenced the structure of those institutions. The Catalan Church's endorsement of Catalan nationalism and self-definition as "Catalan" provoked the popular classes and the Church itself to create an indigenous Church with its own figures, cults and symbols[477], which became another evidence that the perception of threat and the holding of nationalism had been a major factor in the distinction of the churches on the basis of "reaction" to the Franco regime. On the other hand, Spanish Church's alliance with the Franco's dictatorship helped official rhetoric to portray the regime as the ideal Catholic model of the Church-State relations and as the exemplification of the Catholic third way between liberal democratic capitalism and totalitarian socialism.[478] Unlike the Catalan Church, efforts to nationalize the Spanish Church could not be embraced by the Church, resulting in its inability to homogenize the country.

---

[475] Galva, *Futura grandeza de Espana*, p. 268.

[476] Humblebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* p. 358.

[477] Dowling, *For Christ and Catalonia,* p. 66.

[478] Casanova, "Church, State, Nation, and Civil Society in Spain and Poland", p. 108.

The efforts of the Catalan Church in the Catalanization process were the outcome of the alliance with popular classes on the basis of Catalan nationalism; thus it is not surprising that the Catalan Church put the Spanish Catholic fundamentalism aside and embraced the re-Christianization with the Catalan traditions. As a result, it can be inferred that two different nationalisms created two different Catholicisms. As a result, Catalan Catholic Church turned into a progressive, modern and Catalanized institution while the Spanish Catholic Church continued to serve as a traditional, statist and status quoist establishment during Franco period.

During the Francoist era, one of the reasons that the Spanish Catholic Church continued to ally with the state and ignored the "national" part of the official ideology was the archaic weakness of Spanish nationalist movement; the cultural creation continued to be limited to the elites and they did not undertake any effort to nationalize masses.[479] "Nationalization" meant only the persecution over Catalan and Basque nationalisms. Hence any kind of cultural activity was to ingratiate with the Franco regime. The discourses of being "Spaniard" remained idle; thus it was Catholicism which was sharpened rather than the national elements. On the contrary, the Catalan Church together with the Catalan nationalists utilized the ethnic constituents for the adoption by the masses. In other words, the cultural and nationalists elements were used in order to appeal to the below rather than above.

The distinct perceptions of threat can also be detected in the discourses which were embraced by the Spanish Church and the Catalan Church. Since the Spanish Catholic Church had been allied with the state, it associated itself with the state's discourse referring to the Catholic roots and separatist and communist "others", namely, Catalan nationalists and Republicans. Moreover, the Spanish Church also attributed a religious reference to the state's discourse

---

[479] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 24.

while the Catholic identity was sharpened with no regard to the "fatherland".[480] On the other hand, the Catalan Church, due to its closeness to the people, had embraced the discourse of the Catalan nationalists by underlining the victimization and the persecution from which the Catalan people had long been suffering.

This shows that even though the Spanish Catholic Church seemed more politicized due to its close relationship with the state, in fact the Catalan Church was more politicized during Franco's dictatorship. On the other hand, even though the Catalan Catholic Church could integrate into the Catalan politics thanks to its stance vis-a-vis the below, it could not be a decision-maker in the political arena. Despite its crucial role in Catalanism during the Franco period, the nationalist movement was dominantly secular; the Catholic identity did not turn out to be a part of the Catalan identity.[481] Catholicism was limited to the personal area due to the Church's adoption of the Catalan nationalism.

As it is mentioned, the distinction between the Spanish Catholic Church whose collocutor was the state and the Catalan Catholic Church whose was Catalan nationalism put them in different positions regarding politics during the dictatorship. To be a part of the state privileged the Spanish Catholic Church while creating a more heterogenous structure among the Spanish Catholics due to interests obtained from the government. For the Catalan Church, being an actor of the Catalan nationalism which had a widespread support among the Catalans helped to preserve a more solid position within the Catalan society since the victimization and Catalanism were the motivation of all the groups regardless of their political background in Catalonia.

---

[480] Junco, "The Formation of Spanish Identity", p. 24.

[481] Borja, de Riquer, "La societat catalana al final del regim franquista", *La transicio a Catalunya i Espanya,* Fundacio Doctor Lluis Vila d Abadal, Barcelona, 1997, p. 53.

With the end of Francoism and the re-introduction of democracy with the death of Franco in 1975, the Spanish Catholic Church, preserving its mentality of "threat from above", shifted from its Francoist stance to another inclination which resembled that of the Catalan Catholic Church. Even if it did not embrace the ideals of secularism and democracy, due to the re-emergence of its historical "accidentalist" policies as well as the loss of its institutional prestige in the eye of the people owing to being Francoist, the Spanish Church could not find an opportunity to raise its voice. On the other hand, the Catalan Church, thanks to its efforts on behalf of Catalan nationalism achieved to reverse anticlericalism to non-clericalism in the region. While the Catalan Catholic Church has promoted its image and reputation by pursuing a "standing-up-with-victim" policy, the Spanish Catholic Church is labelled as the co-conspirator of the persecutor. These contrasting attitudes paved the way for a striking contemporary paradox: a society which is secular by being preserved through Catholicism and a conservative society which has abandoned its Catholic identity.

REFERENCES

Abad, Alicia Mira & Mónica Moreno Seco, "Religion and Politics in the Mediterranean: An Historical Perspective", *History and Anthropology*, 18/3, 2007, pp. 275-290.

Acción Católica, 1 February 1941.

Afinoguénova, Eugenia, "'Unity, stability, continuity': heritage and the renovation of Franco's dictatorship in Spain, 1957–1969", International Journal of Heritage Studies, 16/6, 2010, pp. 417-433.

Alimbau, Jaume Reyner, *Catalunya, qüestio d'estat: vint-i-cinc anys d'independentisme catala 1968-1993,* Edicions El Medol, Barcelona, 1995.

Alvárez Bolado, Alfonso, *El experimento del nacional catolicismo*, Edicusa, Madrid, 1976.

Anderson, Benedict, (revised),*Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, Verso, London and New York, 1991, pp.1-46.

Anderson, John, "Catholicism and democratic consolidation in Spain and Poland", *West European Politics*, 26/1, 2003, pp. 137-156.

Andrés-Gallego, Jose, *¿Facismo o Estado Católico? Ideologia, Política, Religión y Censura en la España de Franco, 1937-1941*, Ediciones Encuentro, Madrid, 1997.

AragüezRubio, Carlos, "La nova canço catalana: genesis, desarollo y trascendencia de un fenomeno cultural en el segundo franquismo", *Pasado y memoria,* 5, 2006, pp. 81-97.

Arbeloa, Victor Manuel, *Aquella España Catolica,* Sigueme, Salamanca, 1975.

Armengou, Josep, *Justificacio de Catalunya,* Edicions de La Magrana, Barcelona 1979.

Artola, Miguel, *La España de Fernando VII,* Espasa, Madrid, 1999.

Balcells, Albert, Catalan Nationalism: Past and Present, edited and introduced by Geoffrey J. Walker, Palgrave, New York, 1996.

Balcells, Laia, "Mass Schooling and Catalan Nationalism", *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics*, 19/4, 2013, pp. 467-486.

Balcells, Albert, Enric, Pujol and Jordi, Sabater, *La Mancomunitat de Catalunya i l'autonomi,* Edicions Proa S.A., Barcelona, 1996.

Balfour, Sebastian, *Dictatorship, Workers, and the City: Labour in Greater Barcelona since 1939*, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1989.

Billings, Dwight B. and Scott, Shaunna L., "Religion and Political Legitimation", *Annual Review of Sociology*, 20, 1994, pp. 173-202.

Blazquez, Feliciano, *La traicion de los clerigos,* Editorial Trotta, Madrid, 1991.

Bollen, Kenneth, Medrano, Juan Diez, "Who are the Spaniards? Nationalism and Identification in Spain", *Social Forces*, 77/2, 1998, pp. 587-621.

Borja de Riquer, "La societat catalana al final del regim franquista", *La transicio a Catalunya i Espanya,* Fundacio Doctor Lluis Vila d Abadal, Barcelona, 1997) p. 53.

Braden, Charles S., "Church and State in Spain", *Church History*, 3/3, 1934, pp. 207-221.

Brubaker, Rogers, "Religion and Nationalism: Four Approaches", *Nations and Nationalism,* 18/1, 2012, pp. 2-20.

Cabana, Francesc, *Banca Catalana: Diario Personal,* S.A. Tibidabo Edicions, Barcelona, 1989.

Callahan, William J., "The Evangelization of Franco's 'New Spain'", *Church History*, 56/4, 1987, pp. 491-503.

Callahan, William J., *The Catholic Church in Spain, 1875-1998,* The Catholic University of America Press, Washington D.C., 2000.

Callahan, William J., "Was Spain Catholic?" *Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos*, 8/2, 1984, pp. 159-182.

Canal, Jordi, "El Estado Autonómico: Reflexiones Historicas sobre Cataluna y el Nacionalismo Catalan", *Cuadernos de Pensamiento Político,* 32, 2011, pp. 59-71.

Candel, Francesc, *Els altres Catalans vint anys despres,* Ediciones 62: Barcelona, 1985.

Cantero, Pedro, *La hora católica de España,* RUTA, Madrid, 1942.

Carles Cardo, Canon, *Les dues tradicions. Historia espiritual de las Espagnes,* Editorial Claret, Barcelona, 1994, p. 187-200.

Carr, Edward Hallett, *The Comintern and the Spanish Civil War,* Pantheon Books New York, 1984.

Carsten, Humlebaek, *Spain: Inventing the Nation,* (kindle version), Bloomsbery Academic, London, 2015.

Casanova, José and Sanchis, Marina, "España: de la Iglesia estatal a la separación de Iglesia y Estado", *Historia Social*, 35, 1999, pp. 135-152.

Casanova, José, "Church, State, Nation and Civil Society in Spain and Poland", *The Political Dimensions of Religion,* edited by Said Amir Arjomand*,* State University of New York Press, Albany, 1993.

Casanova, José, "Civil Society and Religion: Retrospective Reflections on Catholicism and Prospective Reflections on Islam",*Social Research*, 68/4, 2001, pp. 1041-1080.

Casanova, José , "Catholic and Muslim Politics in Comparative Perspective", paper presented at Taiwanese Political Science Association's International Conference on *Religion and Politics: A Holy But Controversial Affiliation at National Sun Yat-Sen University, Kaohsiung,* 2005*,* pp. 1-16.

Casanova, José, "Globalizing Catholicism and the Return to a "Universal" Church", in *Religion in the Process of Globalization,* Ergon Verlag, Wurzburg,2001, pp. 121-143.

Casanova, José, *Public Religions in the Modern World*, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 1994,pp. 75-92.

Casanova, José, "The Opus Dei Ethic and the Modernization of Spain", *Annual Review of the Social Science Information,* 22/1, 1983, pp. 27-50.

Casanova, Julián, *La Iglesia de Franco*, Ediciones Temas de Hoy, Madrid, 2001.

Christian, William A.,*Person and God in a Spanish Valley,* Princeton University Press, New York, 1972.

Clifford, Rebecca, Townson, Nigel, "The Church in Crisis", *Cultural and Social History*, 8/4, 2011, pp. 531-550.

Colomer, Jose Castaño, *La JOC en España 1946-1970,* Sigueme, Salamanca, 1978.

Conversi, Daniele, "Language or race? The choice of core values in the development of Catalan and Basque nationalisms", *Ethnic and Racial Studies,* 13/1, 1990, pp. 50-70.

Conversi, Daniele, *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain: Alternative Routes to Nationalist Mobilization,* C. Hurst & Co. Ltd., London, 1997.

Costa Pinto, António Elites, "Single Parties and Political Decision-Making in Fascist-Era Dictatorships", *Contemporary European History*, 11/3, 2002, pp. 429-454.

Cotton, Charles L., "Political Lineages in Catalonia, 1939-2014: From Dictatorship to Independence?", (published paper), pp. 1-20.

Cruz, Rafael, "Los estúdios sobre anticlericalismo en España al final del milenio", *Ayer*, 27, 1997, pp. 219-229.

Cuesta Bustillo, Josefina, "Estudios sobre el Catolicismo Social Español (1915-1930), Un Estado de la Cuestión", Studia Historica. Historia Contemporanea, 2, 2010, pp. 194-244.

"Declaration on Religious Freedom Dignitatıs Humanae on the Right of the Person and of Communities to Social and Civil Freedom in Matters Religious Promulgated by His Holiness Pope Paul VI", *Documents of the Second Vatican Council,* (1965), www.vatican.va/archive/hist_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651207_dignitatis-humanae_en.html (accessed: 23.03.2017).

"Documents of the Second Vatican Council", www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/index.htm (accessed: 23.03.2017).

Diaz Sanz, Benito, Quinones, Olga and Perez i Moragan, Francesc, "El sindicat democratic d'estudiants", *La oposicio universitaria al franquisme: Valencia 1939-1975,* Departamento de Derecho Constitucional y Ciencia Politica y de la Administracion, 2013, pp. 64-83.

Diffie, Bailey W., "The Ideology of Hispanidad", *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, 23/3, 1943, pp. 457-482.

Domke, Joan, "Education, Fascism, and the Catholic Church in Franco's Spain", (PhD Thesis)*,* 2011.

Dowling, Andrew, "For Christ and Catalonia: Catholicism, Catalanism and the Origins of Convergencia i Unio 1939-1975", (PhD Thesis), 1999.

Dowling, Andrew, "For Christ and Catalonia: Catholic Catalanism and Nationalist Revival in Late Francoism", *Journal of Contemporary History*, 47/3, 2012, pp. 594-610.

Dowling, Andrew, "The Catholic Church in Catalonia. From Cataclysm in the Civil War to the "Euphoria" of the 1950s", *Catalan Review*, 20, 2006, p. 83-100.

Dowling, Andrew, "The Reconstitution of Political Catalanism 1939–75", *International Journal of Iberian Studies*, 14/1, 2001, pp.17-25.

Edles, Laura Desfor, "A Culturalist Approach to Ethnic Nationalist Movements: Symbolization and Basque and Catalan Nationalism in Spain", *Social Science History*, 23/3, 1999, pp. 311-355.

Ehrlich, Charles E**.,** "Federalism, regionalism, nationalism: A century of Catalan political thought and its implications for Scotland in Europe", *Space and Polity*, ½, 1997, pp. 205-224.

Escalzo, José Luis Martin, *Tarancon, el cardenal del cambio,* Planeta, Barcelona, 1982, pp. 116-117.

Escarré, Aureli M.,*La Federació de Joves Cristians de Catalunya. Contribució a la seva història*, Nova Terra, Barcelona, 1972.

Escudero, Jose Maria Garcia, "La autocrítica religiosa", in *Catolicismo español: aspectos actuales,* RUTA, Madrid, 1955, p. 128.

Escudero, Jose Maria Garcia, "La eficacia del catolicismo español", in *Catolicismo espanol: aspectos actuales,* Madrid, 1955*,* pp. 107-116.

Espinosa, Losada, "La Iglesia que vive el Concilio Vaticano II", p. 50.

Etherington, John, "Nationalism, nation and territory: Jacint Verdaguer and the Catalan Renaixença", *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 33/10, 2010, pp. 1-32.

Ethnic Challenges to the Modern Nation State, (edited by Shlomo Ben-Ami and Yoav Peled and Alberto Spektorowski), Macmillan Press Ltd, London, 2000, pp. 95-108.

Fernandez, Jose Maria Magaz, "Los Partidos Católicos Durante el Regimen de Franco", in *Los Partidos Confesionales Espanoles,* Facultad de Teologia San Damaso, Madrid, 2010, pp. 119-141.

Fradera, Josep Maria, "Rural traditionalism and conservative nationalism in Catalonia 1865-1900", *Family, Class and Nation in Catalonia,* Mare Nostrum Editions, London, 1990, pp. 51-71.

Frye, Timothy M., "Rethinking Nationalism and Sovereignty", *Journal of International Affairs*, 45/2, 1992, pp. 599-623.

Fusi Aizpurúa, Juan Pablo, *España. La Evolución de la Identidad Nacional*, Ediciones de Temas Hoy, Madrid, 2000.

Fusi Aizpurúa, Juan Pablo, "La Aparición de los Nacionalismos", *Revista del Centro de Estudios Constitucionales,* 11/2, 1992, pp. 181-194.

Galva, Enrique Lopez, *Futura grandeza de Espana segun notables profecias,* Imp. Moret, La Coruna, 1941.

Gellner, Ernest, *Nations and Nationalism* Blackwell, Oxford, 1983, pp. 1-7, 39-62.

Gill, Anthony, *Rendering Unto Ceasars: The Catholic Church in Latin America,* New York University Press, New York, 2011.

Gómez Roda, Alberto, Campos Saz, Ismael "Politics and Society: Valencia in the Age of Franco", *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies*, 75/5, 1998, pp. 157-185.

Greenfeld, Liah, *Nationalism: Five Roads to Modernity,* Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Mass. and London, 1992, pp. 3-26.

Greenfeld, Liah, "The Emergence of Nationalism in England and France," *Research in Political Sociology,* 5, 1991, pp. 333-370.

Greenfeld, Liah, "The Modern Religion?", *Critical Review*, 10, 1996, pp. 169-191.

Greer, Scott L., "Who negotiates for a nation? Catalan mobilization and nationhood before the Spanish democratic transition, 1970–1975", *Democratization*, 23/4, 2016, pp. 613-633.

Groves, Tamar, Milito Barone, Cecilia, "Imagining a Democratic Future, Forgetting a Worrisome Past: Educational Policy, School Textbooks, and Teachers under the Franco Regime"*, War & Society*, 33/1, 2014, pp. 43-58.

Guibernau, Montserrat, *Catalan Nationalism Francoism, transition and Democracy*, Routledge, London and New York, 2004.

Guibernau, Montserrat, "Nationalism and Intellectuals in Nations without States", *Political Studies*, 48, 2000, pp. 989-1005.

Guibernau, Montserrat, "Spain: Catalonia and the Basque Country", *Parliamentary Affairs*, 53/1, 2000, pp. 55-68.

Hayes, Carlton J. H.,*Milliyetçilik Bir Din: Batı Siyasal Düşüncesinde "Ulusalcılık" Tasavvuru*, (İstanbul: İz Yayıncılık, 2010).

Harrison, Joseph, *The Spanish Economy in the Twentieth Century,* Palgrave Macmillan, London and Sydney, 1985, p. 146-163.

Hastings, Adrian, *The Construction of Nationhood: Ethnicity, Religion and Nationalism,* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1997*,* pp. 1-35, 167-210.

Hemingway, Ernest, *Çanlar Kimin İçin Çalıyor?,*Bilgi Yayınevi, İstanbul, 2006.

Hobsbawm, Eric, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1990, pp.1-45.

Hroch, Miroslav, "From National Movement to Fully Fledged Nation", *Mapping the Nation,* New Left Review, London, 1996, p. 75-100.

Höllinger, Franz, Haller, Max, Valle-Höllinger, Adriana, "Christian Religion, Society and the State in the modern World", *Innovation: The European Journal of Social Science Research*, 20/2, 2007, pp. 133-157.

Hugh, Thomas, *The Spanish Civil War*, Penguin, New York, 1961.

Jacobson, Stephen, "Law and Nationalism in Nineteenth-Century Europe: The Case of Catalonia in Comparative Perspective", *Law and History Review*, 20/2, 2002, pp. 307-347.

Janue i Miret, Mauricio, "El fracaso del Sexenio en Cataluña", in Rafael Serrano Garcia (ed.), *España 1868-1874. Nuevos enfoques sobre el Sexenio Democratico,* Junta de Castilla y Leon, Valladolid, 2002.

Joaquin Luis, Ortega, "La Iglesia Española desde 1939 hasta 1975", *Historia,* 5/2, 1979, pp. 665-714.

Johnson, Hank, *Tales of Nationalism, Catalonia 1939-1979,* Rutgers University Press, New Jersey, 1991, p. 57-70.

Johnston, Hank, Figa, Jozef, "The Church and Political Opposition: Comparative Perspectives on Mobilization against Authoritarian Regimes", *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 27/1, 1988, pp. 32-47.

Johnston, Hank, "Toward an Explanation of Church Opposition to Authoritarian Regimes: Religio-Oppositional Subcultures in Poland and Catalonia", *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 28/4, 1989, pp. 493-508.

Junco, José Álvarez, "El nacionalismo español: las insuficiencias en la acción estatal", *Historia Social*, 40, 2001, pp. 29-51.

Junco, José Álvarez, "La nación posimperial. España y su laberinto identitario, Historia Mexicana", *México e Hispanoamérica*, 53/2, 2003, pp. 447-468.

Junco, José Álvarez, "The Formation of Spanish Identity and Its Adaptation to the Age of Nations", *History and Memory*, 14/1-2, 2002, pp. 13-36.

Kamen, Henry, *Imagining Spain: Historical Myth & National Identity,* Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2008.

Keating, Michael, *Nations against the State The New Politics of Nationalism inQuebec, Catalonia and Scotland*, Macmillan Press Ltd, London, 1996, pp. 1-63, 115-160, 217-230.

Laboa, Juan Maria, "España por el Papa", *XX Siglos*, 1/1, 1990, p. 47-64.

Laitin, David D., "Linguistic Revival: Politics and Culture in Catalonia", *Comparative Studies in Society and History,* 31/2, 1989, pp. 297-317.

Langdon-Davis, John, *Darrere les Barricades*, Angle Editorial, Barcelona, 2009.

Lannon, Frances, *Privilege, Persecution, Prophecy. The Catholic Church in Spain 1875-1975*, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1987.

Linz, Juan J., "Church and State in Spain from the Civil War to the Return of Democracy", *Daedalus*, 120/3, 1991, pp. 159-178.

Linz, Juan J.,*Totaliter ve Otoriter Rejimler*, Liberte, Ankara, 2012.

Linz, Juan J., "Religion and Politics in Spain: From Conflict to Consensus above Cleavage", *Social Compass,* 27/2-3, 1980, pp. 255-277.

Linz, Juan J., "State building and nation building", *European Review*, 1/4, 1990, pp. 355-369.

Llorens i Vila, Jordi, "El foment catalanista. Els inicis de l'associacionisme catalanista popular", *L'Avenç: Revista de historia i cultura,* 217, 1997, pp. 6-10.

Loff, Manuel, "Dios, Patria, Autoridad: la Iglesia Católica y la fascistización de los regímenes ibéricos", *Espacio, tiempo y Forma, Serie V, Historia Contemporánea,* 25, 2013,pp. 49-66.

Loureiro, Angel G., "Spanish nationalism and the ghost of empire", *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies*, 4/1, 2003, pp. 65-76.

Louzao Villar, Joseba, "Catholicism Versus Laicism: Culture Wars and the Making of Catholic National Identity in Spain, 1898–1931", *European History Quarterly,* 43/4, 2013, pp. 657–680.

Madeley, John, "A framework for the comparative analysis of church–state relations in Europe", *West European Politics*, 26/1, 2003, pp. 23-50.

Madeley, John, Catholicism and nationalism: changing nature of party politics, *West European Politics*, 39/4, 2016, pp. 912-913.

Manent, Albert, *El moli de l'ombra. Dietari politic i retrats 1946-1975*, Edicions Destino, Barcelona, 1986, pp. 110-147.

Marfany, Joan-Lluis, "The Catalan Question Revisited: On Lodares, a Dubious 'Linguistic Community and Imaginary Threats to It", *Bulletin of Spanish Studies,* 83/7, 2006, pp. 939-955.

Martin, David, *A General Theory of Secularization,* Gregg Revivals, Oxford, 1978.

Martínez Hoyos, Francisco, "Mayo del 68 y Los Catolicos Catalanes", *Hispania Sacra*, 131, 2013, pp. 425-445.

McRobert, Kenneth, *Catalonia: Nation-Building without a State",* OUP Canada, Ontario, 2001, pp. 21-45.

Massot i Muntaner, Josep, *L'esglesia catalana al segle XX,* Curial, Barcelona, 1975.

Massot i Muntaner, Josep, *L'esglesia catalana entre la guerra i la post guerra,* Rafael Dalmau, D.L., Barcelona, 1978.

Mediterranean Fascism, 1919-1945, edited byCharles F. Delzell, The Macmillan Press LTD, New York, 1971, pp. 257-329.

Medrano, Juan Díez, "Patterns of Development and Nationalism: Basque and Catalan Nationalism before the Spanish Civil War", *Theory and Society*, 23/4, 1994, pp. 541-569.

Memoria sobre les activitats del "Grup Torras i Bages" durant el curs 1949-1950, Biblioteca de Montserrat, Montserrat, 1950.

Mir Curcó, Conxita, "El estudio de la represión franquista: una cuestión sin agotar", *Ayer*, 43, 2001, pp. 11-35.

Molinero Ruiz, Carme and Ysàs, Pere, "La historia social de la época franquista. Una aproximación", *Historia Social*, 30, 1998, pp. 133-154.

Monfort i Coll, Aram "Los Campos de Concentracion Franquistas y Su Funcionamiento en Cataluña", *Revista Española de Historia*, 231, 2009, pp. 147-178.

Montero, Feliciano "Autocríticas del Nacionalcatolicismo en los Años Cincuenta", *Historia del Presente,* 5, 2005, pp. 139-162.

Montero, Feliciano, "La historia de la Iglesia y del catolicismo español en el siglo XX. Apunte historiográfico", *Ayer,* 51, 2003, pp. 265-282.

Montero, Feliciano, *La Iglesia: De La Colaboración a La Disidencia (1956-1975),* Encuentro, Madrid, 2009.

Muñoz Soro, Javier, "Despues de la Tormenta. Accion Politica y Cultural de los Intelectuales Catolicos entre 1956 y 1962", *Historia y Política*, 28, 2012, pp. 83-108.

Muro, Diego, Quiroga, Alejandro, "Spanish nationalism", *Ethnicities*, 5/1, 2005, pp. 9-29.

Muñoz, Xavier, *L'economia com a experienciadiaria a Catalunya,* Edicions 62, Barcelona, 1984, p. 30-46.

Nairn, Tom, *Milliyetçiliğin Yüzleri: Janus'a Yeni Bir Bakış,* İletişim Yayıncılık, İstanbul, 2015.

Nationalism and the Nation in the Iberian Peninsula: Competing and Conflicting Identities, edited by Clare Mar-Molinero and Angel Smith, Bloomsbury Academic, London and Oxford, 2008.

Navedo Pérez**,** Francisco Javier, "Los Nacionalismo y la Oposicion Durante el Franquismo", *Panta Rei,* 3/1, 1997*,* pp. 79-83.

Rendon, Silvio, "The Catalan premium: language and employment in Catalonia", *Journal of Population Economics*, 20/3, 2007, pp. 669-686.

Orwell, George, *Katalonya'ya Selam,* BGST Yayıncılık, İstanbul, 2011.

Payne, Stanley G., "Catalan and Basque Nationalism", *Journal of Contemporary History*, 6/1, 1971, pp. 15-33, 35-51.

Payne, Stanley G.,*Fascism. Comparison and Definition*, The University of Wisconsin Press, Wisconsin, 1980.

Payne, Stanley G*., Fascism in Spain 1923-1977*, The University of Wisconsin Press, Wisconsin, 1999.

Payne, Stanley G, "Nationalism, Regionalism and Micronationalism in Spain", *Journal of Contemporary History,* 26/3-4, 1991, pp. 479-491.

Payne, Stanley G., Palacios, Jesús, *Franco A Personal and Political Biography*, The University of Wisconsin Press, Wisconsin, 2014.

Payne, Stanley G., *Spain: A Unique History*, The University of Wisconsin Press, Wisconsin, 2011.

Payne, Stanley G.,*Spanish Catholicism: An Historical Overview,* The University of Wisconsin Press, Wisconsin, 1984.

Payne, Stanley G., "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century", *The Review of Politics*, 26/3, 1964, pp. 403-422.

Pérez-Agote, Alfonso, "Sociologia Historica del Nacional-Catolicismo Español"**,** *Historia Contemporánea,* 26, 2003, pp. 207-237.

Phillips Jr., William D. and Phillips, Carla Rahn, *A Concise History of Spain,* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2010.

Philpott, Daniel, "The Catholic Wave", *Journal of Democracy*, 15/2, 2004, pp. 32-46.

Plenn, Abel, *Wind of Olive Trees: Spain From Inside*, Kessinger Publishing, New York, 1946.

Pi-Sunyer, Oriol, "The Maintenance of Ethnic Identity in Catalonia", *Research Report 09: The Limits of Integration: Ethnicity and Nationalism in Modern Europe.* Paper 5, 2008.

Pollard, John, ''Clerical Fascism': Context, Overview and Conclusion", *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions*, 8/2, 2007, pp. 433-446.

Preston, Paul, *The Politics of Revenge: Fascism and the military in twentieth-century Spain*, Routledge, London and New York, 1995.

Pujol, Jordi, *Memòries, Historia D'Una Conviccio, 1930-1980,* Edicions 62, Barcelona, 2007.

Raguer, Hilari, 'El grup "Torras i Bages", unpublished article, Biblioteca de Montserrat, Montserrat,cited inDowling, Andrew, *For Christ and Catalonia*, p. 80.

Rego, Chao, *La Iglesia en el franquismo,* Ediciones Felmar, Madrid, 1976.

Rico, Juan Jose Ruiz, *El papel político de la Iglesia católica en la España de Franco, 1936-1971,* Tecnos, Madrid, 1977.

Rokkan, Stein, Unwin, Derek W., "Centers and Peripheries" in Western Europe in *The Politics of Territorial Identity: Studies in European Regionalism*, SAGE Publications, London, 1983.

Rokkan**,** Stein, *Centre-Periphery Structures in Europe: an ISSC Workbook in Comparative Analysis,* Campus, Frankfurt, 1987.

Rokkan, Stein, *State Formation, Nation-building, and Mass Politics in Europe: the Theory of Stein Rokkan,* Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1999.

Rooney, Nicola, "The role of the Catholic hierarchy in the rise to power of General Franco" in Issue 4 of Quest of 'Perspectives on Power' Conference, p. 4.

Sanchez Erauskin, Javier, "El nacionalcatolicismo como instrumento cultura y legitimador del franquismo en el Pais Vasco (1936-1945)", *Vasconia*, 27, 1998, pp. 235-244.

Santiago, José, From "Civil Religion" to Nationalism as the Religion of Modern Times: Rethinking a Complex Relationship", *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 48/2, 2009, pp. 394-401.

Saz, Ismael**, *España contra España: Los Nacionalismos Franquistas,* Marcial Pons, Madrid, 2003.

Serrano, Canales, Francisco, Antonio, "El Robo de la memoria. Sobre el lugar del franquismo en la historiografía católico-catalanista, *Ayer,* 5, 2005, p. 276.

Shobe, Hunter, "Place, identity and football: Catalonia, Catalanisme and Football Club Barcelona, 1899–1975", *National Identities*, 10/3, 2008, pp. 329-343.

Smith, Angel, *Origins of Catalan Nationalism, 1770-1898,* Palgrave, London, 2014.

Smith, Anthony, *The Ethnic Origins of Nations*, Blackwell, Oxford and Cambridge 1986, pp. 6-18.

Smith, Anthony, "The 'Sacred' Dimension of Nationalism," *Millennium: Journal of International Studies,* 29/3, 2000, pp. 791-814.

Sobrino, Joseba Inaki, "El Secesionismo Vasco (O Catalan) y la Moral Catolica, *Hermes,* 49, 2015, pp. 10-33.

Stevens, David, "Nationalism as Religion", *An Irish Quarterly Review*, 86/343, 1997, pp. 248-258.

Storm, Eric, "El Nacionalismo Español de los Intelectuales: Unamuno, Costa y Ganivet", in *En Torno al 98,* Universidad de Huelva, Huelva, 2000, pp. 389-403.

The Spanish Civil War (1-6), https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LhbiOIFR774&index=4&list=PL4w-2j6Q0Qj4iJ7GmEoQGWMUBeE5h1GVq. (accessed: 26.07.2017)

Thomas, Hugh, "The Hero in the Empty Room: Jose Antonio and Spanish Fascism", *Journal of Contemporary History*, 1/1, 1966, pp. 174-182.

Torrecilla, Jesús, "Spanish Identity: Nation, Myth, and History,"*Studies in 20th & 21st Century Literature,* 33/2, 2009, pp. 204-226.

Torres Santacana, Carles, "Europeísmo y catolicismo en el discurso cultural y político catalán de la posguerra", *Cercles. Revista d'història cultural*, 26/14, 2011, pp. 25-37.

Tusell, Javier, *Spain: From Dictatorship to Democracy: From 1939 to the Present*, translated by Rosemary Clark, Blackwell Publishing, Oxford, 2007.

Tusell, Javier, *Franco y los católicos. La Politica Interior Española entre 1945 y 1957,* Alianza Universidad, Madrid, 1990.

Tusell, Javier, *La Dictadura de Franco,* Alianza, Madrid, 1988

Ucelay-Da Cal, Enric, "Violencia simbólica y temática militarista en el nacionalismo radical catalán", *Ayer*, 13, 1994, pp. 237-264.

Ullmann, Joan Connelly, *The Tragic Week: A Study of Anticlericalism in Spain 1872-1912,* Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1972.

Vilar, Pierre, *Historia de España,* Critica, Paris, 1971.

Vilar, Sergio, *La naturaleza del franquismo,* La Esfera de Los Libros, Madrid, 1977.

Vilarós,Teresa M., "The Passing of the Xarnego-Immigrant: Post-Nationalism and the Ideologies of Assimilation in Catalonia", *Arizona Journal of Hispanic Cultural Studies*, 7, 2003, pp. 229-246.

Villar, Camara Gregorio, *Nacional-catolicismo y escuela: Socialización Política del franquismo, 1936-1951,* Hesperia D.L., Jaen, 1984.

Vallier, Ivan, "The Roman Catholic Church: A Transnational Actor", *International Organization*, 25/3, 1971, pp. 479-502.

Verdera, Albinana Francisco, *Conflictos entre la Iglesia y el Estado en España. La Revista Ecclesia Entre 1941 y 1945,* Eunsa, Navarra, 1995.

Warner, Marina, *Alone of all Her Sex: the Myth and Cult of the Virgin Mary,* Picador, London, 1985.

Weber, Max, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, translated by Talcott Parsons, Routledge, London and New York, 1992.

Yfante**,** Jesús, *La prodigiosa aventura del Opus Dei: genesis y desarollo de la Santa Mafia,* Ruedo Iberico, Paris, 1970.

Özkırımlı, Umut, *Theories of Nationalism: A Critical Introduction,* Palgrave Macmillan, New York, 2010.

APPENDICES

A. TURKISH SUMMARY/TÜRKÇE ÖZET

Din ve milliyetçilik arasındaki ilişki gerek İspanya'nın gerekse Katalonya'nın tarihinde önemli ve şekillendirici bir role sahip olmuştur. Özellikle Katolik Kilisesi'nin İspanyol ve Katalan milliyetçiliğine karşı tutumu, söz konusu kurumun hem politik hem de sosyal bir aktör olarak davranışlarını etkilemiştir. Katolik Kilisesi'nin milliyetçilik ile olan ilişkisi, hem İspanya hem de Katalonya'da milliyetçiliğin ve kimliklerin oluşumu ve gelişimi sürecinde etkili olan bir aktör olarak ele alınabilir. Ek olarak, her iki bölgedeki sosyal ve politik yapının farklı dinamiklere sahip olması dolayısıyla Katolik Kilisesi'nin İspanya ve Katalonya'daki konumlanışı ve iktidar ile ilişkisi büyük farklılıklar göstermektedir. Söz konusu ilişki stabil ve lineer bir ilişki olmamıştır; özellikle politik ve ekonomik kriz zamanlarında (rejim değişimi yahut ekonomik çalkantılar) hem milliyetçiliğin hem de Katolik Kilisesi'nin politikalarının niteliğini değiştirmiştir. Buradan hareketle, bu çalışma bir politik ve sosyal kriz olarak nitelendirilebilecek olan Franco diktatörlüğü ve Katolik Kilisesi ilişkisine milliyetçiliği baz alarak odaklanmaktadır. Katolik Kilisesi genel olarak yekpare bir kurum gibi ele alınsa da, İspanya ve Katalonya'daki Katolik Kilisesi, kendilerini "İspanyol" ve "Katalan" Katolik Kilisesi olarak nitelemiştir. İspanyol Kilisesi Franco rejiminin müttefiki iken, Katalan Kilisesi ise rejime muhalif bir duruş sergilemiştir. Bu tez de söz konusu farklılığın sebebini farklı milliyetçilikler ve kimliklerin benimsenmesi olarak ele alıp, tarihsel arka planı da göz önünde bulundurarak karşılaştırmalı bir analiz yapmayı amaçlamaktadır.

Çalışmanın giriş bölümünde tezin konusu, konunun ele alınış şekli, teorik çerçevesi ve metodolojisi açıklanmaktadır. Konu ele alınırken bir kaç temel nokta belirlenmiştir. Öncelikle, İspanya'da bulunan Katolik Kilisesi, çalışmaların pek çoğunda birörnek hareket eden bir kurum olarak ele alınmış yahut ayrı ayrı ele

alınsalar bile bölgeler arası karşılaştırmalı bir çalışma yapılmamış ve bu nedenle kiliselerin iktidarla olan ilişkilerindeki farklılığın nedeni ortaya çıkarılmamıştır. Ancak bu çalışma, Katolik Kilisesi'ni, transnasyonel bir kurum olarak kabul etmekle birlikte, bağlı olduğu bölgenin dinamiklerinden de etkilenen bir aktör olarak ele almaktadır. İkinci olarak, İspanyol ve Katalan kiliselerinin Franco rejimine verdiği tepkilerin farklılığının ana sebebi farklı milliyetçilikler ve kimlikler olarak ele alındığından ve din ve milliyetçilik arasındaki ilişki stabil devam etmediğinden, İspanya ve Katalunya özelinde din ve milliyetçilik ilişkisi verili olarak ele alınamamakta ve bu da tez konusunu problematize etmeye yardımcı olmaktadır. Üçüncü olarak, Franco rejimine İspanyol ve Katalan Kilisesi'nin verdiği tepkilerin farklılığının, kiliselerin milliyetçiliği benimseme derecelerinin farklılığı olması neticesinde İspanyol Kilisesi'nin devlet-merkezci, Katalan Kilisesi'nin ise toplum-merkezci olduğunu, bunun da sebebinin tehdidi sırasıyla "yukarıdan" ve "aşağıdan" algılamaları olduğunu göstermektedir. Bu çalışma, konuyu belirtilen bağlamlarda ele alan ilk çalışmadır. Çalışmada yapılan sınıflandırmalar, aktörler bazında hazırlanmış ve özellikle İspanyol ve Katalan milliyetçiliğinin oluşum ve kilisenin sürece dahil olmaları aktörlerin ortaya çıkışı ve etkileşimi temelinde detaylı olarak açıklanmıştır.

Tezin ikinci bölümünde, İspanya ve Katalunya'da Katolik Kilisesi ve milliyetçilik ilişkisinin daha iyi kavranabilmesi için öncelikle İspanyol milliyetçiliğinin tarihsel arka planı açıklanmıştır. Bu tarihsel arka plan aktörler temelinde şekillendirilmiş, böylece İspanyol milliyetçiliğinin bileşenleri ortaya konulmuştur. İspanyol milliyetçiliği iki temel aktörün, liberallerin ve gelenekselcilerin, İspanyol tarihini farklı şekillerde yeniden yorumlamaları şeklinde bir temelden yola çıkmıştır. Liberaller ve gelenekselciler daha sonra kendi içlerinde çeşitli fraksiyonlara ayrılmış olsalar da, bu fraksiyonlar birbirleri ile çatışmaya girmemişlerdir. Bahsedilen her iki grup da referans noktası olarak 1815'te Napoleon Bonaparte'ın İspanya'yı işgal etmesi ile ortaya çıkan "Napolyon Savaşı"nı seçmişlerdir. Her iki grup da bu savaşı "Bağımsızlık Savaşı" olarak yeniden adlandırmış; ancak liberaller bu mücadeleyi İspanyolların ezelden beri liberal olduğu ve haklarını savunduğu, gelenekselciler ise savaşın ateist bir düşmana karşı Katolik İspanyolların zaferi olarak yorumlamışlardır.

154

Bu yeniden yorumlama aynı zamanda liberallerin meclis ve anayasa temelli bir rejim, geleneksecilerin ise var olan monarşik sistemin korunması şeklinde ayrılıklara neden olmuştur.

Bu temel ayrım, İspanyol milliyetçiliğinin zayıf kalmasına ve gelişememesine yol açmıştır çünkü iki grup milliyetçiliği besleyecek marş, bayrak gibi temel öğeler üzerinde bile bir uzlaşmaya varılamamıştır. Bu ayrım ve zayıflık bir diğer aktör olan monarşi tarafından da tetiklenmiştir. Monarşi, İspanyol milliyetçiliği içerisinde bir katalizör olarak görev yapmıştır ve liberallerin milliyetçiliğini "devrimci" bir tehdit olarak algıladığından geleneksel bir tutum izlemiştir. Milliyetçiliğin aynı zamanda gerekli olmadığını da düşündüğünden, zamanla özellikle ekonomik olarak modernleşen devlette meşruiyet kaynağı ve devlet yapısı arasında bir uyuşmazlık çıkmasına sebep olmuştur. Ayrıca kendi meşruiyetini ve varlığını koruduğu için hem ordu hem de Katolik Kilisesi ile resmi olmayan bir ittifak içerisindedir.

Bu bölümde üçüncü aktör olarak orduya değinilmektedir. Ordu da geleneksiler ve monarşi gibi statükocudur ve en önemlisi her zaman politikanın içinde olmuştur. Aslında ordu gerçek anlamda milliyetçi değil "vatansever" olarak adlandırılabilir. Ancak özellikle 1898'de İspanya-Amerika Savaşı sonucunda son koloni olan Küba'nın da kaybedilmesiyle ülkede artan ayrılıkçı sesler ve ekonomik eşitsizlik nedeniyle oluşan sınıf çatışmaları, orduyu kendi politik çıkarlarını korumak adına geleneksel milliyetçiliğe yönlendirmiştir; ordu kendini "milletin" tek kurtarıcısı ve ulus-üstü bir kurum olarak lanse etmiş, İspanyol milletinin ve İspanya'nın kurtuluşu olarak otoriter bir rejimi tek yol olarak sunmuşlardır, bu da hem 1923'te darbe ile gelen General Primo de Rivera'nın hem de İç Savaş sonucu yönetimi ele geçiren General Franco'nun diktatörlüğüne giden yolu açmıştır.

Beşinci aktör olarak cumhuriyetçiler incelenmektedir. 1923'te yönetimi ele geçiren Primo de Rivera, 1931'de cumhuriyetçiler tarafından yenilgiye uğratılmıştır. Diğer gruplardan farklı olarak cumhuriyetçiler "İspanyol" vurgusu yapmamış, bölgeselliğe ve kültürel çeşitliliğe önem vermişlerdir. Bu bir yandan Katalan ve Bask özerkliğinin

yolunu açmış, öte taraftan cumhuriyetçilerin zaafı olmuştur çünkü kendi pozisyonlarını güçlendirecek, ideolojilerini yaygınlaştıracak milliyetçi semboller üretememişlerdir. Bu da altıncı aktör olarak İspanyol Falange'ının ortaya çıkmasına sebep olmuştur. Bahsi geçen aktörler içerisinde milliyetçi olarak nitelendirilebilecek tek aktör olan Falange demokrasi ve parti karşıtı bir oluşum olarak, İspanyol kimliğinin dominasyonunu, merkeziliği ve otoriter bir rejimi savunmuştur. Ülkedeki sorunların kaynağı olarak demokrasiyi görmüş, İspanya'nın ve İspanyolluğun zamandan azade ve kadim olduğunu iddia etmişlerdir. Cumhuriyetçiler ve liberaller dışında kalan tüm aktörler gibi, Falange da kendini Katolik olarak tanımlamıştır ancak Katolik Kilisesi'nin bir politik aktör olmasına şiddetle karşı çıkmıştır. İç Savaş esnasında da kendini "Milliyetçiler" olarak tanımlayan General Franco ve destekçileri ile cumhuriyetçilere karşı savaşmışlardır.

İspanyol Katolik Kilisesi ise tüm bu süreci etkileyen ve aynı zamanda daha çok süreçten etkilenen ayrı bir aktör olarak ele alınmaktadır. Kilise, Katolik inancının temelinde olmaktan ziyade politik ve sosyal olarak etkin olan bir kurum şeklinde analiz edilmektedir. Esasında Katolik Kilisesi, İspanyol milliyetçiliğini benimsemiş ve ona eklemlenmiş bir kurum olmaktan öte kendi çıkarları doğrultusunda politikalar izleyen bir yapı olmuştur. Katolik Krallar'dan bu yana monarşi Katolikliği ve Katolik Kilisesi'ni imtiyazlarla ödüllendirmiş, ona pek çok finansal ayrıcalık tanımıştır. Bu nedenle İspanyol Kilisesi çıkarlarını korumak adına devletle yakın ilişkiler kurmuş ve ona meşruiyet sağlamıştır. Monarşi milliyetçiliği "devrimci" bir hareket olarak gördüğünden, Kilise de aynı görüşü benimsemiş, özellikle liberal milliyetçilerin devlet ve Kilise'nin ayrılması ilkesine şiddetle karşı çıkmıştır. Aslında hem monarşi hem de gelenekselciler Kilise'yi politikadan ayrı, sadece din alanında sınırlandıran politikalara sahip olsalar da Kilise çıkarları nedeniyle bu politikalara itiraz etmemiştir. Rejimin liberal hükümetler tarafından değiştirildiği zamanlarda da Kilise "accidentalism" denilen, her ideolojiye ve rejime aynı şekilde eşit mesafede oldukları vurgusunu yapmıştır.

Kilisenin çıkarlarını korumak için devletle olan yakın ilişkisi tabandan uzaklaşmasına sebep olmuştur. Milliyetçilik ile olan mesafesi de geniş halk kitleleri ile "İspanyollaşma" temelinde bir araya gelememesine yol açmıştır. Bu sebeple Kilise kendisini ve kitleyi İspanyollaştırma çabası yerine söz konusu kitleyi ve tüm sosyal yapıyı "Katolikleştirme" politikası izlemiştir. Özellikle 1898'den sonra belirginleşen sınıf çatışmaları, ayrılıkçılık tehdidi, yükselen Marksizm ve sekülerlik dalgası ile birlikte Kilise, ordu ve monarşi ile daha yakın ilişkiler kurmuş, meşruiyet sağlamak için yükselen hareketleri "ateist" olarak nitelendirmiştir.

İkinci bölümde, Katalan milliyetçiliğini oluşturan aktörler analiz edilmektedir. İspanyol milliyetçiliğinin aksine Katalan milliyetçiliği dil ve kültür üzerinden, Katalan entelektüellerin girişimi ile inşa edilmiştir. Bu aktörler, İspanyol milliyetçiliğini oluşturan yahut etkileyen aktörlerden oldukça farklıdır; bu da iki kilisenin farklılaşmasına erken bir işaret olarak görülebilmektedir. Katalunya, bölge olarak İspanya'nın geri kalanından ekonomik ve sosyal anlamda çok daha ileride olduğu için, daha erken oluşan Katalan burjuvazisi Katalan milliyetçiliği için büyük önem taşımaktadır. Aslında merkezi bir yönetim Katalan burjuvazisi için avantajlı olduğundan, burjuvazi Katalan milliyetçiliğine başından itibaren destek vermemiştir. Ancak savaşlar, Katalanlar üzerine konulan ekstra vergiler, ticaret yapılan son koloninin kaybedilmesi, ekonomik dalgalanmalar yüzünden ortaya çıkan sınıf çatışmaları Katalan burjuvazisinin fikrini değiştirmiştir. Ekonomik üstünlüğe rağmen İspanyol diline ve kültürüne ikincil olarak görülmelerine tepki göstermişlerdir. Böylece burjuvazi, dil ve kültür çalışmalarına materyal bir temel sağlayarak hareketin gelişmesine katkıda bulunmuştur.

İkinci ve üçüncü aktörler olarak Romantik ve Modernist Katalan entelektüelleri açıklanmıştır. Katalan milliyetçiliğinin elementleri ve prensipleri bu aktörler sayesinde belirlenmiştir. İspanyol milliyetçiliğinden farklı olarak bu iki grup ortak değerlere sahiptir, her iki grup da Katalan dilini ve kültürünü yaymayı temel amaç ve prensip olarak benimsemiştir. Aralarındaki tek fark, romantik entelektüellerin Katalan milliyetçiliğini şehirli ve elitist yapıdan çıkaramamaları ve bu nedenle

milliyetçiliğin "burjuva" tandanslı olduğu algısı yaratmalarıdır. Modernistler ise daha politik bir tutum benimsemişler, daha savunmacı, federalist ve cumhuriyetçi prensipleri benimsemişlerdir.

Dördüncü aktör olarak muhafazakarlar ve cumhuriyetçiler ele alınmıştır. Bu aktörler özellikle 1898 Savaşı'ndan sonra güçlenmişler, politize olmuşlar ve Katalan milliyetçiliğinin organizasyonlar aracılığıyla kurumsallaşmasını sağlamışlardır. Bahsedilmesi gereken en önemli nokta ise muhafazakar milliyetçilerin Katolik olduklarını vurgulamalarına rağmen seküler yapı nedeniyle dini bir referansa başvurmak istemedikleridir. Öte yandan Lerroux önderliğindeki cumhuriyetçi milliyetçiler ise Katalan dilinin ve kültürünün özerkliğini vurgulamalarına rağmen merkezi bir devleti savunmuşlar, dini her türlü tandansa şiddetle karşı çıkmışlardır.

Beşinci olarak işçi sınıfı ve ayrılıkçılar milliyetçilik içinde önemli bir yere sahip aktörler olarak analiz edilmektedir. Özellikle Sovyetler Birliği kurulduktan sonra, ülkedeki ekonomik eşitsizlik sonucunda sınırları belirginleşen sınıflar ve Birinci Dünya Savaşı sonucunda özellikle Wilson'ın 14 İlkesi ile deklare edilen self-determinasyon ilkesi ve Balkanlarda oluşan devletler Katalan ayrılıkçılarına gayriresmi bir meşruiyet sağlamıştır. Ancak devletin buna cevabı bir askeri darbe ile (General Primo de Rivera Darbesi) olmuş, 1931'de ilan edilen İkinci Cumhuriyet de, Katalunya'ya özerklik getirmesine rağmen hem 1929 Büyük Buhranı'nın hem de Hitler ve Mussolini'nin yükselişi nedeniyle bir İç Savaş sonucu İkinci Cumhuriyet yerini Franco diktatörlüğüne bırakmıştır.

Bölgedeki Katolik Kilisesi de altıncı aktör olarak analiz edilmektedir. Aslında Katalunya'daki Katolik Kilisesi, Katalan milliyetçiliğinin yeşermeye başladığı zamanlarda milliyetçiliğe destek vermemiş, oldukça anti-liberal bir kurum durumundaydı. Ancak Katalan milliyetçiliği, daha geniş kitlelere hitap edebileceği Katalan dili ve kültürünü hareketin çekirdeği olarak belirleyip sistematize edince, Katolik Kilisesi de Katalan milliyetçiliğini göz ardı edemeyecek bir duruma geldi. Hareket alt sınıflara da yayılınca Kilise, tabandan kopup atıl kalmamak adına

Katalan milliyetçiliğine eklemlenmiştir. Milliyetçilik ve sivil toplum çok güçlü ve sekülerlik ve işçi hareketleri baskın olduğundan, İspanya Katolik Kilisesi'nin aksine, bölgedeki Katolik Kilisesi için asıl tehdit devlet değil alt sınıflardı.

Katalan milliyetçiliğine entegreolmasıyla birlikte, Katolik Kilisesi "Katalanlaşma"ya başlamıştır. Bu Katalanlaşma, Katalan milliyetçiliğinin beslendiği damar olan "mağduriyet"ten (dil ve kültür baskı altında olması, ekonomik olarak sömürülme, İspanyol dili ve kültürü tarafından domine edilme) Katalan Kilisesi'nin de aynı mağduriyetten beslenmesine olanak tanımıştır. Alt sınıflar radikalleştikçe Kilise de Katalan milliyetçiliğine olan desteğini artırmış, baskı politikalarına karşı gelmiştir. Daha "Katalan" bir hale gelmek için de domestik ve popüler öğelere (popüler Katoliklik Vatikan'ın ve İspanyol Kilisesi'nin onay vermediği bir şeydi çünkü Kilise dogmalarıyla çelişiyordu) yer vermeye ve bunları Katalanlığın sembolü haline getirmeye başlamıştır. Montserrat Manastırı ve "Black Madonna" Katalan milliyetçiliği için önemli kültler haline gelerek hareketin daha hızlı mobilize olmasına katkı sağlamıştır.

Çalışmanın üçüncü bölümü Franco döneminde İspanyol Katolik Kilisesi, milliyetçilik ve kilisenin rejimle olan ilişkisini analiz etmektedir. Kilisenin milliyetçilik ve rejim ile ilişkisi stabil olmadığından, Franco dönemi kilisenin değişen tutumuna göre periyotlara ayrılmıştır. İlk periyot olarak 1940-1960 aralığı belirlenmiştir. Bu dönem, Franco rejiminin "ulusal-Katoliklik" ideolojisini devletin resmi ideolojisi olarak belirlemesi ile başlamıştır. Bu da daha etnik temelli bir İspanyol milliyetçiliğine ve bunun ayrılmaz bir parçası olarak Katolikliğe vurgu yapmaktadır. Bu ideoloji sayesinde Katolik Kilisesi rejimle resmi bir simbiyotik ilişki kurmuştur; rejim Katolik Kilisesi'ne eğitim ve finansal alanda ayrıcalıklar verirken, kilise de rejime meşruiyet sağlamıştır. Eğitimde din eğitiminin zorunlu hale getirilmiş, kiliseye çıkarlarını korumak ve yerini sağlamlaştırmak adına "yeniden Katolikleştirme" politikasını uygulama alanı verilmiştir. "İki kusursuz topluluk" yani İspanyolluk ve Katoliklik böylece devlet ve kilise söyleminde yerini bulmuştur. Ancak rejim hem Katolikliği hem de Katolik Kilisesi'ni kendi çıkarları için bir araç

olarak kullanmıştır. Yani söz konusu ilişki Kiliseye sosyal prestijden çok maddi imkanlar kazandırmıştır. Yine bu dönemde ulusal semboller, dini sembollerle birleştirilmiş ve yayılmaya çalışılmıştır.

Rejimi oluşturan Falange gibi diğer gruplar ile Kilise arasında güç çekişmeleri de yaşanmıştır. Bu dönem için söylenebilecek en önemli şey İspanyol Kilisesi'nin tamamen politikleşmesi ve din alanına sınırlandırılmak istememesidir. İkinci Dünya Savaşı'nda faşist cephenin yenilmesiyle Franco "ulusal-Katoliklik"in Katolik kısmına vurgu yapmış ve uluslar arası bir prestij kazanmaya çalışmıştır; bu da kiliseye daha politik bir rol kazandırmıştır. Üzerinde durulması gereken bir diğer nokta ise kilisenin yarattığı paradokstur. İspanyol Kilisesi rejime verdiği desteği, İç Savaş boyunca cumhuriyetçi cepheden gördüğü zararla meşrulaştırırken, öte yandan rejimin muhalifler üzerindeki şiddeti ve baskısını tamamen görmezden gelmiştir. Yani tabanla olan mesafeli ilişkisini, elit bir karaktere bürünerek devam ettirmiştir. 1950'lerle birlikte, özellikle Franco rejiminin otarşik ekonomi modelinin işlevini yitirmesiyle işçi sınıfında oluşan memnuniyetsizlik kiliseyi tedirgin etmiştir ve kilisenin alt segmentlerinde sosyal sorunlara daha fazla eğilme talebine zemin hazırlamıştır. Sosyal Katolisizm geliştirilmeye çalışıldıysa da söz konusu hareket işçi sınıfına hitap edememiştir çünkü Kilise eski ve tarihte de işe yaramamış olan yöntemlerini kullanarak bir yenilik yaratmaya çalışmıştır.

İkinci periyot olarak 1961-1975 aralığı seçilmiştir. Bu dönemde kilisenin rejim ile ilişkisini etkileyen en önemli faktör İkinci Vatikan Konseyi (1962) olmuştur. Dünyadaki gelişmeler de göz önüne alınarak, Konsey'de tolerans, insan hakları ve özgürlük vurgusu yapılmıştır. Buna ek olarak, ekonomide liberal modele geçme çabaları, tüketim toplumunun oluşmasına sebep olmuş ve ulusal-Katoliklik ideolojisinde bir çözülme yaratmıştır. Vurgulanması gereken bir nokta da İspanyol Kilisesi'nin erken söylemlerinde referans olarak İç Savaş'ı seçmesi ve onu bir zafer şeklinde yorumlamasıdır. Konseyle birlikte bunun yanlışlığı görülmüş, artık savaş bir trajedi, ayrımı besleyen bir olay olarak anılmaya başlanmıştır. Kilise içerisinde bir grubun rejim karşıtı bir tutum benimsemesiyle birlikte, paradoksal olarak Franco

anti-klerikal bir pozisyon almıştır; bu da Katolikliğin rejim için bir araç olduğuna kanıt oluşturmuştur. 1970'lerle birlikte rejimin sona ereceği anlaşılınca Kilise "accidentalist"[482] kimliğine bürünse de, diktatörlüğe destek vermiş bir kurum olarak, tabandaki prestijini tamamen kaybetmiştir.

Çalışmanın dördüncü bölümünde, Katalan Katolik Kilisesi, milliyetçilik ve Franco rejimi arasındaki ilişki periyotlara ayrılarak incelenmiştir. İlk periyot olarak 1940lar ve 1950ler belirlenmiştir. Bu ilk dönemde Katalan Kilisesi, "ulusal-Katoliklik" ideolojisinden beslenmiş ve bu sayede savaş sonrasında kendini toparlayacak bir zaman ve ortam bulmuştur. Genel olarak Katolik Kilisesi, ülkedeki baskı ve yaptırım dalgasından en az etkilenen kurumdu ve görece bir özerkliğe sahipti. Ulusal-Katoliklik ile birlikte İspanyolca dışında tüm dillerin kamusal alanda kullanılması ve her türlü "farklı" kültürel faaliyet yasaklanmıştı. Katalancanın kullanılabildiği tek yer Katalan Katolik Kilisesi olduğundan, zaman içerisinde kilise, Katalan milliyetçiliği için tarihinde ilk bir barınak haline gelmiştir. Bunun başka bir sebebi de Katalan Kilisesi'nin Franco dönemi öncesinde Katalan milliyetçiliğine eklemlenmiş olması ve Katalanlaşması olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır.

1940'ların sonlarına doğru, Katalan Kilisesi içerisinde İspanyol Kilisesi'ne tabi olma durumuna bir tepki doğmuştur ve Katalan Kilisesi içerisinde bir kırılma yaşanmıştır. Bununla birlikte, kilise Katalan dini ritüellerini ve sembollerini (Montserrat Manastırı ve Black Madonna gibi) yeniden canlandırmış ve Katalanlığın bir simgesi haline getirmiştir. Dil ve kültür üzerine konulan baskı ters etki yaratmış ve milliyetçi faaliyetlerin kilise çatısı altında gizlice ancak güçlenerek devam etmesine neden olmuştur. Futbol, izci grupları gibi pek çok değişik alan Katalan kültürünü ve dilini yeni nesillere yaymak ve öğretmek için kullanılmıştır. 1950'lerle birlikte ekonomideki darboğaz ve ardından gelen liberalleşme, Katalan burjuvazisinin yeniden ortaya çıkmasına ve Katalan milliyetçiliğinde başrol oynamasına yol açmıştır.

---

[482] Kavram, kilisenin ideoloji ayırt etmeksizin her türlü rejim ve hükümete aynı ve eşit mesafede olması anlaımna gelmektedir.

İkinci periyot 1960-1975 arası olarak seçilmiştir. Bu dönem Katalan ekonomisinde bir patlamaya şahitlik etmiştir. Zaten var olan mağduriyet, ekonomik üstünlük ve kültürel ikincillik Katalan burjuvazisinin milliyetçiliğe desteğine artarak devam etmesine olanak sağlamıştır. Milliyetçi çabaların finansal olarak desteklenmesi harekete hız vermiş ve Katalan burjuvazisinin elini güçlendirmiştir. Yine bu dönemde kilisenin tabana destek olması ve onun çıkarına hareket etmesi sayesinde bölgedeki anti-klerikal tandans yok olmuştur. İkinci Vatikan Konseyi ile birlikte azınlık haklarına vurgu yapılması Katalan milliyetçiliğine bir meşruiyet sağlamıştır ve kiliseye olan düşmanlığın bitmesinde önemli bir dayanak haline gelmiştir.

Ancak ekonomik liberalleşme ile birlikte gelen tüketim toplumu, turizm ve bölgedeki maddi refahla birlikte seküllerliğin yeniden görünürlük kazanması kilisenin çabalarına ket vurmuştur. Özellikle "Nova Cançó" gibi popüler ve seküler oluşumlar geniş kitlelere daha kolay ve hızlı nüfuz etmenin öğeleri konumuna gelmiştir. Katalan burjuvazisi de Katolik olduğu vurgusu yapmasına rağmen, seküllerlik tandansından ödün vermemiştir. Bunlara rağmen kilise rejime destek vermemiş, kitleyle birlikte hareket ederek uyum sağlama yolunu seçmiştir. Bu dönemde Avrupa Ekonomik Topluluğu'na alınmamak, Katalan burjuvazisini kendi oluşumlarını kurmaya itmiş ve Avrupacılık vurgularını ön plana çıkarmıştır. 1975'te Franco öldüğünde, Katalan Kilisesi tabanı Katolikleştiremese de İspanyol Kilisesi'nin aksine prestijini artırmış olarak demokrasiye eklemlenmiştir.

Çalışmanın sonuç bölümünde, İspanyol ve Katalan Kilisesi'nin rejimle olan ilişkilerindeki farklılığın nedenleri ve milliyetçilik ile olan ilişkisi analiz edilmektedir. Farklılığın esas sebebi iki kilisenin tehdit algılarının birbirinden farklı olmasıdır. İspanyol kilisesi çıkarlarını devletten sağladığı için tehdidi "yukarıdan" algılamış ve onunla yakın ilişkiler kurmuştur. Franco döneminde rejimle olan ittifakının sebebi olarak da bu gösterilebilir. Katalan Kilisesi ise politikleşen ve radikalleşen, sivil toplumun çok güçlü olduğu bir bölgede, tabanla çatışmayı göze alamamış bu nedenle onunla birlikte hareket etmiştir; diğer bir deyişle tehdidi "aşağıdan" algılamıştır. Franco döneminde de bu tutumunu değiştirmemiştir.

Milliyetçilik bağlamında bakıldığında, İspanyol milliyetçiliği zayıf kaldığı ve üst otoriteler tarafından sistematize edilmediği ve desteklenmediği için devlet ile olan simbiyotik ilişkisini de göz önünde bulundurarak İspanyol Kilisesi de İspanyol milliyetçiliğine mesafeli kalmıştır. Franco döneminde ulusal-Katoliklik ideolojisini benimsemesinin sebebi de yine bu ilişkinin temelinde yer alan maddi çıkarları olmuştur. Katalan Kilisesi ise Katalan milliyetçiliği hızlıca yayıldığı, sistematize olup çoğunluğa nüfuz ettiği için milliyetçi hareketlere eklemlenmiştir. Bu sayede de tehdit algıladığı tabandan kopmamıştır. Franco dönemi boyunca da Katalan kimliğinden, kimliğin "mağduriyet" imgesinden yararlanarak kendine yer edinmiştir. Böylelikle Franco döneminin sonunda ortaya bir paradoks çıkmıştır: seküler bir topluma sahip Katalunya'da kilise prestijini artırırken, kendini Katolik olarak tanımlayan İspanya'da kilise konumunu ve prestijini kaybetmiştir.

B. TEZ İZİN FORMU / THESIS PERMISSION FORM

ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences ☐

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Social Sciences ■

Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics ☐

Enformatik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Informatics ☐

Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Marine Sciences ☐

YAZARIN / AUTHOR

Soyadı / Surname : Doygun
Adı / Name : Pelin
Bölümü / Department : Uluslararası İlişkiler

TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (**İngilizce** / English) : The Catholic Church and Nationalism in Spain and in Catalonia During Franco Period

TEZİN TÜRÜ/ DEGREE**: Yüksek Lisans** / Master ■   **Doktora**/PhD ☐

1. **Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır. /** Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide. ■

2. **Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of **two year.** * ☐

3. **Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for period of **six months**. * ☐

* Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu Kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir.
A copy of the Decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.

Yazarın imzası / Signature   **Tarih** / Date