CLASSIFICATION OF MIGRAINEURS USING FUNCTIONAL NEAR INFRARED SPECTROSCOPY DATA

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF INFORMATICS OF THE MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

 $\mathbf{B}\mathbf{Y}$

YUSUF SAYITA

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF MEDICAL INFORMATICS

FEBRUARY 2012

CLASSIFICATION OF MIGRAINEURS USING FUNCTIONAL NEAR INFRARED SPECTROSCOPY DATA

Submitted by **YUSUF SAYITA** in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of **Master of Science in Medical Informatics, Middle East Technical University** by,

Prof. Dr. Nazife Baykal Director, Informatics Institute, METU		
Assist. Prof. Dr. Didem Gökçay Head of Department, Medical Informatics, ME	ETU	
Assist. Prof. Dr. Alptekin Temizel Supervisor, Work Based Learning, METU		
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ata Akın Co-Supervisor, Biomedical Engineering, Boğa	ziçi University	
Examining Committee Members:		
Assist. Prof. Dr. Didem Gökçay Medical Informatics, METU		
Assist. Prof. Dr. Alptekin Temizel Work Based Learning, METU		
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ata Akın Biomedical Engineering, Boğaziçi University		
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ünal Erkan Mumcuoğlu Information Systems, METU		
Dr. Tolga Esat Özkurt Medical Informatics, METU		
	Date:	09.02.2012

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last name: Yusuf SAYITA

Signature: _____

ABSTRACT

CLASSIFICATION OF MIGRAINEURS USING FUNCTIONAL NEAR INFRARED SPECTROSCOPY DATA

SAYITA, Yusuf MSc, Department of Medical Informatics Supervisor: Assist. Prof. Dr. Alptekin Temizel Co-Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ata Akın

February 2012, 49 pages

Classification of migraineur and healthy subjects using statistical pattern classifiers on functional Near Infrared Spectroscopy (NIRS) data is the main purpose of this study. Also a statistical comparison between trials that have different type of classifiers, classifier settings and feature sets is done. Features are extracted from raw light measurement data acquired with NIRS device, namely Niroxcope, during two separate previous studies, using Modified Beer-Lambert Law. After feature extraction, Naïve Bayes classifier and k Nearest Neighbor classifier are utilized with and without Principal Component Analysis in separate trials. Results obtained are compared within each other using statistical hypothesis tests namely Mc Nemar and Cochran Q.

Keywords: Pattern Classification, Near Infrared Spectroscopy, Migraine

ÖΖ

MİGREN HASTALARININ İŞLEVSEL YAKIN KIZILALTI SPEKTROSKOPİSİ KULLANILARAK SINIFLANDIRILMASI

SAYITA, Yusuf

Yüksek Lisans, Sağlık Bilişimi Bölümü Tez Yöneticisi: Yard. Doç. Dr. Alptekin Temizel Ortak Tez Yöneticisi: Doç. Dr. Ata Akın

Şubat 2012, 49 sayfa

Migrenli ve sağlıklı örneklere ait verinin, işlevsel yakın kızıl altı spektroskopisi (YKAG) verisi üzerinde istatistiksel örüntü sınıflandırma yöntemleri kullanılarak sınıflandırılması bu çalışmanın ana amacıdır. Ayrıca, farklı sınıflandırma yöntemleri, farklı sınıflandırma yöntemi kurulumları ve farklı özellik setlerine sahip denemeler arasında istatistiksel karşılaştırma da yapılmıştır. Özellikler, Niroxcope adlı YKAG cihazı ile önceki iki çalışmada elde edilmiş olan işlenmemiş ışık verisinden, Düzenlenmiş Beer-Lambert Kanunu kullanılarak çıkartılmıştır. Özellik çıkartma işleminden sonra, Naive Bayes ve k Yakın Komşu sınıflandırıcıları, ayrı denemelerde, Başlıca Bileşke Analizi yöntemi ile birlikte ve ayrı olarak kullanılmıştır. Elde edilen sonuçlar, birbirleri arasında Mc Nemar ve Cochran Q isimli istatistiksel hipotez testleri kullanılarak karşılaştırılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Örüntü Sınıflandırma, Yakın Kızılaltı Görüngelemesi, Migren

To my family

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisors Assist. Prof. Dr. Alptekin Temizel and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ata Akın for their guidance and insight throughout my study.

I also want to thank Prof. Dr. Hayrünnisa Bolay Belen for her invaluable contribution and guidance on medical issues that I made use of in this thesis.

I would like to extend my appreciation to the scientists of Neuro-Optical Imaging Laboratory in Department of Biomedical Engineering, BOUN, who have kindly allowed me to use the findings obtained in two of their studies.

It has been an amazing opportunity for me to have "The Master" Güçlü Ongun on my side as the first person to seek help from for any problems that I encountered in many years. My friends Alper Çevik and Özge Kaya were kind enough to cover me at work during the busiest days of my life which enabled me to complete this thesis. Also all members of the Hemosoft Team were very understanding and supportive throughout the whole period.

I would like to thank my mother, uncles, grandparents and the rest of my family for their continuous and never-ending support throughout my life and tolerating any negativity that stemmed from me.

My dearest friends, Ahmet Erdem Küçükoğlu, Ufuk Satır, Barış Mutlu and Emre Sakabaş were always there for me for which I am most grateful.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	iv
ÖZ	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
CHAPTERS	

1. INTRO	DDUCTION	1
1.1.	Literature Review	2
1.2.	Motivation	3
2. DATA	ACQUISITION	5
2.1.	Spectroscopic Measurement	5
2.2.	Oxy Hemoglobin (HbO2) and De-oxy Hemoglobin (Hb) Calculation	6
2.3.	Oxy and De-oxy Hemoglobin Measurement from Live Tissue	9
2.4.	Niroxcope	. 10
2.5.	Dataset 1	. 12
2.6.	Dataset 2	. 16
3. FEATU	URE EXTRACTION AND CLASSIFICATION	. 22
3.1.	Feature Extraction	. 22
3.2.	Classification	. 23

4. RESU	LTS AND COMPARISON OF TRIALS	
4.1.	Classification Results of Dataset 1	
4.2.	Classification Results of Dataset 2	
4.3.	Statistical Hypothesis Tests	
4.4.	Statistical Inspection of Classification Results of Dataset 1	
4.5.	Statistical Inspection of Classification Results of Dataset 2	40
5. CONC	LUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK	
5.1.	Discussion	
5.2.	Contributions	44
5.3.	Future Work	44
REFERE	NCES	

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 (a) Absorption profile of Hb and HbO2 (Near-infrared window in bio	logical
tissue, 2011) (b) Absorption spectrum of water (Near-infrared window in bio	logical
tissue, 2011) (c) Comparison of absorbance's of melanin, water, Hb and	HbO2
(Delpy & Cope, 1997) (d) Absorption coefficients of Hb, HbO2 and cytochr	ome c
oxidase (Delpy & Cope, 1997)	7
Figure 2 Prefrontal Cortex Probe Layout	11
Figure 3 Basic Measurement Setup (Unlu, Bolay, & Akin, 2009)	11
Figure 4 Timeline of first study	13
Figure 5 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Control 14 and Migraineur 1 Subject	ets For
Dataset 1	14
Figure 6 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Control 14 and Migraineur 1 Subject	ets For
Dataset 1	15
Figure 7 Approximate timeline for second study	16
Figure 8 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Migraineur 1 Subject For Dataset 2	18
Figure 9 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Control 1 Subject For Dataset 2	19
Figure 10 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Migraineur 1 Subject For Dataset 2	20
Figure 11 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Control 1 Subject For Dataset 2	21
Figure 12 ROC Curve of Trial 12 for Dataset 1	31
Figure 13 ROC Curve of Trial 24 for Dataset 1	31
Figure 14 ROC Curve of Trial 42 for Dataset 1	32
Figure 15 ROC Curve of Trial 48 for Dataset 1	32
Figure 16 ROC Curve of Trial 28 for Dataset 2	36
Figure 17 ROC Curve of Trial 32 for Dataset 2	36
Figure 18 ROC Curve of Trial 64 for Dataset 2	37
Figure 19 ROC Curve of Trial 67 for Dataset 2	37

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Pattern classification methods have been utilized in medical classification and diagnostic problems since the very beginning of their evolution. The range of applications extends from speech, two/three dimensional images, to numeric data. Following the development of new diagnostic devices and technologies, fresh an uncharted data sources for these pattern classification methods have been constantly increasing. Using these new data sources, scientists have been able to develop new systems not only for offline data investigation and mining but also for online data analysis. Data gathered by functional systems such as functional magnetic resonance imaging, functional Doppler scanner and functional computer aided tomography have been fed to pattern classification systems and results of these studies have been used to shed light on how biological systems work, what are the main causes for diseases and how they can be cured.

In this study, series of experiments have been conducted to differentiate between patients suffering from migraine and healthy individuals using pattern recognition techniques on data acquired by functional near infrared spectroscopy (fNIRS).

Near infrared spectroscopy (NIRS) is a method which has been widely used in experimental medicine for the last twenty years (Villringer, Planck, Hock, Schleinkofer, & Dirnagl, 1993). It is based on the principle that light absorption coefficient varies for different types of molecules and for different wavelengths of light. Using the amount of light reflected back, measured by light sensors, and making use of the BeerLambert law reveals the amount of change in concentration of the required molecules, in the example case HbO2 and Hb (Hoshi, 2005).

Migraine is considered to be a neurovascular coupling disorder, which means that it is associated with anomalies regarding responses of blood mechanism to the neurologic activity of the brain (Bolay & Moskowitz, 2005). A non-invasive method of measuring blood HbO2 or Hb concentrations is useful in investigating the relation between the blood mechanism response and migraine. As field expert informed, currently there are no specific test method used for diagnosing migraine. Only, information derived from patient history, is used for diagnosis.

1.1. Literature Review

There are a number of studies reported in the literature that suggest possible different discriminative techniques for migraineur classification. In 2009, Chan et al. suggested that migraineurs are more sensitive to breath-hold challenge than healthy. To prove their hypothesis, a Transcranial Doppler Sonography (TCD) device was utilized and Cerebral Blood Flow Velocity (CBFV) was inspected. According to their findings, there is a significant difference of CBFV change between healthy and migraineur subjects during a breath-hold challenge (Chan, et al., 2009).

In 2005, Shionura and Yamada shared the findings of their study which they utilized NIRS and head-down maneuver in order to investigate differences in cerebral blood pressure between healthy and migraineur. According to their findings, there is statistical difference in blood volume (or total hemoglobin) and regional oxygen saturation which indicates suppression of pressure related vasoreactivity in the right hemisphere of PFC of migraineurs during period without pain (Shinoura & Yamada, 2005).

A similar study to the one of Chan et al. was reported in 2007 by Liboni et al. They both used TCD and NIRS together to investigate the differences between cerebral auto-regulation systems of migraineur and healthy subjects, again with a breath hold challenge. Their results also show decreased vasoreactivity for migraineur compared to healthy (Liboni, et al., 2007).

In 2008, Vernieri et al. conducted a study that involves TCD and NIRS measurements during carbon dioxide inhalation sessions of healthy and migraineur to investigate differences in cerebral vasomotor reactivity of subjects. Their study also resulted in findings with difference of cerebral neurovascular system between healthy and migraine eur during hypercapnia sessions (Vernieri, et al., 2008).

In addition to the studies with intentional reducing of oxygen input, cognitive tasks have been proven to cause changes in cerebral neurovascular system. In 2002, Schroeter et al. reported their findings of an experiment conducted with NIRS data gathered from healthy subjects during a stroop test. It was revealed that, cognitive challenges like stroop test result in an increase in hemodynamic response (Schroeter, Zysset, Kupka, Kruggel, & von Cramon, 2002).

As reported in 1992 by Thie et al. hemodynamic responses observed by TCD during cognitive and motor tasks, differentiate between healthy and migraineur groups significantly (Thie, Carvajal-Lizano, Schlichting, Spitzer, & Kunze, 1992).

In 2009, Bolay, Unlu and Akın reported their findings of a study that they conducted with 16 migraineur and 16 healthy subjects who were requested to answer mental arithmetic questions in 3 different levels during NIRS measurement. A statistically significant difference between power spectrums of hemodynamic responses of two groups was found.

Another study reported by Akın et. al. in 2006, conducted with 6 migraineur and 6 healthy subjects. Subjects were requested to do a breath hold during NIRS measurement. Their results show a statistically significant difference between hemodynamic responses of two groups.

1.2. Motivation

With these assumptions, two different experiments have been conducted by a group of scientists. They were both based on the hypothesis that there is a significant difference in neurovascular coupling mechanism between control and migraineur groups and this difference can be observed using functional near infrared spectroscopy (fNIRS). In order to prove this hypothesis, scientists requested cognitive and physical tasks to be conducted during fNIRS measurement and then analyzed the data gathered. Their results show significant difference in de-oxy hemoglobin and blood volume concentration changes during the experiments between the two groups.

The statistically proven difference in two groups motivates further investigation of the problem using pattern classification techniques to automatically classify migraineurs from healthy people. This study has been conducted to utilize pattern classification methods with different pre-classification procedures using the data gathered in these two previous experiments. The results have been further analyzed using two different statistical hypothesis tests to find out the most successful classification method as well as the selection of the data acquisition technique.

In this thesis, findings of the experimental study, which has been conducted with the motivation mentioned is presented. It consists of four chapters. In chapter 2, data acquisition studies are going to be covered in detail. In chapter 3, data pre-processing procedures, feature selection work and pattern classification trials are going to be covered. In chapter 4, results of the experiment will be detailed and discussed. In 5th and last chapter, possible future work and improvement ideas will be shared along with discussion of the results.

CHAPTER 2

DATA ACQUISITION

The datasets which were used in this study have been gathered during two other previous studies conducted by a group of scientists that include biomedical engineers from Boğaziçi University and neurologists from Gazi University. In this chapter detailed information about the data gathering process is explained and the features of the acquired data is discussed.

2.1. Spectroscopic Measurement

Near infrared spectroscopy is a method that measures how much of light is absorbed by the tissue that was sent at a specific wavelength using light sensors placed at a distance from the source. Then, using that information and Beer – Lambert Law, concentration of a certain chromophore in the tissue or environment that is observed, can be calculated. According to this theory, absolute concentration of a substance (C) dissolved in a pure liquid, amount of light applied and absorption of light during its pass through the solution are formulated using ((1):

$$I^{\lambda} = I_0 e^{-\varepsilon_C^{\lambda} CL} \tag{1}$$

In this equation, I_0 represents the amount of light that was projected with λ wavelength, I^{λ} represents the amount of light that passes from the liquid, ε_c^{λ} represents the molar absorption coefficient of substance for the same wavelength, *C* represents molar amount of the substance and *L* represents the distance between the light source and the detector. Main assumption in this equation is that the substance is dissolved in the solvent homogeneously and the solvent's optical features can be dismissed compared to the optical features of substance. In settings with more than one chromophore dissolved, the equation is modified as below, with C_1 and C_2 being molar quantity of different chromophores:

$$I^{\lambda} = I_0 \exp\left[-\left(\varepsilon_{C_1}^{\lambda} + \varepsilon_{C_2}^{\lambda}\right)L\right]$$
(2)

In this case, because there are two unknown parameters, a second measurement with a different wavelength of light should be conducted and using these two equations, separate amounts corresponding to the different chromophores can be calculated.

2.2. Oxy Hemoglobin (HbO2) and De-oxy Hemoglobin (Hb) Calculation

Within the range of near infrared wavelengths of light, the interval between 710 nm and 1000 nm is the most favorable as a tool for observing tissue oxygenation. In this wavelength span, absorption coefficient of water is extremely low (Figure 1b); so this region is called "optic window of tissues" (Figure 1a). Also in this region, oxy and de-oxy hemoglobin chromophores have very high absorption coefficients. These two chromophores have very different absorption rates (Delpy & Cope, 1997).





(b) Absorption spectrum of water (Near-infrared window in biological tissue, 2011)

(c) Comparison of absorbance's of melanin, water, Hb and HbO2 (Delpy & Cope, 1997)

(d) Absorption coefficients of Hb, HbO2 and cytochrome c oxidase (Delpy & Cope, 1997)

According to the literature, it is known that two other substances, namely melanin and cytochrome c oxidase, would have some light absorption too in tissue oxygenation measurements. Generally, light absorption of human epidermis is caused by melanin content of it. Melanin is a polymer that is constructed by condensation of tyrosine molecules that has absorption in visible light wavelength band (400 - 700 nm) and stronger absorption in shorter wavelengths (Figure 1c). Melanin consists of pieces that covered with membrane, sizes between 10 nm – 30 nm and contains melanin granules (Mobley & Vo-Dinh, 2003).

Cytochrome c oxidase is an enzyme that is used during cellular respiration. Mitochondria help oxygen to combine with hydrogen to build up water by giving an electron from cytochrome c oxidase to hydrogen in its membrane. Although that absorption coefficient of cytochrome c oxidase is higher than of those Hb and HbO2 (Figure 1d), for *in vivo* measurements, due to its low change rate of concentration and low concentration, it has no effect (Richards-Kortum & Sevick-Muraca, 1996).

In order to calculate changes in concentration of Hb and HbO2, measurements of light absorption conducted using two light sources with different wavelengths, can be placed on equation below which is derived from Beer – Lambert Law (Chance, 1991) (Delpy D. T., et al., 1988) (Hoshi, 2003) (Hoshi, 2011) (Villringer & Chance, 1997).

$$\Delta OD^{\lambda_i} = ln \left\{ \frac{I_0}{I} \right\} = \varepsilon_{HB,HBO_2}^{\lambda_i} \Delta C_{HB,HBO_2} L \tag{3}$$

In this equation; ΔOD^{λ_i} represents the change in ratio of light passed through to the light projected for wavelength of λ_i , $\varepsilon_{HB,HBO_2}^{\lambda_i}$ represents molar absorption coefficients of different chromophores and $\Delta C_{HB,HBO_2}$ represents the absolute change in molar amounts of chromophores compared to the initial moment that the light was projected. Since absorption coefficient of each chromophore for each wavelength of light, is different, absorption measurements conducted with at least two light sources with different wavelengths can result in calculation of change of Hb and HbO2 concentrations as shown in the example equations below.

$$\Delta[HB] = \frac{\varepsilon_{HBO_2}^{\lambda_2} \Delta OD^{\lambda_1} - \varepsilon_{HBO_2}^{\lambda_1} \Delta OD^{\lambda_2}}{\left(\varepsilon_{HB}^{\lambda_1} \varepsilon_{HBO_2}^{\lambda_2} - \varepsilon_{HB}^{\lambda_2} \varepsilon_{HBO_2}^{\lambda_1}\right)L}$$
(4)

$$\Delta[HBO_2] = \frac{\varepsilon_{HB}^{\lambda_1} \Delta OD^{\lambda_2} - \varepsilon_{HB}^{\lambda_2} \Delta OD^{\lambda_1}}{\left(\varepsilon_{HB}^{\lambda_1} \varepsilon_{HBO_2}^{\lambda_2} - \varepsilon_{HB}^{\lambda_2} \varepsilon_{HBO_2}^{\lambda_1}\right)L}$$
(5)

In these measurements, wavelengths of light that are going to be used can be selected as $\lambda_1 = 730 \ nm$ and $\lambda_2 = 850 \ nm$, since they should be selected above and below the isosbestic point (specific wavelength at which two chemical species have the same molar absorptivity) which is 800 nm (Figure 1a). A single distance measure between single sensor and single light source is used in this equation.

2.3. Oxy and De-oxy Hemoglobin Measurement from Live Tissue

Blood diffusion and oxygenation of live tissue can be observed using two methods, one is invasive and the other is non-invasive. In invasive method, amount of dissolved oxygen or its partial pressure (PO₂) can be measured using a thin probe with thickness of 250 μ m, placed in the tissue. (Oxford Optronix, 2011)

Using non-invasive method, with light sources and sensors placed above the skin, concentration of Hb and HbO2 contained in tissue below the skin is calculated. Again, using an equation derived from Beer-Lambert Law, measured light data is converted to concentration data. But, the tissue underneath the skin is not homogenous as Beer-Lambert Law foresees. It is made up of several different layers. Each of these layers has capillary vessels in them which would have independent changes in Hb and HbO2 concentration from others. The light projected to such area, would pass through some and would be reflected back from some. The light that is reflected back carries data about $\Delta[HBO_2]$ and $\Delta[HB]$ of all layers that it passed through. To cover all these concerns, some changes are made on the Beer-Lambert Law given in (

$$I^{\lambda} = I_0 e^{-\varepsilon_C^{\lambda} CL} \tag{1}$$

) and this new law is called Modified Beer-Lambert Law. This modified law covers these points:

- 1. Tissue being reflective besides being absorbent
- Depending on the positions of light source and sensor, a new differential light path length is suggested
- 3. Absorbance of chromophores in the area observed, being greater than the reflectivity of them. $(\mu_a \gg \mu_r)$
- 4. Changes caused by light reflection in the environment being rather too small than of those caused by light absorption. $(\Delta \mu_r \ll \Delta \mu_a)$

Modified Beer-Lambert law which accounts for these points is given in ((6) (Delpy D. T., et al., 1988) (Sayli, 2009) (Sayli, Aksel, & Akin, 2008).

$$OD^{\lambda} = \ln\left(\frac{I_0}{I}\right) = \varepsilon^{\lambda} CDPF^{\lambda}r + G^{\lambda}$$
(6)

In this equation, λ represents the wavelength of light used, OD^{λ} represents the optical density in this wavelength, I_0 represents the power of light sent to the tissue in Watts, *I* represents the power of light received back from the tissue in Watts, ε^{λ} represents absorption coefficient specific to that wavelength in $cm^{-1}mM^{-1}$, C represents the absolute concentration of chromophore in environment in mM, r represents the shortest path between light source and sensor in cm, DPF^{λ} represents differential path length factor. Actually, DPF^{λ} is equal to L^{λ} divided by r. G^{λ} is added for the geometry and reflection property of the area. The assumption of a change in concentration of a chromophore is going to affect optical density is valid. These measurements can be done with two light sources with different wavelengths and using equations in ((4) and ((5), concentration change of Hb and HbO2 can be calculated between light source and sensor.

2.4. Niroxcope

NIRS equipment that is used in both studies was developed in the Neuro-Optical Imaging Laboratory of Biomedical Engineering Department of Boğaziçi University. Both devices have the same prefrontal cortex probe designed in the same laboratory. Prefrontal cortex (PFC) probe, that has been used, has four light sources and ten light sensors. Detectors and sources are placed symmetrically in a rectangular probe with 2.5 cm spacing between each source detector pair. One light source and four light sensors considered as a quadrant. Using the adjacent sensors of quadrants twice, device observes sixteen different light paths which are considered to be sixteen channels as shown in Figure 2 Prefrontal Cortex Probe Layout. This probe is placed on the forehead of the subjects extending from the right dorsolateral PFC to the left dorsolateral PFC with the help of rubber bands (Figure 3Hata! Başvuru kaynağı bulunamadı.). The midline of the probe was adjusted to align with the middle of the forehead. The bottom of the probe was aligned with the eyebrows. Data collection

started with the resting state and ended with resting state in order to observe the baseline measurements.



Figure 2 Prefrontal Cortex Probe Layout



Figure 3 Basic Measurement Setup (Unlu, Bolay, & Akin, 2009)

Niroxcope controller unit is connected a computer, through which cognitive or physical tasks are given to the subjects. The computer also records the markers along with the data as subject completes the tasks or comes to a point that is important, such as beginning of a question section or rest section. Using these markers in data, in analysis phase, sections of measurement (question sections, rest sections, breath hold sections etc.) can be separated. Data is recorded in a cyclic routine. It begins with first quadrant in the probe and activates the light source of first wave length of first quadrant. Then records measurements acquired from the sensors of first quadrant. After that, the second light source with second wavelength is activated and again measurements of first quadrant's sensors are recorded. After doing same routine for all four quadrants, controller returns back to the beginning and continues with the first quadrant again. A cycle of all four quadrants is completed in approximately 572 milliseconds. Each cycle is represented as a row in data file with tab separated columns. Each value in each cell in data file is the voltage measurement of light sensor varying from 0 to 5 Volts.

After measurements are recorded to data files for each subject, these data files are processed with a Matlab[©] based software developed by same group. This software reads the data files and extracts marker information. After marker extraction, using the Modified Beer-Lambert Law ((6), it converts the voltage data to HbO2, Hb and blood volume data.

2.5. Dataset 1

First study was designed to investigate hemodynamic differences between migraineur and healthy subjects during a mental arithmetic task. The task is expected to create a cognitive burden and consequently result in a change in the blood flow in the prefrontal cortex. Participants (5 healthy men, 11 healthy women, 4 migraineur men and 12 migraineur women) were aged between 20 and 40 years with mean of 23.94±3.45, who had their college degree and were informed about the test procedure before the experiment and consented. Participants who were in their menstrual period, had cardiovascular or neurologic or psychological problems, had experienced migraine attack within previous 3 days from the experiment or had been using migraine medication were kept exempt from the study. Subjects were requested to answer as quickly as possible for mental arithmetic questions during three consequent sessions which include different question groups derived from different levels. Question sessions last for 60 seconds and had 60 seconds of rest periods in between (see Figure 4 Timeline of first study).



Figure 4 Timeline of first study

Due to measurement errors such as a faulty sensor or wrong positioning of PFC probe, there was some loss in data. Channel 15 of all data was faulty due to faulty sensor 9 in PFC probe. Also data of 6 of migraineur subjects and 3 healthy subjects were eliminated due to error. Total of 13 healthy and 10 migraineur data could be used in classification trials. Reported results shows that, increase in mean values of oxy-hemoglobin volume induced by the first level of questions in the regions of PFC of significant 8 sensors are higher in healthy people in contrast with migraineurs (Unlu, Bolay, & Akin, 2009). In Figure 5 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Control 14 and Migraineur 1 Subjects For Dataset 1 and Figure 6 Plot of BV values vs. Time of Control 14 and Migraineur 1 Subjects For Dataset 1 sample plots of BV and HB data are shown. As their relative time markers are same along the study, both migraineur and healthy plot sample can be shown on the same graph.



Figure 5 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Control 14 and Migraineur 1 Subjects For Dataset 1



Figure 6 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Control 14 and Migraineur 1 Subjects For Dataset 1

2.6. Dataset 2

Second study whose data was used seeks to observe whether there were any differences between migraineur and healthy hemodynamic metabolisms while conducting a task which results in a physical change of PFC vascular system. Six participants diagnosed with migraine without aura (five women with ages 29. 2 ± 9.0 , one man, age 39) according to IHS criteria and six healthy subjects (four women and two men, with ages 26.3 ± 1.6) from the outpatient headache clinic. Participants with migraine were not using any prophylactic medication and had not have any migraine attack in three days period before the day that they participated in the experiment. Subjects were positioned in supine position, and asked to breathe normally during rest periods. After an initial 60 seconds of rest, subjects were asked to exhale all the air and hold their breaths for a minimum of 20 seconds as much as they can (usually 30 seconds). The procedure of breath hold was repeated four times, with a 90 seconds of rest between each hold episode.



Figure 7 Approximate timeline for second study

As it's reported on study, changes in de-oxy hemoglobin volume between the seconds of 20–45 and 55–75, recovery peak value which is the highest value in the rest phase after the breath hold and initial dip value which represents the minimum value in the fall down section at very beginning of the breath hold section shows statistically significant difference between healthy and migraineur groups (Akın, et al., 2006).

In Figure 8 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Migraineur 1 Subject For Dataset 2 Figure 9 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Control 1 Subject For Dataset 2 Figure 10 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Migraineur 1 Subject For Dataset 2 and Figure 11 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Control 1 Subject For Dataset 2 sample data plots of HB and BV measurements of migraineurs and healthy subjects are shown. As time markers of subjects are not same, migraineur and healthy data plots could not be shown on the same graph.



Figure 8 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Migraineur 1 Subject For Dataset 2



Figure 9 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Control 1 Subject For Dataset 2



Figure 10 Plot of HB Values vs. Time of Migraineur 1 Subject For Dataset 2



Figure 11 Plot of BV Values vs. Time of Control 1 Subject For Dataset 2

CHAPTER 3

FEATURE EXTRACTION AND CLASSIFICATION

3.1. Feature Extraction

Both datasets have a time dependent, temporal nature so that a pre-classification task of future extraction process should be conducted before using statistical classifiers such as Naïve Bayes and clustering algorithms such as K-Nearest Neighbor.

In order to understand the physiological base of the experiments and their expected consequences over the datasets measured, a neurologist was consulted as field expert. According to the field expert; as the migraineurs are expected to be tired more than healthy subjects, their de-oxy hemoglobin and blood volume levels are expected to be higher at the end of the measuring approaches. Being tired means that, substances that are produced during the work of neurons in PFC, are produced faster than the vascular system can clean. Thus, more end-product substances such as de-oxy hemoglobin, sodium and potassium are expected to pile up in vascular system of PFC and surrounding tissue of migraineurs; because of different neurovascular coupling property caused by the migraine disease. Also, it was suggested that, in addition to physical burdens to PFC, such as breath hold and head down maneuver, measurements of BV and Hb during cognitive tasks could be discriminative for migraineurs too.

Taking these inputs in consideration, de-oxy hemoglobin and blood volume data generated at the task sections which are closer to the end of measurement were inspected. To remove the time dependency, mean value for each question or breath hold session and rest sessions before and after them are calculated for Hb and blood volume (BV) data. Also differences between the mean value of a question or breath hold session and the mean value of the rest session coming before it is also calculated to see how much that session increased the observed property (Hb or BV).

For first study's dataset, 3 mean values of Hb are calculated for each question session, 3 mean values of BV are calculated for each question session, 3 mean difference values for differences between mean values of Hb in each question session and the rest session coming before it and 3 mean difference values for differences between mean values of BV in each question session and the rest session coming before it. All these mean values are calculated for each 15 channels separately.

For the dataset collected in second study, 4 mean values of Hb are calculated for each breath hold session, 4 mean values of BV are calculated for each breath hold session, 4 mean difference values for differences between mean values of Hb in each breath hold session and the rest session coming before it and 4 mean difference values for differences between mean values of BV in each breath hold session and the rest session coming before it.

3.2. Classification

With features extracted from temporal datasets, a classification and a clustering algorithm were utilized in classification task, namely Naïve Bayes (NB) and K Nearest Neighbor (KNN). These algorithms were selected because minimum error rate nature of NB. Also, as the labels of measurements in training and test sets were known, this learning method is an example of supervised learning and NB is shown to be working very well in real world problems with supervised learning (Zhang, 2004). In classification trials, as both datasets are small in terms of number of subjects, separating random training and test sets and doing n-fold trials was not viable. Instead, leaveone-out method was implemented (Furey, et al., 2000). In each trial, one of the subjects was left out and classification or clustering algorithm was trained with the remaining; then the measurement that was left out, used as test subject.

Our literature survey revealed that there are only a limited number of classification studies that use oxy and de-oxy hemoglobin data acquired with fNIRS as input is available. In 2006, Sitaram et al. (2007) reported findings of a classification trial us-

ing fNIRS data that was gathered from 5 healthy subjects during repeated right-hand and left-hand motor imagery tasks. This data was fed into two different pattern classification methods namely Support Vector Machine (SVM) and Hidden Markov Model (HMM). The study was conducted in order to investigate the possibility of a brain computer interface (BCI) using NIRS measurements. But study was conducted only using data from healthy subjects and data of subjects classified among each other. Aim of the classification was to differentiate right hand imagery from left hand imagery data of the same subject. As a result, NIRS was found suitable for development of an online BCI in consistency with pattern classification methods (Sitaram, et al., 2007). As their dataset was big enough thanks to repeated measurements, it was possible to use pattern classification methods such as HMM and SVM. Unfortunately, with small datasets such as dataset 1 and dataset 2, it is not possible to do so.

Naïve Bayes is a pattern classification technique that has been used since the very beginning of classification trials which is based on Bayes' Theorem. It considers both a priori probability ($P(w_j)$, probability of w being an example of class j) and likelihood ($p(x|w_j)$, probability of w being an example of class j depending on x feature) of a test subject belonging in to a class. According to Bayes' rule;

$$P(w_j|x) = \frac{p(x|w_j) \times P(w_j)}{p(x)}$$
(7)

Naïve Bayes classifier simply calculates posterior probabilities using prior probabilities and a likelihood probability derived from the training set, and then assigns the label of the class that has the biggest posterior probability, to the test subject. Likelihood of a subject belonging to a class depending on a value of a feature is simply calculated with the distribution function of that feature (Duda, Hart, & Stork, 2000).

It is known that features that are dependent to each other lower performance of Naïve Bayes classifier. To make sure that, this problem is not affecting our case, we consulted to the field expert who informed us that there is no evidence that the physical locations that measurements were taken are dependent to each other. There is no prior evidence that shows dependency between hemodynamic properties of regions in prefrontal cortex. Thus, it is assumed that there are no dependency between features in trials.

KNN classifier selects a class label for a test sample according to the label of the k nearest neighbor of that test sample in feature space. The class that has higher number of neighbors to the test sample wins against others (Duda, Hart, & Stork, 2000).

As there are many features extracted from dataset, their importance in classification is unknown except field expert information provided. In order to prevent errors caused by "curse of dimensionality", a dimension reduction algorithm, principal component analysis (PCA) has been used and all of classifiers and feature sets have been merged in trials with and without PCA. PCA is a method that investigates each feature distribution provided in the training set and tries to find out the most correlated ones within the classes. Ordering features according to their correlation from high to low, allows the user find out features' importance for the classification task. (Duda, Hart, & Stork, 2000)

For classification tasks, NB classifier and PCA software provided in statistics toolbox library and KNN classifier provided in bioinformatics toolbox library, by Matlab©, have been utilized. Both classifiers were used with default parameters as there were no prior experiences with classification of NIRS data using these classifiers and their most common application parameters were set as default. NB classifier was used with Gaussian distribution and empirical prior probability estimation which derives a priori probabilities from the training set. KNN classifier was used with Euclidian distance measure and label of the nearest neighbor was selected as tie breaker.

All classification trials were repeated in three different sessions in order to eliminate the possibility of random error and results have been assured to be the same for all trials. Predictions of classifiers in each trial were same with the other two.

After feature extraction, extracted feature sets were used both separately and together in classification trials. For example, in classification of data set acquired from first study, means of blood volume changes in question level 1 recorded from 15 channels were fed to the classifiers as a single dataset. Also all these mean values of BV and Hb in all question levels from 15 channels were merged as a dataset with 90 features and classifiers were run on that dataset too. Same is done with dataset collected during second study and mean difference values. Also, the k value of KNN classifier was changed from 1 to 10 and for all these trials, each k value from 1 to 10 was tried. For each feature set, the k value with best success ratio will be reported. In addition to that, PCA was applied to all feature sets, and classifiers were tried with this datasets too. All trials repeated for each number of features. For example, again with the example above, PCA applied to the dataset data for 14 times each time reducing it to 1 less feature 14 features to 1 and classification was tried 14 times. Results of all these trials are going to be reported in this document.

In classification trials of both datasets,

- for each subject's data
- for each feature set,
- for each classifier (with and without PCA),
- for each k value from 1 to 10
- And for each number of features after PCA from 1 to 14 a trial has been completed.

For the dataset 1, 15 channels, 12 feature sets, 2 classifiers and 23 subjects are present. A total of 91080 classification trials with different settings and/or different feature sets have been completed for three times. For dataset 2, 16 channels, 16 feature sets, 2 classifiers and 12 subjects are present. A total of 67584 classification trials with different settings and/or different feature sets have been completed for three times.

CHAPTER 4

RESULTS AND COMPARISON OF TRIALS

As mentioned in previous chapter, more than 150 000 trials have been completed, and for each dataset and each classification method, result and settings of the trial with highest success ratio is reported. Number of features used after PCA and k value for KNN of the trial with the best performance is reported for each classifier and feature set. The following metrics are calculated and presented:

- True positive (TP, number of migraineur subjects classified as migraineur by classifier),
- False positive (FP, number of healthy subjects classified as migraineur by classifier),
- True negative (TN, number of healthy subjects classified as healthy by classifier)
- And false negative (FN, number of migraineur subjects classified as healthy by classifier)
- Sensitivity (ratio of correctly classified migraineurs to the total number of migraineurs)
- Specificity (ratio of correctly classified healthy to the subjects that are classified as healthy)
- Success ratio values (ratio of correct classifications to the total number of subjects) are reported below for each dataset and classifier.
- Precision (ratio of correctly classified migraineurs to the subjects that are classified as migraineurs).

Abbreviations used in result reports are;

- NB for Naïve Bayes classifier
- kNN for k-nearest neighbor classifier with k varying from 1 to 10
- wPCA for with PCA applied
- nF for n features used in trial.

For all result tables, cell with the maximum value for each column, is printed in red.

4.1. Classification Results of Dataset 1

Classification results of dataset 1 are summarized in Table 1 Classification Results of Dataset 1 using means and Table 2. In these tables, calculated feature from original dataset is given in "Feature" column, observed region of the experiment is given in "Region" column, classifier, feature reduction method (if used), number of features observed are given in "Classifier Setting" column, success ratio calculated as percentage of truly classified is given in "Success Ratio" column and true positive, false positive, true negative and false negative values are given in the rest of the table. Highest success rate was found as 73.91% with features acquired from question level III region of the experiment data. ROC curves of trials that have highest success ratio, highest sensitivity and highest specificity values are given in Figure 12 ROC Curve of Trial 12 for Dataset 1, Figure 13 ROC Curve of Trial 24 for Dataset 1 Figure 14 ROC Curve of Trial 42 for Dataset 1 and Figure 15 ROC Curve of Trial 48 for Dataset 1.

						1	1				
		Classifier Set-	Success								Trial
Feature	Region	up	Ratio	TP	FP	ΤN	FN	Sensitivity	Specifity	Precision	#
	۲	NB15 F	56.52%	6	6	7	4	60.00%	53.85%	50.00%	1
	stio el I	NBwPCA8F	60.87%	7	6	7	3	70.00%	53.85%	53.85%	2
All Means BV Means BV Means	llev	2NN15F	60.87%	8	7	6	2	80.00%	46.15%	53.33%	3
	Region Classifier Set- up Success Ratio TP FP TN FN Sensitivity Specifity Precision NB15 F 56.52% 6 6 7 4 60.00% 53.85% 53.00% 1 NBWCA3F 60.87% 7 6 7 3 70.00% 53.85% 53.33% 1 2NNWPCA5F 60.87% 8 7 6 2 80.00% 46.15% 53.33% 1 NB15 F 56.52% 7 7 6 3 70.00% 46.15% 53.33% 1 NB15 F 56.52% 7 7 6 3 70.00% 46.15% 53.33% 1 2NNWPCA10F 60.87% 8 7 5 5 50.00% 53.85% 45.45% 1 NB15 F 52.17% 5 6 7 5 50.00% 53.85% 45.45% 1 NB15 F 52.17% 5 8 5	4									
SL	u	NB15 F	56.52%	7	7	6	3	70.00%	46.15%	50.00%	5
ear	stio el II	NBwPCA10F	60.87%	8	7	6	2	80.00%	46.15%	53.33%	6
N N	ues ev-	2NN15F	43.48%	5	8	5	5	50.00%	38.46%	38.46%	7
B	σ –	2NNwPCA10F	60.87%	6	5	8	4	60.00%	61.54%	54.55%	8
	u _	NB15 F	52.17%	5	6	7	5	50.00%	53.85%	45.45%	9
	stio el III	NBwPCA10F	56.52%	8	8	5	2	80.00%	38.46%	50.00%	10
	Ques Leve	3NN15F	65.22%	6	4	9	4	60.00%	69.23%	60.00%	11
		6NNwPCA4F	73.91%	6	2	11	4	60.00%	84.62%	75.00%	12
	uestion Level I	NB, 15 F	65.22%	7	5	8	3	70.00%	61.54%	58.33%	13
		NBwPCA, 13F	60.87%	9	8	5	1	90.00%	38.46%	52.94%	14
		5NN, 15F	47.83%	8	10	3	2	80.00%	23.08%	44.44%	15
	σ	6NNwPCA, 2F	60.87%	5	4	9	5	50.00%	69.23%	55.56%	16
SL	ч	NB, 15 F	56.52%	5	5	8	5	50.00%	61.54%	50.00%	17
lear	stio el II	NBwPCA, 12F	52.17%	4	5	8	6	40.00%	61.54%	44.44%	18
N N N	leve	5NN, 15F	43.48%	7	10	3	3	70.00%	23.08%	41.18%	19
Ŧ	σ –	10NNwPCA, 1F	60.87%	7	6	7	3	70.00%	53.85%	53.85%	20
	<u>د</u>	NB, 15 F	69.57%	8	5	8	2	80.00%	61.54%	61.54%	21
	stio el III	NBwPCA, 3F	69.57%	6	3	10	4	60.00%	76.92%	66.67%	22
	eve	3NN, 15F	52.17%	7	8	5	3	70.00%	38.46%	46.67%	23
	α -	5NNwPCA, 2F	73.91%	6	2	11	4	60.00%	84.62%	75.00%	24
SI	g	NB, 90F	60,87%	6	5	8	4	60.00%	61.54%	54.55%	25
ear	oine	NBwPCA, 4F	60,87%	8	7	6	2	80.00%	46.15%	53.33%	26
Σ	mt	8NN, 90F	52,17%	6	7	6	4	60.00%	46.15%	46.15%	27
All Co		6NNwPCA, 5F	69,57%	6	3	10	4	60.00%	76.92%	66.67%	28

Table 1 Classification Results of Dataset 1 using means

		Classifier Set-	Success								Trial
Feature	Region	up	Ratio	ΤР	FP	ΤN	FN	Sensitivity	Specifity	Precision	#
	L	NB, 15 F	65.22%	8	6	7	2	80.00%	53.85%	57.14%	29
	itio el I	NBwPCA, 14F	65.22%	7	5	8	3	70.00%	61.54%	58.33%	30
VII Mean HB Mean Differences BV Mean Differences Etremences HB Mean Differences HE etremences HE etr	ues Lev	2NN, 15F	60.87%	7	6	7	3	70.00%	53.85%	53.85%	31
ces	α	2NNwPCA, 2F	65.22%	6	4	9	4	60.00%	69.23%	60.00%	32
erer	ч	NB, 15 F	56.52%	6	6	7	4	60.00%	53.85%	50.00%	33
iffe	stio el II	NBwPCA, 14F	56.52%	4	4	9	6	40.00%	69.23%	50.00%	34
u D	leve	6NN, 15F	47.83%	4	6	7	6	40.00%	53.85%	40.00%	35
Леа	α –	5NNwPCA, 2F	65.22%	7	5	8	3	70.00%	61.54%	58.33%	36
3V N	n I	NB, 15 F	69.57%	8	5	8	2	80.00%	61.54%	61.54%	37
Ш	stio el II	NBwPCA, 5F	69.57%	8	5	8	2	80.00%	61.54%	61.54%	38
	ues eve	7NN, 15F	47.83%	5	7	6	5	50.00%	46.15%	41.67%	39
	0 -	4NNwPCA, 2F	56.52%	5	5	8	5	50.00%	61.54%	50.00%	40
	luestion Level I	NB, 15 F	56.52%	6	6	7	4	60.00%	53.85%	50.00%	41
nces		NBwPCA, 4F	69.57%	10	7	6	0	100.00%	46.15%	58.82%	42
		8NN, 15F	47.83%	4	6	7	6	40.00%	53.85%	40.00%	43
JCE	0	5NNwPCA,6F	65.22%	6	4	9	4	60.00%	69.23%	60.00%	44
erer	n	NB, 15 F	43.48%	4	7	6	6	40.00%	46.15%	36.36%	45
oiffe	stio el II	NBwPCA, 1F	52.17%	0	1	12	10	0.00%	92.31%	0.00%	46
an E	lev	3NN, 15F	65.22%	3	1	12	7	30.00%	92.31%	75.00%	47
Mea	0	3NNwPCA, 13F	65.22%	3	1	12	7	30.00%	92.31%	75.00%	48
HB I	۲ _	NB, 15 F	73.91%	8	4	9	2	80.00%	69.23%	66.67%	49
-	stio el II	NBwPCA, 1F	60.87%	2	1	12	8	20.00%	92.31%	66.67%	50
	ue: _eve	5NN, 15F	65.22%	5	3	10	5	50.00%	76.92%	62.50%	51
	0	5NNwPCA, 11F	69.57%	5	2	11	5	50.00%	84.62%	71.43%	52
u n	ed	NB, 90F	60,87%	4	3	10	6	40.00%	76.92%	57.14%	53
1ea enc	oine	NBwPCA, 4F	60,87%	9	8	5	1	90.00%	38.46%	52.94%	54
∆ II ⊽ Ter	omt	9NN, 90F	56,52%	7	7	6	3	70.00%	46.15%	50.00%	55
Al Dif Co		2NNwPCA, 2F	65,22%	8	6	7	2	80.00%	53.85%	57.14%	56

Table 2 Classification results of Dataset 1 using mean differences



Figure 12 ROC Curve of Trial 12 for Dataset 1



Figure 13 ROC Curve of Trial 24 for Dataset 1



Figure 14 ROC Curve of Trial 42 for Dataset 1



Figure 15 ROC Curve of Trial 48 for Dataset 1

4.2. Classification Results of Dataset 2

Classification results of dataset 2 are summarized in Table 3, Table 4 and Table 5. In these tables, calculated feature from original dataset is given in "Feature" column, observed breath hold session of the experiment is given in "Region" column, classifier, feature reduction method (if used), number of features observed are given in "Classifier Setting" column, success ratio calculated as percentage of truly classified is given in "Success Ratio" column and true positive, false positive, true negative and false negative values are given in the rest of the table. Highest success rate was found as 83.33% with features acquired from first, third and fourth breath hold session regions of the experiment data. ROC curves of trials that have highest success ratio, highest sensitivity and highest specificity values are given in Figure 16, Figure 17, Figure 18 and Figure 19.

Fea- ture	Re- gion	Classifier Set- ting	Suc- cess Ratio	T P	F P	T N	F N	Sensitivi- ty	Specifici- ty	Preci- sion	Tri- al #
		NB, 16F	58.33%	2	1	5	4	33.33%	83.33%	66.67%	1
	SI	NBwPCA, 6F	58.33%	4	3	3	2	66.67%	50.00%	57.14%	2
	ВН	6NN, 16F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	3
		3NNwPCA, 2F	75.00%	6	3	3	0	100.00%	50.00%	66.67%	4
		NB, 16F	58.33%	3	2	4	3	50.00%	66.67%	60.00%	5
	BHS II	NBwPCA, 8F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	6
SL		6NN, 16F	75.00%	6	3	3	0	100.00%	50.00%	66.67%	7
ear		6NNwPCA, 16F	75.00%	6	3	3	0	100.00%	50.00%	66.67%	8
Σ		NB, 16F	58.33%	3	2	4	3	50.00%	66.67%	60.00%	9
B	≡	NBwPCA, 4F	66.67%	3	1	5	3	50.00%	83.33%	75.00%	10
	BHS	6NN, 16F	58.33%	6	5	1	0	100.00%	16.67%	54.55%	11
		3NNwPCA, 2F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	12
		NB, 16F	50.00%	2	2	4	4	33.33%	66.67%	50.00%	13
	BHS IV	NBwPCA, 8F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	14
		4NN, 16F	58.33%	6	5	1	0	100.00%	16.67%	54.55%	15
		4NNwPCA, 3F	75.00%	5	2	4	1	83.33%	66.67%	71.43%	16

Table 3 Classification results of dataset 2 using BV means

Fea- ture	Re- gion	Classifier Set- ting	Suc- cess Ratio	T P	F P	T N	F N	Sensitivi- ty	Specifici- ty	Preci- sion	Tri- al #
		NB, 16F	58.33%	4	3	3	2	66.67%	50.00%	57.14%	17
	IS I	NBwPCA, 8F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	18
	ВН	4NN, 16F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	19
		4NNwPCA, 16F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	20
		NB, 16F	50.00%	4	4	2	2	66.67%	33.33%	50.00%	21
	S II	NBwPCA, 2F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	22
SL	ВН	8NN, 16F	58.33%	5	4	2	1	83.33%	33.33%	55.56%	23
lear		8NNwPCA, 8F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	24
≥ q		NB, 16F	58.33%	4	3	3	2	66.67%	50.00%	57.14%	25
Ξ	BHS III	NBwPCA, 9F	66.67%	3	1	5	3	50.00%	83.33%	75.00%	26
		8NN, 16F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	27
		3NNwPCA, 1F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	28
	-	NB, 16F	50.00%	3	3	3	3	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	29
	S IV	NBwPCA, 2F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	30
	BH	6NN, 16F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	31
		2NNwPCA, 3F	83.33%	6	2	4	0	100.00%	66.67%	75.00%	32
É.		NB, 128F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	33
U U	σ	NBwPCA, 8F	75.00%	6	3	3	0	100.00%	50.00%	66.67%	34
ans	ine	6NN, 128F	75.00%	6	3	3	0	100.00%	50.00%	66.67%	35
All Me b		2NNwPCA, 128F	75.00%	6	3	3	0	100.00%	50.00%	66.67%	36
p	d d	NB, 128F	66.67%	3	1	5	3	50.00%	83.33%	75.00%	69
lear	oine	NBwPCA, 8F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	70
E N		3NN, 128F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	71
All Difi Co		3NNwPCA, 3F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	72

Table 4 Classification results of dataset 2 using Hb means, all means combined and all mean differences combined

Fea- ture	Re- gion	Classifier Set- ting	Suc- cess Ratio	T P	FP	ΤZ	FΖ	Sensitivi- ty	Specifici- ty	Preci- sion	Tri- al #
		NB16F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	37
	IS I	NBwPCA8F	83.33%	4	0	6	2	66.67%	100.00%	100.00%	38
	ВН	7NN16F	75.00%	5	2	4	1	83.33%	66.67%	71.43%	39
		3NNwPCA2F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	40
S		NB16F	50.00%	3	3	3	3	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	41
uce	SII	NBwPCA4F	66.67%	6	4	2	0	100.00%	33.33%	60.00%	42
erei	ВН	6NN16F	58.33%	6	5	1	0	100.00%	16.67%	54.55%	43
oiffe		3NNwPCA16F	58.33%	6	5	1	0	100.00%	16.67%	54.55%	44
an E		NB16F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	45
Mea	SIII	NBwPCA10F	50.00%	5	5	1	1	83.33%	16.67%	50.00%	46
3V P	вна	3NN16F	50.00%	3	3	3	3	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	47
ш		5NNwPCA3F	66.67%	2	0	6	4	33.33%	100.00%	100.00%	48
	BHS IV	NB16F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	49
		NBwPCA7F	58.33%	2	1	5	4	33.33%	83.33%	66.67%	50
		9NN16F	41.67%	1	2	4	5	16.67%	66.67%	33.33%	51
		2NNwPCA,4F	50.00%	4	4	2	2	66.67%	33.33%	50.00%	52
		NB, 16F	75.00%	4	1	5	2	66.67%	83.33%	80.00%	53
	IS I	NBwPCA, 7F	66.67%	5	З	З	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	54
	ВН	5NN, 16F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	55
		6NNwPCA,1F	83.33%	6	2	4	0	100.00%	66.67%	75.00%	56
S		NB, 16F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	57
JCe	SII	NBwPCA, 6F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	58
erer	ВН	4NN, 16F	58.33%	5	4	2	1	83.33%	33.33%	55.56%	59
oiffe		2NNwPCA, 6F	66.67%	5	З	З	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	60
an E		NB, 16F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	61
Mea	E	NBwPCA, 9F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	62
d dł	вна	2NN, 16F	75.00%	4	1	5	2	66.67%	83.33%	80.00%	63
±		2NNwPCA, 4F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	64
		NB, 16F	66.67%	4	2	4	2	66.67%	66.67%	66.67%	65
	\geq	NBwPCA, 5F	66.67%	5	3	3	1	83.33%	50.00%	62.50%	66
	BHS	2NN, 16F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	67
		2NNwPCA, 16F	83.33%	5	1	5	1	83.33%	83.33%	83.33%	68

Table 5 Classification results of dataset 2 using mean differences



Figure 16 ROC Curve of Trial 28 for Dataset 2



Figure 17 ROC Curve of Trial 32 for Dataset 2



Figure 18 ROC Curve of Trial 64 for Dataset 2



Figure 19 ROC Curve of Trial 67 for Dataset 2

Classification results are consistent with the information obtained from the field expert. Regions at the end of the experiment (third for the dataset 1 and fourth for the dataset 2) are observed to be more significantly correlated within the groups. Thus, classification trials using the features gathered from these regions have higher success ratio than the trials with features extracted from the first and second regions of the experiments.

4.3. Statistical Hypothesis Tests

In order to observe if the differences between the results are statistically significant, statistical comparison tests should be conducted. As feature sets are extracted from the same measurement dataset, all trials are statistically related. The ANOVA test is a commonly used statistical method investigating if differences between more than two related sample means are significantly different. In our case, as data is nonparametric and binary, ANOVA's non-parametric equivalent for binary data is Cochran Q test (Looney, 1988). Cochran Q test was applied to the results gathered from classification trials of both datasets separately to see whether trials succeeded differently and also whether they classified the subjects differently, with null hypothesis of there were no difference between classification trials. To calculate this statistics, a table for performance of test trials and test subjects has been tabulated. In this table columns include test trials and rows include test subjects. If a test trial predicted the class of a subject, 1 is written as value of the cell in conjunction between row of that subject and column of that test trial, else 0 is written. After table is constructed, Cochran Q test statistics is calculated using the ((8). In this equation, C_i represents the total of values in the column for the trial j, k represents number of classification trials, R_i represents the total of values in the row *i* and *n* indicates number of test subjects. If test calculated test statistic value is smaller than the $(1 - \alpha)$ -quintile of the chi-squared distribution with k - 1 degrees of freedom, null hypothesis is accepted; else it is rejected. (Alpar, 2006).

$$Q = \frac{(k-1)\left[k\sum_{j=1}^{k}C_{j}^{2} - \left(\sum_{j=1}^{k}C_{j}\right)^{2}\right]}{k\sum_{i=1}^{n}R_{i} - \sum_{i=1}^{n}R_{i}^{2}}$$
(8)

For investigation of difference between two related samples with binary data, Mc Nemar's test is used (Dietterich, 1998) (Alpar, 2006). Also, to confirm results of

Cochran Q that there were no differences or to find out if there were differences, which two trials were different, McNemar's test was used, with null hypothesis of there were no difference between subjects. To calculate Mc Nemar's test statistics a table with 2 rows and 2 columns is constructed, in first cell, number of test subjects classified correctly by both methods (a) is written, in second cell, number of test subjects that are classified correctly by first trial but not by the second (b) is written, in third cell, the number of test subjects that are classified correctly by second trial but not by the first (c) is written and to the last cell, number of test subjects that are classified wrong by both methods (d) is written. After the table creation, Mc Nemar's test statistics is calculated, with the ((9):

$$\chi^2 = \frac{(b-c-1)^2}{b+c}$$
(9)

If test calculated test statistic value is smaller than the $(1 - \alpha)$ -quintile of the chisquared distribution with 1 degree of freedom, null hypothesis is accepted; else it is rejected.

4.4. Statistical Inspection of Classification Results of Dataset 1

To apply Cochran Q analysis on classification results of dataset 1, test statistics calculated using the ((8) is 34.53, smaller than the calculated chi-square distribution statistics, 74. Thus null hypothesis is accepted; there was no statistically significant difference in performances of trials with the confidence interval of 95%. All the trials performed equally successful within the given dataset. But there were statistically significant differences in predictions of classification trials for the subjects, again with the confidence interval of 95%. Using the ((8), calculated Cochran Q statistic is 136.73 and greater than the 0.05-quintile of the chi-squared distribution with 55 degrees of freedom, 74. So, null hypothesis is rejected; there is statistically significant difference between the predictions of trials for the test subjects. That means some of the trials, labeled some of the subjects different than others.

To confirm the Cochran Q test results and find difference between the trials, pairwise Mc Nemar's tests are applied for the trials. Using ((9), Mc Nemar's test statistic is calculated for each trial pair. All of the calculated statistics using the performance

values of the trials were less than the 0.05-quintile of the chi-squared distribution with 1 degree of freedom, which is 3.841. So all null hypothesis are accepted, there were no differences in performance between trial pairs. In Cochran Q test conducted using the predictions of trials, there was a significant difference in some of the trials. To find out which pairs were different than each other, pairwise Mc Nemar's tests are conducted using the prediction data. Some of these Mc Nemar's test statistics were higher than the 0.05-quintile of the chi-squared distribution with 1 degree of freedom, which is 3.841; consistent with Cochran Q test result. A total of 3080 Mc Nemar's tests are conducted for the performances.

As there was no significant difference between the performance measures of the tests by the Cochran Q test, a success measure was created using the Mc Nemar's test results and success ratios of the test trials. Trials were inspected pairwise and for each test pair, if their predictions were found statistically different from each other, the trial with higher success ratio was given 1 point. As a result of this work, best classification trial was found as the one done with blood volume means of the third question level section as feature set and 6 nearest neighbor classifier after PCA with 4 features. Its predictions were different than 6 trials with lower success ratio and its success ratio was 73.91%.

Consistent with the information gathered from the field expert, blood volume information content of the regions at the end of the experiment regarding the classification of migraineur and healthy is higher than the feature sets.

4.5. Statistical Inspection of Classification Results of Dataset 2

To apply Cochran Q analysis on classification results of dataset 2, test statistics calculated using the ((8) is 46.82, smaller than the 0.05-quintile of the chi-squared distribution with 71 degrees of freedom, 93. Thus null hypothesis is accepted; there was no statistically significant difference in performances of trials with the confidence interval of 95%. All the trials performed equally successful within the given dataset. But there were statistically significant differences in predictions of classification trials for the subjects, again with the confidence interval of 95%. Using the ((8), calculated Cochran Q statistic is 153.74 and greater than the 0.05-quintile of the chisquared distribution with 71 degrees of freedom, 93. So, null hypothesis is rejected; there is statistically significant difference between the predictions of trials for the test subjects. That means some of the trials, labeled some of the subjects different than others.

To confirm the Cochran Q test results and find difference between the trials, pairwise Mc Nemar's tests are applied for the trials. Using ((9), Mc Nemar's test statistic is calculated for each trial pair. All of the calculated statistics using the performance values of the trials were less than the 0.05-quintile of the chi-squared distribution with 1 degree of freedom, which is 3.841. So all null hypothesis are accepted, there were no differences in performance between trial pairs. In Cochran Q test conducted using the predictions of trials, there was a significant difference in some of the trials. To find out which pairs were different than each other, pairwise Mc Nemar's tests are conducted using the prediction data. Some of these Mc Nemar's test statistics were higher than the 0.05-quintile of the chi-squared distribution with 1 degree of freedom, which is 3.841; consistent with Cochran Q test result. A total of 5112 Mc Nemar's tests are conducted for the performances.

As there was no significant difference found between the performance measures of the tests by the Cochran Q test, a success measure was created using the Mc Nemar's test results and success ratios of the test trials. Trials were inspected pairwise and for each test pair, if their predictions were found statistically different from each other, the trial with higher success ratio was given 1 point. As a result of this work, best classification trial was found as the one done with de-oxy hemoglobin means of the fourth breath hold section as feature set and 2 nearest neighbor classifier after PCA with 3 features. Its predictions were different than 7 trials with lower success ratio and its success ratio was 83.33%.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK

5.1. Discussion

From the beginning of the study, there was a certain degree of uncertainty in which features to extract and which classification methods to use as there were no previous work on classification of migraineurs with neurovascular system data gathered during cognitive or physical challenges using NIRS. This fog of unknown has been eliminated in part thanks to the information supplied by field expert. After extracting features in consistency with the information supplied by the field expert, extraction methods were selected as a set of most commonly used supervised learning techniques with data having unknown distribution.

Results gathered indicate significance of blood volume and de-oxy hemoglobin data acquired in the last sessions of experiment, in classification of migraineur and healthy from each other, in consistence with the reported expectations of the field expert. As it was also suggested, data gathered during a cognitive task, mental arithmetic, seems to be as successful as physical tasks.

As observed from the results of statistical tests, there is no significant difference between performance measures of the trials for both datasets. Thus, trial with better success ratio, sensitivity and specificity would be considered as a better classification method for migraine disease.

With dataset 1, best result seems to be gathered with the trial 49 which is conducted with differences between de-oxy hemoglobin mean values of question level III and

the rest session before that and Naïve Bayes classifier. But, there are trials with higher specificity, with close success ratios to the success ratio of trial 49, such as trial 12 or trial 24. Those with higher sensitivity are expected to detect migraineurs better; on the other hand, trials with better specificity would detect healthy subjects better (Altman & Bland, 1994).

With dataset 2, the best results are shared among a number of trials. Trial numbers 28, 37, 40, 62, 64, 67, 68 and 72 all have the same success ratio, sensitivity, specificity and precision values of 83.33%. 5 of these trials were made using KNN after PCA, 1 made using KNN, 1 made using Naïve Bayes and 1 made using Naïve Bayes after PCA. 1 of the trials used Hb mean values of breath hold session III, 2 used differences between means of blood volume values of breath hold session I and rest session before that, 2 used differences between means of blood volume values of blood volume values of breath hold session before that and rest session before that, 2 used differences between means of de-oxy hemoglobin values of breath hold session III and rest session before that and 1 used all differences between mean values of blood volume and de-oxy hemoglobin of all breath hold sessions and rest sessions before them. As error type I and error type II of all these methods were shared with exact same subjects, it can be said that, sources of these errors were measurements.

For trials with both datasets, feature sets that include all of the features extracted combined, had lower performance than other trials. This may be a result of dependency of BV and HB values as statistical methods such as Naïve Bayes and KNN.

Also, dependencies between channels of NIRS device are unknown and assumed to be non-existent in this study. But this is certainly an issue that should be investigated further.

5.2. Contributions

In this study, contributions can be listed as;

- Physiological assumptions of field expert, namely regions closer to the end of measurements being more discriminating than previous ones, were proven right.
- Statistical pattern classification methods were shown to be promising on classification problems of migraineur and healthy subjects using NIRS data
- Both cognitive and physiological tasks are proven to be valuable for discriminating migraineur from healthy subjects
- As there is no particular test for migraine diagnosis, this method may be improved further to be one.

5.3. Future Work

As reported in classification section, small in numbers-of-subjects datasets such as dataset 1 and dataset 2 are not suitable for application of pattern classification methods such as HMM and SVM. Especially temporal classifiers such as HMM may contribute to cases like this one. Temporal classification of NIRS data which is similar to multi-channel electroencephalography or multi sourced audio data may be more successful than statistical methods applied to data after feature extraction. During feature extraction, some of data is lost by functions like mean, maximum or minimum because of the need of expressing a specific region of measurement with a single value. Using temporal classifiers and feeding data to the classifier as is, may increase classification performance as content of the supplied data is increased.

As the dataset sizes are too small, results of classification were not easy to interpret. There is no certain way to find out error source in classifications, so to improve classification results by modifying classifier setups, these preliminary trials must be repeated with datasets having more subjects. After those results are generated, more definitive comments would be possible to do about the classifier settings.

Also length of measurements in future experiments is recommended to be altered. As suggested by the field expert, migraineurs are expected to get tired more and quicker

than healthy subjects, so effects of longer challenges should be investigated. For example, in dataset 1, there are three levels of question and it is unknown if it would be more discriminative to have a fourth level of question in measurements. Experiments with three, four and five question settings (maybe longer) should be repeated and results of those should be compared using statistical methods explained above.

Dataset 1 had deficiencies caused by measurement device. Having how much effect would it have on classification results unknown, there is possibility of increase in classification performance. So, a better checked equipment should be used with further studies.

As all subjects were requested to do measurements only once, there could be no inspection about repeated measurements. Further experiments having repeated measurements of the same subjects would not only increase amount of data but would also help eliminating random error caused by daily effects that subjects' are under such as stress, pain, lack of sleep etc.

REFERENCES

Near-infrared window in biological tissue. (2011, September 2). December 14, 2011 tarihinde Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Near-infrared_window_in_biological_tissue adresinden alındı

- Akın, A., Bilensoy, D., Emir, U., Gülsoy, M., Candansayar, S., & Bolay, H. (2006). Cerebrovascular dynamics in patients with migraine: Near-infrared spectroscopy study. *Neuroscience Letters*, 400(1-2), 86 - 91.
- Alpar, R. (2006, September). Spor Bilimlerinde Uygulamalı İstatistik (3rd Edition b.). Nobel Publishing and Distribution.
- Altman, D. G., & Bland, J. M. (1994, June). Diagnostic tests 1: sensitivity and specificit. *British Medical Journal*, 308, 1552.
- Bolay, H., & Moskowitz, M. A. (2005). The neurobiology of migraine and transformation of headache therapy. S. G. Waxman içinde, *From neuroscience to neurology* (s. 107-123). Academic Press.
- Chan, S.-t., Tam, Y., Lai, C.-y., Wu, H.-y., Lam, Y.-k., Wong, P.-n., & Kwong, K. (2009). Transcranial Doppler study of cerebrovascular reactivity: Are migraineurs more sensitive to breath-hold challenge? *Brain Research*, *1291*(0), 53 - 59.
- Chance, B. (1991). Optical Method. Annual Review of Biophysics and Biophysical Chemistry, 20(1), 1-30.

- Delpy, D. T., Cope, M., van der Zee, P., Arridge, S., Wray, S., & Wyatt, J. (1988). Estimation of optical pathlength through tissue from direct time of flight measurement. *Physics in Medicine and Biology*, 33(12), 1433.
- Delpy, D., & Cope, M. (1997). Quantification in tissue near-infrared spectroscopy. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences, 352(1354), 649-659.
- Dietterich, T. (1998, oct). Approximate Statistical Tests for Comparing Supervised Classification Learning Algorithms. *Neural Computation*, *10*(7), 1895--1923.
- Duda, R., Hart, P., & Stork, D. (2000). Pattern Classification (2nd b.). Wiley.
- Furey, T., Cristianini, N., Duffy, N., Bednarski, D., Schummer, M., & Haussler, D. (2000). Support vector machine classification and validation of cancer tissue samples using microarray expression data. *Bioinformatics*, 16, 906-914.
- Hoshi, Y. (2003). Functional near-infrared optical imaging: Utility and limitations in human brain mapping. *Psychophysiology*, 40(4), 511--520.
- Hoshi, Y. (2005). FUNCTIONAL NEAR-INFRARED SPECTROSCOPY: POTENTIAL AND LIMITATIONS IN NEUROIMAGING STUDIES. INTERNATIONAL REVIEW OF NEUROBIOLOGY, 237-266.
- Hoshi, Y. (2011). Towards the next generation of near-infrared spectroscopy. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences, 369(1955), 4425-4439.
- Liboni, W., Molinari, F., Allais, G., Mana, O., Negri, E., Grippi, G., . . . Bussone, G. (2007). Why do we need NIRS in migraine? *Neurological Sciences*, 28, S222-S224.

Looney, S. (1988). A statistical technique for comparing the accuracies of several classifiers. *Pattern Recognition Letters*, 8(1), 5 - 9.

Mobley, J., & Vo-Dinh, T. (2003, mar). Optical Properties of Tissue. CRC Press.

- Oxford Optronix. (2011). *Tissue Vitality Monitoring > Dissolved Oxygen Tissue pO2 Monitors*. January 02, 2012 tarihinde Oxford Optronix: http://www.oxfordoptronix.com/pO2monitors.htm adresinden alındı
- Richards-Kortum, R., & Sevick-Muraca, E. (1996). QUANTITATIVE OPTICAL SPECTROSCOPY FOR TISSUE DIAGNOSIS. *Annual Review of Physical Chemistry*, 47(1), 555-606.
- Sayli, O. (2009). Accuracy improvements of NIRS and investigation of muscle oxidative metabolism. Istanbul, Turkey: Bogazici University.
- Sayli, O., Burtecin Aksel, E., & Akin, A. (2008). Crosstalk and error analysis of fat layer on continuous wave near-infrared spectroscopy measurements. *Journal* of Biomedical Optics, 13(6), 064019.
- Schroeter, M., Zysset, S., Kupka, T., Kruggel, F., & von Cramon, D. (2002). Nearinfrared spectroscopy can detect brain activity during a color–word matching Stroop task in an event-related design. *Human Brain Mapping*, 17(1), 61--71.
- Shinoura, N., & Yamada, R. (2005, jun). Decreased vasoreactivity to right cerebral hemisphere pressure in migraine without aura: a near-infrared spectroscopy study. *Clin Neurophysiol*, 116(6), 1280--1285.
- Sitaram, R., Zhang, H., Guan, C., Thulasidas, M., Hoshi, Y., Ishikawa, A., . . . Birbaumer, N. (2007). Temporal classification of multichannel near-infrared spectroscopy signals of motor imagery for developing a brain Computer interface. *NeuroImage*, 34(4), 1416 - 1427.

- Thie, A., Carvajal-Lizano, M., Schlichting, U., Spitzer, K., & Kunze, K. (1992). Multimodal tests of cerebrovascular reactivity in migraine: a transcranial Doppler study. *Journal of Neurology*, 239, 338-342.
- Unlu, E., Bolay, H., & Akin, A. (2009, may). Hemodynamic correlates of mental arithmetic task in migraine. *Biomedical Engineering Meeting*, 2009. *BIYOMUT 2009. 14th National*, (s. 1 -4).
- Vernieri, F., Tibuzzi, F., Pasqualetti, P., Altamura, C., Palazzo, P., Rossini, P., & Silvestrini, M. (2008). Increased cerebral vasomotor reactivity in migraine with aura: an autoregulation disorder? A transcranial Doppler and nearinfrared spectroscopy study. *Cephalalgia an international journal of headache*, 28(7), 689--695.
- Villringer, A., & Chance, B. (1997). Non-invasive optical spectroscopy and imaging of human brain function. *Trends in Neurosciences*, 20(10), 435 442.
- Villringer, A., Planck, J., Hock, C., Schleinkofer, L., & Dirnagl, U. (1993). Near infrared spectroscopy (NIRS): A new tool to study hemodynamic changes during activation of brain function in human adults. *Neuroscience Letters*, 154(1-2), 101 - 104.
- Voelz, V. A. (2006, August 30). *Hypothesis Testing*. 01 01, 2012 tarihinde Vincent Voelz Personal Website: http://www.stanford.edu/~vvoelz/lectures/hypotesting.pdf adresinden alındı
- Wikipedia. (2012). *Supervised learning*. January 06, 2012 tarihinde Wikipedia: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Supervised_learning adresinden alındı

Zhang, H. (2004). The Optimality of Naive Bayes. FLAIRS Conference. AAAI Press.

TEZ FOTOKOPISI IZIN FORMU

_

<u>ENSTİTÜ</u>

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü	
Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü	
Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü	
Enformatik Enstitüsü	
Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü	

YAZARIN

	Soyadı : Adı : Bölümü :	
	TEZİN ADI (İngilizce) :	
	TEZİN TÜRÜ : Yüksek Lisans Doktora	
1.	Tezimin tamamından kaynak gösterilmek şartıyla fotokopi alınabilir.	
2.	Tezimin içindekiler sayfası, özet, indeks sayfalarından ve/veya bir bölümünden kaynak gösterilmek şartıyla fotokopi alınabilir.	
3.	Tezimden bir bir (1) yıl süreyle fotokopi alınamaz.	

TEZİN KÜTÜPHANEYE TESLİM TARİHİ: