

CONTESTED BELONGINGS: UNDERSTANDING THE MEANING OF
TURKISH CLASSICAL MUSIC AMONG YOUNG WOMEN IN GERMANY

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY
NEVİN ŞAHİN

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
SOCIAL ANTHROPOLOGY

SEPTEMBER 2009

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Sencer Ayata
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Prof. Dr. Cüneyt Can

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sabine Strasser
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mustafa Şen (METU, SOC) _____

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sabine Strasser (METU, SOC) _____

Assist. Prof. Dr. Cenk Güray (Atılım U., Fine Arts) _____

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last name: Nevin Şahin

Signature:

ABSTRACT

CONTESTED BELONGINGS: UNDERSTANDING THE MEANING OF TURKISH CLASSICAL MUSIC AMONG YOUNG WOMEN IN GERMANY

Şahin, Nevin

M.S., Department of Sociology

Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sabine Strasser

September 2009, 95 pages

Turkish citizens who went to Germany as migrant workers during 1960s and 1970s attached themselves to the language and music of their home country in order to sustain their local, regional or national belongings. In the 21st century, against the backdrop of globalization, the second and third generation of the Turkish group in Germany has different ties with Turkey and “Turkish culture”. Are the belongings of the German-Turkish youth still shaped by language, music and cultural artifacts related to Turkey? What do they try to preserve, what do they reassemble or re-arrange? What is the meaning of music in these processes of identity?

Considering the literature on the German-Turkish youth, this study aims at giving voice to an “invisible” group through an unheard genre of music. This study looks at young women, second and third generation of Turkish background, in Germany and the role of Turkish classical music in their everyday lives. A genre with a history of about a millennium, Turkish classical music as a performance entered the German context in late 1970s with the first Turkish classical music choir.

Since then the production of Turkish classical music has been feminized, and the young women singing in these choirs, who are somehow the followers of previous generations, develop ties to the music and the music circles they attend.

The ethnographic data, which has been collected through a fieldwork of three months in Germany, mainly in Berlin, among young women in Turkish classical music choirs, shows that multiple belongings play a role in the transnational experience of music making among German-Turkish young women. When considered the Turkishness and Germanness of their identities with religious, linguistic and national aspects, it can be said that the young women experience a contestation of belongings and try to hide themselves in music in an effort to escape the tension of contested belongings. However, Turkish classical music is a source of contested belongings since the young women considered produce a type of music that they do not normally listen to.

Keywords: German-Turkish Young Women, Turkish Classical Music, Belongings, Transnationality.

ÖZ

AİDİYETLER ÇEKİŞMESİ: KLASİK TÜRK MÜZİĞİNİN ALMANYA'DAKİ GENÇ KADINLAR ARASINDAKİ ANLAMI

Şahin, Nevin

Yüksek Lisans, Sosyoloji Bölümü
Tez Yöneticisi: Doç. Dr. Sabine Strasser

Eylül 2009, 95 sayfa

1960 ve 1970lerde Almanya'ya işçi olarak giden Türk vatandaşları yerel, bölgesel ya da ulusal aidiyetlerini koruyabilmek için ana vatanlarının dillerine ve müziklerine kendilerini bağladılar. 21. yüzyılda, küreselleşme ortamına karşı, Almanya'daki Türk grubun ikinci ve üçüncü kuşakları Türkiye ve Türk kültürü ile daha farklı bağlara sahiptir. Genç Türk-Almanların aidiyetleri hâlâ Türkiye'yle ilgili dil, müzik ve kültürel nesnelerle mi şekillenmektedir? Neyi korumaya, yeniden kurmaya ya da düzenlemeye çalışmaktalar? Bu kimlik süreçlerinde müziğin anlamı nedir?

Türk-Alman gençliği üzerine var olan çalışmalar düşünüldüğünde, bu çalışmanın “görünmeyen” bir gruba ve duyulmayan bir müzik türüne ses vermeyi amaçladığı söylenebilir. Bu çalışma Almanya'daki Türk kökenli ikinci ve üçüncü kuşak genç kadınları ve klasik Türk müziğinin onların günlük hayatlarındaki rolünü

incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Yaklaşık bin yıllık bir geçmişe sahip bir müzik türü olan klasik Türk müziği, bir gösterim olarak Alman bağlamına 1970lerin sonunda ilk klasik Türk müziği korosuyla girdi. O günden bu yana klasik Türk müziği üretimi kadınlaştı ve bu korolarda şarkı söyleyen ve bir şekil önceki kuşakların devamı olan bu genç kadınlar müziğe ve katıldıkları müzik çevrelerine bağlar geliştirmişlerdir.

Çalışma için Almanya’da, özellikle Berlin’de, Türk musikisi korolarına devam eden genç kadınlar arasında üç aylık bir alan araştırmasıyla toplanan etnografik veri Türk-Alman genç kadınların ulusaşırı müzik üretim deneyimlerinde çoklu aidiyetlerin rol oynadığını göstermektedir. Kimliklerindeki dinî, dilsel ve ulusal boyutlarıyla Türklük ve Almanlık göz önünde bulundurulduğunda, söz konusu genç kadınların bir aidiyetler çekişmesi yaşadıklarını ve çekişen aidiyetlerin yarattığı gerginlikten kaçabilmek adına kendilerini müzikle gizlediklerini söylemek mümkündür. Ancak, klasik Türk müziği de aidiyetler çekişmesinin bir kaynağıdır, çünkü bu kadınlar genelde dinlemedikleri bir müziği üretmektedirler.

Anahtar kelimeler: Türk-Alman Genç Kadınlar, Klasik Türk Müziği, Aidiyetler, Ulusaşırılık.

To amateur musicians...

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sabine Strasser for her valuable guidance, encouragement and insight throughout the research. I also express my sincere thanks to Dr. Michi Knecht from Humboldt Universität zu Berlin, who supervised my field research in Germany, for her worthy contribution to the framework of the study. In addition, I would like to thank the examining committee members, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mustafa Şen and Assist. Prof. Dr. Cenk Güray for their enlightening suggestions.

I am especially grateful to Gökçe Aydın for dedicating a considerable amount of time to review chapters of this thesis. I am also thankful to Nurhak Polat, Nilüfer Nahya and Zeynep Helvacı for their invaluable assistances and supports. I would also like to thank my colleagues Zeynep Sariaslan and Yakup Deniz Kahraman for their contribution to the emergence of this research project.

I am appreciating Mustafa, Besim, Kübra, Kıvanç and Cahit abi for their friendship and assistance during my field research. I also thank Nuri Karademirli, Serap Sağat, Remzi Altıok, Öztürk Şahin, Haluk Yücel and all my informants for their enthusiasm about contributing to my research.

I am especially thankful to TÜBİTAK (The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey) for the financial support throughout my field research as well as my MS studies.

Additionally, I owe to thank to my dear friends Aydan, Yüstra, Emre, Ezgi, Bülent, Seval, Ebru, Cengiz, Bican, Engin, Miase, Salih, Nazlı, Mehmet, Gundula, my dear choirmaster Coşkun and the “Sayko” group for their being a great source of

support, love and patience throughout my research in Germany and the nerve-cracking writing procedure.

Finally, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my family who always made me feel that I was not alone by their encouragement and support of any kind throughout the research just as they have been doing throughout my life.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PLAGIARISM	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ÖZ	vi
DEDICATION.....	viii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	ix
TABLE OF CONTENTS	xi

CHAPTER

1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1. From Cackling to Singing: A Historical Overview of Turks in Germany	3
1.2. Migration of Turkish Classical Music to Germany.....	5
1.3. German-Turkish Youth.....	8
1.4. A Quest to Understand: Research Questions	11
2. PROCESSES, DEFINITIONS AND CONSIDERATIONS OF KEY CONCEPTS	12
2.1. From Identity to Belongings	12
2.2. Transnationality.....	14
2.3. Youth and Gender	17
2.4. Turkish Classical Music.....	19
3. YOUNG GERMAN-TURKISH WOMEN IN TURKISH CLASSICAL MUSIC CIRCLES: A DESCRIPTION OF THE FIELD AND METHODOLOGY	24
3.1. The Site	24
3.2. German-Turkish Young Women: An Introduction	27

3.2.1. “I was born in Berlin but...”: Social Backgrounds of the Young Women.....	27
3.2.2. Awareness of Turkish Classical Music	28
3.2.3. Relationship with the ‘Home’ Country	32
3.2.4. Attitudes towards Instruments and Instrumentalists	34
3.3. Methodology	38
3.3.1. Grounded Theory	38
3.3.2. Techniques Used in the Field.....	40
4. A LOOK INTO IDENTIFICATION PROCESSES	43
4.1. “Es geht um uns”: Turkishness Reconsidered	44
4.1.1. Turkishness on the Level of Nation	46
4.1.2. Turkishness on the Level of Language.....	47
4.1.3. Turkishness on the Level of Religion.....	48
4.1.4. Second <i>Memleket</i> : Understanding of the ‘Home’ Country	49
4.2. Different Levels of Belonging	52
4.2.1. The Importance of Being Young Women	52
4.2.2. Age-based Relationships	53
4.2.3. Belonging to the Music Circle	54
4.3. The Role of Music	56
4.3.1. “No music without sharing”: Belonging to Music.....	56
4.3.2. Superiority and Difficulty: Meanings Attached to Turkish Classical Music	57
4.3.3. Taste and Lyrics: A Peculiar Experience	60
4.3.4. Multiple Contexts in Determining the Meaning	62
4.4. Contested Belongings	65
4.4.1. “ <i>Deutsche Türk</i> ”: Revered Turkishness vs Despised Turkishness ..	65
4.4.2. Contested Experiences of the Home Country.....	67
4.4.3. “Two things cannot be good at the same time”: Germanness in Act	68
4.4.4. Turkish Classical Music as a Source of Contestation	71

5. CONCLUSION	74
---------------------	----

REFERENCES	77
------------------	----

APPENDICES

A. The note of <i>Şu dere yonca</i>	88
B. The note of <i>Can ellerinden gelmişem</i>	89
C. The note of <i>Erler demine destur alalım</i>	90
D. The note of <i>Aşkın ile âşıklar</i>	91
E. The note of <i>Gurbetten gelmişim yorgunum hancı</i>	92
F. The note of <i>Dil seni sevmeyeni sevmede lezzet mi olur</i>	93
G. The note of <i>Sende acep uşşaka eziyet mi çoğaldı</i>	94
H. The note of <i>Ännchen von Tharau</i>	95

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

...we are only where the music takes us.
Simon Frith (1996: 125)

In today's world where crossing borders is becoming easier and easier, at the same time it is becoming more and more difficult to find an accurate answer to the question: Who am I? As Poster frankly asked about 20 years ago (Hannerz, 1996: 26), e-mailing a friend in Paris when actually being in California and witnessing political and cultural events all around the world without even leaving home has made people think about their identities. Migration even contributed to this confusion of where the origins and today's belongings are. Salman Rushdie gave a laconic explanation to this case in an interview with Gerald Marzorati (Manuel, 1997: 17): "We are increasingly becoming a world of migrants, made up of bits and fragments from here and there."

With the intensified transnational flows of money, people, goods and media content, Peter Manuel states that globalization of world culture annexes new dimensions to the construction of migrant identities and the role of the images of the home country (1997:17). Through the labyrinth of transnationality, music can be one of the lanterns showing the researchers their way towards a better understanding of the belongings of migrants. Arjun Appadurai mentioned in his study on modernity that in a transnational world, music is travelling across global and local borders via electronic media and having a role in global cultural flows. He indicates that the complex forms of media have impacts on the audience so that their imagination and desires are fostered (1990: 298-299). Considering the bits and fragments Rushdie talked about, it is meaningful to look at Dick Hebdige's approach to music: "The roots don't stay in one place. They change shape.

They change colour. And they grow. There is no such thing as a pure point of origin, least of all in something as slippery as music, but that doesn't mean there isn't history.” (1987: 10)

Wherever its origins are, music has a certain role in the global cultural flows and it is one of the forces determining transnational ties and belongings of migrant people. However, studying music on its own is not enough to give a satisfying explanation to the belongings and the processes they are constantly re-shaped through. Giving examples from opera (regarded as a frame for ritual social interaction), jazz (in connection with heterogeneous Afro-American experience), African rhythm (socially connected) and Aztec *cantares* (integrated metonymic construction of pre-Columbian Mexican perceptions), Regula Qureshi, who seeks a “truly cosmopolitan musicology” (2003: 342) shows how an anthropological approach to music brings in the “social meaning conveyed in the music” (2003: 339) to the scene. Although it is necessary to take history of music into account, Qureshi emphasizes the focus of anthropology in privileging present over past through lived experiences (2003: 333). This focus gives anthropology an important mission in giving answers to questions related to music and it is a rather late response to Martin Stokes' complaint about the “tone-deafness” of anthropology towards music as a research topic (1994: 1).

Being influenced by the ideas of the scholars mentioned above, this study aims to have an understanding of the belongings of a migrant group in Germany through their relationship with a specific genre of music which was brought there from their ‘home country’. The introductory chapter of this thesis gives a short account of the history of the Turkish migrant group¹ in Germany and Turkish classical music, which form the two bases of the research.

¹ The term ‘group’ is preferred to describe the people concerned in this study as it is regarded the basis of human interaction (Stangor, 2004: 2) by reflecting the common ground the members of which meet and it has relatively less connotations when compared to ‘community’ the effort to define which would probably fail to provide a concise explanation (Milson, 1974 : 3) and ‘diaspora’ the definition of which changes depending on the context (Slobin, 2003: 285), carrying much politics in it that would exceed the limits of this study.

1.1. From Cackling to Singing: a Historical Overview of Turks in Germany

“Those days were especially difficult for the first comers” started Şebnem abla², a middle-aged oud player at the Berlin Private Conservatory of Turkish Music, to tell the history of Turks in Germany when we were eating sunflower seeds in a special nut-café in Kreuzberg. This was her favorite place just because she was able to eat sunflower seeds there. “A few decades ago we didn’t have any of these shops”, she continued; her first years in Germany just like the rest of the first generation Turks were filled with adventures which would later on turn into short stories to be told to the following generations and researchers. Since 1960s, Turks have been one of the major migrant groups in Germany, appealing to the ethnographers with their interesting identity construction and integration processes. The first Turks in Germany were total strangers and had a very hard time giving up their habits and getting used to this new lifestyle. Şebnem abla was bitterly smiling when telling the story of a miserable housewife who had to cackle in a shop so as to buy eggs just because she did not know any German. As the years passed, however, the Turks managed to adapt to Germanness in their own way without giving up their national, cultural and linguistic belongings. Ruth Mandel summarized the state of Germany in 1990s as a nation-state “whose identity is becoming ever more problematic as it is threatened by outsiders already inside the ‘fortress’.” (1994: 122) The Turks were once regarded as only *Reichsausländer* and citizenship was not granted to them (Mandel, 1994: 116). This situation aroused a debate because people with Polish origin who do not even know the German language at all, just because they are descendants of previous citizens of the Reich, “have an automatic ‘bloodright’ to German citizenship, but not necessarily the second- and third-generation descendants of Turkish migrant workers, born and reared in Germany.” (Mandel, 1994: 117) Nevertheless, after the reunion, although they were more ‘foreign’ than the citizens of former East

² Names of the informants, apart from the public figures like the choirmasters, have been changed.

Germany, the Turks showed that they were much better integrated into the everyday life of western Germany (Mandel, 1994: 115).

As Rupa Huq mentions, the stricter it is practiced, the more integration suppresses differences (2003: 199). However strictly integration policies were practiced, Turks have never left their Turkishness away. This strong attachment to national identity unfortunately constructed essentialized images of Turks in Germany and these essentialized images “distance them beyond the embrace of Europeanness” (Mandel, 1994: 120). But of course things are not that simple. Jeffrey Jurgens talks about “imagined ties and identifications” (2001: 94), which probably fit the German understanding of integration in the sense of not only a process of ethnic assimilation but also a process of acquiring the appropriate ‘middle class’ lifestyle (2001: 106), but which also reflect their relationship with the home country. Jurgens also asserts that the identities of Turkish migrants in Germany are not basically determined “by their transnational social networks or their imagined relationships with Turkey and Turkishness” (2001: 95). He alerts his audience that being strongly attached to Turkishness for the Turkish migrants in Germany should not necessarily mean that “Turkish ethnic identity in Germany is identical to its counterpart in Turkey” (2001: 106). The identities of people with Turkish origin living in Germany is more complex than the intersection of Turkishness and Germanness, that is why Jurgens urges to consider ‘Turkish-German transmigrants’ in plural sense (2001: 107).

Cihangir Terzi also emphasizes this multi-dimensional nature of Turkish identity in Germany and talks about the ‘German Turkey’ which seems to be intellectually Turkish and spatially German (2009: 134). The music cultures of the Turks in Germany, just like their lifestyles, are stuck in between according to Terzi (2009: 135). There is a large sector of Turkish music production on the level of education (religious and national associations, institutes, culture houses, private music schools etc.), live music sites (wedding halls, restaurants, *türkübar* etc.) and broadcast channels like Metropol FM (Greve, 2006; Terzi, 2009). However, the production of traditional and popular Turkish music genres are regarded as low

quality due to lack of proper education and guidance (2009: 135) but the active participation of the youth in cultural events and music production is promising when considered the future of Turkish music in Germany (2009: 138). The complexity of the current state of Turkish music in general brings in the necessity to have a historical overview so as to better understand Turkish classical music.

1.2. Migration of Turkish Classical Music to Germany

Karl Signell, when he was conducting his field research in Turkey, was told that Turkish classical music as a genre was on the point of death and it had at most 10 years life left (1976: 80). However, that time was in fact the birth of Turkish classical music in Germany. Remzi Altıok, the president of *Berliner Ensemble für klassische türkische Musik e.V.*, told that there were choirs of workers under leftist associations during early 1970s which formed the basis of Turkish classical music choirs. The first Turkish classical music choir started to practice in 1979 in Berlin (Greve, 2006: 340). But even before that the Turks in Germany had connections with Turkish classical music. Nuri Karademirli, a young oud player at İzmir branch of Turkish national radio by then, came to Germany for a concert in 1969 and had to settle there, pioneering activities in Turkish classical music.³

John Cornell and Chris Gibson say that it is possible to regard all music as ‘world music’ at one level since music is a perennial feature of all societies (2004: 343) but it is significant that Turkish music in Germany has not gone under this umbrella title of ‘world music’. In the last few years, Turkish Music in Germany has stuck out and various genres, including classical music, found a place for themselves within this trend. The 2004 Golden Bear winner director Fatih Akın’s documentary film *Crossing the Bridge: Sound of Istanbul* (2005) was about the music culture in Turkey and it attracted a great deal of attention from the German audience as well as Turkish ones. Two important events have recently fostered special attention on Turkish Music in Germany. The first one is *Klangkulturen*⁴.

³ May 28, 2009, personal communication.

⁴ http://www.roc-berlin.de/content/ueber_uns/vierklang/klang_kulturen/index_ger.html

The Berlin Radio Orchestra and Choir, known as *roc-Berlin* started delivering concerts named *Klangkulturen*, “the voice of cultures” in 2007. The themes of the concerts range from hymns to folk songs covering both German and Turkish traditional pieces and they are featuring musicians from Berlin Private Conservatory of Turkish Music. The *Klangkulturen* concerts, which now include Persian as well as Turkish music, are in their second season now and bringing together two very different musical traditions on the same stage; the main aim of the project is to contribute to the integration of immigrant groups into the society. The second event is *popKomm*⁵. In October 2008, the event *popKomm* took place in Berlin with Turkey as the partner country. In an effort to emphasize one of the many colors in Berlin, the event brought famous Turkish musicians together. For example, famous musicians of classical and folk music, Sabahat Akkiraz, Taksim Trio and Halil Karaduman performed under “Traditional Turkish Music” section. During my field research İstanbul State Choir of Turkish Classical Music had a concert in The Berliner Philharmoniker under the title *Alla turca: ein kultureller Dialog* (Alla turca: Orient and Occident meet for a Cultural Dialogue), which was a continuation of this increasing interest in Turkish music.

Cornell and Gibson regard world music as always changing through processes of fusion, diffusion, decline and revival (2004: 358) and they conclude with Frith’s idea that musical traditions only survive through constant innovation (2000: 311). This general comment can be adopted for Turkish classical music which is also under constant change and this change is reflected in the instruments people prefer to play, the songs people prefer to sing etc. Going back to the 10th century with the first compositions by Al-Farabi (Üngör, 1999: 573), Turkish classical music reached its peak with Hammamizade İsmail Dede Efendi during Ottoman period and meanwhile an effect of Western music started to be seen in the compositions (Signell, 1976: 74). Under the influence of the Turkist Theory of Culture offered by Ziya Gökalp, there occurred a political segregation between Turkish classical music and Turkish folk music and with the Gökalpian language of Western

⁵ http://www1.messe-berlin.de/vip8_1/website/Internet/Internet/www.popkomm/deutsch/Festival/Programm/index.jsp

orientalism (Stokes, 1992: 34) Turkish folk music was favored by the state while Turkish classical music was banned from the state radio in 1934 (Tekelioğlu, 2001: 105). Once regarded as one of the two great music systems in the world next to Western classical music (Songar, 1986: 7), Turkish classical music, having covered 562 makams⁶ (Sökmen & Aksu, 1986: 17), has been expanding with new makams and new musical forms in recent compositions while on the other hand losing the performance frequency of most makams and forms of previous centuries. While some instruments like *rebab*, *lâvta*, *sînekeman* and *santur* were commonly used in the performance of Turkish classical music once, they are either totally abandoned or about to be abandoned or have already been forgotten or replaced by instruments like violin and clarinet (Üngör, 1999: 579, 581). Manuel writes about the music traditions of Indo-Caribbeans, who do not have any actual contact with India but strive to reconstruct the traditions of home country, and he confirms that *tan*-singers who sing the traditional Indian music do not have continuous interaction with Indian classical music (1997: 26). For the people dealing with Turkish classical music in Germany, the issue of representation is similar to that of Indian classical music. Turkish people, although they have strong ties with Turkey cannot keep their ties with the classical music that strong and they have a rather limited perception about this music genre, which consequently shapes their production of Turkish classical music. No matter how much limited their relationship with the classical music of the 'home country'⁷, the Turkish people reflect the role of Turkish classical music in

⁶ Makam is the key musical structure of many Middle Eastern musics and it has different names in different music traditions. It is mainly built upon two key factors: space (tonal) and time (temporal) which concern the scale and the rhythmic pattern, although makam is not directly dependent upon rhythm (Touma, 1971: 38). Together with a specific scale built upon Pythagorean intervals instead of the equal temperaments of Western musics, there is a certain melody pattern called *seyir* which has an introduction, development, and conclusion structure (Tanrıkorur, 2003a: 132) which comprise a makam.

⁷ Host country is used as the country of immigration, i.e. Germany in this case, and home country as the country of origin, the country where the first immigrants came from and which the immigrants keep longing for, and that is Turkey for the German-Turkish people. Although it is currently the third- and fourth-generation Turks in Germany who actually lose their organic ties with Turkey, I still prefer to use these terms since my informants have an understanding of and attachment to the concepts *memleket* and *gurbet*, which are the Turkish equivalents of home

constructing their identities in that they can define themselves with the Turkish classical music circles they are members of or that they can refer to Turkish classical music as their favorite genre or the music of their *memleket*. As Stokes confirms, “[a] sense of identity can be put into play through music by performing it, dancing to it, listening to it or even thinking about it” (1994: 24). The relationship of German-Turkish youth with Turkish classical music is of special concern for this study.

1.3. German-Turkish Youth

My interest in the meaning of Turkish classical music focuses on the German-Turkish young women. First of all, this target group is formed so as to look at the descendants of Turkish migrants who certainly have different identity construction processes and when considered the role of music, focusing on the youth has even more importance. Throughout the study on North African Dance Music and French Rap, Huq emphasizes the significance of second-generation youth:

As well as greater commercial accessibility, it is a commonplace assumption to attribute a growing confidence amongst second-generation youth as a reason for the spread of these diasporic musics. This confidence is seemingly buttressed by a growing visibility of youth of second-generation ethnic origins in the mainstream media reflecting the changing perceptions of minorities in the popular imagination from ‘immigrants’ to ‘settled population’. [2003: 199]

The descendants of immigrants, although sometimes wrongly referred to as second- and third-generation immigrants, are born and grow up in the ‘host country’; thus they are no longer immigrants but rather settled people, which inevitably brings in a different process of identification and a new intersection of cultural processes of the ‘home country’ and ‘host country’. Huq continues to summarize her findings by saying that these diasporic musics reflect a duality or multiplicity of cultural identification for young people rather than being stuck

country and host country respectively, and these words are part of their daily vocabulary which they frequently refer to. See chapter 4 for the lyrics of the songs in the repertoires of the Turkish classical music circles considering these concepts.

between two stools (2003: 204). The second- and third-generation of Turkish population in Germany similarly have different identification processes from both their parents and their German counterparts. Jurgens goes one step further and after mentioning the importance of the image of Turkey in constructing identities for the second- and third-generation Turks in Germany, claims that it is difficult to anticipate the role of 'home country' for the fourth-generation in 2020s. He is also curious about the image of Turkey as the 'home country', which is assumed to be the final destination for settlement, for the following generations (2001: 100). The role of the 'home country' changes from generation to generation as the Turkish people integrate more into German lifestyle. It is inevitable for music to affect this change and be affected from this change in return. Manuel talks about a Hindi song composed by a Trinidadian singer, which contains the lines 'Let's go to the Lucknow bazaar'. What is significant about these lines is that the singer has never been to Lucknow (1997: 19). The relationship between images of 'home country' and traditional music genres for the young people makes youth an important point of focus for the study. Furthermore, in her study on Muslim youth in Britain, Clare Dwyer refers to one of her informants who says that the only thing that relates her to the Muslim identity is her Muslim name and she has nothing else to do with Islam at all. (1999: 61) For the German-Turkish young women who all carry Turkish names, their names are not the only attachment to the Turkish identity and music is one of the agents in going beyond their names in terms of Turkishness.

Another reason why young German-Turkish women and the meanings they attach to Turkish classical music are a matter of concern for this study is that they are not challenging in terms of cultural representation. According to Marianne Gullestad (2004), cultural blindness exists among the unmarked group of majority whose culture is invisible, making them become blind to their own culture and behave as if it is the minorities who could possibly have cultures but not the majority. When we look at minority groups, however, we can see that they are not homogeneous but they have differences within and there exists a majority with mainstream features and minorities with marked peculiarities within the minority group (Yip

2008: 106). Gullestad's conceptualization of the invisibility is about the position of the majority in the society. On the other hand, what Yip draws our attention to is the diversity within minorities. However, it is expected that within this diversity, there will also be majorities within the broader minority groups. Applying Gullestad's conceptualization of the majority, this study regards the German-Turkish young women as an invisible group and invisible groups can be regarded as the expectedly unheard and unmarked majorities among the German-Turkish groups in Germany as the broader minority group. Young women can be regarded as one of those majorities. As Helena Wulff emphasized, anthropology has for a long time overlooked the youth, and when it became concerned about youth culture, it generally focused on male youth (1995: 3). Thus trying to understand how young women are "active agents" in constructing the meanings and symbolic forms of their cultures (Wulff 1995: 1) would be a response to her question on the place of youth in anthropological texts. Considering studies on Turkish music among German-Turkish youth, on the other hand, we come across studies mainly on rap and hip-hop since they are challenging the whole society and cultural environment. However, anthropology has been kind of deaf to Turkish classical music; this genre has remained unheard just like young German-Turkish young women. Neither young German-Turkish women nor Turkish classical music has challenged the society in terms of cultural representation seriously although such a challenge is necessary so as to claim a Turkish identity in Germany. Giving voice to this unheard group through an unheard genre of music thus enables this research to contribute to the literature on Turks in Germany.

It is difficult just to name the target group as Turkish on the level of nationality since the youth generally have either only German citizenship or dual citizenship of Turkey and Germany. It is again inarticulate to name them as German although most of them were born in Germany and have grown up in this country because their ties to Turkey and Turkish culture have not disappeared totally. Thus the definition German-Turkish is preferred without falling into the trap of essentialism as it is defined on the basis of the memories and meanings regardless

of ethnic background and religion but rather, according to the existence of a migration story. The definition of young women, besides, covers the women ranging from adolescence to early adulthood without marital ties⁸, ages between 12 and 27, which includes the active participants of learning and producing Turkish classical music among choirs.

1.4. A Quest to Understand: Research Questions

This study, in short, aims to have a better understanding of the belongings of German-Turkish young women through Turkish classical music. In an effort to give voice to this invisible group and this unheard genre of music, the answer to the following question will be sought throughout the thesis: What is the meaning of Turkish classical music among German-Turkish young women? The key concepts and the theoretical framework of the study will be explored in the second chapter. The methodology adopted for the research will be explained and the field site will be described together with the background information of the informants in the following chapter. The fourth chapter will mainly be the analysis of the findings and it will clarify how much space Turkish classical music takes part in the life of these young women; how they have access to Turkish classical music; the places and people attached to Turkish classical music; their choices; the meanings that they attach to Turkish classical music in relationship with friendships, the home country, the host country and the people in those places; and how their belongings are contested through Turkish classical music.

⁸ I should mention that I had an exception in my group in terms of marital ties. Sezin, a 23-year-old singer, has been married for two years. But I did not want to exclude her from my group since she preferred not to spend time with the other married women in the choir but rather with her peers who were single.

CHAPTER 2

PROCESSES, DEFINITIONS AND CONSIDERATIONS OF KEY CONCEPTS

2.1. From Identity to Belongings

The background of this research started to be built upon the concept identity. As the understanding of identity in academia changed extensively throughout history, its place in this research has inevitably evolved from a single and holistic term to a multi-dimensional and flexible understanding, which is better communicated with the term belongings. First of all, Simon Frith, a sociologist of popular music culture, emphasizes the processual aspect of identity and uses music as a tool to understand and explain the performativeness of identification and he states:

[...] first that identity is mobile, a process not a thing, a becoming not a being; second, that our experience of music- of music making and music listening- is best understood as an experience of this *self-in-process*. Music, like identity, is both performance and story, describes the social in the individual and the individual in the social, the mind in the body and the body in the mind; identity, like music, is a matter of both ethics and aesthetics. [1996: 109]

Jenny White in her article on Turks in Germany comes up with processual identity as another usage to highlight the change and the fluidity of the contexts where identities are produced (1997: 754). Besides the emerging understandings of the term identity, Rogers Brubaker and Frederick Cooper in their article (2000) reject to use this term by implying that identity is an overwhelmed concept carrying a heavy load of connotations like sameness, core of selfhood, process and unstable multiple nature of self; in addition, they come up with different concepts such as identification, categorization, self understanding, social location, commonality, groupness and connectedness so as to overcome the theoretical ambiguity of the

concept. Together with their suggestions, the term belonging started to be adopted instead of identity.

Belonging, which includes different dimensions of the identification process, such as desire, was used mostly for explaining the relation between the individual and the place, with an emphasis on the materiality of the culture (Probyn 1996: 5). Consequently, Ulf Hedetoft and Mette Hjort prefer to define the term as the state of “being” in one place and “longing” for another, which is a rather strong and limited version of the concept as showed below:

Our home is where we belong, territorially, existentially and culturally, where our own community is, where our family and loved ones reside, where we can identify our roots, and where we long to return to when we are elsewhere in the world. [2004: vii]

Belonging works in two different levels, one as individual and the other as collective. Still, it could be argued that just like different positionalities and intersectionality (Yuval-Davis 2006: 199), belongings vary too. Therefore, belongings are plural as people may feel belonged to more than one context or setting. In addition, while religious, national and ethnic belongings are obviously significant notions, other forms of belonging, such as class, family, location, generation etc., are also unavoidably influential.

Not only the dimensions they have, but also the perceptions they arouse are a matter of concern for belongings. As another contribution to the ongoing debate, Valentina Napolitano comes out with prisms of belonging. Napolitano, who studied the medicine men in Mexico, claims that “prisms of belonging are not only the experience itself but also the contested interpretations through which experience is categorized.” (2002: 10) She explains prisms of belonging as having a three-dimensional nature: “they are spatial and temporal; they combine cognitive-emotional experiences, memory, and history; and they link self-understanding to the process of migration and urbanization” (2002: 10). Thus the place where people actually are, where they long to be, the time they live in, the things they experience, their memories, and their understanding of all these form

the facets of prisms of belonging. Napolitano adds that the prisms of belonging are important because people tend to show different identifications of themselves under different conditions (2002: 9).

Napolitano's idea on prisms of belonging show parallelisms to Dwyer's findings about young British Muslim women which she concludes by saying that identifications are "fluid and fluctuating" (1999: 64). Yet the term identity is still being used by scholars, but not with the previous connotations of the term which made people find new concepts to cover what the concept fails to express. Jurgens, for example, states that it is necessary to have particular assumptions about defining collectivities and how one belongs to them so as to claim an identity (2001: 103). Thus it is not wrong to say that the term identity has evolved into a broader and flexible, at the same time a narrower and more articulate concept intersecting with the concept belongings. In this study both concepts frequently recur although it is believed that belongings cover the multi-dimensionality better and the understanding of the concepts include memories about home country and host country, memories about people in those countries, images of "self" and "other" in terms of nationality, ethnicity, language, religion and music. Of course the effect of technology and global cultural flows should not be forgotten. According to Jurgens, "print capitalism, music scales, and satellite television play a decisive role for migrants in knitting together a sense of multi-local belonging and identification" (2001: 99). Furthermore, as Sabine Strasser explains, the conceptualization of culture as something historically contextualized, beyond territories and heterogeneous allows researchers "to trace complex and contested experiences of belonging, othering and place-making in national and transnational spaces" (2008: 175). At this moment, transnationality becomes one of the key concepts for this study.

2.2. Transnationality

Appadurai takes imagination as a collective fact constantly influenced by electronic mediation and mass migration (1996: 7), thus in today's world it is difficult to separate migration stories from media. Ulf Hannerz, in parallel, talks

about how media gave language the power to define cultural boundaries (1996: 21). To talk about the production of Turkish classical music in Germany by young German-Turkish women, it is necessary to understand transnationality. One of the first definitions of the concept came out in 1980s:

The global flow of information proceeds on many different technical and institutional levels, but on all levels the intellectuals are the ones who know most about one another across the frontiers, who keep in touch with one another, and who feel that they are one another's allies...

We may describe as transnational those intellectuals who are at home in the cultures of other peoples as well as their own. They keep track of what is happening in various places. They have special ties to those countries where they have lived, they have friends all over the world, they hop across the sea to discuss something with their colleagues; they fly to visit one another as easily as their counterparts two hundred years ago rode over to the next town to exchange ideas. [Konrad, 1984:208-9, quoted in Hannerz 1990: 243-244]

Referring to George Konrad, Hannerz confirms that transnationality has become a concern for research rather recently (1997: 3). The move of culture through migrant flow, commodity flow and media flow or different combinations of these three brings together different perceptions and communicative modalities each of which draw their own boundaries in a peculiar way (Hannerz, 1997: 8). Borders and boundaries are important in understanding transnationality. "In the borderlands, there is scope for agency in the handling of culture." (Hannerz, 1997: 12)

Featherstone (1993) and Tomlinson (1999) share the same idea on the fluidity of identities, mentioning that globalization is not producing a homogeneous world in any sense, but instead, as Appadurai says (1990), places are repositioned and reimagined under the effect of global flows and networks (Cornell & Gibson, 2004: 343-344). Not only the places but also the identities themselves are repositioned, and musical identities, as Cornell and Gibson put forward, "are now more transient and more evidently involved in fission and fusion than ever before." Producing a local music today brings in the necessity of the effect of global trends, thus global and local should be regarded as relational rather than

oppositional (2004: 357). Consequently, it is impossible to regard Turkish classical music only as the “courtly music of the city İstanbul” without taking into consideration the current dynamics in Turkey and Germany and the people crossing borders in between.

At this point it would be explanatory to go into the semantic genealogy of the word ‘transnational’: ‘nation’ comes from the Latin word ‘nation’ derived from ‘natus’, the past participle of ‘nasci’, meaning ‘to be born’. ‘Trans’ comes from Latin as well, meaning ‘across’, ‘over’, ‘beyond’, ‘through’, ‘on’, or ‘on the other side’. (Luke, 2006: 2-3) Following the linguistic background of the term, Timothy Luke’s definitions can be adopted for this study:

[...] a transnationality could be an embedded community of beings born without their own place in many spaces of diaspora, a migration or a colony interposed in the places of beings born somehow otherwise with their own national places. Similarly, a transnationality could be imagined as beings born in many places and spaces who create communities of conduct, consciousness or conscience across, over, and beyond many other competing codes for the same cultural practices. [2006: 4]

As Luke (2006: 13) confirms, today a number of religions, ideologies, and ethnicities are transnational because they have long histories and deep roots in many different societies and states. Thus it would not be wrong to claim that Turkish music is now transnational as well as the German-Turkish community analyzed in this study. Together with the collective aspect that Appadurai mentioned above, the individual aspect is also important in understanding transnationality. Hannerz tells that a person can connect territorial cultures instead of remaining within them and can make other rounds of life meaningful, which will be consequently incorporated into the personal perspective as an influential experience (1996: 108). Hence, a person can experience a transnational identification by getting in touch with different cultures; furthermore, the background of the same person can be influential in the identification process through transnationality. As Jurgens states, “differing educational and work experiences, along with the differing forms of cultural capital that accompany them, further structure the articulation and enactment of transnational ethnic

identity.” (2001: 95) The German-Turkish young women who engage themselves with Turkish classical music certainly have some kind of cultural capital in common, which makes them share the taste (Bourdieu, 1989) to attach meanings to this genre of music.

2.3. Youth and Gender

As Wulff emphasizes, youth studies in anthropology are relatively limited no matter how much a significant group they are in determining the route of diasporic musics (Huq, 2003). Fortunately they are not too limited in number and there exist some studies which aim to understand how the descendants of migrant groups lead their everyday lives and how they create their own youth culture.

Regina Römhild (2005: 1), for instance, conducted her fieldwork in Frankfurt among a group of young migrants in order to explain the contradiction between nation-state’s claim to power and the reality of migration. What she finds as an explanation is that youth do not become as German as the nation-state expects them to be, but they do not remain attached to their home country either. Consequently, they adopt themselves to a transnational condition and develop their identities accordingly. Another anthropologist specialized in Germany, Levent Soysal, mentions that there is still a tendency to prefer to discover “timeless traditions and unbridgeable cultures” when looking at migrant youth. He adds that the cultural productions of Turkish migrant youth display a “diversity of experience” and “their experiences are displays of diversity” (2001: 21-23). He concludes that they are creating their own peculiar culture which has both local and global attachments. Soysal also ties youth culture and music in his study on hip-hop, which was conducted in Berlin. This study shows that although performing hip-hop has lost its popularity among youth, the noise of its claim “To stay is my right!” still remains (2004: 80-81). This outcome shows that music is instrumentally used by young migrants to raise their political claims.

Another study on Berlin rappers is done by Ayhan Kaya (2002: 44, 59), who argues that Turkish rappers prefer to sit on a third chair instead of being stuck into

the group labeled as “Turkish community” and they rather build up a resistant bloc against structured ‘outsiderism’ in Germany. He also emphasizes the ‘Glokal’ aspect of his German-Turkish hip-hopper informants (2001) and tells (2002) that they can use both their “authentic” cultural capital and global transcultural capital so as to construct and articulate their national and cultural belongings, developing a “third culture”. (Wilpert, 2004: 25)

What these studies on youth and music have in common that they lack a perspective on the two main points of this current study. They focus on popular music genres and they do not have a gendered perspective. However, considering the young women’s participation in Turkish classical music (see chapter 3) there is a significant difference between young men and young women, which makes it necessary to focus on gender. When we look at Bülent Aksoy’s historical study on the role of women in Turkish classical music during Ottoman period, we see that there is a lack of information about women. Nevertheless, Aksoy claims that there was a certain space for women in Ottoman music traditions and Turkish classical music was not a ‘male-music’ (1999: 799) but the lack of information arose not from the fact that it was a patriarchal culture but rather from the fact that Ottoman music culture was an oral tradition (1999: 798).

The place of women in Turkish classical music is consolidated through a transmission of musical culture from generation to generation: the women who listen to Turkish classical music make their daughters listen and get used to it, the ones who produce this music genre by singing encourage their daughters to join their music circles. While young men are taking initiative towards popular music genres, young women prefer to follow their mothers and grandmothers, creating a female-dominated participation in choirs. Considering the ties between old and young women, it is not wrong to say that the German-Turkish case resembles the Harari case in which men gave up dealing with music and “women’s custodianship turned into the key of preservation, transmission and development of local traditional modalities of musical performance.” (Sartori, 2007: 8) Another similar case is the Afghan case, in which women keep singing in spite of the war

and changing regime, transmitting their traditional repertoire from mother to daughter (Doubleday, 2007: 7).

As Henrietta Moore explains, there is a multiplicity of socially constructed locations and positions, thus the experience of being women can never be a singular one (1994: 3). Not only music but also religion determines the identification processes of young women. Dwyer in her study on Britain emphasizes “the extent to which Muslim identities are articulated in relation to, and in resistance against, dominant racialised discourses of national community”. Furthermore, being British/Asian/ Pakistani/Muslim have various dimensions for the young British Muslim women, and these identities cross cut, intersect and from time to time contradict each other when considered their relationships with their peers, parents, teachers, work colleagues, media context and other elements of youth culture (1997), which all can be regarded as contested identifications. (1999: 57). This contestation is also constructed by and reflected onto music. Hence a concise definition of Turkish classical music will be sought so as to go on with the contested belongings in the following chapters.

2.4. Turkish Classical Music

As Zeynep Helvacı (2005: 1) states, it is possible to analyze music as part of a larger whole, an internal and functional part of human culture and it can be used as a tool to understand culture. Regarding the importance of music in everyday life experiences of people in transnational era, Marco Martiniello and Jean-Michel Lafleur (2008: 1197) define music in four terms, that are sounds, words, rhythm and lyrics, which at the same time potentially have political meanings. In addition, they assert that people use music not only to preconceive knowledge about other people and places but also to locate themselves in a particular social context. This is parallel to Stokes’s definition of music, who rejects the essentialist definitions of musical “universals” of 1960s ethnomusicology and says that “music ‘is’ what any social group consider it to be” (1994: 5). Quoting from Martiniello and Lafleur, “since culture is regarded as a multi-local process involving both the home country and the countries of migration” (2008: 1200), it is not wrong to say

that the Turks in Germany use music so as to define their belongings. Turkish classical music, which is regarded as apolitical, tender and sensitive, thus hierarchically superior in the Turkish context, inevitably has a variety of meanings attached in the German context differing from those in the Turkish context, in which it has been evaluated from a quixotic view, exemplifying *Orientalism* (Tkachenko, 2005: 13).

Turkish classical music, which is a tradition of nearly a millennium, keeps carrying this function to play an active role in defining culture although as a genre it suffered a lot throughout the history from government policies, popular productions and different musicological perspectives. During the Ottoman period, there was a strong classical music tradition in urban settings and the ‘Ottoman woman’ was a townswoman although ‘Anatolian woman’ produced a functionalist music (lullabies, elegies etc.) in the rural setting (Aksoy, 1999: 788). During the first years of the Republic the Europeanization of Turkish music was so obvious that the traditional music of the Ottoman court was banned from radios. The Gökulp ideology was supporting the Westernization of folk music, which was not under the Persian and Byzantine impact but was pure Turkish:

If Russian nationalism could inspire folksong quotes in *Boris Godanov* and Polish nationalism could be served by a Polonaise, why not Turkify Ottoman classical music with echoes of Anatolia? [Signell, 1976: 75-76]

This genre did not only suffer from the Gökulp ideology during the first years of the Republic but it also faced neglect and even hostility (Signell, 1976: 80) which is believed to have had a role in the current change in the genre. The neglect and hostility led to the late institutionalization of Turkish classical music education in conservatories (1970s) which prevented the emergence of qualified musicians and the exposition of Turkish classical music listeners to Arab radios changed the dynamics of music production, together with the effect of migration and

urbanization, resulting in deterioration of the pure classical understanding and the emergence of *gazino* music and *Arabesk*⁹ (Stokes, 1994b: 23).

The effort to define the genre itself together with this short historical account reflects the contestation of belongings expressed through music. Cinuçen Tanrıkorur, a famous oud player, composer and theoretician of 20th century, analyzes Turkish music under four main areas that are classical, folkloric, military and religious music and they are all under the same makam structure (2004: 206-207). Referring to Gazimihal's expressions, Tanrıkorur states that Turkish classical music is the music of the 'intellectual class' (2003: 190). What he calls Turkish classical music is named as Turkish art music by the state radio and he blames the state institution for the ideological segregation of classical music and folk music. He is also concerned about the title of the music and he claims that there is an ideological effort in simply naming the rural tradition as folk music and giving many different names to the urban tradition such as 'court music', 'enderûn music', 'edvâr music', 'divan music', 'monophonic urban music', 'meyhane music', 'Turkish art music', and ironically "*Model Teksesli Müzikler (!) Şubesi*" (2003: 189). He concludes with photos of a *ney*-playing dervish and a *kaval*-playing shepherd which are identical, telling that although the social backgrounds are different, the musical taste is the same (2003: 198).

Covering a range of more than 500 makams, 80 rhythmic patterns, a number of forms from long and technically challenging ones to short and lyrical ones either with or without lyrics, this genre which seems to be one of the bases of Ottoman music culture, is not well-defined especially in terms of name and content (Güray, 2006: 72). Signell, who conducted fieldwork so as to understand the makam structure of Turkish Classical Music between 1970 and 1972, prefers to use Turkish art music and Turkish classical music interchangeably (Signell, 2006: 25,

⁹ Nazife Güngör, an assistant professor on communication and popular culture, prefers to define *Arabesk* as a genre peculiar to Turkish society, shaped according to the social and cultural environment it arose from, lacking in a consistent theoretical standpoint, carrying influences of Arab music in terms of melody and Western music in terms of instruments being used, which started in the rural but extended to a large audience from all segments of the society (1990: 23).

31). He differentiates between Turkish Classical Music and other genres as folk, popular, semi-classical, mosque and Sufi music, but they all have connections and it is difficult to separate one from the other according to him (Signell, 2006: 31). He regards Turkish Classical music as a production of Ottoman civilization (Signell, 2006: 25). Cem Behar, for instance, uses Ottoman/Turkish music, traditional Ottoman/Turkish music and classical Turkish music (2005: 273, 274). Aksoy, who prefers the Ottoman word *musiki* most frequently, first rejects the expression Turkish music and just uses Ottoman music (2008: 138) but then, just like Behar, adopts Ottoman-Turkish music (2008: 238). According to him Turkish art music is the popularized version of Ottoman-Turkish music (2008: 249). Maria Wurm, on the other hand, differentiates between traditional art music of the Ottoman court and popular art music (2006: 1). Preferring to use Turkish music as an umbrella term like Tanrıkorur, Jäger talks about the interaction between European music and Turkish music in the Europeanization of Ottoman art music (2000: 769). Throughout this confusing list of names, Cenk Güray rejects to use the terms ‘Turkish folk music’ and ‘Turkish classical music’ so as to prevent terminological confusion and he adopts Okan Murat Öztürk’s (2006) ‘integrated traditional music’ approach.

Not only the name but also the time interval the genre covers is a debatable issue. Tanrıkorur, although he prefers to use the umbrella term Turkish music when talking about the 20th century musicians, does not separate contemporary composers from classical composers and the contemporary forms from classical forms (2004: 174). The debate is not yet over among theoreticians. As Stokes clearly states, “the definition and construction of national styles is seldom unproblematic.” (1994: 11). Parallel to that, Mehmet Uğur Ekinci confirms that Turkish classical music is not a single and monolithic genre but rather there is a broader *musiki* which keeps up with the change brought by time (2006: 55). When we go into the everyday lives of people, however, we come across a much different scene. The most frequently used title for the genre is Turkish art music (*türkische Kunstmusik*, *Türk sanat müziği*) although neither of them sounds natural and grammatical in neither language. The names Turkish classical music

and Turkish *musiki* also exist with exactly the same meaning. The repertoires of the choirs generally cover merely 20th century compositions and simpler forms like *şarki*, *türkü* and *fantezi* rather than classical and more complicated forms like *kâr* and *beste*. Singing songs of Hammamizade İsmail Dede Efendi, one of the greatest classical composers of 18th century, and of Orhan Gencebay, a contemporary *Arabesk* musician with compositions fitting in the makam structure, makes virtually no difference for the singers and the individual definitions of the genre are very similar to each other (see chapter 4).

Although the most frequent name encountered in the field is Turkish art music, I personally prefer to use Turkish classical music in defining the genre. As a native Turkish speaker, I find the expression *sanat müziği* rather ungrammatical since ‘art’ seems redundant before ‘music’. Furthermore, the name of the institution where I first came across this music is Classical Turkish Music Club and this memory makes the expression Turkish classical music more meaningful for me. In addition, I still perceive the genre as covering the time interval from early 10th century to today although it is impossible to claim that all the forms and compositions throughout this broad time interval fit into the pure classical understanding of Turkish classical music. Nevertheless, the term I prefer to use is not the perfect concise expression to define the genre we are concerned but I prefer to use Turkish classical music since I cannot offer a better name.

CHAPTER 3

YOUNG GERMAN-TURKISH WOMEN IN TURKISH CLASSICAL MUSIC CIRCLES: A DESCRIPTION OF THE FIELD AND METHODOLOGY

3.1. The Site

As Vered Amit confirms, "... in a world of infinite interconnections and overlapping contexts, the ethnographic field cannot simply exist, awaiting discovery." The ethnographer should construct the field by the help of the conceptual, professional, financial and relational opportunities and resources (2000: 6). My research field started to be constructed by the Erasmus grant for the spring semester 2009 in Germany. From an interest in doing a research on language, I switched to music and in an effort to find the German-Turkish young women who are dealing with Turkish classical music; I started to construct my field in Turkey by creating connections on the Internet. Before actually entering the field in Germany, I got in touch with Berlin Private Conservatory of Turkish Music (*Berlin Türk Musikisi Özel Konservatuarı-Konservatorium für türkische Musik Berlin*), which is the only conservatory of Turkish music in Europe. Although Berlin was my centre of focus, it was not possible to limit my field with this city because there were various networks among cities and countries. On the path of multi-sited ethnography offered by George Marcus so as to follow people and music (1995: 106), I consulted my musician friends who were to give a concert in North Rhine-Westphalia, another state of Germany, with a Turkish classical music choir. During my stay in Germany, I enlarged my site to three choirs in Berlin which are the Turkish art music choir of the conservatory, the choir of the association *Berlin Klasik Türk Müziği Derneği* (*Berliner Ensemble für klassische türkische Musik e.V.*) and *Spandau Türk Sanat Müziği Korosu*; one

choir in Munich under Octave Academy of Turkish Music (*Octave Türk Müsîkîsi Akademisi*) and one choir in Gelsenkirchen (*Gelsenkirchen Türk Sanat Müziği Korosu*)¹⁰. Of course there are many more Turkish classical music circles in Germany with members of different age groups and backgrounds, with different understandings of Turkish classical music and with a range of productions but considering all the network would exceed the limits of this research, thus the current study can be regarded as a snapshot of the German-Turkish young women's experience of Turkish classical music rather than a comprehensive monograph of Turkish classical music circles in Germany.

Barbara Tedlock argues that ethnography, as both as a product and process, shifted the eye from participant observation to the observation of the participation as the combination of ethnographic information with the dialectic of personal involvement (1991: 81); following her brought the necessity to be concerned about creating a dialogical ground in my research. Hence I actively participated in the activities of the circles I was concerned. I regularly joined the weekly practices of the Turkish art music choir of the conservatory and *Spandau Türk Sanat Müziği Korosu*, I followed the meetings of the association and voluntarily worked as a hostess in the RBB Concert hall before their seasonal concert, I even sang together with the conservatory choir in a joint concert with the church choir of Schönow in the neighboring city Bernau bei Berlin and played the role of a journalist in a short drama organized by Spandau choir. I also tried to go through the fieldwork with an inductive approach under the light of grounded theory (Glaser & Strauss, 1967).

¹⁰ *Berliner Ensemble für klassische türkische Musik e.V.* was the descendant of the first choir in Berlin and it was established as an association in 1988. For a while Nuri Karademirli conducted the choir there but he resigned from his position in the association upon the decision to found the first conservatory of Turkish music in Europe. The conservatory was established in 1998 and the tenth anniversary of its establishment was celebrated with the contribution of the association in 2008 (Remzi Altıok, personal communication, July 2, 2009). Spandau choir was founded by Serap Sağat, who learned Turkish classical music in Adana and moved to Germany after marriage, in 1993 and the choir has officially been a *Verein* like the association since 2000 (<http://www.spandau-tsmk.de/web/index.html>). Octave Academy of Turkish Music was founded rather late, in 2003, by Öztürk Şahin (<http://www.octave.at/index.php>) and Gelsenkirchen choir is conducted by Haluk Yücel, an oud player and a PhD candidate in musicology.

The group of German-Turkish young women I created a sincere relationship with consisted of 15 women who were in the two choirs I regularly joined in Berlin, the choir at the conservatory and the choir at Spandau. A small building hidden in a yard of an apartment, the conservatory was not easy to recognize and even the taxi driver responsible for bringing me to the conservatory had a hard time finding the address. The building had many neighbors looking at them, and sometimes shouting at them especially when the music was loud, through windows facing the yard and inside there were many classrooms with pianos available. The studio where Nuri hoca preferred to spend his time was also the library and the instrument room. Both recordings and singing classes took place there. Facing the studio was the Department of Instruments, which was rather noisy during the day as the room was also an atelier and rather quiet in the evenings as the students left before the collective practices started. After the view of a school, it was challenging for me to visit the practices of Spandau choir at a café. I was told that the choir normally practiced in the *Kulturhaus* of the district but they preferred to meet at the café for practices during the second half of the year. Having a nice view of the old city, the café seemed to me a more appealing place for weekly practices, the relaxing interior design of the café also influenced my positive attitude towards the place, which is a more sincere and comfortable environment than a classroom or a hall. The table they surrounded during the practices made the choristers look at each other and communicate, which would never be the case in an official environment like that of the conservatory. I had interviews with 13 of the 15 young women who regularly attended the practices. I was told about other young women in other circles, but I did not have a chance to meet them. They were no more there, but their memories remained. The methods I adopted during and after my fieldwork will be mentioned in the following parts of this chapter.

3.2. German-Turkish Young Women: An Introduction

3.2.1. “I was born in Berlin but...”: Social Backgrounds of the Young Women

Although I did not limit my field research with the young German-Turkish women tried to keep in touch with as many people within the circles as possible, my main focus was on young women and it is important to give some background information about them before trying to understand their belongings. First of all, almost all my informants were born in Berlin; there was only one exception and it was a conscious act of her family in fact to go to Turkey for her birth. Today the place of birth is even more important due to the regulations of German government, which lets people of migrant origin to have dual citizenship until age 18 and then asks them to decide on the country of citizenship until age 23.¹¹ No matter where they were born, all my informants declared a different city from their city of birth as hometown, frequently starting the sentence with the expression “*Berlin doğumluyum ama...*” (I was born in Berlin but...). Çiğdem and Feyza sisters, 21 and 20 years old respectively, who were both born in Berlin, see Adana as their hometown and they do not forget to add that their origin goes back to Gaziantep. Ceren, who was born in İstanbul 20 years ago, respects both Siirt and Giresun, the hometowns of her parents, as her cities of origin. She nevertheless loves İstanbul and is proud to have been born there. Cansu, a 12-year-old singer who joined the choir by the influence of her elder brother, also tells the names of two cities as her hometown, one is Ankara and the other one is Aydın Söke. It is significant that she enunciates both the name of the city and the town together. Serpil (18) says she is from Ardahan and Sezin is from Şanlıurfa.

¹¹ According to the recent news, German Green Party’s proposal to demolish this legal regulation was rejected in the federal assembly. The citizenship law which was implemented in 2000, making dual citizenship for people older than 23 impossible, is still valid. (<http://www.haberprogram.com/h/2009/07/04/45685-cifte-vatandaslik-baska-bahara-kaldi.php>) Nevertheless, the Federal Minister of Justice, Brigitte Zypries, has recently criticized the current regulation, saying that the issue of dual citizenship should not be a problem in the future. (<http://www.euractiv.com.tr/ab-ve-turkiye/article/alman-adalet-bakani-cifte-vatandaslik-gelecekte-sorun-olmamali-006645>)

Gizem (14), considering her hometown, refers to the village where her mother was born and claims that she cannot decide which city her origin goes back to since their village is on the borders of Sivas and Dersim. Duygu (21) refers to Ankara and Bursa mentioning that these are the cities her parents are from. Aslı (27) is from Kastamonu although she was born in Berlin, and Figen (21) is from Çorum, again declared by the sentence “*Berlin doğumluyum ama...*”. Deniz (18) is from Samsun and Rümeysa (19) is from Yozgat, which came out as the names of their *memleket*. Most of my informants are second generation, and in Aslı’s case for example, her grandparents permanently turned back to Turkey although she is third generation.

The variety of hometowns is blended into the fact that they are all Berliners and another thing they have in common is their socio-economic status. All the young women I interviewed, without any exception, declared that they belong to the middle class. This declaration was usually followed by a religious expression of gratitude: “Thanks God we can buy whatever we need.” Only two of the young women were not receiving any kind of formal education at that moment, and one of them was accepted to a vocational school for becoming *Sozialassistentin* during my stay while the other was still seeking opportunities to go to a vocational school on theatre. The younger ones were willing to go on studying, and Sezin, who was already an undergraduate student of *Sozialpädagogie* and willing to receive a graduate degree, summarized their enthusiasm in education by saying that nothing is as beautiful as education in life. Being members of the same social class and owning the same cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1998), these young women met in Turkish classical music choirs and each woman has an interesting story of entering into these circles. The next part of this chapter is concerned about these stories of joining the circles and the awareness of Turkish classical music.

3.2.2. Awareness of Turkish Classical Music

Two main factors played an important role in the young women’s joining these choirs. The first one to be mentioned here is the role of money. Some of my informants preferred to start going to a specific circle just due to monetary issues.

Since the culture associations are voluntary organizations, they are not financially supported by the state- that is why attending any activity provided by these associations is charged¹². The members of the circles regularly pay a membership fee and they are allowed to attend the activities that they have paid for, which is another bit of money apart from the membership fee¹³. Ceren, who did not know anything about Turkish classical music before, started to attend the Turkish art music choir of the conservatory after she had registered the guitar classes there. Her main motivation was to study logopedics in higher education and she needed to play an instrument and sing at the same time so as to be qualified for this specialization area. She registered the guitar classes at the conservatory since it was the cheapest alternative for learning how to play the guitar in her district and as a guitar student she was allowed to attend any collective practice at the conservatory free of charge. She also receives classes on singing as an art. Another similar example is that of Serpil's. She has been interested in playing the violin for a long time and she registered the violin classes at the conservatory just because that was the most affordable alternative for her among the music schools in Berlin. She is also one of the instrument students who preferred to take advantage of the free collective practices. During our interview, she told me that she is willing to buy a new violin in Turkey. Buying the traditional Turkish instruments like *ney* and *kanun* in Turkey sounds reasonable but was it really reasonable to go to Turkey for buying a violin, a European instrument which entered the Turkish music zone rather late? Aslı assured that it was. This was again related to money and she told me that buying an instrument, whatever it is,

¹² Tiyatrom, which is the Turkish theatre association in Berlin, was an exception until the year 2009. The Senate Department of Culture declared that it would no longer spare budget for supporting Tiyatrom (<http://www.tiyatrom.de/newsfiles/184bulten.pdf>). This occupied a significant place in the Turkish press in Berlin (Merhaba, June 2009) and the members' effort to get this budget back was harshly criticized by the members of the conservatory, who never pleaded the state for money.

¹³ I never attempted to ask how much they paid for membership because I got the feeling that the number I was to hear would just give me a shock since my understanding was framed according to a different currency; once I went to a concert with my informants and I would not have gone to such a concert in exchange for that much money if it had not been for the sake of spending time with them.

is cheaper in Turkey than in Germany although some specific instruments like *bağlama* are already produced in Germany.

Cemile and Sezin are the other examples of students who attend the practices of the choir without any specific intention to sing Turkish classical music. Sezin who was not interested in neither music nor singing previously, suddenly decided to take classes on singing as an art. She had been dreaming of playing the piano before her singing classes started, and after these classes she lost all her interest in instruments. Within two months she left her previous singing teacher and started to take classes from Nuri Karademirli, who is the founder of the conservatory and the choir master of Turkish art music and Turkish folk music choirs at the conservatory (see 4.1.3.). Cemile has an even more interesting story. She used to sing in German, English and Portuguese previously. Her mother is German and her father is Turkish, that is why she decided that she should be able to sing in Turkish as well. She registered the singing classes at the conservatory and simultaneously started to attend the choir practices and theory of Turkish music classes. Towards the end of the semester, she was able to communicate in Turkish and solo a song in makam Uşşak before the choir as her audience.

The other factor making young women join the Turkish classical music circles is the people around them. Some of my informants already had an idea about Turkish classical music due to their parents' or relatives' interest and some others were influenced by their neighbors, friends etc. Çiğdem and Feyza had already been exposed to Turkish classical music during their childhood. They were somehow aware of Serap Sağat, the choirmaster of Spandau choir, and they listened to some of her concerts. One day they went to her café, Café Neva in *Altstadt Spandau*, and after having a nice meal there, they started attending the practices of the choir which took place at this Café during my stay in Germany. Duygu also knew Serap hoca since she was their neighbor and she became a member of the choir under pressure of one of her close friends. "I owe a lot to her for bringing me here to the choir, she gave up in a very short time and I remained here" said Duygu remembering her friend. Figen and Deniz were forced by their

mothers to join the choir and they are now thankful. Figen was not interested in music as her mother did, and she involuntarily started attending the practices last year; now she feels rather pleased to be in the choir and she is willing to bring her friends who are interested in Turkish classical music to the choir soon. Deniz had psychological problems before adolescence and she was so introvert that her mother thought joining the choir would be a solution for her, which turned out to be an actual solution. Her Turkish improved together with her communicative skills, and she turned out to be the first addict to Turkish classical music in the whole family.

Regarding the effect of the family, Aslı and Rûmeysa were on a different base. Rûmeysa's father, who is a *ney* player, bought her an oud when she was only 15 and she had no chance but become interested in Turkish classical music. Aslı's grandmother, in addition, was known for her beautiful voice and she used to sing together with some well-known figures like Müzeyyen Senar and Nuri Sesigüzel. She learned much of her repertoire from her grandmother and she inherited a huge archive of Turkish classical music when her grandmother passed away. She improved herself much by listening to this huge archive and became one of the most successful solo singers in the choir of the conservatory; however, she did not receive any kind of formal education on music before and now she has trouble in learning new songs since she cannot read notes.

Other informants who had such an opportunity of awareness were luckier than Aslı who regretted not having learned the theory when she was a child since they had chance to learn more about the language of music. Gizem and Duygu were able to name makam Hicaz as their favorite makam and Deniz articulated that she liked songs in makam Uşşak and Hicaz more than the songs in other makams. Duygu even stated that her favorite composers were Hammamizade Dede Efendi and Avni Anıl¹⁴. Having had a chance to meet Avni Anıl before he passed away

¹⁴ Hammamizade İsmail Dede Efendi, one of the greatest composers of Turkish classical music in 18th century, and Avni Anıl, who passed away in 2008, appeal to different tastes of music. When considered Dede Efendi's compositions in long and classical forms like *kâr* and *beste* and Avni Anıl's compositions in more lyrical forms like *şarkı* and *fantezi*, the different *makam* and *usûl*

was influential in her decision on favorite composers. Deniz's case was influenced by such a memory; her first solo song was in makam Hicaz and the theme of the song was longing for home country, she said that this song was probably the reason why she liked songs in makam Hicaz more.

3.2.3. Relationship with the 'Home' Country

No matter how many years passed after the first Turks arrived in Germany, the ties with Turkey never have disappeared. These ties were obvious even in the expression about the city of birth and city of origin "*Berlin doğumluyum ama...*" in my case. Not surprisingly the people I communicated with within the Turkish classical music circles still have physical ties to the home country. If it is time to go for holiday and if there is enough money, Turkey is the best alternative and usually the city of origin is visited even though the whole holiday is not spent in that city. I met Ceren in İstanbul following my arrival in Turkey and after a few days, she gave me a call, telling that they would be travelling to Giresun soon. The weekly practices of *Berliner Ensemble für klassische türkische Musik e.V.* had come to an end by July because most of the members had already left Berlin for spending their holiday in Turkey.

The yearly visit to Turkey generally has some musical meanings for the members together with the connections of the associations throughout the year. The conservatory, for instance, has collective activities with the Conservatory of Haliç University in İstanbul and the Conservatory of Ege University in İzmir. These cities are also significant for the musicians; since the instrumentalists in Germany are regarded as sufficient neither in number nor in quality, the state musicians are invited to concerts of the Turkish classical music circles all around the country. When I asked this to İsmail Bergamalı, a famous clarinet player from the İzmir branch of TRT, before the concert of the association, he told about the corruption in TRT which made many instrumentalists lose their jobs in İzmir. In addition, the

ranges they benefitted from and the historical contexts that influenced their compositions, it is interesting to hear these two names next to each other as favorite composers.

music sector in İzmir is not as large as that of İstanbul; according to him the instrumentalists from İzmir frequently came to concerts in Germany because this was the only way to earn a living for them. In that concert which took place on May 2, *İstanbul Sazendeleri* were also playing. In fact they have always come to Berlin from İstanbul for the concerts of the association for a few years and they became good friends with the choristers. Consequently, they were singing while playing their instruments during the concert, which was peculiar to that concert. Apart from the instrumentalists, singers and composers are also invited to the concerts. Duygu was able to meet Avni Anıl, who would later become one of her favorite composers, when he was invited to one of their concerts. More than three people from the association told me about Ahmet Özhan's visit and his astonishment by the orchestra before the choir. This famous singer of Turkish classical music said: "We cannot see these musicians next to each other even in Turkey. How come do you manage to bring them together in Germany?"¹⁵

The transnational connections are not limited on the professional level; the members of the circles are also travelling across local and national boundaries. One member of the choir in Munich was happily telling his friends about the concert of another choir in another city he was to listen to. The members of the association in Berlin travelled to İstanbul just for the sake of listening to a concert and as Remzi bey told, this was the only time *İstanbul Sazendeleri* sang while they were playing their instruments before they did so in Berlin in May. Furthermore, the choir of the conservatory went to Uşak, which is the hometown of one of the founders of the conservatory, for giving a concert a few years ago and this visit still remains as one of the major topics of discussion. Apart from these memories, Turkey is the place of instruments and it is also significant that the concert costumes of the conservatory choirs are produced in Turkey. Ayhan assured that there were some shops in Germany where you could find Turkish

¹⁵ The first time Remzi bey they referred to Ahmet Özhan was after the last practice for the seasonal concert, when the choristers were having lunch together with *İstanbul Sazendeleri*, a famous group of instrumentalists from the İstanbul choir of Ministry of Culture and Tourism, and İsmail Bergamalı, a famous clarinet player from the İzmir branch of the national radio and TV broadcast, TRT. The musicians travelled from Turkey to Berlin exclusively for their concert.

classical music instruments and there are also some luthiers who produce instruments like oud but either the instruments are low in quality or the instrument that you are looking for does not exist at all. Aslı, who has a collection of percussive instruments, told about Maksim where she used to buy her instruments and added that the instruments in that shop actually came from Turkey.

The relationship with home country is not limited to the concert and instrument traffic, there are also academic purposes. Nuri hoca pays regular visits to Turkey, for example, and he gives seminars on oud. This summer he taught at a Turkish music camp in İstanbul and some of his students at the conservatory registered the one-week camp, making the ones who could not afford to attend feel sad. The Instruments Department (*Instrumentenbau*) of the conservatory also plans internships and seminar programs on exchange basis with Ege University.

To turn back to the musical meanings of the yearly visits to Turkey, it is relevant to mention that some members come together in Turkey and these meetings bring in Turkish classical music to their holidays. Duygu and Gizem were glad to hear their families' decision to go to Mersin together for holiday, this togetherness would certainly bring music to the scene. In addition, Ali, a 15-year old oud player from the conservatory, told me that he would be going to Balıkesir soon with his oud for holiday. He has always carried his instrument to Turkey since he started to attend Nuri hoca's oud classes and shared his music with his relatives there. However, this was not the case for Rûmeysa, who left her oud in Germany during holidays. Her family loved to make music together in Germany, especially when the relatives came to Berlin to visit them, but not in Turkey. Consequently, it can be said that music is gendered and the attitudes change depending on the context, which will be further explained in the following section.

3.2.4. Attitudes towards Instruments and Instrumentalists

Stokes asserts that “musical instruments and ways of playing them not only define ranks and hierarchies but gender.” (1994: 22) In his study of *Arabesk*, Stokes shows that there is a hierarchy among musicians and according to this hierarchy

violin is generally the lead instrument (1994a: 106). The same pattern is followed in the contemporary practices of Turkish classical music. Although violin entered the orchestra rather recently, it became the leading instrument. The role of the instrument is one of the main reasons why violinist Talat Er travels to Berlin so as to lead the orchestra in the concerts of Spandau choir.¹⁶ In the conservatory choir there is not a qualified violinist and Abdurrahman Özyay, who is the choirmaster of the association, came and played in the 10th anniversary concert in 2008. During the last weekly practices, it was interesting to see Salih, the leading *kanun* player among the other players¹⁷, preferred to play the violin, which made the young women admire him more not because he was able to play two instruments but rather because he was able to play an instrument and the violin.

Stokes also mentions a hierarchy between *sanatçı*, the singer, and *müzisyen*, the instrumentalist, according to which the singer among the professional musicians gets the biggest slice out of the pie and distributes the rest evenly (or unevenly) to the instrumentalists. (1994a: 108) This code of hierarchy among professional musicians exists among the choirs as well. Nuri hoca is admired most as an instrumentalist at the conservatory, in which his singing definitely plays a role. He plays the oud during the practices of Turkish art music choir and *bağlama* during those of Turkish folk music choir, but he sings during both practices. When considered Spandau choir, on the other hand, Serap hoca never plays an instrument during the practices. Usually one of the choristers plays *bendir* for providing the rhythm and there is one oud and one violin player during the practices as the whole orchestra. During one practice Serap hoca harshly criticized the violinist and the oud player for not playing correctly. The problem usually

¹⁶ The other reason is that he is an acquaintance of the choirmaster Serap Sağat from Adana, in the conservatory of which she learned Turkish classical music.

¹⁷ Normally only one *kanun* player exists in one orchestra since the instrument has a loud and dominant voice. If there are two players, usually the more experienced player becomes the lead and the other one plays the *kanun* more piano. During the weekly practices at the conservatory, however, there were sometimes four or five *kanun* players and all the male players kept playing loudly, which from time to time became even disturbing in the practice hall which was obviously too small for four *kanun* players.

aroused by the chorister who tried to play *bendir* unsuccessfully but she was never criticized since she was actually a chorister. The violinist got terribly hurt and gave up playing for a while. This attitude determined the interest of the choristers in playing an instrument.

When compared to Spandau choir, the choir of the conservatory has a greater number of people with interest in learning to play an instrument, which sometimes results in a more crowded orchestra than the choir itself during the practices. Since Nuri hoca gives many instrument classes, his students who learn an instrument prefer to join the practices with their instruments. However, on the level of young women, only Rûmeysa dares to attend the practices with an instrument. At this point appears the role of gender on the stage. Sezin, who dreamt of playing the piano or *bağlama*, did not ever bother to start learning any of them. She believes that *bağlama* suits men as players; when women play, they cannot even produce a high quality sound through the instrument. She also enjoys listening more when men play *bağlama* rather than women.

It is not wrong to say that the role of gender evolved throughout time. Aksoy, when talking about the Ottoman period, says that it was not enough to only sing *şarkı* and *türkü* for the music lover townswoman; she needed to play an instrument (1999: 788). During that period the instruments had gendered roles. Aksoy at this moment refers to Gelibolulu Mustafa Âli, who divides instruments into two sections in the 16th century: female instruments and male instruments. *Çeng* was one of the female instruments and the majority of *çeng* players in the 16th century were women. He also added that this female character of the instrument stayed stable until the instrument started to disappear in the late 17th century (1999: 790). The women who were previously expected to be good instrumentalists of especially so called female instruments, today prefer to sing and not to play even though they learn how to play an instrument. The society inevitably played a role in this change. Asiye abla, a middle-aged *kanun* player from Isparta, is claimed to have been criticized by her family a lot for trying to learn an instrument. In the 11th year of the conservatory, she seems to have

overcome this family pressure; however, Nuri hoca never trusts her as an instrumentalist and makes fun of her instrument, saying that it has never been in tune. Rûmeysa tuned her instrument herself but before the practice began she gave her oud to Nuri hoca so that he could believe that her instrument was actually in tune. I myself also experienced the reflections of this belief “women cannot make good instrumentalists”. I tried to attend the practices with my oud as frequently as possible, but whenever I brought it to the conservatory, there were one or two choristers who were encouraging me to “learn how to play the oud well”. Nuri hoca also preferred to see me among the choir rather than among the orchestra. Furthermore, I never dared to bring my oud to the practices at Spandau choir. Nevertheless, I was appreciated much among the choir in Munich especially by the choirmaster, Öztürk Şahin. Pointing me and my oud, he advised especially his female choristers to learn an instrument. I later on learned that the choir had just lost my coeval and namesake violinist due to a quarrel totally unrelated with music and I was automatically compared with her. Back to the choir at the conservatory, Ali had an interesting farewell comment on me: he advised me to never give up music (he meant my instrument) and to never resemble those ‘out of tune’ singers. The understanding of the “instrumentalist woman” identity depended on a multiplicity of contexts and my identification with my instrument was constantly contested among different circles.

The nationality of the instrumentalist also created a certain interest in the instrumentalist. Nuri hoca was proud of having non-Turkish students and one day he told me that he was actually planning to change the name of the conservatory as part of the project of joining the academia. There were students of non-Turkish origin, the most famous of whom was Mario Rispo¹⁸, and there were people

¹⁸ Mario Rispo is significant for the members of the conservatory since he learned Turkish music at the conservatory. A German of Italian origin, Mario travelled from Hamburg to Berlin and visited the conservatory each and every weekend for more than 2 years. Then he moved to İstanbul so as to learn Turkish language, culture and music better. He gives periodical concerts titled ‘*Hüzün-Benim İstanbulum*’ in Berlin and the conservatory sells the tickets for the concerts, advising the members to listen to him. Nuri hoca believes that he represents-and advertises-the Turkish culture properly and he is proud to see Mario on the stage, travelling around Germany singing Turkish songs (personal communication, April 22, 2009).

interested in other genres of world music among the members. The Italian and US American violinists who from time to time attended the practices were appreciated by the choristers. Furthermore, I once brought my Italian friend, who plays the piano and sings in a choir in Italy, to the conservatory and every single person he met asked him to join the practices although he had never even heard of Turkish classical music before. The oud player of US origin in the association, in addition, is claimed to attend *tanbur* classes at the conservatory. He did not appear at the conservatory but he was certainly a person of interest at the association.

3.3. Methodology

3.3.1. Grounded Theory

As previously mentioned, I formulated my research according to grounded theory. To put it in the simplest way, grounded theory can be defined as discovering systematically the theory hidden in the data of social research. This way the researcher can feel sure that the theory would fit and work (Glaser& Strauss, 1967: 3). Grounded theory puts the ethnographic data to the centre and the theory comes out of that data. As Rod Suddaby puts it, grounded theory “should not be used to test hypotheses about reality, but, rather, to make statements about how actors interpret reality.” (2006: 636). This should not mean that the researcher should enter the field without any knowledge of the existing literature or ignore whatever has been so far done; doing so only leaves the theory weak. Suddaby suggests that grounded theory is rather the middle ground:

The reality of grounded theory research is always one of trying to achieve a practical middle ground between a theory-laden view of the world and an unfettered empiricism. A simple way to seize this middle ground is to pay attention to extant theory but constantly remind yourself that you are only human and that what you observe is a function of both who you are and what you hope to see. [Suddaby, 2006: 635]

Thus, knowledge of existing literature is as important as conducting a structured research. According to Suddaby, “[t]otally unstructured research produces totally unstructured manuscripts that are unlikely to make it past the desk editor at any credible journal of social science” (2006: 634). Letting the field find its way

towards theory is only good when there are reasonable limits of structure to this freedom and the theoretical work that has already been done should be avoided only in an effort to prevent presumptions and prejudices. How the field shapes the theory, moreover, depends on how well the data is being analyzed while it is being gathered. The founders of grounded theory suggest that formal theory start from a substantive theory. The theory can directly come out of the data but the former “not only provides a stimulus to a ‘good idea’ but it also gives an initial direction in developing relevant categories and properties and in choosing possible modes of integration.” (Glaser & Strauss, 1967: 79) This is also explained by Patricia Martin and Barry Turner as a key element of grounded theory that is a higher level of abstraction than the data itself (Suddaby, 2006: 636). This abstraction is possible through ‘analytic induction’ which is the move of the researcher between induction and deduction even when the data collection is still going on and this is part of constant comparative method (Suddaby, 2006: 639). Anselm Strauss in another study with Juliet Corbin says that this procedure goes on with data collection until no new evidence appears. This moment is the time to finish the fieldwork and is named ‘category saturation’ (Suddaby, 2006: 636).

The problem with grounded theory is it is generally taken as phenomenological approach or content analysis. Suddaby at this point refers to Peter Wimpenny and John Gass (2000), who show the difference between these two approaches through the use of interviewing. While in a phenomenological study interviews are a key means of looking into the subjective experiences of individuals, it is only one way of gathering information. In grounded theory, interviews can be taken with a phenomenological interest, but the effort in grounded theory is not to probe the experience of subject without contaminating the data as Clark Moustakas (1994) puts it. The stories are of interest in grounded theory, but the primary interest is understanding the social situation lying beneath these stories. That is why in grounded theory studies interviews are the sole form of data collection (Suddaby, 2006: 635). The case of content analysis is concerned about the context. While in grounded theory the overall method for gathering and

analyzing data systematically is described, content analysis describes the context within which a specific type of data is to be collected and analyzed (Suddaby, 2006: 636). Being open to interpretation and standing away from long-standing assumptions researchers can best adopt grounded theory (Suddaby, 2006: 641). What I tried to do during my research was benefitting from the flexibility of grounded theory. I went through the literature before actually entering the field so as to gain some general knowledge about the field but I postponed reading the material especially on young women and Muslim youth in Germany, which would make me create prejudiced assumptions, to the end of my fieldwork. I started with one circle and then enlarged my field into three circles in Berlin and two circles in other cities and focused once more in Berlin, then left one circle in Berlin out, finalizing my study in two circles. Meanwhile I kept going through my field notes in an effort to see which categories I already had and which way I should shape my questions in the field.

3.3.2. Techniques Used in the Field

Within grounded theory, the main technique I applied was, as mentioned before, participant observation. Regularly attending the weekly practices of the Turkish art music choir of the conservatory and Spandau choir, I also attended some rehearsals of the association, the seasonal concert of the association, one practice of the choir in Munich, two practices of the Turkish folk music choir of the conservatory, one joint concert of the conservatory choir, several classes at the conservatory, the terminal meeting of Spandau choir and some other events organized by the members of the choirs like Mario Rispo's concert. I was also to attend the concert of Gelsenkirchen choir but unfortunately the concert was cancelled, nevertheless I kept in touch with Haluk Yücel, the choirmaster, and joined one of his projects. After creating connections and forming sincere relationships with my informants, I started arranging interviews. The interviews I made were semi-structured since I had some main questions and the minor questions came out depending on the proceeding of interviews. I also tried to implement a specific technique of focus group to grasp meanings and perceptions

on the role of music in the identification processes since it is easier to talk to a peer instead of an outsider researcher as Elizabeth Suter (2000) suggests. She has a different approach to focus group study, which, according to her, brings participant observation-like understandings through a more natural setting and less intervention of the researcher. I was not able to create such a natural environment as she suggested, but I formulated the interviews for two women at the same time instead of individual interviews, which certainly lessened the effect of the researcher's intervention.

My regular attendance to the rehearsals inevitably brought the intervention, though. Öztürk hoca and Serap hoca from time to time interrupted the practice and needed to give explanations to me in an effort to prevent any misunderstandings which would turn out to appear wrongly in the text. At one point I was made to solo pieces in both the conservatory choir and Spandau choir. In Spandau choir, I was invited to the upcoming concert as a solo singer and in conservatory choir I was identified with one song in makam Nihavend, which I soloed three times. For the terminal meeting of Spandau choir, the young women wrote a small drama about the cultural interaction in Café Neva, the café which Serap hoca owns and where they come together for weekly practices during the second half of the academic year, and I was asked to act a journalist and ask questions to the protagonists (just like I did during the interviews).

Apart from the interviews with young women, I made semi-structured expert interviews with the dominant figures like Nuri hoca, who has been within these circles for more than 35 years and who has an idea about the motivations of young women in joining these circles. I also gathered the notes of all the songs that were practiced during the semester in the conservatory choir and Spandau choir. Of these 45 songs and 2 instrumental pieces, 13 were of religious content and 2 were folkloric songs although the composer of only one of them was anonymous. The makams Nihavend (14), Kürdîlihiczâkâr (7), Muhayyerkürdî (4), Hicaz (6) and Rast (4) were the most frequent ones while there were few examples in makam Muhayyer, Uşşak, Hüzzam, Segâh, Kürdî and Sûznak. What is significant about

the frequent makams is that they are closer to the chromatic structure of European music, the major and minor scales with 12 equal temperament of the octave, than the Pythagorean intervals of Turkish music. Furthermore, the only piece in makam Rast that Nuri hoca notated did not have the peculiar 1-comma flat on the scale. Although the repertoires covered much of the historical span of Turkish classical music from 13th century up to now, out of the 47 pieces, only 8 of them were composed before 20th century, one of which was in fact out of the Turkish classical music repertoire. This structure of the repertoire certainly has a role in shaping the meanings attached to Turkish classical music among young German-Turkish women. The meanings, together with the belongings, will be analyzed in the next chapter.

CHAPTER 4

A LOOK INTO IDENTIFICATION PROCESSES

Music out of place,
we are too readily inclined to believe,
is music without meaning.
Martin Stokes (1994a: 98)

Levent Soysal states that migrants are squeezed in between the past of their countries of origin and the present of their host countries. These ties and the otherness being faced in the host country bring certain tensions and processes of identification to migrants' lives. "He is bounded by his nation in nations of others and in this boundedness he¹⁹ lives diasporas." (Soysal, 2003: 501) This boundedness is inevitably reflected in the music making of migrants. As Stokes explains "...traditional music making takes place in one context, in which musician and audience alike can take the transaction of meaning entirely for granted." (1994a: 105) But just like for the Black Sea musicians that Stokes is talking about, multiple contexts exist for the people dealing with Turkish classical music in Germany, defined by migration; national, ethnic, linguistic, religious and musical belongings of the home country and those of the host country; the circles they are members of and the interaction between those circles. On the level of young women, it would be beneficial to consider the findings of Dwyer. In the case of British Muslim young women, "[o]ne of the primary constructions of community evoked by almost all participants was that of a local 'Asian community'." (Dwyer, 1999: 58) In my case with German-Turkish young women, this identification through locality came out as referring to Berlin as the city of birth and a city of Turkey as the city of origin, *memleket*. This expression signals a tension between what they call the home country and the host country in terms

¹⁹ Referring to Berger's *A Seventh Man*, Soysal prefers to talk about the migrant as "he".

of national belongings. To go on with the study among British Muslim young women, one of Dwyer's informants says that the only thing that relates her to the Muslim identity is her Muslim name and she has nothing else to do with Islam at all. (Dwyer, 1999: 61) As for the German-Turkish young women, although the city they live throughout years has evolved into the fourth biggest Turkish city with the popular symbolic name *Klein İstanbul*, there are still limitations to realize religious and linguistic belongings. Thus, Turkish classical music becomes an agent in going beyond their names in terms of Turkishness. Furthermore, another informant says that she sees herself only as a Muslim and not in any sect, leading Dwyer to regard her as a nonreligious Muslim (1999: 62), without any religious practice and a strong attachment to Muslim identity. When considered the ethnic and religious belongings of the German-Turkish young women I interviewed, questions arise on their level of commitment to the identifications.

Using Philip Lewis's term (1994), Dwyer concludes by saying that only a small number of her informants are "self-consciously" Islamic. The rest only have Islam as part of their identity but one that can change depending on the context. (Dwyer, 1999: 63) It would again be suitable to ask questions in an effort to come out with an induction about German-Turkish young women within music circles. Putting it into question form with Dwyer's terminology, apart from all the levels of identification, does Turkish classical music occupy a certain space in the lives of the young women? Is Turkish classical music only part of their identity or are they "self-consciously" musicians? A detailed analysis of the belongings is to be provided at this point so as to reach a satisfactory answer to these questions.

4.1. "Es geht um uns": Turkishness Reconsidered

Before the concert for Saisho Homa Ceremony for Peace and Harmony²⁰ at Velodrom, one of the most gorgeous halls in Berlin, Nuri hoca was haranguing the choristers:

²⁰ The event was organized by a Buddhist order named Shinnyo-En and this concert was part of a larger project. Saisho Homa Ceremony has become an annual event by the participation of the

If we were to sing for a solely Turkish audience, the detonations would be no problem, *kol kırılır yen içinde kalır*.²¹ But when we are going beyond the Turkish community, it is not only me, not only him, we are all responsible for the results of this job; *es geht um uns* (it is about us). We as Turks still have a terrible image due to the people who behaved carelessly without thinking about how the other people would think about us in 10-20 years' time in the past. If you have a navy pass, you are a third class human being, alas that's the way it is. Hence our production should not be something that confirms these prejudices; all the syllables should come out of our mouths simultaneously. Because we'll be there as the Turkish choir, we should represent the Turkish name in the best possible way, we should not repeat the mistakes of the past.

This harangue made it clear that among the Turkish community in Germany, there is large-spread heterogeneity and the choristers should behave in a non-Turkish manner so as to represent the actual Turkish culture. This title does not only include nationality but other aspects like ethnicity, language and religion. In a case study about Muslim youth in Europe, it is shown that the majority of Muslim youth from Turkey in Germany are believers and religion is also a part of their identity. But considering the articulation and practice of their beliefs, it is not wrong to say that they are quite heterogeneous. (Wilpert, 2004: 26) It should not be forgotten that the young women concerned have relatively limited interaction with Turkey and this makes them more strongly attached to Turkish identity. What I understood from Nuri hoca's claims was that it was not the country or the people living there that were praised through Turkishness, it was rather about constructing and rearticulating Turkish identity and their multiple belongings in the German context against exclusion and devaluation: "I would criticize Turkey in whatever way I want, but I wouldn't let a German do so" said Nuri hoca in conclusion.

representatives of many religions and different social and political organizations. The conservatory participated in this year's ceremony as the Islamic choir and they performed two religious pieces in makam Segâh composed by Buhurizade Mustafa İtrî in 17th century.

²¹ A Turkish proverb meaning that a problem which arises in a group should be solved within the group and no outsiders should be informed about the problem. Nuri hoca, who has given up preparing concerts for the Turkish audience two years ago, believes that the Turkish community in Germany does not valorize efforts to preserve the Turkish culture properly. After a relatively bad performance of the choir during the last practice, he started this speech so as to make his choristers get out of the "Turkish psychology" and perform greatly.

4.1.1. Turkishness on the Level of Nation

Part of this praised identity was the learned relationship with the neighboring nations. I do not know if Feyza had any kind of negative interaction with any Greek people but she got very angry when she learned that I was interested in Greek music as well as Turkish classical music. “Are you Greek? Why are you listening to Greek music?” she was shouting at me. There was this hostility between Turkey and Greece and it should be hindering the cultural interaction according to her; no matter how common the musical roots were and how much the musical structures resembled, a Turkish person should listen to Turkish music and not Greek music. I was lucky enough that my mp3 player, in shuffle mode when she was shouting at me, made her listen to a *peşrev* probably of a Greek composer without lyrics and not a *ρεμπέτικο* probably composed by a person of Turkish origin, with lyrics in Greek.

The understanding of Turkishness in relationship with other nations also spread into communities of different ethnic origins within Turkey. When preparing the drama about the cultural interaction in Café Neva, the young women preferred to create the scenario upon four different stereotypes: the Kurdish Alevi from Adana, the Laz from the Black Sea region, the Romany from Thrace and the “high-toned” from Istanbul, rejecting local identities. The main motivation for selecting such protagonists was to make the drama more humorous but the roots for those preferences lied both in their own local backgrounds and their understandings of the variety of identities under Turkishness. Towards the end of the drama, they wanted to insert a quarrel between the protagonists from Adana and the Black Sea region and they thought this would be suitable since “a Kurd and a Laz could not anyway get on well with each other”²². Despite the variety, what they had in mind was a holistic understanding of Turkishness. This holistic understanding came out in my interview with Aslı as well. This time it was formulated against European identity in terms of meanings attached to music. Aslı said that as a nation Turkish understanding and emotionality is more than that of Europeans and that is the

²² Personal communication, July 3, 2009.

main reason why German songs do not impress Turkish people. Her point of emotionality was just supported by Nuri hoca; de did not even believe that the European musicologists could give an articulate explanation to Turkish classical music system because they were not able to feel the emotionality in the genre.

4.1.2. Turkishness on the Level of Language

Another aspect of Turkishness is language and this is an important matter of concern since the music in the circles is not instrumental but rather vocal. The lyrics of the songs were an important factor determining whether they would like the song or not. The only song in *türkü*²³ form in the repertoire of the conservatory choir was generally regarded as easier compared to the other songs in *şarkı* form in their repertoire although there was not a significant difference apart from the comprehensibility of the lyrics. The song composed by Civan Ağa in the 19th century, for instance, was a song that Sezin did not like at all. When I asked why, her answer was that she was never able to learn the song by heart, in which the fact that she was not able to understand the lyrics totally played a role. The religious pieces which were notated by Nuri hoca did not have any characters of the Turkish alphabet due to the software he used, but this lessened the comprehensibility of the lyrics and resulted in incorrect articulations of certain words like *şol* /ʃol/ meaning ‘that’ as *sol* meaning ‘left’.

Apart from the fact that the German-Turkish young people are bilingual and they are proficient speakers of Turkish, they still are not as good in Turkish as they are in German, which also determined the methodology of the choirmasters. Taking advantage of bilingualism, Nuri hoca preferred to switch into German during the practice sessions in order to be clearly understood since there were some foreigners among the choir and the German-Turkish members’ proficiency in

²³ The *türkü* they learned was ‘*Şu dere yonca*’, which is an anonymous piece that was collected by Ali Canlı from the informant Hüseyin Çakır in Middle Anatolia (http://www.turkuler.com/nota/ezgi_bu_dere_yonca.html). However the note they used claimed that this was a *türkü* in makam Mahur from Şanlıurfa collected by Saadettin Kaynak, who is actually a composer (see appendix).

Turkish was not always enough to understand a technical critique. On the other hand, Öztürk hoca spoke solely in Turkish without mixing any German words, which definitely had an ideology of protecting the Turkish culture from the effect of German language behind. Serap hoca borrowed words from German although she mainly spoke in Turkish, creating an interesting linguistic synthesis. When she asked her students to do a specific exercise with their tongues so as to get ready for singing, she would say: “*Bu hareket ‘Kehlkopf’lerinizi çalıştıracak*” (This exercise will train your larynxes) with a German word agglutinated by Turkish suffixes.

4.1.3. Turkishness on the Level of Religion

Another aspect of Turkishness is religion as mentioned before. All my informants, without any exception, were Muslims and there was a variety in the sects they belonged to, the way they lived their religion and the way they articulated it. The young women in Spandau choir were mainly Alevis and understanding of religion sometimes became the central topic in their discussions. There was a depiction of Ali on the desktop of Gizem’s computer as a religious symbol and she believed that it was sinful not to have such a symbol at home. Çiğdem agreed to carry a depiction of Zulfiqar, the sword of Ali, as a necklace but she was not sure about the sin of not putting a picture on the walls. In the conservatory choir, on the other hand, none of my informants told me that they were Alevis. This may have resulted from Nuri hoca’s attitude towards ‘fanatic supporters’ of Alevism²⁴. Nevertheless, it was not an issue of conflict to sing religious pieces attributed to Alevism. But headscarf was. Before concerts with religious repertoires, Nuri hoca was very careful in politely asking the women to wear a symbolic headscarf since the songs they were to sing had religious content and they should be symbolizing

²⁴ Different from most of the music schools in the city, only *uzun sap bağlama* was taught at the conservatory as a folk music instrument and not *kısa sap bağlama* which is attributed to Alevism and effectively used as a propagating instrument. Nuri hoca blamed *kısa sap bağlama* as the marker of fanaticism so he did not appreciate the instrument as the core instrument of music teaching.

this with their clothing as the German audience would not be able to understand the content. Some members of the choir were still uncomfortable with the idea of wearing a headscarf despite Nuri hoca's moderate approach. The only young woman wearing a headscarf was Rûmeysa, whose name carried Islamic connotations as well.

4.1.4. Second *Memleket*: Understanding of the 'Home' Country

Considering the national aspect of Turkishness, it would be appropriate to explore the meaning of the home country and the host country for German-Turkish young women. According to Hannerz, "[p]erhaps real cosmopolitans, after they have taken out membership in that category, are never quite at home again, in the way real locals can be. Home is taken-for-grantedness..." (1990: 248) Nuri hoca believes that this taken-for-grantedness will ever be relevant for the German-Turkish youth. "The Turks cannot be Germanified" he said; the Turks were people who are able to long for their home country, their ancestors and they were sensitive people who are able to love. The longing for Turkey inside the youth is taken for granted; they naturally love and miss their home country although they are born in Germany and even if they do not visit Turkey at all. On the other hand, this longing for home country does not always come out as love for home country. Talking about South Asian diaspora communities, Amitav Ghosh (1989) says that they "in general are less interested in visions of returning to a lost homeland than in desires to recreate their culture in diverse locations". (Manuel, 1997: 26) Sometimes arguments can arise on turning back to Turkey. İlay, a PhD candidate in law in one of the most outstanding universities, attenuated the enthusiasm of the youth around her to settle in Turkey by referring to the time she lived in İstanbul. Even not being able to ride her bike was a good enough reason to turn back to Germany; living Turkishness by singing Turkish classical music in Berlin was better than striving to live in İstanbul.

Another point about home was the understanding of second *memleket*. Since they lead their lives in a country different from their country of origin, the young women can develop strong attachments to both countries. Cemile, for instance,

after a long period of disappearance, came happily to a rehearsal and started talking about her visit to her German *memleket*., that was her mother's city of origin. Deniz was sharing her point of view; she said that she missed one country when she was spending time in the other country, "Germany is my second *memleket*" she said. For Çiğdem, Turkey was the place for visiting and fulfilling the longing, but not the place for spending the whole life. Deniz is also on the same point with Çiğdem; she is not willing to settle in Turkey and the reason is that she cannot feel herself as a Turk in Turkey, which is an echoing of the understanding of *Almancı*.²⁵

Nevertheless, this way of thinking was not the dominant understanding of home country. Feyza thinks differently from her sister and she gets angry whenever Çiğdem says something good about Germany without a correspondent in Turkey. She wants to live in Turkey and whenever the time comes to leave the home country and turn back to Germany, her mood desperately changes. Going back to Berlin feels like going back to hell for her. Duygu explains the syndrome of spending the holiday in Turkey: "The first week passes on the roads, the second week passes with an effort to settle down, the third week you start enjoying your time, and the fourth week you have to move back to Germany; you are separated from the home country at the moment you get used to living there". Just like Feyza, Rûmeysa wants to live in Turkey, especially in İstanbul, and she is dreaming of studying Turkish literature at a university in İstanbul; Turkish classical music, the music of her home country, reminded her of the love for the home country.

Like Duygu, Figen wants to try her chance in living in the home country although people claim that they will not be able to get used to the lifestyle in Turkey. Even

²⁵ *Almancı* is previously a pejorative term used for the Turks living in Germany by the Turks living in Turkey meaning that they are neither Turkish nor German but lost in between. Recently it has been given to the name of a film and theatre festival with an exclamation mark so as to ironically mean that the German-Turkish, humiliated once, now can go beyond the borders of prejudices. The festival titled 'Beyond Belonging III-Almancı!' took place in İstanbul between June 12-20. (<http://almanci.kulturspruenge.net/>)

the difficulty of living in Turkey seems great for her; she expresses her anger with the young German-Turkish people who do not want to turn back by saying “How come you believe that you cannot manage to live in Turkey? It’s your home country!” She remembers Turkey whenever she listens to a song of Turkish classical music; she feels the warmth of her home country in the music. “It’s cold in here” she says, “There is the warmth and sisterhood in Turkey”. Serpil feels the same warmth when she is inside Turkish classical music; she is reminded of the home country and she feels happy. She believes everything is systematic and difficult in Germany while one can feel more comfortable and freer in Turkey. “Everybody is a Turk in Turkey, one’s own people are different” she concludes; she feels there is a different spirit in the home country.

Not only the feeling but even the smell of the home country is something of inestimable value. Sezin, whose second name means “big dark eyes” in Arabic and is also the name of a lake in Şanlıurfa, tells her mother’s experience of going to Turkey: “when she gets off the plane, the smell of cowpat feels like the smell of a perfume”. Carrying the home country even in her name, Sezin missed the home country so much. At that moment Ceren started to talk about their long trip to Turkey by car: “The moment you pass the border, something warm and sweet starts” she said. She was listening to Turkish classical music for the sake of fulfilling the longing for the home country. After my short visit to Turkey, she hugged me tightly, saying that even my hair smelt like *memleket*.

Aslı, another young woman who is enthusiastic about settling in Turkey, gives a short analysis of music in relationship with places. She compares *Brauerei*, a typical German pub, and *meyhane*, a typical Turkish pub. She remembers only entertaining musics when she thinks about *Brauerei* but emotional musics when she considers *meyhane*. German music means waltz while Turkish music means *fasıl* and *uzun hava*, making Turkish music a more dramatic music tradition. She carries stronger emotions for the home country and its music consequently.

In most contexts, the two countries are compared and contrasted. No matter how much (or little) they love the home country the fact is that the young women

experience the home country in Germany. They can cherish their mother tongue and culture almost without corruption, they have access to every commodity from the home country; the only thing they lack right at the moment is the power to interfere in the political and economic troubles in the home country. Before my short visit to Turkey, I asked what they wanted from *memleket*; the response was common and striking: “Bring us good news!”

4.2. Different Levels of Belonging

4.2.1. The Importance of Being Young Women

German-Turkish young women form a group within the Turkish classical music circles when considered the common context they share, the most widely discussed topic in which is morality. The first significant discussion about morality I came across was on the Eurovision song contest, which is taken as seriously in nationalistic terms among the Turkish group in Germany as well as in Turkey. Immediately after the contest, the young women at the conservatory were discussing the representation of Turkey by Hadise with the song *Düm tek tek*. “She was on the stage half-naked and danced as if she were a belly dancer! And can you believe that she received 400000 dollars for being on the stage that day? She didn’t deserve it at all! Thanks God she could only be the fourth!” Sezin was very critical about her performance and Ceren totally agreed with her. She was already fed up with hearing her song *Düm tek tek* everywhere and she disliked the lyrics not because they were in English but because they had many sexual references; she was even joyful that the song without any morale was only the fourth, which was not success but failure according to her. Morality was a very important aspect of the young women’s identification with Turkish culture and everyday issues were discussed around an understanding of *ahlâk*. Upon Çiğdem’s love story with an unhappy ending, they started talking about love and marriage. Gizem said that it was wrong to kiss one’s boyfriend before being engaged; for Çiğdem, on the other hand, even engagement was early for kissing each other on the lips. In a city where people felt comfortable to kiss each other in every part of social life, their strict rejection of kissing showed how much closed

their group was although they were well integrated to the German lifestyle; being a young German-Turkish woman necessitated a high morale. Wearing too low-cut clothes was a matter of criticism among them as well. “I don’t understand why they dress up in this half-naked way” started Çiğdem to criticize her schoolmates, “there aren’t even any boys at the school, to whom are they trying to show their bodies? And it’s only the Turkish girls who do so, they are so immoral.” The significant thing about the critiques on Turkish young women was that the German-Turkish young women did not comment on their German counterparts in terms of morality, which was also a signifier of their identification with the Turkish culture and segregation from the mainstream German culture.

The topics they discussed around morality never turned into a philosophical debate; the issues were limited to their context of youngness and womanness. How to wear good make-up and how to get rid of pimples were sample topics they discussed during the breaks at the conservatory. The common context they shared made them physically closer, which became obvious in the way they preferred to sit during practices. The young women at the conservatory preferred to sit next to each other during practices and not with the married women aged over 30. One day Aslı asked me to sit together with them at the front and when I said that I was afraid of sitting so close to the choirmaster, she smiled by saying: “we’ll soon assimilate you”. Being physically close to each other made the practice more meaningful for the young women; once they were singing the songs arm in arm and looking deep into each other’s eyes during the practice and their body language was telling that they enjoyed the music more than the other women at that moment.

4.2.2. Age-based Relationships

The attitudes of the elderly people towards young women also determined this physical closeness and common context of youngness and womanness. Filiz hanım from Spandau choir, who responded to my e-mail by inviting me to the practice, was happy to see that I was as young as the members of the choir. “We always support youth” she said, and told that the choir was comprised of families

when it was established 16 years ago. Then the parents started to bring their children and when they saw that their children's solo performances were more beautiful and enjoyable to listen to, they left the stage to their daughters and sons. "Ours is the first youth choir in Berlin" was Duygu's definition of her circle parallel to Filiz hanım's declaration. Their stage costume for the mini-concert at Zitadelle was composed of white pants and purple blouses, which was not typical for Turkish classical music choirs²⁶ at all; their clothes were symbolizing the youngness and womanness of the circle. In addition, Serap hoca was glad to see a young woman among the choir as a researcher; she said that she was proud of me as a woman when she introduced me to the choir. The attitude at the conservatory was that positive as well. Nuri hoca said that he was a much stricter figure during the practices a few years ago and that was because there were many middle aged people in the choir. Now that there were young people in the choir, it would be rather wrong to treat them tyrannically; he should be milder so that the young people would not lose their enthusiasm for Turkish classical music.

4.2.3. Belonging to the Music Circle

The positive attitude towards them in the circles made the young women develop belongings to the circle, which is a marker of their group besides youngness and womanness. The happiest day of Cemile at the conservatory was the day they moved to a different house which was closer to the conservatory; being closer to the circle made her love her new home. Deniz, who was not willing to come to the practices at the beginning, was now so happy with the practices and she was missing the Sundays she spent with her friends singing and learning new songs whenever she was on holiday. Having the rehearsals at a café was also an important factor for the members of Spandau choir. Apart from the rehearsals, the young women preferred to meet their choir-mates at the café. The place was also an advantage when music is considered. Several members of the choir at the

²⁶ The Turkish classical music choirs, in an effort to represent the discipline in the practices and glory of the music, usually identify with special stage costumes, which are typically black suits for men and bright and ornamented, preferably black dresses for women.

conservatory were actually students of other classes and some of them learned what Turkish classical music just because they were at the conservatory and not in another school like Ceren and Sezin. There were other examples like Rûmeysa, who was in the choir because she already knew the music, and there were other music circles that she attended and had friends within. Some members were identified with the circle among other friend groups like Aslı and Figen; Aslı's friends were bringing her music samples by claiming that she would sing them well, Figen also had some friends interested in Turkish classical music and she was willing to bring them to the choir, blending one friend group with another.

The young women not always felt belonging to the music circle and some groups were lacking in the participation of young women. The youngest member of the association was 28 years old and the members were asking each other to find a way to rejuvenate the choir and turn back to the good old days with young people. The previous choirmaster was blamed for making the youth flee the choir. Several years ago, all by chance, there were many young women in the choir but after a love affair of the previous choirmaster with one of those young women and his getting angry with the youth by claiming that the choir resembled a kindergarten with them, they lost their enthusiasm and left the choir. It was again the attitudes towards young women that determined their participation, this time in a negative manner. However, it was never the participation of young men that was considered, the feminization of the choir made the choristers think about the younger sisters and nieces as potential members of the choir.

The attitudes of the choirmaster developed a significant attachment to the circle among young women through the choirmaster. Çiğdem, who started working in a restaurant on Sundays was really sorry for being late for the rehearsals and each time she felt that Serap hoca was getting angry with her, which made her feel sorry in fact. Sezin, in addition, gave up her singing classes with her previous tutor and started attending Nuri hoca's singing classes after a short time. She said that she was so impressed by his energy that she felt the necessity to practice the songs they learned all the time at home; she did not want to leave his effort

unreturned. Aşlı, similarly, was feeling very happy after her singing classes because she was able to “grab one more drop from the knowledge ocean of Nuri hoca”²⁷. The young women went to watch his concert with the children’s choir²⁸ not because they were interested in the songs the children sang, but because they wanted to make their choirmaster feel happy by seeing his lazy students in front of him. The respect for the choirmaster represented the respect for the circle, belonging to which was a marker of their group.

4.3. The Role of Music

4.3.1. “No music without sharing”: Belonging to Music

The violinist at Spandau choir, when he first saw me at the café, advised me to attend the practices and sing together with the young women I was to observe; only this way I would be able to understand the spirit in the music and only this way I could write a better thesis according to him. The young women had much in common when considered the contexts of youngness and womanness, but nevertheless Turkish classical music was the common ground that made them come together in those circles. Part of their conversation was composed of the new songs they learned, and several informants claimed that they were referring to the lyrics of the songs they learned at the choir when they were talking about everyday issues. Probably what Nuri hoca dreamt of when he first entered the music sector in Germany was this sharing; he suffered a lot from being alone in his first years in Berlin because there were only few people who knew about Turkish classical music. “You cannot make music without sharing it”²⁹ he sighed; he was happy to see young women sharing this music and the particular feeling enmeshed in it.

²⁷ Personal communication, June 5, 2009.

²⁸ This concert took place on April 24 for the celebration of Children’s Day and the children’s choir was composed of the students from six different music schools all around the city. They sang together at the foyer of The Berliner Philharmoniker 9 *türküs* from middle, northern and western Anatolia and Thrace. Nuri hoca was one of the three choirmasters of the event.

²⁹ Personal communication, May 28, 2009.

Not only singing together but listening to the choir was part of this sharing. İrem's first concert with the conservatory passed with her among the audience and listening to the choir was an interesting experience for her. For Duygu, who listened to the choir's concert once because she was not able to attend the practices regularly due to course workload, she realized that it was rather boring to listen to the choir when compared to singing together. Gizem experienced the same feeling with her; both of them claimed that they would only listen to the concerts of their own choir. They were singing a specific music genre that they would not be willing to listen to. Does this claim have anything to do with the meanings attached to Turkish classical music?

4.3.2. Superiority and Difficulty: Meanings Attached to Turkish Classical Music

According to Stokes, any kind of performance can revive a sense of identity through music (1994: 24). This sense gains a different dimension when transnationality enters the scene. Sara Cohen, upon her study on Liverpool sound, concludes that "[t]he globalization of cultural forms has been accompanied by a localization of cultural identity and claims to authenticity, resulting in a tension or dialectic between the two trends." Thus, music as an expression of local identity finds its definition in relation to the 'non-local' (Cohen, 1994: 133). In the German-Turkish case, as expressed by Wurm, the identification through music comes out as a comparison with other musics. When the emotional experience is considered, Wurm says that the young people experience Turkish music as more emotional than German music (2006: 9). In her study among German-Turkish youth, she saw that everything Turkish has positive connotations and the German context is identified with school or job, bringing in connotations of rejection and alienation although no overt alienation is suffered from at school or at work. She concludes that these positive connotations make the young people learn the emotions and recognize them in Turkish contexts better (2006: 10). What I found out during the interviews was similar to what Wurm summarized. Ceren said that she found Turkish traditional musics more lyrical while German correspondents

were more pastoral. She felt stronger emotions when she listened to *türkü*, a typical Turkish piece of music, but she was not influenced by *Schlager*, a typical German piece of music, much. Serpil shared the same idea with Ceren; she found Turkish music very beautiful while German music sounded factitious and rude. Aslı, parallel to what Ceren and Serpil said, claimed that there is no such song as *Koparan sînemi ağyar elidir* (It's the hands of the others which tear my heart), a song in makam Kürdîlihiczâr composed by Bimen Şen and the first piece in the second part of the conservatory's concert repertoire. I could not help agreeing with her when I thought about the emotions this very song aroused in me.

When we leave comparisons aside and look solely into the meaning of Turkish classical music, it becomes clear why the most frequent title adopted for this genre is Turkish art music within the circles. Aslı starts defining the music she is dealing with via the expression “high art”³⁰ and she is not the only one thinking in that way. Cemile also uses the same expression when describing Turkish classical music. She additionally claims that it is difficult to deal with Turkish classical music for a person who is specialized in another genre but for a person of Turkish classical music, all other genres would be easy enough to deal with. Turkish classical music is a particularly difficult genre and it is superior to all other musics according to her.

Difficulty was emphasized in relationship with superiority in every interview I made as an aspect of Turkish classical music. Çiğdem, for instance, said that everybody cannot sing Turkish classical music but they would rather easily sing folk music. The polite and pure language used in Turkish classical music, without carrying any local (and inferior) accents, makes this genre a high art in her opinion. Nuri hoca makes his comment about the superiority by an analogy of German cars; he regards Turkish classical music as a Mercedes car and Turkish folk music as a Volkswagen car: “I know there are less people in number who are interested in art music than folk music, but what can I do for them? They are the

³⁰ She preferred to express this with a German phrase, *hohe Kunst*, and not with a Turkish phrase.

ones who should work harder so as to be able to buy a Mercedes.” Cansu, parallel to what Çiğdem said, explains that it is difficult to love Turkish classical music the first time one listens to it. Ceren and Sezin also think that it is difficult to like some songs the first time they listen to them, especially the ones they cannot understand the meaning of, thus they do not feel like learning especially the “slower”³¹ songs quickly. But after a while they get used to those slower songs and love singing them. Gizem, whenever she heard the name of the music, she remembers the difficult songs that everybody cannot easily sing. Duygu, in addition, made virtually the same claim with Çiğdem; a person who can sing Turkish classical music can easily sing any genre. She also regards Turkish classical music as a good genre to start with; if somebody starts with Turkish classical music, then they can easily direct themselves towards other genres, but a person who started music through a different genre cannot be directed towards Turkish classical music. Turkish classical music comes first, as Duygu claims- that is why it is a difficult genre; it is difficult to produce it and like it, it is even difficult to define it. Its difficulty makes it a beautiful genre according to Deniz: “It’s the real music, the others are just for amusement” she says. Aslı also thinks that Turkish classical music is the real music and she generalizes this idea to all classical musics; the acoustic nature of classical musics reveals the real voice of the instruments and thus they are superior to popular musics which are amplified and factitious. Turkish classical music that is full of emotions is again a difficult music for Rûmeysa; what is striking about her definition is that as an instrumentalist she claims that Turkish classical music is a genre that everybody cannot sing. Since she is aware of the different sound intervals in Turkish classical music, she can easily recognize if something is Turkish classical music or not the first time she listens to it, and she adds that the different sound intervals also make the genre a difficult one.

³¹ The Turkish word *ağır* is used with the meaning slow in rhythmic patterns like *ağır aksak* (nine fourth beat) as compared to *aksak* (nine eighth beat). It is also part of the name of a classical form *ağır semaî*. It is not wrong to say that when the informants used the Turkish adjective *ağır* for the songs or the genre in general, they meant that what they were talking about was both slow and classical.

4.3.3. Taste and Lyrics: A Peculiar Experience

Together with being a high art and difficult, Turkish classical music was found relaxing and emotional by my informants. Serpil says that she forgets everything about her daily concerns and goes deep into the song she is exposed to, that is how she feels relaxed. Gizem and Duygu similarly get away from daily issues when they are inside Turkish classical music; they think their minds go far away to different places and their souls are set free via this music, they feel consequently relaxed. Deniz also feels that she escapes daily troubles³² when she enters the world of Turkish classical music. Giving reference to Ahmet Özhan, Feyza defines Turkish classical music as a genre which tugs at people's heart strings. It is a pure, elegant and tranquilizing music according to her. She also compares Turkish classical music to the sea; it is sometimes rough and sometimes calm but it always makes you feel the emotion, whatever it is, to the utmost level. Sezin could not find any appropriate word to define the music after she heard Ceren's definition: "the perfect expression of love".

Love is the dominant emotion created by Turkish classical music according to the young women's explanations. Yearning is another common emotion, and especially the beloved people and places (i.e. Turkey) are remembered through Turkish classical music. Sometimes the emotions created through the music makes them smile and sometimes feel sad, even cry. Sezin says these are especially the emotions that they cannot express in daily life. The emotions aroused through the music also depend on the memories about the music. Deniz especially likes the songs which remind her of *memleket* since the three songs she has soloed so far were about longing for the home country. Not only the memories but many different factors like stress and the mood determine the emotion aroused by the songs according to Aslı. She says every time she sings the same song, she feels in a different way; if she is stressful or if she does not understand the lyrics,

³² 'Escaping daily troubles' was a common phrase and they referred to the school or job, which were regarded as burdens occupying the precious time of the day through assignments. They did not mention any kind of psychological trouble such as exclusion considering the school or job environment.

her performance changes and if she is happy and she concentrates on the song, her performance is much different. She simultaneously remembers the song she sang as a birthday present to Nuri hoca, *Yanıyor mu yeşil köşkün lambası* (Is the light of the green chalet on) in makam Hüzam and adds that she imagines a different green chalet every time she sings this very song. She believes that she is not the subject and the song she listens to is not the object in determining the meaning of music; she as the listener is rather only one of the subjects- that is why she feels in a different way each time she is exposed to the same song.

Reconsidering the definitions of Turkish classical music, it is not wrong to say that the repertoires they are made to sing in the circles have a role on their definitions. For Çiğdem and Feyza, for instance, the historical span of Turkish classical music only goes back to the early 20th century. They are reminded of old, black and white Turkish movies when they consider the history of Turkish music. When I ask about the Ottoman period, it does not mean anything in terms their way of defining Turkish classical music. For Figen, similarly, the expression “old song” covers only the songs that were composed 20-30 years ago. The members of the conservatory, who are exposed to pieces composed as early as in the 13th century, did not make such definite comments about the historical span of Turkish classical music.

The lyrics definitely had a role in the meanings the young women attached to Turkish classical music; they are one of the subjects as Aslı puts it. Once Serap hoca while explaining the lyrics of a song in makam Uşşak, *Gurbetten gelmişim yorgunum hancı* (I came from the foreign land, I’m tired Host) tells what *gurbet* is. She says “we are all in *gurbet* now, which is far away from our home country; we are all separated from our home country”. Considering the frequency of the songs with the theme of longing for home country in their repertoire, we can say that the young women in this choir develop an understanding of home country through the lyrics of the songs even though they do not have any physical contact with Turkey. Besides the emotions she is reminded of through the songs of Turkish classical music, Ceren also remembers the Old İstanbul although she has

never experienced the Old İstanbul. The song in makam Nihavend in their concert repertoire with the lyrics “*Gel güzelim Çamlıca’ya* (come my beauty, let’s go to Çamlıca)” is only one example of the songs which refer to the romantic districts of Old İstanbul and their lyrics somehow create an attachment to the beauty of the Old İstanbul in young women. The emotions aroused also have something to do with the lyrics. Ceren continued her comments by saying that she remembered the old and pure feeling of love, the permanent emotions that did not fly away like their contemporary versions do, through the songs. She was actually thinking of a song from their concert repertoire, “*Yıllar sonra rastladım çocukluk sevgilime* (after many years I came across my childhood love)” when she was imagining the old and pure feeling like the love of childhood. Gizem and Duygu, moreover, were reminded of the sadness of death through Turkish classical music and they simultaneously remembered a song of Münir Nurettin Selçuk, a 20th century singer and composer, in makam Segâh, “*Dönülmez akşamın ufkundayız, vakit çok geç* (we are watching the horizon of the last night, it is too late)”. Aslı has a very strong attachment to a song in makam Nihavend, the song that she learned from her grandmother and that they sang together until she passed away, “*Bir ilkbahar sabahı güneşle uyandın mı hiç* (Have you ever woken up with the sunlight in the morning of a spring day)” which reminds her of her childhood, her grandmother, her home country where her grandmother died, her love and longing for her grandmother and the home country.

4.3.4. Multiple Contexts in Determining the Meaning

The role of the lyrics changed from song to song and person to person, thus it is important to look at some different contexts. Below are the lyrics of two songs out of the concert repertoire of the conservatory from 19th century in makams Nihavend and Kürdîlihiczâkâr respectively.

*Dil seni sevmeyeni sevmeye lezzet mi olur
Olsa da böyle muhabbette hakikat mi olur
Yek cihet olmaz ise, dilde muhabbet mi olur
Aldanıp sevmeyeni can vererek sevmemeli
Aklını başına al herkes için olma deli*

(Dear heart, would there be pleasure to love somebody who does not love
Even though there is, would there be any reality in such a love
If it does not turn into one, would there be any love in the heart
One should not fall for someone who does not love and love to death
Pull your socks up and do not become mad for everybody)

The first song by Civan Ağa is in three fourth beat (*Semaî*) like waltz and the melodic pattern (*seyir*) of the song resembles the minor scale, thus it can be said that this composition carried effects of the Westernization period. The theme is unrequited love and the song warns the lovers about this kind of love which is not agreeable. Only three of the words in the lyrics do not exist in contemporary Turkish, thus the lyrics are relatively easy to understand compared to the second song.

*Sende acep uşşaka eziyet mi çoğaldı,
Yâ bizde cefâ çekmeye tâkat mi azaldı?
Âşıkların âzâr ile bîât ü tûvandır,
Ey kân-ı kerem lütf u inâyet sana kaldı.*

(Is there an increase in your cruelty towards lovers?
Or is there a decrease in our strength towards pain
Your lovers are exhausted by your scolding
Dear God kindness and grace is left to you)

The second song by Hacı Arif Bey, on the other hand, is in ten eighth beat (*Curcuna*) and the melodic structure carries peculiar sounds to Turkish classical music; it can be said that the song is rather within the classical tradition and not under the influence of Westernization. The theme is again unrequited love; this time the lyrics address the lover, not the heart of the protagonist, and the lyrics show the pain in unrequited love. The language of the song is not easy to understand since most of the words are not used in daily language in contemporary Turkish.

After listening to their comments about the meanings attached to Turkish classical music, I would expect the young women to love the first song more easily than the second one, which was not the case. The second song was one of their favorites among the whole repertoire while they did not enjoy the first song much. Nuri hoca generally preferred to skip the first song since he felt that the choristers were

not willing to sing that song enthusiastically. It was definitely more than lyrics that were appealing to their tastes. Probably the more Turkish style of the latter stimulated stronger feelings compared to the more European style of the former.

Another song from 19th century was part of the repertoire of the conservatory. They were to sing *Ännchen von Tharau*, a composition of Friedrich Sicher upon the poem of Simon Dach, in the concert in Bernau bei Berlin with the church choir of Schönower. It is regarded as an important *Volkslied* although it is not actually a folk song and the theme is love. Below is the first stanza of the song with the English translation of the poem by Henry Wadsworth Longfellow.

*Ännchen von Tharau ist, die mir gefällt,
Sie ist mein Leben, mein Gut und mein Geld.
Ännchen von Tharau hat wieder ihr Herz
Auf mich gerichtet in Liebe und Schmerz.
Ännchen von Tharau, mein Reichthum, mein Gut,
Du meine Seele, mein Fleisch und mein Blut!*

Annie of Tharaw, my true love of old,
She is my life, and my goods, and my gold.
Annie of Tharaw, her heart once again
To me has surrendered in joy and in pain.
Annie of Tharaw, my riches, my good,
Thou, O my soul, my flesh and my blood!

A depiction of a passionate love with more understandable lyrics than the Turkish examples of the same era, this song was part of a bizarre experience for the German-Turkish young women. Although the melodic structure resembled that of Civan Ağa's song, they were more enthusiastic about singing the German song, believing in that it would contribute to their musical development more. This was an example of a romantic theme different from the *Schlager* that Ceren mentioned before and the song addressed more intense emotions about love compared to the first two examples. The song definitely influenced them, but the influence was very much related to the context they sang the song in. When considering Manuel's comments, "[a]s musical sounds mingle and cross-fertilize in the global soundscape, it is inevitable that at a certain point they can come to be heard not as resonant cultural icons, but as depthless simulacra." (1997: 30) The song was not a love song for them but rather a memory of an amusing concert experience. The notes of the song remained within

the repertoire booklets even after the Bernau bei Berlin concert, and one day during the practice Nuri hoca came across the note in his own booklet. “Now, let’s sing Ännchen von Tharau” he said, making everybody laugh their heads off. This amusement aroused questions on their complex identification processes.

4.4. Contested Belongings

4.4.1. “*Deutsche Türk*”: Revered Turkishness vs Despised Turkishness

The day Nuri hoca learned about my research, he felt the necessity to warn me about the German-Turks. “The Turks here are not like the Turks you know” he said, “they’re *Deutsche Türk*”³³. This was the very first moment the questions started to appear in my mind: How were the belongings shaped? What was the difference of being a German-Turk?

Nuri hoca was not content with the attitudes of the “*Deutsche Türk*” towards the conservatory. “The Turks here do not respect the value of anything” he continued. He believed that his efforts to establish a conservatory to teach Turkish classical music to the German-Turkish youth were in vain. He gave up giving concerts to an exclusively Turkish audience because he could receive no feedback from the Turks and he was not appreciated. His effort to establish the conservatory was first hindered by the German government with this claim: “We are trying to Germanify the children of the minorities. Why are you trying to Turkify them through a conservatory of Turkish music?” After founding the conservatory as a private school, this time he received extreme critiques from the Turks around. They did not know what a conservatory was and they were not willing to send their children to this school because they were afraid their children would be “artists”, they could become singers, belly dancers, even porn stars³⁴. The Turkishness they revered was carrying ignorance inside, thus it was harshly

³³ What made this expression significant was that the first half was in German and the second half was in Turkish.

³⁴ Personal communication, Halime Karademirli, April 20, 2009.

criticized at the same time. The young women of the conservatory choir once were discussing TV news and especially one specific report in which the reporter talked to the truck drivers as if she were a prostitute infected with AIDS. “Oh the men of my *memleket*”, sighed Sezin, “they wouldn’t even hesitate to make love with a prostitute to death”. Being a Turkish man was contested through indifference towards health from a gendered perspective while the role of the woman was not considered at all. Indifference within the despised Turkish identity was attached to the corrupted men suddenly; the German-Turkish women should care for morality all the time, they should not have a fault in the despising of Turkish identity.

Besides ignorance and indifference, Turkishness negatively connoted lack of discipline. Before the concert of the association began, the daughters of the choristers were complaining about the typical Turkish attitude of coming late to the concerts. Nuri hoca saw the lack of institutionalization of Turkish music in Turkey as another aspect of lack of discipline; according to him this was the main reason why foreigners came to the conservatory for learning Turkish classical music instead of seeking the resources in Turkey. He did not believe that the Turks in Turkey were serious enough in producing Turkish classical music. Thus the Turkish classical music in Turkey was not qualified enough on international level. Suddenly he moved on to say that he did not love Turkey since the country did not use the opportunities to care for the transnational Turks around the world, especially in Germany. He was preaching a kind of Turkishness as a missionary to the young German-Turkish people, which was contested through the existing kind of Turkishness that he did not like at all. Parallel to that, he suggested a strategy for representing Turkish classical music beyond the borders of Turkey: if he were the minister of culture, he would ask for written documents about the events the musicians are joining and the groups they are playing/ singing with. After checking the biographies of the musicians, the structure and aim of the events, and sample recordings, he would select certain events on the basis of fulfilling certain criteria and he would not let all the musicians go to all kinds of events. He did not like his “home country” because serious mistakes have been made concerning

Turkish classical music so far and he was striving hard to correct the mistakes and change the incorrect image of Turkish classical music in people's minds. His belongings of home country were contested through Turkish classical music as well.

I myself as a performer of Turkish classical music saw the contestation of my own belongings during my stay in the field. I played and sang among the Turkish classical music circles so as to have an insight of their feelings and this participation was actually very difficult for me. With the choir in Munich, I had to play some recent compositions and popular songs in makam Muhayyerkürdî which are well known due to the easiness and simplicity of the compositions and lyrics and which are rather weak compositions devalorizing the classical tradition. I normally did not ever play those pieces in the music circles in Turkey and whenever other people in the group attempted to play them, I protested and gave up singing/ playing until the songs ended. It would not be appropriate to protest the pieces they practiced, so I tried to keep playing but I could not have enthusiasm to play anymore. Moreover, before the concert of the conservatory choir in Bernau by Berlin, I got extremely angry with the people who showed up at the last minute in order to be on the stage. They did not know the songs well and they were not taking the concert seriously enough, which resulted in their chatting on the stage in front of the audience; all in all they were just spoiling the whole performance. I would immediately take action to stop the undisciplined behavior among the choir or leave the choir under such a circumstance in the music circles I regularly attend but this time what I could do was just smile. My understanding of Turkish classical music did not fit into their scheme and I had a hard time adopting myself to the new scheme.

4.4.2. Contested Experiences of the Home Country

As mentioned before, there is a heterogeneous understanding of the home country among the German-Turkish young women. Turning back to the belongings of home country, it would be appropriate to say that the young German-Turkish people's belongings to home country were also contested. Once Figen asked me

how much I missed Turkey. I told her that I was lucky enough to come to Berlin where one can find thousands of things related to the home country and I was not actually able to miss Turkey. She suddenly got angry with me; a person having her origin in Turkey, wherever she was born and wherever she was living, should be missing her home country according to her. Vedat bey, one of the instructors at the conservatory whose relatives had a migration story although he was the first person in his family to settle in Germany, told about his nephews and nieces who were enthusiastic about going to Turkey for the whole year but who immediately started to wait for the day to turn back to Germany the moment they arrived in Turkey. Since everybody around them told about the beloved “home country”, they inevitably loved the home country within the context; but the image they had in mind was different from the actual state of the home country, resulting in a desired holiday which passes terribly. According to him it was the same context which made the young people enthusiastic about a final return to home country, but the ones who tried their chance, since they were used to the German lifestyle, were unsuccessful enough to flee back to Germany. The home country, nevertheless, remained the place to spend the holidays. The first step of enthusiasm exactly fits most of my informants’ desire and the second step of disappointment exactly fits the case of İlay, who discouraged the young women around her from settling in Turkey. Belonging to the home country was an essential part of their existence in Germany as a Turk, but they inevitably got confused by the contested experiences of the home country.

4.4.3. “Two things cannot be good at the same time”: Germanness in Act

Belongings of Turkishness were contested through belongings of Germanness and I was told about stories on different points of view. Considering the success of the conservatory for 11 years, there were still people waiting for the conservatory to be closed down. If the story came to such an end, the Turkish people would say “We have told you thousands of times before” for losing a doomed institution while the German people would say “Alas!” for losing a precious institution³⁵.

³⁵ Personal communication, Halime Karademirli, April 20, 2009.

Vedat bey also referred to the different perspectives by giving an example about instruments. Whenever he was selling an instrument to or repairing the instrument of a German person, he would never think about financial issues, but the Turks he came across always treated the instruments that were invaluable for him as pieces of wood and they were always trying to bargain. When discussing the current state of Turkish classical music at the conservatories with a German-Turkish scholar, I told about my ideas on the insufficiency of academic research about Turkish classical music, and he was shocked to hear that especially on the level of active performers: “I would imagine a musician as a person who has read about the theory of their music and who is able to write and argue about their music” he said. Within different contexts, different levels of belongings worked and Turkishness and Germanness acted as if the two sides of a coin, they were frequently contested by each other and Turkish classical music was a point of contestation. “Two things cannot be good at the same time according to Turks” said Vedat bey and this was the reason lying beneath the criticisms according to him. The association was criticizing the conservatory for not properly teaching and applying Turkish classical music while the conservatory was criticizing music schools for not providing proper education of Turkish classical music. How were these contestations reflected among German-Turkish young women?

“I hope your research can represent the youth of here to the youth of there” an elderly chorister at Spandau choir told me. The German-Turkish youth were so different from their correspondents in Turkey and thus they were not able to understand each other. Sezin’s comment was parallel to the advice I received; the German-Turkish young women did not have the chance to study abroad since their families were afraid of racism as they somehow suffered from discrimination in their daily lives in Germany. She expected that the lucky Turkish youth who could travel across Europe for education would not be able to empathize with the German-Turkish youth. According to Manuel, “[a] basic feature of modernity is the way that individuals have become increasingly free – indeed, condemned – to self-consciously choose their sense of identity, rather than unquestioningly inheriting it as a pre-ordained given” (1997: 27). The German-Turkish young

women had to negotiate between the norms and values of Turkishness and Germanness and construct their belongings accordingly and this was definitely not an easy process. Wurm says, the main feature of youth cultures is “the differentiation from others on the one hand, and affiliation with others on the other hand” (2006: 14). The German-Turkish young women want to be different from the youth in Germany and they also want to be part of the mainstream. Turkish classical music is one of the safest tools to do so since it was not politicized: they can easily segregate from youth in general by dealing with a rather old and unheard music genre; they can also remain within their groups without dissociation from society (Wurm, 2006: 15) since dealing with Turkish classical music is not threatening the mainstream society. Wurm also confirms that Turkish music is a good source for designing a self-image for the German-Turkish youth who try to “locate themselves in a society they do not feel accepted by but nevertheless live in” (2006: 15). Nuri hoca expresses this feeling by the recently emerged term “*Deukisch*” which is the combination of the German words for German and Turkish; the German-Turkish youth preserved their cultural belongings while integrating well into the German lifestyle. From Mandel’s perspective, who tells about a kebab shop owner who is victimized and blamed for not communicating his demands and not being able to integrate, but who is in fact beyond questions of integration by speaking fluent German and negotiating well with the German authorities for keeping his shop open and by selling his döner kebab to the German people (2008: 312), integration is actually not a question anymore; the Turkish people are not assimilated but they are consolidated. The German-Turkish youth have well become part of the society they have grown up in; they speak the language as fluently as the German do, they receive as high degrees in education as their German counterparts do, they know the legal and social systems just as well as the German people do, but nevertheless they feel they will never be welcome in Germany (Wurm, 2006: 15)³⁶. Consequently, there arises a tension within being a German-Turkish young woman and Turkish

³⁶ My informants never openly said that they will never be welcome, but they definitely expressed the alienation from the mainstream society when comparing Turkey to Germany.

classical music works as a tool to escape this tension. Many informants confirm that they feel relaxed when they deal with Turkish classical music; they just forget about everyday concerns, probably the contesting German-Turkish belongings.

The contested German-Turkish belongings showed themselves upon a visit of an unexpected guest to the conservatory. A guitarist who accompanied his friend in buying oud strings was interested in challenging the opinions of the young women about music. His Turkish was not good at all. When he learned that Ceren was attending guitar lessons, he started to preach her by claiming that guitar is a more modern instrument than *bağlama*, thus guitarists are more open-minded people than *bağlama* players. “Did you get it” he asked Ceren who was via her body language rejecting his opinions. Then he asked me whether I was playing the guitar; actually I was, but I pretended to learn the oud only. He immediately stopped his conversation with me and turned back to Ceren. He was no longer able to claim that Turkish music and Turkish instruments were inferior to the European ones. He advised her (but not me) to work hard and to listen to the music she was trying to learn more. When he went away, Ceren told me how angry she was about his attitude towards the modernity of Turkish music. She believed that the superiority depended on the person and a *bağlama* player could well be more open-minded than a pianist despite the fact that piano is a more complicated instrument. “Turkish art music is modern as well” she said, she did not believe that Western music was modern and Turkish music primitive and thus Western music was superior to Turkish music. Nevertheless, she was learning Turkish music upon a Western instrument which did not have an appropriate fret system to play all the pieces of Turkish classical music. There was heterogeneity in the education provided at the conservatory upon Turkish music.

4.4.4. Turkish Classical Music as a Source of Contestation

As it can be inferred from the story of the unexpected visitor, Turkish classical music is as well a source of contestation. Out of the 13 young women I interviewed, only 3 of them were listening to Turkish classical music apart from the practices and repertoires. Rûmeysa’s favorite song was one of the songs that

Nilüfer, a famous Turkish pop music singer, sang and the song was composed by a Canadian musician; Turkish classical music did not fit well into her tastes and none of the songs in the Turkish classical music repertoire could become her favorite song. Duygu used to listen to Turkish classical music for instance, but later on she gave up doing so. Furthermore, she hated the experience of listening to the concert of her choir. She enjoyed singing a genre that she did not like listening to. The only informant who had some friends interested in Turkish classical music was Figen, and she was enthusiastic about making them join the choir. I asked them whether music took any space in their conversations, and Sezin's answer was that they would discuss the songs they recently learned but music did not occupy an important space in their daily conversations. They were not able to share their music with their friends; they were not even able to share their opinions about music within their music circles. Their friends were not listening to Turkish classical music and they were getting really bored even with the idea of their concerts. Thus, the young German-Turkish women were not able to greet their friends on the stage since their friends were not willing to listen to their concerts. The lack of interest of the friends in Turkish classical music was one of the reasons why Rûmeysa did not bring her instrument to Turkey, for instance; she did not share anything in common with her friends in terms of Turkish classical music. This could be one of the reasons why she was not performing her instrument enthusiastically. Nuri hoca once complained about the youth who were not passionate about their instruments. "I have been playing this instrument for years and I still have the same passion to play it whenever I have it on my lap. They're so young and it is really sad to see them already exhausted by playing their instruments" he said. The young women's attachment to Turkish classical music was shaped by the contestations of their belongings and social belongings were part of the contestation. Furthermore, Deniz said that she hanged around with her friends from the choir from time to time since other friend groups were not interested in Turkish classical music. The young German-Turkish women needed to separate themselves into two since they were not able to make their friend groups come together under the domain of their interest.

Strange enough for me to have the choirmaster as the chief cook at a café, I had a rather interesting experience attending the terminal celebration of the Spandau choir at the café. For a few weeks, the young women of the choir had hidden themselves in a yard of a neighboring building and practiced their drama which was about the cultural interaction of people from different parts of Turkey who met at the café. The protagonists from Adana, İstanbul and Thrace fought with each other in every scene and at the end they danced together in the same *halay*³⁷. They were sorry that the Laz figure was too sick to join the event but it was not a big shortcoming for the success of the show. The drama actually symbolized their contested belongings on different levels like nation, culture and music. There was a contestation between them all the time, but this was the way they managed to overcome the burden of migration history and transnational life between two countries. Serap hoca enjoyed watching her students' performance much and she was surprised at the same time. "What talents you have apparently!" she exclaimed when they were taking photos with their costumes. She was complaining at the same time by saying "this is actually a choir".

³⁷ *Halay* is a common folk dance in the Middle East in which the dancers form a circle or a line by holding each other on the little finger, on the shoulder or on the hand (<http://www.reference.com/browse/wiki/Halay>). The particular *halay* my informants danced was in Kurdish style and they preferred to dance with Kurdish music.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

“In a world of uncertainties, notions of culture and identity are at stake because forms of belonging are no longer guaranteed” as Strasser puts it (2008: 191). Belongings are multi-dimensional and the different dimensions may not always be in good harmony. Migration stories just contribute to the uncertainties as the people cross borders and carry their belongings from the home country to the host country. The cultural capital that migrant groups own has a role on the cultural productions of those groups and they are transmitted to the following generations no matter whether they still have organic ties to the origins of these cultural productions in everyday lives or not. Even though the second and third generations of migrant groups have transnational connections with different countries and constantly cross borders, they may not develop strong attachments to the good old cultural traditions of their parents and grandparents. Nevertheless, these productions play a role in their identification processes especially in a context in which they constantly feel that they are different from the mainstream society. Sometimes the youth create a mixed understanding of popular music which carries elements of both the global musical flows and the local traditional musics. *Arabesk* in German, rap and hip-hop are such productions of the German-Turkish youth that have been appealing to ethnographers in Germany for a couple of decades. Having a gendered perspective, this study moved towards a music genre that has been unheard, Turkish classical music, a genre with a peculiar sound system and understanding of *makam* and *usûl*, a music tradition of about a millennium up to now originating in the Middle East and reaching its climax during Ottoman period which was brought to Germany in late 1970s, and aimed to give voice to the German-Turkish young women dealing with this genre, who have been unheard as well since they are well integrated into the German society

and they are not challenging the norms through extraordinary cultural productions.

However, when we look deep inside, it is not difficult to see that the ‘invisibility’ (Gullestad, 2004) of these young women, producing silently the music of their interest, actually carries contested experiences of belongings. Being born almost exclusively in Germany, the German-Turkish young women expressed belongings to cities all around Turkey as the hometown. For some of the young women like Feyza, Figen and Serpil, Turkey is the home country where you can experience your Turkishness comfortably; for some others like Deniz, on the other hand, it is one of the home countries where you miss the other. Turkish classical music, a difficult and beautiful genre full of emotions, contributes with the melodies, the lyrics and the emotions to the identification processes with Turkishness. The young women identified themselves with Turkishness and willingly joined- or were encouraged to join- the Turkish classical music circles the motivation of which is to preserve the Turkish culture, and they at the same time faced the ignorance, indifference and lack of discipline within this revered identity. They experienced Germanness with the language and the lifestyle at the same time, which made them recognize the despised aspects of Turkishness and which constrained the attachment to an abstract and glorified Turkishness.

Migration and transnationality, confusing enough together with other intersections like womanness, youngness and different tastes, contribute to the tension of the multi-dimensionality of belongings. Throughout the contested belongings, music works both as a tool to escape the tension created by contesting belongings and as a source actually creating the tension. Thus it is inevitable for the meanings attributed to music to reflect these contested belongings. Being within Turkish classical music circles, for my informants, brings together the conflict of singing Turkish classical music and (not) listening to Turkish classical music; being a young woman interested in Turkish classical music and being a member of a group of young women who are not interested in Turkish classical music at all; willing to go back to the home country but not being able to survive back in the

home country; the conflict of appreciated Turkish identity and despised Turkish identity. When considered the different ethnic and religious belongings, the contested identification of Turkishness becomes more complicated on the level of German-Turkish young women, some of whom are of Kurdish origin and some are Alevis; however, these complexities do not turn into ‘politics of participation’ (Strasser, 2008) and adopting Dwyer’s explanation of British Muslim young women, it would be possible to claim that the Kurdish belongings are non-ethnic and the Alevi belongings are non-sected. Similarly, they are not ‘self-consciously’ (Lewis, 1994) musicians; they produce a genre of music that they do not listen to and they define their group through the music circles they attend, not with the music itself. Nevertheless, singing and playing together the pieces from all the periods of Turkish classical music regardless of their structural differences and enjoying the music they do together no matter how wide a range of differences exist among their groups, German-Turkish young women attribute their love of the home country and the beloved people back in the home country to the songs they sing through the meanings of the lyrics and the emotions aroused by the music. Creating so many conflicts in their minds, it is again these circles which make them forget all kinds of everyday conflicts and go deep into the music which appeals to their souls through its meaning.

REFERENCES

Aksoy, Bülent

- 1999 Osmanlı Musiki Geleneğinde Kadın. *Osmanlı*, vol. 10: Kültür ve Sanat, Güler Eren ed. Pp. 788-800. Ankara: Yeni Türkiye Yayınları.
- 2008 Türk Musikisi sözü üzerine. *In Geçmişin Musiki Mirasına Bakışlar*. Pp. 133-138. İstanbul: Pan Yayıncılık.

Amit, Vered, ed.

- 2000 Introduction: Constructing the field. *In Constructing the Field: Ethnographic Fieldwork in the Contemporary World*. Pp. 1-19. London, New York: Routledge.

Appadurai, Arjun

- 1990 Disjuncture and difference in the global culture economy. *Public Culture*, 2 (2): 1-24.
- 1996 Here and now. *In Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Pp.1-26. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Behar, Cem

- 2005 Musikiden Müziğe. *Osmanlı/Türk Müziği: Gelenek ve Modernlik*. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.

Bourdieu, Pierre

- 1989 *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. London: Routledge.

Brubaker, Rogers and Cooper, Frederick

- 2000 Beyond 'identity'. *Theory and Society*, 29: 1-47.

Cohen, Sara

- 1994 Identity, Place and the 'Liverpool Sound'. *In* Ethnicity, Identity and Music, Martin Stokes, ed. Pp. 117-134. Oxford, New York: Berg.

Connell, John and Gibson, Chris

- 2004 World music: deterritorializing place and identity, *Progress in Human Geography*, 28 (3): 342-361.

Doubleday, Veronica

- 2007 The Role of Women and Children's Amateur Music Making in Afghanistan and the Afghan Diaspora: Considering Continuity and Change. Paper presented at Conference on Music in the world of Islam/Congrès des Musiques dans le monde de l'islam. Assilah, August 8-13.

Dwyer, Clare

- 1997 Contesting identities: challenging dominant representations of young British Muslim women. *In* Cool Places: Geographies of Youth Cultures, Tracey Skelton & Gill Valentine, eds. Pp. 50-65. London: Routledge.
- 1999 Contradictions of community: questions of identity for young British Muslim women, *Environment and Planning A.*, 31: 53-68.

Ekinçi, Mehmet U.

- 2006 Yaşayan 'Musikî'. *Kılavuz*, 39: 54-56.

Featherstone, Mike

- 1993 Global and local cultures. *In* Mapping the futures: local cultures, global change, Jon Bird, Barry Curtis, Tim Putnam, George Robertson & Lisa Tickner, eds. Pp. 169-182. London: Routledge.

Frith, Simon

- 1996 Music and Identity. *In* Questions of Cultural Identity, Stuart Hall & Paul Du Gay, eds. Pp. 108-127. London: SAGE Publications.
- 2000 The discourse of world music. *In* Western Music and its Others, Georgina Born & David Hesmondhalgh, eds. Pp.305-322. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Ghosh, Amitav

1989 The diaspora in Indian Culture, *Public Culture*, 2 (1): 73-78.

Glaser, Barney G. and Strauss, Anselm L.

1967 The discovery of grounded theory; strategies for qualitative research. Chicago: Aldine Pub. Co.

Greve, Martin

2006 Almanya’da “Hayalî Türkiye’nin” Müziği. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Gullestad, Marianne

2004 Blind Slaves of our Prejudices: Debating 'Culture' and 'Race' in Norway, *Ethnos*, 69 (2): 177–203.

Güngör, Nazife

1993[1990] Arabesk: Sosyokültürel açıdan Arabesk Müzik. Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi.

Güray, Cenk

2006 Makam yapılarını yansıtan bir model önerisi için yapay zekâ tekniklerinin kullanımı. MA thesis, Department of Musicology, Başkent University.

Hannerz, Ulf

1990 Cosmopolitans and Locals in World Culture, *Theory, Culture & Society*, 7: 237-251.

1996 Transnational connections: culture, people, places. London: Routledge.

2000 [1997] “Flows, boundaries and hybrids: Keywords in transnational anthropology”, trans. *Mana*, 3 (1). Pp. 7-39.

Hebdige, Dick

1987 Cut ‘n’ mix: culture, identity and Caribbean music. London: Routledge/Comedia.

Hedetoft, Ulf and Hjort, Mette

- 2002 The Postnational Self. Belonging and Identity. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Helvacı, Zeynep

- 2005 Kültür tarihinin yeniden inşasında müziğin rolü: Evrimci ve difüzyonist okulların karşılaştırılması. MA Thesis, Department of Anthropology: Hacettepe University.

Huq, Rupa

- 2003 Global Youth Cultures in Localized Spaces: The Case of the UK New Asian Dance Music and French Rap. *In* The Post Sub-Cultures Reader, David Muggleton& Rupert Weinzierl, eds. Pp. 195-208. Oxford: Berg.

Jäger, Ralf Martin

- 2000 Kültürler Arasında Müzik: XVI. Yüzyıldan XVIII. Yüzyılın Sonuna Kadar Olan Dönemde Müzikteki Asimilasyon ve Kabullenme Hakkında Düşünceler. *Osmanlı*, vol. 10: Kültür ve Sanat, Güler Eren ed. Pp. 759-774. Ankara: Yeni Türkiye Yayınları.

Jurgens, Jeffrey

- 2001 Shifting spaces: Complex identities in Turkish-German migration. *In* New Transnational Social Spaces, Ludger Pries, ed. Pp. 94- 112. London: Routledge.

Kaya, Ayhan

- 2001 Sicher in Kreuzberg!: Constructing Diasporas: Turkish Hip Hop Youth in Berlin. Bielefeld: Transkript-Verlag.
- 2002 Aesthetics of diaspora: contemporary minstrels in Turkish Berlin, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 28 (1): 43- 62.

Konrad, George

- 1984 Antipolitics. San Diego and New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Lewis, Philip

- 1994 Islamic Britain: Religion, Politics and Identity among British Muslims. London: I B Tauris.

Luke, Timothy W.

- 2006 Transnationalities: Embedded, Imagined and Engineered Communities. Paper presented at Rethinking Spaces: Transnational Representations/Repenser les espaces: Les représentations transnationales, McGill University, February 10.

Mandel, Ruth

- 1994 'Fortress Europe' and the Foreigners Within: Germany's Turks. *In* The Anthropology of Europe, Victoria A. Goddard, Josep R. Llobera and Cris Shore, eds. Pp. 113-124. Oxford: Berg.
- 2008 Cosmopolitan Anxieties: Turkish Challenges to Citizenship and Belonging in Germany. Durham: Duke University Press.

Manuel, Peter

- 1997 Music, Identity, and Images of India in the Indo-Caribbean Diaspora, *Asian Music*, 29 (1): 17-35.

Marcus, George E.

- 1995 Ethnography in/of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-Sited Ethnography, *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 24: 95-117.

Martin, Patricia Y. and Turner, Barry. A.

- 1986 Grounded theory and organizational research, *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 22 (2): 141-157.

Martiniello, Marco and Lafleur, Jean-Michel, eds.

- 2008 Ethnic Minorities' Cultural and Artistic Practices as Forms of Political Expression: A Review of the Literature and a Theoretical Discussion on Music. Theme issue, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 34 (8): 1191-1215.

Marzorati, Gerald

- 1989 Salman Rushdie: Fiction's Embattled Infidel, *The New York Times Magazine*, Jan 29, sec. 6, pp. 24-27, 47-49, 100.

Milson, Fred

1974 An Introduction to Community Work. London: Routledge.

Moore, Henrietta L.

1994 A Passion for Difference. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Moustakas, Clark E.

1994 Phenomenological research methods. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Napolitano, Valentina

2002 Introduction: Prisms of Belonging and Alternative Modernities. *In* Migration, Mujercitas, and Medicine Men: Living in Urban Mexico. Pp. 1-16. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Öztürk, Okan Murat

2006 Anadolu Yerel Müziklerinde Yapıtaşları Olarak Makam ve Usul Kavramları. Paper presented at the International Congress on Musical Culture in Turkey throughout history and the museum of music, İstanbul, May 27-29.

Poster, Mark

1990 The mode of information: poststructuralism and social context. Cambridge: Polity.

Probyn, Elspeth

1996 Outside Belongings: Disciplines, Nations, and the Place of Sex. New York, London: Routledge.

Qureshi, Regula B.

2003 Music Anthropologies and Music Histories: A Preface and an Agenda, *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 48 (3): 331-342.

Römhild, Regina

- 2005 Global Heimat Germany: Migration and the Transnationalization of the Nation-State, *Migration, Culture and, the Nation State*, 1 (1): 1-8.

Sartori, İlaria

- 2007 Cultural identity, Islamic revivalism and women's new-found role in preserving and transmitting musical traditions. Suggestions from Harar, Ethiopia. Paper presented at Conference on Music in the world of Islam/Congrès des Musiques dans le monde de l'islam. Assilah, August 8-13.

Signell, Karl

- 1976 The Modernization Process in Two Oriental Music Cultures: Turkish and Japanese, *Asian Music*, 7 (2): 72-102.
- 2006 Makam: Türk Sanat Musikisinde Makam Uygulaması. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.

Slobin, Mark

- 2003 The Destiny of "Diaspora" in Ethnomusicology. *In* The cultural study of music: a critical introduction, M. Clayton, T. Herbert and R. Middleton, eds. Pp. 284-296. New York: Routledge.

Songar, Ayhan

- 1986 Musiki Psikolojisi. *In* Türk Musikisinin Dünü, Bugünü, Yarını, Feyzi Halıcı, ed. Pp. 3-7. Ankara: Sevinç Matbaası.

Soysal, Levent

- 2001 Diversity of Experience, Experience of Diversity: Turkish Migrant Youth Culture in Berlin, *Cultural Dynamics*, 13 (1): 5-28.
- 2003 Labor to Culture: Writing Turkish Migration to Europe, *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102 (2/3): 491-508.
- 2004 Rap, Hiphop, Kreuzberg: Scripts of/for Migrant Youth Culture in the WorldCity Berlin. *In* Multicultural Germany: Arts, Media, and Performance, Special Issue, edited by Barbara Wolbert and Deniz Göktürk, *New German Critique* 92: 62-81.

Sökmen, Ayhan and Aksu, Şenol

- 1986 Türk Musikisinde Makamlar: 1000 yıl içinde makamların yaşamları. *In* Türk Musikisinin Dünü, Bugünü, Yarını, Feyzi Halıcı, ed. Pp. 17-36. Ankara: Sevinç Matbaası.

Stangor, Charles

- 2004 Social groups in action and interaction. New York: Psychology Press.

Stokes, Martin

- 1992 Discovering the Folk and their Music. *In* The Arabesk Debate: Music and Musicians in Modern Turkey. Pp. 20-49. New York: Clarendon Press-Oxford.
- 1994 Introduction: Ethnicity, Identity and Music. *In* Ethnicity, Identity and Music, Martin Stokes, ed. Pp. 1-27. Oxford, New York: Berg.
- 1994a Place, Exchange and Meaning: Black Sea Musicians in the West of Ireland. *In* Ethnicity, Identity and Music. Martin Stokes, ed. Pp. 97-115. Oxford, New York: Berg.
- 1994b Turkish arabesk and the city: Urban popular culture as spatial practice. *In* Islam, Globalization and Postmodernity, Akbar S. Ahmed and Hastings Donnan, eds. Pp. 21-36. London: Routledge.

Strasser, Sabine

- 2008 We will not integrate! Multiple belongings, political activism and anthropology in Austria. *In* Taking Sides: ethics, politics and fieldwork in anthropology, Heidi Armbruster & Anna Laerke, eds. Pp. 175-198. NY and Oxford: Berghahn.

Strauss, Anselm L. and Corbin, Juliet M.

- 1998 Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Suddaby, Rod

- 2006 From the Editors: What grounded theory is not, *Academy of Management Journal*, 49 (4): 633-642.

Suter, Elizabeth A.

- 2000 Focus Groups in Ethnography of Communication: Expanding Topics of Inquiry Beyond Participant Observation, The Qualitative Report [On-line serial], 5 (1&2). Electronic document, <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR5-1/suter.html>, accessed December 22, 2008.

Tanrıkorur, Cinuçen

- 2003 Türk Halk Mûsikîsi ve Klasik Türk Mûsikîsi. *In* Osmanlı Dönemi Türk Mûsikîsi. Pp. 188-198. İstanbul: Dergâh Yayınları.
- 2003a Makam. *In* Müzik, Kültür, Dil. Pp. 131-142. İstanbul: Dergâh Yayınları.
- 2004 Türk Müzik Kimliği. İstanbul: Dergâh Yayınları.

Tauma, Habib Hassan

- 1971 The Maqam Phenomenon: An Improvisation Technique in the Music of the Middle East, *Ethnomusicology*, 15 (1): 38-48.

Tedlock, Barbara

- 1991 From Participant Observation to the Observation of Participation: The Emergence of Narrative Ethnography, *Journal of Anthropological Research*, 47 (1): 69-94.

Tekelioğlu, Orhan

- 2001 Modernizing Reforms and Turkish Music in the 1930s, *Turkish Studies*, 2 (1): 93-108.

Terzi, Cihangir

- 2009 Almanya’da Yaşayan Türklerin Müzik Kültürü, Sosyal Statüsü ve Entegrasyon Politikaları Üzerine Saptamalar, Değerlendirmeler ve Öneriler, *Folklor/Edebiyat*, 15 (58): 133-144.

Tkachenko, Paul Steven

- 2005 The Musical Activities of the Young Turkish-Speaking Community in London: Identity and Nationalism. MA Thesis, Department of Music: Open University.

Tomlinson, John

- 1999 Globalised culture: the triumph of the West? *In* Culture and Global Change, Tracey Skelton & Tim Allen, eds. Pp.23-31. London and New York: Routledge.

Üngör, Ethem Ruhi

- 1999 Osmanlı'da Türk Musikisi ve Çalgılar. Osmanlı, vol. 10: Kültür ve Sanat, Güler Eren ed. Pp. 572-583. Ankara: Yeni Türkiye Yayınları.

White, Jenny B.

- 1997 Turks in the New Germany, *American Anthropologist*, 99 (4): 754-769.

Wimpenny, Peter and Gass, John

- 2000 Interviewing in phenomenology and grounded theory: Is there a difference?, *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 31(6): 1485-1492.

Wilpert, Czarina

- 2004 National Case Study: Muslim Youth in Germany. Focus on Youth of Turkish Origins. Paper presented at the International Conference Muslim Youth in Europe. Typologies of religious belonging and sociocultural dynamics, Edoardo Agnelli Centre for Comparative Religious Studies, Turin, June 11.

Wulff, Helena

- 1995 Introducing youth culture in its own right: The state of the art and new Possibilities. *In* Youth Cultures: A Cross-cultural Perspective, Vered Amit-Talai & Helena Wulff, eds. Pp. 1-18. London, New York: Routledge.

Wurm, Maria

- 2006 Musik in der Migration: Beobachtungen zur kulturellen Artikulation türkischer Jugendlicher in Deutschland. Bielefeld: Transcript.

Yip, Andrew Kam-Tuck

- 2008 The quest of intimate/sexual citizenship: lived experiences of lesbian and bisexual Muslim women, *Cont Islam*, 2: 99-117.

Yuval-Davis, Nira

2006 Belonging and the Politics of Belonging, *Patterns of Prejudice*, 40
 (3): 196-213.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

The note of the *türkü* sung by the conservatory choir. It has information about articulation of Turkish letters, in handwriting, so as to help the German choristers.

ŞU DERE YONCA (ALİM)

Yöresi: Şanlıurfa
Kaynak: Sadettin Kaynak

Makamı: Mahur
Derleyen: S. Kaynak
Notalayn: S. Kaynak

SAZ

Ah

Şu de re yon ca SAZ Her se her fer- Aç kol la rın

yad e- de- rek A lim SAZ A lim SAZ

Ah çeker ağ- lar Boy lu bo yun ca SAZ ca SAZ

Ah.....Şu dere yonca
Aç kolların sar boynuma Alim
Boylu boyunca
Ah..... Aşık olanın
Kuturmu aklı başında Alim
Yarı görünce

Ah.....Meşeli dağlar
Açıldı gül lale sümbül Alim
Bezendi dağlar
Ah.....Çileli bülbül
Her seher feryad ederek Alim
Ah çeker ağlar

Ş = sch
C = dj
Ç = tsch
ğ = bever steller
büchttabe
verlängern
S = sss
- = zzz

APPENDIX B

A religious piece notated by Nuri hoca, with the peculiar sharp for B, it is significant that the symbol occurs only in the first line of the score.

Can ellerinden gelmişem

Can el le rin den__ gel mi sem fa ni me ka__ ni ney le yem

Ol mül ke mey__ lim sal mi sam ben bu ci ha__ ni ney__ le yem

Dünyaya geldim gitmeye ilm ile hilme yetmeye Ask-i ile an seyretmeye ben in-ü ani neyleyem
Askin sarabin icmisem dil gülsenine göcmüşem Ben varligimdan gecmişem nam-ü nisani neyleyem
Dilden dile bin terceman varken ne söyler bu lisan Cün canı dildir hem zeban Nutk-ü beyani neyleyem
Hakki cem-i halkdan müstagniyem billahi ben Hallaki alem var iken halkı zamani neyleyem

APPENDIX C

The notes of a religious piece in makam Rast, notated by Nuri hoca, which lacks the peculiar sharp for B.

Hacı Tahsine Hanım

Erler demine destur alalım

Hacı Tahsine Hanım

RAST

9
Er ler de mi ne des tur a la lim per va ne ye bak ib ret a la lim per va ne ye bak ib ret a la lim

15
As kin a te si ne gel bir ya na lim yan dik ca her an mes ud o la lim yan dik ca her an mes ud o la lim

21
dost dost dost dost dev ra na gi rip sey ran e de lim

27
dev ra na gi rip sey ran e de lim ey vah de me den

32
al lah di ye lim la i la he il lal lah la i la he il lal lah la i la he il lal lah hu N.K.

Günler geceler durmaz geçiyor
Sermayen olan ömrün bitiyor
Bülbüllere bak efgan ediyor
Ey gonca acil mevsim geçiyor

Ey yolcu biraz dur dinle beni
Kervan geçiyor sen kalma geri
Yusuf denilen dünya güzeli
Fethetti bugün kalbi seferi

APPENDIX D

The notes of a religious piece in makam Nihavend, notated in the same software, lacking Turkish letters which leads the choristers to confusion.

Askin ile asiklar

z. Yunus Emre Dogan Ergin

As kin i le a sik lar yan sin ya Re sul al lah
Sol se ni sev di süb han ol du ka mu ya sul tan
Sol se ni se ven le re kil se fa at an la ra

3
i cip as kin se ra bin kan sin ya Re sul al lah
ca nim yo lu na kur ban ol sun ya Re sul al lah
mü min o lan ten le re can sin ya Re sul al lah

5
Sol se ni se ven ki si ve rir yo lu na ba si
A si kim ol dil da re bü l bü lüm sol gül za re
A sik yu nu sun ca ni hil mu se fa at ka ni

7
i ki ci han gü ne si sen sin ya Re sul al lah
se ni sev me yen na re yan sin ya Re sul al lah
a lem le rin sul ta ni sen sin ya Re sul al lah

N.K.

Askin ile asiklar yansin ya Resulallah
Icip askin serabin kansin ya Resulallah
Sol seni seven kisi verir yoluna basi
Iki cihan günesi sensin ya Resulallah

Sol seni sevdi sübhan oldu kamuya sultan
Canim yoluna kurban olsun ya Resulallah
Asikim ol dildare bülbülüm sol güzare
Seni sevmeyen nare yansin ya Resulallah

Sol seni sevenlere kil sefaat anlara
Mümin olan tenlere cansin ya Resulallah
Asik Yunus'un cani hilm-ü sefaat kani
Alemlerin sultani sensin ya Resulallah

APPENDIX E

The first page of *Gurbetten gelmişim yorgunum hancı*, the lyrics of which was explained by Serap hoca.

5557

-Uşşak Şarkı-

GURBETTEN GELMİŞİM YORGUNUM HANCI

Düyek (♩=)

Beste: Selâhattin İnal
Güfte: Bekir Sıtkı Erdoğan

ARANĖME---

Gur bet den gel mi şim yor gu num han cı (---SAX---

-) Şu ra ya bir ya tak ser ya vaş ya vaş

Sana her şe yi mi an la ta ca ğım

O tur baş u cu ma sor ya vaş ya vaş (--SAX--)

(SERBEST)

Gari bim her ta raf bana ya ban cı

Dert li yim çekin me dol dur be han cı

İlk ön ce kı mıl dar ha fîf bir san cı

Ay rı lık son ra dan kor ya vaş ya vaş (---SAX---) D.C.

APPENDIX F

The note of *Dil seni sevmeyeni sevmeye lezzet mi olur*.

-Nihavena şarkı-

DİL SENİ SEVMEYENİ SEVMEDE LEZZET Mİ OLUR

Semâî (♩ = 144) Süre: 2.40 Beste: Civan Ağa (xix. y. y.)

ARRANJEME---

Dil se ni sev me ye ni sev me de lez zet mi o lur

Ol sa da öy le mu hab bet
2. Ak lı nı ba şı na al her

de ha ki için kat ol mi ma o de li D.C. (SON)

Yek ci het ol maz i se dil de mu hab bet mi o lur

Al da nıp sev me ye ni can ve re rek sev me me li

3 4 4 8. Dil seni sevmeyeni sevmeye lezzet mi olur
Olsa da öyle muhabbetde hakikat mi olur
Yek cihet olmaz ise dilde muhabbet mi olur
Aldanıp sevmeyeni can vererek sevmemeli
Aklını başına al herkes için olma deli

APPENDIX G

The note of *Sende acep uşşaka eziyet mi çoğaldı*.

TRT MÜZİK DAİRESİ YAYINLARI
TÜRK SAN'ATİ MÜZİĞİ No: 30
CURCUNA
SÜRE : 3'
♩ = 240

HACI ÂRİF BEY
(1831 - 1885)
9 4 4 9.

KÜRDİ' Lİ HİCAZKÂR
Sende aceb uşşâka eziyyet mi çoğaldı ?

SEN... DE .A... CEB UŞ... ŞA... KA
E... ZİY... YET Mİ... ÇO... ĞAL...
DI I Sax...
YÂ BİZ... DE CE... FÂ ÇEK... ME... ĞE
EY KÂ... Nİ KE... REM LÖT... PU...
TÂ TÂ...
NÂ NÂ...
KAT... HÂ... NÂ... ZÂ... DI... DI...
VET SA... NÂ... ZÂ... DI...
Â... ŞIK... LA... RIN... Â... ZÂ... I... LE
Bİ... TÂ... BÜ... TÛ... VAN
DIR II. (Sax...) 1/2 (Sax...) 1/2 (Sax...) 1/2
Arasayışma... A.N.
DI II. 1/2

SENDE, ACEB, USSAKA EZİYYET Mİ ÇOĞALDI ?
YÂ, BİZDE CEFA ÇEKMEGE TAKAT Mİ AZALDI ?
AŞKILARIN AZAR İLE Bİ-TÂB'U TUVANDIR.
EY KÂN-I KEREM, LÜTF'U İNAYET SANA KALDI.

APPENDIX H

The note of *Ännchen von Tharau*.

9

5. Ännchen von Tharau

1. Änn-chen von Tha-rau ist, die mir ge-fällt, sie ist mein Le-ben, mein
 2. Käm al-les Wet-ter gleich auf uns zu schlahn, wir sind ge-sinnt, bei ein-
 3. Recht als ein Pal-menbaum ü-ber sich steigt, hat ihn erst Re-gen und
 4. Wür-dest du gleich ein-mal von mir ge-trennt, leb-test da, wo man die

Gut und mein Geld. Änn-chen von Tha-rau hat wie-der ihr Herz
 an-der zu stahn. Krank-heit, Ver-fol-gung, Be-trüb-nis und Pein
 Sturm-wind ge-beugt, so wird die Lieb in uns mäch-tig und groß
 Son-ne kaum kennt, ich will dir fol-gen durch Wäl-der und Meer,

auf mich ge-rich-tet in Lie-be und Schmerz. Änn-chen von Tha-rau, mein
 soll un-srer Lie-be Ver-kno-ti-gung sein. Änn-chen von Tha-rau, mein
 nach manchem Lei-den und trau-ri-gem Los. Änn-chen von Tha-rau, mein
 Ei-sen und Ker-ker und feind-li-ches Heer. Änn-chen von Tha-rau, mein

Reich-tum, mein Gut, du mei-ne See-le, mein Fleisch und mein Blut.
 Reich-tum, mein Gut, du mei-ne See-le, mein Fleisch und mein Blut.
 Reich-tum, mein Gut, du mei-ne See-le, mein Fleisch und mein Blut.
 Licht, mei-ne Sonn, mein Le-ben schließ-sich um dei-nes her-um.

Worte: Simon Dach, 1637; Hochdeutsch von Herder, 1778. Weise: Friedrich Silcher, 1825. Satz: Hans